Team of This issue

Editor: Prof. Dr. Khairi Al-Zubaidi
Executive Director
Arab Society of English Language Studies

Dr. Raja Lahiani
Department of Languages and Literature,
United Arab Emirates University, Al Ain, UAE

Dr. Safi Mahfouz
Department of English Language and Literature
School of Languages, The University of Jordan, Aqaba, Jordan
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article Titles &amp; authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Democratizing the Dramatic Text: Wannous’s Late Aesthetics and Individual Freedom</td>
<td>1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samar Zahrawi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Challenge of Training Translators and Interpreters in the Social Context of Foreign</td>
<td>3-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unaccompanied Minors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hanan Saleh Hussein</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic Contemporary Poetic Drama: Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir A Pioneer</td>
<td>20-39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yahya Saleh Hasan Dahami</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual Analysis of James Joyce’s Dubliners: A Fanonian Reading</td>
<td>40-59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FERHI Samir</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anachronism in Geoffrey Hill's &quot;Mercian Hymns&quot;</td>
<td>60-71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nadia Ali Ismael</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Use and Abuse of Machine Translation in Vocabulary Acquisition</td>
<td>72-81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>among L2 Arabic-Speaking Learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lamis Ismail Omar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photography as a Reflection of the Photographer’s Pain in Time Stands Still</td>
<td>82-98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhawy Abdulaziz Almeshaal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation of Idioms: How They are Reflected in Movie Subtitling</td>
<td>99-112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yana Shanti Manipuspika &amp; Damai Reska Julia Winzami</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roses in Amber: Gendered Discourse in Disney’s 2017 Adaptation of Villeneuve’s Fairytale</td>
<td>113-125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beauty and the Beast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atoof Abdullah Rashed &amp; Laila. M. Al-Sharqi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamophobia, Othering and the Sense of Loss: Leila Aboulela’s The Kindness of Enemies</td>
<td>126-143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khaled Abkar Alkodimi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perplexity and Predicament: A Corpus Stylistic Analysis of A Summer Bird-Cage</td>
<td>144-158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xuqin Lin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maya Angelou’s Battle with Alienation in I know Why the Caged Bird Sings</td>
<td>159-176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qudsia Zaini &amp; Mohsin Hasan Khan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evolution of Creation from Mythology to Reality: A Multidisciplinary Study into the</td>
<td>177-186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roots of Shelley’s Frankenstein and Ahmed Sa’adawi’s Frankenstein in Baghdad</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karzan Aziz Mahmood</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insanity and Murder in Robert Browning’ and Robert Lowell’s Dramatic Monologues.</td>
<td>187-200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maha Qahtan Sulaiman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Fuel Burns Mixed with Seawater”: The Relationship between the Refugee Tragedy and the</td>
<td>201-209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological Crisis in the Mediterranean Sea in Khaled Mattawa’s Mare Nostrum (2019)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ashwaq Basnawi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing Language Skills and Building Characters through Literature</td>
<td>210-224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatchul Mu’in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Postcolonial Scrutiny of the Media Imperialism in Wajahat Ali’s The Domestic Crusaders</td>
<td>225-233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maram Mohammed Samman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language as Students’ Artistic Value: Linguodidactic Dimension</td>
<td>234-247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iryna Guslenko, Evgeniya Myropolska &amp; Natalia Myropolska</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab World English Journal for Translation &amp; Literary Studies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSN: 2550-1542</td>
<td><a href="http://www.awej-tls.org">www.awej-tls.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pip's Ego Oscillations in Charles Dickens's Great Expectations</td>
<td>Bechir Saoudi, Lama Fahad Al-Eid, Noura Mohammed Al-Break, Rahaf Saad Al-Samih &amp; Tarfah Abdullah Al-Hammad</td>
<td>262-278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading F.S. Fitzgerald’s The Great Gatsby through Aristotle’s Eyes:</td>
<td>Ibrahim Henna &amp; Sabrina Zerar</td>
<td>279-295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendship, Gifts, and Commodities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Evolution of Post-Postmodernism: Aesthetics of Reality and Trust</td>
<td>Mashael H. Aljadaani &amp; Laila M. Al-Sharqi</td>
<td>296-323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Jonathan Franzen’s The Corrections and Freedom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconstructing the Mother-Daughter Relationship: Lydia Davis and Amy</td>
<td>Hala Ewaidat</td>
<td>324-335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Integration of Computer-Aided Translation Tools in Translator-</td>
<td>Lama A. Al-Rumaia</td>
<td>336-362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Programs in Saudi Universities: Toward a More Visible State</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Cognitive Analysis of Si Mohand’s Translated Poetry L’Amitié</td>
<td>Kahina MECHAT &amp; Souryana YASSINE</td>
<td>363-377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bafouée</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Democratizing the Dramatic Text: Wannous’s Late Aesthetics and Individual Freedom

Samar Zahrawi
Department of World Languages and Cultures
College of Humanities and Social Sciences
Sam Houston State University, TX, USA.
Email: szahrawi@shsu.edu

Received: 1/4/2021  Accepted: 2/9/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Sadallah Wannous (1941-1997), the Arab World’s most celebrated dramatist, gave up on the didactic art of the ‘theater of politicization’, in the middle of his career, in favor of a freer introspection of human psyche and passions. He spent his most prolific late years searching for new aesthetics and promoting a culture of free thinking. Abandoning his prior commitment to achieving the modern state, Arabic unity, the liberation of Palestine and the triumph of communism, he started creating individuals who are caught up in conflicting passions, loyalties and choices. However, his new themes will still betray a will to reform the many ailments in Arabic culture and politics, such as politico-religious coalitions and colonialism. This article will study the artistic and ideological transformation in Wannous’s later drama. It will also explore the later pro-democracy trends through analyzing the emerging individualism in characterization and the plurality of discourses in the plays of the later period 1989-1997, namely The Rape (1989), Historical Miniatures (1993), Miserable Dreams (1994), Rituals of Signs and Transformations (1994), and Drunken Days (1997).

Keywords: democratization of the dramatic text, intellectual freedom in Syrian drama, late plays of Sadallah Wannous, plurality of voices in theater, Sadallah Wannous, Syrian theater, Syrian drama

Cite as: Zahrawi, S. (2021). Democratizing the Dramatic Text: Wannous’s Late Aesthetics and Individual Freedom. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 3-19. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.1
Introduction
How can democracy replace autocracy after long decades of dictatorship? This is the concern of the leading Syrian dramatist Sadallah Wannous (1941-1997), who was most dedicated to instigating a revolution and attaining freedom through his dramaturgy. His journey of ideological and artistic transformation is inspiring, as it points to the painstaking process of education and awareness that democracy requires. Syria, as a young state, newly independent from the French mandate in 1943, suffered from the repercussion of colonialism and struggled with neocolonial interventions that sponsored multiple coups from 1949 till 1971 and deterred the instillation of democratic rules (Wakim, 2013, pp. 89-96). Controlled by dictators for over seven decades, Syrians underwent multiple forms of oppression. Freedom of expression has been repeatedly deemed as national treason. Many freethinkers lost jobs and even lives for candidly criticizing the government (Kahf, 2001, p.8). As a result, the public, for a long time, resorted to silence and passivity. When the revolution, that Wannous persistently propagated for in his theater of politicization, finally erupted after his death in 2011, it brought about not a democracy, but the worst human and economic crisis in modern times: nine years of war, 12 million displaced individuals, half a million killed, and grand scale destruction. Such catastrophic results had been foreseen only by few intellectuals who championed truth and freedom as the only way to combat oppression. Although advocated for by numerous thinkers, such democracy was unreachable. The path to intellectual freedom under hard-core totalitarianism is not easily accessible, as writers needed to rid themselves of multiple layers of indoctrination and ideological constraints. One example is Sadallah Wannous who developed a very strong stance against the autocracy of dictatorship and religo-political alliances. He and many other contemporary writers took refuge in a Marxist ideology that seemed to promise the panacea against the financial exploitation of the impoverished masses. It is during the last seven years of his lifetime that he acquires the broadness of vision to branch out and embody the concept of freedom on multiple levels, the individual as well as the political. As his middle period plays are written in the Brechtian tradition that call for moving from the word to action, he concluded, towards the end of his career, that theater cannot effectuate a revolution against oppression. Rather, it can only have an enlightening role. To lay grounds for democratic education and reasoning within a totalitarian-ruled society, Wannous in his late plays created dramatic dialogues informed by a plurality of perspectives. Allowing for a multiplicity of voices, the dramatist shifted his focus from his earlier insistent calls for revolution against dictatorship to advocating for the individual’s assimilation of personal and intellectual freedom.

Wannous’s last period: Transformation from an Instigator to an Edifier
In the middle period of his writing for the stage (1968-1978), Wannous devised the theater of politicization and theorized for it in his Manifestos for a New Arabic Theater (1970). This theater is a “response to systematic oppressive regimes” (p. 107). It discusses political issues through their “inherent laws and intertwined relations within the economic and political structure of society” (p. 91). At the same time, it tries to “discover a progressive milieu in which such issues can be solved” (p. 92). Inspired by Carl Marx and Berthold Brecht, his middle period plays
1978) aimed at politicizing the common people who are kept ignorant and ineffective by the oligarchies. It is this stratum of the oppressed people that Wannous hopes will one day “champion revolution and change” (Wannous, 1970, p. 92). Falling short of his initial aim at mobilizing the masses through theater, Wannous receives a second blow as he learned about President Anwar Sadat of Egypt signed a peace treaty with Israel. His frustration in effectuating change is only extenuated by his despair of any chance that the Palestinian people can ever reclaim their homeland. Surviving from a suicidal attempt, he gave up writing for the stage for ten years, during which he worked as a journalist and reassessed his political stances. He found that his obsession with the Marxist class struggle had removed him away from due concern with the individual. His awareness that no democracy can be attained unless the individual in brought back to the center stage again informs his later writing and formed is new aesthetics.

When he took up writing again in the last seven years of his life, the freedom that he always called for is clearly more organically fused into his writing. It took this champion of freedom a lifetime to internalize freedom and become less dogmatic. As he was battling cancer, he broke free from the inner censor, sexual taboos, Marxist doctrine and many more dogmas. His late plays feature multiple voices that argue cogently from a plurality of perspectives. Such dramaturgy manifests a growth of the democratic spirit, that was missing in his earlier theater of politicization. In an interview, Wannous explains that his silence upon losing his project and undergoing severe transformations, gave him the ability to adapt and to reinvent himself for the stage. Democracy is still a far-fetched dream, but he is confident that freedom of thought and expression is an essential step of the long road:

I feel horrified when I think about my life. Except for the two or three years towards the end of the fifties, I do not have a recollection of a period that allowed me to flourish, or to express myself freely. I was too young then when democracy was not an essential issue for my being. I am filled with horror for myself and for many generations that go through life without the chance to be free and open, or to build their awareness in a lively atmosphere enjoying dignity and geography. I am more motivated to be silent than to write... Losing belief in one’s ability to effectuate change, a writer would lose the incentive to write. You should not forget that I am one of a generation of writers that made a grave mistake when they made a strong connection between their artistic creativity and their political efficacy. (Wannous, 1986, p. 453)

After a long period of reassessment, Wannous came to the conviction that theater is not a tool of revolution, but that of spreading knowledge (Wannous, 1970, pp. 114-115). “The effectiveness of theater now does not lie in its preoccupation with the quick revolutionary change, but in its ability to function as a medium of enlightenment, which can broaden the audience’s horizon. It is a means of cultivating aesthetic values which are at odds with these propagated by public media” (Wannous, 1970, pp. 114-115).
In such a period of transformation, personal freedom and the psyche of the individual are blatant features. His theatre of the 1990s makes a clear break from that of the 1960s and 70s with its astonishing freedom in its subject matter and boldness in its themes and language (Al-ʾAnezi, 2006, p. 203). Admiring Taha Hussein (1889-1973), the prominent controversial and secular Egyptian writer, Wannous adopts his project of modernization and democracy:

No rational thinking without science and rejuvenation of reason. No blooming of science without freedom. No freedom without secularism. No secularism without modernization of state and propagation of democracy. The latter can only be attained by creating a civil society based on national unity and fair distribution of economic and political privileges (Wannous, 1990, pp. 492-3).

Hence, his late characters break social, political and religious taboos. They communicate a diversity of intellectual perspectives and a multiplicity of voices. With his new expansion towards multiple variations on the theme of freedom, it is almost impossible to categorize his last plays under one form, but they can all be described as promoting democracy and civil society through allowing pluralism and expressing individual and libidinal freedom.

The most prominent feature of change in Wannous’s later dramaturgy is avoiding earlier direct didacticism where the authorial voice is ascribed to minor characters who break the fourth wall and directly preach the playwright’s message. For example, the running commentary of Anwar in Soiree with Abi Khalil al-Qabbani (1973) polemically argues for the role of theater in intellectual freedom: “Theater solidifies people’s inclination to get together because it minimizes conflicts and fanaticism and urges them to unite and socialize. (Wannous, 1973, p. 756). In a similar polemical oratory, the actors in King’s Elephants (1969), break the fourth wall and exhort the audience to rebel against oppression in order to prevent a “bloody and violent story” (p. 579). These two examples of polemical dramatization are cited here in order to serve as a ground of comparison to show the way Wannous’s later dramaturgy internalizes the concept of freedom and imbeds it organically in his dramatic techniques.

In his late period, Wannous changed from an instigator to an edifier, from Marxism to freedom from dogmas. In this most prolific period, he produced eight plays The Rape (1989), Historical Miniatures (1994), A Day of our Time (1994), Rituals of Signs and Transformations (1993-4), Miserable Dreams (1994), Mirage Epic (1995), Countries Narrower than love (1996), and Drunken Days (1997). These plays enlighten the audience about multiple issues, ranging from the political to the personal. They reveal an increasing focus on the individual’s response to social repression. “For the first time in his last plays, Wannous takes special care to build complex characters that are full of life and rich in social, human and psychological features” (Abboud, 2008, p. 66). During his terminal illness (1992-1997), Wannous’ focus turned on the individual, thus making a clear break with his earlier Marxism which had ascribed all human strife to class struggle.
and considered focusing on the self a bourgeoisie Indulgence. (Al-ʿAnezi, 2006, p. 276). At this stage of transformation, the playwright learns that delving into the self is a way of freeing himself from the dogma of ‘isms’ and that concealing individuality is counter effective to building a free civil society. In an interview with Mary Ilyas, he admits:

I discovered that we live with the idea that we should tame our individuality for the purpose of social integration. I have been working against my individuality all my life... How wrong is that and to what extent this depletes our creativity! A society that suppresses the benign uniqueness of the individual, will necessarily be poor, backward and incapable of forming a pluralistic civil society. (Ilyas, 200 p. 19).

His later dramatic conflicts and themes reveal his liberation from the narrowness of Marxism and his inclusion of the concept of freedom in all facets of life.

As Wannous evolved, his later plays focus on expressing the self and they significantly depart from the earlier and middle plays in techniques, characterization, and range of themes. In a study of the individual and autobiographic elements in Wannous later plays, Souleman observes that “the character occupies the front of the theatrical scene, and the individual performs the act of revelation and exposure of the self, which is the foundation of the dramatic discourse. (Spring 2015, p.1). The search for truth and freedom in the later plays transcends the cultural taboos and allows for introspection into libidinal passions and fantasies as well as individual and social interactions. Approaching these two themes, Wannous ended his plays with the total collapse of the characters’ worlds. Such a collapse is ascribed to the “tension between the self and the other, between the private and the public, and between the individual and the collective”. (Souleman, spring 2015, p.1). Delving deep into the psyche of the characters, Wannous studies the influence of traditional social values, religious taboos and political oppressions on the freedoms afforded for individuals resulting in hypocrisy or suppressions. The personas in these plays seek freedom and truth but never achieve them. Thus, they end up with frustrations and utter failures, which explain why all these plays are tragedies ending with death or despondence.

**First Stage of Democratic Characterization: The Rape**

*The Rape* (1989) marks Wannous’s first departure from the theater of politicization and the Brechtian Epic theatre. The once relentless opponent of Israel, who attempted a failed suicide at the news of peace treaty between Egypt and Israel, is now able to envision a dialogue between Israeli and Palestinian discourses, thus expanding his vision to include the other. His main concern invariably remains in solidarity with the justice of the Palestinian people. The weight of the final message lies in the incrimination of the unjust policies and practices of both the Israeli government as well as Arabic regimes. However, what revolutionizes his approach is the innovation in which he humanizes the Israeli citizens, presents them in an empathetic light, and widens the scope of voices in his dramaturgy.
Inspired by the Spanish playwright Antonio Buero Vallejo’s *The Double Life of Dr. Valmy*, 1978 (Al-Anezi, p. 207), *The Rape* presents a dual story of Palestinian and Israeli characters who are equal in dramatic grandeur. The Palestinian characters, such as Dalal, Al-Fare’a, and Isma’il, are victims of displacement and loss of land. They become activists who are consequently tortured by the Israeli police force and acquire heroic/martyr status. The Israeli characters, such as Isaac, Rahil, and the psychiatrist Dr. Manouhin are intrinsically conscientious individuals burdened by humanitarian concerns as they own their ethical responsibility towards Palestinians. The security officer, Isaac, who is assigned to torture and rape Palestinian prisoners, eventually suffers from sexual dysfunctions and an excruciating sense of guilt. His wife Rahil wakes up to the injustices done to Palestinians upon establishing the state of Israel and decides to leave the country. The narrator, Psychiatrist Dr. Manouhin, acting as the moral compass, instructs Rahil to convey the truth to the world, so that “we will not be an accomplice with them. We will not allow them to confiscate the future” (Wannous, 1989, p. 163). The innovation here lies not in compromising on an earlier political pro-Palestinian stance, but obviously in the author’s willingness to negotiate a more democratic and pluralistic characterization by allowing voice to the ‘other’. The author’s notes show that he deliberately aimed at equal gravity of the Israeli and Palestinian personas:

Both plots interweave and grow reciprocally. I am dreaming of two distinctive performances, one characteristically Israeli, and the other characteristically Palestinian. Both performances should be earnestly genuine. Here, I warn against any grotesque dramatization of Israeli characters. I also warn against hyperbolic acting or hostile presentation (Wannous, 1989, p. 64).

In this, Wannous is a pioneer in democratizing the dramatic text and allowing for a wider perspective. However, despite this innovation at plurality of voices, both stories are still controlled by his leftist anti-Israeli ideology, and his belief in the fairness of the Palestinian cause. Thus the play does not democratically reveal two opposing perspectives. The play presents the Palestinians as victims of dispossession and torture, while the sympathetic Israeli characters are victims of a Zionist ideology that indoctrinates them with hatred and supremacy. For example, while treating the guilt-ridden security officer, Isaac, from sexual incompetence, Dr. Manouhin argues that Isaac, after participating in the torture and rape of Palestinian freedom fighters, cannot salvage his conscience. When Isaac argues dogmatically that his actions were legal thus right, Dr. Manouhin argues for ethics rather than power:

My loyalty is to justice, not to the law; there is no justice in what you are doing. There is no justice in occupying another people's land and there is no justice in the Zionist severity on which the Israeli state was established. I refuse to accept what you are doing, no matter what the justification is. (Wannous, 1989, p. 114)

These Israeli characters are dramatized as conscientious liberalists who escape the brain-washing effect of the right-wing Zionists such as Meid, Jadoun and Sarah. Because of his ethical awakening,
Isacc sympathizes with Arabs and loses his life when he requests to be discharged from his security forces (Wannous, 1989, p. 160). His wife, Rahil, is disillusioned with the foundational political perspective of the State of Israel, humanizes Arabs, and upon her husband’s murder, decides to immigrate and advocate for truth and justice. (Wannous, 1989, p.162). The limited plurality of voices is a mark of Wannous’s early stage of democratizing the text.

The novelty of this new approach is quite significant to Wannous’s evolving freedom of thought. The main change of theme here is the call for justice for both Israelis and Arabs, while the censure falls solely on the governments on both sides. In lieu of his earlier uncompromising animosity towards Israel, he is now able to humanize liberal Israeli citizens while censuring only policies and governments. In this play “Zionism is a dilemma for Arabs and Jews alike” (Wannous, 1989, p. 165). For him, Zionism has an extension in the Arab dictators that “are oppressing their people” (p.166) and “are looting and squandering national resources” (p. 167). Merely by daring to present sympathetic Israeli characters, to call on his fellow Arabs to consider the possibility of peaceful coexistence with Israeli people, and to equate Arab regimes of the Middle East with Zionism, the playwright knew that he was inviting vilification and risking the reputation he had gained through his plays of the 1960s and 1970s. He was very aware of the danger of condoning the ideas of liberal Israelis, and was expecting to become subject to the “animosity of both the Israelis and the Arab Zionists” (p. 167). Most responses to the play ranged from bewilderment to hostility and outrage. “Those who retained the 1948 mentality attacked it vehemently as if it were a scandal or treason” (Al-ʿAnezi, 2006, p. 215). Expecting a hostile reception to his empathetic Israeli characters, the playwright includes an interview between himself and the persona of Dr. Manouhin, in the epilogue, in which he meta-dramatically describes the challenges he encountered while creating the story. In this imagined interview, Wannous explains that he was changed and inspired by the attitudes and testimonies of some courageous Jews who opposed Zionism (Wannous, 1989, p. 164). To him Dr. Manouhin, like prophet Jeremiah [Irmiya], is not betraying his people by opposing their politics. On the contrary, he is committed to protecting them from a moral dilemma. On the other hand, the persona of Dr. Manouhin posed extra challenges to the playwright who knew that the very idea of dramatizing him as an empathetic character from the enemy camp would be received by Arab audience as a treason:

I had to overcome so many obstacles such as historical suspicion, that denies your existence, political demagoguery, which denies your identity, the defeated people’s phobia from treachery, the mayhem of victims and wounds, the possibility being hunted as a traitor”. (Wannous, 1989, p. 165).

There can be little doubt that the Wannous of the 1960s and 1970s would have condemned the play. However, the evolved Wannous was aware of his role as a pioneer in breaking a political taboo and presenting a new daring and more democratic way of understanding people’s diversity and regional politics. The fact remains that The Rape is a revolutionary step, although not yet complete, at creating equal standing and dialogue between Israelis and Arabs.
Second Stage of Democratic Characterization: *Historical Miniatures*

As Wannous started presenting multiple truth and plural voices in *The Rape*, he refined this further in *Historical Miniatures* (1993). In this long play, dramatic conflicts grow in complexity and various characters, at opposite ends, equally express their perspectives cogently and eloquently. It is a historical play presenting the events of Tamburlaine’s invasion of Damascus in 1401. However, the play, in fact, has contemporary relevance in issues such as national sovereignty and intellectual freedom. To that end, the playwright gives voice to a vast diversity of the society including the educated elite, progressive and Salafi clergy, statesmen, economic leaders as well as the common people.

*Historical Miniatures* starts with the news of Tamburlaine’s army conquering Aleppo and moving towards Damascus. Expecting defeat, Damascus governor declares his will to surrender in order to save lives. However, the clergy, under the guidance of Tadheli, and the princes, under Azdar, decide to resist and defend the city against the instruction of the governor. As Tamburlaine’s forces approach, the army of Sultan Naser Farah Bin Barquq arrives to Damascus. However, the Sultan’s soldiers start ransacking the city instead of defending it. The Sultan, after several victorious battles, withdraws and returns to Egypt in order to secure his throne in the face of civil unrest, thus manifesting the priority of his throne to the safety of his subjects. With the Sultan gone, people in Damascus are divided between two positions; resistance or surrender. People under the leadership of Prince Azdar and clergy Tadhel, fight Tamburlaine, and briefly take over the castle. The intellectual and financial elite, such as the famous historian Ibn Khaldun and the merchant Dulama, decide to surrender in order to save their interests. Worried that Tamburlaine may hold him responsible for this split, Ibn Khaldun, joins a committee of merchants and society leaders to present their loyalty to him with a great deal of expensive gifts. Tamburlaine accepts the surrender but imposes excessive tax, thus oppressing and impoverishing the people of Damascus. In the tumultuous situation of military invasion and consequent defeat, opposing voices rise to express the varying perspectives while dealing with the menace. Wannous’s mastery and innovation, here, lie in allowing for a democratic presentation of all parties involved. For example, the perspective of the Clergy, Ibn Nabuls, who pushes for surrender in order to protect the welfare of the city is proportionately counterargued by the Prince of the castle, Azdar, who fights for the honor and dignity for future generations. The conflict between both perspectives is resolved, as history denotes, in favor of surrender, thus the people of Damascus tragically cooperate with the Tatar army in destroying the castle of Damascus and ending the siege. The authorial voice is given to Ibn- Mufleh in his deathbed speech in which he reveals that the main reason for the downfall of Damascus is diminishing the civil society and debilitating the army which resulted in ethical and physical decline:

> We have been erring since the beginning. We made a mistake when we disarmed people. We made a mistake when we made our fort walls defenseless. We made a mistake when we trusted to our foes. There can never be a peace treaty between a weak unarmed party and the heavily armed enemy. In such a case, there will only be surrender and submission.
….. Had we fought; we wouldn’t have lost that much… Behold. The destruction is not limited to people’s homes and livelihood, but also reaches out to their souls and hearts. (Wannous, 1993, pp. 455-6)

This final verdict by Ibn-Mufleh may betray conscious didacticism, on the part of the playwright, who vehemently preaches for the absolute need for both fortified borders and a free civil society. However, this forthrightness does not detract from the playwright’s increasing intellectual and artistic growth which has broadened his horizon and allowed him to proportionately include the perspectives of his ideological opponents.

With the play’s contemporary relevance, the conflicting ideologies are used to demonstrate the state of modern malaise in Syria and its incapacity to deal with adversity. In an interview with Maher al-Sharif, Wannous explains that his “aim was to introspect about a historical anecdote and explore the responses of the strata of statesmen, academics and the common people in relation to catastrophe” (Wannous, March 1994, p. 668). To that end, he combines real and fictional characters and, endows them with complexity. Avoiding stock characters of good and evil, the playwright provides characters with a “wide margin of freedom, initiative and democracy” (Wannous, March 1994, p. 668). With the idea of contemporary relevance of historical events in mind, one can notice parallels with diverse contemporary vices. For example, there is analogy between the Sultan of Egypt forsaking Damascus and the Middle Eastern despots seeking their own positions in time of national crisis. Hence, the play censures modern time Arab despots for prioritizing their offices over the safety of their people. Similarly, the character of the greedy merchant, Dulama, points to the modern stratum of rich merchants who, fearing for their possessions, wish to surrender the city to invaders. The play also presents a critique of modern religious leaders who maintain their statuses by obeying the dictator or the Sultan. Most importantly, in the character of the famous historian Ibn Khaldūn, Wannous voices a critique of the intellectual elites, who are entrenched behind their academic neutrality and refrain from involvement in timely issues. In Al-Tadheli, there is a critique of the pedantic clergy who, despite being well intentioned, prohibits the freedom of thought and philosophical introspection. Thus, all these historical personas are meant to comment on all contemporary categories of potential leaders who, by taking the wrong stance, are contributing to chaos and destruction. The contemporary relevance together with the plurality of voices point to Wannous’s growth in adopting the concepts of freedom and democracy.

The newly formed concept of democracy is integrated within the very structure of *Historical Miniatures*. “The play is not built according to a plot procession, but a mosaic made of miniatures” (Wannous, March 1994, p. 668). Each miniature is a scene that displays a wave of intricate events and details discussing various responses to the menace awaiting Damascus. In lieu of a plot, the play uses narratives interwoven with and interrupted by debates which delineate clearly the “conflicting interests and different viewpoints” (Wannous, March 1994, p. 668).
Showcasing divergent perspectives, this complex structure proves to be an adeptly expressive tool for a democratic platform.

Characters voicing these diverse thinking patterns are neither condemned nor condoned. Instead, each character at the opposite end of the spectrum is endowed equally cogent argument. Hence, intellectual complexity arises, and characters stand up to test the validity and/or folly of their claims. It is the balanced duality of perspective that is the characteristic feature of the dramaturgy of the later period. For example, the dichotomy between the Salafism and liberalism of both leading clergy- Sheikh Burhaneddin al-Tadheli and Sheikh Jamaeddin al-Shara’iji is a most impartial presentation of conflicting theological views. The venerable Tadheli is a pious patriot, who, like Joan of Arc, receives a spiritual revelation instructing him to defend Damascus and secure its freedom. He wholeheartedly leads militant strife to defend the lives and honor of his countrymen against the Tartar invasion and inspires many honorable freedom fighters such as his daughter Su’ad and the scholar Sharafeddin. He eventually dies as a revered martyr. Due to his selfless dedication to the sovereignty of his people, he is viewed as an empathetic protagonist. Yet, he is a force of darkness as he incriminates freethinking. He condemns his theological opponent the Sufi philosopher, al-Shara’iji, because of the latter’s free speculation on matters of faith and fate. It is noteworthy that al-Shara’iji is, in part, a self-dramatization of the playwright who sees himself as a martyr for the cause of reasoned debate and honest dialogue. The fundamentalist, al-Tadheli, considers al-Shara’iji’s logical reasoning of theology as a blasphemy to be punished by jail. Wannous’s truth here is complex due to al-Tadheli’s ambivalent characterization swaying between the two extremes of his empathetic patriotic strife and repulsive intolerance of intellectual freedom. Such a binary opposition in religious implications has contemporary relevance to the later rise of Salafi/takfiri Jihadist trend and their conflict with Islamic free thinkers in the modern Muslim world. The play utilizes the conflicting emotional appeals of al-Tadheli’s dedication to his city’s sovereignty and al-Shara’iji’s dedications to freedom of thought within Islamic faith. The playwright’s role here is to enlighten the audience of the need to see the bigger picture of Islamic fervors that are the dynamos of the masses. In this instance, he tips the scale in favor of liberalism as he places the Jihadist liberating fervor proportionately within the larger picture of intellectual oppression.

The duality of perspectives is dramatized again in all three miniatures. For example, Ibn Khaldūn and his disciple Sharafeddin are foils who bring to attention the academics’ ethical responsibility towards public affairs. Ibn Khaldūn, the celebrated scholar and historian of the 14th Century Muslim world 1, is presented in this play as a controversial character whose academic neutrality is most praiseworthy, but his disengagement in the welfare of the city is most objectionable. His name relates to uncontested pride in Muslim past, shown clearly in Su’ad’s respect towards him while reverently massaging his feet. (Wannous, 1993, p.360). To present this scholar in a critical perspective would be unsettling for audience who are used to unquestionably celebrating icons of a glorious past. Ibn Khaldūn’s commitment to utter neutrality in recording history is contested by his disciple Sharafeddin who calls for an agency in making history. In his
historical manuscript, Ibn Khaldūn refers to Tamburlaine respectfully as ‘Prince Tamr’ and refrains from condemning his conquest of Damascus. He defends his academic detachment in his words: “We are documenting history, not writing scathing literature” (Wannous, 1993, p. 360). Although highly acclaimed, Ibn Khaldūn is severely criticized for being too emotionally detached, for seeking the safety of his manuscripts, and for having no moral scruples about giving his loyalty to the conqueror. When he realizes that Tamburlaine will win the battle, he joins a convoy of Damascus elite, presents him with expensive gifts, plays the sycophant and secures his own personal and academic safety. Ibn Khaldūn’s characterization creates a controversy about the role of intellectuals. What good does knowledge do if it cannot be applied to reality in order to improve it? Should educated people be neutral or take part in historical action? Should the educated elite serve authority or move the society? Such questions are deeply connected to the playwright’s concern for democracy. If Wannous has stopped instigating people to start a revolution, he is now promoting free thinking and highlighting the importance of education in raising awareness and enlightening people. Through this duality of Ibn-Khaldun and Sharafeddin’s perspectives, Wannous puts his weight in the argument as he rejects utter neutrality and calls the educated elite to take an active role in serving people and determining the destiny of the nation.

A third plurality of perspective relates to the double burden of safeguarding both sovereignty and democracy at the same time. The dialogues among Azdar, Sharafeddin and Ibn Tayeb about colonization and dictatorship present conflicting views on the exigency of protecting the state versus homeland. Azdar, the Prince of the Castle, defends Damascus city, against the Tartar invasion, and fights to safeguard the rule of the Sultan equally ardently. For him, patriotism means unconditional allegiance to both homeland and the ruler. He, thus, equates the safety of the nation with the security of the state. However, the anti-Sultan opposition, represented in Ibn Tayeb, vilifies the Sultan for withdrawing and prioritizing his rule. He changes throughout the play from demanding the right to fight the tartars to calling for surrender in order to limit bloodshed and destruction. Sharafeddin, on the other hand, opposes both the Sultan rule and the foreign invader, thus, making a statement against both dictatorship and colonialism. The plurality of political opinions in the voices of the three characters Ibn Tayeb, Azdar and Sharafeddin create a democratic debating platform on stage, where the dialogue develops freely. The multiple facets of truth depict a nation paralyzed, firstly by totalitarianism, and secondly by colonization. Wannous links these two evils as cause and effect: Totalitarianism and the lack of democracy historically created squabbles among people and impeded their union. The result is utter defeat and a massacre on the hands of the Tartars. The causal relation between totalitarianism and colonialism and the need for democracy in this play have contemporary relevance in the priority given to the rule of Al-Assad over the security and welfare of the Syrian people. This mistaken fusion of the two concepts marks the dictatorship of Hafiz Al-Assad (1971-2000), and is clear in the famous motto ‘Assad’s Syria’. Similarly, the same is true for the later totalitarianism of President Bashar Al-Assad, with the catchphrase of “Al-Assad or we burn the country,” which became the leitmotif of Assad supporters while extinguishing the revolution that started in 2011 (Dagher, 2019). Azdar’s justification for this dictatorship and police state has its contemporary relevance in support of Al-Assad
totalitarianism. Moreover, the multiplicity of the three voices in this play seems to anticipate the much later conflicting strife in Syria against the Assad dictatorship and the consequent hegemony of foreign powers such as Russia and Iran. It seems that Wannous is prophetic in linking the struggle for freedom to both in-state democracy and the sovereignty of the nation. Considering all the previous dichotomies and multiplicities, truth in Historical Miniatures has multiple facets. The dramatist allows his characters cogent argument to present their perspectives and convictions. With the uncontestable historical truth of the destruction of Damascus, the author does not draw conclusions or resolve the multiple arguments. He dramatizes the conflicting views, gives them equal weight, and leaves it to the historically aware audience to process ideas. Allowing for such controversies, Wannous is creating a democratic experience where every perspective is allowed full expression.

Third Stage: New Aesthetics in Exploring the Individual and Society

The more Wannous internalizes freedom, the more he shifts towards a freer expression of the individual and libidinal desires, in such plays as Miserable Dreams (1994), Rituals of Signs and Transformations (1993-4) and Drunken Days (1997). Reassessing his earlier Marxism, Wannous stopped marginalizing the self and experienced more elation in dramatizing his own passions. With his knowledge of impending death, Wannous developed the urgency to write more compulsively and more freely. Such an elation is observed by many critics such as Shakhsoukh:

For the first time, Wannous feels the joy of writing. He used to deny himself expression as he had believed that the individual’s suffering is too personal to write about. Focusing mainly on historical awareness, he had bypassed his own feelings, thus he felt divorced from himself and out of his skin (1998, p. 68-69).

Shying away from politicizing the masses in the later period, he invents new aestheticism and new means of expression, a theater that bravely explores the individual and society.

His main concern in this period is to live life to the full, unshackled by social restraints. His other concern is unmasking the social forces that curb individuals and conceal their true selves. The antagonists are men representing forces of social and political backwardness and corruption. For example, through Kazem and Faris, in Miserable Dreams, he critiques toxic masculinity. Through the Mufti, Chieftain of noblemen [Naqīb alAshraf] ii, and chief of police, in Rituals of Signs and Transformations, he censures the corruption of politico-religious establishment. Through Sanaa’s husband, in Drunken Days, he shows his dismay with the bourgeois society in transition between conservative Arabic culture and openness to the west. In contrast, it is women who become centerstage characters, who express the human longing for freedom. In these three plays, the female characters Ghada, Mary, Mu’mena /Almassa and Sanaa are empathetic protagonists yearning to live life to the full through their expression of libidinal desires. These women are repressed by social taboos imposed on their gender. Due to ubiquitous social oppression, they are deprived from the agency to develop self-awareness and to act on their
problems. When the female, at last, becomes aware of her internalized sexual repression and finds
the will to rebel, her quest for freedom is most tragically aborted.

The pervasive yearning towards fulfillment of sexual desires in Wannous’s last plays is, in
effect, not inseparable from the playwright’s overall concern with social justice and political
reform. Miserable Dreams portrays the debilitating effect of social oppression on women. Having
contracted a venereal disease from her husband, Mary is deprived of procreation and connubial
pleasures. Ghada, on the other hand is abused psychologically and physically by an ignorant
unethical husband, Kazem. Working as a morally degenerate government informer, he bars her
from independent thinking and forces her to worship him as a god. Disgusted with her husband’s
vulgarity, she fantasizes about Mary’s tenant, an offstage college student who has the potential of
refinement and education. Simultaneously, Mary imagines the tenant to be her unborn child, a
surrogate of productivity and hope. As both husbands conspire to evacuate the tenant, Mary and
Ghada desperately rebel against their husbands and plan to poison them. However, their hopes for
liberation are crushed with the ironic turn of fate as Ghada’s child, by mistake, ends up consuming
the poison. Thus, Ghada and Mary’s lame revolt against life-long suppression meets a tragic end.
Although their wish to relieve their oppression is a valid human aspiration, they lack the proper
tools to effectuate change, and they can only think of a panacea through murder. It is ironic that
Wannous who was in his middle period aiming at instigating rebellion, is dramatizing here the
tragic consequence of a poorly planned revolt that, just as the later Syrian revolution in 2011, only
perpetuated more destruction and oppression.

Identifying with the female gender and delving into the individual desires in the later
period, Wannous does not relinquish his mission of spreading political awareness. For example,
the female protagonist, Ghada, shares with the playwright his predilection for the Egyptian
president Jamal Abdulnasser who championed the concept of Arab union. She perseveres through
male hegemony and keeps up her intellectual autonomy by writing letters to her brother, resisting
her husband’s politics and dreaming of a better world in the company of an educated young male
neighbor. Ghada’s struggle for intellectual autonomy and self-fulfillment within an oppressive
milieu is parallel to Wannous’ own resistance for awareness and freedom from oppressive regimes.

Wannous’s female characters contribute to an autographical strain in his later writing
where the political and the individual concerns are fused. In his masterpiece, Rituals of Signs and
Transformations, his identification with women becomes more evident as Mu’mena, the female
protagonist, while seeking personal freedom, provides a critique of the politico-religious
establishment. The play, which is set in Damascus at the end of the 19th century, revolves around
a storyline borrowed from the memoirs of Fakhri al-Baroudi. The Mufti of Damascus quells two
notables- the Chieftain of Noblemen and the chief of police- and reigns. The cunning Mufti seems
to forgo a personal grudge against the Chieftain and helps him out after the chief of police arrests
the Chieftain under the charge of indecency with a concubine. Having the Chieftain in his grip, the
Mufti demolishes the chief of police as he has dared to defame a prominent member of prophet’s
descendants. Evading public anger, Wannous claims not to aim at censuring any historical religious public figures or establishment. Instead, he contended that the characters in the play are individuals who have “their personal struggles and desires” (Wannous, 1994, p. 469). However, the action of the play departs from the original storyline of the memoir and revolves around Mu’mena, the Chieftain’s wife, whose already simmering anger is ignited by her husband’s infidelity and the Mufti’s slyness. As Mu’mena agrees to acquit her husband by switching roles with the concubine in prison, she seizes the opportunity to break free, get a divorce and pursue a life of unrestrained desires and pleasures. Breaking away from the restrictions imposed on her by her husband, her father, and the social norms, she follows her whims and transforms to Almassa, a fille de joie. As a child, she witnessed her respectable father hypocritically indulging himself in connubial pleasures with the housemaid. Now, it is her very husband that is practicing the same licentiousness and hypocrisy. As a result, she rebels against sexual repression and double standards that connect honor exclusively to female chastity. She wants to explore the full range of pleasures and physical desires available to the human body regardless of social or ethical restrictions.

The transformation of Mu’mena’s name, that denotes piety, to Almassa, that means a shiny diamond, is a declaration of rebellion against conventional taboos. This transformation is parallel to the playwright’s later desire for emancipation from all constricting ideologies. In his evolving freedom, while he is counting down his days, he introduces personal topics which he never felt easy to discuss. The notion of freedom now expands beyond the economic and political to include the social and the personal. In her poetic imagination, she sees that her divorce and consequent fall into “temptation” will allow her to “soar in space as a bird, the wind and sun rays” (Wannous, 1993-4, pp. 553-4). The poetic language with which she expresses her transformation bypasses taboos and sanitizes her wish to be united with her inner self: “I yearn to cut the coarse fiber ropes that have been tearing my flesh and oppressing my body, ropes pated with fear, decency, chastity and self-loathing, of sermons, verses, warnings, proverbs, and the instructions of ancestors” (Wannous, 1993-4, pp. 553-4). She wants her body to be as free as “flowers, leaves, moon, grass, gazelles, springs, light and everything alive in this world” (Wannous, 1993-4, p. 554). Uniting herself poetically with aspects of nature, Almassa presents her freedom allegorically and acquits herself from moral condemnation. While collapsing, having been stabbed by her brother, she elevates herself to the level of mythical fables:

Oh Safwan, I am a story and a story cannot be killed, I am an obsession, longing and seduction that you cannot kill with your dagger… My story will blossom now just like the orchards after a rainy winter. Almassa will grow and spread, she will spread with the thoughts, with the obsessions and stories.. stories.. sto.. (Wannous, 1993-4, pp. 596-597)

While seeking her freedom, Mu’mena/Almassa unravels the complexities and hypocrisies lying at the heart of an austere and, at the same time, dissolute society. The main idea of the play is the uncovering of the way social norms tend to change and deform human nature. Wannous in this play identifies with his female protagonist. Almassa’s longing for fulfillment and freedom belongs
to the dramatist himself. The release of the self from ideological framework in the later plays, as Ali Souleman points out, led to the emergence of the private space of the individual and the appearance of a “recognizable autobiographical elements” (2015, p. 1).

Representing the self through a female protagonist is to be encountered again in Wannous’s last play Drunken days, as Sanaa’s private hedonistic tendency conflicts tragically with the expectations of a confining society. Imprisoned by harsh rules and taboos, Sanaa is commodified and married off to a rich husband for a mutual family business agreement. Like the unmasking of society in Rituals, the grandson unravels hidden secrets in the family past. His grandmother, Sanaa, had eloped from her husband and led a life in which she and her lover celebrated connubial pleasures and deep emotional ties. Such an episode revealed the social complexities of an era at the beginning of the twentieth century when Syria and Lebanon were transitioning from Arabic tradition to French modernity brought about by colonialism. As the affluent family was starting to accept the French lifestyle and cast away their traditions, Sanaa’s elopement shocks the husband and makes him revert to his old lifestyle. Freedom brought by modernity liberated Sanaa from commodification and suppression only for a while, but she must meet her own duties as a mother. She gets out of the cocoon of her connubial happiness to find that her elder son is so scandalized that he commits suicide. Realizing that her elopement has brought shame and trauma to her children, she abandons her marital heaven and lives on as a hermit. In this last dramatic piece, Wannous expresses the malaise of society as experienced by women. He had shifted from dramatizing the tyranny of autocracy and police state to presenting the cruelty and hegemony of a collective space that deprives the individual from personal freedom.

Conclusion

Wannous in his later plays 1989-1997 evolved intellectually and artistically as he broached new aesthetes and a freer horizon of ideas in his theater. After his long commitment to his innovation of the theater of politicization in the middle period plays (1968-1978), he was disillusioned with the ability of the theater to effectuate a revolution. However, he maintained his belief in the role of creative artists in combating oppressive environments and creating atmospheres of intellectual freedom. In his late period, he realized that the theater could only have an enlightening and educating role. In his later plays, The Rape (1989), Historical Miniatures (1993), Miserable Dreams (1994), Rituals of Signs and Transformations (1994), and Drunken Days (1997), he advocated for intellectual and individual freedom. Internalizing this freedom, Wannous democratized his dramatic text and allowed for plurality of voices. He abandoned his earlier didacticism and dispersed a multiplicity of ideas by endowing characters of opposing stances equal empathy, cogency and grandeurs. Moreover, women become central empathetic characters who take center stage and manifest undeniable self-identification on the playwright’s part.

Wannous realized that his earlier commitment to Marxism had been counter-effective for his democratic aspiration, as it had deterred him from dramatizing the individual, a literary practice which was thought of as bourgeois indulgence. Reassessing his earlier stances, he realized that
promoting individuality is vital for advocating for a free civil society, which is in turn necessary to safeguarding the society from totalitarianism. Hence, he freed himself from the dogmas of isms and delved into the self, portraying the individuality of his characters, their psyche, aspiration, desires and conflict with society. The more aware of his approaching death, the braver Wannous was in facing his inner sensors and breaking away from oppressive ideologies and social taboos. This transformation manifested itself in his plays in the growth of a democratic spirit represented in the equality of opposing voices, the rise of individuality, depth and richness in characterization, the presence of libidinous dimensions, and the presence of women as protagonists.

About the Author
Samar Zahrawi received her PhD from the University of Leeds, U.K. in Modern Drama in 1992. She taught modern drama at Al-Baath University, Syria, and King Saud University, KSA. Currently, she is an Associate Professor of Middle Eastern Studies at Sam Houston State University, Texas, USA. Having a background in English and comparative drama, her current research interest is Arabic drama, Arabic culture, and translation studies.

ORCiD https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6897-523X

References:
Ilyas, M. (summer 2000). "Al-hayat masrah tijari tuzihahu al-kitabah: hiwar[Life is a commercial theater geared by writing]". Al-Karmil, 64.
Souleman, A. (Spring 2015). “Staging the self: Autobiography in the theatre of Saʿdallah Wannous”. Arab Stages, Volume 1, Number 2


Notes

i *Abū Zayd ‘Abd ar-Rahmān ibn Muḥammad ibn Khalīdīn al-Ḥadrāmī;* 27 May 1332 – 17 March 1406) was a leading Tunisian Arab historiographer and historian, best known for his book the *Muqaddimah [Introduction]*. He is considered as one of the greatest philosophers of the Middle Ages who contributed to modern disciplines of historiography, sociology, demography and economics.

ii The government position of the Chieftain of noblemen [Naqīb al Ashraf], in various Islamic Empires, refer to the head of the descendants of Prophet Mohammed, who enjoyed certain privileges and legal immunity.
The Challenge of Training Translators and Interpreters in the Social Context of Foreign Unaccompanied Minors

Hanan Saleh Hussein
Department of Philology and Translation
Faculty of Humanities
Pablo de Olavide University, Seville, Spain
Email: hsalhus@upo.es

Received: 12/18/2020     Accepted: 1/16/2021     Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract:
There are many challenges facing teachers in the classroom, throughout the process of training translators and interpreters in higher education. This paper aims to share reflections and teaching practices related to the preparation of these future professionals, in the context of caring for a vulnerable group of the immigrant community, Unaccompanied Foreign Minors (UFM). The proposal is based on taking a step further in the Teaching Practice and Development (TPD) methodology of Specialized Translation and Bilateral Interpreting subjects by incorporating new knowledge such as that related to Public Management or Social Sciences. This is due to the firm belief of the author of this manuscript in the quality of training from a multidisciplinary approach that will undoubtedly bring many more benefits, not only to the students, but also to UFM as a sensitive group, to the Administration as a competent body and, also, to the host society. This proposal arises from a simple question: Are future translators and interpreters prepared to manage their work in a vulnerable context? To answer this question, it is necessary to analyze the practical knowledge acquired by these professionals in the preparation phase. Thus, the main objective of this work is to demonstrate that the use of real texts in the Translation and Interpreting classroom is a bet that leads to an excellent academic training. Furthermore, this multidisciplinary work will serve as a model to be followed by teachers in this field.

Keywords: Interdisciplinary, specialized Translation, training of translators and interpreters, unaccompanied foreign minors (UFM)

Introduction

This article investigates new methodologies in the classroom of practical teaching in Translation and Interpreting studies. The aim is to bring students closer to a social and legal reality in a specific work context through multidisciplinary material. This material consists of real and current texts used by the public entities that manage the care process for Unaccompanied Foreign Minors in Spain from three areas of knowledge: Translation and Interpreting of Arabic, English and French, Sociology and Public Law. The results of this work translate into the achievement of an integrated and useful training for the professional future of the students.

Theoretical Framework

The migratory movement of groups of Unaccompanied Foreign Minors (henceforth UFM) in Spain, especially in Andalusia, has had a social and political impact, especially in the last two decades. The vast majority of university students remain oblivious to the social, legal, administrative, economic and political dimensions of this phenomenon. These are groups of foreign minors who come mostly from North African and require protection and care from the authorities and official bodies, including non-governmental humanitarian organizations. It is a complex process involving various professionals such as social workers, specialists in the field of public management, and translators and interpreters, among others.

To get an idea of the dimension of the migratory effect on Spanish society and on Andalusian society, some quantitative data can be provided. The Guide to Initial Health Examination of Unaccompanied Foreign Minors (UFM) issued by Andalusia’s Regional Department of Health and Family in June 2019, states that, according to the Information System for Minors (SIME) of the Andalusian Government, the majority of unaccompanied migrant children and adolescents who arrived in 2018 are from Morocco (63%). Other frequent countries of origin are Guinea (14%), Mali (9%), Ivory Coast (5%) and Algeria (2%). Ninety-five per cent of these persons under 18 years of age are male. The profile of UFM has become more diversified, and it is very likely that this will continue, with children and adolescents arriving from other countries, some of which are unsafe and subject to serious social and political conflicts, increasing personal circumstances linked to traumatic experiences and family losses.

Furthermore, according to another report by Andalusia’s Regional Department of Equality and Social Welfare (February 2019), Andalusia is home to almost half the UFM that manage to reach Spain. Of the 10,162 undocumented children and adolescents without families that the Ministry of the Interior must monitor, 4,798 are cared for by Andalusia’s welfare network, while the rest are distributed among the other Spanish regions. Whilst developing teaching innovation projects in the practical teaching sessions included in the Degree in Translation and Interpreting at the Universidad Pablo de Olavide (hereinafter DTI), which has been carried out with regard to the assistance and management of vulnerable groups of immigrants, refugees and asylum seekers, we noted the lack of resources available for the work assisted by qualified translators and interpreters during the primary phase of reception, identification and refuge. This lack of resources
varies according to the classification of the managing body: public sector or the sector made up of humanitarian organizations that assist immigrants and UFM\textsuperscript{iii}. Since translation in the field of foreign nationals, immigration, refugee, and asylum is a new field of work where the services of translators and interpreters are requested, it believed that providing training for translation and interpreting students in a real context is an effective teaching method. Therefore, the purpose is to bring into the classroom a new methodology based on an approach that has been reset and synchronized with other areas of knowledge such as the field of Social Work and Public Management. This new methodological approach allows students to carry out translation and interpreting services from a global perspective, with core interdisciplinary knowledge that guarantees quality assistance to UFM as an unprotected sector in the host society (Alonso & Ruiz, 2010).

There are many intended outcomes to be achieved by this action, including the following:

- To train students to deal with the difficulties that arise in the process of translation and interpreting caused by intercultural and psychological shock when assisting UFM.
- To reinforce the skills and sensitivity that stimulate students through logical thinking and from a multicultural perspective.
- To connect several areas of knowledge in order to work towards a shared responsibility that encourages collaborative work in groups of students from different areas and languages.
- To create a social and universal conscience from the field of transcultural research and to bring students closer to the legal and social reality of other parts of the world.

In addition to the general goals mentioned in the previous paragraph, another specific objective of this study is to investigate the feasibility of training translators and interpreters specialized in assisting immigrants and refugees in general, although, in this case, it is even more relevant to highlight the additional work taken on by all of them for the sake of protecting and monitoring the correct application of the protocol used in the assistance of UFM.

The starting premise is that multidisciplinary work is the most effective and appropriate practice for the achievement of the primary objective: updated TPD information that is materialized in the teachings delivered as part of the DTI. This methodology involves carrying out exercises and tasks that cover knowledge from the area of Sociology and Public Management. It follows guidelines that provide students with a better understanding of the social and legal reality of other parts of the world and help them to reflect on the adaptation of legal texts in the host societies within Europe. As there are few teaching manuals to approach T and I subjects from this three-dimensional approach, the author believes, even more, in the need for this type of action.

**Literature Review**

Classroom work in T and I, especially when it comes to Specialized Translation and Bilingual Interpreting, requires competence-based instruction. In this regard, supports the reflections of Álvarez (2004) about competence-based higher education, interdisciplinarity and
autonomous student work. As the concept of competence becomes very broad, it allows us, in the case of our work, to include related and complementary knowledge in T and I. Hence, may be integrated into this methodological scenario social skills, legal knowledge, and social and cultural practices, among others, to achieve the task of “doing” and to teach students “know-how in context”:

The concept of competence is diverse, depending on how you look at it, or the emphasis placed on one element or another, but the most widespread and accepted is that of “know-how in context”. “Know-how”, far from being understood as “doing” just like that, requires knowledge (theoretical, practical, or theoretical-practical), affection, commitment, cooperation, and compliance, all of which is expressed in performance, also of a theoretical, practical or theoretical-practical nature. For example, when someone reads a text and interprets it (know-how), they perform an action (performance) in a theoretical context (content of the text). When an empirical mechanic repairs a vehicle (performance) they apply practical knowledge in an equally practical context (situation and conditions in which the performance occurs). (Álvarz, 2004, p.1)

On the other hand, it is agreed that interdisciplinarity is considered as a set of disciplines and as the pillar of the organization of integrated and transversal knowledge from the pedagogical point of view. In this sense, the opinion of Arrabal (2017: 6) is reaffirmed when he defines interdisciplinarity as "the crossing of boundaries, the opening to new spaces, the concern to respond to the real problems of the world, characterized by dynamism and flexibility". This thinking being akin to the philosophy of this work, its application has been carried out about the opening of new spaces such as those of the social sciences and legal sciences (Public Law) when elaborating the material for translation and interpreting practices in the higher education classroom. In this way, it is possible to respond to the real problems that arise in the work environment in the trajectory of future translators and interpreters in the context of managing the task with vulnerable groups such as UFM.

Other researchers assert that interdisciplinarity is an act of integration of several disciplines or fields of study and can exist within one or several educational institutions, as explained by Jacob (2015:2):

The terms ID and interdisciplinarity are often used interchangeably in the literature.1 The former is an adjective and the latter a noun. ID practices in higher education refer to the integration of two or more disciplines or fields of study in relation to research; instruction; and program offerings, certifications, and/or degrees. Interdisciplinarity may exist within a single institution of higher education (HEI) or between two or more HEIs. There are many types of ID practices in the higher education literature.

Following these approaches from the formative point of view in higher education in which three different areas of knowledge work in an integrated manner within the same institution. This refers
to the three arias mentioned above, all of which are located within the public institution of the Univ. Pablo de Olavide. Thus, the author chooses to a methodology of translatological practices in the classroom based on “knowing how to translate in a context of assisting UFM”. To this end, texts from different official bodies and others from entities dedicated to assisting immigrants, refugees, and UFM are used. In another section, the main procedures carried out in the classroom and the results of the work will be presented, which will show the multiple interactions between teachers and the T and I teaching tools. Finally, we will draw some conclusions and indicate future lines of work in this same direction.

Context of the Study

To answer this question, it is necessary to briefly define which migrants are referred to when this acronym is used. The definition formulated by the Council of the European Union, set out in Article I of its resolution of 26 July 1977, defines an unaccompanied minor as:

A non-EU national or stateless person below the age of 18 who arrives on the territory of the EU States unaccompanied by an adult responsible for him/her, and for as long as s/he is not effectively taken into the care of such a person, including a minor who is left unaccompanied after s/he has entered the territory of the EU States. (97/C 211/03)

This group of minors requires the services of various professionals throughout Spain, as well as to have various needs met “in terms of education, health, accommodation, transition to adult life and social support” to adapt to the host context (Bravo & Santo, 2017, pp. 55-62). It is then that translators and interpreters, social workers and technicians specialized in law enter the scene.

One of the aspects that most concern the staff in charge of UFM is the information that adolescents must provide about their history, family, and emotional life. If the information provided to the minors interviewed is incorrect or flawed, they may conceal or not want to share any information about themselves, as noted by Bravo and Santo (2017). Thus, great emphasis should be placed on the training of future translators and interpreters in this context.

Other research on UFM sheds light on a significant new migration strategy that requires attention from the legal sources of the law:

The law seeks to respond to this reality to balance the interests protected by the law on immigrants and the interest of the child, which is the core of child protection. There can be no doubt that the interest of the child - including the foreign child - must prevail because, according to the United Nations Convention, it is superior to any other interest. The following pages present the state of play and recent jurisprudential positions. In addition to its social importance due to the dimensions reached, the legal situation of foreign minors is of interest because of the concurrence of different public powers in the decision-making process, the plurality of protection regulations resulting from Spain’s devolved government to the Autonomous Communities, and because the limited judicialization of the problem to date does not allow for rigorous scientific evaluation. (González, 2007, p. 149)
Such statements reaffirm the need to introduce an interdisciplinary approach in Translation and Interpreting TPD classroom methodology as soon as possible.

In order to understand the particular vulnerability of UFM, refers to a classification mentioned in the Children’s Conference “Proposals for a social protection strategy for children” held in April 2003 at the Training Seminar on “Legal Protection of Unaccompanied Foreign Minors”, organized by Save the Children and the Universidad Pontificia Comillas de Madrid in September 2004 (González, 2007), which consists of the following:

— Unaccompanied minor children.
— Minor asylum seekers.
— Minors suffering from mental illness.
— Groups of children on the street.

Section one of the Guide to the Health Examination of UFMs published by Andalusia’s Regional Department of Health and Family in June 2019, highlights the importance of communication with minors during the process to overcome language barriers through translation and interpreting. The Guide sets out the following recommendations:

— In the first interview, a climate of trust and friendliness should be promoted, avoiding as much as possible intimidating questions and invasive procedures. The development of the interview will be facilitated by the observation of the different emotional reactions of both the minors (fear, insecurity, distrust) and the health personnel (cultural difficulties, unknown pathologies).
— To overcome language and cultural barriers, a mediator should be present to provide an understanding of the language and culture. The APHS provides translation resources through “Health Service Responds” (phone: 955545060). It may be useful to contact NGOs in the area that regularly collaborate in the assistance of these people.
— The professional should address the child directly and at the same time, respect the necessary pauses for translation and/or interpreting.
— Since the vast majority of children who come to our Community are Moroccan or sub-Saharan, a grasp of and familiarity with some common terms will create a smoother and more open interview process (Annex 4).
— A sensitive approach is needed, in an enabling environment. Ask the minor about possible symptoms and always explain the examination to be carried out through the medium of a mediator/translator. Consider consulting the multidisciplinary group of MÉDICOS DEL MUNDO Málaga (952252377), mala@medicosdelmundo.org (point 3.4)

As can be seen, the UFM context is a multidisciplinary professional field from which Translation and Interpreting TPD classroom methodology should not be excluded.
Training of Translators and Interpreters

About the task of training translators and interpreters in general, it is necessary to stress the relevance of the sociological approach. This is because translation and interpreting are activities that are based on understanding the mechanisms underlying the task itself, as Wolf states in a paper on the didactics of translation (2010:337). In this sense, according to this author, research in this field has helped the creation of a new approach in the teaching of translation and interpreting, among them is the approach that embraces translation from a socio-political aspect, an aspect related to activism or what is called the engaged and activist approach, among others.

This reflection has been one of the axes of this work, since the task of translation and interpreting in the processes of care for UFM requires preparation based on the sociological approach. It can be said that this work context on which this research has been based could belong to what is called "committed approach".

In this same work on the didactics of translation, the researcher Kelly (2010: 394) discusses several approaches used in the classroom when training translators. Among them are Vienne's (1994) situational approach, Nord's translation approach and another approach that is of interest for this study and that is Daniel Gouadec's (1994) approach. The latter approach consists of the following:

A similar approach to training is that of Daniel Gouadec, who around the same date proposed incorporating real translation commissions for real clients into training programmes organized in workshops (1994, 2003). This same idea is later taken up by Kiraly in his second major publication on translator training.

This is where the focus of attention should be placed, since in this article the basis of the actions revolves around classroom work in a real context, with real people - in this case UFM-, with real documentation and in real situations. This makes the result of the methodology followed in the classroom for the training of students the most appropriate and effective.

Without going into detail on the issue of training for translators and interpreters, a brief allusion is made to the empirical studies that deal this reality and with regard to the training of translators and interpreters (Álvarez, 2004; Serrano, 2005; Garcés & Cata, 2006, 2009, 2014, Nieto et al. (2009); among others). Throughout their cited research, these authors provide a vision of this field that reaffirms, even more, our multidisciplinary vision of formative action and which we apply in this work.

The need for methodological change responds to the evolution of today’s labor markets and demands. These changes require certain adaptations, one of which pertains to the work of translators and interpreters in public services and official bodies. Research has led to programmes
that combine training with research and practice in multidisciplinary, multilingual, and multicultural contexts.

NGOs and the translation and interpreting services that are contracted or subcontracted by the Administration represent one of the scenarios in which translators and interpreters work. Hence, translation and interpreting services are required in all areas, including the field of immigration. Translation and Interpreting students represent the future liaison between the host society and different groups of immigrants, including UFM.

Therefore, to align the training of future professionals with the changing needs of society and the labor market, our purpose is focused on bringing updated texts into the classroom, thus providing students with the necessary information to meet the desired objectives. It must be produced translated materials aimed at UFM groups.

Linking teaching to the labor market and addressing the needs and shortfalls of students in training should be one of the most urgent priorities in the field of higher education in translating and interpreting.

Other research (Kelly, 1999, 2002; Way, 2002) on interdisciplinarity in the teaching of specialized translation confirms that this practice is becoming increasingly necessary in the training of professional translators and interpreters. This is because these professionals require specific information and knowledge in different areas, including the field of law, in order to clarify concepts, terms and major questions, with a tendency towards the global. This means that the translator and interpreter must become an expert who is called upon by clients for document translation assignments and interpreting services. There is a need for development in the training of translation skills, which the authors call “translation competence and sub-competence”, which entails the active involvement of students throughout the learning process. These actions improve the student’s ability to interact in their work context from a knowledge base characteristic of an expert in the client’s own field of expertise. In our case, this argument helps us to apply this principle to the field of specialized translation for UFM groups. A translator with interdisciplinary knowledge covering translation tools and mechanisms, together with other knowledge related to Public Management in Law and/or basic skills in the field of Sociology, is a qualified translator, capable of managing a translation assignment for the Administration with all the necessary guarantees. Just like a translator, an interpreter will act under the same conditions. Moreover, this knowledge is most evident when an interpreter is working in a context involving minors. The research carried out by students of Translation and Interpreting in Arabic, English and French before translating texts or in preparation for Bilateral Translation practical assignments generates a higher degree of confidence both during the work process and in the results obtained. This same degree of effectiveness and confidence has been one of the key points displayed by translation and interpreting students of Arabic during their internships at the Seville Refugee Reception Center (CAR) during the 2017-2018 academic year.
Methodology

1. Study of the Selected Corpus

To proceed with the task of organizing the work, it is necessary to indicate that the texts selected for the translation process in the three working languages are texts and documents belonging to official bodies and entities such as: The Immigration Unit of the National Police of West Andalusia, the National Police Unit attached to the Regional Government of Andalusia, the Spanish Commission for Refugee Aid (CEAR) and the Seville Refugee Shelter (CAR):

⎯ Minor Authorization Form.
⎯ UFM interview questionnaire.
⎯ Residency application form for the resident’s children.
⎯ Application form for the temporary transfer of minors.
⎯ UFM NGO inclusion form.

The selected texts contain data relating to the competent body, either the Public Administration (Regional Government of Andalusia or the State) or the Humanitarian Organizations (NGOs). These data are found in the header of each document, so that students know the organizational reporting structure of each body.

The rest of the references are personal data, some of which are requested by the managing body. The language and terminology used in this sense are very varied, but most terms are from the judicial and legal field.

2. Subjects involved in the project:

Regarding the subjects involved in this methodological experiment have been the following subjects belonging to the academic year 2019-2020 of the Degree and Double Degree in Translation and Interpreting of the Faculty of Humanities at the Pablo de Olavide University:

⎯ LCI Specialized Translation of the Arabic language, 3rd year of Degree and Double Honours Degree in T&I.
⎯ LCII Specialized Translation of the Arabic language, 3rd year of Degree and Double Honours Degree in T&I.
⎯ Interpreting Techniques B English L1, 4th year of Degree in T&I.
⎯ Terminology B French, 3rd year of Degree in T&I.
⎯ Interpreting Techniques B TPD 2-1, 4th year of Degree in T&I.
⎯ Other subjects involved in the project in order to use the results in the classroom for the benefit of the students:
⎯ Public Management, 4th year of the Double Honours Degree in Law and Political Science of Administration.
⎯ Basic Skills in Sociology, first year of the Degree in Sociology and Social Work.
3. Methodology and classroom work

It should be noted that, from the outset, the methodology used in the translation and interpreting classroom, in Arabic, English, and French, has considered a major factor in achieving optimal results. This factor seeks to awaken the interest of students in the qualitative values obtained in the texts and the tools made available to the students as material for the subjects in terms of assisting UFM groups. Furthermore, texts related to the basic skills required of a translator/interpreter in this work context are made available to the student. Hence, before beginning the process of translating the selected texts, the teachers provide the students with reading texts on the origin and history of the UFM groups and the regulations in force in the national and international spheres. Likewise, the way in which official bodies (Immigration Units and MENOR units) carry out the public management of UFM is detailed. In this way, the author starts from a globalized vision and gradually moves towards a translatological approach.

One of the aspects covered in practical classroom teaching is the analysis of the types of legal-administrative texts used when assisting UFM and aspects of these texts.

Selected texts for each TPD session are provided so that students can prepare a pre-translation analysis that will be reviewed and discussed in the classroom. Corrections will be made through a whole-class discussion, considering various alternatives and solutions to possible difficulties encountered, encouraging teamwork, and considering the cultural and linguistic diversity of the final recipient in the case of the child him or herself, or whether the final recipient is the administration.

Furthermore, to address the problems that arise in the process of translation and interpreting caused by intercultural clashes when assisting UFM, the following actions have been carried out:

Reading and discussion in the Virtual Classroom forums of the course about the legal and social aspects related to UFM.

Training and informative talks by associations and humanitarian organizations involved in the process of assisting UFM. These included talks given by technicians and social workers from entities such as: The Association for Cooperation and Development with North Africa (CODENAF) and the Spanish Commission for Aid to Refugees (CEAR).

Talks were also given by staff from the National Police Immigration Units in Andalusia. These are the officials responsible for activating the UFM protocol and oversee the documentation process from the beginning of the assistance phase up to the provision of accommodation in specialized centers run by Andalusia’s Regional Government.
Although it is not possible here to make a very broad analysis of the development of these activities, we do want to point out the relevance of this type of actions in which a further step is taken in the training of students from a sociocultural perspective.

Another of the activities processed in this regard is the presentation of the work undertaken by students from the three areas involved in the project by way of a conclusion. The result of this action is included as a basis for the work carried out during subsequent academic years in the same subjects. The analysis conducted by the students is clearly beneficial to other students following in their footsteps, as a chain of reflections and conclusions that affect their way of viewing this work context.

4- Timing and schedule of the work:

The following is the timeline of the temporization of the classroom work of all the subjects involved:

September/October 2019: (Common to all Degrees).
- Compilation and preparation of documents.
- Constitution of working groups of teachers and students in the Areas.
- Informative meeting between those responsible for the official bodies and teachers to define the tasks to be carried out.
- Organization of training activities for students.
- Distribution of the material to the work teams.
- Work planning.

A) For T&I students:

October 2019/February 2020:
- 1st phase of translation of documents by the students and revised by the teaching staff.

February 2020:
- Conduction of a first evaluation by students and faculty.
- Preparation of a guide of difficulties and incidents during the translation process.
- Elaboration of interviews with those responsible involved in the process of implementation of the protocol of care for UFM in Seville, in all the languages involved.

February/April 2020:
- Corrections of the 1st phase.
- 2nd phase, consisting of the translation of the documents used in the protocol with supervision of the teachers.
- June 2020: Preparation of the final material: translated documents.
- Elaboration of a general evaluation guide and a guide that collects the work done in all the languages involved.

B) For students of the Sociology and Public Management Degrees:

October 2019/February 2020:
— Each group of students will submit the papers with a commentary related to the requirements of the subject in question.
— The professor proceeds to the correction of the students' work.
— Generate a debate in class on the social reality and possible changes that could be introduced in this type of texts, in order to meet the needs of foreign minors given the case that they are not entitled to legal aid.

February / April 2020:
— Elaboration by the students of a critical analysis based on the basic competences and reflecting the skills related to each of the branches of these two subjects.
— Carry out an evaluation by the teaching staff of said analysis and the sharing of the results of the work in each subject.

June / October 2020: (Common to all Degrees)
— Dissemination and publication of the results of the research work carried out.

Results and discussion
Since this activity is classified as a teaching innovation action in the classroom involving three different branches of knowledge (Humanities, Law and Social Sciences), it is extremely necessary to verify the degree of fulfillment of the objectives set, the following evaluation actions are proposed:
— The elaboration of questionnaires/surveys both quantitative and qualitative to evaluate the activity from the students' perceptions regarding the difficulties encountered.
— This evaluation will be carried out individually for students of the Degree in Translation and Interpreting, students of Public Law and students of Sociology and, finally, a general evaluation common to all the subjects involved will be carried out as a final evaluation.
— Likewise, students will be able to express their degree of satisfaction and the learning support provided by the activity. In the same way, the degree of professional interest that this activity awakens in the students of each area will be evaluated.
— The opinions of the participating teachers will be evaluated to improve future research teaching actions along the lines of this activity and to detect the students' shortcomings when dealing with the management and work in this area.
— A report on the results of the work carried out by the students will be sent to the organizations involved in this action. Also, their opinion will be requested on the subject and the evaluation of the degree of usefulness of this type of actions. To this end, specific questionnaires will be prepared to determine how the results of this work would help to improve the attention to UFM in the reception and identification phase.
— On the other hand, teaching materials will be developed for the practice of this type of texts in the classroom. Likewise, an analysis will be carried out to detect the students' shortcomings and difficulties for future translation and interpretation work, work related to the sociological analysis of intercultural and interlinguistic mediation in vulnerable sectors, and work related to the analysis of public law in this field.
The results of this work have been directly reflected in the following actions:

— The research topics for final degree dissertations in the T&I Department include this field as an alternative for working with students, and they have selected the topic as an option.
— The students have chosen to complete their internships in UFM’s Center.
— The training sessions organized by the teaching team and attended by technicians from the entities involved in assisting UFM have borne fruit in the form of students volunteering as translators and interpreters.

Another of the key outcomes, which cannot yet be quantified, is social awareness. The methodology followed in this work generates discussion both in the classroom and in discussion forum activities that demonstrates the knowledge gained about this issue at a personal and social level. This is undoubtedly a valuable contribution to the training of future translators and interpreters, as stated by authors such as Cano (2014), Díaz et al. (2018) or Garcés (2011).

Regarding future projection, this classroom teaching innovation action aims to train students from three different areas, using a transversal, socio-cultural and linguistic approach, as an alliance of social commitment and research. Thus, students who are studying the specific competencies of Translation and Interpreting also acquire the transversal skills of Political Law and Sociology. The same applies to each of the subjects taught on the other two Degrees. The teachers participating in this Action instruct their students in a methodology that goes beyond the simple translation of a source text into a target text, and which is grounded in the analysis of social reality and the handling of that reality by Public Administration.

This will allow us to undertake new didactic work based on this three-dimensional approach, which can provide new alternatives to the texts used when receiving and identifying vulnerable foreign minors. These alternatives will improve the management of Public Administrations and humanitarian organizations when dealing with UFM.

As an example, one of the questionnaires carried out in the Public Management classroom is shown below:

PUBLIC MANAGEMENT - TEACHING INNOVATION PROJECT
"Multidisciplinary work on the process of care for Unaccompanied Foreign Minors (UFM) in Andalusia: Sociology, Public Law and Translation and Interpreting areas."

— QUESTIONNAIRE
— How are UFM's Centers managed?
— What services are offered?
— How are the services provided evaluated?
— Analyze
— Necessary documentation
Lecture notes on management modalities and public/private partnerships

1. UFM's centers are:
   a. Privately owned centers that are managed with private funds.
   b. Publicly owned centers that are managed by a public administration.
   c. Publicly owned centers that are managed by a private entity.

2. The management modality of the UFM's centers is a
   a. Privatization
   b. Outsourcing
   c. Direct management by a public administration

3. Direct management of a public service
   a. It never involves collaboration with other actors
   b. It may involve collaboration with other actors
   c. Always involves collaboration with other actors

4. What type of public-private collaboration is carried out in the UFM System of Care?
   a. Service Contracts
   b. Concessions
   c. Agreements
   (Explain)

5. What types of agreements can be carried out by the Department of Equality, Social Policies and Conciliation?
   a. Collaboration agreements
   b. It is not competent to sign agreements
   c. Collaboration, coordination, and consultation agreements

6. Between what types of entities is a Collaboration Agreement executed?
   a. Between public and private entities
   b. Between public entities
   c. Both above are correct

7. What programs does SAMU offer in relation to UFM's?
   a. They are varied and depend on the situation and age of the minor.
   b. Foster care program
   c. Health care

8. Do UFM's centers offer translation services?
   a. Yes
   b. No
   c. I don't know

9. To what extent are/would Translation services be important?
   a. Not at all
   b. Not very
c. Quite a bit
d. A lot (Justify)

10. What is a Service Charter?
a. An instrument to promote the quality of public services.
b. An instrument to promote the efficiency of public services.
c. Instrument to promote the efficiency of public services.

11. What is a Quality Commitment?
a. A general statement on the quality of a service
b. An objective that is set to achieve quality in the service.
c. A contract with the customer of the service

12. How is a quality commitment measured/evaluated?
a. According to its adequacy to the general objectives of the organization.
b. By analyzing the clauses of the contract
c. By establishing indicators

13. Do the entities that manage the reception of UFM's have Service Charters?
a. Yes
b. No
c. I don't know

Make an evaluation on the management modality of the UFM's centers and indicate at the end what you thought of a practice on this subject.

Conclusion

The impetus for this work has been that the author has realized that the texts used in the practices of university teaching in the Degree of Translation and Interpreting are not adequate to the new contexts of work in professional life. Thus, the purpose of this research is to offer a vision of the training situation of T&I students from a multidisciplinary point of view and specifically, in the context of dealing with and assisting UFM groups.

Analyzing the actions carried out in the classroom with respect to practical Translation and Interpreting teaching through this methodological innovation action, the training of translators and interpreters depends to a great extent on the teaching received at university level. In this respect, it is believed that one of the most effective tools in preparing students to face the problems they will encounter in the professional field is to offer an interdisciplinary approach.

This action reinforces the skills and sensibilities that stimulate students and provides them with a logical way of reasoning from an intercultural point of view. It is known from the comments in the discussion forums that our students acquire a new capacity to ask questions for research, from a comprehensive viewpoint. The practice of professional translators and interpreters with this
vulnerable group is a responsibility that must be undertaken and developed with the necessary scientific knowledge, but in an honest way and with the utmost care.

The students are strengthened through collaborative work with groups from different disciplines that helps to create a social and universal conscience from the field of cross-cultural research.

Undoubtedly, future translators and interpreters who have been able to carry out their practical studies grounded in a current and updated reality will be able to face any problems that arise in a more decisive way. Along the same lines, the texts translated into the three working languages (Arabic, English and French) are proving useful for the task of preparing teaching materials for the translation and interpreting classroom in these three languages.

Finally, it is believed that this work represents an aid to future translation and interpreting professionals to become familiar with their working environment. This is clearly an advantage that will favor the development of the task in the best possible way, increasing the quality of the results obtained. Likewise, our results point to certain trends that could serve as an experimental methodological basis for future actions in the T and I classroom.

About the Author:

Dr. Hanan Saleh Hussein is a PhD Associate Professor in the Area of Arabic and Islamic Studies in the Department of Philology and Translation at the Pablo de Olavide University in Seville since 2010. She studied Hispanic Philology and T&I at the University of Ain Shams (Egypt). She is a translator and interpreter in the private and judicial field and a teacher and trainer in the field of Arabic language and culture for the National Police Force. ORCID: http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6905-4267

References


Websites:
http://www.codenaf.org/ [7.06.2020]
https://www.cear.es/ [7.06.2020]

Annexes in source language
Texts for translation practice in the context of UMFs Source text in Spanish for translation into the three languages: Arabic, English and French.

Appendices
Texts of the annexes translated from the source language (Spanish) to English.

Appendix A
Text One: UFM coming of age regulations.

Coming of age
The minors under guardianship who have a residence permit and reach the age of majority may request the renewal of the permit. For its renewal, which will take into special consideration the degree of integration of the applicant into Spanish society, the same procedure will be followed as that established for the renewal of a temporary non-profit residence permit, although the amount to be accredited as economic means for its maintenance is established in an amount that represents 100% of the Public Indicator of Income from Multiple Effects (IPREM) monthly.
The validity of the renewed authorization will be two years unless a long-term residence permit is required.

At the time of their coming of age or during any subsequent moment, they may request the modification of the current residence authorization to obtain a residence and work authorization.

In the case of minors for whom a child protection service has legal guardianship, custody, provisional protection, or guardianship, who reach the age of majority without having obtained a residence permit and have participated adequately in the training and activities planned by that entity to promote their social integration, it may recommend the granting of a temporary residence permit in exceptional circumstances. If it is granted, a temporary residence permit or residence and work permit for employees or self-employed persons will be granted.

The application for temporary residence authorization due to exceptional circumstances shall be submitted in person by the foreigner to the Immigration Office for the province in which he or she is domiciled during the sixty calendar days prior to or during the ninety calendar days.
following the date on which he or she turns eighteen, and he or she must provide proof of this alternatively:

1. That he has sufficient economic means to support himself, in an amount representing 100% of the IPREM monthly.
2. That he has a work contract or contracts of successive duration and meets the requirements established for such purpose.
3. Who meets the requirements established for the exercise of a self-employed activity?

However, the expected return on the project must be, at least, an amount to ensure the expenses related to their food and accommodation that represents 100% of the IPREM monthly.

Appendix B

Text Two: UFM regulations on repatriation

Repatriation of the unaccompanied foreign minor

The Delegation and Sub-delegation of the Government in whose territory the home of the minor is located will be competent to carry out the procedures related to the repatriation of an unaccompanied foreign minor, including the practice of previous informative actions and, if necessary, the initiation, processing, and resolution of the repatriation procedure.

The Government Delegation or Sub-delegation, through the General Commissioner for Foreigners and Borders, will request a report from the diplomatic representation of the child's country of origin on the child's family circumstances, as well as any information on the child's situation from the entity that has been assigned legal guardianship, custody, provisional protection, or care.

The procedure for the repatriation of the child shall be initiated when, according to the reports, it is considered that the best interests of the child are served by reuniting him/her with his/her family or by making him/her available to the protection services of his/her country of origin.

Once the established procedures have been completed (allegations, evidence, etc.), after having heard the minor if he or she has sufficient evidence, and after receiving a report from the child protection services and the Public Prosecutor's Office, the State Administration will decide, in accordance with the principle of the best interests of the minor, on the repatriation of the minor to his or her country of origin or to the country where his or her family is located, or on his or her stay in Spain.

Those over sixteen and under eighteen years of age will be recognized as capable of acting in the repatriation procedure, as well as in the contentious-administrative jurisdictional order for the same purpose and may intervene personally or through the representative they designate.

In the case of minors under sixteen years of age, with sufficient judgment, who have manifested a will contrary to that of the person who holds their guardianship or re-presentation, the course of the procedure shall be suspended until the appointment of the judicial defender to represent them. Without prejudice to the fact that this degree of maturity may be appreciated at a lower age, it shall be understood that the foreigner over twelve years of age has sufficient judgment.
If the repatriation is resolved, it will be carried out either through family reunification or by making the child available to the child protection services of the country of origin. If the minor is involved in a legal process and this fact is accredited in the administrative file of repatriation, the execution of this will be conditional on judicial authorization.

Appendix C

Text Three: UFM residence regulations

*Residence of the unaccompanied foreign minor*

If it is proven that it is impossible to repatriate the minor, and in any case after nine months have passed since the minor was placed at the disposal of the competent services for the protection of minors, a residence permit will be granted.

The procedure may be initiated ex officio by the Aliens Office of the province in which the child's domicile is located, or by superior order, or at the request of the child protection service.

**Documentation**

- In the event of having initiated the procedure ex officio, the Aliens Office will communicate the agreement to begin and will require the mandatory documentation from the child protection service.
- In the case of initiation at the request of the child protection service, at the Aliens Office of the Government Delegation or Sub-delegation of the province in which the foreign minor has set his or her home, the application form (EX-01) must be submitted in duplicate, duly completed, and signed by the child protection entity.
- Original and copy of the complete passport, travel document or valid identity card of the minor.
- Documentation accrediting the representation of the service of protection of minors in favor of the natural person who presents the application.
- Documentation accrediting the legal guardianship, custody, provisional protection, or guardianship between the minor and the protection service.
- Decree, Agreement or Resolution of the Public Prosecutor's Office of making available.

---

i. [https://www.juntadeandalucia.es/boja/2019/31/11](https://www.juntadeandalucia.es/boja/2019/31/11)

ii. This information refers to “Action 2” teaching innovation projects carried out by the author of this work as coordinator of a teaching team during the 2017/2018 and 2018/2019 academic years. The projects have been managed in classrooms with real material belonging to the Seville Refugee Reception Center (CAR).

iii. The title of the teaching innovation project is “Multidisciplinary work on the process of care for unaccompanied foreign minors in Andalusia: Areas of Sociology, Public Management and Translation and Interpretation”.


v. [https://www.cear.es/](https://www.cear.es/)
Arabic Contemporary Poetic Drama: Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir A Pioneer

Yahya Saleh Hasan Dahami
English Department, Faculty of Science and Arts, Al Mandaq
Al Baha University, Saudi Arabia
Email: dahami02@gmail.com

Received: 12/8/2020  Accepted: 2/9/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Many central playwrights significantly contributed to the progress and advancement of Arabic drama. They were apt to achieve dramatic illustrations in several Arabic countries all the way through ages and places. Still, this study attempts to shed light on an innovator poet-dramatist who represents many cultures and experiences. It aims at displaying the most significant features of renovation associated with the development of the modern Arabic poetic drama that employs history and social problems to present a vision for Arabic literature in the contemporary age. The researcher adopts the critical-descriptive approach in analyzing the poet-dramatist, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir, and two of his poetic dramas. It is mapped with an introductory overview dealing with a concise notion of drama, concentrating predominantly on poetic drama. The foremost part copes with the developer and pioneer Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir, focusing on his thoughts and experiences in the field. The paper, then, moves ahead to deal with two verse plays as a model of his craftsmanship and mastery. After that, the study finishes with a brief argument and/or recommendations and an end.

Keywords: Arabic drama, Arabic literature, Bakatheer, growth, innovation, Poetic drama

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.3
Introduction

Drama in general and poetic drama, in particular, is one of the most beautiful literary arts and the most acceptable expressive means; a person can convey his message by presenting a play. Drama was, in the beginning, a way to bring people closer to belief, refine them, and teach them. It provides the distinction between good and evil, right and wrong until it becomes an independent art like the other literary types such as poetry, novel, and the short story. It occupied a prominent position among the scientific and cultural circles and sometimes surpassed the other literary arts. Drama was initially a way to bring people closer to confidence, discipline them, and teach. Drama is enriched by the singers and represented by the actors.

Drama has existed among all the peoples of the world since ancient times. As available documents indicate, this art originated first in Greece and developed then spread through different countries and centuries. The plays' subjects were initially on gods, religious rituals, and idols and then flourished in the palaces of kings and princes, in which they enjoyed them.

1. Poetic Drama

The poetic drama continued to spread worldwide, and its presence began to strengthen with the successive days, in which many playwrights appeared to have enabled this genre to stand competitive to prose drama. It imposed itself within the map among modern European literature. One of the great pioneers of this genre is the Norwegian writer Henrik Ibsen (1828 – 1906). He:

Is a poet and playwright from Norway. He is estimated to be the major playwright representing the realities of modern life. Under Ibsen’s influence, serious drama from 1890 onward ceased to deal with themes remote in time and place. He began his literary career as a poet where he wrote good poetic dramas such as Brand and Peer Gynt, but then he abandoned poetry in his plays. Ibsen had taught men that drama, if it was to live a true life of its own, must deal with the human emotions, with things near and valuable to ordinary people (Dahami, 2017, p. 18).

What makes the distinction between poetic drama and prosaic drama is a sort of duplication in action. In a poetic play, poetry and movement are made fundamental to each other. They are not only brought together but also they are interchangeable and homogenous. The preference of verse in drama has appealed too many poet-dramatists through different ages and different places, such as Shakespeare, Marlowe, Milton, Yeats, Christopher Fry, Christopher Isherwood, James E. Flecker, Eliot, Ahmad Shawgi, Salah Abdo As-Sabour, An-Nagash, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir and many several others. They had the belief “that drama in verse is a center of cultural and proper rehabilitation” (Dahami, 2020c, p. 3; Dahami, 2018a, p. 484). In addition, verse and action in a poetic drama mutually enhance each other. Poetic drama enjoys two things: a poetic speech device like rhythm, which appears natural to performers and audience, as well as the supremacy and influence to express individual appeal. Furthermore, “It is believed that poetic drama has the
aptitude to pierce into the sources of action and passion of human beings” (Dahami, 2018b, p. 158).

In a poetic play, the verses’ expressions actually have a richer connotation than the expressions used in a prose play. “Coleridge in *Biographia Literaria*, confirms that the nature of poetic expression and its depth can be better achieved in verse than in prose” (Dahami, 2016, p. 158). Coleridge says, “It is certain that poetry when it has attained this excellence, makes a far greater impression than prose. So much so indeed, that even the gratification which the very rhymes afford becomes then no longer a contemptible or trifling gratification” (Sampson, 2015, p. 107; Coleridge, 2009, p. 316).

Some prose dramas are more limited in their profundity of expression than verse dramas because poetry significantly builds up the term. Eliot, the pioneer of poetic drama in twentieth-century England, declares, in his critical essays about poetic drama that verse is the right language of dramatic action in the theater. “Eliot was occupied with writing flowing poetic dramas in his modern age. His preoccupation was how to make such dramas better apply a modern language as its medium” (Dahami, 2020b, p. 76). The matter is similar with Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir. The most excellent drama is principally poetic, where poetry is fundamental, not incidental. A poetic drama has enough flexibility to convey anything and is considerably more apparent and more profound than a prose drama. Inherently, the verse is an appropriate compound to prose as a dramatic idiom because poetry can offer better occasions for the interaction and relationship of action, sentiment, and attitude.

In a poetic drama, verse establishes and creates the third voice in poetry, wherein the poet is “saying, not what he would say in his own person, but only what he can say within the limits of one imaginary character addressing another imaginary character” (Jackson, 2014, p. 192; De Molina, 2013, p. 59; Eliot, 2000, p. 80). Poetry and drama are integrated that “poetry expresses the most intense emotion only with a dramatic situation consisting of a persona whose identity is separate from the author’s, and who addresses other characters and an audience according to particular circumstances dictated by plot action” (Dahami, 2016; Skaff, 1986, p. 104).

Several critics may opine that this art has originated among the Arabs due to the literary connections and ties between Arabs and the people of the West in the modern era. One of the pioneers in this genre contributing to its progress is Marun An-Naqqash, who tried to revive this art through serious attempts after experiencing theater and plays in Italy. They significantly influenced him, and then when he returned home to Lebanon, he tried to establish a group with his friends and taught them the art of drama and theater. Not only that but also, he wrote his first play, *The Miser* (*البخيل*), which saw the light on the stage in 1847.

Several Arab dramatists wrote their plays in prose and others in verse, as it is natural with other languages. Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir (1910-1969) is one of the pioneers who mastered Arabic poetic plays among several others such as Ahmed Shawgi (1870-1932), Mohammad Aziz Abathah...
(1898-1973), Salah Abdul Saboor (1931-1981), Abderrahman Ash-Shargawi (1921-1987) and many others, in which poetic drama, through their hands progressed and cultivated.


Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir (باكثير) – also written as Bakatheer or Bakatair – is considered one of the most prominent Arab literary writers of the twentieth century. He is the author who is unique in producing many different literary arts, such as drama, poetry, and novel. He wrote more than seventy literary works in prose as well as in poetry long and short, which dealt with several social, historical, and religious Arabic issues. Ba-Kathir was born in Surabaya (Indonesia) in 1910 to Arab parents from Yemen. He is a man of multiculturalism, in which his birth was in Indonesia, his family originally is from Yemen, and he lived in Egypt as an Egyptian citizen.

Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir was one of the most famous Arabic dramatists during the forties and fifties of the twentieth century. He was a great author and poet. When he was ten years old, his father traveled with him to Siyoon city in Hadramout to be raised in an Arabic and Islamic way with his brothers and sisters. He started writing poetry when he was thirteen years old and got his education in the school of An-Nahthah Al-Elmiah (مدرسة النهضة العلمية). He has been taught Arabic and Islamic law by many great sheikhs such as his uncle the judge, poet, linguistic and grammatical Mohamed Ba-Kathir.

It has been said that Ba-Kathir is one of the pillars of modern Arabic literature. However, his fame was less than some of his contemporaries because he preferred the distance from the focus of public attention, avoiding selfish talk about himself, without missing sight of the frenzied attacks against him late in his life. Nevertheless, it is true that the most prominent literary field in which Ba-Kathir excelled, and known for his abundance of production, is drama in general and poetic drama in particular. Ba-Kathir has accomplished and produced more than thirty-five diverse prose plays, ranging from the publication to the manuscript, including The Promised Pharaoh (1945), Omar Al-Mukhtar (1948), Dar Ibn Luqman (1960), and the War of Al-Basus (1990). Among his eminent plays, one could remark The Caliph's Jester, which was performed at the Royal Opera House in Cairo.

He is considered one of the pioneers of Arab theatrical literature who played a significant role in developing this literary genre. He was influenced by Shawgi’s plays when he read them in his travel through Al-Hijaz. He had acquired a relevant experience and learned how poetry can be useful and operative in life and how the poet expresses himself and deals with historical events or issues that touch the nation’s need.

During his stay in Hadramout, Ba-Kathir married when he was young but was shocked by his wife's death in her youth shortly after their marriage. This painful incident deeply moved him; he wrote several poems as an elegy of her passing away. Moreover, he dedicated the first play he wrote to her soul. He then left Hadramout to reside in Aden in 1931. Still, he did not stay long,
then moved to Ethiopia and Somalia before traveling to Al-Hijaz, in which he settled there for a reasonable period of time where he was able to organize and compose a notable work titled Al-Burdah or The Memory of the Prophet.

He composed his first work in poetic drama, which he printed on his arrival to Egypt entitled Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf. This play was reprinted in Aden with little modifications in 1967, in which he included a number of his reform ideas that shaped his thought throughout his stay in Hadramout. This play was considered one of the first Arab social poetic plays in which the Arab poetic dramas were dominated by historical characteristics, in events, themes, and characters.

After four years of writing Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, he wrote his second play Akhenaten and Nefertiti (إخناتون ونفرتیتی) in 1938 and published in the same magazine in 1940. After more than four years, his third play, The Palace of Howdah or Qasr Al-Howdaj (قصر الهودج), which was published in 1944. It can be said that Ba-Kathir wrote his poetic plays in ten years from 1934 to 1944. His first poetic play Tammam fi Bilad Al-Ahgaf was written in the traditional rhythm and rhyme style.

He was the first to write the operetta in classical Arabic as the play called Ash-Shayma (شادية الإسلام) (الشيماء شادية الإسلام) (1969), a historical religious play. Ash-Shayma is the sister of Prophet Muhammad (µ) from breastfeeding. She is the daughter of Halimah As-Saadiah, the Prophet's nurse, and is the focal point of this play. It is composed of five chapters. Through this play, in intelligence, and through a captivating dialogue, Ba-Kathir presents the prophetic biography's many events. In this play, poetry is mixed with prose as a necessary element suitable for singing. Ash-Shayma has a sweet voice that through this beautiful voice; she used to sing with meaningful and profitable poetry of variation and flexibility. She is calling for Islam and the support of her brother, the Prophet of Islam. She confronts the tyrants who used to take ploy against the Prophet, starting with her husband, Bejad, and the polytheists' leader in Mecca named ‘Ekremah ibn Abi Jahl and others. Her brother Abdullah, her father Al-Harith ibn Abdul A’za, and her mother Halimah As-Saadiah supported and maintained her mission.

Ba-Kathir arrived in Egypt, where he polished his literary background by joining the English Department at Cairo University, from which he ultimately obtained the bachelor's degree in literature in 1939. After that, in 1954, he traveled after receiving a free scholarship to France, and after he effectively finished the scholarship, he returned to live in Egypt, where he married for the second time. He liked and enjoyed life in Egypt, where he saw eminent authors, for instance, Najeeb Mahfouth, Taha Husien, Tawfig Al-Hakeem, and many other pioneers.

In 1955, he moved to work in The Ministry of Culture after working as a teacher for almost fifteen years. Then he shifted to the department of the monitoring of the artistic productions, where he continued working until his demise (Al-Hawari, 2017, p. 235). He was the first author in Egypt
who was given the free fellowship. He got an open fellowship for two years to complete his enormous Islamic poetic legend about the dutiful, obedient, and rightful caliph Omar Ibn Al-Khattab. This voluminous literary and historical work is composed of nineteen parts.

Ba-Kathir obtained a diploma of teaching from the Teachers’ Higher Institution. He stayed in Egypt and worked as a teacher while authoring several fruitful historical and literary works. He enjoyed reading English poetry remarkably free verse, preferring writing in blank verse after acquiring its basis from reading and studying English poetry. “It can be said that he is among the first who started this sort of new poetry” (Munaif, 2006, p. 360). There is a challenging story for such a preference. Al-Khateeb, (2009), sheds light on the way Ba-Kathir mastered blank verse. Ba-Kathir tells about the reason for this occasion, saying that when he was in one of the English classes, the English teacher took a lecture on English blank verse. The teacher said; this sort of poetry did not succeed in any other language as it grew in English. He adds: the French themselves wanted to emulate this type of English verse but failed as is in English; of course, he adds that there is no such thing in this language in Arabic. Ba-Kathir opposed saying: I objected to the teacher’s views and told him that every nation has its artistic traditions in its poetry, and it is the tradition of the Arabs to adhere to the one rhythm and rhyme. It is their style of expression and their artistic style. He confirmed that there is nothing to prevent creating such a kind of poetry in the Arabic language because it can deal with linguistic variations that are not available in any other language. The teacher showed his dissatisfaction, which I still remember that he said; nonsense.

Ba-Kathir adds; I went out of class directly to my house. I continued thinking about this verse, but this challenge made me accomplish what I had right away in my mind. I came home during the day and resorted to the nearest thing that helps me emulate this verse. Then I found the English version of Romeo and Juliet. I chose a scene and continued to treat it with such poetry until I made it close to my desire. Then it occurred to me to translate the whole play from the first until the end. After that, I worked on it until I accomplished it; this is the first experience (Al-Khateeb, 2009, pp. 24-25).

Therefore, Ba-Kathir translated a scene from Shakespeare's Romeo and Juliet in Arabic blank verse in which it was a gate for him to the renewal of the new form of Arabic poetry, but he did not finish it. When he finished writing his central play Akhenaten and Nefertiti, he returned to the play Romeo and Juliet and finished it in full with a mixture of the blank verse and free verses. It is a type of poetry that is exempt from restrictions of rhyme, and it is flexible. However, “Shakespeare did not only influence poets of his age who dealt with blank verse and poetic dramas, but also, he greatly influenced poets and dramatists of the twentieth century” (Dahami, 2020a).

Ba-Kathir, in his book The Art of the Play from My Personal Experiences (1964), declares that he did not adhere to one specific rhythm in his plays. However, he used the various ones required by the poetic situation, taking into account their compatibility with different expressions. He tried to avoid the continuation of the same rhythm and rhyme as possible so that the play is not
a collection of poems added to each other. He is keen to diversify the rhymes to be more informed in the musical toning (p. 18). As for his play, The Palace of Howdah, Ba-Kathir wrote it in lyric poetry. He took great care about it that the play should be suitable for singing (Ittiḥād al-Kuttāb al-'Arab, 2004, p. 44; Rābiṭat al-Adab al-Islāmī, 1993, p.2).

Ba-Kathir has directed three poetic plays, presented various experiences inside them, and opened a new gate for the Arab poetic play. His Arabic play Romeo and Juliet is written in verse and has great importance for critics, readers, and students because Ba-Kathir, the poet-dramatist, directed it after a sort of challenge. In writing his dramas, he deals with ancient themes but made the texts of his plays suit his goals and introduces them to tackle the social and political problems that the Arabic nation suffers from, particularly in his country of residence, Egypt.

Ba-Kathir’s life was full of intellectual and literary contributions. He left the Arabic nation with a wide range of creative and literary texts divided between drama, novels, poetry, and other academic and critical essays. However, it is noticeable that he began his literary career with poetry writing before moving on to link poetry with drama to create poetic dramas. He also skillfully wrote prose dramas, as well as translating texts from foreign languages he was fluent in. Nevertheless, the dramas, both kinds, the poetic and prose, shaped the literary field in which Ba-Kathir excelled. He published two collections of seven texts in his lifetime, ‘From Above Seven Heavens’ (Ba-Kathir, 1989), and the epic called ‘This is How God Met Omar’.

Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir knew many languages such as English and French besides his native language, Arabic. He composed many poetic plays, such as The Tragedy of Oedipus that was interpreted into English. The Chain and Forgiveness [Al-Selsilah wal-Ghfran 1951] “makes a much more straightforward religious statement, presenting a parable set in medieval Egypt illustrating how an act of forgiveness breaks the chain of evil. Arab scholars have called this the first allegorical play in Arabic literature” (Carlson, 2019, p. 46). In addition, he wrote The Secret of the Ruler by the Command of Allah. It is a tragic play that tells the story of the Fatimid Caliph Al-Hakim bi-Amr Allah and the secret of his claim to divinity. The play was written and published in 1947 and was performed on the stage several times. The dramatist shared many social and artistic and social conferences. He was a member of the Story Club and was rewarded with a prize from the Ministry of Knowledge in 1949 because of the successful poetic play The Chain and Forgiveness (1951). After a prosperous literary life, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir died in 1969 owing to a heart attack. He was buried in the family graveyard of his second wife.

Ba-Kathir singled out the Palestinian issue in a large part of his plays, whether poetic or prose, long or short, before or after the catastrophe of 1948 because the case was a stream of blood in his veins. He used to publish a short play every week to reach fifty short plays and five extensive plays. Ba-Kathir was the first writer to deal with the question of Palestine, dramatically, on the Arab theater and drama with his long play The New Shylock 1944 [شيلوك الجديد], which is divided
into two parts, the Problem and The Solution. Because of such division, he was the first who divided the play into two parts, known as a double play (Saqr, 1991, p. 167; Albir, 1970).

The dramatist has left dozens of poetic plays of different sizes, contents, and directions. They are predominantly Arabic and Islamic because they are Arabic, as many other non-dramatic works dominate it. Such works made him a pioneer in Arabic literature in general. Najeeb Al-Kailani (1987), has emphasized that “Ba-Kathir is a distinct school in most of his dramatic and theatrical productions, which bears the Islamic imprint; he is a school that has not yet taken his right by analysis, investigation, and study” (Al-Kailani, 1987, p. 47).

3. Examples of the Poetic Drama of Ba-Kathir

Ba-Kathir realized the importance of combining drama and poetry, as the theater pioneers have done since the earliest times. He believes that there is a relationship of organic syndrome throughout history between drama and poetry. The first dramas on the theater were written in verse, and the early poems written on wooden plates were dramatic, or, say, they were poetic or verse with a dramatic vision. Although drama originated in the temple as religious and legend, poetry was its foundation of tragedy as it was with the ancient Greeks and Egyptians.

Bakathi r had a distinct preference for subjects drawn from history, myth, and legend as well as folklore, a preference for which he tried to find an aesthetic justification. Even when he wished to comment on the modern world, he often found it easier to use the past as a metaphor for the present. His passionate commitment to Islam made him turn naturally to Islamic and Arab history, but his treatment of myth and legend embraced a wider field, including ancient Egyptian and Greek themes (Badawi, 2004, p. 117).

Ba-Kathir is associated with poetic drama more than other fields of literature in which he has been involved. He has dealt with various aspects of dramas such as historical, lyrical, political, social, and other poetic plays, although most of them are short in size. The numerous productions of the poet-dramatist Ba-Kathir is unmanageable to be studied in a paper like this. However, they need to be examined and analyzed in more than research or even a book. Nonetheless, this article will deal with three plays of Ba-Kathir, showing and illustrating his skillful power in this field as a pioneer of Arabic literature in the modern age.

3.1. Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf (1934)

The poet-playwright Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir is one of the pioneers who called for the reform of society through literature. It is evident in the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf. It deals with one of the most critical issues for which he devoted his life, pen, and knowledge. The examiner of Ba-Kathir’s literary works, especially the play in question, will realize that the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf is a reflection of a small part of the life of the poet-playwright Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir.
His displeasure with the life he experienced in Hadramout inspired him to produce Hammam’s poetic play in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, which illustrates the natural life in underdeveloped Hadramout and people’s ignorance and illiteracy, particularly women. When he watched and read Shawgi’s plays, Ba-Kathir wanted to emulate him but with his new color, expressing the pain inside him, for the most part, after his wife’s death and his region’s miserable state, Hadramout. Consequently, he wrote this poetic play, which he called Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf (همام في بلاد الاحقاف Hammam fi Belad Al-Ahgaf), during his stay in the city of Taif date 1934, where he used to spend summer among the writers and the literary figures of Al-Hijaz (Ghuneem, 2018, p. 333).

Ba-Kathir has written this play, Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, without sufficient familiarity with the basis and origins of drama, so he did not consider it a successful play but instead called it a poem that contained a single theme. As critics state, it did not meet successful drama requirements, such as the construction, the action, and characters. However, it has opened a new door for Ba-Kathir to write more full-fledged dramas containing all the drama elements. Ba-Kathir published his first play in the magazine Excerpt (المقتطف Al Mugtadaf) in 1934.

In the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir presents his society’s conditions in three acts. In the first act, he deals with his father’s state and the domination of backward traditional ideas that are behind the veil of religion, classic science, and the tyrannous dominant rule. The play depicts the reality of the region of Hadramout, which is the country of Al-Ahgaf that made the mind ignorant, and the woman is inexperienced. Education proceeds in a way that depends on memorization without thinking or contemplating. Therefore, many social diseases are spread, including gluttony, greediness, voraciousness, money love, and its preference over everything.

Example of the verse that illustrates Ba-Kathir’s goal in describing the undeveloped region Hadramout and his wish to help in its development and enlightenment. The verse lines are said in a dialogue between Hammam and his sister:

Brother, what is wrong with you today? I see you as a less active and very bored
Are you unwell? Evils are prevented, and may God reward you long life

Her brother Hammam responds:

That is, I have a condition in the heart, O blossom, that warns me of danger
You do know what your brother is busy with, you know what appears or that is hidden

Some verses of the reply of his sister Zahra shows the artisanship of the poet. As it is the nature of the majority of the verse in the play, lines show operative and compelling rhythm. She says:
Do not make despair a way for you; in grief, a loss of purpose
Others should rely on despondency. You should win.

After his sister consoles, pleases him, and motivates him in order to stand and not to despair of what is going on, he feels better in his mood and concern. He then responds to his sister in the same poetic way that is exquisitely rhymed and contemplated. He says:

Oh Zahra, may you are protected to serve the land; your speech dispels the sadness
You are the solace when you attend, and you are the happiness
Where is the book? Won’t you read?

Ba-Kathir called for women's education, and they have an active role in the fields of life, in the sense that women should be as pro-Islam as men should. Women, as Ba-Kathir believes, can support men by word and action even if they are forced to take up arms.

Zahra has the ability to take out advocacy and outreach classes for Hadramout women (Al-Ahgae). She succeeded in her quest, even attracting women from the anti-reformist class, and she is based on her call for the Islamic science of Qur’an and As-Sunnah. Ba-Kathir, through the mouthpiece Zahra, stands against many superstitions and the minds of the agitators of the preachers and the people of sectarian fanaticism.

His sister, Zahra, responds as if she understood his goal that useful science is one of the reasons for the progress and development of nations, saying:

Yes! The book is with me
It is a generous book deserves to be written with the light of the sight
(Reaching the Goals) and (the Paths of Peace) upon it hop the false
The talks of Taha (the Prophet) and verses of the book (Qur’an) glistening in it through the lines
The sayings of the companions and the diligent imams from every righteous pilot
The schoolboy takes from it everything that is useful and leaves the unhelpful.
The writer intervenes to add an essential explanation of what Zahra read and describes the hero of the play as improving in his condition. Then, Hammam shows a smile for what he saw from his sister's intelligence and acumen about the importance of sound science away from shadows and mental deviation. On the other hand, Ba-Kathir points to Zahra's understanding of the prominence of useful science and learning it. She also helps her brother in critical and valuable thinking. She adds:

لا فاز قارئها بالوطور
صاحب الراوح فيها ولا يصور فيها مجال الأمم ويرك فيها هم الصور
(Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 13)

The books of the rigid were not delivered, nor did their readers win a fortune
Sheets have no soul, nor the good of mankind was mentioned
They depict impossible substances and leave the most important lessons.

Hammam is content and happy because of the talks of his mature and fruitful sister. Her speech can be considered food for the mind and soul with its logic. Hammam then asks his sister to read him a chapter of the book because of its great benefits. After his sister has finished reading, and in the same poetic style and the charming and smooth flexibility of the rhythm, he asks his sister to help him in his humanitarian mission by saying:

صار فرضا عليك أن تنشري هذت الهدى في جماعة النسوان
فهدى الشعب من هدى أمم وبنات الأحقاف أولى بأن يحذق في الشتى العلوم والعرفان
(Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 14)

It became obligatory for you to spread this guidance among the group of women
The guidance of the nation is the result of the guidance of mothers in every place and time
And the girls of Al-Ahgaf are first to be proficient in various sciences and knowledge.

Zahra responds positively to her brother, confirming that she will stand by him in his noble quest, with the same delicate poetic rhythm. She chants:

لتطب يا همам نفسا فما تر جو سامع في بغير توان
Oh, Humam, let a breath solace you; I will strive for it without delay.

He thanks her for her efforts and for standing with her brother. Hammam, then, provides her with some advice in her task inviting the women of Al-Ahgaf to follow her, so he says, directing and advising his sister:

بارك الله في الصغار فيهم
نجمود الحصى فلا يهتدينا
(Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 14)

God bless the little ones, for they accept the truth when it is called
Rather, evil is in the elderly; they are frozen like the pebbles, so they are not guided.
The conversation between the hero and his sister illustrates Hammam's quest and shows directly from the very beginning the aim of the dramatist in writing this poetic play. Moreover, what is appealing is the amazing Arabic verse implemented in the lines of the play, which clearly indicates that the dramatist is a great poet. Furthermore, the writer made a direct and unambiguous indication of one of the greatest encyclopedically religious and educational books in Yemen and Arabia. The book is *The Paths of Peace: Explanations for Reaching the Goals* (2011), written by Muhammad ibn Ismail As-San’ani (1059-1182 A.H. / 1687-1768). Al-Ameer As-San’ani is a historian, a poet, and a great writer from Sana’a. He is one of the late imams of Yemen, who is estimated among the few liberal diligent, hardworking, and assiduous Yemeni intellectuals who followed the evidence from the Qur’an and As-Sunnah. As-San’ani was born in Kohlan (كحلان), near Sana’a.

In the second act, Ba-Kathir depicts other diseases such as bribery, kissing the hand of the sheikh, and visiting the places where invalid rituals are held that have nothing to do with religion. The character Hammam takes advantage of the ideas of sheikh Mohammed Abdo and Jamal Al-Din Al-Afghani to get rid of such false deeds. He wants to educate women and empower them with the means of education. He invites people to his social invitation, and his sister comes forward to help him with his mission, addressing women's meetings. Hammam addresses men to his reformation notions and finds supporters from both genders.

Here, a love story arises between Hammam and Husn, so people get angry at Hammam and his beloved, so he has no way but to emigrate, and his friend A’mer is traveling with him. Hammam returns from his travels after two years and is married to Husn in a celebration of singing, joy, and delight. The dramatist portrays with many images of the wedding ceremony in his region. The play does not end in this happy scene as is illustrated by the third act, but rather the dramatist brings another love story between Muhammad the friend of Hammam, with the girl A’lawiah. The marriage between them does not occur because the people of Muhammad do not marry their children outside their family. The people of this area do not propose the engagement to A’lawiah because she is poor. Then Muhammad gets sad, which leads him to illness as well as A’lawiah. Hammam travels at that time to Mecca to do the rituals of pilgrimage (Hajj) without taking his wife with him because she was also sick. In Makkah, he receives a telegram telling him the death of his wife Husn; thus, he stands in front of the Al-Ka’bah and recites these verses:

إن عظمت مصيبتي وخطبي
فأنت رعاني وهو حسبي
يا رب انت الواحد القهار
وانت ذو الرحمة والبار
تفجرت من نورك الأناور
وقصرت عن كنهك الأفكار
يا رب لا نقض لما ابرمتا
فرضني رب بما حكمتا
لعلني أجهل ما علمتا
اكرر بذلك عينها وعيني
(بأ-كاثير, 1934, pp. 111-112)
If my misfortune is great, Allah will take care of me, and he is my suffice
O Lord, you are the one, the subduer, and you are the one with mercy and mighty
The lights exploded from your enlightenment and fell short of your thoughtfulness
O Lord, no objection to what you decided, so, make me satisfied, Lord, with what you have decided
Possibly, I am ignorant of what you learned, what is right for me in what I have established
Oh Lord, inspire me with healing consolation and bandage my wounds with Your kindness
Bestow me the will of the ancestors, for you, are the most sufficient, how fair the recompense!
And donate me my wish in the two worlds, and gather me with Husn
In a house immortalized between two gardens, that her eye and mine to be delighted

The play is ended with a distinguished and stunning verse full of profound connotative metaphors and imaginative symbols. It opens a new gate for the dramatist to initiate other plays after acquiring sufficient experience and knowledge on drama and theater. Another poetic and dramatic work is Qasr Al-Howdah.

3.2. Palace of Howdah (1944)

Qasr Al-Howdah is a historical musical play that talks about the nobility of the commander in God's rulings, the Fatimid Caliph, through a love story like the one mentioned among the Bedouins. It is written in a style similar to the level of Lubna and Qais, and several other stories. As for the development of Qasr Al Howdah, it is the love story of Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah.

Palace of Howdah is the third poetic play, which saw the light in 1944 that Ba-Kathir was inspired by much of the Fatimid history in Egypt. He selected a social story of passion between Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah. Salma and Ibn Mayah grew up in the country, and they exchanged virtual love. Before the nest of the marriage brought them together, destiny wanted Salma to meet the Caliph who loved her as her beauty captivated him. He could no longer tolerate sleep and would not know life a taste unless he won her to be among his wives. Therefore, the Caliph, disguised, went to the tent of Sheikh Ammar bin Saad, Salma's father, on the road to the Upper Egypt desert.

In the first act, the playwright ingeniously introduces the play's conflict when love arises among lovers. An element of competition is seen when the Fatimid Caliph, The Commander of the Rulings of Allah, meets Salma and discloses his love for her disguised in his messenger's clothing. Still, Salma rejects his love because she genuinely loves her cousin Ibn Mayah. When the messenger could not convince her, he tries to tempt her for himself as though he is a messenger of the Caliph even though he is the Caliph himself:
The comer: Lived o Salma free, cities have no friends
You do not like its songs nor the elegant houses
Salma: May Allah be kind to you. You have now seen what I mean
The comer: How do I not understand? What you have I have
My opinion is like yours, Salma; my tendency is like yours
Oh, if days allow me, Salma, to have you
You are mine, not for others, and I am yours
I have a heart like yours
Salma: well ... are you senseless?
The comer: Yes, the light of my eyes
I am unwise in your love

The messenger approaches and tries to kiss her, so Salma screams, and her cousin and father come; she tells them what happened. Ibn Mayah and Salma’s father know that the one wearing the messenger’s clothes is not a messenger, but he is the Caliph himself. Ibn Mayah sadly leaves them. Salma’s father regrets what happened with the Caliph and apologizes to him. Then he goes to his daughter and consults with her about the request of the Caliph. As for Ibn Mayah, he leaves the country as well as Salma to the Caliph. Salma grieves deeply for the absent lover. Nonetheless, the Caliph knows her love for her cousin, Ibn Mayah.

Act two events occur on the island of Fustat (Al Rawthah) in the Al-Houdaj Palace that the Caliph built for his sweetheart wife. It is located on the Nile from one side, and around it, the Arab tents were struck, showing the simple life in the countryside. Before his travel, Ibn Mayah comes to say goodbye to his beloved niece, as it is not permissible for him to wander in the desert without saying goodbye. Salma, accompanied by a servant, is terrified to see him in the palace; her servant withdraws to the balcony, leaving the two relatives alone. The Caliph arrives suddenly and indicates to the servant to be silent and stay in her place. The Caliph remained in his position with the girl-servant listening to two lovers’ speech, realizing the relationship between Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah.

The Caliph hears his wife Salma blaming her cousin, who came to her at night, he did not go to her in broad daylight, and he heard her reproach him because he left her and left for
the desert. She told him that if he stayed beside her, she would hold on to him, showing that Salma did not agree to marry the Caliph, and she is not happy with this marriage, despite the comfort the Caliph provided to her. The Caliph did not leave anything to bring happiness to her. He also made the whole island her own, built the wonderful palace there, and struck tents around it to make her feel that she is among her people. Then she groans because she is unjust to her loving husband, that Salma did not repay him with the same love, so she feels unfaithful to him. The Caliph enters the room, stands before him; the two lovers are shocked, they try to explain the situation, but the Caliph orders him to be taken to prison, and he leaves her in her palace to cry for her cousin, herself, and bad luck.

In the second act, we find that Salma arrives at the Caliph’s palace that becomes her residence. Ibn Mayah comes to visit Salma secretly at night, hoping not to meet or see the Caliph but the Caliph sees him from behind the door. In his meeting with Salma, Ibn Mayah does not see the Caliph, showing his fondness for Salma, telling her that he fled the country for her to live a happy life. The Caliph suddenly appears and orders that Ibn Mayah be imprisoned for five months. As a reaction of Salma, she grieves him and cries for her loneliness. The second act tends to be followed by the third, which begins with Salma's father's arrival on the order of the Caliph. Salma's father comes to know that the Caliph has divorced Salma. Ibn Mayah is brought from prison, the Caliph gives him a dowry for marrying Salma twenty thousand dinars, and the Caliph requests the sheikh to make the engagement of marriage between Ibn Mayah and Salma. After marriage, they return home to Upper Egypt, in which several ceremonies of the wedding are held, telling that the play comes to an end. Salma and some girls sing chants and songs showing happiness and pray for the righteous Caliph.

In the third act, in Al-Houdj Palace itself, accidents happen five months after Ibn Mayah's imprisonment. Sheikh Ammar comes from the desert of Upper Egypt in response to the call of the Caliph. Salma welcomes him, but he sees her pale face asking her about her life; she does not respond, only cries. After a talk for a while, the Caliph comes, and Salma withdraws to her room; Sheikh Ammar asks his brother-in-law, the Caliph, if Salma has wronged him to discipline her. The Caliph tells him about Ibn Mayah's visit to her in the dead of night. The father revolts and asks the Caliph to slaughter him and Salma together in order to wash away the shame that they denigrated him at the end of his life. Then, the Caliph orders the bringing of Ibn Mayah. In the meantime, Sheikh Ammar has leaped on Salma, dragging her by her hair to where the Caliph sits. When Ibn Mayah is brought, Sheikh Ammar draws his dagger and jumps on him to slaughter, but the Caliph orders him to return to his seat. The Caliph says that it is not permissible to kill a person sheltered by the Caliph. So, Sheikh Ammar was surprised by the noble behavior of the Caliph. The Caliph then describes the situation he saw between the two lovers saying:

إن سلمى لم تخن زوجاً، ولا والله لم تفضح أباً
إنها أظهر من ذلك أخلاقاً، وأسمى أدباً (p. 76, Kathir, 1978)

Salma has not betrayed a husband, nor, by God, divulged a father
She is purer than that by virtue and bears utmost morals

Then the Caliph says that he divorced Salma from that moment in which Ibn Mayah was imprisoned, and Salma's timing after divorce is completed a month ago. The Caliph married Salma to Ibn Mayah, and he paid twenty thousand dowries for her. Thus, Salma returns to the desert with her husband Ibn Mayah so that they live a beloved happy couple in the bowels of the desert.

Thus, it appears that the play's theme is social, and there are similarities with what Ahamd Shawgi has written, like Majnun Laila and other Arab poet-dramatists and his book. It is the issue of love that possesses the hearts of the lovers, so they sacrifice everything for the beloved's sake. Ibn Mayah, as it is understood of the play, risks his life for the sake of a farewell look to his beloved. Salma sacrifices money, prestige, and comfortable living in a mythical palace for the sake of her cousin and lover, Ibn Mayah. It seems that the dramatist has dealt with an important issue as close as to the martyrs of virtual or platonic love. It is a love protected by chaste and virtue.

4. Discussion and Argument

As stated by Julie Scott Meisami, “Bakathir's work is of uneven quality. Many of his plays lack dramatic qualities, and his work suffers from a narrowness of vision associated with the author's passionate belief in Islam and his anti-Marxist stance” (Meisami, 1998, p. 129). Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir says in presenting the play, Qasr Al-Howdah, he tried his best, in this poetic play, to fulfill two characteristics that are indispensable for successful musical plays.

The first is adopting its language so that the ordinary audience could understand it without difficulty while preserving the radiance and poetic splendor. In this point, Ba-Kathir reminds us of the same ideas of T. S. Eliot on the poetic drama in which he wanted the language to be poetic and to be appropriate to drama. “It is the power of the dramatic verse that gives the play its unique unity and intensity. The language is the verse, which is the action, which is the theme, which is the atmosphere, which is the meaning; in other words, we have here an impressive realization of the dramatic potentials which Eliot, in his critical works, has claimed for verse” (Dahami, 2017, p. 52). The second is his way of choosing the weights and rhymes appropriate to the different narrating situations. He also tried to make them prevail in using verbal and abstracted musicality that helps the composer reach the goal of composing it.

By contemplating the play and its language, we find that the author has managed to adapt the language so that the ordinary audience understands it. The fulfillment of this condition is not easy in a historical, poetic play. Most of those who wrote the historical, poetic, or prose plays have been betrayed by success in adapting the language in works such as Majnun Laila and Antara by Shawgi, as well as Qais Lubna by Aziz Abatbah. In such plays, the spectators find it difficult to quickly grasp the meanings and their goals due to the difficulty of the used vocabulary. With this adaptation by Ba-Kathir, his style remains poetic, preserving the level that he settled in the majority of his poetic plays.
The poet variously has colored the meter and rhymes and does not stand in his works with the framework of a single poetic meter and a unified rhyme. Instead, the diversification reached the point of two and three lines in the dialogue of one character, not to mention the division of one verse between the two interlocutors in order to fulfill his aim in choosing the meters and rhymes appropriate to the different positions of the plays. We notice in the following verses between the disguised Caliph and the father of Salma, sheikh Ammar in which the line has been fragmented:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>عمار: إن بيتي لهو بيتك.</td>
<td>Ammar: My home is yours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>القادم: لا تؤاخذني فديتك ما أنا اليوم بضيف.</td>
<td>The comer: excuse me, today, I am not a guest.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عمار: ما تقول؟</td>
<td>Ammar: What are you saying?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>القادم: لا ولكني رسول.</td>
<td>The comer: No, I am only a messenger.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عمار: رسول إلي؟</td>
<td>Ammar: A messenger to me?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>القادم: نعم.</td>
<td>The comer: Yes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عمار: مرحباً بك، خير أتى بك، من أرسلك؟</td>
<td>Ammar: You are welcome, Good bring you, Who sent you?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>القادم: ملك البلاد.</td>
<td>The comer: the king of the country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>القادم: قد قال لي:</td>
<td>The comer: He had told me:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عمار: ما الذي قال لك؟</td>
<td>Ammar: What did he tell you?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, Ba-Kathir, the pioneer of rhythmical poetry, was able to weave his blank verse as rhythmical that he had previously performed in his play Romeo and Juliet. However, the poet is interested in the play’s lyrical success because the free verse is more flexible to sing from rhythmical poetry. Nevertheless, it is obviously realized that the poet-dramatist is proficient in his poetic techniques and his theatrical techniques, which has fulfilled his ambition to make suitable
poetic plays with success in poetry and drama. He made the language flexible with meter and rhymes. The dialogues are lively and far from unnecessary filling.

If there is an observation or flaw in this regard, it is the dialogue's failure to draw the characters' physical features; however, the dramatist succeeded in depicting the two dimensions of drama: the psychological and the social. He also succeeded in highlighting the conflict of all kinds between opposing personalities.

Conclusion

The plays of Ba-Kathir, whatever their nature, involve many manifestations of individuality, honesty, and originality to be qualified to obtain recognition and gratitude, ascending Ba-Kathir as one of the prominent Arab pioneers in the field of Arabic literature, particularly poetic drama. What has been presented is very little of the numerous literary productions that Ba-Kathir has produced. The experience of Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir's poetic plays illustrates multi-pictures to form the theatrical script. In the plays of Ba-Kathir, readers and critics find traditional poetry, blank verse, and free verse. Ba-Kathir's plays influenced many Arab writers, so they wrote their plays after benefiting from Ba-Kathir's poetic plays. It has been shown that the poet-dramatist, Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir, used to write his plays and literary works with deep awareness, proving that he is a master of the mechanics and rules of dramatic artistry among the pioneers of Arabic poetic drama in the contemporary age.

Recommendation

Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir has produced more than seventy literary works in the different genres of literature. Appropriately, it is strongly recommended to continue academic and scientific studies and investigations on the literary works of Ba-Kathir to put him in a real, valid, and honest rank among the best literary figures of the Arabic nation.

About the Author:

Yahya Saleh Hasan Dahami is an Associate Professor of English Literature and Criticism, working in the English Department, Faculty of Science and Arts – Al Mandaq, Al Baha University, KSA since 2010. He obtained his Ph. D. in English Literature from Jamia Millia - New Delhi, in 2004. Dahami is an active researcher and reviewer. He is a Board Member of the English Department, Al Baha University. Dahami has been the Head of the English Department and a Board Member https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0195-7878

References:


Bā-Kathīr, 'A. A. (1964). The Art of the Play from My Personal Experiences [fan almasrahiat min khilal tajaribii alshakhsia], Dar Al Ma’refah, originally from the University of Michigan.


cities: Bloomsbury.

After revising some Arabic sources, I found the name is written in two ways but the meaning can be understood differently. Humam and Hammam [هُمّام] [هُمَام], however, I preferred the second expression because it can be used as a name of a person. The second is used as an adjective more than a noun.
Arabic Contemporary Poetic Drama: Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir A Pioneer

Yahya Saleh Hasan Dahami
English Department, Faculty of Science and Arts, Al Mandaq
Al Baha University, Saudi Arabia
Email: dahami02@gmail.com

Received: 12/8/2020   Accepted: 2/9/2021   Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Many central playwrights significantly contributed to the progress and advancement of Arabic drama. They were apt to achieve dramatic illustrations in several Arabic countries all the way through ages and places. Still, this study attempts to shed light on an innovator poet-dramatist who represents many cultures and experiences. It aims at displaying the most significant features of renovation associated with the development of the modern Arabic poetic drama that employs history and social problems to present a vision for Arabic literature in the contemporary age. The researcher adopts the critical-descriptive approach in analyzing the poet-dramatist, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir, and two of his poetic dramas. It is mapped with an introductory overview dealing with a concise notion of drama, concentrating predominantly on poetic drama. The foremost part copes with the developer and pioneer Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir, focusing on his thoughts and experiences in the field. The paper, then, moves ahead to deal with two verse plays as a model of his craftsmanship and mastery. After that, the study finishes with a brief argument and/or recommendations and an end.

Keywords: Arabic drama, Arabic literature, Bakatheer, growth, innovation, Poetic drama

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.3
Introduction

Drama in general and poetic drama, in particular, is one of the most beautiful literary arts and the most acceptable expressive means; a person can convey his message by presenting a play. Drama was, in the beginning, a way to bring people closer to belief, refine them, and teach them. It provides the distinction between good and evil, right and wrong until it becomes an independent art like the other literary types such as poetry, novel, and the short story. It occupied a prominent position among the scientific and cultural circles and sometimes surpassed the other literary arts. Drama was initially a way to bring people closer to confidence, discipline them, and teach. Drama is enriched by the singers and represented by the actors.

Drama has existed among all the peoples of the world since ancient times. As available documents indicate, this art originated first in Greece and developed then spread through different countries and centuries. The plays' subjects were initially on gods, religious rituals, and idols and then flourished in the palaces of kings and princes, in which they enjoyed them.

1. Poetic Drama

The poetic drama continued to spread worldwide, and its presence began to strengthen with the successive days, in which many playwrights appeared to have enabled this genre to stand competitive to prose drama. It imposed itself within the map among modern European literature. One of the great pioneers of this genre is the Norwegian writer Henrik Ibsen (1828 – 1906).

What makes the distinction between poetic drama and prosaic drama is a sort of duplication in action. In a poetic play, poetry and movement are made fundamental to each other. They are not only brought together but also they are interchangeable and homogenous. The preference of verse in drama has appealed too many poet-dramatists through different ages and different places, such as Shakespeare, Marlowe, Milton, Yeats, Christopher Fry, Christopher Isherwood, James E. Flecker, Eliot, Ahmad Shawgi, Salah Abdo As-Sabour, An-Nagash, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir and many several others. They had the belief “that drama in verse is a center of cultural and proper rehabilitation” (Dahami, 2020c, p. 3; Dahami, 2018a, p. 484). In addition, verse and action in a poetic drama mutually enhance each other. Poetic drama enjoys two things: a poetic speech device like rhythm, which appears natural to performers and audience, as well as the supremacy and influence to express individual appeal. Furthermore, “It is believed that poetic drama has the
aptitude to pierce into the sources of action and passion of human beings” (Dahami, 2018b, p. 158).

In a poetic play, the verses’ expressions actually have a richer connotation than the expressions used in a prose play. “Coleridge in Biographia Literaria, confirms that the nature of poetic expression and its depth can be better achieved in verse than in prose” (Dahami, 2016, p. 158). Coleridge says, “It is certain that poetry when it has attained this excellence, makes a far greater impression than prose. So much so indeed, that even the gratification which the very rhymes afford becomes then no longer a contemptible or trifling gratification” (Sampson, 2015, p. 107; Coleridge, 2009, p. 316).

Some prose dramas are more limited in their profundity of expression than verse dramas because poetry significantly builds up the term. Eliot, the pioneer of poetic drama in twentieth-century England, declares, in his critical essays about poetic drama that verse is the right language of dramatic action in the theater. “Eliot was occupied with writing flowing poetic dramas in his modern age. His preoccupation was how to make such dramas better apply a modern language as its medium” (Dahami, 2020b, p. 76). The matter is similar with Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir. The most excellent drama is principally poetic, where poetry is fundamental, not incidental. A poetic drama has enough flexibility to convey anything and is considerably more apparent and more profound than a prose drama. Inherently, the verse is an appropriate compound to prose as a dramatic idiom because poetry can offer better occasions for the interaction and relationship of action, sentiment, and attitude.

In a poetic drama, verse establishes and creates the third voice in poetry, wherein the poet is “saying, not what he would say in his own person, but only what he can say within the limits of one imaginary character addressing another imaginary character” (Jackson, 2014, p. 192; De Molina, 2013, p. 59; Eliot, 2000, p. 80). Poetry and drama are integrated that “poetry expresses the most intense emotion only with a dramatic situation consisting of a persona whose identity is separate from the author’s, and who addresses other characters and an audience according to particular circumstances dictated by plot action” (Dahami, 2016; Skaff, 1986, p. 104).

Several critics may opine that this art has originated among the Arabs due to the literary connections and ties between Arabs and the people of the West in the modern era. One of the pioneers in this genre contributing to its progress is Marun An-Naqqash, who tried to revive this art through serious attempts after experiencing theater and plays in Italy. They significantly influenced him, and then when he returned home to Lebanon, he tried to establish a group with his friends and taught them the art of drama and theater. Not only that but also, he wrote his first play, The Miser (البخيل), which saw the light on the stage in 1847.

Several Arab dramatists wrote their plays in prose and others in verse, as it is natural with other languages. Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir (1910-1969) is one of the pioneers who mastered Arabic poetic plays among several others such as Ahmed Shawgi (1870-1932), Mohammad Aziz Abathah
(1898-1973), Salah Abdul Saboor (1931-1981), Abderrahman Ash-Shargawi (1921-1987) and many others, in which poetic drama, through their hands progressed and cultivated.

2. **Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir: A Man of Arabic Literature and A Designer Poet-Dramatist**

   Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir (باكثير) – also written as Bakatheer or Bakatair – is considered one of the most prominent Arab literary writers of the twentieth century. He is the author who is unique in producing many different literary arts, such as drama, poetry, and novel. He wrote more than seventy literary works in prose as well as in poetry long and short, which dealt with several social, historical, and religious Arabic issues. Ba-Kathir was born in Surabaya (Indonesia) in 1910 to Arab parents from Yemen. He is a man of multiculturalism, in which his birth was in Indonesia, his family originally is from Yemen, and he lived in Egypt as an Egyptian citizen.

   Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir was one of the most famous Arabic dramatists during the forties and fifties of the twentieth century. He was a great author and poet. When he was ten years old, his father traveled with him to Siyoon city in Hadramout to be raised in an Arabic and Islamic way with his brothers and sisters. He started writing poetry when he was thirteen years old and got his education in the school of An-Nahthah Al-Elmiah (مدرسة النهضة العلمية). He has been taught Arabic and Islamic law by many great sheikhs such as his uncle the judge, poet, linguistic and grammatical Mohamed Ba-Kathir.

   It has been said that Ba-Kathir is one of the pillars of modern Arabic literature. However, his fame was less than some of his contemporaries because he preferred the distance from the focus of public attention, avoiding selfish talk about himself, without missing sight of the frenzied attacks against him late in his life. Nevertheless, it is true that the most prominent literary field in which Ba-Kathir excelled, and known for his abundance of production, is drama in general and poetic drama in particular. Ba-Kathir has accomplished and produced more than thirty-five diverse prose plays, ranging from the publication to the manuscript, including The Promised Pharaoh (1945), Omar Al-Mukhtar (1948), Dar Ibn Luqman (1960), and the War of Al-Basus (1990). Among his eminent plays, one could remark The Caliph's Jester, which was performed at the Royal Opera House in Cairo.

   He is considered one of the pioneers of Arab theatrical literature who played a significant role in developing this literary genre. He was influenced by Shawgi’s plays when he read them in his travel through Al-Hijaz. He had acquired a relevant experience and learned how poetry can be useful and operative in life and how the poet expresses himself and deals with historical events or issues that touch the nation’s need.

   During his stay in Hadramout, Ba-Kathir married when he was young but was shocked by his wife's death in her youth shortly after their marriage. This painful incident deeply moved him; he wrote several poems as an elegy of her passing away. Moreover, he dedicated the first play he wrote to her soul. He then left Hadramout to reside in Aden in 1931. Still, he did not stay long,
then moved to Ethiopia and Somalia before traveling to Al-Hijaz, in which he settled there for a reasonable period of time where he was able to organize and compose a notable work titled Al-Burdah or The Memory of the Prophet.

He composed his first work in poetic drama, which he printed on his arrival to Egypt entitled Hammam1 in the Land of Al-Ahgaf. This play was reprinted in Aden with little modifications in 1967, in which he included a number of his reform ideas that shaped his thought throughout his stay in Hadramout. This play was considered one of the first Arab social poetic plays in which the Arab poetic dramas were dominated by historical characteristics, in events, themes, and characters.

After four years of writing Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, he wrote his second play Akhenaten and Nefertiti (إخناتون ونفرتيتى) in 1938 and published in the same magazine in 1940. After more than four years, his third play, The Palace of Howdah or Qasr Al-Howdaj (قصر الهودج), which was published in 1944. It can be said that Ba-Kathir wrote his poetic plays in ten years from 1934 to1944. His first poetic play Tammam fi Bilad Al-Ahgaf was written in the traditional rhythm and rhyme style.

He was the first to write the operetta in classical Arabic as the play called Ash-Shayma (شادية الإسلام) (الشيماء شادية الإسلام) (1969), a historical religious play. Ash-Shayma is the sister of Prophet Muhammad () from breastfeeding. She is the daughter of Halimah As-Saadiah, the Prophet's nurse, and is the focal point of this play. It is composed of five chapters. Through this play, in intelligence, and through a captivating dialogue, Ba-Kathir presents the prophetic biography's many events. In this play, poetry is mixed with prose as a necessary element suitable for singing. Ash-Shayma has a sweet voice that through this beautiful voice; she used to sing with meaningful and profitable poetry of variation and flexibility. She is calling for Islam and the support of her brother, the Prophet of Islam. She confronts the tyrants who used to take ploy against the Prophet, starting with her husband, Bejad, and the polytheists' leader in Mecca named ‘Ekremah ibn Abi Jahl and others. Her brother Abdullah, her father Al-Harith ibn Abdul A’za, and her mother Halimah As-Saadiah supported and maintained her mission.

Ba-Kathir arrived in Egypt, where he polished his literary background by joining the English Department at Cairo University, from which he ultimately obtained the bachelor's degree in literature in 1939. After that, in 1954, he traveled after receiving a free scholarship to France, and after he effectively finished the scholarship, he returned to live in Egypt, where he married for the second time. He liked and enjoyed life in Egypt, where he saw eminent authors, for instance, Najeeb Mahfouth, Taha Husien, Tawfig Al-Hakeem, and many other pioneers.

In 1955, he moved to work in The Ministry of Culture after working as a teacher for almost fifteen years. Then he shifted to the department of the monitoring of the artistic productions, where he continued working until his demise (Al-Hawari, 2017, p. 235). He was the first author in Egypt
who was given the free fellowship. He got an open fellowship for two years to complete his enormous Islamic poetic legend about the dutiful, obedient, and rightful caliph Omar Ibn Al-Khattab. This voluminous literary and historical work is composed of nineteen parts.

Ba-Kathir obtained a diploma of teaching from the Teachers’ Higher Institution. He stayed in Egypt and worked as a teacher while authoring several fruitful historical and literary works. He enjoyed reading English poetry remarkably free verse, preferring writing in blank verse after acquiring its basis from reading and studying English poetry. “It can be said that he is among the first who started this sort of new poetry” (Munaif, 2006, p. 360). There is a challenging story for such a preference. Al-Khateeb, (2009), sheds light on the way Ba-Kathir mastered blank verse. Ba-Kathir tells about the reason for this occasion, saying that when he was in one of the English classes, the English teacher took a lecture on English blank verse. The teacher said; this sort of poetry did not succeed in any other language as it grew in English. He adds: the French themselves wanted to emulate this type of English verse but failed as is in English; of course, he adds that there is no such thing in this language in Arabic. Ba-Kathir opposed saying: I objected to the teacher’s views and told him that every nation has its artistic traditions in its poetry, and it is the tradition of the Arabs to adhere to the one rhythm and rhyme. It is their style of expression and their artistic style. He confirmed that there is nothing to prevent creating such a kind of poetry in the Arabic language because it can deal with linguistic variations that are not available in any other language. The teacher showed his dissatisfaction, which I still remember that he said; nonsense.

Ba-Kathir adds; I went out of class directly to my house. I continued thinking about this verse, but this challenge made me accomplish what I had right away in my mind. I came home during the day and resorted to the nearest thing that helps me emulate this verse. Then I found the English version of Romeo and Juliet. I chose a scene and continued to treat it with such poetry until I made it close to my desire. Then it occurred to me to translate the whole play from the first until the end. After that, I worked on it until I accomplished it; this is the first experience (Al-Khateeb, 2009, pp. 24-25).

Therefore, Ba-Kathir translated a scene from Shakespeare’s Romeo and Juliet in Arabic blank verse in which it was a gate for him to the renewal of the new form of Arabic poetry, but he did not finish it. When he finished writing his central play Akhenaten and Nefertiti, he returned to the play Romeo and Juliet and finished it in full with a mixture of the blank verse and free verses. It is a type of poetry that is exempt from restrictions of rhyme, and it is flexible. However, “Shakespeare did not only influence poets of his age who dealt with blank verse and poetic dramas, but also, he greatly influenced poets and dramatists of the twentieth century” (Dahami, 2020a).

Ba-Kathir, in his book The Art of the Play from My Personal Experiences (1964), declares that he did not adhere to one specific rhythm in his plays. However, he used the various ones required by the poetic situation, taking into account their compatibility with different expressions. He tried to avoid the continuation of the same rhythm and rhyme as possible so that the play is not
a collection of poems added to each other. He is keen to diversify the rhymes to be more informed in the musical toning (p. 18). As for his play, The Palace of Howdah, Ba-Kathir wrote it in lyric poetry. He took great care about it that the play should be suitable for singing (Ittiḥād al-Kuttāb al-ʻArab, 2004, p. 44; Rābiṭat al-Adab al-Islāmī, 1993, p.2).

Ba-Kathir has directed three poetic plays, presented various experiences inside them, and opened a new gate for the Arab poetic play. His Arabic play Romeo and Juliet is written in verse and has great importance for critics, readers, and students because Ba-Kathir, the poet-dramatist, directed it after a sort of challenge. In writing his dramas, he deals with ancient themes but made the texts of his plays suit his goals and introduces them to tackle the social and political problems that the Arabic nation suffers from, particularly in his country of residence, Egypt.

Ba-Kathir’s life was full of intellectual and literary contributions. He left the Arabic nation with a wide range of creative and literary texts divided between drama, novels, poetry, and other academic and critical essays. However, it is noticeable that he began his literary career with poetry writing before moving on to link poetry with drama to create poetic dramas. He also skillfully wrote prose dramas, as well as translating texts from foreign languages he was fluent in. Nevertheless, the dramas, both kinds, the poetic and prose, shaped the literary field in which Ba-Kathir excelled. He published two collections of seven texts in his lifetime, ‘From Above Seven Heavens’ (Ba-Kathir, 1989), and the epic called ‘This is How God Met Omar’.

Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir knew many languages such as English and French besides his native language, Arabic. He composed many poetic plays, such as The Tragedy of Oedipus that was interpreted into English. The Chain and Forgiveness [Al-Selsilah wal-Ghfran 1951] “makes a much more straightforward [straightforward] religious statement, presenting a parable [parable] set in medieval Egypt illustrating how an act of forgiveness breaks the chain of evil. Arab scholars have called this the first allegorical play in Arabic literature” (Carlson, 2019, p. 46). In addition, he wrote The Secret of the Ruler by the Command of Allah. It is a tragic play that tells the story of the Fatimid Caliph Al-Hakim bi-Amr Allah and the secret of his claim to divinity. The play was written and published in 1947 and was performed on the stage several times. The dramatist shared many social and artistic and social conferences. He was a member of the Story Club and was rewarded with a prize from the Ministry of Knowledge in 1949 because of the successful poetic play The Chain and Forgiveness (1951). After a prosperous literary life, Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir died in 1969 owing to a heart attack. He was buried in the family graveyard of his second wife.

Ba-Kathir singled out the Palestinian issue in a large part of his plays, whether poetic or prose, long or short, before or after the catastrophe of 1948 because the case was a stream of blood in his veins. He used to publish a short play every week to reach fifty short plays and five extensive plays. Ba-Kathir was the first writer to deal with the question of Palestine, dramatically, on the Arab theater and drama with his long play The New Shylock 1944 [شيلوك الجديد], which is divided
into two parts, the Problem and The Solution. Because of such division, he was the first who divided the play into two parts, known as a double play (Saqr, 1991, p. 167; Albir, 1970).

The dramatist has left dozens of poetic plays of different sizes, contents, and directions. They are predominantly Arabic and Islamic because they are Arabic, as many other non-dramatic works dominate it. Such works made him a pioneer in Arabic literature in general. Najeeb Al-Kailani (1987), has emphasized that “Ba-Kathir is a distinct school in most of his dramatic and theatrical productions, which bears the Islamic imprint; he is a school that has not yet taken his right by analysis, investigation, and study” (Al-Kailani, 1987, p. 47).

3. **Examples of the Poetic Drama of Ba-Kathir**

Ba-Kathir realized the importance of combining drama and poetry, as the theater pioneers have done since the earliest times. He believes that there is a relationship of organic syndrome throughout history between drama and poetry. The first dramas on the theater were written in verse, and the early poems written on wooden plates were dramatic, or, say, they were poetic or verse with a dramatic vision. Although drama originated in the temple as religious and legend, poetry was its foundation of tragedy as it was with the ancient Greeks and Egyptians.

Bakathir had a distinct preference for subjects drawn from history, myth, and legend as well as folklore, a preference for which he tried to find an aesthetic justification. Even when he wished to comment on the modern world, he often found it easier to use the past as a metaphor for the present. His passionate commitment to Islam made him turn naturally to Islamic and Arab history, but his treatment of myth and legend embraced a wider field, including ancient Egyptian and Greek themes (Badawi, 2004, p. 117).

Ba-Kathir is associated with poetic drama more than other fields of literature in which he has been involved. He has dealt with various aspects of dramas such as historical, lyrical, political, social, and other poetic plays, although most of them are short in size. The numerous productions of the poet-dramatist Ba-Kathir is unmanageable to be studied in a paper like this. However, they need to be examined and analyzed in more than research or even a book. Nonetheless, this article will deal with three plays of Ba-Kathir, showing and illustrating his skillful power in this field as a pioneer of Arabic literature in the modern age.

3.1. **Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf (1934)**

The poet-playwright Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir is one of the pioneers who called for the reform of society through literature. It is evident in the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf. It deals with one of the most critical issues for which he devoted his life, pen, and knowledge. The examiner of Ba-Kathir's literary works, especially the play in question, will realize that the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf is a reflection of a small part of the life of the poet-playwright Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir.
His displeasure with the life he experienced in Hadramout inspired him to produce Hammam's poetic play in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, which illustrates the natural life in underdeveloped Hadramout and people's ignorance and illiteracy, particularly women. When he watched and read Shawgi's plays, Ba-Kathir wanted to emulate him but with his new color, expressing the pain inside him, for the most part, after his wife's death and his region's miserable state, Hadramout. Consequently, he wrote this poetic play, which he called Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf (هامم في بلاد الاحقاف Hammam fi Belad Al-Ahgaf), during his stay in the city of Taif date 1934, where he used to spend summer among the writers and the literary figures of Al-Hijaz (Ghuneem, 2018, p. 333).

Ba-Kathir has written this play, Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, without sufficient familiarity with the basis and origins of drama, so he did not consider it a successful play but instead called it a poem that contained a single theme. As critics state, it did not meet successful drama requirements, such as the construction, the action, and characters. However, it has opened a new door for Ba-Kathir to write more full-fledged dramas containing all the drama elements. Ba-Kathir published his first play in the magazine Excerpt (المقتطف Al Mugtadaf) in 1934.

In the play Hammam in the Land of Al-Ahgaf, Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir presents his society's conditions in three acts. In the first act, he deals with his father’s state and the domination of backward traditional ideas that are behind the veil of religion, classic science, and the tyrannous dominant rule. The play depicts the reality of the region of Hadramout, which is the country of Al-Ahgaf that made the mind ignorant, and the woman is inexperienced. Education proceeds in a way that depends on memorization without thinking or contemplating. Therefore, many social diseases are spread, including gluttony, greediness, voraciousness, money love, and its preference over everything.

Example of the verse that illustrates Ba-Kathir’s goal in describing the undeveloped region Hadramout and his wish to help in its development and enlightenment. The verse lines are said in a dialogue between Hammam and his sister:

Brother, what is wrong with you today? I see you as a less active and very bored
Are you unwell? Evils are prevented, and may God reward you long life

Her brother Hammam responds:

That is, I have a condition in the heart, O blossom, that warns me of danger
You do know what your brother is busy with, you know what appears or that is hidden

Some verses of the reply of his sister Zahra shows the artisanship of the poet. As it is the nature of the majority of the verse in the play, lines show operative and compelling rhythm. She says:
Do not make despair a way for you; in grief, a loss of purpose
Others should rely on despondency. You should win.

After his sister consoles, pleases him, and motivates him in order to stand and not to despair of what is going on, he feels better in his mood and concern. He then responds to his sister in the same poetic way that is exquisitely rhymed and contemplated. He says:

**Aزهراء لا عدمتك الديا**

ر، حديثك يقشع عنى الكدر

وانت الهناء وانت الحنر

فأين الكتاب؟ أنت القرئين؟

Oh Zahra, may you are protected to serve the land; your speech dispels the sadness
You are the solace when you attend, and you are the happiness
Where is the book? Won’t you read?

Ba-Kathir called for women's education, and they have an active role in the fields of life, in the sense that women should be as pro-Islam as men should. Women, as Ba-Kathir believes, can support men by word and action even if they are forced to take up arms.

Zahra has the ability to take out advocacy and outreach classes for Hadramout women (Al-Ahgaf). She succeeded in her quest, even attracting women from the anti-reformist class, and she is based on her call for the Islamic science of Qur'an and As-Sunnah. Ba-Kathir, through the mouthpiece Zahra, stands against many superstitions and the minds of the agitators of the preachers and the people of sectarian fanaticism.

His sister, Zahra, responds as if she understood his goal that useful science is one of the reasons for the progress and development of nations, saying:

**بلى! ذا الكتاب معي قد حضر**

بأن يكتبوه بنور البصر

(بلوغ المرام) و (سبيل السلا

لم) عليه تحجج منه الغـمر

ب تلاذو فيها خلـال السطر

أحاديث طـه وأي الكتـا

وأقوال مجتهدي الصحب والأئم

فياخذ منها الفتى ما كـدر

Yes! The book is with me
It is a generous book deserves to be written with the light of the sight
(Reaching the Goals) and (the Paths of Peace) upon it hop the false
The talks of Taha (the Prophet) and verses of the book (Qur’an) glistening in it through the lines
The sayings of the companions and the diligent imams from every righteous pilot
The schoolboy takes from it everything that is useful and leaves the unhelpful.
The writer intervenes to add an essential explanation of what Zahra read and describes the hero of the play as improving in his condition. Then, Hammam shows a smile for what he saw from his sister's intelligence and acumen about the importance of sound science away from shadows and mental deviation. On the other hand, Ba-Kathir points to Zahra's understanding of the prominence of useful science and learning it. She also helps her brother in critical and valuable thinking. She adds:

 فلا سلمت كتب الجامدين ولا فاز قارؤها بالسطر صحائف لا روح فيها ولا يجول بها ذكر خير البشر يتصرف فيها محل الأمور ويتصرف فيها مهم الصور (Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 13)

The books of the rigid were not delivered, nor did their readers win a fortune. Sheets have no soul, nor the good of mankind was mentioned. They depict impossible substances and leave the most important lessons.

Hammam is content and happy because of the talks of his mature and fruitful sister. Her speech can be considered food for the mind and soul with its logic. Hammam then asks his sister to read him a chapter of the book because of its great benefits. After his sister has finished reading, and in the same poetic style and the charming and smooth flexibility of the rhythm, he asks his sister to help him in his humanitarian mission by saying:

صار فرضا عليك أن تنشري هذ الهدى في جماعة النسوان فهدى الشعب من هدى أمه وبنت الأحقاف أولى بأن يحذق بند خلق العلوم والعوارف إنما الشر في العجوز يجمد ففي العجائز يجمد (Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 14)

It became obligatory for you to spread this guidance among the group of women. The guidance of the nation is the result of the guidance of mothers in every place and time. And the girls of Al-Ahgaf are first to be proficient in various sciences and knowledge.

Zahra responds positively to her brother, confirming that she will stand by him in his noble quest, with the same delicate poetic rhythm. She chants:

لتطب يا همام نفسا فما تر تجر سعيه في بغير توائ (Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 14)

Oh, Humam, let a breath solace you; I will strive for it without delay.

He thanks her for her efforts and for standing with her brother. Hammam, then, provides her with some advice in her task inviting the women of Al-Ahgaf to follow her, so he says, directing and advising his sister:

يباكى الله في الصغار ففيهم إنما الشر في العجائز يجمد قبول للحق إما دعينا (Ba-Kathir, 1934, p. 14)

God bless the little ones, for they accept the truth when it is called. Rather, evil is in the elderly; they are frozen like the pebbles, so they are not guided.
The conversation between the hero and his sister illustrates Hammam's quest and shows directly from the very beginning the aim of the dramatist in writing this poetic play. Moreover, what is appealing is the amazing Arabic verse implemented in the lines of the play, which clearly indicates that the dramatist is a great poet. Furthermore, the writer made a direct and unambiguous indication of one of the greatest encyclopedically religious and educational books in Yemen and Arabia. The book is The Paths of Peace: Explanations for Reaching the Goals (سبل السلام شرح بلوغ المرام 2011), written by Muhammad ibn Ismail As-San‘ani (1059-1182 A.H. / 1687-1768). Al-Ameer As-San‘ani is a historian, a poet, and a great writer from Sana'a. He is one of the late imams of Yemen, who is estimated among the few liberal diligent, hardworking, and assiduous Yemeni intellectuals who followed the evidence from the Qur’an and As-Sunnah. As-San‘ani was born in Kohlan (كحلان), near Sana'a.

In the second act, Ba-Kathir depicts other diseases such as bribery, kissing the hand of the sheikh, and visiting the places where invalid rituals are held that have nothing to do with religion. The character Hammam takes advantage of the ideas of sheikh Mohammed Abdo and Jamal Al-Din Al-Afghani to get rid of such false deeds. He wants to educate women and empower them with the means of education. He invites people to his social invitation, and his sister comes forward to help him with his mission, addressing women's meetings. Hammam addresses men to his reformation notions and finds supporters from both genders.

Here, a love story arises between Hammam and Husn, so people get angry at Hammam and his beloved, so he has no way but to emigrate, and his friend A’mer is traveling with him. Hammam returns from his travels after two years and is married to Husn in a celebration of singing, joy, and delight. The dramatist portrays with many images of the wedding ceremony in his region. The play does not end in this happy scene as is illustrated by the third act, but rather the dramatist brings another love story between Muhammad the friend of Hammam, with the girl A’lawiah. The marriage between them does not occur because the people of Muhammad do not marry their children outside their family. The people of this area do not propose the engagement to A’lawiah because she is poor. Then Muhammad gets sad, which leads him to illness as well as A’lawiah. Hammam travels at that time to Mecca to do the rituals of pilgrimage (Hajj) without taking his wife with him because she was also sick. In Makkah, he receives a telegram telling him the death of his wife Husn; thus, he stands in front of the Al-Ka’bbeh and recites these verses:

إن عظمت مصيبتي وخطبي
فأحكم في حركتي وتحذيتي
يا رب انت الواحد القهار
وانت ذو الرحمة والجبار
تفجرت من نورك الانوار
وقصرت عن كنهك الأفكار
يا رب لا نقض لما ابرمتا
وافتما وحكلت عني كل ما
وقتما في غيبتي وما
فانت لي الكافي ونعم الكافي
وأولني مناي في الدارين
(بـا كـثـيـر, 1934, pp. 111-112)
If my misfortune is great, Allah will take care of me, and he is my suffice
O Lord, you are the one, the subduer, and you are the one with mercy and mighty
The lights exploded from your enlightenment and fell short of your thoughtfulness
O Lord, no objection to what you decided, so, make me satisfied, Lord, with what you have decided
Possibly, I am ignorant of what you learned, what is right for me in what I have established
Oh Lord, inspire me with healing consolation and bandage my wounds with Your kindness
Bestow me the will of the ancestors, for you, are the most sufficient, how fair the recompense!
And donate me my wish in the two worlds, and gather me with Husn
In a house immortalized between two gardens, that her eye and mine to be delighted

The play is ended with a distinguished and stunning verse full of profound connotative metaphors and imaginative symbols. It opens a new gate for the dramatist to initiate other plays after acquiring sufficient experience and knowledge on drama and theater. Another poetic and dramatic work is Qasr Al-Howdah.

3.2. Palace of Howdah (1944)

Qasr Al-Howdah is a historical musical play that talks about the nobility of the commander in God's rulings, the Fatimid Caliph, through a love story like the one mentioned among the Bedouins. It is written in a style similar to the level of Lubna and Qais, and several other stories. As for the development of Qasr Al Howdah, it is the love story of Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah.

Palace of Howdah is the third poetic play, which saw the light in 1944 that Ba-Kathir was inspired by much of the Fatimid history in Egypt. He selected a social story of passion between Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah. Salma and Ibn Mayah grew up in the country, and they exchanged virtual love. Before the nest of the marriage brought them together, destiny wanted Salma to meet the Caliph who loved her as her beauty captivated him. He could no longer tolerate sleep and would not know life a taste unless he won her to be among his wives. Therefore, the Caliph, disguised, went to the tent of Sheikh Ammar bin Saad, Salma's father, on the road to the Upper Egypt desert.

In the first act, the playwright ingeniously introduces the play's conflict when love arises among lovers. An element of competition is seen when the Fatimid Caliph, The Commander of the Rulings of Allah, meets Salma and discloses his love for her disguised in his messenger's clothing. Still, Salma rejects his love because she genuinely loves her cousin. When the messenger could not convince her, he tries to tempt her for himself as though he is a messenger of the Caliph even though he is the Caliph himself:
سلمى: لطف الله بحالك قد فهمت الآن قصدي
القادم: كيف لا أفهم ذلك والذي عندك عنددي
أنا من رأيك يا سلمى و ميلي مثل ميلي
أه لو تسمح لي الأيام يا سلمى بنبك
أنت لي لست لغيري و أنا لست لغيرك
إن لي قلبا كقلبك
سلمى: عجبا … هل أنت مجنون؟
القادم: نعم يا نور عيني
أنا مجنون بحبك (21-20
(Ba-Kathir, 1978, pp. 20-1978, Kathir,

The comer: Lived o Salma free, cities have no friends
You do not like its songs nor the elegant houses
Salma: May Allah be kind to you. You have now seen what I mean
The comer: How do I not understand? What you have I have
My opinion is like yours, Salma; my tendency is like yours
Oh, if days allow me, Salma, to have you
You are mine, not for others, and I am yours
I have a heart like yours
Salma: well … are you senseless?
The comer: Yes, the light of my eyes
I am unwise in your love

The messenger approaches and tries to kiss her, so Salma screams, and her cousin and father come; she tells them what happened. Ibn Mayah and Salma's father know that the one wearing the messenger's clothes is not a messenger, but he is the Caliph himself. Ibn Mayah sadly leaves them. Salma’s father regrets what happened with the Caliph and apologizes to him. Then he goes to his daughter and consults with her about the request of the Caliph. As for Ibn Mayah, he leaves the country as well as Salma to the Caliph. Salma grieves deeply for the absent lover. Nonetheless, the Caliph knows her love for her cousin, Ibn Mayah.

Act two events occur on the island of Fustat (Al Rawthah) in the Al-Houdaj Palace that the Caliph built for his sweetheart wife. It is located on the Nile from one side, and around it, the Arab tents were struck, showing the simple life in the countryside. Before his travel, Ibn Mayah comes to say goodbye to his beloved niece, as it is not permissible for him to wander in the desert without saying goodbye. Salma, accompanied by a servant, is terrified to see him in the palace; her servant withdraws to the balcony, leaving the two relatives alone. The Caliph arrives suddenly and indicates to the servant to be silent and stay in her place. The Caliph remained in his position with the girl-servant listening to two lovers' speech, realizing the relationship between Salma and her cousin Ibn Mayah.

The Caliph hears his wife Salma blaming her cousin, who came to her at night, he did not go to her in broad daylight, and he heard her reproach him because he left her and left for
the desert. She told him that if he stayed beside her, she would hold on to him, showing that Salma did not agree to marry the Caliph, and she is not happy with this marriage, despite the comfort the Caliph provided to her. The Caliph did not leave anything to bring happiness to her. He also made the whole island her own, built the wonderful palace there, and struck tents around it to make her feel that she is among her people. Then she groans because she is unjust to her loving husband, that Salma did not repay him with the same love, so she feels unfaithful to him. The Caliph enters the room, stands before him; the two lovers are shocked, they try to explain the situation, but the Caliph orders him to be taken to prison, and he leaves her in her palace to cry for her cousin, herself, and bad luck.

In the second act, we find that Salma arrives at the Caliph’s palace that becomes her residence. Ibn Mayah comes to visit Salma secretly at night, hoping not to meet or see the Caliph but the Caliph sees him from behind the door. In his meeting with Salma, Ibn Mayah does not see the Caliph, showing his fondness for Salma, telling her that he fled the country for her to live a happy life. The Caliph suddenly appears and orders that Ibn Mayah be imprisoned for five months. As a reaction of Salma, she grieves him and cries for her loneliness. The second act tends to be followed by the third, which begins with Salma's father's arrival on the order of the Caliph. Salma's father comes to know that the Caliph has divorced Salma. Ibn Mayah is brought from prison, the Caliph gives him a dowry for marrying Salma twenty thousand dinars, and the Caliph requests the sheikh to make the engagement of marriage between Ibn Mayah and Salma. After marriage, they return home to Upper Egypt, in which several ceremonies of the wedding are held, telling that the play comes to an end. Salma and some girls sing chants and songs showing happiness and pray for the righteous Caliph.

In the third act, in Al-Houdj Palace itself, accidents happen five months after Ibn Mayah's imprisonment. Sheikh Ammar comes from the desert of Upper Egypt in response to the call of the Caliph. Salma welcomes him, but he sees her pale face asking her about her life; she does not respond, only cries. After a talk for a while, the Caliph comes, and Salma withdraws to her room; Sheikh Ammar asks his brother-in-law, the Caliph, if Salma has wronged him to discipline her. The Caliph tells him about Ibn Mayah's visit to her in the dead of night. The father revolts and asks the Caliph to slaughter him and Salma together in order to wash away the shame that they denigrated him at the end of his life. Then, the Caliph orders the bringing of Ibn Mayah. In the meantime, Sheikh Ammar has leaped on Salma, dragging her by her hair to where the Caliph sits. When Ibn Mayah is brought, Sheikh Ammar draws his dagger and jumps on him to slaughter, but the Caliph orders him to return to his seat. The Caliph says that it is not permissible to kill a person sheltered by the Caliph. So, Sheikh Ammar was surprised by the noble behavior of the Caliph. The Caliph then describes the situation he saw between the two lovers saying:

إن سلمى لم تخن زوجاً، ولا والله لم تفضح أباً
إنها أظهر من ذلك أخلاقاً، وأسمى أدباً (Ba-Kathir, 1978, p. 76)

Salma has not betrayed a husband, nor, by God, divulged a father.
She is purer than that by virtue and bears utmost morals

Then the Caliph says that he divorced Salma from that moment in which Ibn Mayah was imprisoned, and Salma's timing after divorce is completed a month ago. The Caliph married Salma to Ibn Mayah, and he paid twenty thousand dowries for her. Thus, Salma returns to the desert with her husband Ibn Mayah so that they live a beloved happy couple in the bowels of the desert.

Thus, it appears that the play's theme is social, and there are similarities with what Ahamd Shawgi has written, like Majnun Laila and other Arab poet-dramatists and his book. It is the issue of love that possesses the hearts of the lovers, so they sacrifice everything for the beloved's sake. Ibn Mayah, as it is understood of the play, risks his life for the sake of a farewell look to his beloved. Salma sacrifices money, prestige, and comfortable living in a mythical palace for the sake of her cousin and lover, Ibn Mayah. It seems that the dramatist has dealt with an important issue as close as to the martyrs of virtual or platonic love. It is a love protected by chaste and virtue.

4. Discussion and Argument

As stated by Julie Scott Meisami, “Bakathir's work is of uneven quality. Many of his plays lack dramatic qualities, and his work suffers from a narrowness of vision associated with the author's passionate belief in Islam and his anti-Marxist stance” (Meisami, 1998, p. 129). Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir says in presenting the play, Qasr Al-Howdah, he tried his best, in this poetic play, to fulfill two characteristics that are indispensable for successful musical plays.

The first is adopting its language so that the ordinary audience could understand it without difficulty while preserving the radiance and poetic splendor. In this point, Ba-Kathir reminds us of the same ideas of T. S. Eliot on the poetic drama in which he wanted the language to be poetic and to be appropriate to drama. “It is the power of the dramatic verse that gives the play its unique unity and intensity. The language is the verse, which is the action, which is the theme, which is the atmosphere, which is the meaning; in other words, we have here an impressive realization of the dramatic potentials which Eliot, in his critical works, has claimed for verse” (Dahami, 2017, p. 52). The second is his way of choosing the weights and rhymes appropriate to the different narrating situations. He also tried to make them prevail in using verbal and abstracted musicality that helps the composer reach the goal of composing it.

By contemplating the play and its language, we find that the author has managed to adapt the language so that the ordinary audience understands it. The fulfillment of this condition is not easy in a historical, poetic play. Most of those who wrote the historical, poetic, or prose plays have been betrayed by success in adapting the language in works such as Majnun Laila and Antara by Shawgi, as well as Qais Lubna by Aziz Abathah. In such plays, the spectators find it difficult to quickly grasp the meanings and their goals due to the difficulty of the used vocabulary. With this adaptation by Ba-Kathir, his style remains poetic, preserving the level that he settled in the majority of his poetic plays.
The poet variously has colored the meter and rhymes and does not stand in his works with the framework of a single poetic meter and a unified rhyme. Instead, the diversification reached the point of two and three lines in the dialogue of one character, not to mention the division of one verse between the two interlocutors in order to fulfill his aim in choosing the meters and rhymes appropriate to the different positions of the plays. We notice in the following verses between the disguised Caliph and the father of Salma, sheikh Ammar in which the line has been fragmented:

أمام: إن بيتي لهو بيتك.
القادم: لا تواخذني فيديتك ما أنا اليوم بضيف.
عمار: ما تقول؟
القادم: لا ولكني رسول.
عمار: رسول إلى؟
القادم: نعم.
عمار: مرحبًا بك،
خير أتى بك،
من أرسلك؟
القادم: ملك البلاد.
عمار: يعيش الخليفة.
القادم: قد قال لي:
عمار: ما الذي قال لك؟

Ammar: My home is yours.
The comer: excuse me, today, I am not a guest.
Ammar: What are you saying?
The comer: No, I am only a messenger.
Ammar: A messenger to me?
The comer: Yes.
Ammar: You are welcome
Good bring you,
Who sent you?
The comer: the king of the country.
Ammar: Long live the Caliph.
The comer: He had told me:
Ammar: What did he tell you?

However, Ba-Kathir, the pioneer of rhythmical poetry, was able to weave his blank verse as rhythmical that he had previously performed in his play Romeo and Juliet. However, the poet is interested in the play's lyrical success because the free verse is more flexible to sing from rhythmical poetry. Nevertheless, it is obviously realized that the poet-dramatist is proficient in his poetic techniques and his theatrical techniques, which has fulfilled his ambition to make suitable
poetic plays with success in poetry and drama. He made the language flexible with meter and rhymes. The dialogues are lively and far from unnecessary filling.

If there is an observation or flaw in this regard, it is the dialogue's failure to draw the characters' physical features; however, the dramatist succeeded in depicting the two dimensions of drama: the psychological and the social. He also succeeded in highlighting the conflict of all kinds between opposing personalities.

Conclusion
The plays of Ba-Kathir, whatever their nature, involve many manifestations of individuality, honesty, and originality to be qualified to obtain recognition and gratitude, ascending Ba-Kathir as one of the prominent Arab pioneers in the field of Arabic literature, particularly poetic drama. What has been presented is very little of the numerous literary productions that Ba-Kathir has produced. The experience of Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir's poetic plays illustrates multi-pictures to form the theatrical script. In the plays of Ba-Kathir, readers and critics find traditional poetry, blank verse, and free verse. Ba-Kathir's plays influenced many Arab writers, so they wrote their plays after benefitting from Ba-Kathir's poetic plays. It has been shown that the poet-dramatist, Ali Ahmed Ba-Kathir, used to write his plays and literary works with deep awareness, proving that he is a master of the mechanics and rules of dramatic artistry among the pioneers of Arabic poetic drama in the contemporary age.

Recommendation
Ali Ahmad Ba-Kathir has produced more than seventy literary works in the different genres of literature. Appropriately, it is strongly recommended to continue academic and scientific studies and investigations on the literary works of Ba-Kathir to put him in a real, valid, and honest rank among the best literary figures of the Arabic nation.

About the Author:
Yahya Saleh Hasan Dahami is an Associate Professor of English Literature and Criticism, working in the English Department, Faculty of Science and Arts – Al Mandaq, Al Baha University, KSA since 2010. He obtained his Ph. D. in English Literature from Jamia Millia New Delhi, in 2004. Dahami is an active researcher and reviewer. He is a Board Member of the English Department, Al Baha University. Dahami has been the Head of the English Department and a Board Member

References:


Bā-Kathīr, 'A. A. (1964). The Art of the Play from My Personal Experiences [fan almasrahiat min khilal tajaribii alshakhsia], Dar Al Ma’refah, originally from the University of Michigan.


cities: Bloomsbury.

1 After revising some Arabic sources, I found the name is written in two ways but the meaning can be understood differently. Humam and Hammam هَمّام, however, I preferred the second expression because it can be used as a name of a person. The second is used as an adjective more than a noun.
Anachronism in Geoffrey Hill's "Mercian Hymns"

Nadia Ali Ismael
Department of English,
College of Languages, University of Baghdad
Baghdad, Iraq
Email: nadeaali@colang.uobaghdad.edu.iq

Received: 10/28/2020       Accepted: 1/6/2021       Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
As Jeffrey Wainwright (2005) notes, "it is apparent that [Geoffrey] Hill's poetry has always known history very well indeed" (n.p.). Throughout his works, including the Mercian Hymns, historical events and figures play a central role. When references to the past make their way into literature, the resulting allusions often broaden the work's depth, increasing not just the richness of the symbolic interpretation but also rooting the work into a multidisciplinary conversation, bringing events from different points along the human timeline into the conversation. When anachronism occurs, the intentionality plays a role in determining the significance not just of the instance but, potentially, the work as a whole. This paper explores how Hill puts anachronism to intentional use in the Mercian Hymns, with an enduring impact on the meanings that emerge for the reader, depending on the reader’s cultural perspective.

Keywords: anachronism, Geoffrey Hill, history, international, memory, multidisciplinary

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.5
Introduction

Sir Geoffrey William Hill (1932-2016) noted English poet and professor emeritus of English literature and religion at Boston and Oxford universities. His contribution exceeds poetry to critical writings. He wrote *Mercian Hymns*, a collection of some thirty poems that place Hill's childhood, growing up in Mercia in England's West Midlands, with King Offa's history, who ruled Mercia, then an Anglo-Saxon principality, in the eighth century (Milne 1979). This juxtaposition means that anachronism plays a significant role in the exposition of themes in the series, which deals with such ideas as collective memory, national identity, and the definition of such concepts as personal value or worth as well as authority. Questions such as what it means to be English resonate from the intersections from different points in history. The series was published in 1971 and remained one of the unique works in Hill's body of poetry.

From the outset, it appears that the poem will take, shall one say, a unique approach, one that plants tongue, at least at times, firmly in cheek. The poem begins: "king of the perennial holly-groves, the riven sandstone: overlord of the M5; architect of the historic rampart and ditch, the citadel at Tamworth, the summer hermitage in Holy Cross; guardian of the Welsh Bridge and the Iron Bridge: contractor to the desirable new estates: salt-master: money-changer: commissioner for oaths: martyrrologist: the friend of Charlemagne. 'I liked that,' said Offa, 'sing it again' "(Hill 1971, n.p.).

If one looks, at the interplay of terminology between items that would have been present in the eighth century (such as the holly-groves) and those that were patently not present (such as the M5, a motorway), then one sees Hill's technique at work. From the outset, he sets up a junction between past and present that serves as a central dialogue in the poems. Offa’s interjection shows that he stands somewhat outside time itself, instead of working as a sort of extraneous presence who will serve to emphasize many of Hill’s ideas.

Offa, Anglo-Saxon King

The central anachronism in *Mercian Hymns* is the introduction of King Offa into contemporary Britain. The fact that the speaker introduces Offa to the reader as the one who built the venerable dyke that separates Wales from England renders Offa as a symbol for the isolationism within England as well as its desire to gain empire. In Hymn VII, one sees some of the negative traits that Offa brings. In this part, he deals with another Anglo-Saxon monarch, Ceolred, who is dragged into the present day.

The speaker notes that "Ceolred was [Offa's] friend and remained so, even after the day of the lost fighter" (Hill 1994, p. 99). This referred to a toy biplane that had fallen through a crevice in the classroom floor, down into the space among the piers. Offa's revenge is to entice Ceolred, "who was sniggering with fright, down to the old quarries, and [to flay] him" (Hill 1994, p. 99). Offa would flay someone for losing a toy suggests that he is not only ruthless but to a degree that is not proportional to the cause for outrage. If one views Offa as a symbol for the origins and the
intentions of the modern British nation, the one that spread empire worldwide, then one can see his behavior here as a figurative expression of its ruthless behavior toward parts of the world that he seeks to conquer.

If one examines what this trend would mean for Great Britain to have Anglo-Saxon origins, this would suggest that those origins also contain a great deal of cruelty – and that they had a significant impact on English culture in the future, even though there is a tradition in literature that points toward the gentler elements of English origins as more influential, perhaps to take the patina of brutishness away from the idea of what it means to be English (Moffett 2006, p.14).

In the section of "Acknowledgments" that appeared with the original publication of Mercian Hymns, Hill addresses the fact that Offa is everywhere – but also everywhen, both in the seventh century and in the present day as the poem presents it. Hill notes that Offa was already taking on legendary status in medieval England. When Hill refers to him as the "presiding genius of the West Midlands," (Moffett 2006, p.14), he also points out that anachronisms will result in the presentation of Offa in work. Still, it also brings to question Hill's notions of what it means to be English and connecting them to Offa. If Mercian Hymns poses the question as to whether Offa's influence remains an integral part of England not just at the writing of the hymns but even into the future after that, one gets the sense that this king is a lot less noble than that lord of Camelot whom so many English like to consider their idyllic ruler.

If one returns to the beginning of the poem, mentioned in the introduction, Offa responds to a lavish description of himself, which might well be taken from a proclamation penned with a quill on sheepskin, with a terse chuckle. Here is the series of epithets again: "king of the perennial holly-groves, the riven sandstone: overlord of the M5; architect of the historic rampart and ditch, the citadel at Tamworth, the summer hermitage in Holy Cross; guardian of the Welsh Bridge and the Iron Bridge: contractor to the desirable new estates: salt-master: money-changer: commissioner for oaths: martyrologist: the friend of Charlemagne. 'I liked that,' said Offa, 'sing it again' " (Hill 1971, n.p.). If one looks at the interplay of the nicknames given to Offa, some suggest a sort of oppressive domination (overlord and money-changer). Still, others offer a kind of stewardship (architect, guardian, contractor, commissioner). Ending with "the friend of Charlemagne," who is selected as the first Holy Roman Emperor, gives Offa a status that the sarcastic flair of "overlord of the M5" seems to want to undermine.

When Offa asks for the opening to be sung again, this could suggest satisfaction. Still, it could also mean either confusion or merely a lack of emotional response, given the different tones within the same series of compliments. One could easily see the king wondering whether the positive sentiments coming his way are sincere or sarcastic, given the level of exaggeration that appears.

Hill's imagination for history goes back to memories of childhood. Also, it considers the implications for what a relatively unknown Anglo-Saxon king could bring to the modern sense of
the English identity. The time shifts among four primary periods: the present of reflection, the past of memories of boyhood, the history of Offa's time on the actual throne, and a sort of Anglo-Saxon Tardis that carries Offa back and forth between the eighth century and the twentieth. The poem suggests a first-person narrator that appears to be rooted in Offa's memories of his boyhood, but that fluctuates from time to time, leaving the actual voice ambiguous.

The effect of ambiguity, as one might expect, is not always consistent. Empson notes that ambiguity in writing requires multiple types of indecision: "an indecision as to what you mean, an intention to mean several things, a probability that one or other or both of two things are meant, and the fact that a statement has several meanings" (Empson 1951, pp.5-6). In understanding the presentation of Offa, it is essential to note that the work lacks certainty not just in the state of mind of the speaker, but also the consistency in the message from the other voices in the poem. In cases like this, the reader needs to find a point of distinction between situations in which the author might lack certainty or situations in which a remark could have multiple meanings, all of which were within the author's mind at the time of writing. Also, it is essential to discern whether it makes sense that the text might have a more fabulous body of meaning than the author meant for it.

Here is a relevant passage from Hymn IV:"I was invested in mother-earth, the crypt of roots and endings. Child's play. I abode there, bided my time: where the mole shouldered the clogged wheel, his gold solidus; where dry-dust badgers thronged the Roman flues, the long-unlooked-for mansion of our tribe (Hill 1994, p.96). At this point, the "I" could be the implied boyhood voice of Offa, remembering boyhood as a time when he dwelt in the earth, and through the lens of memory, sees that waiting as biding his time. The "I" here also could refer to Offa talking about himself in that sort of Doctor Whovian floating between the eighth century and the twentieth century. Merely reading the poem provides no guide as to which of those choices is the correct one. Instead, one could argue that this is a point where the work intentionally moves into ambiguity, which puts two voices in the reader's ear at the same time, leaving the reader unaware of the intentional extent of the combination.

It is worth pointing out that, according to the work of the poststructuralists, led by such figures as Roland Barthes, the actual intent of the author is immaterial. Barthes (n.d.), in "The Death of the Author," uses the word "scripture" to refer both to the individual writing a text and the individual reading the text, as both have a semiotic nexus operating between their intellectual filters and the end product. In the case of the person writing the text, that nexus between inspiration and composition changes the meaning; in the person reading the text, the set of experiences that the reader has gone through in life uniquely colors his or her interpretation, shifting the meaning once again. If one looks at this discussion of ambiguity from a poststructuralist perspective, one sees that the intent of the author is less important than the interpretive result for the person encountering the text, as the person reading the text often brings just as much chance to the reader as the person who recorded it.
A passage from Hymn V also highlights the fundamental ambiguity at work in Mercian Hymns: "exile or pilgrim set me once more upon that ground: my rich and lonely childhood. Dreamy, smug-faced, sick on outings – I who is taken to be a king of some kind, a prodigy, a maimed one" (Hill 1994, p. 97). If one believes that the "I" here is that eponymous voice from Offa's childhood, then the words "exile" and "pilgrim" ring somewhat false – or at least somewhat arrogant, at least through recollection. Perhaps, for example, the adult Offa could be looking back at his boyhood and reflecting that his personality was snobbish or self-satisfied. If this is the voice of Offa moving fluidly through time, this could be a comment from the author that the king/narrator is a hypocrite, too willing to indulge his sense of self to portray his actual significance truthfully.

In 1981, Hill sat down with John Haffenden for an interview about this poem. The conversation reveals, to a limited degree, the correct direction to follow when answering questions about this ambiguity. Hill notes that he had the desire to express "mixed feelings for [his] own home country" as well as the opacity of English history" (Haffenden 1981, p.94). This provides three different answers: it confirms the fact that there is ambivalence at work in the poem (although the reader hardly needs anyone to vouch for that); it suggests that Offa holds a significance in the poem that is intentionally dual – and intentionally left without resolution, a puzzle for the reader; finally, it shows how ambiguity, somewhat ironically, can end up clarifying meaning. However, the interview does not clear up what appears to be a bias for Offa throughout the poem, one that seems to relish the violent side of his personality rather than to provide a sort of moral judgment on his behavior for the reader.

One could view this lack of judgment in a couple of ways: a sort of entertainment that does not come with any sense of restraint, or as a sort of ironic ambivalence of its own, designed to make the reader wonder whether or not the author takes the moral tone that the speaker seems to at times, linking Offa’s brutish behavior with the brutal behavior of the British Empire, or not.

In his interview with Haffenden, Hill indicates that his purpose was to bring both the voice of a "tyrannical creator of order and beauty" and the voice of a boy facing "early humiliations and fears," for the purpose to show the "discovery of a tyrannical streak in oneself" as well as its development as that person moved toward and into adulthood (Haffenden 1991, p.94). The claim that going through a series of emotionally negative experiences in one’s childhood necessarily leads to tyrannical behavior as an adult is a problematic one, given the sheer universality of those childhood experiences, and it is this implication that makes the anachronistic extension of Offa somewhat complicated.

With that said, Offa and Hill both have their origins in the same section of England, and both seem to feel a sense of identity with their country is a part of the cycle of poems that is worth addressing. One aspect of the anachronism, of course, has to do with the fact that the idea of England as a nation was much different, and much smaller, in the eighth century than it is in the
twentieth. Just as ambiguous as the relationship between the two ideas of nationalism is, so is the connection between Offa and the boy.

The fantasy of living like a king over a world in which one finds life to be unfair and degrading is a common one in childhood, whether one finds it in such work as Maurice Sendak's *Where the Wild Things Are* or in the escapism that comes from the establishment of a world in which some children get to head off to a particular school where they learn to do magic just at the dawn of puberty, when their sense of identity is just awakening. The notion that the boy in the poem fantasizes about the possibility of his status as a king is reasonably clear from the verse. However, this is a sort of incongruous comparison because the connection between those frustrations and the tyrant's role, as mentioned earlier, is somewhat problematic. Much as the journey of the young Max, sent to his room without dinner only to fantasize about a trip to an island filled with monsters who end up doing his bidding and crowning him king, there is much more of the grotesque in a world shaped by such whim than there is in terms of genuine self-reflection.

The grotesque can serve as the basis for complexity in a poem, and the questions that the connection between Offa and the boy generates can be a source of that complexity. Hill, in an interview with *The Paris Review*, claimed that when poems contain "any complexity of language, any ambiguity, any ambivalence," they also include "intelligence" (Hill 2000, p.275). In his work, *The Structure of Complex Words*, Empson (1951) notes that when a text is ambiguous, this can lead to interest for the reader, no matter what the intention of the author concerns the actual meaning. In other words, if there is ambiguity between the two interpretations, the ambiguity is of interest to the critic and reader whether the author meant one of the two, both of them – or neither. In Hymn V, one reads that the speaker "wormed [his] way heavenward for ages amid barbaric ivy, scrollwork of fern" (Hill 1994, p. 97). Here the ambiguity centers around the word *heaven*: Is this a reference to the physical sky above, or is it a more metaphysical reference to the next plane.

If one looks at the term "for ages" from that quotation in a literal way, then it seems that one is dealing with the speaker's view as a timeless Offa, moving back and forth between centuries. However, if one looks at the term "for ages" as the sort of hyperbole to which a boy might resort in the description of a situation, then the speaker here could be the young boy, considering what had happened in the ruins he was exploring. The ambiguity enabled by this anachronism is what makes this point in the poem of interest.

It is possible, of course, that the option for confluence between the boy and Offa makes the question moot since both of those factors could be in operation behind the voice. Another point of ambiguity that results from this anachronism comes in Hymn X, in which the speaker "wept, attempting to master *ancilla* and *servus*" (Hill 1994, p.102). Bursting into tears over grammar questions is a reaction that one might anticipate from a boy – but it is also possible that the speaker here is Offa (North 1987). However, the crying would seem more appropriate for the boy while
more figuratively fit for the king. If one considers that the speaker here is Offa, there could also be symbolic interpretations for the possibility that the king has to bring others beneath him in servitude.

There are also several points at which the Mercian Hymns show a fascination with the pursuit of power. This is a point at which the ambiguity concerning the identity of the narrative voice becomes even more of an interpretive problem, and the silences within the poem become increasingly pregnant. In Hymn VII, one returns to the memory of flaying Ceolred and then leaving him behind in a sand lorry, traveling quietly and in silence. The most intriguing part of this passage is that the speaker travels "for hours, calm and alone" in the aftermath of such a violent action (Hill 1994, p. 99).

The implication here is that calm seems like a counterintuitive response to such actions of violence. One generally moves into a period of peace after an experience that brings happiness or satisfaction. In carrying out violence, the aftermath often brings anxiety, worry, and even a sense of frustration at times – unless one has enjoyed what one has done. The importance of calm could suggest a feeling of accomplishment and even pleasure taken in what has happened in the last few minutes or hours. One gets the understanding that the speaker has acted brutally (as suggested by the use of the word "flayed"), and with malice aforethought (as indicated by the use of the story "lured"). The fact that he moves to travel alone for such an extended period suggests both that he realizes that his actions violate social norms – but is willing to spend his time of satisfaction alone, discovering learning on an individual basis.

What then is the effect of a speaker that appears to find pleasure in delivering pain and fear to others and then enters into a period of calm after having exercised that sort of brutish power over others? No ethical questioning emerges explicitly from the text; instead, there is simply a shortage of ethical consideration at any point. Therefore, if there is a judgment on the morality of the situation, it takes place silently. This, of course, creates another point of ambiguity in the poem. When it comes to leaving important matters unsaid, Hill referred to this in an interview in The Guardian in 2002. He noted that when he was young, "the word 'cancer' wasn't said aloud; it was mouthed silently. In [his] own approach to language, that aspect of fraught mime is as significant…as are the history and contexts of etymology" (Hill 2002, n.p.). The term "fraught mime" here is interesting to consider. It is that anxiety that waits not just the whispering or silencing of problematic words but also the hearing of that adjustment in volume and delivery; the adjustment often carries more rhetorical weight than the text itself.

It is clear, of course, that Offa enjoys carrying out behavior that is primal in its violence. The creation of pain, suffering, fear, and even death in others pleases him and resolves what, for him, is an apparent necessity. There are times when establishing and maintaining one's own rule as king makes this a need; there are other times when enjoying the experience of power results in this as a consequence. The fact that one reads about the satisfaction that the speaker feels from the
situation without any ethical correction raises the question of whether, at the authorial level, there is still a way to use reason and justice when carrying out force as a king.

In other words, if one has power, as Offa has power, what is the proper connection between the use of force and the enforcement of the law? Does the existence of a code of law make the use of violence that, in the hands of others, would violate that code, legitimate for those carrying out the will of the government? There is a scant response to that question in the hymns; there is, though, a great deal of enjoyment that Offa derives from delivering fear. In this passage from Hymn XVIII, one sees this pleasure at a new level: "He willed the instruments of violence to break upon meditation. Iron buckles gagged; flesh leaked rennet over them; the men stooped; disentangled the body. He wiped his lips and hands. He strolled back to the car, with discreet souvenirs for consolation and philosophy" (Hill 1994, p. 110). There is little left to the moral imagination here concerning the possibility that there is some way justice is carried out by this application of pain. Instead, torture has taken place for its own sake, for the sake of the one who has sufficient power over others to carry it out with impunity.

The “discreet souvenirs” that Offa carries with him back to his car can be seen as an extension to the stroll that the speaker earlier made to his sand lorry after having carried out that brutal flaying. He realizes that if others knew about the souvenirs, the parts of the body that he has chosen to carry along as souvenirs, then there might be some censure to come, much like the disfavor into which American soldiers fell after it became known that they had taken photographs of prisoners that they had taken in Iraq forced into humiliating positions. The fact of the torture was not, perhaps, the most shocking detail; it was the fact that the soldiers felt not just amusement at what they had done but the entitlement to take and keep photographs of their deeds.

Suppose one takes from this poem the suggestion that the Anglo-Saxon area ruled by Offa as inspiration for Offa to speculate about a future England as a nation, then one could also take the idea that notions of power and its exercise as a result. It is a short path from that point considering how the English government exercises force in the twentieth century – and exercised force in its days of empire – descended from Offa's thoughts and had those vicarious pleasures in common.

Anachronism in Form: The Composition of Mercian Hymns

It is also worth noting at this point that the style that Hill brings to bear in Mercian Hymns differs substantially from that of many of his earlier works. Many of those poems featured a great deal of formality, not just in tone but also structure, showing a fixed pattern of meter, generally iambic (Wootten 1998). In the Mercian Hymns, though, that pattern has gone by the wayside. Instead, one finds "a rhythmical prose influenced by Anglo-Saxon and early Welsh verse"(Wootten 1998, p.156). The thematic result is also different; while many of Hill's earlier works demonstrate a great deal of pathos, what one sees in this cycle of poems is the absence of pathos, the presentation of the event and word without the concomitant demonstration of feeling that one might expect.
The syntax at work in the *Mercian Hymns* brings nouns and adjectives together without a verb to provide a set of actions. In Hymn VI, the speaker "fostered a strangeness; gave [himself] to unattainable toys. Candles of gnarled resin, apple branches, the tacky mistletoe. 'look' they said and again 'look.' But [he] ran slowly; the landscaped flowed away, back to its source" (Hill 1994, p. 110). The juxtaposition here of the candles, apple branches, and mistletoe suggest a sort of enchantment, which then runs smack into the word "tacky," which takes the patina of the mystical away, as mistletoe can have a sticky texture to it – and can also be tacky in the sense of a clichéd or even vulgar decoration.

One implication of this is a loss of innocence and wonder in the mistletoe, an item that often causes excitement about the coming of Christmas in children. Still, as life moves into adulthood, those feelings are replaced by memories of an unwanted kiss at a party, fueled by too much liquid "joy" in the kisser.

The idea of a quality remaining "unattainable" in this situation has much less to do with its physical unavailability and much more to do with the loss of the enchanted associations that had previously attended it. One can compare this to the shift in the relationship between Jay Gatsby and Daisy once they reunite and start spending afternoons in assignation together. After their meeting, that green light on her dock, which had stood for possibility, now was no longer necessary. " Compared to the great distance that had separated him from Daisy [the light] had seemed very near to her, almost touching her. It had seemed as close as a star to the moon. Now it was again a green light on a dock. His count of enchanted objects had diminished by one" (Fitzgerald, 1923, n.p.). The implication was that finally gaining the object of his desire had removed the patina of magic and awe from that object.

**Conclusion**

In the *Mercian Hymns*, the loss of the patina is somewhat different. While the mistletoe itself might not have been the object of desire, the associations that it brings, the experience of the Christmas season, may have been the object. Once one has experienced that object multiple times, the mystique wears off, and now it seems, out in the full light of adult experience, somewhat sad. This could explain the eponymous shifting in the narrative voice as well, because it is no longer possible for Hill to look at life through the innocent eyes of that young boy, and it is no longer possible to live that life of isolation, keeping his associations to himself. How history and mythology intervene in our connection with the path are moving from childhood to contact to broader adult society. Sometimes this leads to a syncretism that is less than pleasing, because it turns our childhood illusions into an awareness of the horror of humanity – and the beauty that some find in that horror.

This paper analyzes the use of anachronism in the *Mercian Hymns*. The movement back and forth in time leads to several ambiguities as far as the speaker's voice and the expression of
the theme. This work also represents an unusual choice of form for Hill, also an anachronism, as it seems from a different time than his typical style.

About the Author

Dr. Nadia Ali Ismael has a Ph.D. in Modern American poetry and is currently an assistant professor teaching fourth-year students at the College of the Languages/University of Baghdad. She has a research interest in literary criticism and English poetry. She has widely published research papers in local and international journals. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1463-4325

References
The Use and Abuse of Machine Translation in Vocabulary Acquisition among L2 Arabic-Speaking Learners

Lamis Ismail Omar
English Language and Literature Department, College of Arts and Applied Sciences, Dhofar University, Salalah, Sultanate of Oman
Email: lameesiomar@gmail.com

Received: 12/30/2020 Accepted: 1/17/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Using Machine Translation (MT) for vocabulary acquisition is an inevitable phenomenon among Arabic-speaking L2 learners. But has MT fully succeeded in replacing traditional dictionaries and providing an ideal tool for vocabulary acquisition among L2 learners? This study aimed to research the value and implications of using machine translation in vocabulary acquisition. The study is significant as it investigates a neglected area in teaching a second language focusing on the role of MT in vocabulary acquisition. The empirical study adopted a combined quantitative and qualitative methodology that tested students’ skills in answering vocabulary questions in context by using online translators. Forty-seven participants took part in the assessment voluntarily, and they were all fourth-year students about to graduate from an Omani private university. The findings confirmed the results of earlier research about the challenges ESL learners face in vocabulary acquisition, including difficulties in processing sequential lexical patterns and using vocabulary communicatively. The results further revealed that online translators do not provide an optimal solution to overcome obstacles in using vocabulary unless accompanied by higher metacognitive skills such as critical thinking and using words in context. The study concluded with some implications and recommendations for further relevant research.

Keywords: English as a Second Language, Machine Translation, Omani private university, online dictionaries, online translators, pedagogy, Second Language Arabic-speaking learners, technology, vocabulary acquisition

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.6
Introduction

There is a universal consensus among foreign language learners, academics, and researchers that vocabulary acquisition is an integral part of second/foreign language teaching (Constantinescu, 2007; Boers & Lindstromberg, 2008). Words are the point of departure in learning a foreign language and using it effectively. Even when used individually, a word can start a communication process and keep it going. Accordingly, it is recognized in L2 learning and teaching activities that mastering the use of lexis is both an obstacle to and a predictor of the learners’ effective use of language (AlQahtani, 2015). In pedagogical practice, teaching new vocabulary in the L2 classroom takes place in parallel with reading comprehension activities as the reading skill depends on the learner’s vocabulary and background knowledge in the second/foreign language (Constantinescu, 2007). Throughout the reading activity, the learners can acquire new words and practice using them in context (Nomass, 2013). Blake (2008) observed that the learners’ superficial knowledge of vocabulary is detrimental to their ability to achieve full reading comprehension. AlQahtani (2015) pointed out that L2 readers face formidable challenges unless they have rich knowledge about vocabulary and their use in context. Empirically, learning vocabulary plays a vital role in the reading skill and all other language skills because it is sentential to the successful uses of language (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018). Research has revealed that L2 learners achieve more when they have rich knowledge about vocabulary in quantity and quality (AlQahtani, 2015). Therefore, students always need to develop their vocabulary and ameliorate their ability to master their use in the four language skills equally: reading, writing, listening, and speaking (Alagozlu & Kiymazarslan, 2020).

Teaching new vocabulary in the foreign language classroom is not an easy process for reasons to do with the lack of awareness among learners and instructors about the significance of this task and the appropriate methods to approach it. AlQahtani (2015) observed that most instructors are not well-informed about how best to teach vocabulary in the L2 classroom and what pedagogical practices they can follow to address the challenges students encounter when learning about vocabulary uses in context. This has become more evident following the emergence of technology and its uninformed, ubiquitous uses in L2 learning activities. Al-Qahtani (2015) discussed the techniques used by L2 instructors in teaching vocabulary, including the use of objects, drawings, illustrations, pictures, contrasting vocabulary with their antonyms, enumeration, mime, gestures, guessing from context, eliciting as well as translation. ‘Translation’ came at the end of the list, implying that it should be the last resort of EFL instructors in teaching vocabulary. Yet, it is still considered a useful technique in teaching and acquiring vocabulary, mainly because it provides the learners with fast answers while looking for the meaning of a word on the spot.

L2 learners have always employed translation to learn new vocabulary or explore their meaning in the target language (Alroe & Reinders, 2015). Before the emergence of technology-enabled translation software, students and academics used to resort to traditional dictionaries, monolingual or bilingual, but nowadays, almost everyone seems to have turned to the following resources: search engines, Online Translators (OTs), Online Dictionaries (ODs) (O’Neil, 2019) for
The Use and Abuse of Machine Translation in Vocabulary Acquisition

Omar

multiple purposes related to teaching or learning vocabulary. Research in foreign language teaching has revealed that one of the practical uses of technology is to simplify vocabulary acquisition (Shrum & Glisan, 2010). Nevertheless, this task does not go unchallenged, given several impediments L2 learners encounter when using MT to check the meaning of vocabulary in context.

First, L2 learners assume that online dictionaries provide an ideal solution to problems associated with vocabulary acquisition tasks, and they are addicted to the uninformed uses of the online translation software. Second, instructors lack the required academic and pedagogical background to address the challenges related to online translators’ arbitrary uses in vocabulary acquisition. Third, although using electronic translation tools is pervasive among L2 learners and users and is a frequently-discussed academic topic (Clifford et al., 2013), not much scholarly work has investigated the role of MT in learning vocabulary in the EFL classroom. In other words, there is a pressing need for exploring the role of MT in different EFL activities, including vocabulary acquisition (Sabtan, 2020), with a particular reference to Arabic-speaking L2 learners. This study is pertinent and significant because it aims to bridge the gaps in academic research on the value of technology for vocabulary acquisition among L2 learners. The study aims to test online translators’ effectiveness in answering vocabulary questions among ESL Arabic-speaking learners in a private Omani university. It also highlights the challenges that L2 learners face when learning about the uses of vocabulary in context. The empirical study will attempt to answer the following questions:

1. Is using online translation software an optimal strategy to learn vocabulary among L2 Arabic-speaking learners?
2. Has machine translation managed to replace traditional dictionaries in the effective acquisition of vocabulary?
3. What challenges do L2 learners face when using online translators to answer vocabulary questions?
4. What appropriate pedagogic strategies can instructors adopt for better teaching of vocabulary vis-à-vis the use of technology?

The following literature review will highlight the relevance of technology to teaching and learning vocabulary, discussing its affordances and limitations in ESL/EFL teaching.

Literature Review

Machine Translation (MT), also referred to as ‘Online Translator’ software (OT), goes back to the middle of the twentieth century (Akbari, 2014; Poibeau, 2017). It is a branch of “computational linguistics that investigates the use of software to translate text or speech from one natural language to another” (Al-Tuwayrish, 2016, p. 5). Electronic translation may occur with the intervention of human beings or without it (Akbari, 2014). By and large, the majority of EFL students use “MT as a dictionary (specifically MT is easier than a dictionary)” (Clifford et al., 2013, p. 112) to translate lexical items or check up their meaning in vocabulary learning activities (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018; Clifford et al., 2013). Using MT as a translation tool applies to diverse language combinations, including English/Arabic. Several studies researched this function of MT.
from the perspective of Arabic-speaking learners of English (See Abu-Al-Sha’r & AbuSeileek 2013; AlQahtani, 2015; Kumar, 2012; Medvedev, 2016). Kumar (2012) remarked that using MT among Arabic-speaking ESL learners, especially in Gulf countries, is prevalent in vocabulary activities as these learners use MT to translate the new vocabulary and understand their meaning in the target language.

It is undeniable that using MT in L2/FL learning contexts has become a fait accompli and is expected to grow even further with the increasing demand for online learning in the post-COVID era. Fundamentally, EFL learners use MT in vocabulary learning activities because it has many affordances. Shrum and Glisan (2010) said there is “enough research to confirm that the use of technology has a small but positive effect on L2 reading, writing and vocabulary development” (p. 454). Other researchers highlighted MT’s value in providing convenient and instant support to EFL learners in vocabulary learning activities (Al-Tuwayrish, 2016; Lee, 2019), especially in the classroom context where both instructors and learners are mindful of the constraints of time. Additionally, MT has other positive aspects for being free of charge and providing translation services in different languages. MT software has recently been updated to provide additional functions to giving the direct meaning of words. The following quote explains all these advantages:

It has a free access. The users only need to open its website in a browser or download the app in their gadget to use it. It is also instant, in a quick click, the users could get the translation result. It also provides a variety of languages. Photo recognition becomes one feature in GT application in students’ smartphone that they use in order to save their time, especially when they try to understand some English texts. (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018, p. 229)

Despite the positive aspects associated with the use of MT in terms of promptness and other learner-support features, “Such immediacy also has a negative side to it” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 184). MT has several limitations that cannot be overlooked from a pedagogical and academic perspective as they undermine the effectiveness of online translators (O’Neil, 2019). Certainly, MT is a handy tool to be used in the EFL classroom, but it has shortcomings in understanding the use of vocabulary in context as it may yield inaccurate results. The source of the challenge is not only in using MT to check the meaning of vocabulary. Instead, it is in the learners’ overdependence on their native language to understand new vocabulary in the target language. Chapelle (2003) observed that “in English language teaching the common wisdom seemed to suggest that learners should develop their strategies for figuring out the meaning or guessing the right word rather than relying on the first language” (p. 48). AlQahtani (2015) noted that, regardless of the instructors’ techniques in teaching vocabulary, they need to provide examples of vocabulary used in rich and multiple contexts, which MT may fail to offer.

Constantinescu (2007) discussed the integrated relationship between learning vocabulary and reading comprehension and the importance of using technology to enhance this relationship in the classroom, concluding that in reading activities, full comprehension requires a
contextualized understanding of the meanings of vocabulary. It is not surprising that teaching L2 students new vocabulary is closely related to reading comprehension exercises because vocabulary acquisition does not happen in isolation of a particular context. Students also need to learn how and when to use different lexical items. The fact that teaching/learning vocabulary needs to occur in context is deeply rooted in the nature of meaning and the issue of polysemy. Meaning is a variable component which “does not reside in language; it is produced in practice” (Canagarajah, 2007, as cited in Lomicka, 2020, p. 310). The concept of meaning has multifaceted levels, including, lexical meaning (dictionary meaning), propositional meaning (contextual), expressive meaning, presupposed meaning, and evoked meaning (Baker, 2018). These different layers of meaning make it difficult for MT to “distinguish multiple meanings of the source language words in the target language” (Akbari, 2014, p. 7). Latest developments in computational linguistics have introduced contextualized MT models such as Rule-based MT and Statistical MT that have provided partial solutions to such problems (Akbari, 2014). Still, the inability of MT to think critically makes the absolute reliance on such software disruptive. Akbari (2014) discussed different types of shortcomings in MT, including syntactic problems, idioms, slangs and expressions, lexical problems, and paralinguistic problems. The researcher concluded that it is still impossible for MT to function accurately without human beings’ intervention.

Although most EFL students use MT as a dictionary (Clifford et al., 2013), and this is visibly the case among Arabic-speaking EFL learners, practically, there are some functional differences between MT and ODs. Like OTs, ODs provide a direct and easy means for vocabulary acquisition by English language learners (Nomaas, 2013). The main difference between them is that most ODs provide contextualized examples of vocabulary uses, which is not the case in all OTs. According to Jin and Deifell (2013), “online dictionaries that offer more contexts of usage lead to more successful language use by second language learners” (p. 517), and they are used by learners at the level of words when they become “difficult to figure out from the context” (p. 522). An empirical study conducted by O’Neil (2019) to investigate L2 students’ opinions about ODs and MT observed that both ODs and MT software had the same results in terms of the number of students who use them in their L2 tasks, including vocabulary checking. But there was a difference between the two in terms of students’ attitudes. To clarify, ODs received a higher percentage of positive attitudes than OTs. The results showed that “93.9% of comments about online dictionaries were judged to be positive” (O’Neil, 2019, p. 165) compared to 75.6% of positive opinions about online translators. The study explained that the source of the negative feedback on OTs’ performance was related to their inaccuracy and unreliability, compared to ODs that did not receive similar feedback. This variation in students’ attitudes vis-à-vis the reliability of OTs and ODs is related to the fact that ODs involve the students in reflective thinking. On the other hand, OTs seem to be used “as a sort of ‘crutch’ to help them complete assignments […] at least in some cases, online translation is being used as a means to an end as opposed to a learning tool” (p. 172). Jin and Deifell (2013) explained that the value of online dictionaries is seen “in their innovativeness, which includes their convenience, quick updates, interactivity, and potential for designer/user collaboration” (p. 516).
As a matter of fact, unlike ODs, OTs have a relatively deterministic function that does not help L2 students to develop their skills of reflection as autonomous learners. Nonetheless, OTs can be helpful in learning vocabulary if students receive guidance on using them “effectively and critically” (Reinhardt, 2020, p. 239) as learning tools. Viewing OTs or other technological resources as a learning tool is indispensable for L2 learners to use them constructively. Seeing technology in terms of the tool metaphor is in harmony with the communicative approach that “shifted language teaching practices from a focus on translation, text, and memorization to techniques that provided authentic opportunities for learning through interaction and meaningful language use” (Reinhardt, 2020, p. 235). While ODs can be more reliable than OTs in learning new vocabulary and mastering their use in context, learners need to be mindful of how best to use them, as expressed in the following quote:

Translation programs (…) may lack cultural knowledge and the application of higher-level thinking that students would normally apply to creating their own expression. Students should be cautious in using a translation program because such programs do not help them learn how to interpret and communicate in the TL. Similarly, use of an online dictionary should be limited to consulting the meaning and proper use of a word, while also verifying that the correct meaning or connotation of the word is selected. (Shrum & Glisan, 2010, p. 465)

Despite the challenges L2 learners meet when using MT or ODs to identify the proper uses of words, their application is inevitable among all L2 learners. Clifford et al. (2013) highlighted this idea by stating that “these applications and programs are here. They are pervasive. They are being actively promoted. They are being actively updated and tweaked. They are garnering widespread attention and, most importantly, they are being used by our students” (p. 116). Therefore, it is essential not to throw the baby with the bathwater but rather to see how instructors can integrate technology with L2 learning activities without influencing the quality of the learning process. Clifford et al. (2013) pointed out that as instructors, we should explore the use of MT in vocabulary acquisition with our students rather than prevent them from using it. In other words, instructors need to reconsider their pedagogic practices in teaching vocabulary in the L2 classroom, given the unavoidable use of MT by L2 learners. Therefore, it is necessary to think of strategies that can be adopted by both instructors and learners to maximize the benefit of OTs and ODs. For instance, learners need to receive training in how to “use online translators and online dictionaries in concert to facilitate language learning and develop effective digital literacy practices” (Jin & Deifell, 2013, p. 525). This can help them “avoid semantic breaches” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 187). In other words, recent research calls for merging the use of technology, as a tool, with the role of instructors who are required to guide their students on the most effective uses of OTs (Medvedev, 2016; O’ Neil, 2019; Shrum & Glisan, 2010).

According to Nomass (2013), integrating the role of technology with that of the instructor is an optimal way to achieve “advanced learning results” (p. 111). Some EFL instructors are not speakers of the target language, so they cannot rely on MT to verify their students’ correct
understanding of the actual meaning of vocabulary in context (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018), but still, there are several strategies that EFL instructors can adopt in order to complement the role of the translation software in the learners’ acquisition of new vocabulary. If used in a pedagogically-sound manner, these strategies can develop students’ skills to use MT effectively and independently in advanced phases without the guidance of their teachers. First and foremost, instructors need “to show students the benefits and drawbacks of instant translation as a learning tool so that they are not lost but, instead, found in meaningful language practice” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 192). For example, teachers can highlight the disadvantages of OTs or ODs “by illustrating selected errors in a brief lesson” (Sweley, 2008 as cited in Shrum & Glisan, 2010, p. 465). Secondly, instructors need to teach their students the skill of critical thinking (Jin & Deifell, 2013), which is important to employ in online translation when dealing with the issue of polysemy because “critical thinking really comes into play when students scan the available translated option in search of the proper equivalent” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 188). An example of one level of meaning that MT does not process successfully is expressive meaning. Learners can have access to this level of meaning via an intervention from their instructors who have the required experience to “expand their critical awareness of the emotional impact of words” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 189).

Following the rise in using OTs and ODs among L2/FL learners, research studies started investigating their relevant uses quantitively and qualitatively. Jin and Deifell (2013) accentuated the need for research on “Which mobile dictionaries are used in FL learning and how these dictionaries are used” (p. 526). In the majority of studies that discussed the uses of MT in the context of ESL/EFL, Google Translate (GT) was singled out as one of the most popular MT tools among learners and instructors alike. Medvedev (2016) stated that “Google Translate is likely to be most frequently referred to by the English language learners to look for the translation of individual words” (p. 186). Accordingly, GT is used as a dictionary to find words or translate them into the target language (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018) when students are involved in a particular activity or assignment. Clifford et al. (2013) pointed out that the pervasive use of free MT online programmes like GT is revolutionizing the way students interact in the second language. This has triggered interest in researching the value of this tool in EFL learning activities.

Several studies discussed the uses of GT among Arabic-speaking EFL learners (Abu-Al-Sha’r & AbuSeileek, 2013; Kumar, 2012; Medvedev, 2016). Abu-Al-Sha’r and AbuSeileek (2013) concluded that since 2008 “Google has achieved prominent advancement in the field of electronic translation” (p. 533), compared to other systems. Chandra and Yuyun (2018) indicated that “GT is helpful if it is dealing with only words” (p. 236). This is related to the fact that GT has high accuracy in translating vocabulary because it identifies the uses of a specific vocabulary based on many statistical patterns in millions of documents (Abu-Al-Sha’r & AbuSeileek, 2013; Medvedev, 2016). Accordingly, GT was commended as “one of the easiest and most accessible tools to help users meet their translation needs. Since it offers quick and rather accurate dual translation services” (Medvedev, 2016, p. 183). Yet, there are still some reservations on using GT as an absolute resource in learning vocabulary. For example, it lacks accuracy when used for translating...
vocabulary in context (Chandra & Yuyun, 2018). Besides, the quick and convenient access that GT gives encourages over-dependence among learners and makes specific cognitive processes such as memorizing and remembering words more challenging (Jin & Deifell, 2013).

Kumar (2012) described the use of GT by Arabic-speaking EFL learners to learn vocabulary as a prevalent and useful but not always reliable tool in learning English well because sometimes “it changes the meaning of the sentence” (p. 444). Medvedev (2016) conducted a study on the use of GT as a tool for translating vocabulary among Arab learners of English in Oman. The study explained how GT may lead to “misunderstanding in the choice of words” (p. 185), particularly in the case of neologisms and synonyms “when the Arabic part appears to be completely the same, whereas the English equivalent presents a significant difference in meaning” (p. 186). The paper concluded that instructors need to adopt practical techniques to show their students how to employ GT and other translation tools in learning vocabulary away from bad practices. Al-Tuwayrish (2016) studied the use of MT among Arabic-speaking EFL learners and pointed out that the product of MT certainly needs to be examined by experienced people and that MT “is a potent tool to be used with caution. This is especially true in EFL situations as in Saudi Arabia where the student community is ill equipped to verify the reliability of machine translated texts” (p. 9). Jin and Deifell (2013) explained that instructors are required to develop professional experience about the reliability of different OTs or ODs to provide their students with relevant guidance, as explained in the following quote:

Online dictionaries and other digital resources, such as online translators, have great potential in assisting FL learning inside and outside the classroom. Although FL learners have awareness of the strengths and weaknesses of these tools, FL instructors should develop and facilitate a better understanding of the quality and functions of various online dictionaries in the target language. Instructors can provide the necessary guidance to help students better take advantage and avoid the pitfalls of tools that FL learners are already using. (p. 525)

The empirical studies conducted so far on the use of MT in vocabulary acquisition among Arabic-speaking L2 learners are valuable and pertinent. However, they are limited in number and hardly provide empirical evidence on the challenges that students face while identifying the appropriate uses of vocabulary in context. The following empirical study will attempt to bridge a gap in this context, focusing on the nature of problems students face in answering vocabulary questions and the factors that play a role in determining the ‘correct’ uses of vocabulary in context. The study also highlights the skills that instructors need to focus on in training their students in the appropriate uses of vocabulary.

**Methodology**

This empirical study was conducted based on a combination of quantitative and qualitative methodology to explore the effectiveness and limitations of using OTs in answering vocabulary questions and using vocabulary effectively and communicatively. The analysis dealt with the
collected data descriptively by focusing on data that showed a noticeable deviation from the norm, which was detected by examining the results’ standard deviation (SD).

**Participants**

The participants were selected based on the convenience sampling method. They were forty-seven ESL students in their fourth academic year at an Omani private university during the Summer Term 2019-20. Usually, students who are about to graduate can complete their remaining courses during the summer term to expedite their graduation. The study coincided with the onset of the online learning mode following the COVID-19 pandemic. All participants were native Arabic speakers and were taking an advanced course in English language and communication skills to prepare for their IELTS exam following their graduation. In an IELTS exam, vocabulary accounts for 25% of the total marks assigned for the writing and speaking tests (Wang, 2018), and advanced knowledge of the effective use of vocabulary is indispensable to perform well in the four sections of the exam. The criteria for assessing an applicant’s ability to use vocabulary functionally comprise accuracy, appropriateness in terms of context, the uses of word combination, and the applicant’s ability to express connotative meanings and attitudes precisely.

**Research Instruments**

The participants had to complete an authentic vocabulary quiz within fifteen minutes using OT software. The students accessed the test via the testing functions available on Moodle, and they completed it from the comfort of their home without any observation mechanism. They had to answer 5 MCQs that prompted them to choose the most appropriate and accurate vocabulary in terms of lexical sequence, context, and communicative function (expressive meaning) to fill in the gaps in statements that provide contextual cues about the appropriate uses of vocabulary. The table below gives full information about the questions and the multiple-choice answers. It is worth mentioning that the model answer appears in the table under choice A.

**Table One: The quiz content by questions, multiple choices and model answer**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Question statement</th>
<th>A (model answer)</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>During the <em>Khareef</em>, Dhofar becomes an attraction place for tourists who come to enjoy the rain-soaked ……. mountains, valleys and coastlines.</td>
<td>spectacular</td>
<td>great</td>
<td>green</td>
<td>natural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>In order to protect the environment, it is necessary to ……. the means of</td>
<td>renew</td>
<td>convert</td>
<td>adapt</td>
<td>recharge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
transportation into environment-friendly vehicles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3</th>
<th>The computer came as an/a ………… invention that changed all aspects of life all over the world.</th>
<th>modern</th>
<th>up-to-date</th>
<th>sophisticated</th>
<th>revolutionary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>There was a traffic jam as a result of the accident, and ………… were advised to avoid the area in order not to be late for work.</td>
<td>commuters</td>
<td>passenger</td>
<td>pedestrians</td>
<td>cyclists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>On the weekend, we go to visit my grandmother who has a large house with a garden ………… of town.</td>
<td>in the suburbs</td>
<td>in the middle</td>
<td>on the outskirts</td>
<td>In the centre</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The limitations of the data collection method are threefold. The first limitation is the small number of vocabulary examined in the experimental study. This was addressed by testing the uses of the selected vocabulary among a relatively good number of students and providing a quantified description of the data behaviour, as the analysis will reveal. The second limitation in the research methods is related to the fact that the students’ answers were collected from an authentic quiz, which put them under the pressure of time and their motivation to get high grades. Normally, students have high expectations about their results when it comes to answering vocabulary questions, considering OTs’ availability. Little do they know that their failure in answering some vocabulary questions or even reading comprehension questions can be highly attributed to their failure in understanding the meanings and uses of words in context and following specific sequential patterns or communicative functions.

The main shortcoming here is that the activity was not designed as a regular vocabulary acquisition exercise in the classroom, but it is worth mentioning that the students were involved in similar classroom activities which were designed for the purpose of learning the uses of vocabulary in context and in different communicative situations. Another important point is that some questions were designed in the context of the students’ cultural background to test their ability to select and use vocabulary within a situational context and in a way that develops their critical thinking and cross-cultural communication. The third limitation in the methodology is that the students answered the questions without any monitoring mechanism since they completed the test online, which means that they had access to each other’s social media like WhatsApp groups,
Facebook, and others. This may undermine the value of the results as students would be tempted to copy the responses from each other. The section on the discussion will provide details on how this limitation was addressed by the researcher.

The data were collected using the tools available on Moodle, including the quiz results as grades, excel sheets of students’ responses, as well as statistics generated by the Learning Management System (Moodle), and then the results were analysed by observing several criteria. The main criterion is the level of variation in the results of the students who answered the five vocabulary questions. The researcher studied the collected data to detect whether the results of the quiz showed sporadic distribution (high SD) or whether they were concentrated close to the mean (average), showing a noticeably-low SD in all the questions. If the data show a very low SD in all the results, this can be interpreted in one of the following ways:

1. The students copied the responses from each other without trying to think critically, which casts doubt on the validity of the experimental research.
2. The students have the same level and academic background, which is highly improbable since university students who take ESL language courses in Oman come from different disciplines and have different levels.
3. The vocabulary questions pose no issues or challenges for the students to answer correctly, which casts doubt on the validity of the examination content as exams are not only assessment tools. They are also pedagogical tools.
4. If most questions are answered incorrectly, then the exam content is challenging and not appropriate to the students’ level.
5. If all questions are answered correctly, then using MT is effective. This interpretation promotes the use of OTs as optimal solutions for vocabulary acquisition among ESL learners.

On the other hand, if all the results show a high SD, this means that the tested students come from different academic backgrounds or levels, explaining why the data is overstretched. In both cases, i.e., whether the SD is minimal or maximal, the data behaviour is indicative of a learning issue that is worth studying and investigating to uncover the possible reasons behind the abnormal behaviour of the data. Analysing the results by observing where exactly in the data there was a very low/high SD provides empirical evidence about the validity of the quiz and the responses provided, on the one hand, and highlights any learning or pedagogic issues that need to be addressed vis-à-vis the research’s main topic, on the other hand. This method of data analysis is of particular significance as it unveils the types of difficulties that learners face in their attempt to acquire vocabulary and raises their awareness about the challenges associated with the use of OTs in the acquisition of vocabulary. The data analysis also gives instructors insight into the obstacles students face while using OTs in vocabulary acquisition. Accordingly, they become mindful of the aspects they need to focus on in guiding their students and addressing their relevant educational and self-learning needs.
Findings

This section provides a general idea about the empirical study’s findings, vis-a-vis the methodology and the research questions. The results show that there is variation in the SD of the answers provided by students in all five vocabulary questions. The SD of the responses hit different values, which has implications for the methodology used in collecting the data. To clarify, the fact that the students completed the quiz unobserved did not interfere with their choices of the answers and did not influence the authenticity of the responses. Otherwise, the SD in all the results would be close to 0%, which is not the case, as clarified in Table Two below.

The total grade for the exam was five marks, and the total average (mean) of students’ grades reached approximately 2.57 (51.4% of the total grade). This value is indicative of an essential analysis criterion, namely the normal variation in the academic level of students. For example, an average value that is close to the minimum value of zero or the maximum value of 5 would be indicative of abnormal variation in the results due to cases of students copying from each other or homogeneity in the level of students. In other words, the initial examination of the results against the assumptions provided in the earlier account on methodology leads to the following findings on the reliability of the vocabulary quiz content and the testing criteria:

1. There were no noticeable cases of students copying from each other.
2. There was variation in the academic background and language level of the students.
3. There was variation in the content of the quiz and gradation in difficulty vis-à-vis different testing criteria.
4. The variation in the results is reflective of the appropriateness of the quiz to the students’ level.

The following table provides the details on variation in the results of each question by the SD.

Table Two: variation in the SD of student’s responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question title</th>
<th>Students’ Answers</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary Q1</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary Q2</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>33.73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary Q3</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>49.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary Q4</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>28.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary Q5</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>20.40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The data are further represented as a bar graph (graph one below) to give a clearer idea about the variation the results.

![Data Distribution by SD](image)

**Figure One:** Data Distribution by SD

As for the results of the empirical study in relation to the research questions, the initial examination of the data shows that the total average of students’ grades did not hit 100% and was nowhere near this value, which casts doubt on the effectiveness of using MT in all cases of vocabulary acquisition. Besides, the participants’ individual results showed that none of them answered all the vocabulary questions correctly. In general, the collected results highlight the following findings:

1. Online translation software is merely a tool and not a reliable strategy that L2 learners can adopt to use vocabulary appropriately.
2. MT has not succeeded in replacing traditional bilingual dictionaries in using vocabulary effectively.
3. Students who answer vocabulary questions by relying solely on MT face challenges that disrupt their full comprehension and eventually leave a detrimental impact on their learning.

The following section on the discussion will investigate the nature of the challenges students faced when using MT to identify the appropriate uses of words and further analyse the results in relation to the literature review.

**Discussion**

This section provides a quantitative and descriptive reading of the results in relation to the different assumptions discussed in the literature review about using technology for the acquisition of vocabulary among L2 learners. The fact that none of the students got a full mark (5/5) although
they had access to OTs further confirms the need to study the role of OTs in the acquisition of vocabulary and identify the sources of challenge. The implication here is twofold: first, students use online translators to translate individual vocabulary out of context, which is precisely what L2 learners used to do when checking traditional bilingual or monolingual dictionaries before the technology revolution and the advent of MT. This practice in learning new vocabulary and using them in different contexts reflects the shallow understanding that ESL learners have of the five levels of meaning referred to in the literature review. For example, students are not cognizant of the issues that may emerge as a result of the synonymy and polysemy of lexical meaning. Second, the students were under the influence of their mother-tongue linguistic habits, which forced them to select the vocabulary that were natural for them. For example, in question two, 37 students out of 47 gave the wrong response because they were under the influence of Arabic. It is more common in Arabic to talk about ‘converting’ the means of transportation into environment-friendly vehicles than ‘adapting’ the means of transportation into environment-friendly vehicles. Also, in question four, 32 students out of 47 gave the wrong answer because the concept of ‘commuters’ is not lexicalized in Arabic, which put them under the influence of the more common vocabulary ‘passengers,’ although this word is not appropriate to use in the context of ‘traveling to work’.

Examining the SD of the results highlights another aspect of vocabulary acquisition. As the table of the data and the graph representation above show, the most prominent result is in the first question with data that show a SD close to zero. This means that the results centred on one answer which is the wrong answer from a communicative perspective. The question was reflective of the learners’ cultural background as they live in a tourist attraction area known for its spectacular landscape. The word ‘spectacular’ has a positive expressive meaning compared to the two other vocabulary that the learners selected to answer the question. The majority of students chose words with a neutral meaning ‘natural’ and ‘green.’ The only interpretation for this is the learners’ tendency to choose the vocabulary that looks familiar for them and reflects visible features of their environment, as opposed to communicatively-embedded features.

The context was rich in cues that guided the learners to using a vocabulary with prominent positive connotations such as: attraction place, tourists, enjoy, rain-soaked. The students did not seem to observe these cues, which shows that their use of OTs was quite impulsive and uninformed, and that they were under the influence of their native language while using the tools available for vocabulary acquisition. This finding also shows the student’s inability to practice critical thinking or communicate culturally-embedded content accurately. This is another point of concern that was discussed in the literature review on the shortcomings of using MT in vocabulary acquisition. Interestingly, all the answers provided are correct, vis-a-vis the lexical and propositional levels of meaning. The issue here is whether all four answers provide a communicatively accurate use of the vocabulary, something which OTs would fail to address. It is worth noting that following the quiz, all the students argued that they deserved a full mark for their apparently-correct- yet simplistic- response to question one. The instructor explained the forceful communicative function of an expression like ‘spectacular landscape/mountains’ in
promoting the area to a tourist, compared to using an expression like ‘green or natural landscape’. The students were convinced, and the argument reached a peaceful settlement.

**Conclusion**

Using MT in vocabulary acquisition among EFL learners is an indisputable trend that is impossible to reverse, but it has its shortcomings and challenges. This research investigated the challenges ESL Arabic-speaking learners encounter when relying on MT in vocabulary acquisition. The empirical study was limited in the number of vocabulary examined. Still, the number of participants was quite representative, considering the quantified analysis of the results by using statistical tools like the average and the SD of data. The study’s findings confirmed the results of earlier research that MT has not fully bridged the existing gap in using vocabulary among L2 learners and cannot function as a reliable strategy to learn about the uses of vocabulary in context. The study is valuable because it provides empirical evidence about the nature of problems students face in their absolute reliance on MT and gives valuable insight into the sensitivity of teaching ESL learners about the effective uses of vocabulary and the role of OTs in vocabulary acquisition among ESL learners.

**Implications**

The empirical study provides several significant implications for further consideration by ESL scholars, educators, as well as learners:

First, online dictionaries are mere tools that can help learners to perform specific cognitive tasks, just like traditional monolingual or bilingual dictionaries. To maximize their benefits, they need to be used jointly with critical thinking and contextualization strategies. Students may think that MT is a magical solution for contextualizing all words’ meanings whenever needed. Instructors should develop their pedagogical methods to teach their students how to identify the meaning of words in context and use them in a sound, communicative manner. They are also required to practice using different types of OTs and ODs with their students in the classroom to provide them with practical examples about cases of error in MT and how to avoid/correct them. This way, both instructors and learners may form empirical perceptions about the most reliable OTs or ODs, bilingual or otherwise, in vocabulary acquisition.

Second, there is a need for future studies on vocabulary acquisition in other ESL learning activities such as reading comprehension, speaking exercises, and writing. Students always have high expectations about their results when it comes to answering vocabulary questions, considering OTs’ availability. Little do they know that their failure to answer some reading comprehension questions is related to their inability to understand the meanings and uses of words in context and follow specific sequential patterns or communicative situations. This observation underlines the importance of raising awareness among ESL learners about the different levels of meaning and the value of distinguishing between these levels of meaning while acquiring new vocabulary and examining their uses in context (lexical or situational). Usually, studying the levels of meaning is part of the curricula of translation students considering the difficulties they encounter in choosing
target language ‘equivalents’ while translating. Understanding the complexity of meaning is indispensable for ESL learners who are under the influence of their mother tongue when learning new vocabulary or using them. This aspect of L2 teaching and learning is worth a careful study and pedagogic integration with the L2 educational process.

Third, it is crucial to raise the learners’ awareness of the communicative aspects of vocabulary uses. This is something that MT is still incapable of responding to. Until MT specialists provide possible answers or strategies to deal with this source of challenge, instructors are required to address this issue in their classroom. A very sensitive aspect of teaching L2 learners about the communicative uses of vocabulary is relevant to their awareness about culturally-embedded lexical units and how to use them to be able to communicate cross-culturally.

Fourth, online learning management systems can provide a useful tool for researching pedagogical and learning aspects. This implication is timely, considering the recent shift to online or blended learning in higher education institutions worldwide. Learning management systems are a rich source of data that equip academic researchers with the necessary empirical research tools. Examples of LMS’ sources of data include exams’ results and the relevant statistics on students’ responses.

About the Author:
Dr. Lamis Ismail Omar is Assistant Professor of Translation and ESL at Dhofar University, Oman. She holds a doctorate in Translation Studies from Durham University, the UK. She taught translation, conference interpreting, ESL and literary criticism at Damascus University, and she also has long professional experience in English/Arabic translation and conference interpreting. Her research interests include translation and conference interpreting, the conceptual theory of metaphor, Shakespeare’s metaphors as well as teaching English as a Second/Foreign Language.
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0246-5613

References


Photography as a Reflection of the Photographer’s Pain in *Time Stands Still*

Madhawy Abdulaziz Almeshaal

English and Literature Department, College of Arts
King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia
Email: malmeshaal@KSU.EDU.SA

Received: 11/17/2020  Accepted: 1/20/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

**Abstract**

The paper at hand attempts to interpret a female war journalist’s, the protagonist’s, Sarah Goodwin’s, decision to return to war zones after surviving a near-death experience in *Time Stands Still*, by Donald Margulies, (2010). The play starts with the protagonist’s strong assertion that she is endangering her life working in different war zones just to help the victims of wars by showing the world pictures of their suffering. After surviving a deadly road-bomb accident, Sarah Goodwin decided to settle down at home and never return to dangerous zones. However, after six months of recovery, this female war journalist decided to return to war zones. The present study finds it intriguing to speculate on Sarah Goodwin’s determination to return to such zones at such a time of her life. Through consulting some aspects of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and different aspects of Jacques Lacan’s words on photography, lack, and absence, the present study concludes that the protagonist’s desire to go back to war zones does not just help show the world pictures of wars victims’ suffering, but it helps the protagonist construct her own identity. Photography/war journalism becomes a medium through which Sarah Goodwin asserts her identity as a human being as she cannot fulfill her feminine role as a nurturer in a patriarchal society. The audience realizes that through photography, the protagonist projects her sense of lack and pain and attempts to attain some sense of wholeness.

**Keywords:** lack, identity, masculine, photography, post-traumatic stress, *Time Stands Still*, war journalism

**Cite as:** Almeshaal, M. A. (2021). Photography as a Reflection of the Photographer’s Pain in *Time Stands Still*. *Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies* 5 (1) 99-112. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.7
Sarah Goodwin makes an intriguing decision at the end of *Time Stands Still*, a play by Donald Margulies (2010). The audience cannot help but wonder about the real, conscious or unconscious, motivation that would cause a middle-aged woman to give up the comfort and safety of home and return to a deadly war zone in a foreign country. She returned to a place where she almost lost her life in a roadside bombing just to record life, a mission she could more easily do at home.

*Time Stands Still* revolves around a female war photojournalist, Sarah Goodwin, who survives a near-death experience in a dangerous Iraqi war zone. She comes home in a pathetic physical state, declaring she would never go back to such zones. After recovering physically, Sarah attempts to settle down socially. However, in six months, she decides to go back to a different war zone.

Throughout the play, Sarah asserts that her mission in life is to save lives by taking pictures of victims of “violence, famine, and genocide” (Margulies, 2010, p.25) and showing the world these pictures. She states, “I was helping them [the victims of violence] by gathering evidence. To show the world. If it were not for people like me ( . . .) The ones with cameras ( . . .) who would know? Who would care?” (Margulies, 2010, p.39). Sarah’s belief that photography is a strong and memorable form of expression relates to the idea that

the inclusion of photographs has the advantage of being more memorable for the audience . . . the simultaneous use of words and pictures leads to a greater depth of analysis and . . . to a longer-lasting stronger memory trace in comparison with shallower levels of analysis. (Eysenck & Flanagan, 2000, p. 46).

When Sarah visits a day-care center at a women’s prison, as part of her family friend Richard’s “Keep Sarah Home” initiative, she has many flashbacks of suffering mothers she saw in Iraq. She vividly re-envisions a horrible Mosul market bombing that nearly killed her and did kill her Iraqi friend, Tariq. She emotionally breaks down and questions the ethics of being a war journalist. Sarah states, “I live off the suffering of strangers. I built a career on the sorrows of people I do not know and will never see again ( . . .) I’m such a fraud.” (Margulies, 2010, p. 69). At this point, Sarah’s boyfriend, James, seizes the chance to convince her to settle down, to “make a home,” and to “stop running” (p. 70). Sarah hesitatingly accepts even though she profoundly feels that “marriage is not [their] thing” (p. 70). Sarah later admits she accepted James’ marriage proposal only because she was trying to act “grateful” toward him. However, within six months, Sarah realizes she is not what James wants. Sarah tells him, “I cannot be a playmate, have babies, and sit and watch movies with you, I cannot sit still, and I cannot be a Mandy” (p. 70). Sarah asserts that she has a humanitarian mission and even questions James’ decision not to return to war zones: “How can you live with yourself, knowing what goes on there?” (p. 70). At this point, James realizes Sarah needs “the chaos and the drama of the mess” (p. 78) and that she does not need him; therefore, he lets go of her. In the last scene of the play, before Sarah departs to a new war zone, Sarah and James hug fervently, but she gently separates herself from him. After he leaves, Sarah
shuts the door and takes a deep breath, then begins to pack her cameras. She becomes lost in thought as she polishes her camera’s lens, then attaches the lens to the camera. She looks out from her window and sees something in the distance; just as she is about to take a picture of it, the stage lights quickly fade to black, indicating the stillness of time (p. 86). Sarah can retake a deep breath again only when she is ready to leave home and to return to war zones such as Kabul and Kandahar.

Does leaving her secure home and going to a war zone shortly after surviving a horrible near-death experience give meaning to Sarah’s life and grant her a sense of identity? Though Sarah repeatedly asserts that recording images of life is a humanitarian mission, one cannot help wondering about what kinds of fulfillment this mission consciously or unconsciously brings Sarah and about what pains she might have to silence when taking pictures in war zones. It is striking that Margulies never directly reveals Sarah’s inner thoughts and conflicts in a soliloquy. The audience’s speculation and analysis of Sarah’s actions and reactions lead to a desire to decode Sarah’s decisions, particularly at the end of the play. To help interpret Sarah Goodwin’s puzzling decision during a certain time of her life at the end of the play, one has to consult some aspects of psychoanalytical theories and trauma studies in an attempt to comprehend it.

An immediate interpretation that most audiences and critics apply to decode Sarah’s persistent determination to leave home for foreign war zones shortly after surviving a near-death experience is by applying some trauma theories elements. Post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), known as “shell shock” that “occurs after experiencing severe trauma or a life-threatening event” (Smith Lawrence & J. Segal, 2018, p. 2), is often a common explanation for Sarah’s decision. Sarah’s inability to feel and stoic attitude is dominant throughout the play. She asserts that to do her job as a war journalist, she cannot be emotional, contrasting herself with Mandy, who cried while describing the separation of a baby elephant from his mother in a TV show. Sarah states,

I wish I could cry like that. But I can’t; I can’t let it get to me. If I let it get to me (. . .) How could I do my job? I couldn’t. I’d want to take away all the guns and rescue all the children. But I can’t. That’s why I’m there. (Pause). I’m there to take pictures. (Margulies, 2010, p. 40).

Thus, indifference to human suffering seems to be an effect that post-war trauma has had on Sarah. One can argue that Sarah is compartmentalizing her emotions (to borrow Roger Simpson’s word). According to Simpson and Boggs, a journalist who covers a war “tends to compartmentalize his emotions and isolate them from professional reactions” (Simpson & Boggs, 1990, p. 1). Through such compartmentalization of emotions, a war journalist is able to ensure the job is done, as that process blocks much of the trauma, suffering, and pain that could affect a journalist’s nervous system and emotional well-being. According to Herman (1997), “If the nervous system becomes overwhelmed, traumatic reactions occur. Each component of the ordinary response to danger,
having lost its unity, tends to persist in when actual danger is over” (p. 34). Such traumatic reactions, which symptoms of psychological distress, are consequences of experiencing a “life-threatening event.” According to Feinstein (2004), these reactions include fear, sadness, guilt, nightmares, agitation, helplessness, and horror. Feinstein asserted that war journalism is distinguished from other professions by its “repeated exposure to danger” and added that because war journalists are not “schooled in how to react to violence, as policemen or soldiers are, for example, they are more likely to be unable to bear the aftermath of that danger” (p.1). Thus, Sarah, like other war journalists, suffers from the symptoms of PTSD.

PTSD consists of three symptom clusters: re-experiencing, avoidance, and arousal, according to Feinstein, Re-experiencing refers to “unwanted intrusive recollections of the traumatic event that may occur during working hours as flashbacks or recurrent thoughts and during sleep as nightmares” (Feinstein, 2004, p. 2). Avoidance is “a reluctance to return to the scene of trauma that also may encompass a numbing of emotions or damping down of emotional responsiveness to people and event” (p. 2). Arousal refers to “the heightened responses of the body’s nervous system that may manifest as a startled response, an expectation of further violence even in situations deemed safe (e.g., after a return to civil society), problems falling asleep, irritability, and poor concentration” (p. 2).

Considering the symptoms of PTSD helps explain Sara’s behaviors and unusual decisions. For example, Sarah frequently undergoes a stage of re-experiencing. When Richard suggests that Sarah works at a day-care center at a women’s prison, James decides on her behalf with a sharp “No.” As a reaction to her husband’s attempt to control her, Sarah becomes very upset and accepts the offer immediately saying, “I don’t need to think about it. I want to do it” (Margulies, 2010, p.60). This is Sarah’s first job in six months she has spent recovering from her near-death experience in Iraq. Although this job involves a different type of violence than the one she experienced overseas, she is still devastated by a flashback triggered when an inmate asks why Sarah is taking her picture. This brings Sarah back to Mosul, as Sarah narrates:

Anyway, I’m shooting (. . .) sort of getting in the zone and this one woman (. . .) big [and] heavily tattooed with Hell’s Angels’ kind of skulls with fire coming out of the eye sockets, comes up to me, gets right in my face (. . .) and looks at me with such (. . .) contempt (. . .) (Brutish voice) “What you want to take my picture for? Huh?” And I was back in Mosul. (p, 68)

For the first time, Sarah vividly tells James what happened to her in Mosul on the day of the explosion: her story sounds as if the event just happened:

The light that day was gorgeous. I remember. (Pause) I was sitting in a café with the Reuters guys (. . .) And a car bomb went off, a block or two away, in the market. I just ran to it, took off. Without even thinking. The carnage was (. . .) ridiculous. Exploded produce, body parts, Eggplants. Women keening. They were digging in the rubble for their children. I
started shooting. And suddenly this woman burst out from the smoke covered in blood (. . .) her skin was raw and red and charred, and her hair was singed. She got so close I could smell it-and her clothes, her top had melted into her, and she was screaming at me. “Go way go way! No picture, no picture!” She started pushing my camera with her hand on the lens. (p, 69)

Sarah’s terrifying narration of her flashback allows the audience to witness the psychological suffering she experienced as a war journalist who had just survived a near-death experience. She feels scared, horrified, sad, guilty, and discontented with her work and herself. She is so familiar with violence that she records her pain in a very mechanical manner. This numbness is reflected in her strong sense of addiction to pain and in her familiarity with grotesque images of violence: “This woman burst out from the smoke (. . .) covered in blood (. . .) her skin was raw and red and charred, and her hair was singed. She got so close I could smell it . . .” (p, 69). Sarah obviously has been detached from her emotions after repressing them for so long to do her job. A strong indication of Sarah’s familiarization with grotesque images of violence is that she lists “body parts” along with “exploded produce” and “eggplants” while vividly visualizing mothers “digging in the rubble for their children” (p. 69). However, she soon breaks down, saying,

I feel so ashamed (. . .) They did not want me there! They didn’t want me taking pictures! They lost children in the mess! To them, it was a sacred place. But there I was, like a ghoul with a camera, shooting away. No wonder they wanted to kill me; I would’ve wanted to kill me, too (. . .) I live off the suffering of strangers. I built a career on the sorrow of people I do not know, and I will never see again (. . .) I am such a fraud. (p, 69)

As a victim of PTSD, Sarah struggles during her time at the women’s prison with unwanted and intrusive recollections of different traumatic events she experienced in Mosul. Sarah’s sense of guilt is so immense that she compares herself to a ghoul who “wanted to even kill” herself (p, 96).

Similarly, Sarah undergoes a stage of avoidance because she is reluctant to return to the scene of her trauma. Sarah allows James to convince her that they can be happily married and have a “comfortable life” away from violence and wars; that they can “make a home” (Margulies, 2010, p. 69). However, that desire is short-lived. Sarah uses this desire as temporary avoidance; she admits later that she married James as a way of paying him back for his support, as an expression of gratitude. This confirms her agreement was a temporary form of avoidance.

At one point in her life, Sarah asserts that marriage can make many issues such as medical management “a lot easier” (p, 42). She soon realizes she had engaged in avoidance throughout her six months marriage. She temporarily tries to avoid remembering her near-death experience, and she seems to suffer from both primary and secondary traumas. Obraztsova (2017) defined these two types of trauma as follows: “Besides a ‘primary’ trauma, when a reporter survives a disaster directly, there is a risk to be traumatized in a ‘secondary’ way, by intensive interactions with
suffering people and by taking on all the grief” (p.1). Thus, Sarah undergoes avoidance physically and psychologically because of her primary and secondary trauma. She seeks to drink “something harder than tea,” and desperately looks for a cigarette “now” even though she has not had “a cigarette in months” (Margulies, 2010, p.71). She gets married but only for six months, and she even briefly entertains the idea of motherhood. These are Sarah’s short-term attempts to deal with her primary and secondary trauma via avoidance.

Another way to decode Sarah’s decision to return to war zones at the end of the play is to view her choice as an unconscious attempt to overcome what is known as “survivor’s guilt,” related to PTSD. According to Danieli (1984), “A person may feel guilty without being consciously aware of it. Conscious and unconscious sense of guilt may act as an underlying factor in behavior, emotions and relationships” (p.25). Sarah experiences an unmistakable sense of guilt throughout the play. She feels guilty for cheating on James, and she tries to silence this feeling by marrying him for six months. Sarah feels guilty for Tariq’s death and her survival, and she tries to deal with her survivor’s guilt by insisting on having Richard be the one to explain Tariq’s role when writing their book. Although Sarah feels she has a great mission to show the truth to the world and thus to help the victims of violence, she often questions her professional and ethical principles: “I live off the suffering of strangers. I built a career on the sorrow of people I do not know and will never see again (. . .) I am such a fraud” (Margulies, 2012, p. 69). Sarah’s puzzling decision to go back to war zones could be an unconscious attempt to silence her unresolved sense of guilt so that she can heal and be able to live. Sarah’s decision to face her sense of survivor’s guilt by going back to her job can be seen as a step toward her emotional recovery. Sarah’s decision to go back into danger despite her terrifying, near-death experience can be seen as a reflection of her sense of responsibility, as a human being, to document the violent world. Because Sarah’s determination to return to war zones could be a symptom of PTSD, it heightens the audience’s sympathy and empathy. However, one cannot help but wonder about Sarah’s unconscious motivation for returning to danger. In other words, Sarah seems to be asserting herself as a human being by engaging in a universal humanitarian mission, but this could, in part, be an unconscious attempt to compensate for a deep sense of lack and loss.

To decode the source of Sarah’s feeling of lack, which she seems to unconsciously compensate through her role as a war journalist, one can consult the words of Lacan’s (1991a) on photographs as courtly love. According to Lacan (1991), a photograph is a “picture of lack, absence, something that is already lost” (p.48). Adopting this idea, Howie (2007) further argues:

If subjectivity is based on lack/desire, the photograph is the perfect object to operate on both: it always represents a lack, absence, but at the same time, it offers passion, images of wholeness, and illusion of closeness. A photograph is the (impossible) speculation of a perfect object petit a-both the hole in the subject, the lack or gap, and the object that can hide it. (p.13).
Hoewie added that photography represents “a lack of security, a sense of fear in the photographer and the picture, the photographed” (p.13).

Moreover, Lacan’s distinction between a *look* and a *gaze* helps in understanding Sarah’s gaze through her camera lens. Felluga (2019) asserted that the Lacanian gaze refers to the uncanny sense that the object of our eye’s look or glance is somehow looking back at us of its own will. This uncanny feeling of being gazed at by the object of our look affects us in the same way as castration anxiety (p.18).

When an object looks back at us, we are reminded of our lack of the fact that only a fragile border from the materiality of the real separates the symbolic order (Lacan, 1954). If Lacan’s sense of gaze confirms that an object is looking back at us, thus reminding us of our lack and our sense of nothingness, Sarah’s addiction to gazing through her camera’s lens and seeing the pleading gaze of the victims back can be viewed as own gaze reflected back at her own pain, nothingness, and lack. That is, by steadily and intently gazing at suffering faces of war victims through her camera lens, Sarah is, in fact, looking at her pain, which is reflected back through the gaze of the victims. Adopting Sartre’s (1955) notion regarding “the other as a reflection of oneself” (p.310), one cannot help but think about the significance of that gaze and of how time stands still when dealing with pain. When Sarah is gazing through her camera lens, she is not only capturing someone else’s pain but is also projecting her own pain outward. That excruciating sense of pain makes time feel as if it stands still, as Sontag (1990) explains that “photographs are memento mori. To take a photograph is to participate in another person’s mortality, vulnerability, mutuality. Precisely by slicing out this moment and freezing it, all photographs testify to time’s relentless melt” (p.15). Sarah’s projection of her pain and that of war victims through her photography helps “testify to time’s relentless melt” (p.15).

Moreover, Barthes’ (2010) reflection on war journalism and speculation that there is always an invisible meaning in any photograph is intriguing:

> This facility (no photograph without something or someone) involves photography in the vast disorder of objects in the world: Why choose (why photograph) this object, this moment, rather than some other? Photography is unclassifiable because there is no making this or that of its occurrences; it aspires, perhaps, to become as crude, as certain, as noble as a sign, which would afford it access to the dignity of a language: but from there to be a sign there must be a mark; deprived of a principle of marking, photographs are signs which don’t, which turn, as milk does. Whatever it grants to vision and whatever its manner, a photograph is always invisible: it is not that we see. (Barthes, 2010, p. 6)

Barthes added that photography “is subversive not when it frightens, repels, or even stigmatizes, but when it is pensive, when it thinks” (p.38). The idea that a photograph can be pensive, and that
it can intrigue when it forces the audience to reflect applies to Sarah’s photographs of violence and misery.

If photography is an indication of absence, insecurity, and fear, then Sarah’s lack is transparent in her war photography. Even though Sarah’s superior attitude is unmistakable throughout the play, her sense of lack is obvious. In other words, her life as an American journalist in developing countries contributed significantly to her superior attitudes towards other groups such as Iraqis, war victims’ mothers, and even Tariq. One can easily classify Sarah’s gaze through her camera lens as an “imperial gaze” that “infantilizes and trivializes what it falls upon, asserting its command and ordering function as it does so” (Kaplan, 1997, p.10). Sarah’s sense of superiority even extends to people in her home country, including James, Richard, and Mandy. Early in the play, as she suffers from physical and psychological weakness, Sarah rejects James’ support. During her first trip to the bathroom after getting home from the hospital, for example, she sharply rejects his assistance and harshly instructs him to “stop staring” because “it only makes it worse” (Margulies, 2010, p.14). Though it is part of a normal sense of human pride during such circumstances, Sarah’s harsh remarks heighten the sense that she has a feeling of superiority. She describes Mandy, a young party planner, as “embryonic” and “light-weight,” and she repeatedly asserts that she “can never be a Mandy” (p.35). Nevertheless, Sarah’s sense of emptiness and absence is unmistakable.

Sarah’s difficult childhood, youth, and later life indicate that she never felt she could cling to a family or belong to one of her own. This might help explain what she is lacking and why she consciously or unconsciously pursues such a dangerous career. For instance, she remembers her difficult childhood as a war: “War was at my parents’ house all over again; only on a different scale” (p.33). Her mother has been absent for most of Sarah’s life, and she does not have siblings. One of the most important relationships to a woman is the mother-daughter relationship. According to Walker (1998), such a relationship is very complex and has contradictory influences on the daughter’s sense of identity as an adult: “Like the maternal itself, the mother-daughter relation is an experience of contradiction: of love and hate, of mutuality and estrangement, of anger and desire, of unity and separation” (p.162). A troubled mother-daughter relationship creates what Freud called melanochlia, through which a daughter experiences an ambivalent sense of hate and love towards her absent or lost mother (Walker, 1998). Though Sarah never mentions her mother in the play, her sense of melancholia is unmistakable. Like any daughter, Sarah would have wanted to see her mother after returning home from the hospital or when getting married. In terms of what Sarah might be lacking in a Lacanian sense, it is fair to wonder about her mother’s absence.

Moreover, Sarah has a troubled relationship with her father, who never helped with her paperwork when she was hospitalized overseas. He also never approved of her marriage to James simply because he saw her marriage as a way of “begging for gifts” (Margulies, 2010, p. 54). He added that there was something “unseemly about a couple who have been living in sin for nine years throwing themselves a wedding” (p.54). Sarah eventually wishes she had not invited him to
her wedding at all. Thus, Sarah’s lack of familial security helps establish her unstable sense of identity and contributes to her inability to recover from PTSD.

The fact that Sarah never fully considers the possibility of being a mother can be interpreted as a result of her lack of familial stability throughout her life. James tries to convince her to have a child of their own, yet, she dismisses the idea very quickly, telling James, “Do you see me pushing a stroller and going to play dates? Honestly, Jamie, do you?” (p.76). She also tells Mandy that she is too old to have a baby and describes having a child at that late stage as “the most ridiculous, irresponsible thing” because it means “depriving a kid of a parent” (p.77). Arguably, Sarah feels too protective of her potential child because of her traumatic experiences. When she describes having a “head full of shrapnel,” and says that she “banged up [her] leg pretty good” and was “Medevac’d to Germany” and “kept in a coma till the swelling went down” (p. 55), it is clear that her near-death experience shook her to the core. She thus has to reconstruct her identity and her life in a certain way, which does not involve being a mother. On a different occasion, Sarah interestingly regards her cameras and photographs as her offspring, which can be an example of a protective mother-child relationship. For example, the minute Sarah arrives home from her painful trip, she is momentarily alarmed and asks, “Where are my cameras?” as if she were a mother checking on her children. Then, after Mandy tells Sarah that her “pictures are beautiful. . . I do not mean. . . You know . . .” Sarah replies, “You can call them beautiful. . . I think they are beautiful. But then I’m their mother” (p. 33). In this context, Sarah’s conscious rejection of motherhood is intriguing. Of course, life as a war journalist does make it challenging to be a mother, which is understandable.

Another way of speculating on Sarah’s unwillingness to be a mother has to do with the absence of her mother, which may have made it hard for Sarah to be a mother herself. This relates to Rebecca West’s concept that motherhood, for most women, is an attempt to remain immortal. Although Mandy seeks immortality in having children and being a mother, Sarah seeks immortality in art and photography. West writes, “Motherhood is neither a duty nor a privilege, but simply the way that humanity can satisfy the desire for physical immortality and triumph over the fear of death” (cited in Seldes, 1985, p. V). Unlike most women, Sarah silences her fear of death and fulfills her desire for immortality through her photography.

Sarah’s childlessness leads to a reflection on Lacan’s idea of absence. That is, Sarah’s lack of a nurturing mother, a stable home, and a nurturing family as a child has made it hard for her to be a part of those things as an adult. This feeling creates a sense of emptiness and lack for women in patriarchal societies. According to Klepfisz, (2001), patriarchal societies emphasize the social myth that a woman’s sense of identity stems from her role as a wife and a mother. This explains the feeling of pain and horror experienced by some childless women: It is a myth perpetually reinforced by the assumption that only family and children provide us with a purpose and place, bestow upon us honor, respect, love and comfort. We are taught very early that blood relations, and only blood relations, and can be perpetual,
fluctuating source of affection, can be the foolproof guarantee that we will not be forgotten. This myth, and many others surrounding the traditional family, often make it both frightening and painful for women to think of themselves as remaining childless. (Klepfisz, 200, p. 21)

Throughout the play, Sarah never comes to terms with her identity as a daughter, wife, or mother. Only through her journalism in war zones in her humanitarian mission can Sarah assert herself as a human being.

Instead of limiting her identity to that of a caretaker, Sarah attempts to reconstruct her identity through war journalism. By looking through a camera lens, her “little rectangle,” (Margulies, 2010, p.33) to capture pain and violence, Sarah reflects her internal pain. One cannot help but think about what Barthes (2010) called “the type of consciousness of the photograph” (p. 44) when considering Sarah’s war journalism:

The type of consciousness the photograph involves is indeed truly unprecedented, since it establishes not a consciousness of the being there of the thing (which any copy could provoke) but an awareness of its having-been-there. What we have is a new space-time category: spatial immediacy and temporal anteriority, the photograph, being an allegorical conjunction between the here-now and the there-then. It is thus at the level of this denoted message or message without code that the real unreality of the photograph can be fully understood: its unreality of the photograph can be fully understood; its unreality is that one of the here-now, for the photograph is never experienced as an illusion, is in no way a presence (claims as to the magical character of the photographic image must be deflated); and its reality that of having-been-there, for in every photograph there is the always stupefying evidence of this I show how it was, giving us, by a precious miracle, a reality from which we sheltered. (p. 44)

Sarah’s unconscious desire to capture varied pictures of pain is intriguing and perhaps reflects a deep sense of fear. Mulvey (1999) argued, “The grotesque transforms the world from what we ‘know’ it to be what we fear it might be” (p.5). Sarah might be unconscious of such an attempt, but she is aware of her “addiction to the misery of life” (Margulies,2010, p. 38). Sarah’s sense of emptiness is very clear when she asks James about the boredom of a daily home routine: “What happens tomorrow? What happens the day after that? (. . .) And what happens after that?” (Margulies 2010, p.11). Sarah is addicted to a grotesquely violent routine because that routine makes her feel excited and significant. This apparent addiction to the physical and psychological scars and deformities of others could be interpreted as her gaze and can reflect her psychological fractures and loneliness. Sarah’s desires seem to be based on a misplaced desire for concrete images of pain; she describes her addictive need to capture pictures of pain as automatic: “I do not even think about it. When I look through that little rectangle (. . .) Time stops. It just (…) All the noise around me (. . .) Everything cuts out. And all I see (. . .) is the picture” (Margulies, 2010, p.
According to Freud, most of the pain that people experience is of the “perceptual order,” which refers to “perception either of the urge of unsatisfied instincts or something in the external world which may be painful in itself or may arouse painful anticipations in the psychic apparatus and is recognized by it as ‘danger’” (Freud, 1961, p. 90). In addition to being a victim of PTSD, Sarah experiences a source of pain that can be interpreted as a deep urge to fulfill her unsatisfied instincts to be a daughter, wife, and mother. Interestingly, Sarah attempts to numb her sense of these unsatisfied instincts by taking pleasure in pain by involving herself in a pain-related environment.

To elaborate on the ways in which Sarah’s unsatisfied instincts trigger her need to focus her gaze on violence and pain, one can draw on Lacan’s (1954) attempt to differentiate the conscious self from Freud’s concept of the ego. Lacan compares the conscious self to a camera that captures an image of a mountain reflected in a lake, asserting that any image that is “reflected onto a surface behaves like a mirror” (p. 49). Lacan further stated the following:

Consciousness occurs each time, and it occurs in the most unexpected and disparate places. There’s a surface such as that it can produce what is called an image [or] the effect of energy starting from a given point of the real. Think of images as being like light, since what most clearly evokes an image in our mind-are reflected at some point on a surface [and] come to strike the corresponding same point in space. The surface of a lake might just as well be replaced by the area striata of the occipital lobe, for the area striata which its fibrillary layers is exactly like a mirror (. . .) All sorts of things in the world behave like mirrors (p.49)

If “all sorts of things in the world behave like mirrors” (Lacan, 1954, p. 49), Sarah’s camera lens symbolically reflects her senses of personal loss and pain, which can be triggered by her unsatisfied instincts and PTSD.

To Sarah, photography is more than a humanitarian mission; it is a means by which she can attempt to reconstruct her sense of self. It is difficult for Sarah to realize her feminine role as a daughter, mother, and wife fully. Whether consciously or unconsciously, she adopts a masculine identity and a masculine quest. In her career as a stoic and persistent war journalist, she takes pictures of suffering mothers who are “digging in the rubble for their children” and putting their blood stained hands on her camera lens while screaming at her to “go way” (Margulies, 2010, p. 69). This is close to the stereotypical image of a masculine figure who cannot identify with maternal instincts. Though Sarah momentarily feels guilty after that event, she continues to record violence and does not directly seek to save lives. In a conversation with Mandy about the role a photographer plays, Sarah sounds convinced that her role as a war journalist is to “record life. Not change it” “to capture truth” not “stage it” (p. 40). Unlike Sarah, James left the war zones and is not planning to return because, in addition to his PTSD, he cannot get over his memories: “Those mothers, those girls, blew up right there, right in front of me! . . . I freaked out! I had to get the
hell out of there” (p. 47). Sarah, on the other hand, insists on going back despite her PTSD and memories of explosions.

In addition, the desire to be in control and in charge is commonly considered a stereotypically masculine characteristic, and this element obviously heightens Sarah’s attempt to assert her masculine identity through a masculine quest. Women in photography and films, according to Mulvey (1999), have mainly been seen as objects because of their “lack of diversity in directions” (p.59). After all, most of the time, men have been in control of the camera, so the audience tends to experience films “from a heterosexual male perspective” (p. 59). Mulvey further argues that a woman has typically been “the bearer of meaning and not the maker of meaning” (p. 66). This suggests that in photography and filmmaking, women have not been able to serve in roles that grant them control of a scene. Rather, they have mostly been seen generally as objects with those in control viewing them from a very limited perspective. Mulvey added that this male perceptive is not reversed even when men can be viewed, which reinforces the notion that “men do the looking and women are looked at” (p.67). When Sarah is acting as a photographer, she interestingly adopts a male role. Yet when she looks through her camera lens, she captures women’s suffering and pain. Her camera lens both captures this pain and mirrors it. Adopting the masculine role of war journalist gives Sarah an unmistakable sense of superiority toward the female victims whom she photographs and minimizes her own femininity so subtly that her action hardly perceived by the audience.

Photography seems to offer Sarah what Lacan (1954) described as “images of wholeness, which offer possession, and an illusion of closeness” (p.48). As a war journalist in a violent, poor country, Sarah’s mission is to record life; even though she never saves lives, her mission creates an illusion of being a heroine who reports key information to the world: “If it was not for people like me (. . .) The one with the cameras (. . .) who would know? Who would care?” (p. 39). Though the native women who are victims of the war reject Sarah and constantly tell her to “go way,” (p. 69), she stays. She even runs toward a car bomb “without even thinking” (Margulies, 2010, p. 39) because she feels responsible for capturing the bombing fully in images. Sarah’s strong need to be a heroine is reflected in her frustration at James’ justification for not wanting to return to warzones. She even questions his integrity as a war journalist: “How can you live with yourself knowing what goes on there?” (p. 77).

Sarah’s decision to return to war zones is partly due to her desire to fulfill a deep sense of superiority because she feels she is a heroine who should be in control of others. Even though she can control some aspects of her life at home such as marryng and breaking up with James within six months or controlling Richard’s narrative, Sarah has more control over situations and other people in her job as a war journalist, which enables her to control what is seen by the world and to communicate certain political messages. Sarah’s masculinity partially seems to fill a deep void within her. Sarah’s life is a masculine quest. Like many men, Sarah never sees herself as “sitting on a sofa watching TV,” and she can never imagine herself “pushing a stroller”; she looks for
cigarettes and “hard drinks” when upset despite claiming, “I’m not smoking! When was the last time you saw me with a cigarette? I haven’t had one in six months” (p. 22). Unlike most women, she never questions Richard’s love for another woman, instead she says “Oh! Wow! Good for you” (p. 84). Like Odysseus, Sarah never dwells on her physical scars; rather she views them as markers of her long missionary voyage of showing the truth to the world. When the play opens, Sarah is “on crutches, [with] one leg in a soft cast, an arm in a sling, and one side of her face poked with shrapnel” (p. 6). Upon noticing the injured side of Sarah’s face, Mandy suggests that Sarah have laser surgery. But Sarah promptly asserts she will not, even though she was earlier murmuring to herself after seeing her face in the bathroom mirror: “I gotta do something about this face” (p. 15). Sarah does not appreciate physical assistance when she is in pain. When James comes to Sarah’s aid as she begins “the arduous process of getting up to go to the bathroom,” she rejects his assistance with a very sharp “Stop” (p.5). Thus, Sarah’s adoption of various stereotypical male characteristics is part of her attempt to assert her identity as a human; she does this because she feels that she cannot fulfill a feminine role in a patriarchal society.

To conclude, Sarah’s decision to return to war zones even after surviving a near-death experience can be interpreted as her attempt to recover from a traumatic experience by reconstructing her identity as a war journalist. She unconsciously realizes her lack and her pain, which is reflected in the victims’ gazes into her camera lens. She is a lonely and deprived middle-aged woman who does not feel as though she belongs anywhere or with anyone. Her fractured self as a woman, daughter, wife, or mother seems to be unified in a humanistic wholeness only when she captures images of pain and suffering. By adopting a masculine quest through a masculine means (i.e., war journalism), Sarah seems to gain a sense of wholeness and an illusion of closeness not just in her job as a war journalist but as a human being who struggles to deal with her pain to compensate for her lack.

About the Author:
Madhawy AZ Almeshaal is an Assistant Prof. of English Literature at the English and Literature Department, College of Arts, King Saud University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia. Dr. Almeshaal’s area of research interest is British and American Drama, Modern & Contemporary British drama, and theater Studies. I have published two articles in two different journals.
ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0302-0667

References


Herman, L. (1997) *Trauma and recovery: The aftermath of violence from domestic abuse to political terror*. Basic Books.


Translation of Idioms: How They are Reflected in Movie Subtitling

Yana Shanti Manipuspika
Study Program of English, Faculty of Cultural Studies
Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia
Correspondent Author: yana.manipuspika@gmail.com

Damai Reska Julia Winzami
Study Program of English, Faculty of Cultural Studies
Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia

Received: 12/2/2020 Accepted: 1/15/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Idiomatic expressions are expressions with a figurative meaning different from their literal meaning, and therefore, they cannot be understood literally. This study aims to scrutinize some aspects of the translation of idiomatic expressions in a mystery movie entitled ‘Murder on the Orient Express’. Seventy-seven idiomatic expressions were found in the movie. The idioms can be categorized as follows: keywords with idiomatic uses (16) idioms with nouns and adjectives (2), idiomatic pairs (1), idioms with prepositions (7), phrasal verbs idioms (26), verbal idioms (5), idioms from special subjects (1), idioms with key words from special categories (16), and idioms with comparison (3). Phrasal verbs idiom was the most frequently occurred because idioms are mostly organized by verb comprising the combination of verb and preposition or verb and adverb. Further, the rendering of the idioms from English as the Source Language (SL) into Indonesian as the Target Language (TL) employed some strategies; translation by paraphrase was the highly frequent translation strategy. The strategy of using an idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form was also located in the high-frequency position of the continuum. Furthermore, using an idiom of similar form and meaning and translation by omission were the translation strategies of low frequency. Translation by paraphrase was frequently used because the translator wanted to convey the meaning as clearly as possible while also considering the cultural difference between SL and TL. To sum up, the idiomatic expression dominantly used in the movie was phrasal verbs (34%), while the strategy that was mostly applied in translating them was translation by paraphrase (56%).

Keywords: figurative meaning, idioms, idiomatic translation, literal meaning, translation strategies

Cite as: Manipuspika, Y. S., & Winzami, D.R.J. (2021). Translation of Idioms: How They are Reflected in Movie Subtitling. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 113-125. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.8
Introduction

Idioms can be found in daily life, from informal conversation to formal written text. They are an inalienable part of each language found in large numbers in most languages. However, idioms have meanings that sometimes depart from the literal meaning. Therefore, it is important to understand what is an idiom, how idioms carry meaning, and what translators do to maintain that meaning in another language. An idiom, also referred to as an idiomatic expression, is a set of words or phrases that has a figurative meaning conventionally understood by native speakers. Although the idiomatic expression is a universal feature of language, different languages may use literally different idiomatic expressions with similar referential meanings.

To know and understand the meaning of idioms, observing the context when the idiom is uttered is crucial. Additionally, some idioms have more than one meaning, thus the context in certain idiom is used to determine the intended meaning of that idiom. Translating idioms is not an easy task. This originates in the fact that each language has got some culture-specific items that are completely different from the corresponding items in another language. It is because idioms are a group of words that mean something different than the individual words it contains. According to Baker (2018), idioms are a frozen pattern of language which allows little or no variation in form and often carry meanings that cannot be deduced from their individual components. Therefore, idioms cannot be translated word-for-word, it has to be translated as a whole.

The complexities of idiomatic expressions make the rendering of the idiomaticity of expressions from a source into a target language so sophisticated and problematic at the same time. As stated by Shojaei (2012), the process of translating idioms from one language into another is a fine work which obliges a translator to have a good knowledge of both languages and cultures being shared or transferred as well as being able to identify and cope with the contingent problems in the process of finding an efficient equivalent for the inter-lingual idiomatic pairs. Taking these into consideration, this study aims at investigating the idioms and the strategies of translating the idioms in Murder on the Orient Express movie, a 2017 movie directed by Kenneth Branagh based on the 1934 novel of the same title and written by British writer, Agatha Christie. The novel was one of the most popular Agatha Christie’s novels and had many adaptations in various forms such as TV series and films. The movie had set in the train to London in 1934. The movie selection was based on the setting, which is culturally different from TL (Indonesian) that would affect the translation. Also, the movie contains many unfamiliar idioms for viewers in the target language.

There are two research problems formulated in this study: 1) What are the types of idioms used in Murder on the Orient Express movie?; 2) What are the translation strategies used in translating the idiomatic expressions in the movie?
Literature Review
Translation is the process of reproducing the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of
the source language message, first in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style (Nida &
Taber, 1982). This could be problematic when dealing with idioms. An idiom is a phrase or a fixed
expression that has a figurative, or sometimes literal, meaning. According to Jabbari (2016), an
idiom’s figurative meaning is different from the literal meaning. They frequently occur in all
languages. Idioms fall into the category of formulaic language.

There are various classifications of idioms proposed by some experts. This paper explores
the idioms referring to Seidl & McMordie’s (1988) classification of idioms, which falls into 9
(nine) categories: 1) Key words with idiomatic uses, 2) Idioms with Nouns and Adjectives, 3)
Idiomatic Pairs, 4) Idioms with Prepositions, 5) Phrasal Verbs Idiom, 6) Verbal Idioms, 7) Idioms
from Special Subjects, 8) Idioms with Key Words from Special Categories, and 9) Idioms with
Comparisons.

Difficulties in Translating Idioms
Idiomatic translation requires far more than the replacement of lexical and grammatical items
between languages, and it may involve discarding the basic linguistic elements of the SL text.
Baker (2018) classifies problems involved in translating idioms into four sub-categories.

First, an idiom may have no equivalence in the target language. Some idioms are bound to
culture that do not exist in other places with different languages. For example, the idiom ‘feather
in (one’s) cap’. This idiom means an exceptional achievement. This idiom is derived from the
culture of some western countries indicating that placing a feather in one’s cap is a sign of a
significant achievement by the wearer. There is no equivalent for this idiom in Indonesian
language. Even predicting the meaning of the idiom is unlikely for Indonesian because the act of
putting a feather in a hat cannot be found anywhere in Indonesian culture.

Second, an idiom may have a similar counterpart in the target language, but its context of
use may be different. In this case, the target language (TL) equivalence is available but is used in
different situation and therefore, makes the idiom translation not applicable. The expressions in
source and target language possibly have different connotations or may not be pragmatically
transferable.

Third, an idiom may be used in the source text in both its literal and idiomatic senses at the
same time. Unless the target language idiom corresponds to the source language idiom in form and
meaning, the idiom cannot be successfully rendered in target language. Finally, the convention of
using idioms in written discourse, the contexts in which they can be used, and their frequency of
use may be different in the source and target languages.
To sum up, the main problems found in translating idioms and fixed expressions are the ability to recognize and interpret idioms correctly, and the difficulties involved in rendering the aspects of meaning that idioms or fixed expressions convey into the target language.

**Strategies for Translating Idiomatic Expressions**

Baker (2018) proposes four strategies for translating an idiom. The explanation is provided as the following.

1. **Using an Idiom of Similar Form and Meaning**

Baker (2018) states this strategy is composed by using an idiom in the target language that has the same meaning as the source language idiom. Also, it must consist of lexical items that is equivalent. This kind of match can only occasionally be achieved.

2. **Using an Idiom of Similar Meaning but Dissimilar Form**

It is often possible to find an idiom or fixed expression in the target language which has a meaning similar to that of the source idiom or expression, but which consist of different lexical items (Baker, 2018). In this case, the lexical items of idioms are not preserved; it is translated as a semantic equivalent.

3. **Translation by Paraphrase**

This translation strategy is the common way of translating idioms when a translator cannot find a match in the target language or when it seems inappropriate to use idiomatic language in the target language because of differences in stylistic preferences of the source and target language.

4. **Translation by Omission**

Baker (2018) mentions as with single words, an idiom may sometimes be omitted altogether in the target text. This may be because it has no close match in the target language, its meaning cannot be easily paraphrased, or for a stylistic reason.

**Previous Studies in the Context of English – Indonesian Language Pairs**

In the English – Indonesian language pairs, some studies have previously been conducted. Noorsavitri (2018) focused on the types of idioms and the translation strategies in translating the idioms in a romantic novel. She used theory from McCarthy and O’Dell (2010) to classify the types of idioms in the novel. Her findings showed 99 data of idiomatic expressions and the novel tends to use compound idioms. Further, translation by paraphrase is the most frequently used in translating the idioms in the novel.

Wicaksono & Wahyuni (2018) conducted an analysis of idioms in Indonesian folklores. Their study focused only on the translation strategies in translating idiom from Indonesia into English. The findings suggested that idiomatic expression translation strategy by paraphrasing is the most dominant strategy used by the translator in translating the idiomatic expression found in five Indonesian folklores.
Another study investigated Indonesia–English translation of idiomatic expressions, focusing on the idioms, in one of Indonesian best seller fiction story, *Bumi Manusia* which was translated into English as *This Earth of Mankind*. This study by Floranti & Mubarok (2020) identified the types of the translation strategies to reproduce the idioms from SL in TL and the accuracy level of their latest meanings in TL. Their results showed that most of the idioms achieved equivalent meanings, but decreased meanings were unavoidable. Thus, it can be seen that the translator attempted to recreate the similar equivalence meaning of the idioms from SL through paraphrasing strategy instead of omitting the idioms in TL. Most of the translated idioms could be reproduced similarly with the original idioms.

Those previous researchers’ work recognized the analysis of idiomatic expressions in literary work. However, the practical application in subtitling has not yet been widely clarified. The purpose of this paper is to reveal the use of idioms in movie subtitle along with the strategies of translating them.

**Method**
This present study utilized Baker’s and Seidl & McMordie theories as its frameworks. With respect to the analysis of the source text and the target text utterances in terms of the idiomatic expressions, this study was rooted in the framework of qualitative research. In order to quantify the qualitative data gathered, and to present them in a more meaningful way, frequency and percentage were used. With respect to the first research question, types of idioms were referred to Seidl & McMordie’s (1988). Meanwhile, for the second research question, using Baker’s (2018) theory, the subtitles of the movie were analyzed, and the types of idiomatic expression were determined. After determining the types and translation strategies, a conclusion was made.

**Findings and Discussion**
In the following data, SL stands for Source Language (in this case, English), and TL stands for Target Language (in this case, Indonesian).

**Types of Idioms**
1. **Keywords with Idiomatic Uses**
   This type of idiom deals with a selection single words which are known to present difficult because of their particular idiomatic meanings. Also, this type of idiom uses adjective, nouns, and miscellaneous words as the main subject.

   **SL:** I speak my mind now.
   **TL:** Aku bebas berpendapat.
   The idiom ‘speak my mind’ is an expression when someone say openly what they think or feel. This expression uses the word ‘mind’ as the idiomatic uses. ‘Mind’ is the main subject and it is classified in the subtype of particular words with special idiomatic uses; noun with special idiomatic uses.
SL: How dare you accuse me!
TL: Beraninya kau menuduhku!

The idiom ‘how dare you’ uses the word ‘how’ as the idiomatic element. ‘How’ is the main subject and it is classified in the subtype of particular words with special idiomatic uses; Miscellaneous words with special idiomatic uses. ‘How dare you’ is an idiomatic expression that show annoyance to others’ rudeness.

2. Idioms with Nouns and Adjectives

SL: But my beginner's luck has panned out.
TL: Tapi aku punya keberuntungan pemula.

In this excerpt, the idiom ‘beginner’s luck’ is a compound noun. The meaning of ‘beginner’s luck is unexpected success in someone’s first attempt at doing something. This expression is used by Mr. Ratchett when telling his experience as a businessman, and he just started as an art dealer and he was successful even though he was just a beginner in this field.

3. Idiomatic Pairs

SL: Consigned to wine and dine handsome officials for all eternity.
TL: Mengajak makan dan minum para pejabat untuk selamanya.

The idiom ‘wine and dine’ is formed by pairing two nouns ‘wine’ and ‘dine’. ‘Wine and dine someone’ is an expression that is used when somebody is trying to entertain someone by offering them drinks or a meal (Siefring, 2004). This expression was used by Mr. Bouc when he told Mr. Poirot that he was going to have a meal with the officials in the Orient Express train.

4. Idioms with Prepositions

SL: …and monster them till they have the world down cold.
TL: …lalu memaksa mereka menghafal dunia.

‘down cold’ begins with the preposition ‘down’ as the main part of the idiom. “Down cold’ means someone learned, mastered, or understood perfectly on something (Farlex Dictionary of Idioms, 2015). In one of the scenes, this expression is used by Ms. Debenham when she was explaining about her job as a governess and she would start teaching geography first, then she would teach her students until they understand it completely and perfectly.

Another example of this type of idiom is:

SL: No, after you.
TL: Tidak, silakan.

In this excerpt, ‘after you’ begins with a preposition ‘after’ as the main part of the idiom. The idiom ‘after you’ means someone politely urges another person to do something first (Farlex Dictionary of Idioms, 2015). This expression, in the movie, was used by Mr. Ratchett when he politely gave Mr. Poirot a way to his cabin.
5. Phrasal Verbs Idioms

In this type, the idiom is formed when it is organized by a verb. A verb can be considered as a phrasal verb if it consists of two or more words. One of these words must be a verb, while the other can be an adverb, a preposition, or both an adverb and a preposition. Sometimes, the combination of verb + preposition of particle results in a separated unit of meaning, which may be highly idiomatic.

SL: And when it is not, the imperfection stands out…”
TL: Ketika tidak semestinya, kecacatannya akan menonjol…”
The idiom ‘stands out’ consists of a verb ‘stand’ and a preposition ‘out’; therefore, the idiom can be classified as Phrasal Verbs Idioms. According to Seidl and McMordie (1988, p.146), the idiom ‘stand out’ means be very noticeable or conspicuous.

SL: You know, with your books and your capers, you are missing out on romance.
TL: Dengan bukumu dan makananmu, kau melewattakan asmara.
The phrase ‘missing out’ can be classified as Phrasal Verbs Idioms, meaning someone has not experienced something or not profit from something.

6. Verbal Idioms

There are two combinations to form a verbal idiom. The combinations are verb with a noun and verb with a prepositional phrase.

SL: I don’t quite see the point of your question.
TL: Aku tak mengerti arah pertanyaaamu.
The phrase ‘see the point of something’ can be classified into Verbal Idioms in Verb + Noun. The idiom means to understand or appreciate the meaning, reason, or importance of something (Farlex Dictionary of Idioms, 2015).

SL: He can see right through us.
TL: Dia bisa membaca pikiran kita.
The idiom ‘see right through us’ consists of a verb ‘see’ and a preposition phrase ‘through us’ therefore, the idiom can be classified as Verbal Idioms in Verb + Preposition Phrase. ‘See right through us’ or ‘see through someone’ means to understand or detect the true nature of someone (Spears, 2005).

7. Idioms from Special Subjects

SL: He is on holiday.
TL: Dia sedang berlibur.
In this excerpt, the idiom ‘on holiday’ can be classified into Idioms with Special Subjects in Travel subject because the idiom is related to travel. According to Farlex Dictionary of Idioms (2015), ‘on holiday’ means spending time away from work or school, especially to travel some place for
recreation. The idiom was used by Mr. Poirot when someone looked for him for another case to handle it, but Mr. Poirot said that he was on holiday which means he did not want to take any cases for a while.

8. Idioms with Key Words from Special Categories

SL: You’re an odd bird there.
TL: Kau orang yang aneh.
The idiom ‘an odd bird’ can be classified as Idioms with Key Words from Special Categories in the Animal category since the word ‘bird’ is related to the category. ‘An odd bird’ means an eccentric person whose behavior or way of life is regarded as strange (Seidl & McMordie, 1988, p.197).

SL: I would like to hire you to watch my back...
TL: Aku ingin menyewamu untuk menjagaku...
In this excerpt, the word ‘back’ is related to the part of the body category, so the idiom can be classified as Idioms with Key Words from Special Categories. The idiom ‘watch someone (or your) back’ means protect someone else (or yourself) against danger from an unexpected quarter (Siefring, 2004). The idiom was used by Mr. Ratchett when he wanted to hire Mr. Poirot to protect him from someone who wants to kill him.

9. Idioms with Comparison

SL: Mrs. Hubbard wants to speak to you. I held her as best as I could.
‘As best as I could’ has a pattern ‘as + Adjective + as + Noun’, so this idiom can be categorized as comparison with ‘as…as’. According to Farlex Dictionary of Idioms (2015), the idiom ‘as best as I could’ means to the best of someone's abilities. In the movie, this expression was used by one of the train conductors, Michel, when he told Mr. Poirot that Mrs. Hubbard insist wanted speak with him, but Michel could not hold Mrs. Hubbard anymore to not speak with Mr. Poirot.

With respect to the first research question, the findings of the study indicated that among Seidl & McMordie’s (1988) types of idioms, all involved in this movie subtitle. Table 1 shows the frequencies and percentages of the categories of idioms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Types of Idioms</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Keywords with Idiomatic Uses</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Idioms with Nouns and Adjectives</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Idiomatic pairs</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Frequency and percentage of each type of idiom
Translation Strategies of Idiomatic Expressions

1. Using an Idiom of Similar Form and Meaning
   This translation strategy involves using an idiom in the TL that has the same meaning as the SL idiom. Also, the idiom in TL must consist of lexical items that is equivalent to the idiom in SL.

   SL: How dare you accuse me!
   TL: Beraninya kau menuduhku!
   In this excerpt, the idiom ‘how dare you’ is an idiomatic expression that shows annoyance to others’ rudeness. The idiomatic expression ‘beraninya kau’ is also often used to express annoyance to others’ rudeness in the target language. Therefore, the translation of ‘how dare you to accuse me!’ into ‘beraninya kau menduhku!’ has both equivalent meaning and lexical item with the SL.

2. Using an Idiom of Similar Meaning but Dissimilar Form
   This strategy is translating idiom by using an idiom with similar meaning but dissimilar form in the target language. In this case, the lexical items of an idioms are not preserved, therefore it is translated as a semantic equivalent.

   SL: I’ve got three religions bent on riot.
   TL: Ada tiga agama siap buat kericuhan.
   According to Spears (2005), ‘bent on riot’ or ‘bent on doing something’ means determined to do something. Therefore, the translator translated the idiom as ‘siap buat kericuhan’ which has an equivalent meaning with the idiom ‘bent on riot’, but the translation has different lexical item from those in the source language.

3. Translation by Paraphrase
   Paraphrasing idioms is the best way to deliver the message contained in the SL idiom using different words and grammatical structures in the TL.

   SL: I want to look at paintings and have too much time on my hands.
TL: Aku ingin melihat-lihat lukisan dan punya banyak waktu luang.
The idiom ‘have too much time on someone’s hand’ means to have extra time or have time to spare. The translator translated the idiom ‘have too much time on my hands’ into ‘punya banyak waktu luang’. There is no match found in TL, so different words and grammatical structure from the SL idiom is used.

4. Translation by Omission

SL: I may not be good for much, but I sure as hell can get you a bed on my train...
TL: Aku hanya orang biasa, tapi aku bisa carikan kamar di keretaku...
In this translation, the translator omitted the idiom ‘sure as hell’ that is used to emphasize something. In this case, the idiom is used by Mr. Bouc that he was really sure that he could find room for Mr. Poirot. This expression has no equivalent lexical items and becomes redundant in the target language; therefore, the translator omitted the idioms for stylistic purpose.

With regard to the second research problem, the findings of the study indicated that from Baker’s (2018) 4 translation strategies, translating by paraphrase was more beneficial for translating idiomatic expressions. Table 2 shows the frequencies and percentages of the translation strategies involved in the translation of idiomatic expressions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Strategies of Translating Idioms</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Using an Idiom of Similar Form and Meaning</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Using an Idiom of Similar Meaning but Dissimilar Form</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Translation by Paraphrase</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Translation by Omission</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>77</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Discussion**

With reference to the results of analysis, phrasal verbs idioms, idioms with key words from special categories, and keywords with idiomatic uses are among the highly frequent idiom categories used in this particular movie. This, in turn, affects the strategies of translating the idioms; Translation by Paraphrase was the very highly frequent translation strategy, taking more than 50% occurrences. On the other hand, Using an Idiom of Similar Meaning but Dissimilar Form is located in the high-frequency position of the continuum. Furthermore, Using an Idiom of Similar Form and Meaning and Translation by Omission are the translation strategies of low frequency.
It was revealed that all types of the idioms were found in Murder on the Orient Express movie. Phrasal verbs idiom is the most frequently type of idiom that occurred in the movie. This result was in line with Seidl & McMordie’s (1988) statement that idioms are mostly organized by verbs and a verb can be considered as a phrasal verb if it consists of two or more words. One of these words must be a verb, while the other can be an adverb, a preposition, or both an adverb and a preposition.

In addition, all strategies of translating idiomatic expressions proposed by Baker (2018) were employed in the movie subtitle. Translation by paraphrase (56%) was found to be the most frequently used by the translator to translate the idioms. It is because there are cultural differences between the SL and the TL, and sometimes translators might find it difficult to find the exact translation of the idioms. Therefore, the translator often uses this strategy in order to convey the meaning of the utterances as clearly as possible.

The result of this present study strongly supported Fitri et.al (2019) revealing that translation by paraphrase is the most preferred strategies in translating English idioms into non-idiomatic expression in Indonesian language. As Baker (2018) indicated that translation by paraphrase is the most common way of translating SL idioms which do not have the equivalent in TL. It is not easy to find the equivalent of SL idiom or there is no appropriate idiom and then transferred it into TL idiom. Hence, the translator tries to render the meaning of source text (ST) idiom using words in TL which are similar or close in meaning to ST, but the words do not make up an idiom.

The second most used strategy (32%) was translating using an idiom of similar meaning but dissimilar form. In this strategy, the lexical items of the idioms are not preserved, therefore it is translated as a semantic equivalent. The third position was the translation using an idiom of similar form and meaning (9%). Even though Baker (2018) argued that this strategy is most unlikely used, this present study found its application in the movie subtitling. Finally, the least strategy employed was translation by omission. Omission may be used when there is no close equivalent meaning and style in the target language.

Idioms are expressions that are culture-bound; therefore, it will not be wrong to say that culture is most complex topic to deal with translation. This is in line with Hassan & Tabassum’ (2014) study stating that culture is an umbrella term and translators confront the problems of mixing between connotations and denotative meanings of words, forms and address and the hurdles related with metaphors and idioms.

This study finding also confirms a previous study from Wicaksono & Wahyuni (2018) that translation by paraphrase is the most common strategy in translating the idioms. The underlying reason is because translation by paraphrase is the flexible strategy to translate the idioms and the translation will be more acceptable and it is easier for TL readers to understand. The difference of the finding may be explained from the variability of the research objects, for instance, folklores,
novels, etc. This present study also came up with results in line with Mabruroh’s (2015) study revealing that the dominant type of idiom used in ‘The Adventures of Tom Sawyer’ novel is phrasal verb idiom with 446 idioms (56.03%).

Lastly, this current study results agreed with Baker (2018) saying that idioms allow little or no variation in form and, in the case of idioms, often carry meanings which cannot be deduced from their individual components. Idioms and fixed expressions cannot be formally translated because their forms are misleading. It is the content and the cultural background that matter.

Conclusion
Phrasal verbs idioms are the most frequent type of idiom used in the movie with the occurrences of 26 out 77 idioms. It is because most idioms were organized by a verb comprising the combination of verb and preposition or verb and adverb. Furthermore, translation by paraphrase is the most frequently used by the translator in translating the idioms in Murder on the Orient Express movie with the occurrences of 43 out of 77 idioms. Due to the different culture between the SL and TL, the translator tends to paraphrase the English idiom into Indonesian. Translation by paraphrase can be used when the translator cannot find the suitable translation idioms in the TL, so they can paraphrase the meaning of the idiomatic expression to the target language, which is Indonesian in this case. Recommendation is addressed to future researchers, in which further study should address a comparative analysis to show how idiomatic expressions are translated differently in different objects.

About the Authors;
Yana Shanti Manipuspika is a lecturer in Study Program of English, Faculty of Cultural Studies Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, East Java, Indonesia. She earned her Master’s Degree (2009) in Applied Linguistics from The University of Newcastle, Australia. Her research and teaching interests include Second Language Acquisition (SLA), Pragmatics, and Translation Studies. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3885-7232

Damai Reska Julia Winzami graduated with a bachelor’s degree from Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia in 2020. She earned a Bachelor of Arts in English language, in linguistics concentration. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7448-9369

References


Roses in Amber: Gendered Discourse in Disney’s 2017 Adaptation of Villeneuve’s Fairytale Beauty and the Beast

Atoof Abdullah Rashed
Department of European Languages & Literature, Collage of Arts & Humanities, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia

Laila. M. Al-Sharqi
Department of European Languages & Literature, Collage of Arts & Humanities, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia
Corresponding Author: laila.alsharqi@gmail.com

Received: 10/28/2020 Accepted: 1/11/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
This study considers the dialogic relationship between the 2017 Disney live-action film Beauty and the Beast with Gabrielle-Suzanne de Villeneuve’s fairy tale and Disney’s 1991 animated version. Drawing on cultural and feminist discourse, the study seeks to examine Disney’s live-action film for incidents of cultural appropriation of gender representation compared to Villeneuve’s fairy tale and Disney’s 1991 animated version. The Study argues that the 2017 film adaptation reverses the traditional patriarchal notions and embraces a transgressive feminist discourse/approach as part of Disney’s strategy of diversity and inclusion of gender, race, class, and sexual orientation as constantly evolving cultural categories. This study finds significant alterations made to the physical and psychological attributes of the 2017 film’s three characters: Beauty/Belle, the Beast, and the Enchantress, changes that align with the film’s gendered discourse. By reversing the characteristic privileging of the male and the empowerment of the female, the live-action succeeds in addressing the contemporary audience demands of diversity and inclusion. The study concludes that the changes made in the 2017 film adaptation displace the oppressive patriarchal notions and stereotypical modes of representing the male and female as they have been perceived in the original fairy tale, for they are no longer compatible with contemporary cultures’ assumptions on gender.

Keywords: adaptation, Beauty and the Beast, cultural studies, de Villeneuve, Disney, gendered discourse

Introduction

Fairy tales are considered as influential sites for the construction of knowledge on gendered relations (Zipes, 2006, 2012). Having their origin in oral cultures, these fairy tales have been narrated repeatedly to young children in public and private spaces providing an essential source for the stereotypical images that perpetuate hierarchical gender forms of feminine and masculine behavior (Rice, 2000). While these fairy tales, such as Sleeping Beauty, Snow White, and Cinderella, which drew images of the female as obedient, submissive, and dependent, “continue to have a powerful effect” on how young and old [women] behave and relate to their daily activities (Zipes 2006, 2012), many contemporary feminist writers and film producers have attempted to reverse these long-standing mental perceptions by presenting the female as strong, independent and resourceful. Donald Barthelme’s Snow White (1967), for example, is a literary rewriting that attempted to redefine the stereotypical gendered notions portrayed in the original fairy tale by altering aspects related to male dominance. Andy Tennant’s Ever After: A Cinderella Story (1998) is another film adaptation that reinvented the Cinderella character as a resourceful female whose liberation from a life of oppression did not merely consist in marrying a charming prince but in saving the life of her future husband.

Beauty and the Beast is one of the most famous fairy tales that have embedded gendered behavior and discourse, and which has been rewritten and adapted. Influenced by ancient Greek stories, the original printed version of this fairy tale appeared in 1740 in The Young American and Marine Tales, credited to Gabrielle-Suzanne Barbot de Villeneuve. In this novel, Beauty is presented as an obedient and self-sacrificing young woman. She is traded by her impoverished father for safety and material wealth and rewarded for her virtuous deeds of obeying her father and the Beast. Beauty is also rewarded for valuing his kindheartedness above physical good looks. (Bottigheimer, 1986). Extending beyond the literary domain, this tale, like many other fairy tales that emphasize patriarchal values (Foss, 1988), reinforces a cultural discourse that presents females as inferior beings (Zipes, 1989; 1995). As an archetypal story, Beauty and the Beast is a reflection of the dominant views about femininity during the 17th and 18th centuries. It emphasizes qualities of obedience, self-sacrifice, and fragility as highly desirable. As Lauran argues (2006), these qualities often become a kind of terrain where Beauty turns into a socio-cultural conceptualization of the approved qualities of femininity and womanhood. Young women with these qualities occupy good status in society as both loved and cherished. Other young women who do not possess or conform to these qualities can threaten social norms and conventions. Dominant views about femininity in Western culture have linked young women with these qualities as positive ideals, prerequisites in exacting femininity.

Although this fairy tale quickly became very popular and was adapted several times into many texts, plays, and film versions across Europe and the US, many of these adaptations continued to reinforce the patriarchal discourse found in the original work. Some examples include
Pierre-Claude Nivelle de La Chaussee’s play *Amour pour amour* (*Love for love*) (1742); *La Belle et la Bête*, a French classic romantic fantasy adapting the Beaumont version (Cocteau, 1946); and the (1991) Walt Disney animation *Beauty and the Beast*, based on Jeanne-Marie Le Prince de Beaumont version (1756) of the fairy tale. The latest 2017 Disney live-action version of the fairy tale, however, presented a counter-gender discourse that troubles female representation in the original novel. Many reviewers of the 2017 film adaptation, *Beauty and the Beast*, received it as an entertaining “face-lift” of the animated classic for its depiction of dazzling customs and stunning musical and visual treat to attract young and adult viewership alike (Gray, 2017; Rosenzweig, 2017). Other reviewers conceived in the film’s treatment of gender a more significant contribution than mere entertainment. In an article review, Giese states that, unlike the 1991 animated *Beauty and the Beast*, which marked a renaissance for Disney in family entertainment, the 2017 *Beauty and the Beast* has not been the case. This is due to the latter’s incorporation of “gay and transgendered elements,” which Giese considers as inappropriate components for young viewers (2017, paragraph. 20). In another review, Gould argues that the film’s significance lies not in its socio-political propaganda and presentation of “gender nonconformity” themes or “GLBT agenda” but in the work’s ability to produce “higher and more immutable truth” (Gould, 2017, paragraph. 1).

Keeping abreast of the changing cultural ideologies in contemporary society, along with the various accompanying discourses and practices that have gained eminence since the 1900s (Zipes, 1995), this adaptation acknowledges spaces of difference in certain identity forms such as gender, race, and class. These cultural spaces stand as conjectures of the Disney company’s evolving strategy of diversity, inclusion, and capacity for cultural introspection, enabling “subgroups” in the society to remain “relevant in a rapidly changing world” especially that “inclusion is a critical part of reflecting the diversity of [its] consumers” (Francoeur, 2004, pp. 1–2; “The Walt Disney Company diversity and inclusion commitment”). This strategy is evident in the several expansions, alterations, and additions made in the 2017 *Beauty and the Beast* to represent various marginalized groups reflecting aspects of gender, race, and class. One example is the inclusion of Lefou, a minor character created by Disney to be Gaston’s underling, who, making an appearance in the 1991 Disney animation, who provides a direct representation of the queer sensibility with a sharply differing portrayal from his previous comedic appearance in the 1991 Disney animation (*Attitude*, 2017, paragraph 2). Another example of the racial inclusion strategy is Pere Robert, the black Chaplain who is the only person to be seen inside the church and who alone helps Belle after she is publicly abused by the rest of the village. Pere Robert shows his objections to the mob’s enraged behavior against Belle and Maurice in a close-up shot that evinces his noninvolvement alongside the gay character, Lefou. Disney’s incorporation of components related to gender discourse is by far the most critical contribution to this version. It is consistent with the increased interest in the construction of gender roles as social categories of analysis that inform notions of masculinity and femininity (Butler, 2007). It is thus essential to investigate the various additions and alterations made to the gendered components that Disney introduced to the 2017 *Beauty and the Beast* to enhance the feminist perspectives. The decision to study the various
methods, narrative and otherwise, Disney employed in the 2017 film to problematize the original tale’s representation of gender is vital. This study is also informed by the need to enrich the current scholarly interest in the intersection between literature and other mediums in connection to specific themes, such as gendered discourse, and theoretical approaches, such as intertextuality and adaptation studies, all of which have become part of the critics’ fervent interest in the late twentieth century, in what Sanders identifies as the desire for finding connections between literary texts and other mediums and genres (Sanders, 2016). More specifically, this study will address the following research questions: What are the main alterations and additions Disney introduces in the 2017 Disney Beauty and the Beast in the representation of its depiction of the film protagonists; how do these alterations in character representation compare and contrast with the characters in the original tale; what impact do these alterations render on the reading/viewing experience of the film; and what are the possible meanings and implications of the film’s revisionary impulse and the embedded reference to gender issues on various literary and cultural contexts. This study will thus provide a thorough understanding of the changing perspectives on gender to contribute to the current scholarly works studying film reworkings of classic fairy tales and exploring how these films diverge from sources to create their intertextual networks and connections. The findings of the study will also furnish grounds for future studies on gendered discourse in film adaptations.

**Literature Review**

**Studies in film adaptations**

Many critics and scholars have speculated on the importance of cultural discourse in film adaptations. Corrigan (1998) and Niklas and Lindner (2012) argue that both film and literature can be discussed on common grounds provided by interdisciplinary and cultural studies. They give significant multidisciplinary perspectives on gender, race, class, and power. These aspects are culturally specific and evolve according to the shifting values of a given society. As Stam (2005) points out, they are “infinite and open-ended possibilities generated by all the discursive practices of culture” (p. 27), “encompassing different questions of power and difference” (Bracke, p. 46), which, according to Stam, motivate film adaptations. They indicate a reading process that measures not only “what is retained and how that is presented [but also] the extent and nature of inventions and departures from the original” (Dudley, 2000, p. 31). While the previous adaptation criticism, based on aspects of “fidelity,” conceived of the inferiority of film to literature, cultural analysis of adaptations overcomes this prejudice by acknowledging their equal status, for, by their very nature, film adaptations are cultural constructs, “mosaics” shaped as much by intertextual and contextual forces as by their literary forbears; i.e., earlier works that “may have to alter the cultural, regional, or historical specifics of the text being adapted” (Stam, 2000, pp. 54–57) to cope with the continually evolving and changing cultural environments that Hutcheon defines as “palimpsest,” “creative and interpretive transposition[s] of a recognizable other work or works … a transcoding into different conventions” (Hutcheon, p. 33 2006). Similarly, Leitch, rejecting the limiting view of adaptation as fidelity to an original text, explores how the intertextual convergence of film adaptations as visual experiences and literature offers limitless discursive possibilities for understanding filmmakers’ different approaches to adaptation (2007, p. 126). Jameson goes a step
Roses in Amber: Gendered Discourse in Disney’s 2017 Adaptation

Rashed & Al-Sharqi

further to state that film adaptations as products of cultural-historical processes that illustrate the changes in different notions, values, and social activities in contemporary culture are “not only governed by a wholly different aesthetic,” but “breathe an utterly different spirit altogether” (Jameson, 2011, p. 218). In the same vein, Andrew, categorizing film adaptations into three modes: borrowing, intersection, and fidelity, argues for the importance of the “sociological turn” and the “complex interchange between eras, styles, nations, and subjects” (Andrew, 2000, p. 37) that film adaptations produce concerning the adapted texts. Providing a historical overview of film adaptations since the turn of the twentieth century, Naremore capitalizes on the importance of giving more attention to the economic, cultural, and political issues these adaptations generate rather than the purely formal ones (Naremore, 2000, p. 8). To illustrate his view, Naremore quotes Fassbinder, who states that “cinematic transformation of a literary work should never assume that its purpose is simply the maximal realization of the images that the literature evokes in the minds of its readers” (qt in Naremore, 2000, p. 9).

Studies on Disney’s Beauty and the Beast

The critical literature on Disney’s 2017 Beauty and the Beast is scant. Only two studies are available on this work. The first study is by Koushik and Reed in which they argue that the film is a representative of a “corporate trend” that Disney adapts to commodify its film products by creating “feminists reimaginings of classic narratives” as part of its strategy to “maintain social and financial capital” (2018, p. 2). The second study is produced by Banerjee and Singh’s who offer a queer reading of Emma Donoghue’s The Tale of the Rose and Disney’s 2017 Beauty and the Beast. The study examines these two works as appropriations of the heteronormative ideals of Madame Beaumont’s Beauty and the Beast. The study argues that, although The Tale of the Rose and Disney’s 2017 Beauty and the Beast present the lesbian relationship in the wake of the LGBTQ activism, they use subtle methods such as humor and veiled symbolism in their attempt to prioritize the mass reception of the film (2020). While the studies above discussed the 2017 Disney’s Beauty and the Beast, none of these studies provided a full-length analysis of the gendered discourse relevant to the work. It is thus pertinent to fill the missing gap in the literature on the issue of gendered discourse.

Methodology

Drawing on cultural and feminist discourse, this study’s objective is to explore the feminist aspects in Disney’s 2017 film adaptation, Beauty and the Beast, as they are related to Villeneuve’s 1740 work (with references to the 1991 animated version). Placing Disney’s 2017 Beauty and the Beast at the center of a web of intertextual relations with these works, the study uses close reading and comparative analysis to examine how the 2017 Beauty and the Beast reverses a set of principles and characteristics around which the notion of gender is organized. Unlike Villeneuve’s 1740 work, Disney’s 2017 Beauty and the Beast, this study concludes, provides alternative qualities associated with the male-female relationship. This reversal is evident in the altered concepts of female submission and domesticity, the changing beauty standards, and the personality traits that Belle and the Beast exhibit to support in breaking the gender stereotyping cycle in ways
that provide meaningful discursive practices recontextualized to resonate with the contemporary audience.

**Analysis and Results**

**The Empowered Beauty**

Consistent with its strategy of diversity and inclusion, Disney reimagines Belle in the 2017 live-action film to support feminism rather conspicuously. Although, as Gray states in *HuffPost* (2017), Belle displays certain feminist aspects in Villeneuve’s original version, particularly her refusal to marry according to her father’s desires, the emphasis is instead on physical beauty, charm, kindness, and selflessness as the most valued traits in women. To some degree, this is apparent in the animated classic; however, the 2017 version extends Belle’s physical and psychological strength away from the previous gender stereotypes. As Gray claims, the 2017 film answers feminist objections to the “weak” Belle (who falls in love with her kidnapper) in the 1991 film by creating subplots and adding details that elucidate Belle’s relationship with the Beast and amplify her independence, agency, and power.

The feminist aspects in the 2017 version are visible in Belle’s character when comparing, for example, the clothing worn by the heroines in the different versions of the story. The fancy gowns Villeneuve’s Beauty wears at the Beast’s castle and the flowers she puts in her hair illustrate her soft and delicate character. In contrast, the 2017 Belle wears a farmer’s outfit reminiscent of the attire she wears in the animation, but now she wears a toolbelt with her hem raised and folded on her right hip. This configuration reveals her bloomers and boots, which replace the ballet shoes chosen by the animators. Furthermore, when Belle is offered a wardrobe of fancy gowns, she uses the fabric to create an escape rope in a gesture that may represent a rejection of the conformity involved in donning typical gender-based clothing. Another example is when she disposes of her heels and the layers of her fancy gown on her way to rescue the Beast from the angry mob. Belle arrives at the battle between Gaston and the Beast in boots and underclothes, adjusting her clothes to make them shorter, lighter, more comfortable, and less restrictive to her movements. These changes in Belle’s attire set her in contrast to Belle in the previous versions; they reflect her empowerment and her readiness to be involved and active.

The most apparent alterations of Belle’s character extend to the qualities of her personality. In the original fairytale, Villeneuve presents Beauty as an example of “perseverance and firmness” as she can overcome hardship and adjust to the new conditions of her rural life (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 3). She forgets her past and focuses on revitalizing everyone around her: “there was nothing she did not do to amuse them” (p. 4). Her light spirit, wisdom, and high educational level help her endure her family’s misfortunes with patience and joy. In her social relations, she is esteemed for her benign nature and always surrounded by admirers—except for her envious, scheming sisters, whom she also treats with benevolence and generosity.
In the 2017 version, Belle lacks Beauty’s patience, contentedness, and cheerfulness as she is dissatisfied with her life in the village. Living in a primitive town as the only daughter of Maurice, a poor artist and music-box maker, Belle rejects her situation and longs for an escape from the “provincial life” (Condon, 2017, 0:017:19). She sings: “I want adventure in the great wide somewhere, I want it more than I can tell […] I want so much more than they’ve got planned” (0:017:33). In the animated version, Belle is merely the daughter of an inventor but, in the 2017 film Belle is also an inventor. Her skills exceed even Maurice’s; she invents the washing machine. The villagers view her as “odd,” “strange,” “funny,” and “different from the rest of [them],” while she thinks of them as dull and simple (0:05:40-55, 0:07:30) Struggling to mingle with others, she suffers from public abuse when she attempts to teach a girl to read.

When the Beast imprisons her father, Beauty’s response differs from Belle’s. For instance, Beauty willingly sacrifices her freedom, believing that it was her request for the rose that caused her father’s imprisonment. Resolved to hide her terror from her family, she pretends to be cheerful to ease their anxiety: “in their presence, she appeared to consider [the departure] as a happy event; it was only, however, to console her father and brothers, and not to alarm them more than necessary” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 23). After she meets the Beast at the castle, Beauty fears his appearance and worries that he will eat her. Trembling with horror, she nevertheless continues to behave with the proper demeanor by “[saluting] him very respectfully,” fulfilling her promise of surrender (p. 26). This response is similar to what occurs in the animation, in which Belle also fears the Beast’s form but asks to be allowed to take her father’s place in prison and accepts her fate as the Beast’s eternal captive in the castle.

In the 2017 version, in contrast, Belle demonstrates heroic bravery when she meets the Beast. Holding a wooden stick, she speaks to him loudly and firmly; she even yells that he is a “liar” when he accuses Maurice of theft (Condon, 2017, 0:27:46). Belle asks the Beast to “[come] into the light” to reveal his form. This scene also occurs in the animation, but the Beast declines her request in this version (0:28:16). His refusal drives the intrepid 2017 Belle to approach him with a candelabra. When he denies her request to take her father’s place, Belle locks herself inside the prison to force his hand. In contrast to her versions in the source text and the animation, Belle breaks her promise and plans to escape. Later, she argues with the Beast when he invites her to dinner: “You’ve taken me as your prisoner, and now you want to have dinner with me? […] I’d starve before I ever eat with you” (0:42:48). While Villeneuve stresses Beauty’s courteous manners, Disney’s 2017 Belle is daring, courageous, and even willing to insult the intimidating Beast.

Another significant distinction is the contrast between Beauty’s gratitude toward the Beast and Belle’s general ingratitude. During her nightly conversations with the Beast, Beauty’s attitude is obligatorily polite: “it was undoubtedly to him that she was indebted for the enjoyment of all imaginable amusements” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 42). Even the animated Belle, in actions and words, expresses thankfulness to the Beast for his support and presents. The newest version of Belle,
however, seldom shows the Beast any appreciation. She does not thank him after he helps her explore her past, apologizes for calling Maurice a thief, nor, most strikingly, attempts to protect her from wolves, during which he is injured. In the 1991 version, Belle, while tending to the Beast’s wounds, ends their argument in a tender tone, saying, “By the way, thank you for saving my life.” He replies, “You’re welcome” as he leans toward her in a moment that reveals their growing tenderness toward each other (Trousdale, 1991, 0:47:45). In the 2017 version, however, Belle withdraws from the argument without expressing gratitude. Instead, she says, “Try to get some rest” (Condon, 2017, 1:01:04). Belle’s lack of gratitude in this film version reflects her proud nature, as she refuses either to accept apologies or to appreciate favors.

An essential trait of the heroine—present in all three versions discussed here—is her fondness for books. While Villeneuve stresses Beauty’s high level of education and her passion for reading in passing general remarks such as “her great taste for study could easily be satisfied in this place” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 35), in the 2017 film Belle, the viewer finds concrete evidence of her vast knowledge of classic literature like Romeo and Juliet and William Sharp’s poem Crystal Forest.

Compared with her depiction in the animated version, Belle shows physical strength and intelligence in the latest live-action film, particularly during the mob scene. In the 1991 version, after Belle returns to town, she struggles to protect Maurice from the angry crowd, while Gaston (the antagonist) not only belittles her but pulls her around with ease. This staging emphasizes her physical weakness as well as her inability to defend herself. After Gaston single-handedly throws Belle into a basement, she is rescued only with the assistance of an enchanted object. In the 2017 version, however, Belle is stronger and more courageous than her animated counterpart. She enters the town on horseback, dramatically blocking the mob’s path. In her body language, facial expressions, and voice tone, she appears robust. She struggles against all attempts to confine her until she is finally dragged by two men and thrown into a carriage. She escapes by utilizing her mechanical knowledge as she aids her father with the proper tool to break the lock.

In terms of character development, Belle’s strong will and independence in the 2017 live-action version occur during the fight scene between Gaston and the Beast. Unlike her animated version, who plays a smaller role in this conflict, pleading verbally with Gaston to stop the violence, and pulls the Beast to safety; she is more physically involved. In the battle scene, she grabs Gaston’s darts and breaks them across her knees, furiously yelling at him. She then proceeds to struggle with him over his gun. To save the Beast from Gaston, she runs across a falling bridge and jumps over a chasm. Eventually, she stands watching from a distance, as in the animation. Yet, Belle’s physical dispute with Gaston and her active willingness to interfere in the fight reflects a shift from the animated heroine’s passivity to a more robust live-action interpretation of her character.

Interestingly, Emma Watson who played Belle in the 2017 film after receiving support for her feminist activities, adds a strong appeal to the film’s feminist approach. Watson has noted in
Entertainment Weekly that she tried to “make [Belle] more proactive, and a bit less carried along with the story […] and a bit more in charge of—and in control of—her own destiny.” Having played the role of a powerful female in Harry Potter, Watson stands as a gender equality activist who gives young girls around the world characters to live up to, someone inspiring and strong (Collis, 2015). Watson’s motivation for incorporating these alterations into the inner and outer dynamics of the role she plays stems from her desire to upgrade the animated character into a role model that could be idolized by young viewers: “Belle as a character represents a woman who is willing to stand outside of what is expected of her, and chase her dreams, chase her intuition, and I think that that will really resonate and really appeal” (Griffiths, 2016, paragraph. 3).

The Weakened Beast

To support its feminist agenda, and in contrast to his counterpart in the traditional fairy tale, the Beast’s vicious actions and motives are sharply evident in Disney’s live-action film. Weakened on several levels, a significant modification in the Beast’s character is his life before transformed him into a beast. In Villeneuve’s version, the Beast is perceived as a beloved and respected prince. He appreciates his Fairy Governess for her supervision: “[He] showed her the same deference, the same attention that [he] should have shown to [his] mother, and gratitude inspired [him] with as much affection for her” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 88). He always respects the Fairy Governess’s orders: “[she] permitted me […] now she forbade me […] I obeyed her without inquiring what were her reasons” (p. 88). He even remains polite under objectionable circumstances, as when he graciously refuses the Fairy Governess’s marriage proposal rather than bluntly expressing his abhorrence:

Madame, I assure you (…) Although I am sincerely grateful to you for past favors, I cannot agree to discharge my debt to you by such means. . . Name any other mode of acknowledging your favors and I will not consider it impossible; but as to that you have proposed, excuse me if you please. (p. 93)

Villeneuve’s Prince is a courteous character admired in his kingdom and even considered worthy of being a fairy’s husband.

In the text, the Fairy Governess becomes infuriated after the Queen rejects her marriage proposal to the Prince and hints at her age, horror, and rank as the reasons she is unsuitable. Because the wicked Fairy believes that the Prince’s excellence is a result of her work as a governess, she decides to deny him his virtues:

It is beauty, then, of this precious son of yours that renders you so vain […] having taken so many pains to make him charming, it is fit that I should […] give you both a cause […] to make you remember what you owe to me. (p. 93)
After the Prince transforms into a beast, he is challenged to find a girl who is willing to marry him, but he must reveal neither his wit nor his royal status to help persuade her. If he cannot find anyone, he is doomed to remain a beast forever. The Prince does not deserve the Fairy’s cruel punishment, since it was his mother who offended her in the first place.

Opposite to Villeneuve’s blameless Prince, Disney, in both its versions, makes the Prince solely responsible for his damnation. In the opening scene of the 2017 film, the narrator describes a “selfish and unkind” prince who abuses his people while delighting in the countless luxuries of his castle (Condon, 2017, 0:00:50). He appears wearing a wig as a maiden applies his makeup, a scene that emphasizes his conceit, mostly concerning his appearance and interest in material possessions. He also demonstrates this trait by “[filling] his castle with the most beautiful objects and his parties with the most beautiful people” (0:00:56). During the ball scene at the beginning of the film, all the dancers before the Prince are women dressed in white, and he sits on his throne, observing them. The lyrics in the scene may also allude to his habit of choosing one of the dancers for his sexual pleasure at each ball: “See the maidens so anxious to shine; look for a sign that enhances chances; she’ll be his special one” (0:01:31). In a brief montage, Disney provides an overwhelmingly negative portrayal of the Prince’s careless lifestyle before he is cursed.

To set the curse in the live-action film, an old lady—the Enchantress in disguise—interrupts the ball and requests shelter from the storm. The Prince laughs insolently and mocks her gift (a single rose), then orders her to leave. The old lady “[warns] him not to be deceived by appearances for beauty is found within” (Condon 2017, 0:02:32). The Enchantress, then, reveals her true identity and punishes the Prince by transforming him into a beast until he “could learn to love another and earn their love in return” (0:03:50). If he does fail before the last petal falls from the enchanted rose, he will remain a beast for eternity. While Villeneuve’s Prince is guiltless, Disney curses the Prince by his folly to teach him a lesson about vanity.

After the metamorphosis, the Beasts of Villeneuve and Disney respond to their situations differently. In the text, the Prince’s initial reaction is to feel anguish: “My despair rendered me motionless […] our misery was too great to seek relief in [lamentations]… I [decided] to fling myself in the adjacent canal” (Villeneuve, 2014, pp. 94–95). After his suicide attempt, a good Fairy appears at the scene. She feels pity for him and decides to help him cope with his situation by adding magical luxuries to the castle so that, although he still feels lonely, he spends his time engaging in useful activities: “I read, I went to plays, I cultivated a garden which I had made to amuse me, and found something agreeable in everything I undertook” (p. 99). The Beast’s emotional state is reflected in the castle’s liveliness. Even though it is uninhabited, it contained a “gentle warmth” and did “not [have] the air of an old castle that had been deserted” (p. 10).

In the 2017 film, in contrast, the Beast’s actions are more distinct. He lives in a state of despair and anger after he is cursed; his fear during the transformation causes him to tear up his portrait and lock himself in the castle. Inside the Beast’s wing, another destroyed portrait hangs
alongsie a broken mirror and several shredded items. This image of broken objects alludes to the Beast’s persistent anger. Although he has magic servants to keep him company and a magical book for entertainment, the Beast still dwells in desperation, gloominess, and fury, and his mood affects his surroundings. He acts out his frustration by breaking plates, roaring, and yelling at Belle and his servants.

Eventually, Belle has to scold him: “You should learn to control your temper” (Condon, 2017, 1:00:53). The Beast reflects on his emotions: “When I enter the room, laughter dies” (1:12:15). Contrary to Villeneuve’s Prince’s effects on his surroundings, the disturbed emotions of Disney’s Beast are mirrored in his castle. Although many people inhabit it, the castle remains bleak, disorganized, dusty, and seemingly empty. Only when Belle and the Beast become friends that the servants finally clean the rooms and open the curtains to let in the sunlight.

Another significant difference between the original text and the 2017 film is the Beast’s treatment of Beauty/Belle and her father during their initial interactions. In the text, the Beast is generous and hospitable toward his guests. Arranging a proper feast, accommodation, and multiple chests for his guests to fill with all the riches they desire, the Beast asks them to “choose anything which both of [them] think will give pleasure to [her] brothers and sisters” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 27). Even though he threatens death to the merchant for plucking a rose, the Beast later explains that he was only following the good Fairy’s plan to help him break the spell: “threaten him that death will be the punishment of his audacity, unless he give[s] you one of his daughters” (p. 100).

In the live-action film, however, the Beast behaves ruthlessly and viciously towards both Belle and Maurice when he first encounters them. He attacks Maurice for plucking a rose and imprisons him inside of his tower. At the end of the scene, the Beast drags the defenseless Maurice across the stairs as he throws him out of the castle. After Belle takes her father’s place, the Beast callously mocks her sacrifice: “You took his place? […] He’s a fool, and so are you” (Condon, 2017, 0:29:55).

The Beast’s treatment of Beauty/Belle during her stay in his castle reveals even more of his personality. Villeneuve’s Beast, for example, abstains from connecting with Beauty for fear that “[his] heart might betray its tenderness” and force him to reveal his identity (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 101). He allows Beauty to entertain herself in the castle without restrictions and says, “Wish for whatever you please, you shall have it” (p. 43). He treats her with “gentleness,” enquires about her daily habits, “[pays] her compliments” (pp. 44-5), expresses empathy, and respects her needs. He even shortens his visit after noticing her discomfort; “The Beast observed her impatience, and came merely to say goodnight, that she might have more time to sleep” (p. 47). It is his good conduct that eventually transforms Beauty’s fear into tenderness:
The weariness she had felt at first in listening to the Beast had entirely departed […] she had become more familiar with the Beast, either from the habit of seeing him or from the gentleness which she had discovered in his nature. (pp. 47–8)

Even the father, who hated him at first, considers him to be a suitable husband for Beauty, given his manners:

Discovering in this Beast too noble a mind to be lodged in so hideous a body, he deemed it his duty to advise his daughter to marry him, notwithstanding his ugliness […] observing so much civility in the Beast, he could not believe him to be as stupid as she represented him. (Villeneuve, 2014, pp. 58–9)

Although he rarely communicates with them, the Beast wins their favor through his generosity and kindness.

In both of Disney’s versions, the Beast displays behavior quite unlike that of the Beast in Villeneuve’s text. The animated Beast shows some compassion on the first night of Belle’s stay as he rubs his neck to relieve the stress and shame that he feels at having made Belle cry. Following the advice of his enchanted servants, he provides Belle with a good bedroom, invites her to dinner, and assures her that his castle and servants are at her command: “The castle is your home now so you can go anywhere you like […] Now if you need anything, my servants will attend you” (Trousdale, 1991, 0:24:43). In an act of politeness and friendship, he expresses sympathy for Belle by following his servants’ guidance. In contrast, the 2017 Beast is abrasive and indifferent, much more often than the 1991 character. He leaves Belle locked in the tower, denies her dinner, and furiously objects when the servants try to help her: “You’re making her dinner? […] You gave her a bedroom?” (Condon, 2017, 0:41:18). Even when the servants suggest using her to break the spell, the Beast replies with disgust, “She’s the daughter of a common thief. What kind of person do you think that makes her?” (0:41:50). Continuing to show little interest in her troubles, however, he eventually complies with the servants’ advice and improves his treatment of Belle.

Another clear distinction between Disney’s two versions of the Beast concerns how the characters introduce their library. In the 1991 version, after the Beast begins to develop feelings for Belle, he decides that he “want[s] to do something for her” (Trousdale, 1991, 0:50:00). Since she loves reading, the Beast shows her to his massive library and joyfully tells her, “It’s yours” (0:51:10). This gesture stems from the Beast’s desire to please Belle, which reflects his kindhearted nature. In the 2017 film, however, the Beast introduces Belle to the library after he ridicules her literary preferences by showing off his collections’ greater worth. The Beast fails to recognize Belle’s amazement until she expresses her joy; he then replies, “If you like it so much, then it’s yours” (Condon, 2017, 1:06:43). In contrast to the romantic appeal shown in the two characters’ kind gestures in the 1991 version, the live-action film dismisses any act of intimacy between the characters by demonstrating the Beast’s indifference to Belle’s intelligence.
The Beast’s disturbed personality in the 2017 film is given some context through a scene from his childhood that reveals his father’s emotional damage inflicted on him. As a character explains: “The master lost his mother and his cruel father took that sweet innocent lad and twisted him up to be just like him” (Condon, 2017, 1:01:23). This passing reference to the Beast’s painful childhood, which includes no further details regarding the father’s motives or the Prince’s gradual change, seems to have been added arbitrarily to justify the Beast’s character flaws. Dan Stevens, the actor who plays the Beast, describes his character’s unsettled personality in an interview with The Hollywood Reporter: “The beast has driven Belle away and now that he can’t love her, who could he ever love?” (Lee, 2017, paragraph. 6).

To enhance the beast’s altered character traits, this live-action version adds a new song, *Evermore*, in addition to two other songs, *Days in the Sun* and *How Does a Moment Last Forever*, to provide the Beast an opportunity to express his love for Belle as she leaves the castle and returns to her village, whereas the animated Beast shows his sorrow only through body language without directly communicating his feelings to the audience.

Why, then, did Disney change the Beast from the tender personality found in the text and the animation into a cold-hearted, impertinent character? One answer might be that the producers of the 2017 version thought that a feminist approach entailed focusing on the Beast’s weaknesses to intensify the strength of Belle’s character. When juxtaposed against such a fierce obstacle, Belle appears even more powerful and effective than in the animated version in influencing the stubborn Beast’s faults. Ultimately, this strategy highlights Belle’s strengths and promotes her as an independent, feminist heroine.

**The New Enchantress**

Another character change in the 2017 version that promotes a sense of feminism is evident when comparing the Fairy Governess in Villeneuve’s tale with Disney’s live-action Enchantress. In the text, the Prince’s Fairy Governess is “vindictive” and someone whom “people feared more than they loved” (Villeneuve, 2014, p. 86). She is mean-spirited not only inwardly but also outwardly, and she is “old,” “naturally hideous,” and “horribly ugly” (pp. 89, 91). She imprisons innocent fairies, manipulates a king to marry her, plans to murder Beauty as an infant, and unjustifiably transforms the Prince into a beast. By the end, she is imprisoned for her evil deeds, and the good Fairy says, “Yes, Prince, [...] you have no longer anything to fear from your enemy. She is stripped of her power and will never again be able to injure you by other spells” (p. 132). This ending is a fitting punishment for the Fairy Governess’s cruel deeds.

Disney’s Enchantresses play different roles in their respective films. The animated Enchantress appears only in the opening scene to curse the Prince. Although she aims to teach the Beast a lesson, her absence makes her seem unjust for cursing him and renders her lesson more elusive. In the live-action film, however, the beautiful Enchantress remains involved throughout the film to help the Prince learn from his mistakes. After transforming him, she gifts him a magical
book that enables him to travel around the world. This gesture is added to the story to demonstrate her kind intentions. She lives inconspicuously in Belle’s town as the poor widow, Agatha, to help break the spell. For example, she causes a lightning-struck tree to fall onto Maurice’s path, which forces him in the castle’s direction. The Enchantress also rescues Maurice from Gaston’s deathtrap in the woods. She, then, goes to the castle with the rest of the villagers to witness Belle’s confession of love and lift the curse.

Although the Enchantress hardly utters a word, her presence throughout the story heightens her benevolence. It serves to support her decision to discipline the Beast to impart a more profound lesson than is possible in the animated version. Gould (2017) observes that the film turns the Enchantress into a saint by making her punishment merciful as it protects the Beast from his flaws. The Enchantress was altered for the 2017 film to support the feminist messaging, changing her wicked nature to be motivated by compassion instead of hostility.²

Discussion
In its live-action production, Beauty and the Beast (2017), Disney addressed the subject of reversed patriarchy in the characters of Beauty/Belle, the Beast, and the Enchantress by exploiting the loose nature of adaptations. Redefining Villeneuve’s classic fairy tale in matters of gender roles served the Disney company’s approach to celebrate diversity and inclusion. Like other previous film adaptations, including Donald Barthelme’s Snow White (1967) and Andy Tennant’s Ever After: A Cinderella Story (1998), the female gains power in both appearance and character in opposition to her original weakness and submissiveness found in the text. Altering the stereotypical female roles in fairy tales (Foss, 1988), Disney and other filmmakers addressed the contemporary audience demands for diversity and equality, among other aspects (Ahmed, 2012; Bracke 2014,).

Establishing a fearless Belle in place of her past versions that adhere to stereotypical femininity, drawing the Beast’s character close to beastliness, and shifting the Enchantress’s past wickedness to compassion reflects the issues Disney addresses to respond to their viewers’ voices. Making use of adaptations’ flexible forms, Disney managed to not only adapt Villeneuve’s text but also to directly borrow from its animated version to incorporate diversity and inclusion within its productions.

Conclusion
This study examined the 2017 Disney film adaptation, Beauty and the Beast, as one of the significant adaptations of Gabrielle-Suzanne de Villeneuve’s classic fairy tale. The study’s objective is to gain a more profound insight into the different strategies, narrative and otherwise, Disney employed in its construction to problematize the original tale’s representation of gender. This study is also informed by the need to reassess the long-standing hegemonic and patriarchal forms of gender domination by examining the implications of the intertextual relation between Villeneuve’s classic fairy tale and Disney’s animated and live-action versions to demonstrate how the intersection between literature and film are used as significant sites of discourse through which cultural transformation and appropriation can be explained. Disney’s 2017 version of Beauty and
the Beast provides a significant example of cultural appropriation in its alteration of Villeneuve’s 1740 novella of the fairy tale (with references to the 1991 animated version). The alterations occur in the depiction of several characters, all made to support aspects of gender negotiation. Although Disney’s 2017 version of Beauty and the Beast may seem to depend on the guaranteed loyalty of the audiences to the original fairy tale, a closer examination of the film, the study argues, essentializes the male-female relationship consistent with Disney’s strategy of diversity and inclusion. This is demonstrated in the variations the protagonist and other major characters revealed. The protagonist, Belle, is reimagined in the film to support feminism by the changes shown not only in her strengthened physical attire and rejection of typical gender-based clothing but also in her empowered character. In the 2017 version, in contrast to the original tale, Belle demonstrates stalwart bravery and pride in her encounters with the Beast. Furthermore, Disney makes the Prince solely responsible for his damnation, and, in his transformed persona to the Beast, he is shown as weakened, despaired, and angered. In the text, the Beast is generous and hospitable toward his guests. In the live-action film, however, the Beast behaves ruthlessly and viciously towards both Belle and other characters like Maurice. These alterations, the study revealed, significantly contribute to the ongoing debates on diversity and inclusion as fundamental principles of recognition crafting the present and future of contemporary cultures.

Endnotes
1. It should be noted, though, that neither ethnicity nor homosexuality plays a significant role in the development of the plot; these elements seem to have been added without details or context to support their inclusion. Fatima al-Sayed calls this “depthlessness,” a tactic related to the approach to diversity and inclusion Disney has applied to Beauty and the Beast. She defines this tactic as a mere “insertion” of the characters into existing narratives with little effort to modify the plot or amplify the minorities’ voices: “The narrative of the film itself hasn’t actually changed in any way, Disney has just inserted diversity […] those same people aren’t controlling the narrative—the voice they’ve been given isn’t their own” (Al-Sayed, 2019, paragraph. 9).
2. This is not the first time that Disney has converted a corrupt female into a favorable character. For example, Maleficent (2014) is a metafictional remake of Disney’s The Sleeping Beauty (1959) and another adaptation, primarily based on the fairy tales of Charles Perrault (1696) and the Grimm brothers. This version reshapes the fairy tale by making the wicked witch, Maleficent, the protagonist. It presents her as a “benevolent character” who looks after the cursed princess and searches for a way to lift her curse (Khan, 2017, pp. 22–23). Changing the roles of “evil females” in fairy tales to justify their curses or add complexity to their characters maybe Disney’s method of adopting, or at least of appearing to adopt a feminist approach to film as part of their diversity and inclusion strategy.
About the Authors

Atoof Abdullah Rashed received her MA degree in English from the Department of European Languages and Literature at King Abdulaziz University, Saudi Arabia in 2020. She wrote a number of short stories and adaptation scripts of original plays. Her research interests are in the area of postmodern literature and adaptation theory. ORCID ID. https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0381-6366

Laila Mohammed Al-Sharqi is an associate professor of English in the Department of European Languages and Literature at King Abdulaziz University, Saudi Arabia. She received her Ph.D. in Cultural Studies from the University of Nottingham. Her research interests include postmodern literature, literary theory, gender studies. “Magical realism as a feminist discourse in Raja Alem’s Fatma” and “Twitter Fiction: A new creative literary landscape” are examples of her research. ORCID ID. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8142-1525

References


Islamophobia, Othering and the Sense of Loss: Leila Aboulela’s *The Kindness of Enemies*

**Khaled Abkar Alkodimi**
Department of English Language and Literature, College of Languages and Translation
Al-Imam Mohammad Ibn Saud Islamic University
Saudi Arabia
Email: kaq2002@yahoo.com

Received: 11/10/2020   Accepted: 2/1/2021   Published: 2/24/2021

**Abstract**

Muslims’ image in the West had completely changed since 9/11, 2001. This paper uses the textual analysis method to explore Leila Aboulela as a writer with a sophisticated commitment to Islam who strives to counteract the biased perception of Islam and Muslims. Drawing on the views of Wail Hassan, the study focuses on Leila Aboulela’s novel *The Kindness of Enemies* to examine the author’s concern of Muslims’ image in the west after the 9/11 terrorist attack and its impact on Muslims, particularly the immigrants. It argues that Aboulela uses Imam Shamil as a metaphor to debunk the terrorist attacks that target innocent people under the pretext of Islam, and on the other hand, setting a good example of the concept of jihad. The findings show that Aboulela’s primary concern is to condemn terrorist operations against innocent people worldwide. To illustrate her views, the author uses two contrasted pictures, the historical story of Imam Shamil, who embodies the proper jihadist/resistance vis-à-vis with the current so-called jihadists. The study further shows that those terrorist acts have significantly impacted Muslims’ lives and are the first cause of contemporary racism, islamophobia, and the sense of loss among Muslim immigrants in the west.

Key Words: islamophobia, Leila Aboulela, Muslim immigrants, other, terrorist, *The Kindness of Enemies*

**Cite as:** Alkodimi, K. A. (2021). Islamophobia, Othering and the Sense of Loss: Leila Aboulela’s The Kindness of Enemies. *Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies* 5 (1) 144-158. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.10
1. Introduction

Leila Aboulela, born in 1964, is an acclaimed Arab-British novelist born in Cairo but raised in Sudan, a country that she frequently revisits in most of her literary oeuvre. As a successful craftsman, bestowed with great creative skills, Aboulela draws the attention of critics and researchers from different parts of the world who showed a keen interest in her works, which focuses on a variety of sociopolitical issues like identity, immigration, racism, Islamophobia, Islam, and assimilation. Such common recurrent themes in her works paved the way for Aboulela to become a global literary figure. What is peculiar about her, is that she becomes a committed Muslim novelist whose “fiction as a whole depicts the experience of practicing Muslims in Scotland and England, from a narrative perspective committed to an Islamic world view…” (Hassan 2011, p. 180). In other words, she became a “devout Muslim and show more commitment to the teachings of Islam in search of inner peace” (Flicker, 2020). Hassan, (2015) further claims that Aboulela’s work “embodies the slogan of the Islamist movement that emerged in the mid-1970s: Islam is the solution” (p. 183). In this sense, she appears to prefer realism as a strategy to portray the struggle of Muslims in the west. Abolela openly admits this view when she said, “I do not tend to experiment in writing, and I believe that the reality of these challenges requires us to be accurate when describing them. This is particularly because the school of realism has always been dominant when it comes to novels” (Flicker, 2020). According to Flicker, many critics think that Aboulela appears to introduce a different image of Muslims through the female characters in her novels who find shelter and cure in religion, rather than escaping it. Perhaps, this is why Mike Philips, a British critic considers Aboulela as one of the most important writers in a new type of English narrative fiction, contributing to a wide range of Islamic novels (Flicker, 2020).

In general, nobody can deny the great storytelling talents of Aboulela. According to Jamal Mohammed Ibrahim, she has made a breakthrough for Sudanese writing and creativity and has had an impact similar to that of late Tayeb Saleh where religion and alienation are the central topics in most of Aboulela’s literary works (Flicker, 2020).

2. Methodological Framework

This paper applies the textual analysis method to examine Aboulela’s novel, The Kindness of Enemy (2015). The textual analysis method is simply an approach that can be applied to analyze the content and the messages contained in a particular text (Botan, 1999). By applying this methods, the researcher intends to explicate the deeper meaning and hidden messages of the selected text. The study argues that Aboulela has skillfully utilized the historical Muslim figure of Imam Shamil as a metaphor to highlight the changing image of Muslims in Britain and to debunk the current terrorist attacks which could be the main reason of such distorted image. It draws on Wail Hassan and others’ work to explore Leila Aboulela as a novelist whose work is engaged in Islam and spirituality and who is considered a robust Muslim voice that opts to reform the distorted image of Muslims. Hassan (2011), for instance, describes Aboulela’s fiction as a work that “represents a linguistic and ideological departure from Arabic fiction, and a new dimension in Anglophone immigrant and postcolonial literature”, considering Aboulela as an author.
“committed to an Islamic world view”. He further states that her works “undertake to explain Islamic theology, shari’a, and rituals to Muslim and non-Muslim readers” (p. 192). In his view, Aboulela’s work “represents two historical developments since the 1970s: the Islamic resurgence that has attempted to fill the void left by the failure of Arab secular ideologies of modernity, and the growth of immigrant Muslim minorities” in the west (p. 181). Khalifa, (2011) also notes that “in their quest for their Muslim identity, many Muslim women writers create a counter-discourse of themselves and Islam through fiction writing (2011, p. 2). Khalifa further points out that “these writers struggle to write back from a strategic positioning where they reclaim their Islamic cultural and religious identity as a mode of discourse that enables them to write back to the stereotyping center in the west (p. 6). Khalifa’s view has been emphasized by Al-Karawi (2014) who notes that “the continuous attack on Arabs and Muslims after 9/11 has generated the need to locate and create space through which Arab immigrant women can speak” (p. 257).

3. Literature Review
3.1. Aboulela, the novelist

As a writer of fiction, Aboulela’s debut novel is The Translator. This beautifully crafted story deals with the romantic affairs of Sammar, a young Sudanese widow living in Britain and a Scottish scholar specializing in Arab and Islamic studies. As the story progresses, Samar demanded her lover to convert to Islam so that they could get married. This novel, according to Wail Hassan “offers a critique not only on racism and Islamophobia but also of nativism, liberalism, multiculturalism …” (2011, p. 188). Mahmoud Khalifa also states that “Aboulela’s The Translator is a reflection of a strong nostalgia to memories of home and the associated Islamic rhythm. For living as an immigrant makes it hard to follow the Islamic rhythm”, as the case with Samar, the heroine of Aboulela’s The Translator and the heroine of Mohja Kahf’s novel, the Girl in the Tangerine Scarf (Khalifa, p. 57). According to Khalifa, these characters are “engaged in a struggle to define their Muslim identity in a culture that is hostile to their beliefs and cultural heritage”. Samar, for instance, “finds in prayer a form of support in a world of existential insecurity and a giver of identity” (Khalifa 38, p. 57).

Similarly, Aboulela’s subsequent novel, The Minaret (2005), tells the story of Najwa, a Sudanese refugee girl in Britain who suffered from a harsh life in exile and alienation from her homeland and culture. Najwa moves to London where she meets Anwar, a socialist student she previously met in Sudan. Unexpectedly, Najwa, starts to imitate western life styles, leading a free life in London. She freely goes to night clubs and puts on revealing clothes. “The party at the American club was in full swing when Omar and I arrived. We walked into the tease of red and blue discount lights and the Gap Bandages ‘Say Oops Upside Your Head’...’My trousers are too tight’. An awkward twisting around to see my hips in the mirror”, Najwa said (Minaret, p. 25). Significantly, however, Najwa “has undergone an Islamic and spiritual awakening that separates her from her previous life in Sudan, as well as from her previous self as the daughter of a corrupt politician-businessman” (Al-Karawi, p. 258). Islam, according to Khalifa, “gives meaning to her life and solace in this precarious world” (p. 63). For Al-Karawi, Minaret de Leila Aboulela allows...
readers to look at the forms in which the veil represents a sign or a stereotype whose diversity is not understood until it unpacks the living conditions of the Arab Muslim woman in the west (p. 255). Mahmudul Hasan also notes that Minaret and Love in Headscarf may be considered as two basic pillars of universe “Islamic Literature” by Muslim women. (p.96). Interestingly, both The Translator and Minaret “portray characters whose Islamic beliefs greatly influence their perceptions about their identities and largely regulate their relationships with other characters and the societies in which they live” (Awad, p. 70).

Such development in fiction became inevitable in Hasan’s (2015) view “after 9-11 and 7-7 as Muslim women’s stereotypic portrayals hit new heights of vulnerability and opacity, claiming that Muslim authors have long been compelled to render Muslim women with a disordered western vision” (p. 93). In this sense, Aboulela appears to be one of those female writers who attempt to “redefine and reposition Islam in relation to women’s lives and struggles and describe the religion as a living system and an integral, inseparable part of who they are” (Mahmudul Hasan, p. 94). For Hasan, Aboulela and Janmohamed are both religious and contemporary writers, committed to combating the misunderstandings of Islam and Muslim women (p. 94).

Interestingly, history seems to be the backdrop on which Aboulela establishes her views. Benguesmia and Refice (2019) note that Leila Aboulela is “inspired by a set of historical events and experiences” (p. 18). In an interview, Aboulela mentioned that writing a historical novel is a challenging task as she had to rely on actual events and stories. According to Benguesmia, The Translator (1999), and Minaret (2005) are two “public fictional novels by Leila Aboulela, in which she exposes several historical events that she has witnessed, lived or at least been told” (p.19). For instance, her literary works “marked by narrative, descriptive, and linguistic images” that reflect Sudan’s history and culture (Flicker, 2020). Such tendency can be discerned in her “history-based novel Lyrics Alley, in which Aboulela seems to be “inspired by the biography of well-known Sudanese poet Hasan Aboulela (1922 – 1962), in a compelling mix of autobiography literature and fiction” (Flicker, 2020).

However, as one of the diasporic Muslims, Aboulela’s fiction does not only reflect historical events but more importantly functions history to tackle specific issues like Muslim identity and religious faith, bringing a new perspective about Muslims and Islam stereotyping in western societies. This shows that Aboulela “succeeded at depicting reality behind the stereotypes of Muslim immigrants’ identity and beliefs” (Benguesmia, p. 19). As Wail Hassan points out, the “west of Aboulela is philosophical and behavioral: it is marked by the anti-Islamic and hostility against Muslims in every region and location, irrespective of color, language, tradition, nationality or geography” (p. 182).

3.2. The Kindness of Enemies: Synopsis

Like her previous novels, Aboulela’s The Kindness of Enemies (2015) is based on real historical events. However, the story runs two stories in parallel. Presently, Natasha Hussein of a Sudanese father and Russian mother is a university scholar specializing in Russian imperialism
and jihad as a form of resistance against the Russians’ invasion in Dagestan, Chechnya, and Circassia in the 19th century. Natasha learns that Oz has an interesting item, the sword of Imam Shamil, his ancestor and the leader of the Caucasian Muslim Rebellion against Russian attacks. She visits him and stays with him and his mother for a couple of days. In an early morning search, during her visit, Oz is abruptly arrested by security forces from his mother’s home, being suspected of having connections with terrorist groups. This incident has affected all those around Oz including Malak and Natasha. This story is paralleled with the story of Imam Shamil whose army was besieged for eighty days in 1839 and Shamil handed over his eight-year-old son, Jamaleldin as a Russian hostage, to escape poverty. Fifteen years later, Imam attempted to save his son. Princess Anna Georgia and her son were kidnapped and imprisoned in exchange for the liberation of Jamaleldin.

However, the issue at stake is that this novel offers a sharp critique of the Islamophobia phenomenon that had swept through most of the western communities due to the changing image of Muslims in the west. In his research, Erik Bleich concludes that “Islamophobia can best be understood as indiscriminate negative attitudes or emotions directed at Islam or Muslims. … where negative assessments are applied to all or most Muslims or aspects of Islam” (2012, p. 181). This study attempts to shed light on Abuolela’s main concern in this novel, The Kindness of Enemies.

4. Abuolela’s The Kindness of Enemies: Post 9/11 and the Distorted Image of Muslims in the West

Indeed, Muslims’ image in the west had fundamentally changed since 9/11. Benguesmia and Refice, (2019) had succinctly summed up the situation as they note,

precisely after the 9/11 attacks, the image of Islam has changed, and Muslims were greatly affected by these events, especially those living in western countries, on the aftermath of the events, many of them suffered discrimination, racism, violence as well as a stereotype. Islam became associated with terrorism and Muslims were treated like extremists and criminals (p. 25)

Raina also observes that since “9/11 the media has been full of images of the Middle East and Muslims, many of which have reinforced stereotypes about Muslim people, their beliefs, and ways of life” (2009, p. 14). Furthermore, in his paper, Examining the Critical Role American Popular Film Continues to Play in Maintaining the Muslim Terrorist Image, Post 9/11, Rubina Ramji argued that “Immigrant Muslims in America have become demonized as a national security threat since 9/11”. This “demonization and otherness”, according to him, has existed for a long time as “Muslim communities and families face bias crimes, sweeping arrests, popular and media hostility and official assumptions of ‘guilt by association’. For decades, the West has viewed Islam as violent, confrontational, and barbaric” (2015, p. 1). According to Ramji, many Americans turned to popular media channels to know more about “Islam and the terrorist motivations of these
Muslims, [however], instead of illustrating a highly diversified Islam, these outlets seemed to merely confirm the existing stereotypes” (p. 9).

However, the objective of this paper is not to delve into the representation of Muslims in the western media but rather to textually analyze how Aboulela has functioned her novel to depict the consequences of the changing image of Muslim immigrants in those communities. Interestingly, Leila Aboulela’s *The Kindness of Enemies* seems to be very much concerned with Muslims’ situation in the west. Broadly speaking, however, most of Aboulela’s novels attempt in one way or another, to illustrate the life of Muslims in the west after the 9/11 terrorist attack. At the same time, she seems to advocate Islamic spirituality to achieve tranquility and peace in life. In other words, Aboulela’s works have “celebrated ethnic and cultural mixing they have also promoted Islamic practices and advocated Muslim immigrants’ religious freedom in the West” (Benguesmia, p. 31). Her recent novel, *The Kindness of Enemies*, offers a bitter critique of the current situation of Muslims in the west in general and Britain, in particular. Her views are mostly illustrated through the major characters, Natasha, Malak, and Oz, who appear to enjoy a normal life at the beginning of the story, however, everything has changed after Oz’s arrest and imprisonment in spite of his release without charges.

The changing circumstances of those characters began with Oz’s arrest whose story is used as a scapegoat to comment on the lives of Muslims there. Natasha’s description of Oz’s sudden arrest illustrates the awkwardness of the situation as time stood still and everyone is speechless. “Because the front door had been open all the time the police were here …, Natasha said. ‘It’s a mistake’, his mother repeats. They’ve mixed him up with someone else, I’m sure’” (p. 79). Obviously, Oz’s story has been carefully functioned in order to highlight the image of Muslims in the west, a terrorist that should be ‘monitored’ (p. 147). Richards (2002) declares that after 9/11 attacks on New York, the American and western media “recirculate the old binaries” West and East, Christendom and Islam which speak to the “stereotypical Oriental Other” that provides filmic and literary representations of the Oriental culture (as cited in Khrisat, 2018, p. 59). Mahmudul Hasan also notes that “Orientalist tendency maintains a reductionist approach and mainly focuses on caricaturing Islam and Muslims. Some notable classical Orientalist texts … provide distorted portrayals of Muslim societies …” (2015, p. 89).

Indeed, Oz’s story puts Aboulela’s views in action, though he has been suddenly arrested and released without any charges, this incident, however, has destroyed his life. His future has been completely “ruined” and what is worse is that he becomes unable “to get out of this” (p. 185). “Oz was released yesterday. … He’s not talking to me. He’s not leaving his room. He won’t eat … I don’t know what to do. Can you come over? Maybe he will talk to you”, said his mother to Natasha (p. 219). Hence, Oz went into a state of emotional disorder, refusing to talk to anyone including his mother. More importantly, he decides to drop from the university and to move to south Africa. His mental and psychological disorder makes him unable to tolerate the changing situation in Britain. Unfortunately, however, all those around him have become potential suspects,
therefore, they have to bear the burden, including his mother and Natasha. This is why his father in south Africa rejects the idea of offering hand to his son in London. “They might drag me into it and then what use would I be to him? Can you believe it?” his father said. “Yes, I could believe it”, confirmed Malak, (p. 187), who is now, very much aware of the changing situation around her. As Wail Hassan notes, “prejudice and harassment by total strangers against practicing Muslims, identifiable by their …” (p.194). He adds, “ugly incidents of racism and harassment of Muslims, particularly Muslim women wearing hijab are depicted in most of Aboulela’s texts” (p.189).

Racism and otherness against Muslim immigrants is further illustrated through Natasha Hussein whose comments on the police investigation of the robbery of her house confirms the difficulties of Muslims there. “… it became more prominent than what I was saying; and I was now an impostor asking for attention, a troublesome guest taking up space. They had better things to do and worthier citizens to protect” (p.108). Her comments summed up the situation of Muslims in Britain who turned to be mere unwelcomed guests. Unfortunately, Natasha whose “dignity” was “shaken” (p. 176), realizes that the police is not concerned about her case. More importantly, their indifference reflects their negligence for her as she is considered the unwelcome ‘other’. As Benguesmia and Refice (2019) note, “western media have promoted the idealization of the western values of democracy, on the other hand portrayed Islam as the religion of violence, sexism, and described it as hostile and unreasonable, and accused Muslims of terrorism” (p. 25). Mahmoud Khalifa further notes, “the representation of Islam in the west was built around a binary system that endowed Islam with negative characteristics and the west with positive characteristics”. He adds, “west makes Islam one of the most recurrent images of the other in Europe and one of the most stereotyped and vilified religions …” (p.1). Mahmudul Hasan also points out that “Muslims have been made into objects of exclusivity and of continued analysis” since the attacks on New York and London, adding that “their identity is hidden behind a smokescreen of uncertainty…”. For him, “both the popular media and literature lay enormous emphasis on the religious affiliation of the perpetrators of the infamous 9/11 and 7/7 horrors”. This, according to him, “rendered the Muslim residents in the west as ‘exoticized others’ and ‘outsiders’ whose presence is said to constitute a threat to the western way of life” (2015, p. 95). The idea of racial prejudice has been further highlighted through Gaynor’s complaint against her teacher, “Natasha put her fat arse on my desk … Black arse … fat black arse … ‘Black arse … fat black arse …’”. However, Natasha’s reaction to Gaynor’s attitude shows her deep disappointment, “the words looped and steadied, they became rhythmic. I woke up warm with humiliation …”, she said (pp. 113-114). Surprisingly, Gaynor didn’t take any action against another staff, she made her complaint only against Natasha, a woman of a different color and religion.

Oz’s revelation to Natasha further reflects his awkward experience with the police and its effect on him. In his letter which he started with an apology, he informs her, “I’m sorry I behaved poorly that day you came over. I wasn’t up to talking much and to tell you the truth, it was because what happened psyched me out. The cell felt as a small as a cupboard and …” (pp. 298-99). Obviously, Aboulela seems to function Oz’s voice as an eye witness to emphasize her vintage
point that the life of any Muslim regardless of his position can suddenly turn upside down. What adds insult to injury and saddened Natasha even more is being helpless: “Oz had dropped out” and the news “passed around the department with relief as if we were well rid of him. One of our best students”, Natasha said. She continues, “I hid myself in the ladies’ and cried with anger, ashamed that, even now, I could not stand up for him” (p. 323).

Such social and political atmosphere led Muslim immigrants in the west to hide their real identities. That is to say, “many Muslims in Britain wished that no one knew they were Muslims. They would change their names if they could and dissolve into the mainstream, for it was not enough for them to openly condemn 9/11 and 7/7, …” (p. 6). They even feel ashamed of their parents who bear the signs of being immigrants. As Natasha declares,

Muslims I taught throughout the years couldn’t wait to bury their dark, badly dressed immigrant parents who never understood what was happening around them or even took an interest, …, who obsessed with about halal meat and arranged marriages … They grew up reptiles plotting to silence their parents’ voices, to muffle their poor accents, their miseries, their shuffling feet their lives of toil and bafflement, … (p. 7)

Ironically, Natasha herself has erased her father’s identity. She called herself Natasha Wilson instead of Hussein (p. 324). It is ridiculous that she was “ashamed to be seen with him around the campus” when he visited her in London (p. 77). However, it is the social atmosphere that leads her to behave awkwardly as she feels ashamed of standing in public with her father, who has crossed a long distance to see his daughter. According to Sardar, “modern Orientalism proceeds to rely heavily on the medieval images of Islam” confirmed by Butler (1988) that the “Orient has long fascinated British artists as an imaginary realm of luxury, violence, and sensuality” (as cited in Khrisat, p. 59).

Significantly, Oz’s mother, Malak, a successful actress who honestly devoted her efforts to serve and to please the community, suddenly realizes that she is the mere ‘other’. She is neglected and looked at with contempt and doubt. She realizes at the end of the day that she is a stranger, despite the services she has offered for the community. Her innocence and good deeds did not spare her. Her life has completely changed “from the optimistic activist mum campaigning for the release of her son to the shadows of being under suspicion” (p. 226). In one of her conversations with Natasha, Malak complains, “my dinner invitations drying up, even the offers of roles dwindling ever so slowly without knowing exactly why. …” (p. 226). Regretfully, Malak who previously rejects any complaints by Muslims in Britain, ultimately finds herself neglected and, like her son Oz, experiences a psychological state. The conversation between her and Natasha clearly describes her current state when Natasha tried hard to help her to overcome the situation: “I think you are unduly pessimistic, Natasha Said. However, Malak’s reply fully summed up her new situation, “all my life I have been hugely optimistic. I have gone ahead with loads of energy, loads of goodwill, until now. I am stumped. I stay up at night …” (p. 226). Such pessimistic reply
reflects the negative impact of the situation on her life. Her optimistic view of life has utterly vanished.

Like many of Aboulela’s characters, Malak ultimately escapes to religion as she finds solace in spirituality, trying to overcome the sudden shift in her life. Her religious tendency has been manifested in the attendance of several Islamic ceremonies to which she has invited Natasha Hussein who appears to be less interested in such Muslim gatherings. These “Muslim gatherings in the mosque create an alternative space for immigrant Muslim women” (Khalifa, p. 67). According to Khalifa, these characters are “engaged in a struggle to define their Muslim identity in a culture that is hostile to their beliefs and cultural heritage. … They find redemption in reclaiming their Muslim identity” (p. 38). Hence, Aboulela seems to stress such spirituality among her characters as most of her characters escape to religion as a solution to overcome life’s difficulties.

Like Malak, Natasha too ultimately realizes that she is strange although she has been a successful academician at the university where she has been teaching for a long period of time. Natasha’s comments on her changing situation clearly depicts her disappointment:

Every step climbed, every achievement, every recognition-all that hard work- had not taken me far enough, not truly redeemed me, not landed me on the safest shore. The skin on my skull tensed so that I could not form a facial expression; even pushing my glasses up my nose felt strange… To have your files examined, to reveal what is exceedingly intimate- a password and a search engine history- felt hundred times worse … (p. 175)

Hence, Natasha’s office was examined. She was also questioned about her relationship with Oz, her student and whom she once visited at home to learn more about Imam Shamil, the subject of her academic research papers. Perhaps, this is why she admits that her “dignity [was] shaken and [her] balance broke” (p. 176). She openly declares:

I was actually one of the lucky ones. I was one of the ones who saw the signs early on in the tricksy ways of schoolchildren, in the way my mother, snow-white as she was, was disliked for being Russian. I saw the writing on the wall and I was not too proud to take a short-cut to the exit. (p. 7)

Unlike Malak, however, instead of escaping to spirituality, Natasha seems to resist religiosity from the beginning of her life there. However, as Khalifa notes, “this insistence that Muslim women deny their religious identity in order to fit in, is a fundamental issue that these novelists raise and discuss” (p. 7). Yet, despite all she did to fit in, unfortunately she never felt at home. Instead, she has been treated as the ‘other’. Interestingly, her identity crisis in Britain provokes her feelings towards Sudan and the people there as she feels home nostalgic.
Such sense of loss was shared by the three characters, Natasha, Oz and Malak whose stories had been skillfully yoked together to produce a clear image of Muslims’ lives in Britain after 9/11. According to Edward said, Muslims “where ever they may be settled, are viewed through a certain lens” (as cited in Raina, 2009, P. 23). Said’s view is confirmed by Janmohamed, who provided a list of labels that are generally attached to Muslims, particularly women: “Oppressed, repressed, subjugated, backward, ignorant Violent, extremist, hateful, terrorist, jihadist, evil, radical Weakling, moderate, sellout, self-hating, apologist” (Mahmudul Hasan, pp. 92-3).

Obviously, “the sweeping, Islamophobic and racist tendency of the host white society adds one extra layer of oppression on them” (Mahmudul Hasan, p. 99). The situation of the three characters, for instance, was summed up in Natasha’s words when she admits, “… it now took conscious effort to walk with my head held high. My voice became softer, my opinions muted, my actions tentative. I thought before I spoke, became wary of my students and, often bowed my head down” (p. 324). Thus, it is ridiculous that even though she has changed her father’s name in order to fit in, she ultimately realizes that she would never belong. Unfortunately, although she is an accomplished and a successful academician, Natasha struggles with a deep “sense of disconnect and duality about her identity and place. Born Natasha Hussein, she changes her name to Natasha Wilson to try to blend in to a place where neither of her parents felt at home” (Carroll, 2016).

In contrast, though she grows up outside Sudan, Natasha feels comfortable as soon as she arrives and meets people there. She immediately feels a sense of belonging, as she remarks,

Chatting with them, we would skip from Russia to English to Arabic, and I relaxed without proving, explaining, or distinguishing myself. Nor squeeze to fit in, nor watch out of the corner of my eye the threats that my very existence could provoke in the wrong place in the wrong time among the wrong crowd. (p. 324)

Obviously, the very mention of the word ‘to fit in’ sums up the whole idea of belonging. Like Malak, despite the accomplishments she achieved, she feels strange. Both Malak and Natasha achieved fame, success and served the public to the best. However, by the time they feel that they are part of it, unfortunately that community seems to reject them, hence, the sense of loss and humiliation had replaced the sense of belonging and connection to that community.

5. Resistance, Jihad, Terrorism: Imam Shamil as a Metaphor to Illustrate the Mystery of All

A part from the image of Muslims that Aboulela attempted to highlight, another central idea in Aboulela’s The Kindness of Enemies is to set a good example of Jihad as this concept has become synonymous with terrorism. In this regard, she introduced a live picture of the historical figure Imam Shamil who led the resistance against the Russian emperor in the Caucasus early 19th century. According to her, Imam Shamil embodied the real example of jihad as his resistance is justified since Imam Shamil and his people got, in Slater’s words, a “just cause”, (as cited in Alkodimi 2019, p.136) to defend their homeland against the Russian invasion. In contrast, the
suicide bombers by al-Qaeda members and other militant groups are considered anti-jihadists or terrorists. They misinterpreted the essence of Islam in general and the concept of jihad, in particular. According to Aboulela, these operations defamed the image of Islam and Muslims. This idea was made clear as early as the first few pages of Aboulela’s novel. Malak’s comments, “ever since 9/11, jihad has become synonymous with terrorism” unveils the author’s dilemma, for Aboulela “jihad is an internal and spiritual struggle” (p. 9). Indeed, the misconception of jihad and the terrorist attacks under its name seem to be Aboulela’s main obsession in *The Kindness of Enemies*. She believes that the real jihad is to struggle to be spiritually connected to God rather than committing suicides.

Aboulela wisely related Islamophobia, racism and the distorted image of Muslims in the west, discussed above, to the terrorist attacks by al-Qaeda members and other militant groups. The author succinctly but indirectly puts it that these are mere terrorists acts and have nothing to do with Islam and Muslims. On the contrary, it affected Muslims across the world and had negatively impacted Muslims in general and Muslim immigrants, in particular. Such situation was embodied in a character in Kia Abdullah’s *Life, Love and Assimilation* that recounts how the stigma infects their view of the world, pushing Muslims to the margins:

9/11 was not good publicity for Muslims. It created a palpable tension between us and the rest of the world. I know that there is general animosity between Asians of different religions but I had never felt it. To me we were all Asians in a predominantly white country and we stuck together. 9/11 changed all that. Sikhs and Hindus became sick of being banded together with Muslims. (as cited in Ancellin, 2009, p. 5)

As Randa Abdel-Fattah, the Australian author of Palestinian–Egyptian parentage also observes that in the post 9/11 period of media and public obsession with Islam and Muslims “most intelligent people can see past the demonic and one-dimensional images of Muslims and are thirsting for an insight into the Muslim community” (as cited in Mahmudul Hasan, p. 93).

Interestingly, Aboulela carefully utilized the historical story of Imam Shamil who leads the resistance war against the Russian invasion on Caucasus as a metaphor to deliver her views on the actual meaning of jihad. That is to say, the story of Imam Shamil had been functioned in such a way as to give a clear example of this concept. According to the author, jihad in Arabic means resistance which is very much exemplified in Imam Shamil. Through the metaphor of his figure, Aboulela strongly mocks the so-called jihadists who target innocent people including Muslims. She uses Imam Shamil to showcase the misconception of the meaning of this concept. For her jihad is resistance rather than killing innocent people and children, which leads to stereotyping Muslims as terrorists and which also gave rise to the islamophobia phenomenon. As Dunia Alzubaidi notes, “With growing pressure on UK professionals [like Natasha] to report signs of religious extremism”, *The Kindness of Enemies* by Leila Aboulela is well timed, “drawing a parallel between the jihad perpetrated by the Islamic State (ISIS) and a case of 19th-century Sufi...
jihad in Russia”. Speaking at Bare Lit Festival in London, Aboulela “contrasted the two types of jihad” (Leila Aboulela, 2016). Interestingly, that comparison is the essence of Aboulela’s selected novel.

Indeed, as a craftswoman, Aboulela skillfully provided two opposed pictures in order to illustrate her views. The first portrait sheds light on the life and resistance of Imam Shamil who used Jihad to defend his land and people against the Russian invasion, and the second one describes the contemporary terrorist attacks against innocent civilians. Such live image of the two portraits vividly depicts the sharp contrast between the two situations. For Aboulela, Shamil and his men “are generous defenders of liberty against the brutal forces of the Russian empire” (p. 8). Such sharp attitude towards imam Shamil and his men is projected mostly through Malak. However, Natasha’s remark on Queen Victoria’s support for Imam Shamil provokes Malak, “who made a face at her son. Queen Victoria championed a jihad [?]”. Oz’s reaction to Malak’s comments further emphasize Aboulela’s views of the concept: “Don’t be naive, Malak. If Russia took over the Caucasus, it would have threatened India. Besides, the word ‘jihad’ then didn’t have the same connotation it has now” (p. 9). Interestingly, Oz’s comments take us to the heart of the matter that the dilemma of the author in this story is to highlight the misconception of jihad/resistance, as “when Imam Shamil, an honorable, even noble, character uses the term, he is describing the defense of his homeland, not aggression or acts of terror” (Braithwaite, 2017).

Aboulela goes further and showed to what extent those jihadists like Imam Shamil were kind to innocent people even though they were their enemies. The story of Anna the princess of Georgia who had been kidnapped by Shamil’s men (pp. 88-90) was functioned in such way as to reflect that Shamil fights only the soldiers who had attacked his land and people. Princess Anna lived as a guest at his house. She was treated as a princess but not as a prisoner. Her story, in other words, shows the kindness of the real jihadist who fought against real enemies, their war had nothing to do with the killing of innocent people. For Aboulela, they are but ‘the defenders of liberty against the brutal forces of the Russian empire’ (Aboulela, 2015). Indeed, the title of the story ‘the kindness of enemies’ is used as a symbol to mock the current militant groups who target the innocent people. The author seems to suggest that Imam Shamil who exemplified the honest jihadist had been kind enough even to his enemies and the story of Anna, the princess of Georgia was functioned in this direction.

Malak, who is a descendent of Imam Shamil, admits and feels proud of her heritage. Speaking about her son, she tells Natasha that “he has- as I have – a heritage which is moral, and thoughtful and merciful” (p.185). According to Malak, that rich heritage does not exist in those militant groups who “are acting in the name of Islam and at the same time don’t follow the principles of submission and restraints?” (p.185). Those so-called jihadists, according to Malak, are the real threat against Muslims themselves. She, on the other hand, reconfirms, through the image of Imam Shamil, the proper example of a jihadist.
Every fight Shamil fought was on the defence. He was protecting his villages against Russian attack. And surrender to the Russians would have meant the end of their traditional way of life, the end of Islam in Dagestan. The Russians were so brutal they often didn’t take prisoners of war (pp. 9-10)

Yet, Aboulela’s intention seems to be briefly confirmed when Malak declares that “by comparison Shamil’s generals were scholarly and disciplined” (p.10).

Indeed, Aboulela’s intention had been revealed as early as the first few pages of her story. She made it clear that her main concern is to debunk the current terrorist attacks under Islam’s pretext. Such view is mostly carried over through the major characters. For instance, the hot argument, referred to above, between Oz, Malak and Natasha, made it clear that there is a misconception of the meaning of jihad nowadays. Malak sums up the idea of the author when she concludes the above discussion by saying, “This type of jihad [Shamil’s] is different from the horrible crimes of al-Qaeda” (p.10). Using the metaphor of Imam Shamil, Aboulela attempted to create awareness among Muslims and non-Muslims about Islam and Muslims’ reality. In other words, she tried to condemn the criminal attacks of al-Qaeda members and those militant groups who target innocent civilians and call themselves jihadists. Such ‘horrible’ attacks, according to her, have only nourished the islamophobia phenomenon and othering in those societies.

Even though the two portraits, exposing the image of Muslims in the west and the anti-terrorist voice were integrated, the former is used to serve the latter. Aboulela made it clear that the phenomenon of islamophobia is the ultimate outcome of the terrorist attacks by those who have misunderstood the concept of jihad in Islam. Such view is further emphasized at the end of the story through Aboulela’s mouthpiece, Natasha, who admits that she:

wanted to compare Shamil’s defeat and surrender, how he made peace with his enemies, with modern-day Islamic terrorism that promoted suicide bombings instead of accepting in Shamil’s words, ‘that martyrdom is Allah’s prerogative to bestow’. How did this historical change in the very definition of jihad come about? (p. 324-5)

In her review of Aboulela’s novel, Kate Braithwaite states that “by drawing parallels with history, this contemporary novel effectively shows how clarity has been lost in today’s discussions of religious issues” (The Kindness of Enemies, 2017). Indeed, it is interesting that Aboulela ends her story with the same idea with which she begins, the sharp contrast between Shamil’s deeds and the current terrorist attacks under the pretext of Islamic jihad. Yet, in between, she clearly emphasized that those who target innocent civilians are mere terrorists and have distorted the image of Muslims in the world in general, and Muslim immigrants, in particular, and more importantly, have initiated the rise of the islamophobia phenomenon.
6. Conclusion

*The Kindness of Enemies* by Leila Aboulela united two stories, the history of Imam Shamil and the present story of Natasha Hussein. Although they are set in different periods of time, yet, they are tightly related. Interestingly, the two stories had been skillfully integrated to illustrate the distorted image of Muslims and its relationship to the misconception of jihad/resistance.

The Novel, first, condemns the unjust social system that views Muslim immigrants as terrorists. In this sense, the author sharply ridicules the increasing negative attitudes like islamophobia, discrimination and racism against Muslims as those ‘horrible’ acts, to use the author’s own words are performed only by a handful of people who neither represent Islam nor Muslims. Thus, Aboulela strongly rejects any attempt that connects Islam to terrorism. Another message is directed to those militant groups whom she made the butt of her criticism. She strictly blames them of violating the essence of jihad/resistance where she uses the figure of Imam Shamil as a metaphor to showcase the actual meaning of it. The death of Imam Shamil at al-Madinah after he performed Hajj is also symbolic as he died at the Sacred place. In contrast, those terrorists face a shameful death which could be a sign of their value in the eyes of God. In a nutshell, this novel confirms Aboulela’s Islamic views, she uses her fiction as a medium to correct the distorted image of Muslims in the west. Instead of denying her “Muslim identity”, as her heroine does, she “reconcile it with Britishness and debunk the association between Muslims and violence” (Hasan, p. 94).

About the author
Khaled Abkar Alkodimi is an assistant professor of English Language & Literature, Imam University, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. He got his PhD from University Putra Malaysia (UPM) in 2011. Dr. Alkodimi has participated in a number of international conferences and published a number of articles in different internationally scientific indexed journals on a wide range of topics. ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4894-8223

7. References


Perplexity and Predicament: A Corpus Stylistic Analysis of *A Summer Bird-Cage*

**Xuqin Lin**  
School of Foreign Studies  
Anhui Normal University, Wuhu, China

Received: 1/4/2021 Accepted: 2/7/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

**Abstract**  
This paper aims to explore the text style of Margaret Drabble’s novel *A Summer Bird-Cage*. Specifically, it is intended to scrutinize how Drabble’s language style vivifies her representation of some women characters’ perplexity and predicament when they are confronted with problems related to value orientations and lifestyles. The present paper’s significance lies in a methodological breakthrough and resultant interdisciplinary insights. To achieve the main aims specified above, this paper will explore the following research question: stylistically, how some lexical categories such as nouns, verbs, and clusters are related to the spatio-temporal order of the novel and to its discourse prosodies or narratorial attitude with characters’ verbal responses to some thorny issues. As a whole, this study is situated in a research context where previous and many current studies of *A Summer Bird-Cage* are primarily qualitative. To complement them, this paper embodies mixed methods research, featuring in a computer-aided, data-based, corpus stylistic approach to the style in Drabble’s novel. Based on a multi-layered investigation of Drabble’s language use and a close corpus stylistic analysis of it, this paper obtains some interesting findings as follows. First, some young, educated British women’s complicated psychological experiences are thematized via narratorial introspection that centers around characters’ processing of mind. Second, the tone of the women characters’ speeches and the underlying attitude to some important issues are often negative, indicative of their bewilderment. In short, this paper adopts a corpus stylistic approach to thematic studies and character analysis as a contribution to the body of specialized knowledge of Drabble’s art of fiction.

**Keywords:** *A Summer Bird-Cage*, Margaret Drabble, perplexity, predicament, stylistic analysis

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.11

Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies  
ISSN: 2550-1542 |www.awej-tls.org
Introduction

Margaret Drabble is an important contemporary British woman writer who is often grouped with such internationally renowned novelists as A.S. Byatt and Angela Carter (Richetti et al, 1994, p. 938). However, her works are much less studied than they deserve. To redress the situation, this paper is intended to closely analyse A Summer Bird-Cage and identify its stylistic features. 1960s witnessed a profusion of narrative fiction by women writers. In what respects is Drabble’s novel distinguishable from her contemporaries’ works? From the perspective of “narrative stylistics” (Simpson, 2004, p. 18), this is a question worthy of an in-depth exploration. As an approach different from the existing ones, this paper, methodologically, applies corpus stylistics in narrative analysis, thus integrating qualitative and quantitative research with a view to more insightful findings.

A Summer Bird-Cage describes some well-educated women’s psychological progress to self-actualisation through search for self-value and spiritual freedom in modern British society. To computationally identify and locate the stylistic features of Drabble’s novel, this paper explores the stylistic features of the novel with the software of Wordsmith Tools 7.0 (Scott, 2016) and knGram (Fletcher, 2012) and discovers how the language presents the theme of the novel through the choice of language. The pronouns, nouns, and verbs are frequently deployed to present the characters’ qualities, mental activities, and verbal communication. The three-word and four-word clusters will also be examined for detection of their functions in establishment of spatial and temporal relationships. As foci of critical attention, the following questions will be explored:

1) What are some salient stylistic features of Drabble’s novel?
2) How do those features function to generate or accelerate narrative progression and enhance thematisation?

To find answers to the above questions in a corpus stylistic approach, this paper scrutinises the following aspects of the novel as its objects of studies:
(1) grammar and content words, such as pronouns, nouns and verbs as linguistic resources used to describe characters’ attributes, mental activities and features of narrativization;
(2) three-word and four-word clusters embodying negation and indicating spatio-temporal orders respectively.

As this mixed methods research is empirical in orientation, it will generate new insights different from those yielded via traditional or exclusively interpretative methods.

Literature Review

Margaret Drabble’s fiction spans almost five decades, devoting herself to portraying intellectual women’s female consciousness in different life stages. 19 novels have been published consecutively so far since her first novel A Summer Bird-Cage came out in 1963. Her novels can be categorized into three groups. Group I includes semi-autobiographical novels with a strong
realist flavor during the 1960s, focusing on the intellectual women’s self-actualization and spiritual maturity. Group II comprises novels that reflect her vision of the social consciousness of middle-aged women from the 1970s to the 1980s. Group III embraces novels that were published since the middle of the 1980s, Drabble’s novels have shifted from traditional realism to postmodernism, which are marked by a change in style from realist narrative representation to postmodernist one (Wang, 2016, p. 20).

Research context

Studies of Drabble’s novels have been undertaken from various angles of vision. They have been published in the forms of monographs and journal articles. Out of 47 publications, 31 of them are academic books or anthologies of contemporary literature, and Drabble is just mentioned as one of the contemporary writers or feminist writers without a detailed discussion of her novels. Five books are an introduction to a group of renowned feminist writers in history and Margaret Drabble is included as one of them. As these authoritative books comment, “Drabble’s work displays a sense of the social concern which has been a strong characteristic of the English novel since the eighteenth century, but which is found in only a few writers today” (Carter & Macrae, 2017, p. 467). Only 10 books are exclusively about Margaret Drabble’s studies on her novels. Among these 10 books, four books are about Margaret Brabble’s life experience and writing career while others focus on the different topics on the thematization, characterization, and intertextuality of Drabble’s novels. At the same time, more than 100 papers in different journals have been published to analyze the thematization, female identity, a shift of writing style, characterization, narrative techniques, and so on. Before the 1980s these studies all agree that “of all the contemporary English women novelists, Margaret Drabble is the most ardent traditionalist” (Shawalter, 1977, p. 304).

After 2000, the study on Margaret Drabble’s novels shifts from these literary features to a broader discussion. Among these books, three publications explore Drabble’s novels more systematically in terms of feminist identity development, major themes, and style shift, such as Margaret Drabble’s Novels: The Narrative of Identity (Singh, 2007), Female Intellectuals’ Visions—A Thematic Study of Margaret Drabble’s Three Novels (Yang, 2011), and From “Great Tradition” to “Postmodernism”—A Study of Margaret Drabble’s Novels (Wang, 2016). Singh investigates Drabble’s 16 novels from the perspective of feminism and discovers her unique narrative technique from fragmentation to wholeness. Yang Yuehua (2011) chooses Drabble’s three novels to present female intellectuals’ psychological change from the pursuit of independence and motherhood to women’s social awareness in the trilogy of Drabble’s three novels. Compared with this book, Wang Taohua (2016) delineates Drabble’s writing style from traditional realism to modernism and postmodernism through her analysis of Drabble’s seven representative short stories and novels in three stages. This book covers most of Margaret Drabble’s novels and can be regarded as a milestone in studies of Margaret Drabble’s studies because it has been a systematic analysis into Margaret Drabble’s writing style so far.
But until now, no journal articles or monograph has applied a computer-assisted stylistic approach to her novels. Her language use has not been explored in a corpus-assisted methodological approach. Since a corpus stylistic approach embodies mixed methods research, it can be, theoretically, expected to yield more insights into the novel, thus hopefully making new contributions to the existing body of knowledge about Drabble’s novels.

**Methodologies**

*Stylistics as linguistically underpinned study of literary works*

As specified previously, the present paper applies a corpus stylistic approach to Drabble’s novel. As a sub-discipline of stylistics, corpus stylistics examines, computationally, how a given style is constituted. By definition, style is “the linguistic characteristics of a particular text” (Leech & Short, 2007, p. 11), which is the object of stylistic studies. Stylistics is a discipline of studying language devices that are considered to create a literary style. “To do stylistics is to explore language, and more specifically, to explore creativity in language use” (Simpson, 2004, p. 3). The purpose of stylistics is to discover the relationship between language choices and aesthetic functions. Sometimes a writer departs from linguistic norms for an effect of defamiliarization, the concept of which was initially formulated by Shklovsky, a “poetic technique that forces readers to see the familiar things in strange and unfamiliar ways” (Pourjafari, 2012, p. 201). This produces a prominent psychological effect of foregrounding, coined by the Czech theorist Jan Mukarovsky. “In literature, foregrounding may be most readily identified with linguistic deviation: the violation of rules and conventions, by which a poet transcends the normal communicative resources of the language” (Childs & Fowler, 2006, p. 90). Two techniques to create foregrounding are “repetition and parallelism” (Simpson, 2004, p. 50). “Foregrounding can be qualitative — deviation from the language code itself or quantitative — deviance from some expected frequency” (Leech & Short, 2007, p. 39). Frequency is the repetition of words or structures repeated in a passage, so the arithmetic should be applied to do the counting.

Style is presented in the text through recurrence, pattern, and frequency, but how can it be measured? The style can “be measured in terms of deviations — either higher frequencies or lower frequencies — from the norm” (Leech & Short, 2007, p. 35). The frequency can be revealed computationally and corpus stylistics utilizes software to find artistically motivated deviation or foregrounding statistically.

**Corpus stylistics**

Stylistics is considerably active and dynamic in the early 21st century. There emerged cognitive stylistics, discourse stylistics, feminist stylistics, and corpus stylistics, and so on, as some core sub-disciplines of stylistics. Stylistics is based on theoretically informed, systematic, close linguistic analysis, while corpus stylistics “applies corpus methods to the analysis of literary texts, giving particular emphasis to the relationship between linguistic description and literary appreciation” (Mahlberg, 2014, p. 378). Using some software, corpus stylistics examines
the relations between the frequency of patterned language items and their stylistic value. Therefore, the more frequent those patterns are, the greater significance they have. In other words, the recurrent features contribute more to the construction of meaning, generation, or maintenance of genre. The electronic data generated from the software is combined with the theoretically informed interpretation of language characteristics, integrating quantitative analysis and qualitative studies.

Since the 1980s, more and more researchers began to apply corpus stylistics in literary analysis. This interdisciplinary approach enables the provision of deeper insights into the literary texts. For example, in their seminal work, Semino and Short (2004) made a breakthrough in stylistic studies via enriching Leech and Short model by adding writing presentation and quantitative and qualitative analysis. Toolan (2009) combines corpus stylistics with narratology by delineating the matrix of eight parameters of narrative progression in short stories, which methodologically broadens the literary studies. Before 2010, these studies focused on the keyword techniques to literary analysis while after 2009 the scholars shifted their focus to clusters to disclose the linguistic features. Among the cluster analysis, Mahlberg (2013) especially pays attention to those related to body parts in Dicken’s novels but Fischer-Starcke (2009) focuses more on the hierarchically analytical progression from word to text part to text in Austen’s fiction to discover the characters’ perception of the world.

Multi-layered Analysis of A Summer Bird-Cage

Of all the corpus analyses mentioned above, none of them was performed into A Summer Bird-Cage. In response, this paper applies a corpus stylistic approach to Drabble’s novel. “All literary appreciation is comparative, as indeed is recognition of styles in general” (Widdowson, 1975, p. 84). Constructed in 1961, the Brown Corpus was contemporaneous with the corpus of A Summer Bird-Cage (Drabble, 1963). Brown also contains narrative texts. In terms of genres included, therefore, Brown could serve as a rough and ready reference corpus. The tokens in A Summer Bird-Cage are 67,700 and the Brown Corpus (from K to R) contains 297,902 tokens, which are almost five times that of A Summer Bird-Cage. Therefore, the Brown Corpus can serve as a reference corpus. Since the target novel is, in the main, narratively concerned with some women characters’ processing of mind in their self-actualization, some keywords will be extracted using Wordsmith Tools. They will be analyzed with a view to the discovery of any meaning-making patterns. Lemmas are in upper-case and word forms are in lower case, for instance, THINK includes thinks, thinking, and thought.

Besides Wordsmith Tools, the paper uses the software of kfNgram to generate 3-grams, which are most frequent in the novel. The kfNgram is a phraseological software that extracts “uninterrupted strings of words” (Fischer-Starcke, 2009, p. 31), n-grams, from a text or corpus. The dominant or frequent clusters are three-word and four-word clusters, and the two-word or five-word clusters are inextricable in the analysis. Thus, this paper chooses the three-word and
four-word clusters to discuss the language features and style of *A Summer Bird-Cage*. The following is an itemized, multi-levelled corpus stylistic analysis of the novel under discussion.

**Diction**

Stylistics analysis consists of four categories: lexical categories, grammatical categories, figures of speech, and cohesion and context (Leech & Short, 2007, p. 61). Owing to the limitation of space, this paper analyses linguistic items in lexical category, hoping to find out relations between the use of words as well as phrases and narrative style in Drabble’s novel.

**Verbs**

According to Halliday & Matthiessen (2014), language represents patterns of experience in the system of transitivity, which can be realized in the following six process types: material, behavioral, mental, verbal, relational, and existential. They subdivided the mental process (verbs) into four categories: “perceptive, cognitive, desiderative and emotive” (pp. 214-257). In *A Summer Bird-Cage*, the mental verbs are frequently used, especially the cognitive verbs, which refer to perceptions or psychological states or activities of the fictional characters, instead of movements or physical acts, as the following table indicates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of mental verbs</th>
<th>Verbs (frequency/keyness)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>perceptive verbs</td>
<td>feel(77/0.01), seem(33/0.05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>desiderative verb</td>
<td>want(70/0.10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cognitive verbs</td>
<td>think(218/0.32)/thought(95/0.14), suppose(87/0.13), know(234/0.35), mean(93/0.14), believe(44/0.06)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emotive verbs</td>
<td>love(78/0.12), married(58/0.09)/marry(32/0.05)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the keywordlist of the first 100 words, cognitive verbs are overwhelmingly a major part of verbs, which are four verbs. “Mental verbs, especially ‘know’, ‘think’, ‘see’, and ‘mean’, are particularly common in conversations. These verbs report states of awareness, certainty, perception, and desire” (Biber et al, 2002, p. 113). In *A Summer Bird-Cage*, there are numerous conversations. All the events happen between the heroine and her sister, her mother, and other friends, so the cognitive verbs illustrate the female characters’ mental activity, unfolding the their understanding of the world. “The primary focus of A Summer Bird-Cage, however, is not the status within patriarchy of an educated young woman like Sarah, but her psychology” (Rose, 1980, p. 4). Besides, there is only one desiderative verb, want, whose low frequency also cause foregrounding of the female characters’ weak inner desire. Take want as an example,

We could get married if we **wanted**. We
You won’t **want** to stay with me,
I didn’t want to talk female intimacies
I know who really wanted children
I don’t know what I want to do
I feel like a still life. I want to do something
I didn’t want to be Simone, or only at times
Don’t you want a proper career, Sarah?

These conversations are pertinent to family, friends, employment, and marriage, which are common topics facing the girls about twenties. Most of them occur with negative expressions, such as didn’t, won’t and don’t, which implies these women have a strong desire to free themselves from the social conventions, like encaged birds long for the freedom from the patriarchy. Particularly, if it is scrutinized in conversation, the context will further our perception of Sarah’s view of career, as is shown in the next extract:

MAMA: Just any sort of job?
ME: Whatever there is.
MAMA: Don’t you want a proper career, Sarah? I mean to say, with a degree like yours...
ME: No, not really, I don’t know what I want to do. (p. 44)

The above extracted part is not conventional NRST(Narrative Report of Speech and Thought) in prose fiction because it is a dialogue of DS (Direct Speech) vividly presented in the format of play. Stylistically, it is formally “internal deviation”, which stands out against the context of dialogic interaction. The author ingeniously uses “me” and the intimate salutation “mama” to create immediacy and shorten the distance between the author and the reader. Therefore, the reader is like sitting in a theatre and watching their vivid discussion of employment. Thematically, the interrogative sentence uttered by the mother with a pushing tone, clearly shows Sarah’s mother is also a “New Woman” who values intellectual development of a girl and urges her daughter to think about the future path, indicating historical progress of feminist identity from a housewife in the first generation to a university-educated woman in the second generation.

Nouns
Nouns are used to refer to things, objects, persons, qualities, events, and so on. names things and persons by nouns. Things are classified into “abstract and concrete things” (Halliday & Mattiessen, 2014, p. 58). In the keywordlist of A Summer Bird-Cage, the proper nouns of Louise, Stephen, Tony, Daphne, Gill, Francis, and John are listed, which shows the happening between Sarah and her sister and friends. Proper names of places are often mentioned at the same time because almost all of the characters are graduates from Oxford University, which indicates the characters are young intellectuals who are often concerned about marriage and love.
Perceivable from the above table, specific nouns outnumber general nouns. This can be attributed to the use of such nouns as *invitation* to present those narrative situations. As far as characterisation is concerned, this semantic preference throws some light on the dual nature of those women characters’ daily life: easy, comforting, fancy on the one hand, but confining, challenging, conflicting on the other, thus implying thematically that they are, in a sense, encaged in marriage or family life. Moreover, the following three nouns are most frequent: *wedding* (34 occurrences), *love* (78 occurrences), and *books* (42 occurrences). Such frequency distributions show clearly those women characters’ engagement, primary concern, and intellectual interest. Among others, *love* occurs most frequently, unmistakably indicating those characters’ value orientation: genuine and gentle feeling is most important to those educated young women. At the same time, the frequent recurrence of the word *books* metonymically mirrors those women characters’ active interest in reading, learning, and construction of knowledge: a hallmark of educated women’s life. Also, it is inferable that, confined to books or, rather, propositional knowledge embodied in books, it is no wonder why those women found themselves perplexed when confronted with some problems in the real world.

The next recurrent noun *wedding* also marks off a turning point in her perception and cognition of a female’s growth from girlhood to womanhood. The first paragraph of the novel validates the evolution from the perspective of the text world theory.

I HAD TO come home for my sister’s wedding. Home is a house in Warwickshire, and where I was coming from was Paris. I was keen on Paris, but will refrain from launching into descriptions of the Seine. I would if I could, but I can’t. I like the way things look, but can never remember them when I need to. So I’ll leave Paris at that. I was leaving to go home to be a bridesmaid at the wedding of my sister Louise. ... either: all the foreignness that seemed so enchanting when I first went in July had begun to drive me to distraction. Every time somebody pinched me on the Métro I felt like screaming, and as for things like the lavatory paper and the price of chocolate and the brisk, bare-kneed, smart little girls... (p.1)
Perplexity and Predicament: A Corpus Stylistic Analysis of A Summer Bird-Cage

Perceptibly, it was written in past, present, and future tenses, creating different time frames. The text worlds shifting is advanced by some verbs, such as *come, leave, and go*. As Figure 1 shows, the first text world generates the other three text worlds, conveying to the reader that the story is situated at present, after two months in Paris and before the character’s stay at home in the future. The integration of analepsis and prolepsis creates immediacy and impressiveness of decision-making at the beginning of the story as if the feeling is still conjuring up in the author’s present mind, which is characteristic of the innovative modernist writing style. It is also a valid example of internal deviation against the context of the past tense in the story, creating the intersection between the past, the present, and the future. Furthermore, Sarah’s attitudinal contradiction for Paris is manifested in the sentence: “I would if I could, but I can’t” (p.1). Paris, metaphorically, is a symbol of romantic love, but Sarah decides to leave it, indicating that romantic flavor or love will fade gradually and lose its perpetual enchantment eventually. Conversely, home is the destination of the heroine’s journey to attend a wedding, showing her awakening to the power or attraction of marriage or, by extension, family life.
Figure 2. Concordance of the word love

Another prominent noun is love, which is disproportionately used in the novel because it is one of the major themes of the story. Among the 20 words related to love in Figure 2, 17 words are about the emotive feeling for people and three words are about love for books of British classic literature, such as E. M. Forster, George Eliot, and John Keats as seen in the concordance lines 7, 8, and 9. These lines signify both the themes of love and her spiritual pursuit. Emphatically, in Concordance Line 2, Sarah contemplates Louise’s marriage view. The mental process evolves from the initial confusion to the resultant need for a woman pursuing material wealth, so Sarah “discounted the concept of love” to claim her marriage view that marriage should not be based on material wealth. Stylistically, it paves the way for the potential marriage failure of Louise at the end of the story, thus flouting the reader’s expectation of a happy marriage.

Pronouns

Performing a number of functions, pronouns can be divided into several categories: “personal pronouns, reflexive pronouns, demonstrative pronouns, and indefinite pronouns” (Biber et al., 2002, P. 92). Among all the personal pronouns, first-person pronouns are most frequently used, for example I, me and myself with respective frequencies of 3242, 645 and 104. The choice of the pronoun in A Summer Bird-Cage illustrates the overt first-person point of view and direct speech in the writing, deviant from the conventional third-person and male-dominated genres. By virtue of the character-focalizer I, the narrator Sarah’s personal feelings and thoughts are directly presented. “When focalization lies with one character that participates in the fabula as an actor, we can refer to internal focalization” (Bal, 2017, p. 136). Besides, the origo I, as the zero reference point of subjectivity, features modernist writing because “twenty-first century
humans have a strong notion of self and subjectivity” (Gavins, 2007). Finally, the preponderance of I reveals that “at first her novels remain within the rubric of modernism by using the first person, and the protagonist can tell us about herself without violating modernist decorum” (Harper, 1982, p.157). Although most critics agree that she is a realist writer, as a novelist in the 20th century, her writing usually applies the technique of “telling” rather than “showing”, more modernist than realist.

Hedges

Paralleled with the above words, hedges are particularly preferred by the author and achieve high frequency.

Table 3. Frequency and keyness of hedges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hedges</th>
<th>Frequency/keyness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>really</td>
<td>163/0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>very</td>
<td>198/0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rather</td>
<td>90/0.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>always</td>
<td>108/0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>quite</td>
<td>83/0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perhaps</td>
<td>82/0.12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hedges were first mentioned by Lakoff (1972) as “words whose jobs are to make things fuzzier or less fuzzy” (p. 195). In the semantic classification, most of the hedges used by Margaret Drabble are hedges of degree rather than hedges of range of topic, quantity, or quality. The degree does not go to polarity or extremity, but mediates the conversation to avoid directness. Women’s speech seems in general contained more instances of hedges which conveyed the sense that the speaker is uncertain about her statement or cannot vouch for its accuracy (Bucholtz, 2004, p. 79). Although she lacks empirical investigation of hedges, Lakoff “linked women’s use of hedges with unassertiveness” (Coates, 2004, p. 88) because “asserting themselves strongly isn’t nice or ladylike, or even feminine” (Bucholtz, 2004, p. 75). From the keywordlist of A Summer Bird-Cage, hedges are overwhelmingly used to disclose the characters’ uncertainty, lack of confidence, and perplexity, compared with the reference Corpus (Only four hedges are found in the first 100 words in the wordlist ranking). This paper chooses concordance lines of really to analyze hedges.

Concordance Line13: Do I really?
Concordance Line 17: Did I really?
Concordance Line 39: Do you really want me to come?
Concordance Line 47: No, not really, I don’t know what I want to do.
Concordance Line 53: I really don’t know.
Concordance Line 54: I didn’t really think so but I hadn’t the nerve to suggest the other thing.
Concordance Line 13 is Sarah’s uncertainty to her her appearance. Concordance Line 17 is also Sarah’s uncertainty about Michael’s affection and her accusation of that. Concordance Line 39 is Sarah’s hesitation when she is asked whether to go out with her sister Louise and Stephen, which reveals Sarah’s indeterminacy to be involved with a couple, a marital relationship. Concordance Line 47 and 53 demonstrate the psychological status of Sarah’s friend Gill, who is married and jobless. When asked about what to do in the future, Gill does not know whether to work outside the home or what to do. From the above concordance lines, really is not used to emphasize the facts, but mitigate the force of utterances and show the speakers’ tentativeness or even negative evaluation, thus truth value is reduced. When arriving at adulthood, women are confronted with the choice between marriage and occupation. In A Summer Bird-Cage, Sarah finds that her jobless friends and her sister are involved in a unhappy marriage, which sets her into meditation: what is the relationship between marriage and job? Why should women get married? She is haunted by the perplexity from the beginning to the end of the novel.

Clusters

Clusters have been studied by many researchers and endowed with different terms and interpretations. Scott (1997) at first call these formulaic expressions as “clusters”. Altenberg (1998) defines “recurrent word-combinations” as “any continuous string of words occurring more than once in identical form” (p. 195). Biber et al. (2002) call them “lexical bundles”. Stubbs & Barth (2003) call them “chains” (p.61). “Uninterrupted chains of n words are called n-grams” (Fischer-Starcke, 2009, p. 108). Sinclair (2008) asserts that “the normal primary carrier of meaning is the phrase and not the word; the word is the limiting case of the phrase and has no other status in the description of meaning” (p. 409). Therefore, this paper applies “cluster” in Wordsmith Tools and analyze the implied meaning of the most frequent three-word and four-word grams. The following tables clarify the reasons why three- and four-word grams are prominent in the text, compared with the Brown Corpus.

| Table 4. Frequency and percentage of n-gram in A Summer Bird-Cage |
|------------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Length           | 3-word | 4-word | 5-word | 6-word |
| Frequency        | 1,682  | 307    | 59     | 9      |
| Percentage       | 81.8%  | 14.9%  | 2.9%   | 0.4%   |

| Table 5. Frequency and percentage of n-gram in the Brown Corpus |
|------------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Length           | 3-word | 4-word | 5-word | 6-word |
| Frequency        | 6,135  | 1,666  | 138    | 150    |
| Percentage       | 75.8%  | 20.6%  | 1.7%   | 1.9%   |

From the above table, it is self-evident that 3-grams and 5-grams in A Summer Bird-Cage are more frequent than those of the Brown Corpus. The number of 3-grams and 4-grams is much
more than the other types of grams, so the most frequent 3-word and 4-word grams are extracted and analyzed. Six-word clusters occupy only a small part and can be ignored.

Clusters describing spatial and temporal relations

Table 6. Three-word and four-word clusters in A Summer Bird-Cage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>3-word</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>4-word</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>i don’t know</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>from time to time</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>a lot of</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>in the end i</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>it was a</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>what do you mean</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>do you think</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>you know what i</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>i said i</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>know what i mean</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>that i had</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>i didn’t want to</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>i had to</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>i don’t know i</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>in the end</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>at the end of</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>i am sure</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>all right i said</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>i don’t think</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>i don’t know what</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>one of those</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>i don’t want to</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>do you mean</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>i said to myself</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>i used to</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>the end of</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>that it was</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>as though she were</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>what do you</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>as a matter of</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>i began to</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>i don’t know why</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>i had been</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>oh i don’t know</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>you know what</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>i mean to say</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>i would have</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>i thought it was</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>that he was</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>i would like to</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7. Patterns of 3-grams and 4-grams

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>3-grams</th>
<th>4-grams</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Temporal, spatial, quantitative</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and qualitative relationships</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Containing pronouns (including</td>
<td>14 (10)</td>
<td>16 (14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘I’)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Including a verb, adjective, or</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>noun describing a mental process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Including the grammatical</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>negation ‘not’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Having question words</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the above Table 6, the first 20 three-word and four-word clusters are extracted. Table 7 is extracted from Table 6 of three-grams and four-grams. According to the lexical characteristics,
this paper classifies the grams into five groups. From Table 7, the preponderance of clusters is related to the pronoun I and most of them collocate with the mental verbs: think and know, indicating the characters’ frequent mental activities.

In the 4-grams, *the end* includes the three phrases: in the end i, at the end of, and the end of the. In the end i mirrors the heroine’s activity and usually appears at the beginning of a sentence. The variant slot fillers indicate the narrative closure of an event and also the beginning of another event, which pushes the development of narration. But in the end is “a circumstance adverbial of point in time” (Biber et al., 2002, p. 362). For example,

Thinking how unfair it was, to be born with so little defense, like a soft snail without a shell. Men are all right, they are defined and enclosed, but we in order to live must be open and raw to all comers. What happens otherwise is worse than what happens normally, the embroidery and the children and the sagging mind. I felt doomed to defeat. I felt all women were doomed. Louise thought she wasn’t but she was. It would get her in the end. (p. 15)

This extract is Sarah’s deep thinking about the inequality between men and women. Metaphorically, women are vulnerable and defenseless because she compares women to “a soft snail without a shell”. Furthermore, the juxtaposition of “the embroidery and the children and the sagging mind” is not common since there is no comma between the last two nouns, which shows the nonstop and natural narration of destined failure for women. In this example, in the end has the final position in the sentence to indicate the consequence, but sometimes in the end is placed in the initial position to “introduce a new scenario” (Biber et al., 2002, p. 371), for example, “In the end I got a job with the BBC”. In the end marks the spatial-temporal transition from Sarah’s home to London, which is narratorial shifting from Louise’s marriage to Gill’s marriage.

Syntactic Negation

Nine of the first 20 3-word and 4-word clusters begin with the first-person pronoun “I”, which centralize the role or position of the heroine. Besides, the sentence structure of “Subject + Negative word + Verb” or syntactic negation is salient. Syntactic negation is principally realized by the negative particle not and its contracted form n’t. These are seen as prototypical forms of negation (Jeffries & McIntyre, 2010, p. 94). The list of 4-word grams even contains six negative clusters: i didn’t want to, i don’t know i, i don’t know what, i don’t want to, i don’t know why, and oh i don’t know. Evidently, the negative words are mostly combined with the cognitive verbs think and know, which reflect the characters’ mental activities. In the rank of 3-word clusters, two negative clusters are foregrounded and i don’t know is the most frequent. Therefore, this paper chooses i don’t know to explore the mental process embedded in the collocation.

The following concordance lines can provide rich materials for the analysis. Among the 48 concordance lines of i don’t know, 35 sentences are said by the heroine Sarah, nine sentences by Sarah’s sister Louise and five by Sarah’s friend Gill. As for the topic, 21 lines are about love
and marriage, 3l lines about women’s job. Almost all of them are in quotation marks, which are a marker of direct speech for direct thought presentation. In their conversation, there are almost no report words, such as said, to indicate the interlocutors, as if the reader is watching a TV play without interruption of the narrator. Therefore, the dominant use of DS(Direct Speech) vividly and directly presents the scene and characters, a realist writing style.

Concordance line 5: “Oh, I don’t know. Surely one would feel like a lamb led to the slaughter and all that?”
Concordance line 6: “Oh, I don’t know.” I couldn’t go into the twisted motives of middle-class girls with no sense of vocation, although I felt I was becoming an expert on the subject.
Concordance line 7 and 8: “Oh, I don’t know what to say about it really…I don’t know how it happened.”
Concordance line 15: “No, not really, I don’t know what I want to do.”
Concordance line 16: “I don’t know what I wouldn’t have given for the opportunities you’ve been given.”
Concordance line 23 and 24: “I don’t know,” I said. “I don’t know at all.”
Concordance line 43: “I don’t know, I really don’t.”
Concordance line 48: She says she has learned her lesson, but I don’t know what she means by that.

From the above concordance lines, i don’t know is said by different people: Sarah, Louise, and Gill. The frequent occurrence of the phrase hints at the negative narratorial tone of the three major characters in the predicament of their life. Concordance line 5 is the conversation between Sarah and Louise just the night before Louise’s wedding. Sarah compares a bride to a lamb which is led to the slaughter, which reveals Sarah’s fear or hatred towards marriage and the female helplessness in marriage. Concordance line 7 and 8 are about the marital condition of Gill, who gets married immediately after she graduates from Oxford and divorces afterwards. Gill and Louise represent two extremes of marriage: one is for money and another without a vocation. What is a perfect marriage? Should women have jobs after marriage? I don’t know perpetuate these issues in the characters’ minds and foreground the confusion of the theme in the readers’ minds, which is a prominent feature of modernist writing.

Superficially, the female characters get married and jobless, which inflicts a conflict between marriage and occupation, but there is no logic between them. Margaret Drabble’s early work was in line with the second wave of feminism, salient in self-referentiality and feminism. She once stated that the last book she read in Cambridge influenced her profoundly: Simone De Beauvoir’s The Second Sex, which was “material that nobody had used and I could use and nobody had ever used as far as I would use it” (Firchow, 1974, pp. 102-121) The perplexity is not the confusion about whether a girl should take a job or get married, but a young girl’s predicament when she experiences from a girl to a woman: “how and on whose terms to enter the adult world” (Rose, 1988, p. 3). I don’t know is repeated by the different female characters.
when they are confronted with employment, love, marriage, and divorce, which reflects women’s perplexity in their social predicament. The dominantly negative tone permeates the novel.

Conclusion

The present paper examines the themes and character portrayal in Drabble’s *A Summer Bird-Cage* through detailed corpus stylistic analysis into a good number of lexical categories and clusters. The corpus-assisted investigation demonstrates the linguistic features of the novel have enhanced the effectiveness of thematization and characterization in the story. The overwhelmingly negative tone of characters’ speeches felicitously embodies the three female characters’ perplexity and predicament in their critical life stage.

Further research on Drabble’s novels could be enriched with more extended scope to cover most of her novels and investigate the phased features of her writing. What’s more, the software can be applied more proficiently and the analysis can be more thorough through a comparison of a self-made corpus of Drabble’s five early novels from 1963-1969 with the five novels of her contemporaries for more findings about Drabble’s individualized narrative style. Finally, relevant theories and methods can be incorporated into the research in order to obtain more interdisciplinary findings regarding Drabble’s art of fiction, such as speech act theory, schema theory and conversation analysis.

About the Author:

Xuqin Lin is a lecturer teaching English for more than twenty years in China. She graduated from Anhui Normal University, China and got her master’s degree in 2008 with a concentration in British and American literature. Her academic interests are corpus stylistics, second language acquisition, and edusemiotics. ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8386-4191

Acknowledgment

I express my heartfelt gratitude to Professor Jian Luo in Anhui Normal University, China for his for his informing teaching of stylistics to me and my colleagues as well as his insightful feedback on earlier versions of this paper and his continued help in my writing process.

References


Maya Angelou’s Battle with Alienation in I know Why the Caged Bird Sings

Qudsia Zaini
English Language Center
College of Science for Girls, Abha
Department of English, King Khalid University, Saudi Arabia
Correspondent Author: gzuni@kku.edu.sa

Mohsin Hasan Khan
Department of English
Faculty of Arts, Greiger Campus. King Khalid University, Saudi Arabia

Received: 8/20/2020 Accepted: 1/17/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
The themes of the existential crisis have been central in taking up their work in different domains of human experience and exhibit the force of departure from the so-called standardized norms and values of a society. These themes have been taken up by many authors of African American origin. This paper attempts to represent and explain the theme of alienation through an in-depth analysis of Angelou’s I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings. The crisis of identity, gender, consciousness, and everything seemingly comes to question in the powerful narratives of these kinds of writings. One such African American author is Maya Angelou. She is one of those who take these themes with great force and tries to free herself from the shackles of the so-called canonized versions of human values and seeks to explore a world in which she recreates an establishment of her new perspectives and freedom of humanity. The paper concludes by showing the struggles for recognition and self-awareness and developing onto a stronger woman pushed by her feeling of alienation.

Keywords: Alienation, autobiography, freedom, self, Maya Angelou’s I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings

Cite as: Zaini, Q., & Khan, M. H. (2021). Maya Angelou’s Battle with Alienation in I know Why the Caged Bird Sings. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 177-186. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.12
Introduction
This research paper studies the theme of alienation especially emotional isolation or dissociation from others. In Angelou’s autobiography, the main character is consistently alienated and experiences isolation from society. She is separated from their loved ones on and off, both physically and psychologically. The objective is to identify how the writer faces the challenges of racism, sexism, and identity crisis in *I know Why the Caged Bird Sings*. *I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings* is an autobiography. An autobiography is defined differently by many literary dictionaries and books of scholarly definitions. Cuddon (2013) defines autobiography as an account of a person’s life by himself or herself.

The African American Autobiography has a different literary significance. The traditional autobiography focused on the biography of the concerned author. The critics could access African American Autobiography from several other perspectives like cultural, historical, psychological, ideological, philosophical, and literary. The uniqueness of black writing is the set of experiences very different from the world of white American heroic tales. Following the epic tradition, the African American autobiography is much like the prose narratives of voyages by white Americans in the nineteenth century that represent the evolution of the epic genre. The writers of black autobiography have shared and shaped American culture, and their works are very much a part of American literature.

Significance of the Study
The present research will help in identifying the elements of angst and alienation in black writings therefore, enriching the tradition of black canon. It will also shed light on studying female writers in particular and their sense of feminist ideas giving way to robust black feminism.

Literature Review
Angelou is considered one of the most well-known American authors for her memoir, *I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings*, and her numerous poetry and essay collections. She, being a spellbinder storyteller, exhibits and reflects the multiple themes which African American societies face.

Angelou has been described by Butterfield (1974) as one who “does not submit tamely to the cage. She is repeatedly thrust into situations where she must act on her own initiative to save herself and thereby learns the strength of self-confidence” (p.4). She has written biography like many other black writers, but she transcends the limits of society set for African American writers and female writers. Arensberg (1976) describes the heroine as

An unbeautiful, awkward, rather morose, dreamy, and "too-big Negro girl," young Maya Angelou seems an unlikely heroine…. the child Angelou writes about is unadmired, unenvied, uncoddled as she makes her precarious way (on "broad feet," she reminds us) into the world.” (p. 111) and yet she still remains a realistic heroin of the autobiography.
Darling (1981) stated “She is outside and inside at the same time, looking at all of it with double vision”

Angelou tells the readers, “There is nothing quite so tragic as a young cynic because it means the person has gone from knowing nothing to believing nothing” (p.22). What is at once characteristic and suggestive about black women’s writing is its interlocutory or dialogic, character, reflecting not only a relationship with the “other(s)”, but an internal dialogue with the plural aspects of self that constitute the matrix of black female subjects. The interlocutory characteristic of black women’s writing is, thus, not only a consequence of a dialogic relationship with an imaginary or ‘generalized other,’ but a dialogue with the aspect of ‘otherness’ within the self. The complex situatedness of the black woman as not only the ‘Other’ of someone but also as the ‘Other’ of the other(s) implies…a relationship of difference and identification with the ‘other(s)’ (Henderson, 1989).

Samuels (2007) defined Angelou’s autobiographies as the “most significant” and he further describes:

Angelou’s autobiographies mostly follow the classic pattern of black autobiography: the journey out, the quest, the achievement, and the return home. All six of her serial first-person narratives arise directly from the aesthetics and traditions of the slave narrative, the blues, the contemporary African-American journey narrative, and formal autobiography. Each is characterized by an affirmative pattern of moral growth and the reconstruction of the collective myth of black female identity. As blues traveler, she confronts being afraid and bereft through sheer style and courage and offers picaresque progression experiences. (p.14)

She had a vast range that sympathies with multiple and extended arrays of thoughts related to class and history as well as color lines from the perspective of her black struggle for freedom. Other themes recur and include the role of the colored mom, nostalgia for roots, wounds of racism, freedom, sisterly relations, the call to African land, the presence of a slave, black female sexuality, feminist values, complex confrontations, and also the accumulation of wisdom. These volumes aim at the merging of history with fact, other genres of literature like fiction and poetry, and the experience of religion at first hand.

Samuels (2007) writes about the many struggles she went through growing up as an African-American woman in the mid-1900s. She overcomes these issues through the characters, books, and words. The book not only talks about Maya as an individual, but she writes on behalf of whole African American Women. She has published a series of five autobiographies. I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings, Gather Together in My Name, Singin’ Swingin, and Getting’ Merry Like Christmas, The Heart of a Woman, All Gods Children Need Travelling Shoes, A Song Flung Up to Heaven and Mom & Me & Mom are her autobiographies. Bloom (2019) says, “I think that this is part of the secret of Angelou’s enormous appeal to American readers, whether white or
black because her remarkable literary voice speaks to something in the universal American “little me within the big me” (pp.1-2). Particularly in her best book, *I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings*, Angelou achieves an almost unique tone that blends intimacy and detachment, a tone indeed of assured serenity that transcends the fearful humiliations and outrages that she suffered as a girl. Hundreds of thousands of readers have found in Caged Bird an implicit image of the resurrection of their innermost self, a fragment of divinity that transcended natural birth, and so can never die. The uniqueness of *I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings*, being an autobiography, it is not only identifiable with Maya Angelou being her thoughts and words but the Universal Americans. Angelou has contributed to literature by bringing out racism faced by African Americans and breaking barriers for women through her writings. Maya Angelou fearlessly scrutinizes the cultural stigma and her life’s details and creates an extraordinary fiction through her work.

**Alienation**

The German philosopher Hegel took Rousseau’s (2012) thought and declared that humans “live in a world shaped by his work and his knowledge, but it is a world in which man feels himself alien, a world whose laws prevent basic need satisfaction” (“Literary Themes Alienation.” Literary Articles, 2012). Hegel extends the ideas of Rousseau developing an argument that modern man will always feel and face his struggle of needs and his position in society, which results in the feeling of separation, detachment, and estrangement. Hegel’s idea of alienation was further echoed in the writings of Karl Marx, who is considered as one of the most influential thinkers of the concept. Marx's explanation of alienation was in terms of a state which exists with a condition that when things that should go naturally and together are kept apart. An earthly biographer, Angelou (1969) attains a unique quality that blends alienation and reconciliation. Maya Angelou writing on literature, like all her writings are characterized by originality as she has written by what she has felt, thought, realized, and her living experience. Her autobiography is a blend of a child’s perspective and an adult’s outlook. In this book, she confronts racism, sexism, violence, and loneliness.

**Methodology**

This paper is an in-depth textual analysis of Angelou's *I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings*, which focuses on alienation and debilitating displacement and estrangement. The autobiography elaborates on sexual abuse, racist discrimination, and the knowledge of her origin. This paper aims to study the manifestation of different characters and their struggle that is very frantically linked with alienation, results directly from the real-life struggle. Many of them have a feeling that disconnects them and they are instantly detached from other human beings, and with the primary institutions of the society, which can help us to grow and shape ourselves. Although alienation is mostly a negatively powerful force that can drive humans in a very negative realm surrounded by the ideas and impulses of self-pity, violence, and vulnerability but here in Angelou's case this has served as a way of self-introspection as well as build a path to intellectual freedom.
Analysis and Discussion

Family Disengagement

The book opens with family separation. Maya and her brother Bailey were sent by their parents to live with her grandmother after their parents end their calamitous marriage. This feeling of displacement started early on in her life. She feels vulnerable for most of her childhood. She does not have a sense of belonging, being a black girl, growing up in a segregated American South. Being uprooted and sent away from her parents, Maya has trouble feeling that she belongs nowhere, and she has “come to stay.” Her displacement and feeling of being abandoned stems from her family. This separation is always damaging to the well-being of children. The sister and brother embark on a journey by train under the custody of a porter, who abandons the children but tags their wrist with instructions “to whom it may concern” and not addressed to Annie Henderson. Stamps is thoroughly segregated. Here Maya feels she barely knows what white people look like. The autobiography shows not just geographical distance, but emotional and psychological spaces as well. Social distance gives rise to neglect, fear, loneliness, hatred, distrust, and feelings of guilt especially for a child, who has been destitute of parental warmth, and the feeling of “home” is missing. The child has good reasons to feel he's cut off and feels he's strongly neglected. As his/her parents are not part of his/her daily life, the child may feel that they detest him/her and start questioning their birth. This explains why Maya is distant from her father, whom she regards as a stranger, and she is indifferent towards him, and his words mean nothing to her she said, “He was so unreal to me I felt as if I were watching a doll talk” (I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings, 1969, p.56)

For Christmas, Maya and her brother get gifts from their parents. The gift is a blond, blue-eyed China doll. It tortures the children, and they blame themselves for their rejection. They feel isolated from their parents. When their father Big Bailey comes to visit them in Stamps. Maya regards him as a stranger. He does not stand up to her expectation as he owns a car; he speaks, like a white man. She describes him as “blindingly handsome.” The seven-year-old Maya says” her world was humpty dumptied never to be out back together again”. He drives them to their mother. Even her mother’s striking beauty is a shock to her. She says, “My mother’s beauty literally assailed me” (p. 59). Family split is the hardest taken by children. She is not happy with her mother but tries to engage herself in the alien city of St. Louis. The place is chaotic, exotic, and loud.

Like the whites, Maya fails to understand her father as well. She says, “he sounded more like a white man than a Negro. Maybe he was the only brown-skinned white man in the world” (Angelou, 1969, p. 58). Another disastrous relationship is with her mother she says going to their Mother appears to Maya as going to ‘Hell’ (Angelou, p. 59) and their father is the “delivering devil” (Angelou, p. 59) who is taking them there. Seeing the beauty of their parents a strange feeling arises in Maya’s mind. She starts feeling that she is not their daughter as she does not resemble them. As Bailey looks like their parents, probably he is the only child of Big Bailey and Vivian Baxter. Now her dearest brother, whom she loves the most in the world and with whom Maya has shared the pain of being “unwanted children” (Angelou, p. 60), has got his parents, but
Maya still feels displacement and alienation in her heart. Maya never comes out of this belief that she is not beautiful like her parents or brother. Maya’s not so handsome features distance Maya from her parents and, also intensify her loneliness.

**Self-scuffle**

Her appearance and the sense of not belonging with anyone or anyplace have a negative effect on her from a very young age. She dreams that one day she will wake up out of her ugly black dream, and she would be white with long blond hair and blues eyes instead of the unattractive “negro girl, with nappy black hair, broad feet, and a space between her teeth that would hold a number two pencil” (Angelou, 1969, p.3). She equates beauty with being white. She grows up with this notion as Als (2020) observes that Angelou's witnessing of the evil in her society, as directed towards Black women, shaped Angelou's young life and informed her views into adulthood.

**Racism and Resistance**

There are many instances where Maya feels indignation, humiliation, and helplessness. The terrorization of the black community can be seen when Maya describes Willie, the crippled son of Annie Henderson was made to hide in the potato and onion bins in case the white mob comes looking for a victim to lynch. The second incident in the book is about the three girls who visit Mommas Store. The white girls mock her by copying her gestures. Maya describes them as “dirty, grimy, and snotty-nosed girls.” All Momma does is hum the gospel without saying anything to the girls.

Meanwhile, Maya is in rage and tears. Momma turns out to be stronger by demonstrating her maturity. She does not retreat inside the Store or stoop to the level of the girls’ terrible behavior. But she stands her ground and refuses to be displaced physically or emotionally. Mommas and Maya's victory lies in the fact that they are neither dirty nor insolent.

Her identity, her name, is robbed when she takes up a job in Mrs. Cullinan’s place. They start calling her Mary. She chooses to change it according to her convenience. Her renaming constitutes a racial displacement. Maya feels enraged. She knows she would not be allowed to quit. So, she starts lacking in her work and finally decides to break Mrs. Cullinan’s expensive china making it look like an accident. Mrs. Cullinan drops her politeness and insults Maya. Maya cannot take this naming while she could not revolt against it. So, she finds a subversive form of confrontation.

Maya tells about numerous instances of subtle black resistance to racism in her book. The black southern church is an avenue for rebellious resistance. The preacher in the sermon criticizes the whites without naming them. His attack against greedy, self-righteous employers is actually an attack on white farmers for paying miserable wages to black field labor. Movies and other popular culture of the 1930s spread dreadful condescending racial stereotypes of blacks. But Maya’s secret joke, in the movie theater, allows her to be a winner in the battle against the movie’s negative
portrayals of black people. Maya laughs and mocks Kay Francis’ movie because the white actress is loved by the white audience who looks like her mother, a black woman. Maya delights in this irony; Bailey agonizes with a yearning for his mother. Just seeing her likeness makes him miserable. These opposite feelings between the brother and sister eventually create a distancing between them.

Maya feels empowered with these instances of resistance, but Maya knows this kind of resistance rarely affects great change, even within her African-American community. Instead, such resistance often tends to protect the blacks from dying in the desperation and despair that surrounds them. Maya’s description of Joe Louis’s victory is an empowering rejection of the negative stereotypes thrown upon blacks. Even after the victory, the desperate fact remains: Louis must bear the hopes and dreams of the entire black American community. White society prevents blacks from progressing in society. If a few black Americans who received little public attention for their achievements were successful in gathering public approval, they were considered role models and heroes such as Louis, who became the hero of the black community being looked upon for his strength.

Edward Donleavy insults the black community in his speech. The black community’s excitement over graduation comes from the fact that they have fought very hard to receive a very ordinary education. In Stamps, the graduating eighth grade and high-school classes conquer the burdens of poverty and racism to earn their diplomas. He brags about the improvements in the white school, aimed at increasing the opportunities for white students. Donleavy feels the students and their parents should appreciate him for his wretched efforts. The black children bow their heads and are forced to think that they should not value their education and their graduation. Maya says Donleavy “exposed” them. She feels disgusted and angry. Even Henry Reed's speech cannot pull her out of the disgust she feels for the whites.

In the graduation chapter, there is demeaning by a white person, when he tells the black audience of all the development and progress which the white school will receive—improvements that far surpass that of the black schools. This is Maya’s first response of humiliation and anger: “Then I wished that Gabriel Prosser and Nat Turner had killed all white-folks in their beds” (Angelou, 1969, p. 152), shared now by the community: “[T]he proud graduating class of 1940 had dropped their heads” (p. 152). Then there is the action on the part of a member of the black community—Henry Reed’s improvised leading the audience in “Lift Ev’ry Voice and Sing” (p. 155)—that at the same time avoids a permanent conflict with the white oppressor and permits the black community to feel its dignity and superiority: “We were on top again. As always, again. We survived” (p. 156). But the Negro national anthem makes Maya realize the hard work put in by the blacks for the opportunity she has got. She feels pride in being a part of “the wonderful, beautiful Negro race.”
Another incident is in the dentist’s chapter, where Maya and her grandmother are insulted by the doctor. Momma takes Maya to Dr. Lincoln, whom she had helped financially by lending him money in his time of need, interest-free. But he refuses to attend to Maya. Maya thinks Momma is brave and has brought Dr. Lincoln to his knees, but in reality, Momma compromises with her morals to extract money from Dr. Lincoln as he had refused to treat Maya's tooth. “[M]y policy is I’d rather stick my hand in a dog’s mouth than in a nigger’s” (p. 160). In this chapter, we see resistance from Momma. Momma knows she is at fault. Maya’s dire situation pushes Momma to demand interest. Dr. Lincoln's ingratitude and the racial refusal to treat Maya are humane. He does not realize the generosity of a black woman (Momma) who saved his practice with her money. The passage in italics is Maya’s imagination of Momma transformed into a superwoman. Momma and Willie laugh about the incident. Blacks justify their illegal actions because they are forced by necessity and the way, they are treated by whites.

Rape

Maya now knows what a family is like, but soon, she is lost again when Mr. Freeman, her mother’s boyfriend, molests her and later rapes her. After the incident, Angelou could not comprehend what she had experienced. Mr. Freeman stops her from telling anyone about the incident, or else he would kill her brother. Being eight years old, she obeys her mother’s boyfriend. She feels miserable and in pain after the incident. As Jacobs (1994) observes, In this retelling of the rape, Angelou reconstructs the child self who simultaneously experiences the suffering of the victim while responding to the remorse of the victimizer. Immediately after the assault, the perpetrator is [. . .] asking that she, the abused child, understand that he did not mean to hurt her [...]. In that moment of awareness, the physical and emotional boundary violations converge as the child feels both her pain and the pain of the abuser. Empathy is thus engendered under conditions of sexual violence. (p.62)

Her behavior changes as the incident have a great impact on her. Herman (1992) remarks, that traumatic events "shatter the construction of the self that is formed and sustained in relation to others", and "cast the victim into a state of existential crisis” (p. 51). But she ends up telling her brother about the abuse. After the incident, Angelou stops speaking completely because she believes Mr. Freeman died because of what she has spoken; her mouth would utter “something that would kill people randomly.” Her guilt-ridden response to Mr. Freeman’s sexual assault reveals that she has not adjusted well to her parental abandonment and life of isolation. She confuses Mr. Freeman’s sexual assault. She believes, she has done something wrong because he threatens to kill Bailey. She is a child looking for affection. When Mr. Freeman ignores Maya for weeks, she feels rejected. She does not even want to confront herself that she is raped. Herman (1992) explains childhood sexual trauma survivors,

face the task of grieving not only for what was lost but also for what was never theirs to lose. The childhood that was stolen from them is irreplaceable. They must mourn the loss of the
foundation of basic trust (p. 193). "means she has at her disposal are frank denial [. . .] and a legion of dissociative reactions" (p. 102).

Here blacks suffer from racism and oppression but being humans; they can also infect suffering on the other people. Mr. Freeman takes advantage of Angelou’s innocence. Maya feels Bailey has grown apart, yet he remains the closest and most important person in her life. He pushes her to disclose the identity of the rapist. She reveals her rapist’s identity. She knows Bailey will not betray her trust. He never blames her for the rape. Even after returning to her grandmother, Maya's silence regarding the rape persists. She continues to carry her unarticulated burden of guilt. She isolates herself in the library. From the books, she understands that women cannot be heroes. She wishes that she could be male.

Maya moves to San Francisco. She attends a school without racial segregation. She takes interest in drama and dance along with her other subjects. This city seems to be continually changing compared to Stamps because of the war. It is here Maya finally feels at home.

She has insecurities about her sexuality as she feels boyish. This caused her to think she is a lesbian. To check this out, she finds herself a boyfriend. This experience is life-changing. She not only finds out that she is straight but ends up being pregnant. Vivian supports and encourages her without any questions asked. She gives Maya the most crucial advice about trusting her motherly instinct. Vivian is admired in this book for her strength, caring nature, and honesty.

Conclusion
Maya is a young black woman who suffers from a universal struggle of being an adolescent, along with being colored and a female. She had learned to survive in the most challenging conditions and is trying to liberate “herself” from “herself” because of her color and physical appearance. She feels displaced and lost because she is forced to move from one place to another because of her parents. Her parents leave her, her mother’s boyfriend rapes her, she is separated from her grandmother, she is completely lost. Her writing depicts a real picture of injustice, segregation, violence faced by Afro-Americans. It is a harsh criticism of the plight of the colored and how society oppresses and excludes them for their basic rights. While going through this process, she develops into a unique being challenging the existentialism of being and emerges a stronger individual defining her limits and standards. Her incessant struggle to carve her niche finally comes to a standard serving as a beacon of African American rights in its own respect and ushering a new era in the rights of the feminist movement. Angelou’s, I Know Why a Caged Bird Sings overflows with signs of alienation, and disaffection.

About the Authors:
Qudsia Zaini is a lecturer at King Khalid University, Abha, Saudi Arabia. She has a Master of Arts degree in English Literature, a Bachelor of Arts with Honors in English Literature, and a Bachelor of Education in English. All the degrees were awarded by Aligarh Muslim University,
India. Her fields of interest are Postcolonial Literature, Literary Criticism and Theory, Women’s Literature, and Teaching of English. Orcid ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6228-7316

Mohsin Hassan Khan obtained his Ph.D. from Aligarh Muslim University, India. He has been working as an Assistant Professor at King Khalid University Abha, Saudi Arabia. His research interests include Postcolonial Literature, Indian Writing in English, and Literary Theory. Orcid id: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0125-3854

References:
Evolution of Creation from Mythology to Reality: A Multidisciplinary Study into the Roots of Shelley’s Frankenstein and Ahmed Sa’adawi’s Frankenstein in Baghdad

Karzan Aziz Mahmood
Applied Languages, Literature, and Translation
Jaume I University, Castellón De La Plana, Spain
&
English Language/ College of Languages
Komar University for Science and Technology
Sulaimaniyah, Iraq

Received: 12/19/2020    Accepted: 1/24/2021    Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Shelley’s Frankenstein has been considered a literary masterpiece since its publication. Saadawi’s Frankenstein in Baghdad is similarly a work of great significance that won the International Prize for Arabic Fiction in 2014. Since its release, the name ‘Frankenstein’ attached to Baghdad, as a novel title in the mid of the American occupation of Iraq (2005) and its connection to a universal Frankenstein, has been inspiring to the Iraqis and world fiction lovers. What remains essential about this fascination among the readers is in the questions of how and what is the connection between both works. Therefore, this paper attempts to discover the roots of the concept of creation behind Shelley’s Frankenstein in 1818 and Ahmed Saadawi’s Frankenstein in Baghdad in 2013 from mythology, theology, science, and political reality of Iraq. Besides, the linear evolution in the concept of creation throughout the mentioned areas will be displayed to unfold the origins that lie behind these colossal novels. Understanding that lineage development in the concept and the disputes around it is of great significance to the reader which can empower them to contextualize the novels since apprehending new context is a vital factor for appropriation and intertextuality. As long as there are creators and creatures as the two sides of the same process of creation, therefore, the mentioned concepts will always be discussed throughout this work; including the punishment that both protagonists suffer from as one common consequence.

Keywords: creation, Frankenstein in Baghdad, Frankenstein, mythology, reality

Introduction

This *Frankenstein* permeates a broad heterogeneous history of various disciplines for its origins. In addition, creation which is one of its central themes is rooted in a far history that dates back to the Sumerian and Babylon myths and passing through the Greeks to the modern era. What is captivating about the text is that Shelley’s work (1818) appropriates as early as from the title of the novel ‘Frankenstein, Or the Modern Prometheus’ from pre-history and amalgamates it into her present time. The first word of the novel, which is also the overarching title, is a strange name ‘Frankenstein’ which has never been known by anyone before. Alongside this an unidentifiable name, the author ascribes a short description to the title ‘Modern Prometheus’, which, indeed, is not a favor to assist the reader but essentially part of the title. The word Prometheus can be instructive and alleviative to the reader besides a never-heard name with a horrific image of a giant scary monster on the cover.

In such circumstance, one may find himself stuck in a point that cannot be recognized as either past or present. From the Greek mythology, it becomes familiar that Prometheus tricked the God Zeus by stealing fire and giving it to humans. Then, Zeus decided to impose never-ending ferocious kinds of punishment on him. At the start of the novel, the main question is how this Prometheus can be modern or, more vividly, born again? From such a connection between the classical and modern Prometheus, history becomes one of the main fields or lenses to see the work through from the beginning to the end. In immersing into the novel, one can find that this text is centered on modern science or scientific advancements with roots and origins from mythology and theology that make it incomprehensible without them.

On top of that, what is more stimulating is another novel, authored by Ahmed Saadawi, an Iraqi novelist, titled *Frankenstein in Baghdad*, published in 2013 and winning the International Prize for Arabic Fiction in 2014. Again, it is evident from the title that this could be an appropriation of the Prometheus but an appropriation of the modern Prometheus, not the classical one, whose central word/name in the title ‘Frankenstein’ is derived but regenerated in Baghdad. In Baghdad, Frankenstein is animated in a setting that is not skeptical of the danger of modern science and politics and harshly criticizes the entire political scene after the United States’ invasion of Iraq, a combination of political interests, technology, and the destruction of the country and its population. From the ashes of the war or the military intervention waged by the U.S. and its coalition forces, a creation or a new Frankenstein, in the hands of merely a drunkard junk dealer, is born to put an end to the atrocities and conflicts to realize justice and equality. The events take place in 2005 of Baghdad, the capital city of Iraq, which becomes the most dangerous city of the world for explosions, terrorist acts, sectarian violence, and Western military intervention. As a result, mythology, theology, science, and political reality become the cornerstones or the origins of both Frankenstein/s; hence, the works become relatively unfathomable unless their roots are unfolded; and this is the task that this paper sets to itself concerning the conception of creation with creator, creature, and punishment.
Literature Review

The concept of appropriation and adaptation was first coined after the theory of intertextuality has been formulated by Julia Kristeva and Mikhail Bakhtin. In *The Oxford Handbook of Adaptation Studies* edited by Thomas Leitch, Dennis Cutchins believed that:

“One of the questions faced by scholars and students of adaptation is what “adaptation” means in the light of intertextuality. Because an adaptation approach requires that we focus attention on the relationships every text has with other texts, it is in some ways the ideal application of the concepts of intertextuality (Leitch, 2017, p. 71).

Kristeva, for instance, states vividly that “a text is a permutation of texts, an intertextuality in the space of a given text, in which several utterances, taken from other texts, intersect and neutralize one another” (Allen, 2011, p. 11). Furthermore, Bakhtin contended that:

“The word in language is half someone else’s. It becomes ‘one’s own’ only when the speaker populates it with his own intention, his own accent . . . adapting it to his own semantic and expressive intention. Prior to this moment of appropriation the word does not exist in a neutral and impersonal language . . . , but rather it exists in other people’s mouths, in other people’s contexts, serving other people’s intentions: it is from there that one must take the word, and make it one’s own . . . . [But] expropriating it, forcing it to submit to one’s own intentions and accents, is a difficult and complicated process (McKeon, 2000, p. 349).

Therefore, Bakhtin’s concept of appropriation is of great significance in its consideration for the potential influence upon the dynamic evolution of man’s imagination and conceptualization. This, in result, will lead to the development of discourse abilities for the expansion of various features that enable one to utilize diverse forms, words, themes, and content in other genres and situations (Lensmire, 1994, p.412).

More specifically, in her outstanding work titled ‘Adaptation and Appropriation’, Julie Sanders contended that appropriation is substantial in the sense that it often is a fundamental departure from one text to another which becomes either a novel cultural artefact or dwells in a different discipline (Sanders, 2015, p.26). Moreover, the new journey may not be a generic transformation from the previous one but could be against the readers’ primary or central text. She, besides, stated that “But the appropriated text or texts are not always as clearly signalled or acknowledged as in the adaptive process. They may occur in a far less straightforward context than is evident in making a film version of a canonical play” (Sanders, 2015, p.26).

Concerning Shelley’s *Frankenstein* and Saadawi’s *Frankenstein in Baghdad*, this paper presents the strong tie that combines them based on appropriation. This first examination of both novels in that light endeavors to prove that the latter appropriated the former and the former from myths and the religious manuscripts. The line of development, in this work, is traced one after the
other from the notion of creation into the appropriated mythological, theological, scientific, and political origins.

**Discussion**

**Mythological Roots of Creation**

As the oldest epic of the world, Gilgamesh dates back to the Sumerians for at least a millennium B.C. The story is most famously known for its revolt against death or its strife for immortality. It is not a coincidence that Gilgamesh starts his journey to reach eternity after witnessing his friend, Enkidu's challenging death. In the beginning, Enkidu is created by the gods as the counterpart to halt Gilgamesh, the king of Uruk, who had famously underway tyrannizing his people (George, 2000, p. 1). From this, it becomes evident that Enkidu was created to put an end to Gilgamesh’s sovereignty and tyranny upon his people. Contrary to what was planned, they became intimate friends, and then death, as punishment, from the gods had to be imposed onto one of them depending on Gilgamesh and Enkidu’s choice. Then, Enkidu chose it and died. His death becomes a prolonged haunting trauma on Gilgamesh. Therefore, he abandons his power to wander in, till his demise, for immortality (Tigay, 2002, p. 4).

This story can be divided into two parts; before and after the death of Enkidu. It means that Gilgamesh has not experienced the death of an intimate person to him in his past time, and his later life after Enkidu’s death was haunting him forever into a long journey to the forests, deserts, and mountains. In his scientific endeavors, Doctor Frankenstein is believed to pursue and complete the project of immortality or the animation of the dead, which has lingered and preoccupied man for the last few thousand years since Gilgamesh's epic. From this perspective, Yuval Noah Harari, the living Israeli historian, calls Shelley’s *Frankenstein* scientific mythology because the animated creature goes astray and confronts man; through this message, such scientific creators are warned not to play god. Furthermore, Harari contends that Frankenstein opposes Homo sapiens since: “The pace of technological development will soon lead to the replacement of the Homo sapiens completely different beings who possess no only different physiques, but also very different cognitive and emotional worlds” (Harari, 2015, p. 462). From this perspective, *Frankenstein* is remarkably relevant to the myth of Gilgamesh in terms of raising the question or concern of immortality or creating a superior being. Westfahl, G., & Benford, G., V. Hendrix, H. V. Alexander, in their introduction, argued that:

Victor Frankenstein – in wanting not only to rejuvenate aged flesh but to reanimate the flesh of the deceased – goes a good deal further in *Frankenstein*; or, The Modern Prometheus (1818, 1831) than the plot of Gilgamesh, yet the impulse is the same: the preservation of something in the flesh that does not die, that is not merely mortal (Westfahl, 2020, p. 68).

Furthermore, mythological interpretations or fears of the supernatural, gigantic and monstrous creatures have been at work in the human environment, including man's quest for survival on earth and their interaction and conflicts with other forces within nature. Colavito
(2008), for instance, believes that the parts or scary features of the monsters were generated from human reality as he argued:

Early humans encountered gigantic animals, such as the woolly mammoth or Gigantopithecus, the ten-foot-gorilla-like creature, both of which died out at the end of the last Ice Age ten thousand years ago. Memories of these monsters filtered down through the ages, and bones of these beasts, and even the long-extinct dinosaurs, may well have given rise to mythologies early monsters (p. 9).

Both Shelley and Saadawi, in their novels *Frankenstein* and *Frankenstein in Baghdad*, benefit from those notions that spin around the mythological inspections of creation such as the creators and creatures’ characters, the infringement of one’s limits such as interfering the zone of the ‘Other’ (God or nature) by either seeking immortality, stealing fire, sparking life into the dead or collecting and amalgamating discarded body parts, and suffering intolerable punishment at the end as a consequence of the transgression.

The secondary title of Shelley’s novel ‘Or, The Modern Prometheus’ is highly indicative of a precedent Prometheus that heralds this modern one. He is the Greek mythological Prometheus. Frankenstein and the Greek Titan Prometheus are similar in stealing fire from Zeus to grant it to humans or steal secrets from god, which is the principle of life, and then contribute to humans through science. Greek Prometheus is one of the Titans and is well-known for being a trickster by sneaking fire from Zeus to give it to humans (Hesiod, 2006, p. 14). The modern Prometheus is undoubtedly derived from this because light and electricity, in Shelley’s work, are the sources of creating the creature by Doctor Victor Frankenstein.

Moreover, the creation of the Greek Prometheus was evil and the counterpart of Zeus. Simultaneously, Victor’s creation becomes a monster after he opposes the creator (Hesiod, 2006, p. 14). One of the interesting points of similarity is the punishment-revenge relation between creators. After Prometheus disobeyed Zeus, he had been severely punished by Zeus in the following way:

> With breakless, grievous chains he bound Prometheus, then drove
> Those chains into a pillar's midst so that he couldn't move,
> And set a broad-winged eagle on the wily one: it flew
> Down to eat his deathless liver, which always nightly grew
> Back from what the broad-winged bird that day had swallowed down. (Hesiod, 2006, p. 39)

The above lines, from *Theogony*, inform the reader that after Prometheus stole fire from Zeus, he had been chained to a rock. Later, an eagle was sent upon him to eat his liver endlessly as his liver was regenerating every night after it was swallowed by the huge eagle every day. This mythical punishment upon Prometheus is repeated in the modern Prometheus and Saadawi’s
Frankenstein as well, as Hadi, the junk dealer, is arrested and charged with violence and murders (Saadawi, 2017, p. 209). The modern Prometheus in Shelley’s Frankenstein is doctor Frankenstein who is punished repeatedly by the murders inflicted upon his loveliest people around him. Furthermore, in *Frankenstein in Baghdad*, Hadi, or the junk dealer who is the creator of the Whata-name, suffers the same penalty by losing his regular human face after his face was deformed. This distortion to his face will later transform him into being recognized as a horrific being and causes his arrest by the police eventually since his ugly face is confused with the monster’s ugly face. However, many people close to Hadi believe that he is not a murderer. Mahmoud al-Sawadi, for instance, knows that “this was just another massive mistake. They wanted to close the case in any way possible. It was inconceivable that this elderly man was a dangerous criminal” (Saadawi, 2017, p. 210). In the same way that Prometheus was punished forever by chaining him to a rock and his liver eaten by an eagle, Frankenstein loses his entire family. The anguish punishment was also so immense that he eventually regretted his pursuit of knowledge and conducting observations. Likewise, Hadi suffers at the end by losing his human face and being sentenced to life imprisonment by the Iraqi government (Saadawi, 2017, p. 210).

Light is one of the fundamental elements of the mythological conception of creation, impacting the novels. For instance, in Babylon mythology, Tiamat, the master monster (Lambert, 2013, p. 236) was considered evil, or the force of darkness is challenged by the god of light, named Marduk. Its defeat by the god of light is the defeat of darkness by light. These opposing forces of light and dark have played significant roles in mythology and impacted literary science fiction. In the selected novels, this is reflected in the power of lightning and electricity in Shelley’s *Frankenstein* to overcome the darkness of lifeless matter or the dark realm of death. In Saadawi’s *Frankenstein in Baghdad*, the creature returns to life from death because it intends to combat the darkness of the United States invasion, terrorism, sectarian violence, explosions, and the night of inequality.

**Theological Roots of Creation**

The battle between the virtuous and wicked forces, creator and creature, and punishment as a consequence of creation by man is benefited from in these fictions as creation, creator, creature, and punishment have been significantly utilized and appropriated with the impact of theological origins. As long as the creator creates beings under the laws of nature, which inherently bear the codes of creation too; therefore, doctor Frankenstein ardently desires to decode the laws and secrets of nature to be able to create a being, as he has stated:

> It was the secrets of heaven and earth that I desired to learn; and whether it was the outward substance of things or the inner spirit of nature and the mysterious soul of man that occupied me, still my inquiries were directed to the metaphysical, or in its highest sense, the physical secrets of the world (Shelley, 1992, p. 37).

For instance, in Shelley’s Frankenstein, the laws of nature like lightning in control of the divine
force and electricity in scientific creativity are amalgamated to produce someone mutually as natural as humans and as supernatural as the divine. This combination has been embedded by the natural philosophers of the period as a mixture of old concerns and discoveries as Anstey quotes Peter Harrison:

Three specific claims will be made: (1) that the emergence of the disciplinary category ‘physico-theology’ was an explicit attempt to address the issue of the place of theology in early modern natural philosophy; (2) that this category is analogous in certain respects to the ‘physico-mathematics’ inasmuch as both represent attempts to renegotiate traditional disciplinary boundaries; (3) that physico-theology resolved vocational tensions specific to this period concerning the extent to which it was legitimate for naturalists to be engaged in theology, and conversely, for clerics to be engaged in the study of nature (Anstey, 2005, p. 165).

In addition, in Cunningham’s view, natural philosophy, which is one of the significant evident impacts on Frankenstein, was created by the Christian scholars of the thirteenth century as a defense mechanism for Christianity towards the coming changes perceived as dangerous to religion. The pursuit of immortality could indeed be mythical or even ontological. In contrast, Shelley’s novel is a contemporary text that incorporates many scientific discoveries so that natural philosophy was concerned with those sciences. Therefore, Frankenstein’s concern of creation is tilting between theological and scientific beliefs and progressions.

The creator is exceptionally passionate and curious about his observation as any other scientist. However, he eventually becomes regretful of his project and its consequences, specifically, and of what knowledge can bring to humans’ lives. Sublimity, revenge, and horror of the creature are altogether the emblem of man’s fear to what danger may science lead man; or what punishment could await man in such scientific discoveries in the view of theology.

Creation, punishment, and the conflict between the characters in both novels are intermingled in ways that they can be perceived as the embodiment of theology in the concrete world. Ludwig Feuerbach, for instance, argued that “The task of the modern era was the realization and humanization of God – the transformation and dissolution of theology into anthropology” (Feuerbach, 1972, p. 3). This material alteration in the conception of creation and punishment into this concrete world is brought forth due to the scientific and technological advancements that have given excessive powers to man over nature; or in other words, it is the realization and humanization of theology. Once a scientific creation crosses the natural boundary, as Shelley’s Frankenstein indicates, it can be a threat to transgress the creator’s rein of control because the creator is bound with the natural laws, and his creation could be beyond or above the natural laws.

The idea of the natural law could demonstrate the conflict within the modern world as it exists between theological and scientific faiths. For example, the priests did not allow their bodies
to be dissected after their death. Therefore, the disintegration of their bodies, which was merely an act of anatomical segmentation, was perceived to be against God’s consecrated creation of humankind. Koveshnikov, in his *Human Anatomy*, states that:

the medieval period, which began after the Roman Empire (IV-XIV), was marked by the ultimate power of the Church and downfall of sciences and culture. The social system of the period was feudalism. In Europe, Catholic Church declared the dominion of galenism dogmatizing the works of Galen. The dissection of the dead bodies was forbidden (Koveshnikov, 2006, p. 30).

The theological interpretation could influence doctor Frankenstein’s enthusiasm for knowledge, scientific discovery and his punishment that after Eve eats the fruit from the tree of knowledge, she and Adam are punished by god by expelling them from the Garden of Eden. The Oxford Bible Commentary, in this course of the discussion, clarifies that:

In its conversation with the women (3: ib-5), the serpent asserts that God’s threat of immediate death for eating the fruit of the tree of knowledge (2:17) is a false one. The acquisition of the knowledge of good and evil (that is, of wisdom) will lead instead to the human pair becoming ‘like God’. There is truth in what the serpent says: eating the fruit does not result in immediate death, and although the man and the woman do not become wholly like a god since they still lack immortality, god fears that if they also eat the fruit of the tree of life, they will obtain full divine status (3:22). But the serpent fails to say it will be the actual fate. (Barton, 2001, p. 44)

After doctor Frankenstein suffers severely from the punishments inflicted upon him for the quest and pursuit of knowledge or the science of the Gods, he despairingly states:

Learn from me, if not by my precepts, at least by my example, how dangerous is the acquirement of knowledge and how much happier that man is who believes his native town to be the world, than he who aspires to become greater than his nature will allow (Shelley, 1992, p. 52).

**Scientific Roots of Creation**

Yuval Noah Harari, the living Israeli historian and scientist, in regards to Shelley’s *Frankenstein* as a science fiction novel and specifically in relation to its roots, states that:

this is why the Gilgamesh project is the flagship of science. It serves to justify everything that science does. Doctor Frankenstein piggybacks on the shoulders of Gilgamesh. Since it is impossible to stop Gilgamesh, it is also impossible to stop Doctor Frankenstein (Harari, 2015, p. 464).

Besides, the above argument that links the 1818 *Frankenstein* to the few thousand-year-old text of
Gilgamesh myth as a warning that might prevent and halt the scientific discoveries of the emerging progressive period since these novel innovations may pave the way to endanger the future lives of humankind. To Harari, the project of Gilgamesh is reproduced in Shelley’s novel in the light of the fear that the on-going advancements and human creations can introduce new and severe suffering and punishment to humanity.

Despite such a connection in terms of the theme of danger in human creation as transgression, it is more evident that Frankenstein as a text is born in an epoch that is replete with brilliant minds and inventions. Hence, the scientific reality of the prior centuries in which Frankenstein is born is more influential than a myth that dates back a few thousand years. Therefore, if this text manifests contradictory forces, it is within the reality between the old endangered beliefs and/or the new scientific alterations. For instance, Copernicus, Kepler, Descartes, Galileo, Newton, and Franklin are among those giant minds of the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries.

Charles Darwin’s father, Erasmus Darwin, 29 years before the publication of Shelley’s work, had released a famous work, The Botanic Garden, in which he clearly states that the earth was not created by God but originated from a volcanic eruption in the sun (Garfinkle, 1955, pp. 377-378). This perspective towards creating the earth is a secular and radical one that does not shake merely the mythological and theological creation theories but is also a merciless strike against the creation of man, its position, and its purpose in the world to the entire preceding assumptions.

Another remarkable breakthrough behind the novel is Franklin Benjamin’s discoveries in electricity half a century before Mary Shelley's birth. He had proposed a fascinating experiment in 1752 called the Kite Experiment as the following:

As early as November 7, 1749, or about three years after he had first seen a Ley den jar, Franklin concluded that lightning was a manifestation of electricity. He was then forty-three years old. In Letter V of his Experiments, he gives at length his conclusions. In sections 9, 10, and 11, he confuses phosphorescence with electricity while advancing views on the electrical origin of clouds. In paragraph 33 of the same letter, Franklin advances the concussion theory of rain and he might be regarded as the first of a long line of would-be rainmakers who seek to connect explosive waves with precipitation. I mention this matter here because he unquestionably had noticed the rain gushes after near lightning flashes (McAdie, 2020, p. 188).

When doctor Frankenstein was only fifteen years old and staying in Belrive at a house, he noticed a striking thunderstorm hitting a tree, and after the natural incident is complete, he perceived this:

And so soon as the dazzling light vanished, the oak had disappeared, and nothing remained
but a blasted stump. When we visited it the next morning, we found the tree shattered in a singular manner. It was not splintered by the shock, but entirely reduced to thin ribbons of wood. I never beheld anything so utterly destroyed (Shelley, 1992, p. 40).

Despite the intriguing experience at Belrive, he was acquainted with electricity discoveries. Still, a knowledgeable man of natural philosophy who accompanied him on occasion explained the incident with the lens of a new theory about electricity and galvanism. This man and the theory became a significant factor for a flashback as doctor Frankenstein states, “all that he said threw greatly into the shade Cornelius Aagrippa, Albert Magnus, and Paracelsus, the lords of my imagination” (Shelley, 1992, p. 40).

Once Victor Frankenstein’s absolute passion for the secrets of life emerges, he soon immerses himself into intensive self-study as a child, witnesses real experience when he is fifteen and leaves for university studies in the natural sciences when he becomes seventeen years old. In the introduction of one of his essential preliminary lectures at Ingolstadt University, professor doctor Waldman greatly impresses Frankenstein by stating that:

The ancient teachers of this science,’ said he, ‘promised impossibilities and performed nothing. The modern masters promise very little; they know that metals cannot be transmuted and that the elixir of life is a chimera but these philosophers, whose hands seem only made to dabble in dirt, and their eyes to pore over the microscope or crucible, have indeed performed miracles (Shelley, 1992, p. 46).

The progress in modern chemistry, physiology, physics, and mathematics was a new journey in natural philosophy as the secular sciences' birth. This is a strong indication that the bourgeois families whose sons did not have to work could undertake such studies in universities. Above all, this goes hand in hand with the British capitalist development in the middle of its industrial and scientific revolutions. It is precisely after the pertaining advancements to the revolutions that Karl Marx commences his criticism towards the capitalist system and Britain, particularly for its industrial revolution. Hesitation in the heart of Shelley’s novel regarding the inherent threat within the developing capitalism was the control of science in the advantage of capital and exploitation of the workers. From this perspective, the Marxist philosopher, John Holloway, interprets the British Frankenstein’s monster as capitalism that sucks the blood of the workers and endangers human lives. For instance, after Victor Frankenstein creates a being as an actual act of creativity, it becomes independent and eventually controls its creator’s life with his absolute exploitative power. For Holloway, this indicates to the entire mankind as the creator of capitalism and later being controlled and manipulated by the monstevity of its creation: capitalism (Holloway, 2010, p. 229). Regarding the danger of capitalism manipulation of science, David Harvey, the great living Marxist philosopher, contends that science is politically ideological (Harvey, 1974, 256).
War Roots of Creation

It is manifest from Ahmed Saadawi’s title ‘Frankenstein in Baghdad’ that he intertextualizes or appropriates Shelley’s Frankenstein. The main parts that are appropriated include the process of creation, creator and creature, guilt, innocence, and punishment in a way that benefits from mythology and theology, science, and the destruction of war. It could be said that the Iraqi author has revolutionized the original text for the following reasons. The protagonist is not a canonical doctor-like figure; contrary to Doctor Victor Frankenstein, who produces a creation scientifically, science has never been a concern of the junk dealer. Instead, he, Hadi, is merely a junk dealer or scavenger who combines the body parts of innocent blown up people and, with no clue of science, stitches them together. Frankenstein aims at sparking life into the dead or reanimating it. At the same time, Hadi solely intends to give a proper burial to the dead as a whole body and save them from being treated like rubbish by the government after they are torn up into the air by the terrorists as he states “I made it complete so it would not be treated as trash so that it would be respected like other dead people and given a proper burial” (Saadawi, 2017, p. 10).

The novel takes place in Iraq, Baghdad, and the mid of 2005. The U.S. invasion of the country in 2003 has turned Iraq, mainly the capital city Baghdad, to be the most dangerous place in the world. Jessica Stern at Harvard University and Megan K. McBride at Brown University argued that the American military intervention in 2003 was supposed to prevent Iraq from becoming the cradle for terrorism. Still, there have been seventy-eight terrorist assaults during the first year of the U.S. army in the country from 2003-2004. More shockingly, from their stay in the country from 2004-2005, the terrorist attacks have escalated four times to 302 assaults. In another article, How America Created a Terrorist Haven, in August 2003, Jessica Stern argues that “Yesterday's bombing of the United Nations headquarters in Baghdad was the latest evidence that America has taken a country that was not a terrorist threat and turned it into one” (Stern, 2003, p. 1). The charges against Saddam Hussein’s regime for having mass destruction weapons were proven mere accusations.

The U.S. war waged against Iraq had caused hundreds of thousands of victims. A unique survey conducted by the Iraq Family Health Survey Study Group titled Violence-Related Mortality in Iraq from 2002 to 2006 concludes that “in mid-2006 estimated that an additional 654,965 persons had died during the 40 months since the U.S.-led invasion, as compared with prewar numbers. This number included 601,027 excess deaths due to violence”.

This has entirely created a theatre of diverse violence and atrocities that have made Iraq a haunting nightmare of the world's collective unconsciousness. Explosions and bombs become common means of terrorist acts in the capital city, especially in 2005 which was one of the peaks. In such a threatening context, the author of the Iraqi Frankenstein working as a reporter for the Arabic BBC in 2005, visits one of the morgues in Baghdad where he witnesses a young man entering with a cry for his brother’s body just been killed in an explosion. In response, the morgue chief with a hand refers to a piece of a dead body, which is thrown in a corner, to be his brother.
After the dead man’s brother shockingly asks for the rest of his brother's body parts, the man in charge responds to him by saying that he can take whatever part to make an entire body for himself (Hankir, 2018). This novel culminates in transforming the theme of scientific creation to the destruction of war and the U.S. occupation of Iraq in particular. The first body that Hadi pieces it together reanimates one morning and flees. This creature then sets the task of realizing justice upon himself by killing all the guilty people. This nameless man, called Whats-its-name later, turns dangerous for the state and government as they cannot kill him. Eventually, its creator will be confused by the security forces for losing his human complexion and becomes as ugly as his non-human creation. Therefore, the same conception of punishment over the creator due to his creative act is utilized.

Saadawi’s Frankenstein is influenced by the other origins mentioned before. He borrows the same characters and engages with the salient themes of creation, creator, creature, punishment, guilt, innocence, and so on. The revolutionization of the text in terms of the roots includes many. Still, it climaxes in transforming the theme of scientific creation to the destruction of war and the Iraq occupation. The outstanding indication of this destruction in the novel is embodied in the character of Whats-its-name, whose body is a combination of the disintegrated parts of other peoples’ blown-up bodies and the disintegration of Iraq as a whole from the previous co-existing body.

Therefore, the absolute alteration of the creation concept in this novel in the American-Iraqi war zone is transforming into destruction and disintegration. In result, it produces another origin for the evolution of the conception of creation in the history of Frankenstein. This was, on the one hand, formed in England 1818 when the opposing forces of science and theology intersected, and Frankenstein in Baghdad in Iraq and the war destruction, on the other hand.

Conclusion

In the connection between Frankenstein and Frankenstein in Baghdad, the most striking point is perhaps about the question of how and what combines both works. To this paper, the examination of the concept of creation in light of appropriation and intertextuality has been the central tie which derives its origins from mythology, theology, science and reality as they are replete with such stories. In contrast, with the emergence of modern era, scientific discoveries and doctrines have begun replacing or doubting the old beliefs and foundations of creation. Shelley’s Frankenstein manifests the conflict between the power of supernatural creation and the developing science of the period that promised the fulfillment of all the previous dreams. Therefore, Shelley reproduces the ancient origins or roots of man’s transgression from the mythological and theological gods and embodies them with modern science's power. The transformation of Prometheus to the modern Prometheus, lightning to electricity, God as the divine creator, to Victor Frankenstein as the earthly creator are evident examples of those origins. While this Frankenstein is appropriated into Frankenstein in Baghdad, the same origins are utilised with modern war and destruction as another new origin to Frankenstein. This last Frankenstein is produced in Iraq and
precisely after the U.S. invasion of the country, which occasions its disintegration and turns it into bloodshed and terrorism. As a result, this paper unfolds the origins of Frankenstein/s in mythology, theology, science, and the destruction of Iraq by the U.S. military intervention.

About the author:
Karzan Mahmood obtained B A and M A in Iraq and the U K and is currently a Ph.D. student in Spain, all in English literature. His research interests include Romantic Sublime, Intertextuality, Appropriation, Literary Theory and Criticism, Marxism, and Postmodern Studies. He has been teaching English literature from Komar University for Science and Technology since 2016. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8860-5781

References


Insanity and Murder in Robert Browning’ and Robert Lowell’s Dramatic Monologues

Maha Qahtan Sulaiman
Department of English Language
College of Education for Women, University of Baghdad
Baghdad, Iraq

Received: 12/16/2020  Accepted: 2/12/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
The study aims at fathoming Robert Browning’ and Robert Lowell’s intentions of choosing the dramatic monologue as a means of exploring human psyche. Significantly, the themes of insanity and murder are not ideal from an esthetic perspective, but for Browning and Lowell it provides the key to probe into human character and fundamental motives. This study examines Browning’ and Lowell’s dramatic monologues that address crime and the psyche of abnormal men. Browning’ and Lowell’s poetry in this regard unravels complicated human motivations and delineates morbid psychologies. Their monologues probe deep down into the mind-sets of their characters and dissect their souls to the readers. The main character of each of Browning’s dramatic monologues, My Last Duchess and Porphyria’s Lover; discloses his true self, mental health, and moral values through his monologue in a critical situation. Ironically, each monologue invites the reader to detect the disparity between what the character believes the story to be and the reality of the situation detected through the poem. In Lowell’s The Mills of the Kavanaughs, the monologue is delivered by the victim herself. Yet, the fact that the poem reflects Lowell’s individual experience and trauma indicates that the monologue is delivered by the poet-victimizer as well.

Keywords: Dramatic Monologue, Insanity, Murder, Trauma, My Last Duchess, Porphyria’s Lover, The Mills of the Kavanaughs

Cite as: Sulaiman, M. Q. (2021). Insanity and Murder in Robert Browning’ and Robert Lowell’s Dramatic Monologues. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 201-209. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.14
In a letter addressed to Robert Lowell, January 1 (1948), Elizabeth Bishop wrote the following: “I re-read a little Browning & if that is the kind of poem he wants to do I think he should, too. How do you feel about Browning and why don’t the critics ever mention him in connection with you?” (Travisano & Hamilton, 2010, p. 23) Lowell replied to Bishop in another letter, January 21 (1948), stating his opinion regarding Robert Browning:

Browning had all the right ideas about material–new ones at that. But what does he do? Invents a language, ties himself up in metrical knots–often ingenious, but which have nothing to do with what he’s saying. Then all his cheap simplifications! He should have been the great poet of the 19th century, but he constantly amazes and never seems to get anything really right. I suppose his best are “Caliban,” “The House Keeper,” “Mr. Mudge,” “The Bishop Orders” and The Ring–this probably above all, if I could ever get through it. (Travisano et al., 2010, p. 25)

Lowell writes the same opinion regarding Browning in a letter addressed to George Santayana, February 2 (1948):

I think Browning had all the right ideas about what the poetry of his time should take in–people and time. But (this is presumptuous) how he muffed it all! The ingenious, terrific metrics, shaking the heart out of what he was saying; the invented language; the short-cuts; the hurry; and (one must say it) the horrible self-indulgence–the attitudes, the cheapness! I write strongly, for he should, with patience, have been one of the great poets of the world. Anyway, he was on the side of the angels a lot of the time. (Lowell, 2005, pp. 81-82)

However, Bishop’s note concerning the influence of Browning on some of Lowell’s poetry triggered me to write this paper. The study includes one of Lowell’s dramatic monologues, titled The Mills of the Kavanaughs, and two of Browning’s dramatic monologues; My Last Duchess and Porphyria’s Lover. All three poems are about unhealthy relationships and the psyche of abnormal characters. The current study attempts to explore the dramatic monologue in the context of insanity and murder to shed light on Browning’s and Lowell’s notion of madness as a theme in poetry.

Browning is juxtaposed with Lowell in regard to their dramatic monologues otherwise; Lowell is known as a confessional poet after the publication of his book Life Studies (1959); which had a marked influence on American poetry. Ironically, Browning had an opinion similar to that expressed in Tradition and the Individual Talent, where Eliot (1963) wrote: “Poetry is not a turning loose of emotion ( . . . ) it is not the expression of the personality but an escape from personality” (p. 29). Further, according to Sinha. (1994):

It must be noted that what Browning set himself against is the uninhibited exposure of personal feelings, and not objectified (however perfunctorily) affirmation of beliefs that would have some value for mankind in general. Browning’s contempt is reserved, not for those who revealed themselves through their poetry, but for those who made of poetry a
confessional rather than a dramatic art. To Browning this meant all the difference between
a concern for the self and its own point of view, and the higher concern of fitting the
infinite into the finite. (pp. 96-97)

Browning criticises confessional poetry in the sense that the confessional poet treats his art as a
trade rather than nourishment to the spirit. However, Browning composed his best poetry when he
remained in disguise.

Yet Lowell’s confessional poetry is closely linked to his mental illness and psychological
insanity, that “personal madness seemed to the poets an appropriate response to what Eliot called
‘the immense panorama of futility and anarchy which is contemporary history.’ Only disaster
could offer a new experience” (p. 13). Lowell felt he should pursue affliction rather than
consolation. He lurched from delusions to madness, and consequently ruined his marriages and
wellbeing. He used his mental breakdown as the basic material for his poetry, believing that this
makes his art more authentic. Lowell’s monologue chosen for this study is delivered by the victim
rather than the one who attempted to commit the murder. The monologue concerns the poet’s
manic depression and his attempt to strangle his first wife, Jean Stafford. This frightening
experience inspired Lowell to handle the inherently threatening feature of his temperament through
addressing it in his poetry. Ultimately this came to be known as his confessional poetry. Lowell
was destined by hereditary to carry out his family’s fate. His madness also became a reflection of
the intense hardship, agony, and traumatic stress of his generation and community.

Another important element that links Browning and Lowell together is that the former’s
techniques in writing poetry were far more developed than his contemporaries. The characteristics
of Browning’s poetry – the everyday idioms, speech accent, and verse-forms matching the
emotional situation of his characters – have become some of the salient features of modern poetry.
“Much of Eliot’s poetry and drama, indeed, is foreshadowed in Browning’s ironic use of the
persona. These various voices pre-echo those of Prufrock and of Pound’s Hugh Selwyn
Mauberley” (Willy, 1968, p. 91). Browning is the most modern of all the Victorian poets. He
predicted experiments in modern poetry.

Theatre had exerted a powerful and lifelong influence on Browning, yet his career as a
dramatist was a failure and he ultimately abandoned writing plays. Browning’s lack of success
was “due to the defect he shared with the earlier Romantics when they turned from poetry to
drama. All seemed unable to externalise the inner human conflict they attempted to portray”
(Willy, 1968, p. 6). Consequently, Browning concentrated on writing dramatic lyrics that revolve
around the conversation of one character in a critical situation. “This form was peculiarly suited
to the limitations as well as the strength of Browning’s natural gifts” (Willy, 1968, p. 7). Browning
was no longer obliged to deal with the conflicts of many characters or consider a suitable
denouement as the plot unravels on the stage. He addressed the psychological conflict within one
character rather than having to deal with the external actions of different characters of the play. This he achieved “by means of his acute awareness of sounds and the associations of words, and thus to make his statement indirectly” (Williams, 1967, p. 108). The dramatic monologue, also, satisfied the instinctive pull of his inclinations towards the dramatic rather than the lyric utterance. It offered an ideal vehicle for the exercise of his exuberant fertility of invention, his lively historical imagination – especially for the knowledge gained from his reading about unusual characters and passages from the past – and for the vigorous colloquial idiom and conversational speech-rhythms of which he made himself one of the great masters. (Willy, 1968, pp. 7-8)

Browning, however, “did not invent the dramatic monologue, which had been utilized by Chaucer and by Shakespeare, but he concentrated his poetic powers in its form to such an extent that he made of it something essentially his own” (Grosskurth, 1967, p. 13). The dramatic monologue differs from the soliloquy in that it requires the presence of a listener, and consequently the speaker selects his words to influence him. Unwittingly, though, the speaker unveils his deepest motives and desires to the listener and the readers of the poem. Therefore, the “dramatic monologue brings out the presentation of a situation more accurately and graphically because it is three dimensional, whereas the narrative poem is two dimensional” (Pandey, 2014, p. 3). The dramatic monologue, as a poetic expression, gave Browning the opportunity to explore human nature and drives without having to directly confront the reader with a moral lesson that may undermine the merit of his poem. In a letter addressed to Elizabeth Barrett, Browning writes the following: “You speak out, you,—I only make men and women speak—give you truth broken into prismatic hues, and fear the pure white light, even if it is in me” (Karlin, 1984, p. 5). Browning presents himself as a practical and experienced man who composes poetry about real life through adopting imaginary men and women. Their voices are compared to the ‘prismatic hues’, while the truth which Browning is attempting to present is ‘the pure white light’, that the reader is left to grasp from the poem.

The setting of Browning’s My Last Duchess is Renaissance Italy, and the speaker is the Duke of Ferrara. The Duke is negotiating with the emissary of the neighbouring Count, whose daughter he wants to marry. He cunningly conveys his message to the emissary while showing him his portrait gallery and a painting of his last Duchess. He aims at pointing out the flaws in the last Duchess’s character, so his future wife would avoid them. However, Browning’s aim of the poem is to demonstrate the difference between life and art, which the last Duchess true character and her portrait stand for respectively. The Duchess’s sense of being alive is strongly stated by the Duke:

Sir, ‘twas all one! My favour at her breast,
The dropping of the daylight in the West,
The bough of cherries some officious fool
Broke in the orchard for her, the white mule
She rode with round the terrace—all and each
Would draw from her alike the approving speech,
Or blush, at least. (Browning, 1949, p. 172)

The Duke was troubled by the reason of ‘the depth and passion’ in the Duchess ‘earnest glance’, which the painter had successfully reproduced in his painting. The Duke’s dignity and aristocracy prevented him from trying to correct her, so he – “gave commands; / Then all smiles stopped together” (Browning, 1949, p. 172). He had to kill her because he failed to subdue her vibrant nature. The Duke admires the picture of the Duchess, “painted on the wall / Looking as if she were alive” (Browning, 1949, p. 171), more than the real woman. He was unable to subdue her simple and innocent nature in the same manner that the statue of Neptune is ‘taming a sea-horse’. The Duke appreciates art, yet life is outside the scope of his appreciation. The moral values of the Duke are revealed through the monologue. The poem itself, however, contains no direct moralizing. The message of the poem is left to the reader’s understanding. The Duke’s character embodies unusual pleasure in art and severe ruthlessness. He is a Machiavellian Renaissance dictator and oppressor. On a different level, Browning’s engagement with a culture and history different than his own enabled him to indirectly attack the social and political debate of Victorian era in the United Kingdom. The Duke’s opinions regarding arts and women are Browning’s criticism of the darker aspect of Italy’s splendid Humanism that enclosed violence against women in the case of the poem in question. The poet questions the extent of truth in historical accounts; he shows the role of imagination and misapprehension in distorting historical facts. He also addresses the social structure of Victorian society in which men exploit and oppress women.

Another case study of abnormal psychology is addressed in Porphyria’s Lover, where the lover is destructive in his uncontrollable and obsessive thoughts. The lover experiences a moment of intense and unexpected passion, which causes an unforeseen deed. This ultimately brings the moment of crisis and self-revelation that lays his soul bare through the monologue.

The good-looking and inexperienced Porphyria, isolated from her lover due to his lower social rank, runs away from her home to join him on one tempestuous night. The dejected lover gives an account of the weather that night, which matches his inner turmoil before her arrival. The stormy night is a personification of demolition, anger, and malevolence. It damaged the elm trees and disturbed the still surface of the lake. Yet, unexpectedly, and amid the gloom and despair of the situation, Porphyria arrived at her lover’s cottage. Her arrival shut the cold out, literally and figuratively. She then took off her wet cloak, shawl, hat, and dirty gloves, untied her wet hair, sat beside him, and started addressing him. Her reaction to his silence discloses their intimate relationship. Porphyria acts according to what is expected of her: the submissive woman, willing to please her lover at any cost. This is Browning’s criticism of Victorian society, its social conventions, and expectations of women. The lover mentions that Porphyria told him that she came ‘through wind and rain’ and gave herself to him because she was “too weak, for all her heart’s endeavor, / To set its struggling passion free” (Browning, 1949, p. 282). This is a further emphasis on the way women were regarded in the Victorian era; pressured by social structures, weak, and completely under the control of men. The lover’s motivation resembles that of the
Duke of Ferrara. He experienced pathologic jealousy and nervousness of Porphyria’s exuberance. He looked into her eyes and was reassured that she worshipped him. His heart swelled with pride and he began figuring out how to maintain the love of the innocent and charming Porphyria forever. He decided to do so by strangulating her. He mentions that she passed away without the slightest pain: “As a shut bud that holds a bee, / I warily oped her lids: again / Laughed the blue eyes without a stain” (Browning, 1949, p. 283). The lover then loosened the string of hair from around Porphyria’s throat. ‘Her cheeks’, he reveals, blushed again beneath his passionate kiss. He continues describing his ruthless glee as he bore her deadhead on his shoulder for the entire night and pointing out that ‘God has not said a word.

Browning is indirectly criticizing the wickedness of religious institutions and society’s moral conducts that not only assault women but also encourage violence and crime against them. Through the entire poem, Browning is suggesting that the general difference between culture and barbarity and the alleged concept of normality and abnormality are slighter than we are willing to accept.

The issues of a violent and mentally ill lover are also addressed in Lowell’s *The Mills of the Kavanaughs*. The poem marks the beginning of Lowell’s mental illness, his ultimate rejection of Catholicism, and a turning point in his literary career. It paved the way for his next, more successful and ambitious book of verse titled *Life Studies*. This dramatic monologue, however, unlike Browning’s dramatic monologues, is delivered by the victim, not the victimizer. It is a yell of desperate, uncontrollable first-person speech of a woman whose husband was about to strangle her to death. Jean Stafford, Lowell’s first wife, tells a friend the occasion that inspired writing the poem. She mentions that while she was asleep, she dreamt of her former boyfriend. That night Lowell had wakened her up to make love, yet she—not fully awaked—uttered the name of her former lover. Lowell was blinded by fury and tried to strangle her. Ultimately, he loosened his grip on her throat and left the room. Lowell’s grave problems with his parents led to turbulent marriages, characterized by a nervous breakdown. Lowell’s tyrannical mother contributed to his emotional insecurity, and he consequently mistreated his wives in order to assault her. Lowell, however, “would brood hard and long over that night, writing it over and over as the central moment of his long poem, *The Mills of the Kavanaughs*, which he began work on after he and Jean were separated” (Mariani, 1994, p. 130). Lowell’s dramatic monologue is written from the wife’s perspective of the incident in an attempt to understand Jean’s feelings and opinion.

The monologue is preceded by two epigraphs, quoted from Mathew Arnold’s *Dover Beach* and William Carols Williams’s *In the American Grain*. Both show disappointment by the fragile bond between human beings and the lack of the potentiality for compassion and virtue. Congruent with the epigraphs, the monologue reflects the abusive words that both Jean and Lowell used to pour into their quarrels together. Jean’s “voice is unmistakably the voice he borrows for Anne kavanaugh. And the lines that Lowell’s Anne puts in her husband’s mouth seem
meant to exemplify the ‘calm olympian brutality’ which—according to Stafford’s repeated accusation—was Lowell’s actual posture at the time” (Hamilton, 1982, p. 184):

“Anne,” he teases, “Anne, my whole
House is your serf. The squirrel in its hole
Who hears your patter, Anne, and sinks its eye-
Teeth, bigger than human’s, in its treasure
Of rotten shells, is wiser far than I
Who have forsaken all my learning’s leisure

To be your man and husband–God knows why!” (Lowell, 2003, p. 80)

The poetry concerns a husband trapped in an unhappy relationship. During their marriage, there was a circulating story that Jean had an intimate relationship with one of Lowell’s friends. In this regard, The Mills of the Kavanaughs is about Lowell’s suspicions and Jean’s nervousness. According Al-Zwelef, marriage has been one of the most examined human establishments all through history. Modern poetry, however, mostly addresses the pain and desperation suffered after separation and divorce. In Lowell’s poetry, divorce is not only related to matrimony. Divorce could rather signify the separation of man from his self in mental illness, of the artist from society, of the private from the public, and most crucial is the twentieth century historical disintegration of the old cultural structures in the religious, moral, and political fields (p. 3).

The separation of man from his genuine self by mental disorder is related to the husband’s situation in The Mills of the Kavanaughs. The poem deals with the husband’s attempt to kill his wife, rather than to divorce her.

The poem’s central character, Ann Kavanaugh, is a widow sitting in her garden one afternoon. The place is Maine, in the fall of 1943. Ann “pretends that the Bible she has placed in the chair opposite her is her opponent. At one end of the garden is the grave of her husband, Harry Kavanaugh, a naval officer who retired after Pearl Harbor” (Lowell, 2003, p. 73). Harry had suffered from depression, anxiety, and mental disturbance after Japanese planes had attacked the naval base at Pearl Harbor in 1941. The monologue is delivered through the stream of consciousness technique and Ann is addressing her deceased husband. She recalls when Harry once tried to strangle her as he considered her cheating him by mentioning another man in her dream. Sadly, Ann was actually dreaming of making love with Harry the boy, and whom she prefers to the adult and imperfect man. Ann would then recall her husband after the incident sitting in the kitchen in the early dawn, bend down with confusion. The husband is grief-stricken, angry, and perplexed in response to his plight. After savagely attacking his wife, his hostility turns inwards. On a different level, in this private poem, “Lowell has as much difficulty forgiving his mother’s coldness, and her manipulation of his feelings, as his father’s weakness. He is able to
forgive his mother (. . .) in so far he can see her too as a victim (Williamson, 1974, p. 73). The voice in which Anne abhors Harry is the voice of Lowell’s mother speaking of her husband. The criticising female voice of the monologue echoes the poet’s uncertainty and despair. The son of the oppressive mother becomes cruel and aggressive himself.

The theme of insanity and murder in Browning’s and Lowell’s dramatic monologues reveals principle psychological truths about human nature. Both addressed the human psyche through characters reminiscing weird experiences. However, their dramatic monologues present realms of life other and wider than the human psyche. Browning presents insanity through fictional characters, while Lowell addresses it as a reflection of the mental health of the poet. Browning’s *My Last Duchess* presents a sadomasochistic Duke who tortures himself by not fully controlling the life and desires of the Duchess, orders her death. He is ravished by the brutal satisfaction of subjection. The Duchess completely belongs to the Duke only through her portrait. The dramatic monologue addresses the difference between art and life and between historical accounts and truth. The monologue of Browning’s *Porphyria’s Lover* visualizes the complicated mental process of a psychotic lover, who strangled his beloved and then sits placidly with her head on his shoulders. Browning is curious about the peculiarities of different human characters; in their thoughts, desires, motivations, and habits. According to him, knowing the true self requires confronting the shadowy side of our selves and the subdued side of society. Lowell’s monologue, however, is delivered by the victim herself. Nevertheless, the fact that it reflects the poet’s true experience with his wife makes it a study of the extent of the victimizer’s manic state and depression. From this perspective, and given the fact that the monologue is written by the victimizer-poet, it is an expression of the will to heal his mental state and rebuild his relationship with family and friends.

**About the Author:**

Asst. Prof. Maha Qahtan Sulaiman, Ph.D., teaches at the Department of English Language, College of Education for Women, University of Baghdad. Her major is English Literature. She received her Ph. D. degree from University Malaya, in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6994-987X

**References**


“Fuel Burns Mixed with Seawater”: The Relationship between the Refugee Tragedy and the Ecological Crisis in the Mediterranean Sea in Khaled Mattawa’s Mare Nostrum (2019)

Ashwaq Basnawi
Department of European Languages and Literature
Faculty of Arts and Humanities
King Abdulaziz University
Jeddah, Saudi Arabia

Received: 11/23/2020  Accepted: 2/3/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract

With environmental sustainability gaining more attention in contemporary literature, Arab-American poets have begun to focus on the connection between nature and current Middle Eastern and North African politics. Khaled Mattawa's fifth collection of poems, Mare Nostrum (2019), discusses the twenty-first-century refugee crisis in the Mediterranean through the effects of economics and environmental destruction on both humans and marine ecosystems alike. This paper aims to examine the Mediterranean migrant tragedy's entanglement with its ecological crisis in Mattawa's poems. The study seeks to answer the question: can an analysis of Mare Nostrum (2019) illustrate a parallel between humans' oppression and the environment? A postcolonial ecocritical lens can explore this connection by looking at the "changing relationship between people, animals, and environment . . . that can be recuperated for anticolonial critique" (Huggan and Tiffin 12). The study's significance exists in showing the destructive impact of political crises that extend beyond human displacement to become an ecological issue that threatens marine ecosystems. The study's findings reveal that Mattawa's poems illustrate that the environmental and humanitarian crisis in the Mediterranean is a result of both economic and political instability.

Keywords: Arab-American literature, Khaled Mattawa Mare Nostrum, marine ecosystem, the Mediterranean refugee crisis, nature, postcolonial ecocriticism

Cite as: Mu'in, F. (2021). Developing Language Skills and Building Characters through Literature. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 210 -224. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.15
Introduction

Khaled Mattawa (1964-) is a translator, anthologist, educator, and a MacArthur Fellowship recipient who immigrated to the U.S. in his early teens. Interest in poetry came out of his experiences of living in exile and feelings of homesickness, which he expressed through verse. Mattawa has published six collections of poetry. His first and second collections *Ismailia Eclipse* (1995) and *Zodiac of Echoes* (2003) are lyrical critiques of the different kinds of repression Americans and Arabs face daily. On the personal side, these collections depict the complex relationships between native language and place in constructing the diasporic identity. Hassan (2006) notes that Mattawa's writing is "evocative of the difficult negotiation of attachment and distance produced out of filial ties to the Arabic language and Arab places" (pp. 135-136). Also, Mattawa's third collection *Amorisco* (2008) returns to Libya for a personal and political lyrical exploration of a country affected by a history of imperialism and current political strife. *Tocqueville* (2010), his fourth collection, moves away from the lyricism of his earlier collections to criticize Americans' "implicatedness" in enjoying "the vulnerable privilege of a first-world existence on a planet in political, economic, and ecological crisis" (Metres, 2010). This collection takes a step further towards the political and ecological dialogues that his more recent publications would present.

In addition to his poetry, Mattawa connects to the Arab world through his Arabic poetry translations. He explains that his translations aim to situate Arabic poetry in the English poetry canon by bringing "the Arab experience or issues in Arab life (…) into American English." There is also the additional benefit of helping him to formulate his voice and "learn[ing] how to write modern poetry" (Stafford, 2014). Mattawa has also co-edited two widely cited anthologies: *Dinarzad's Children: An Anthology of Arab American Fiction* (2004) and *Post Gibran: Anthology of New Arab American Writing* (1999). He edits the *Michigan Quarterly Review* and has received many prizes and grants for his poetry and translations.

His fifth collection, *Mare Nostrum* (2019), draws parallels between his focus on the migration crisis in the Arab world and his interest in environmental degradation, raising awareness of the negative effect of politics and economics on the environment. Mattawa uses the vulnerable and volatile representation of the sea to draw attention to the particular tragedy of refugees crossing the Mediterranean and how this crisis plays into a larger narrative of political oppression and historical imperialism. His poems lament a region where politics exploit both humans and nature. Mattawa engages in this multicultural ecocritical conversation by attracting attention to the Mediterranean as a region ravaged by colonialism and environmental collapse.

Although Mattawa writes about current issues, such as refugee crises and environmental degradation, his work is understudied. Other than an early 2006 interview by Salah Hassan in *Multi-Ethnic Literature of the United States (MELUS)*, a 2020 interview by Hadji Bakara and Joshua Miller in *The Journal of Narrative Theory (JNT)*, and some articles in online magazines, no researchers have published on Mattawa's work. Both Amal Frag's "Khaled Mattawa and the Construction of National Identity in Exile" (2016) and Leslie Tramontini's "Sheltering the Longing in the Pain of the Words" (2011) write about the formation of Arab identity and culture in exile and the tenuous ties to the homeland presented in Mattawa's works. Although these studies explore essential themes in his earlier poetry, my paper aims to examine the connection between the Mediterranean's migrant tragedy and its marine ecological crisis in his collection *Mare*.
Nostrum (2019). This study has not been explored before by highlighting in Mattawa's poems the many functions that contribute to global conversations on migration and sustainable development of sea and marine resources.

This paper begins by situating the study within a postcolonial ecocritical framework to illustrate Arab American writing's contribution to multicultural conversations regarding the connection between environmental issues and social justice. It then highlights the colonial connotations of the title that were used by the Italians to claim the Mediterranean region. The analysis proceeds to analyze three pivotal poems from the collection in which Mattawa traces the tragic journey of the migrants from the start of the collection to the end. The trip begins in "Psalm of Departure" with those who pursue unrealistic dreams of delivery from ecological devastation and oppression with long waits by the shore and prayers. "Fuel Burns" graphically shows that human activities, represented by the boat fuel, jeopardize the existence of both humans and marine ecology as the migrants' skin melts when fuel from the canisters spills on them and pollutes the sea. The wild sea waves threaten the migrants' lives with drowning when seawater pours into the boat. "Psalm for the Departed" is an elegy and prayer for those who pay their lives for unattainable dreams. Through this trajectory, Mattawa suggests that the migrants' tragic lives have destined them for death, whether on land or sea.

**Literature Review: Ecocriticism in Arab-American Writing**

Ecocriticism, as prominent ecocritic Glotfelty (1996) explains, "is the study of the relationship between language and the physical environment (. . .) ecocriticism takes an earth-centered approach to literary studies" (p. xvii). With the rise of environmental activism, ecocriticism has become a useful lens to study nature's cultural perceptions in literary texts. As Glotfelty (1996) argues:

> in the future we can expect to see ecocritical scholarship becoming ever more interdisciplinary, multicultural . . . It will become a multi-ethnic movement when stronger connections are made between the environment and issues of social justice and when a diversity of voices are encouraged to contribute to the discussion. (p. xxv)

The link between the environment and cultural politics opens up pathways for approaching literature belonging to nations that have suffered from climate change, droughts, famine, plagues, and political turmoil, such as Middle Eastern and North African countries. An ecocritical perspective investigates these works' creative engagement with the political and sociological issues that impact their natural environments.

One challenge involved in reading Arab-American literature through ecocriticism is the perspective that the environment is "peripheral to political turmoil instead of embroiled in it," (Haque, 2019, p. 69). Yet Arab-American writers are drawn into creative and literary conversations about the environment. Nabhan (2016) describes that many Arabs are "climate refugees, from meteorological droughts and local plagues, or from political droughts, such as water wars or the export of peasant-grown foods to industrialized countries" (p. vi). Not only have these environmental conditions impacted people's livelihoods, but they have also inspired writers to engage with the issues that arise from them creatively. Middle Eastern scholars such as Sinno (2013) advocate for this movement: "the greening of modern Arabic literature is a legitimate
project, worthy of further investigation and integration into the growing ecocriticism scholarship in the USA and the world" (pp. 142-143).[ii] As such, ecocriticism is a useful approach through which researchers explore the representations of nature in the works of Arab writers, specifically in their portrayal of the migrants' relationship to nature and Arab writers' relationship to place.

Early comparative studies seek to introduce the multicultural U.S. writing into ecocritical studies by comparing the representation of nature and the environment in two works by Arab-American and Chicana women writers (Nolasco-Bell, 2013). The study looks at the protagonists' interactions with their environment from a cultural view. Two years later, Ismet Bujupaj (2015) read the poetry of Arab-American women poets using an ecocritical approach and finds that "debates of cultural identity" and representations of nature are not mutually exclusive; in fact, the study of "nature adds a deeper dimension to experiences already shaped by political and cultural contestations" (para. 2). In these works, nature acts as a spiritual force that consoles the migrants' nostalgic feelings towards the homeland and creates links between host land and homeland. A more recent article, "Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye's Works: A Vehicle for Creating Peace" (2017), draws on ecocritical theories to show that Naomi Shihab Nye's works depict nature "as a means for creating and sustaining peace and serenity" (Allani, 2017, p. 42). The paper highlights nature's role in settling political tensions between the East and West in Nye's poetry.

Due to the entanglement of politics with nature, writers connect people's oppression with the treatment of the environment. Huggan and Tiffin (2010) considered the convergence of postcolonial and environmental studies as postcolonial ecocriticism that addresses:

the need for a broadly materialist understanding of the changing relationship between people, animals and environment – one that requires attention, in turn, to the cultural politics of representation as well as to those more specific 'processes of mediation […] that can be recuperated for anticolonial critique.' (p. 12)

The writings of contemporary Arab-Americans engage with the "cultural, moral, and aesthetic issues surrounding the environment," as Nabhan (2016, p. vi) notes. Due to the different experiences of Arab-Americans, they approach their connection to the environment from various perspectives.

The latest postcolonial ecocritical reading of Arab-American literature, and the reading most relevant to this study, is Danielle Haque's "Water Occupation and the Ecology of Arab American Literature" (2019). Haque (2019) compares the threat of the Dakota pipeline to the Israeli occupation of the water in Gaza by analyzing the works of Laila Halaby, Rasha Abdulhadi, and Dawud Mulla. Her research gives an account of the marginalization of ethnic groups that "transform[s] them into peripheral citizens subject to state terror, and terminate[s] tribal and local sovereignties" (p. 66). Haque argues that human practices impact humans' relationship to land and water in the same way that water colonization affects the seas' ecology via countries' colonization. These recent studies on Arab-American literature use an ecocritical approach to explore the problematic representations of nature in Arab-American writings that are impacted by cultural and political views of the environment.

Nature in Arab-American poetry connects the present diasporic home with the former homeland. Poets use it to engage in reflective thought to overcome the spatial gap between these
two places. Arab-American poets such as Lisa Majaj, Naomi Nye, and Mohja Kahf depict the homeland's natural landscapes – Lebanon, Palestine, and Syria – as sites of remembrance, sources of spirituality, and chances for peace between East and West (Allani, 2017; Bujupaj, 2015). However, these writers do not explore the role of politics in displacing humans and exploiting the land. Khaled Mattawa, a prominent Libyan poet, approaches nature related to the migration crisis. His Libyan origins contribute to his focus on the political and ecological situation in the Mediterranean region.

*Mare Nostrum: An Ecological and Humanitarian Crisis*

The tragic destiny of the Mediterranean region and its inhabitants is caught up in its history of colonialism as represented in the title to the collection, *Mare Nostrum*. In a video entitled "Mare Nostrum: Lyric Documentation and the Migrant" (*Crisis/Flow*, 2018), Mattawa explains the historical and political significance of the phrase *mare nostrum*, Latin for our sea. This term, first used by the Romans, was adopted by the Italians in 2013 after the Lampedusa boat tragedy when 366 migrants from Africa drowned in the Mediterranean. The Italians revived the term to name a military operation conducted from October 2013 to October 2014 to stop or thwart the increasing flow of migrants from Libya and other African and Middle Eastern countries to European countries. This name's choice shows that the Italians tried to claim control over the sea and, by doing so, over the activities of people who used it.

In the early twentieth century, the Italians colonized Libya. As heirs to the Roman imperialism, the Italians laid claim to Libya as their fourth shore. According to Mattawa, colonization brought the following with it:

modern modes of administration, government, and systems of oppression. Before the Italians, Libya had been part of the Ottoman Empire for four hundred years. Although that regime was also oppressive, people had an allegiance to the Caliph and to the notion of a unified Muslim entity. Unlike the Turks, the 'modern' Italians wanted to confiscate land and inhabit it with their own people. (Mobility & Movement, 2018)

As Lovino (2017) explains, the negative connotation of "Mare Nostrum" stems from its impact on people of the global south, for whom the term is "a propriety expression where 'nostrum' clearly refers to a Euro-Atlantic collective of forces" (p. 7). In naming his collection *Mare Nostrum*, Mattawa is imaginatively reclaiming the Mediterranean region from a history of imperialism. Indeed, the recovery of colonized land starts, according to Edward Said (1994), "only through imagination" (p. 77). The collection of poems in *Mare Nostrum* is approached in this paper through an ecocritical reading of nature's treatment as impacted by politics and a close reading of various poetic forms.

Mattawa writes in multiple forms, in psalms, lyric narratives, songs, a blues poem, an ode, a dramatic monologue, an erasure, two Qasidas,[iii] a poetic journal, and an 'Allam.'[iv] This variety stands as a textured testament to the diverse narratives and multicultural experiences of the migrants. Mattawa identifies the theme and setting of migration from Arab Mediterranean countries in the first epigraph to the collection taken from Algerian singer Dahman El Harrach's famous song "Ya Rayah":

---

[iii] A poetic journal

[iv] An 'Allam' is a poetic form practiced in the Arab world, especially in North Africa. It is similar to a sonnet, with strict line counts and rhyming schemes.
Traveler, where are you heading?
You embark, take sick and return.
So many innocents like you and me
were duped and lost their way. (Mattawa, 2019, p. 4)

The song holds an iconic place in Arab migrant culture as it laments the suffering of the migrant in the diaspora due to displacement, alienation, and nostalgia for the homeland. It posits migration as a flawed solution for Arab migrants. Opening the collection with the theme of the "many innocents" who "were duped and lost their way" supports Mattawa's project of uncovering the painful and dark side of migration. The phrase "lost their way" suggests loss of home and identity, failure to return, or even worse, death. The word "embark," which hints that the means of transportation is by ship, leads into the second epigraph Mattawa uses, which he takes from Emily Dickinson's "How sick — to wait — in any place — but thine —":

Ours be the tossing — wild through the sea —
Rather than a mooring — unshared by thee. (Mattawa, 2019, p. 4)

With this second epigraph, Mattawa explicitly identifies the means of migration as being by "sea." As Dahman El Harrach does in his song, Dickinson emphasizes the dangers of traveling by sea. She uses the sea, which she describes as "tossing" and "wild," as a metaphor for extreme and unbridled love that can be dangerous to both lovers. Mattawa seems to have chosen this quote for its literal representation of the sea and its symbolic connotations. The metaphor allows him to present the journey over the sea as a deadly passion for migrants, who prefer those rough waters over "a mooring" in a place of safety and refuge. Paradoxically, however, the speakers of these two epitaphs take opposite positions in this saga. The speaker in "Ya Rayah" appears to be a wise native of the traveler's homeland who warns the migrant of the risks and dangers of irregular migration pathways; the speaker in Dickinson's poem, though also a migrant, romanticizes the journey, clinging to the dream of better prospects and work opportunities. Dickinson's poem's message is clear: a life without risk is not a life worth living. Thus, Mattawa presents two perspectives of the migrant experience: the realistic and the ideal.

The cover image of the collection was produced by the Tunisian-born immigrant Slim Fejjari (2011), who knows too well the long and challenging journey of migrants after surviving the experience before finding a home in Italy (see figure one). From a postcolonial ecocritical perspective, the illustration is a chilling depiction of the impact of politics and economics on humans' relationship with nature. The picture reproduces the theme of migration and its challenges in an art form. As depicted in the image below, an overcrowded boat of hopefuls braves its way across the tumultuous sea. The ship appears suspended in sea and time with any chance of rescue or salvation out of sight. The bird's-eye view of the ratio of the sea to the migrants captures "an omniscient viewpoint that leaves no room for intervention—the crowded vessel is dwarfed by the surrounding sea, whose waves curl like ferocious eyes around the tiny boat" (Zemel, 2018).
Figure 1. Erano come due notti (2011)

The aerial view also compresses the migrants on the boat into a single black bullet-shaped form, which creates an existential moment for the migrants that echoes Jean-Paul Sartre's (1956) concept of being-in-itself and being-for-itself. The in-itself being is unconscious, passive, and inanimate, while the for-itself is conscious, dynamic, and alive. As the migrants are stripped of their agency and become one with the boat, they are static beings-in-themselves, submitting to the sea's will. On the other hand, the sea's waves' ferocious movement portrays an omnipotent being-for-itself conscious of its threat against humans and in control of their destiny. This binary represents not only the imminent fate of the migrants but also their vulnerability.

If Fejjari's illustration denotes the universal dilemma of migrants, Mattawa's collection portrays the specific plight of migrants from the west and central Africa. The collection's trajectory reflects the route of the migrant's journey: the departure of the disillusioned, the horrific journey itself, and the obscure fate of the departed. Like the cover image, the poems end on a vague note with no refuge in sight.

The migrants' tragic narrative begins with "Psalm of Departure," which establishes the collection's bleak and sad tone. The verse, quoted here in its entirety, is set in Africa and highlights the theme of departure:

Locusts wrap the sun in gauze,  
the river swallows its banks.  
No pleasure but seeing the no-  
king crop here, the no-fields,  
a petrified forest where twins were slain.  
Someone will follow a bird.  
The work of fire never ends:  
Djinn build cities of mirage,  
the poor stand waiting by the shore.  
Signs made of stardust and spider  
thread. Any way you measure it,  
the difference will be a road. (Mattawa, 2019, p. 7)
The title of the poem evokes Hebrew prayers, as the entry for "psalm" in the *Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms* shows that "the term usually refers to the Hebrew verses in the biblical book of Psalms" (Baldick, 1996, p. 181). Together with "departure," the poem alludes to the Israelite's liberation from slavery and suffering, as stated in the Book of Exodus. The word "exodus" is used in many news articles and reports on Africa to denote the mass movement of migrants across land and sea and their dreams of deliverance. Namely, the first two tercets describe the harsh environmental conditions that constitute the main reason for leaving the island, and the second two describe idealized dreams of migration. Mattawa explains that the desolate African "environment is part of it, these places had become bereft of their source of living, with devastated economies" (Smyth, 2019). Foregrounding this poem at the start of the collection underscores the influence of the environment on migration.

Drawing on psalms' connection to biblical literature, the first line of the poem evokes the ancient plague of a massive locust swarm. Hundreds of billions of swarms like this ravage the crops of East Africa. The United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) calls these swarms "extremely alarming" and un "unprecedented threat" to the region. It reports that "[t]ens of thousands of hectares of croplands and pasture have been damaged in Ethiopia, Kenya and Somalia with potentially severe consequences in a region where 11.9 million people are already food insecure" (Food and Agricultural Organization, 2020).

In the context of dry environments and food shortages, locust swarms migrate in search of better resources, but the swarms devastate the vegetation and livelihood of humans as they travel; thus, an ecocentric reading of the first line shows that the wellbeing of locusts and that of humans are mutually exclusive. Through personifying the locusts, which "wrap the sun in gauze," as well as the river, which "swallows its banks," the poem creates a bewildering sight of sky and earth masked, giving nature agency as the catalyst for departure. Nature not only offers "no pleasure" visually but also no sustenance, with the "no-king crops" and the "no fields."

In the second stanza, nature witnesses humans' transgressions against each other committed through age-old traditions. The "forest" is "petrified" as it becomes a graveyard "where twins were slain." Mattawa refers to some Nigerian tribes' practice of killing twin babies based on the belief that twins are evil spirits that threaten the village people's safety. The villagers believe the twins to have strong powers and call them "gods among men. So, at birth, the entire village is alerted that a threat and perhaps an evil has been born into the community" (Sunday, 2018). Chinua Achebe describes in his novel, *Things Fall Apart* (1994), that in the Igbo society, "twins were put in earthenware pots and thrown away in the forest" to die (p. 61). Therefore, with Mattawa drawing parallels between the deterioration of the environment and human suffering, the last line of the second tercet figuratively states the consequence of this calamity when migrants follow birds. As birds symbolize freedom and life, humans turn to this aspect of nature for escape.

With its ability to soar above sorrow, the bird's symbol ushers in the lighter tone of hope mixed with illusoriness in Mattawa's last two tercets. Djinn, which in Arabian mythology and theology are devious spirits made of fire, is the subject of the third tercet's first two lines. Mattawa (2019) draws on them as an allegory for the smugglers who give false hope to the "poor stand waiting by the shore," (p. 7) whose indefinite state is countered by the hope of escape as illustrated in the internal rhyme "poor" and "shore." Geddes et al. (2019) note that smugglers help to enable
the migrant flow by "exploit[ing] vulnerable people and put[ting] their lives at risk . . . tricking migrants into making the journey and giving them the means to do so" (p. 97). Additionally, the word "poor" is a pun, indicating that the people are impoverished, but also naïve, having been duped by the smugglers into paying their life's savings in hopes of a better life as in Dahman El Harrach's song "Ya Rayah."

The mythical atmosphere continues in the last tercet. The road signs of the migrants' journey are crafted tenuously, made of "spider thread" and magical "stardust." The smooth-talking of the smugglers is apparent in the alliteration of the "s" here – "signs," "stardust," and "spider." The whole image is idealistic and romantic, marking the migrant's unrealistic perception of crossing the sea. This dream comes to a halt at the end of the poem when the speaker warns a migrant listener ("you") of the dangers of the journey: "Any way you measure it, / The difference will be a road." Thus, the poem ends by lamenting that the sorrowful conclusion is the same no matter which road the migrants take, whether by land or sea. Mattawa's use of the word "road" instead of "sea" alludes to his grandparents, who migrated to Egypt on foot when the Italians conquered his ancestral city, Misrata, in 1923. Moreover, "road" signifies the universal concept of migration. As Taylor (2019) notes, "Psalm of Departure" is "a tiny poem that in only twelve lines captures a moment that must have been reflected in millions of imaginations."

The other poems in the collection form a roadmap of the many stations and experiences on the journey from the west and central Africa to the Mediterranean: Addis Ababa, Mount Entoto, the Nile river, Khartoum, Darfur, Sebha, Arwad, Daraa, Agadez, Nimroz, Abyssinia, and Bani Walid. As migrants leave these places behind, Mattawa describes the areas in "Season of Migration to the North/Northwest" (2019) as dilapidated places with "Names like shabby trees on a map" (p. 9). In "Psalm on the Road to Agadez" (2019), the repetition of "North" underscores migrants' unidirectional mass migration around the clock: "Day and night / West to North / East to North / North to North / to North to North" (p. 10). However, the dangers of the journey across the land are only half the story. If the migrants survive crossing the Sahara's sea of sand, they must endure the second part of crossing the earthy ocean of the Mediterranean – a graveyard with no return.

Mattawa seeks to draw attention to this fatal kind of migration in "Fuel Burns" by underscoring the connections between the humanitarian crisis and the Mediterranean Sea's environmental crisis. After coming across a blog post entitled "Fuel Burns" by a Canadian doctor volunteering in the Mediterranean region, Mattawa discovered that in addition to hypothermia and dehydration, migrants suffer from fuel burns when boat fuel mixed with seawater burns their skin. Since the scars left by these burns are a physical reminder of the suffering of the migrants, Mattawa's adoption of the title of Giles's (2018) report invites readers to consider the various potential meanings of "burns," which can result in loss of skin, loss of dreams, and loss of life:

Gasoline canisters leak
or get knocked over;
gasoline mixes with seawater,
and when the mixture
touches human skin,
skin begins to burn. (Mattawa, 2019, p. 26)
Mattawa explains the poetic form as an erasure, which removes words and phrases from a text to create a second version that is shorter and sharper than the original (Poetry Foundation). He illustrates that, by crossing out specific words and sentences in Giles's post, he "whittled or rephrased" seven hundred words down to one hundred and thirty-five words." Mattawa did this with the purpose of "let[ting] the images simply speak for themselves. I did not cut off a lot of her language. It was simply a matter of making it a tighter description" (Kenyon Review, 2019). Using erasure, Mattawa finds a way of engaging with the migrant crisis by engaging with first-hand accounts of the migrants' suffering in Giles's blog. The form that is produced entirely from deleting is appropriate to depict the loss of lives in the crisis and alert the reader to the ghostly presence in the original report's background.

From the beginning, "Fuel Burns" presents that human activities and the ecological are entangled. Mattawa's articulation in line three that "gasoline mixes with seawater" implies "the impossibility of an ontological divide between nature and culture" (Alaimo, 2012, p. 489). Humans are not only primary consumers of land and sea environments, but they are also abusers. Although fossil fuels are natural resources that are mined and used for energy, their misuse can negatively impact marine ecology. Doney (2010) explains in "The Growing Human Footprint on Coastal and Open-Ocean Biogeochemistry" that "[h]uman activities have also increased levels of naturally occurring compounds such as polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons, which have sources from petroleum spills . . . and fossil fuels" (p. 1516). Mattawa illustrates in the first two lines of the first stanza that some spills are a result of the "Gasoline canisters [that] leak / or get knocked over." In "A Global Map of Human Impact on Marine Ecosystems," it is reported that 41% of the world's oceans are impacted by human activities, with the Mediterranean being one of the most impacted regions (Halpern et al., 2008). This detrimental impact of human stressors will result in the loss of precious marine life that will further jeopardize other species' survival in the area. The oxymoronic mixture of gasoline with seawater is a grim reminder of human civilization's ecological consequences on all organisms.

However, the gasoline-seawater environmental hazard is additionally dangerous because "when the mixture / touches human skin, / skin begins to burn" (Mattawa, 2019, p. 26). Mattawa takes this image from a section in Giles's (2018) blog that graphically describes the effect of the toxic mix on skin:

Picture the effects of having a vegetable peeler applied to someone's buttocks, plus or minus the backs of the legs (. . .) and back (. . .) Fuel burns occur when gasoline mixes with seawater and then comes in contact with human skin. In a remarkably short period of time, the skin begins to burn.

The proximity of the fuel spilling in the first stanza to the burning in the second stanza creates a unified frame of reference for the tragedy mirroring the short time it takes the skin to burn. Form reinforces content as the two stanzas' lines are connected through enjambment, coming to an end with the consequential "burn." Together with Dr. Giles's report, the poem shows us that the "stories" of environmental crisis and migrant crisis "are connected;" in essence, "Humanity is all involved" (Smyth, 2019). Mattawa's "underscoring [of] connections between environmental injustices and human suffering," according to Danielle Haque (2019), "is key to articulating
postcolonial ecology" (p. 72). His description of the marine ecosystem destroyed by gasoline intensifies the representation of the fuel's devastating effect on humans.

The poem's stanzaic division situates the victims who "are at highest risk" at the poem's center. In eleven stanzas, the poem alternates in a pattern of two stanzas versus one. Two stanzas describe the tragedy alongside one stanza about the "women and children" who "fall through the floor / or are trampled, and drown," mirroring their place at "the center of the boat" (Mattawa, 2019, p. 26). In her blog, Giles (2018) explains the tragedy of their vulnerable position:

People sitting in the bottom of the boat are at the highest risk of acquiring these burns when the canisters carrying gasoline leak, get knocked over, or the gasoline is dumped out in a frantic bid to bail out a sinking dinghy. In the dinghies, women are the most likely to be found sitting on the floor as people erroneously believe it is the safest location in the boat. The unsteady structure of the boat compounds the risk of burning from the fuel. Commercial dinghies are "fitted / with plywood floors," and the wood "expands, and then splits" when it "soaks up water" (Mattawa, 2019, p. 26), as Mattawa explains in the poem. As the boat is at risk of sinking, the boat structure's tenuousness sets the migrants up for death. The "tragic irony," as Mattawa explains, is the diversity of risks women and children face. While the fuel burns when gasoline canisters spill, the planks of the floor are "fixed with nails and screws / that puncture people's feet" (Mattawa, 2019, p. 26), and when these planks begin to split apart, the boat sinks. The vulnerability of migrants' lives is rendered by the cheap plywood's precariousness that expands with moisture and is less sturdy than solid wood. As Giles (2018) explains, these women end up "falling through the floor and getting trampled in the ensuing panic. Tragically, when people trample each other on a leaky boat, they often drown in just a few inches of water." These lines depict humans' complicated relationship with the marine ecosystem and the impact of postcolonial Africa's political and socio-economic situation on both man and sea.

Mattawa's gruesome imagery to describe the migrants' injuries echoes the physical suffering soldiers face in war. In an interview with Mattawa, Gareth Smyth (2019) points out that the "scratches, bite marks, / cuts and bruises" in the "bodies of survivors" (Mattawa, 2019, pp. 26-27) as depicted in "Fuel Burns" resemble the wounds of soldiers in the English poetry of World War I. Mattawa draws on Wilfred Owen's image in the poem "Dulce et Decorum Est" (1920) of a victim of "gas-shells" that leaves him with "white eyes writhing in his face," and "blood / Come[s] gargling from the froth-corrupted lungs." In the tragic irony of the title and the soldier's hardship, Mattawa notes that "Owen presents one case study, one death, which becomes an argument against patriotism being sweet and delightful (. . .) [using] factual detail" (Smyth, 2019). Drawing a parallel between soldiers' distress and the distress of migrants, Mattawa indirectly argues against fanciful perceptions of migration. His message is that migration is neither glorious nor worth the struggle as it does not offer the rewards that the sacrifice entails — only the tragedy of death awaits.

"Fuel Burns" ends on an ironic note. The doctors treating the survivors become endangered themselves, as their protective gloves dissolve upon touching the survivors' clothes. The fuel-seawater mixture is so corrosive that, as Giles (2018) explains, "just touching their clothing has been enough to make . . . medical latex gloves melt." The word "melt" that concludes the poem further presents the reader with two tragic ironies. On one level, it prompts the reader to consider
that the mixture's damage to human skin is far worse than what it does to the gloves. On another level, it signifies the vulnerability of those involved in this crisis, even the physicians. "It's also a point," as Mattawa notes, "where the person who is protected loses their protection. That's where I wanted to leave reader, feeling the glove burning under their fingers" (Kenyon Review, 2019). The message at the end of the poem is clear: there is a strong connection between humans' destiny and nature in the way that the violation against one leads to the ruin of the other.

In the last poem of the collection, "Psalm for the Departed," Mattawa (2019) returns to the entangled destiny of humans and nature presented in Slim Fejjari's illustration on the cover. The poem is an elegy connecting the land to the migrant's death as he is buried with "a fistful of myrrh in his left hand" while "his voice [is] a thread buried in sand." The migrant's body is a relic of the land as the "myrrh" embalms it, and the intangible voice becomes a physical metaphor "in sand." His soul, however, belongs to the sky on its "upward flight" like the "Bennu," soaring above the suffering and pain as "a fluorescent light / inflaming a sky gleaming / with ink." The elegy's narration is from the standpoint of a new migrant who is one of the many nameless symbols "waiting to be assigned" to his fate. As the third stanza transitions to the fourth, the speaker moves from a monologue to a conversation, asking the migrant to "measure" the loss of his life ("in blood") due to the illicit desire ("heart's contraband") of a better land, indicating that the cost of this passion was the migrant's life. The shift in reference from the specific "your heart" to the more general "the mind" in the last stanza suggests that the speaker addresses not only the migrant himself but also all future migrants. The message itself seems to be to "withstand" their life of suffering and pain rather than give in to a dream that could never be "disavow[ed]." The collection leaves us with the grim reminder that there is no escape from suffering except death.

Conclusion

*Mare Nostrum* (2019) illustrates the correlation between environmental and humanitarian crises. Khaled Mattawa shows that ecological and economic destruction impact both marine ecosystems and humans throughout the poetic collection. By drawing parallels between the Arab refugee crisis and the Mediterranean ecological crisis, Mattawa aims to voice the moral and cultural concerns raised by both problems. Using images of environmental collapse and dangerous seas, and diverse poetic forms, Mattawa presents nature as a threatening force and a catalyst for the migrants' departure. The oil spills from the migrants' boats, in turn, reveal the danger of human activities to the marine ecosystem of the Mediterranean Sea. In particular, Mattawa's use of the erasure poem reimagines migrant and marine life's tragic interconnectedness.

This paper explores Mattawa's account of the negative impact that politics has on the people of the Mediterranean and their environment through a postcolonial ecocritical approach that looks at "the complex interplay of environmental categories ( . . . ) with political or cultural categories" (Huggan & Tiffin, 2010, p. 2). He seeks to reveal the problematic relationships between European powers and their former colonies and peoples. This theme permeates not only this collection but also many of his other poems. Therefore, the historical and political articulations of the mutual oppression of nature and human culture in Arab-American literature contribute to the "interdisciplinary [and] multicultural" discussions of the connections "between the environment and issues of social justice" that Cheryll Glotfelty (1996) anticipates in ecocritical scholarship (p. xxv). Like other Arab-American writers, Mattawa uses nature to express nostalgic
sentiments towards the homeland. Yet, it is the harmful impact of politics on migrants and nature that distinguish his work.

Notes

[ii] Recent examples of ecocritical readings of Arab literature are Hala Ewaidat's (2020) exploration of the political and economic questions that surround ecological issues in Al-Sharqaw's *Al-Ardd*; Hamoud Ahmed and Ruzy Hashim's (2014) ecopostcolonial reading of Mahmoud Darwish's opposition of colonialism through poems on nature; and Sharif Elmusa's (2013) examination of the role of Arab desert novels in evoking the figure of the "Ecological Bedouin."
[iii] The Qasida is a classical Arabic poetic form that evokes memories of lost love. It is a long, fixed verse form divided into three parts and relays the speaker's yearning for the beloved (Koeneke, 2014).
[iv] Allams are poems sung by the eastern Sahara Desert nomads between Libya and Egypt. They are discursive short poetic sequences lined up in rows and columns, reflecting the nomad's physical and emotional struggles in the desert (Smyth, 2019).

About the author

Dr. Ashwaq Basnawi is an Assistant Professor of English Literature at King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia. She specializes in contemporary women’s poetry. Her interests lie in ecocriticism, environmental studies, and representations of diaspora and migration in postcolonial literature.

https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2605-335X

References


Developing Language Skills and Building Characters through Literature

Fatchul Mu’in
Department of Language and Arts Education
Faculty of Teacher Training and Education
Universitas Lambung Mangkurat
Banjarmasin, Indonesia
Email: fatchul_muin@ulm.ac.id

Received: 1/4/2021 Accepted: 2/10/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract

Literature is a creative and imaginative work; it records human lives or experiences using a language as its medium. Literary works as a medium rather than a goal or an end in the language instruction will be revealed. There are four language skills to be developed in the process of language instruction. These four language skills are: listening, speaking, and reading as well as writing. This paper will elaborate the aspects: (a) some reasons and strategies for a language educator to utilize the literary works in language learning and teaching, (b) benefits of the various genres of literary works towards the language teaching, (c) using literary works in the teaching of reading and writing, (d) using literary works in teaching listening and speaking, (e) advantages of learning the literary works in nation character building, and (f) suggested activities of the literary work-based teaching language skills for character building.

Keywords: character building, language skills, language instruction, literature

Cite as: Mu’in, F. (2021). Developing Language Skills and Building Characters through Literature. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 225-233. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.16

Introduction
Literary works as a medium rather than a goal or an end in the language instruction will be revealed. It talks about human life. Literature may give us a preview of human lives or experiences; it enables us to relate to our basic levels of desire and emotion. As a product of culture, literature greatly impacts on our society’s development. It has established or shaped human civilizations, and it also has changed the nation's political systems and exposed social injustice. As stated, the literature talks about human lives. The literature has to do with human activities or experiences. Some of those social activities may be peculiar, some may be more widespread, and some may be universal. Thus, we can expect that literary work records human lives or experiences. As a result of recording the human experiences, literature may register and reflect the various aspects of culture such as norms or morality, technological tools, economic system, family, political power, etc.

Literature is a creative and imaginative work; it records human lives or experiences using a language as its medium. In a narrow sense, literature can be said as a special type of language used to express human lives based on literary rules or systems. Furthermore, learning literature is meant to know literature based on literary systems. It is also meant to learn a language. Literature refers to one written by using the language. Thus, the learning of literature implies learning the language as well. Besides, as stated before, the literary work is the record of human lives or human culture. Literary works can be utilized to build our socio-cultural awareness, and in turn, they contribute to our nation's character building.

Based on the description above, literary works are the texts that can be used as materials or mediums for improving language skills (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) and at the same for building our learners’ characters. Learning literature is learning a language through which our learners are made to be aware of morality.

The Use of Literature in Language Teaching

Literary work uses language as its medium. Since literary works use a language, it can be argued that a literary work is a language, that is, a language that is inherent to human values or aspects of human life. To some extent, we can say that "Literature is Language" (Elkins, 1976, p. 2). Although literary works use language, the language in literature will be different from that beyond literature. The language in literature has its peculiarities both in form, selection, and collection. The specificity of language in literature will be different from the language used in everyday life. The use of language in literature will be different from that in the world of law. For example, a lawyer will have much to do with language, but he is not related to literature.

On the other hand, in many ways, someone involved in the literary world will relate to the use of language (Elkins, 1976, p. 3). The literary works can be used as the material for learning and teaching language skills: reading, writing, listening, speaking skills, and language
components such as vocabulary items and grammar. The use of literary works as instructional materials is very popular within language learning and teaching. Some English language teachers have asked their students to recite poetry and the short story to train pronunciation. Some have questioned the students to improve their vocabularies through reading the literary texts, and at the same time, and develop their writing skills through reviewing the texts. Reading and reviewing the literary works allow the students to practice lexicon, syntax, semantics, pragmatics, and stylistics they have acquired through other subjects. The translation, in particular, can be stated as the implementation of the four language skills. Therefore, it is also taken into consideration in the language learning and teaching process.

In the next part, this paper will elaborate on why literary works should be used as the materials in the language classrooms. It will also determine some criteria for choosing the appropriate literary works in the English language classroom. The literary works selected should be suitable for the students' characteristics as the readers of literary works

Some reasons for using literature in the classroom

Why use literature? The use of language in literature depends on the combination of individual and social aspects of the author. The authors' creation of literary works is intended to elicit a particular response from the listener or reader. Thus, the author chooses the forms, which will generate a response from the audience or readers in his judgment. Reactions or responses will arise when the literary works are read or heard (orally performed). Therefore, literary works must be interesting to read, hear, and then discuss. The attractiveness of literary works allows language teachers, for example, to choose literary works as language teaching materials. Here are a few:

1. Literary works can be utilized as authentic material for language instruction. As original materials, the literary works present the unmodified linguistic features or components. Generally, the language in literature has specific linguistic features or components. The language of literature is more difficult to understand when compared with the ordinary language. Thus, the students' language skills from unfamiliar, unknown, or difficult language might be used outside the classroom activities.

2. Literature is useful for encouraging students in classroom interaction. The literature texts provide the readers with multiple types of meanings, and these can be explored much for the object of sharing experiences, opinions, or feeling, presentations, discussions. Semantic, pragmatic, and sociolinguistic knowledge will support these learning activities.

3. Literature may extend the students' language awareness. In this relation, the students may be asked to identify the non-standardized and standardized forms of language and language varieties represented in the literary works/texts. This activity can stimulate them more aware of the socio-cultural rules in the activities in using a language. Awareness of language norms encourages people (the students) to use their language carefully and politely. Understanding this language norm is a factor that has a very big influence on actions, namely the activity of using language.
4. Literature teaches morality. Moral in literary works usually reflects the author's life view, views on truth values, and what he wants to convey to the reader. A literary work is written by an author, among other things, to offer a model of life that he idealizes. Literary works contain moral applications in the attitudes and behavior of the characters following the views of morals. Through the characters' stories, attitudes, and behavior, readers are expected to learn from the additional messages conveyed or mandated. By examining the moral values of literary texts, teachers can encourage their students to develop attitudes (teachers). The values and attitudes adopted from literary works are related to and beneficial to students in the real world outside the classroom. Moral values in the literary works pertaining to good-bad, positive-negative, inappropriate, and the like may be derived from religious teachings. The principle of spiritual education is to regulate human life. Types of moral teaching can cover unlimited living problems. It can cover all the life problems, all matters relating to human dignity. The difficulties of human life can be divided into (a) human problems with themselves, (b) human relations with others in the social sphere, including with the natural environment, and (c) human relations with God. (Fatchul Mu’in, 2009)

5. Literature can increase motivation. The literary works occupy a high status of many varieties of cultures in various regions and countries. Therefore, the students may feel the meaning of great achievement in understanding literary works that are highly respected. Literary works are frequently viewed as instructional materials that are more exciting for the students than the handbooks' materials. Shortly, literary works can be something exciting and stimulating. The literature will allow its reader to imagine the world he/she is unfamiliar with. This activity is conducted by using descriptive language. For the sake of understanding, the readers may create their view or perspective about something the author is talking about. In this relation, the students will become the actors or performers in a communicative event when they are reading. Literature has become a study subject in various countries at the intermediate and tertiary levels. Still, not many language teachers have utilized literary works as the materials in the EFL/ESL classroom.

**Benefits of Using Literary Works in Language Teaching**

1. Literature as Authentic Material.

Authentic materials are texts produced for non-educational purposes (Bacon & Finnemann, 1990). Since these materials are not provided for educational purposes, they are generally not taken from a given lesson book. These materials are not developed systematically in the stages for the language learners. However, many teachers or lecturers are interested in using authentic materials to learn and teach English, either written or spoken, as alternative materials. There are some kinds of authentic materials such as poetry, a short story, a novel, a song, a radio interview, a fairy story, and the like.

   The authentic materials may refer to spoken or written language as the products of truthful communication and not written specifically for language teaching (Nunan, 2001). The authentic materials are regarded as media for contextualizing language learning. The authentic materials effectively present each text's context for the language learners. When the learning and teaching of English are only for studying the educational materials, the learners may solely focus more on
the content and meaning than the context. On the other side, authentic materials will provide rich sources of context in the language instead of the language provided or presented by the teachers (Genhard, 1996).

A new pedagogical term, e.g., authentic learning, is then suggested (Herrington & Oliver, 2000). The term authentic learning is related directly to the learners' real lives, and it prepares them to face and deal with various real-world situations. Thus, authentic learning and teaching materials and activities are planned to imitate or reflect real-world conditions (Herod, 2002). When using literary works as authentic materials, the students are exposed to actual language examples from real life-like settings. In reading literary texts, students must pay attention to the target language used by native speakers of the language. The students are expected to be accustomed to the various linguistic forms, communicative functions, and meanings of the target language.

2. Language Enrichment.
Literary work provides the students with a great number of lexical or syntactic items. Words are the main elements in developing sentences. Words are formed through morphological processes, such as affixation, derivation, blending, coining, compounding, to convey the meaning stated in the sentence. Generally, lexical items can convey one meaning. Sometimes, language consists of lexical items with grammar, but not grammar that is lexicalized. All lexical items in a language are called the lexis.

The language used in literary work aims to obtain aesthetic effects obtained through creativity in expressing language, namely how an author manipulates language to express his ideas. Language in literature reflects the author's attitudes and feelings, influencing the readers' moods and emotions. Language in literary works has uniqueness, multi meanings, and multi-style. For this reason, the language in literary works must be effective and able to properly support ideas that have an aesthetic aspect in a literary work. The English language learners who read the English language well may not have difficulties understanding denotative meanings. However, they may find that sometimes the words bring around them different associations. Mastering a language could be related to a degree; knowing the meanings of all the words may not be sufficient for a full response to the work of literature. The initial step in understanding a word is to grasp its denotation. The following step is the way to understand its connotation.

Semantics is the study of meaning. Semantics examines symbols or signs that express meaning, the relationship of meaning to one another, and their influence on humans and society. Therefore, semantics includes the meanings of words, their development, and changes. The object of a semantic study is the meaning of language. More precisely, the meaning of language units such as words, phrases, clauses, sentences, and discourses. Several types of semantics, which are distinguished by level or part of the language of investigation, are the language's lexicon, so the kind of semantics is called lexical semantics. This lexical semantics is investigated by the meaning that exists in the lexemes of the language. Therefore, the meanings of those lexemes are called lexical meanings. A lexeme is a term commonly used in semantic studies to describe meaningful language units or lexical items. The term lexeme can be equivalent to a word widely used in morphological and syntactic studies, commonly defined as the smallest free grammatical unit.
3. Personal Involvement

Literature can be beneficial in language instruction because of the readers' personal involvement in literary texts. The learners begin involving the literary text when they start reading the texts. They are engaged in the text. Literature can be beneficial in language instruction because of the readers' personal involvement in literary texts. The learners begin involving the literary text when they start reading the texts. They are engaged in the text. In personal involvement, the readers will become excited to pursue the development of the story. The students will be enthusiastic to know the events unfold via the climax; they feel close to particular characters and share their emotional responses. These may have beneficial effects on the process of achieving at least three language skills (reading, speaking, and writing). At this point, the literary texts chosen should have relevance with the students' needs, expectations, and interests.

Some Suggested Ways of the Literary Work-Based Teaching Language Skills for Character Building.

As authentic materials, literary works may facilitate the language learners’ understanding of how communication occurs in a given country. As has been known, though literature is an imaginative one, it provides a setting based on which social and regional characteristics can be presented. Literature provides humans’ customs, feelings, thought, traditions, possessions, and their manner of speaking and behavior in various socio-cultural settings.

Literature can be seen as complementary material to the other materials provided for developing the cultural awareness of language students. Literary works, such as novels, can be viewed as portraits of human life. The author presents life models and social conditions through the novel, including social structure, social relations, social conflicts, kinship relationship, the dominance of powerful groups against the weak one, and other social aspects it happens in real life. Apart from being useful for improving language skills, literature helps make the readers aware of the socio-cultural factors. Since teachers are already using literature with students, they must create their instruction more meaningful by engaging their students and promoting important moral values.

The teaching of Reading and Writing

Reading is an interactive activity to pick and understand the meaning contained in written language. Reading is also intended to obtain messages conveyed by the author through written language. Reading skills are receptive skills of written language. These can be developed from reading literary work. As a written work, literary work is more valuable than texts of non-literary work. This is because literary work has special characteristics compared to non-caste texts. The features of literary language are that: (1) it has specific forms, diction, and collection, (2) many words in it, have connotative, implied, figurative, or socio-cultural meanings, (3) it is symbolic, (3) it has multiple interpretations, and it pays attention to musical effects.

Firstly, reading literary works is intended to comprehend the denotative meaning, but it is meant to determine the connotative implication as well. Reading the literature is designed to learn what is stated in the works, either explicitly or implicitly. English language teachers should adopt the learning approach following the student-centered reading activities using literary works as the
reading materials. In the reading course, a discussion starts from understanding denotative meaning using some questions about setting, characters, and plot, which may be responded to in specific reference to the text.

Secondly, having understood the words based on the lexical meanings, the learners might understand those found on the connotative, figurative, or implied meanings. They might create assumptions and interpretations towards the themes of the literary work; and they might understand the points of view of the author, styles, characters, and story setting. After that, the learners should prepare themselves to conduct working together in a group discussion. The students complete the evaluations on the story and respond to the themes, point of view of the author, styles, characters, and setting of the story. This evaluation is also a suitable time for them to share their responses to the work's natural, cultural issues and themes.

Thirdly, at the evaluative level, the learners may be stimulated to think about the work and provoked to solve the problems as an effort to see their problem-solving capabilities. Group discussion started from such kind of assignment will become the starting point for either the oral or written practices. The literary work will be an essential and stimulating thing for writing in the English language, either as a model or material. When the literary work is utilized as a model, the students may imitate its topic/theme, content, point of view, structure, and styles. When used as the material, the students make their reports showing their own thinking as their appreciation. The students may practice writing in some writing types, such as guided, free, controlled, and other writing types based on literary work.

The teaching of Speaking and Listening
Listening skill is developed through literary works. The learners are exposed to recorded or recited literary works. Using these, they will acquire how the language is spoken. They can gain knowledge of pronunciation per the sound systems of the target language. The pronunciation problem is one of the issues in learning English. The learners usually face the matter because (1) since they were children, they were wont to produce speech sounds in their own language, (2) their habits to provide speech sounds within their own language make them difficult to provide in the other language, and (3) there are different sound systems within the two languages (native and foreign languages). The learners will improve their oral production of a second or foreign language through listening activities by imitating the second or foreign language texts. This learning activity may lead to enhancing not only pronunciation but also intonation, stress, vocabulary mastery, and sentence patterns, which are, in turn, useful for developing writing and speaking competencies. Stern states that literary works in the language classroom particularly focused on reading and writing may play similarly beneficial roles in teaching either listening or speaking. Reading aloud, playing drama, improvising, role-playing, reenacting, discussing, and oral language production group activities can be based on literary works (Fatchul Mu'in et al., 2018; Nanik Mariani et al., 2019). Speaking skills will be developed through reading and paying attention to literary works like poetry and fiction prose. A lecturer may ask his student to read the texts, and at the same time, the other students hear it. Then, each student is asked to form an oral report based on what has been read or listened to. But the foremost appropriate writing is drama. The drama consists of
dialogues. By employing a role play technique, acting is also used for developing speaking skills (Fatchul Mu’in, et al., 2018).

Literature can be used receptively and expressively in character education. Receptive use of literary works as a medium for character education is carried out in two steps:

1. Selecting teaching materials. The literary works chosen as teaching materials are those that sound aesthetically and ethically. Those literary works should be good in literary structures and contain values that can guide students to be good human beings.

2. Managing the learning process. In operating the learning process, the teacher must direct students in reading the literary works. Teachers must lead students to be able to find positive values from the literary works they read. Teachers should not let the students see and deduce the values existing in literary works by themselves. The teachers guide students to apply the positive values obtained from literary works in everyday life.

3. Role-playing. The expressive use of literary works as a medium for character education can be pursued through managing emotions, feelings, enthusiasm, thoughts, ideas. Students' ideas and views are represented in creativity in writing literary works and playing drama, theater, or film. Students are guided to manage emotions, feelings, opinions, ideas, and views to be internalized within themselves and then written down into literary works. Emotions, feelings, dissatisfaction with the existing system, and anger to demonstrate towards something can be actualized in literary works, such as poetry, drama, or prose. If the students are exposed to character-rich literature in an identical manner that will serve those dual purposes, character education is often taught, encouraged, and promoted in our classrooms.

4. The students are asked to reproduce literary works that have been read. In this case, the teacher can choose literary works that contain positive character values (poetry, short stories, dramas, or novels), then students are asked to read. After reading, students are asked to change (reproduce) into other forms of literary work. For example, short stories or novels were turned into drama; poetry was turned into short stories. In reproducing these literary works, the teacher must explain that the emphasis is on the theme. Through literary works that highlight various themes, students (humans) can be invited to recognize and understand the quality levels of their own character or character. After students acknowledge and understand the character level's quality, the teacher must guide or direct the character level's quality to a better one, namely, inviting students to "dialogue with characters in literary works that have quality levels of character at the level of" character level three. " Thus, the four types of character education models are internalized in students and actualized in daily behavior.

5. Literary products in poetry, short stories, dramas, and novels reveal various human life themes. The themes can be grouped into receptive media for character education, simulated inside or outside the classroom (schoolyard, auditorium, or meeting room). This simulation will appeal to students in building character values. With this model, students are trained to implement character values obtained from literary works. If this simulation is often practiced, the character values
derived from literary works will crystallize in students' subconscious. Character values that crystallize in the subconscious can become reference values in everyday behavior.

**Conclusion**

First, literature plays a very important role in students' education, namely in language development, cognitive development, personality development, and social development. Second, literary works can be used receptively and expressively in character education. Third, literary works highlighting various themes that can be used as a medium for students (humans) to recognize and understand the quality of their own character levels. Fourth, literary works that describe various types of characters can be used as a medium for character education for students.

**About the Author:**
**Fatchul Mu’in** is a Lecturer in Literature/Linguistics at Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin. He earned his Sarjana’s degree of Linguistics from Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang (1987), Master’s degree of Humanities from Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta, and Doctoral degree from Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java, Indonesia.

**ORCid ID:** https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4498-3515

**References**


A Postcolonial Scrutiny of the Media Imperialism in Wajahat Ali’s *The Domestic Crusaders*

Maram Mohammed Samman
Department of Languages and Translation
College of Arts and Humanities, Taibah University, Madinah, Saudi Arabia
Email: mmsamman@taibhu.edu.sa

Received: 11/15/2020 Accepted: 1/5/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
The paper reevaluates Wajahat Ali’s play *The Domestic Crusaders* through the postcolonial views of Edward Said. It explores the role of the Western media in the classification and alienation of Muslims according to racist misconceptions. Despite the differences in their respective approaches, the two texts—Ali’s *The Domestic Crusaders* and Said’s *Covering Islam*—denounce the media’s role in the distortion of the portrayals of Islam and Muslims. Accordingly, the study aims at discussing the two texts through a postcolonial viewpoint in relation to the media’s role in the spread of Islamophobia. Extracts from both texts will be provided to explicitly or implicitly epitomize the dilemma of the Muslim society after 9/11. The paper explores how the media exploit the fear, ignorance, or vulnerabilities of the global audience. The paper proves that the crusades against Islam deliberately and erroneously describe it as a source of violence and primitiveness that threatens humankind.

Keywords: *Covering Islam*, Edward Said, 9/11 events, Islamophobia, media imperialism, postcolonial readings, terrorism, *The Domestic Crusaders*, Wajahat Ali

Introduction

Much of what is known about Islam and Muslims in Western societies is derived from the mass media. Studies have shown that over three-quarters of people in Western societies rely on the mass media, mainly television, as their primary source of information about Islam and Muslims. (Rane, Ewart, & Martinkus, 2014, p. 29)

After 9/11/2001, a widespread Islamophobic trend has prevailed in the world. Muslims have to tolerate open enmity and active hatred. It is a publicly acknowledged fact that the events of 9/11 have created a negative and irrevocable image of all Muslims as terrorists. This paper warns against the fact that everyone is being valued according to criteria based on appearances. Depending on the political, social, and cultural complications of 9/11 and the subsequent fiction that addresses this particular context, this article aims, at first, to focus on the role of the modern media in subjugating and neo-colonizing nations, as represented in Wajahat Ali’s The Domestic Crusaders. The play essentially depicts twenty-four hours in the life of three generations of a Pakistani-American who are celebrating the birthday of their third son, Ghafur. Second, the paper attempts to reread this play in the light of Islamophobia and Islamic tolerance due to the unequal relations between Eastern and Western civilizations. It considers the play as a cry against all Muslims’ stereotyping as members of Al-Qaeda or ISIS by the media.

Third, the paper critically evaluates Ali’s play with Said’s (1997) “third and last in a series of books; Orientalism, The Question of Palestine, and Covering Islam” which are considered the “main cornerstone for postcolonialism and cultural studies” (p. i). Said deliberates on the effects of Western media on the one hand and that of power, hegemony, and knowledge on the other. Fourth, in light of the two texts, the paper discusses the responsibility of the American and Western media in the creation of the current situations of intolerance that these Muslim characters find themselves in. In the play, the media’s role is as decisive as the voices of Television and Radio that could silence the family to announce or comment on the news. In Covering Islam, Said (1997) asserts the role of the Western media in the propagation of Islamophobia in the name of realism, liberalism, and freedom. The two texts discuss the idea put forward in Said’s words, “Islam is peculiarly traumatic news today in the West” (p. 1).

Besides, the paper discusses possible answers to the questions: Are Muslims and Islam to be considered the enemies of the West? Is it right to profile all Muslims as terrorists? Can we differentiate between Islam and Muslims? In fact, all discussions of terrorism should center on these trajectories. Islam’s beliefs are frequently distorted and taken out of context, with practices being taken to represent a rich and complex faith. The injustice of Islamophobia is that it confuses small groups of terrorists with the majority of Muslims. Moreover, the supporters of Islamophobia went from being afraid of Islam to launching wars against it with more of a militant and aggressive crusader-like agenda—something that is the essence of both the play and the book.
As a Pakistani-American journalist, playwright, and lawyer, Ali is among those Muslim writers who assiduously “strive to bridge a chasm” due to their role in "reimaging one of the country’s most complicated compound identities: Muslim American" (Gigerenzer, 2010, p. 29). He won the honor of being “An Influential Muslim American Artist” that was awarded by the State Department, and due to his prolific work in journalism, he was also appreciated as a “Muslim Leader of Tomorrow.” He became the addressee of the Muslim Public Affairs Council’s prestige recognition of 2009. In 2010, he received the Otto Award for Political Theater because he is a writer-activist (The Domestic Crusaders, 2016, p. i). As a talented Muslim writer, he feels the necessity to fulfill his duty of expressing the dilemma of his people, especially that of Muslims living within Western societies.

The Domestic Crusaders was published in 2016, and it sets out to comprehensively interpret the characteristics of Islamophobia, the causes, and the consequences. As perceived by Muslim and non-Muslim communities, Islamophobia “plays a critically central role in convincing many that a civilizational clash will be inevitable and all-consuming by establishing an essential and irreconcilable difference between ‘them’ and ‘us’” (Gottschalk & Greenberg, 2008, p. 3). Ali sheds light on the daily suffering of these Muslim minorities living in Western societies. It is interesting to notice that underneath the psychological and familial realism of the story, the family’s trauma arises. In the of the All-Party Parliamentary Group on British Muslims, Abbas (2006) presumes the crucial roles of such texts since they correct the false perceptions of the “pervasive anti-Muslim rhetoric that has penetrated the practices of media, politics, organizations, and community relations. It is anti-Muslim action, sentiment, belief, and even propaganda” (p. 2). The heroic mission of writers such as Said and Ali is that they would not hesitate to use their talent to defend their people and culture.

The Palestinian-American thinker, critic, and writer Said (1935–2003) is known to provide political insights into the Middle East’s postcolonial conditions. In his writing, he is concerned with reversing the misinterpretations of the Middle East by disambiguating the concealed ideologies of the Western media. He (1997) claims that the media keep reinforcing the deluded opinion of “Israel as [a] victim” and “demonizing the Arabs” (p. xxi). The title of the book Covering Islam refers to how “Islam is covered and (mis)represented in Orientalist thought and media stereotypes [to the extent that] it stands charged and convicted without need for supporting arguments” (p. xviii). The importance of the book lies in its discussion of the role of the Western media in the growth of Islamophobia. Said postulates that “the media have covered Islam: they have portrayed it, characterized it, analyzed it, given instant courses on it, and consequently, they have made it known” (p. li). According to this description, Muslims need to lose the shackles imposed on them by the media not only to uncover the true essence of Islam but also to expose the involvement of the media in the propagation of Islamophobia. Said admits that “the overall interpretive bankruptcy of most—though by no means all—writing on Islam can be traced to the old-boy corporation-government-university network dominating the whole enterprise [which]
finally determines the way the United States views the Islamic world” (p.152). Muslims have to invest all their effort to unmask and stop these vicious networks.

**Literature Review**

In this study, a review of the ideology of Islamophobia is needed for a better understanding of the two chosen texts. The postcolonial reading of 9/11 and media imperialism will be reviewed concisely because they are directly connected to the scrutiny.

**Islamophobia**

The creation of new ideologies is one of the characteristics of our modern world. Islamophobia is one of these trending ideologies. According to Runnymede Trust Report (1997), Islamophobia is a “shorthand way of referring to dread or hatred of Islam and, therefore, to fear or dislike all or most Muslims” (p. 1). Most Islamophobic discourse relates the reasons for this ideology to “an antipathy based on faulty and inflexible generalization” (Allport, 1955, p. 9). Other reasons that lead to the fear of Islam are racism, prejudice, and bias (Johnson and Lecci, 2003). On the other hand, Lopez (2011) often uses Islamophobia interchangeably with racialization, discrimination, stereotypes, and racism. The paper scrutinizes the role of the Western media in the spread of Islamophobia.

**Postcolonial reading of 9/11.**

The events that happened on September 11th, 2001 were worldwide. The term 9/11 is used to refer to everything that happened on that day and the impact of these events on the lives of millions. These tragic incidents have brought postcolonial studies, American studies, and ethnic studies together into one intersection. Many researchers have been busy to renew the postcolonial theory and connect it with the current changes that resulted from this dilemma. Meek (2010) defined 9/11 as “iconic cultural trauma—relived and retold in numerous documents and dramatizations” (p. 6). Barber (1995) considered the effects of 9/11 on the theory of postcolonialism as “a body blow” especially regarding “valorization of ambivalence and hybridity” (p.199). Moreover, Morton and Boehmer (2010) commented on the relation between “postcolonial writing and theory, and the phenomenon of terror” (p. 2). They condemned how the supposed “discourse of terrorism” started the spread of Islamophobia (p. 11).

**Media Imperialism**

In the introduction to the twenty chapters of *Media Imperialism: Continuity and Change*, Boyd-Barrett and Tanner (2020) extended the definition of media to include the organizations that “own the news, telecommunications, film and TV, advertising and public relations, music, interactive games, and internet platforms and social media sites” (p. 2). Interestingly, they related media imperialism to cultural imperialism and discussed the influence of both on “media systems and cultures of other countries especially those in the global South” (p. 1). The study focuses on these imperialistic effects that lead to the spread of Islamophobia with special attention to TV as the source of the news.
Wajahat Ali and Edward Said

Muslims need to know that these processes of demonizing Muslims adopted by the Western media are, in Said’s (1997) words, “misleadingly full, and a great deal . . . is based on far from objective material” (p. ix). They puff their writings with ideas about Islam that are “licensed [with] not only patent inaccuracy, but also expressions of unrestrained ethnocentrism, cultural, and even racial hatred, [and] deep yet paradoxically free-floating hostility” (p. 2). For such prejudiced people, the Islamic world is known mainly to them only through “newsworthy issues” such as oil and/or terrorism (p. 16). Said carefully differentiates between the Western and the non-Western or third world media because “the audiences differ, the organizations and the interests differ” (p. 47). It also goes without saying for the same stated reasons that the American media differs from the European media. Said believes that “every American reporter has to be aware that his or her country is a superpower with interests and ways of pursuing those interests that other countries do not have” (p. 47). These obligations and duties have many serious consequences for Islam.

Both texts deliberate mainly on the American and not the Western media. *The Domestic Crusaders* is an appeal to view the life of a Muslim family as a terrible reflection of all the mistreatments felt by all the family members. In the face of Western calls for Islamophobia, it has shouted loud and clear and with force to demand that they modify their stereotypical and distorted images of Muslims. The play focuses on a day in the life of a three-generations of a simple Pakistani American family, but a multi-layered account about the family is presented in the text, which deals with generational conflict, love, fear, food, secrets, worries, and pains. The real events of the play unfold over a single night but the author’s brilliant use of flashback provides insight into the painful stories about the things that happened years ago to almost all the characters. In a concise review of the play, *Newsweek* (2018) posts that it is true that the play “is not as tragic as Arthur Miller’s *Death of Salesman*, and the family is not as dysfunctional as the Irish-American family in Eugene O’Neill’s *Long Day’s Journey*, but it still fulfills what its writer wants to” (p. 2). Ali wants to confute the generalization that after 9/11, all Muslims are terrorists “unless they could prove themselves innocent of either being terrorists or sympathizing with terrorists” (Abrahamian, 2003, p. 538). This sort of perception produces what is known as Islamophobia. According to the Merriam-Webster (n.d.), dictionary, a phobia is an “exaggerated, usually inexplicable, and illogical fear of a particular object, class of objects, or situation” (n.d.). In this case, it usually refers to the fear of Islam.

The reproduction of Western media events should be exact and free from prejudice, but this is not the case. What happens is that “media coverage brings Muslim-American terrorism suspects to national attention, creating the impression that Muslim-American terrorism is more prevalent than it really is” (Kurzman, 2012, p. 7). Said (1997) admits the hidden agenda of these media, concluding that “what the media produce is neither spontaneous nor completely free” (p. 44). Unfortunately, the reporters pick and choose what suits their interests, and they distort the actual reality. “It ought to go without saying that the media are profit-seeking corporations and, therefore, quite understandably, have an interest in promoting some images of reality rather than
others” (p. 49). The real questions that should be asked in this case are why they are doing so and what their aim is. Said explains that “they do so within a political context made active and effective by an unconscious ideology, which the media disseminate without serious reservations or opposition” (p. 45). They do so without any consideration of the damage they cause while they execute their discriminated racial ideology. “The Consciousness of a professional code of ethics and a way of doing things are involved in what one says, how one says it, and who one feels it is said for” (p. 46). The real question that needs to be put forward is how far the Western media fulfills these professional codes.

The play attempts to highlight specific sources of anti-Islamic stereotypical feelings. Ali and his characters know that they have a mission to correct and defend Islam and Muslims against these attacks. Ghafur, the younger son, summarizes the current situation of Muslims and the directed trends of Islamophobia. He (2016) says that these “extremists [are] using those millions to teach their perverted version of Islam” (p. 49). Being Pakistani, he is familiar with the political situation around his country. He blames the Taliban for “thinking it’s Halal and Islamic to beat and lock up women. Thinking they’re doing God’s work.” Moreover, he states, “Americans, and these Christians here, [are] thinking each and every Muslim is a Jew-hater, about to go berserkerrage and blow himself and everyone else up” (p. 50). From his perspective, the fact remains that it is the misdeed of the media that nurtures these stereotypes and generalized misconceptions about Muslims. Correspondingly, Said asserts that these “malicious generalizations about Islam have become the last acceptable form of [the] denigration of foreign culture in the West.” The bleak irony in this situation is that whatever is “said about Muslim mind, or character, or religion, or culture as a whole cannot now be said in a mainstream discussion about Africans, Jews, other Orientals, or Asians” (p. xii). The current situations of Muslims are severe because of the constant threads propagated by these media. Ghafur believes, “that’s the same garbage they get day in, day out. And no Muslim does anything—we just sit and complain. Why don’t we go out and tell them how it really is?” (p. 49). Clearly, Ghafur is articulating his author’s views, Ali, and every other true Muslim. Some non-Muslims worldwide believe that Muslims are dangerous and blood-thirsty, so Muslims must start defending their faith and their people and clear these false accusations. Said comments on the position of Muslims around the world and states that

with some small degree of empathy, it is not difficult to imagine that a Muslim might be made uncomfortable by the relentless insistence—even if it is put in terms of a debate—that her or his faith, culture, and people are seen as a source of threat, and that she or he has been deterministically associated with terrorism, violence, and ‘fundamentalism’ (p. xxi).

The media should address these concerns and immediately stop these crusades.

On the other hand, Said (1997) clarifies the racialized involvement of the media by relating the Iranian hostage crisis of 1979 in Tehran as well as the media’s role that clearly shows the
malignity of western media not only toward Iran but also toward Muslims and Islam. A small group of Muslims is typically seen as the representatives of all Muslims and Islam. In this incident, fifty-two American diplomats were held hostage for 444 days by a group of Iranian college students. Said (1997) explains that the reasons behind his choice of this “Iranian Story” as “a good occasion for examining the media’s performance is exactly what made it understandably agonizing for so many Americans: its duration and the fact that what Iran came to symbolize represented American relations with the Muslim world” (p. 77). The Western and American media

purported … to prove that Islam was one unchanging thing that could be grasped over and above the remarkably varied history, geography, social structure, and culture of the forty Islamic nations and the approximately 800,000,000 Muslims who live in Asia, Africa, Europe, and North America (p. 79).

These biased media reporters tend to vary their tendentious techniques in their wars on Islam. They suggest that “invisible lines connected various other aspects of the [Arabic] Middle East to [Persian] Iranian Islam [and] then damn them together” (p. 80). The irony is that many people, even Muslims themselves, tend to blindly believe and adopt such distorted thinking patterns because of the hegemonic place from which these reporters are speaking.

This ironic and dichotomic conception about Islam is discussed in detail by Said (1997). He posits that this tragic situation “has spawned a set of counter-reductions [in Western nations] and in the Islamic world itself. ‘Islam’ can now have only two possible general meanings, both of them unacceptable and impoverishing” (p. 55). On the one hand, the Western society regards Islam as “a resurgent atavism, which suggests not only the threat of a return to the Middle Ages but the destruction of what is regularly referred to as the democratic order in the Western world” (p. 55). For them, Islam calls for violence and extremism. On the other hand, Said proposes that for “the first time in history (for the first time, that is, on such a scale), the Islamic world may be said to be learning about itself by means of images, histories, and information manufactured in the West” (p. 53). Now, Muslims consider the West as their source of news despite their knowledge of how the West regards them. They see lies, and instead of correcting them, they adopt them as their own.

Moreover, the bitter irony is expressed in Ali’s (2016) play through the voice of a FEMALE COMMENTATOR on the television:

FEMALE COMMENTATOR: (Voice-over) This war will end only when these monsters and terrorists and Al-ka-eeda and fundamentalist regimes renounce their hatred and extremism and learn to love and embrace democracy and freedom and American values, such as tolerance and separation of church and state and, God willing, good hygiene, ha!

MALE COMMENTATOR: (Voice-over) Ann, how do you expect them to love us when we’re invading their countries and bombing their homes?
FEMALE COMMENTATOR: (Voice-over) That’s the problem! They don’t understand. They just don’t get it. We’re not invading them. Hello, stupids! We’re liberating you!” (pp. 92–93)

Clearly, the play depicts the far-reaching impact of the Western media, which fuels the rise of Islamophobic sentiments among the Western as well as Islamic societies. Here, the reporter addresses the Muslim world as monsters, jihadists, and followers of “Al-ka-eeda.” They spin a web of hatred around all Muslims. Other commentators talk as if the world of Islam were more or less identical with the Arab world, whereas a majority of Muslims are not native Arabic speakers. Ironically, even the Muslim world depends on the Western media for news. Thus, as Said (1997) explains, Muslim countries have transformed “from being the source of news” to “the consumers of news.” They started to depend on these Western media and reporters as reliable sources of news. Unfortunately, this is “an accurate, though extremely depressing, picture of what the media revolution [that is] serving a small segment of the societies that produced it has done to ‘Islam’” (p. 53). Moreover, Said suggests that almost none of the “important journals of opinion” use Muslim or Arab critics to put forward their opinions of Islam as insiders. Instead, they use biased Western experts “to interpret political and cultural actualities shaped not by the facts but by unexamined presuppositions” (p. xxvi). This final idea explains the extent of anti-Islamic stereotypes and images that is prevalent in the media.

Surely enough, the kind of media Ali (2016) presents in his play is television, which is at “the top of the media pyramid” and “without doubt, the most powerful medium of mass domination ever invented.” No wonder that El-Sharif (2001) righteously designates it as “the instrument of cultural genocide” (para. 16). In his play, Ali attributes a dominating voice to the television to explain, amplify, or show the general sentiments against Muslims. This voice is so powerful that one may consider it for a character in the play. It has the power to stop the family’s conversation when it has to announce something. Primarily, the media is responsible for propagating Islamophobia. Due to its authoritative role, it is now a fact that “to be a Muslim is to be a distrusted Other” (Gottschalk & Greenberg, 2008, p. 11). Fourie (2001) states that media play an essential role in furthering one group’s interests over the other. These interests could be political, economic, and/or social. The critical question to be asked here is the following: who has the power and the means to shape people’s opinions all around the world? “This power is mainly vested in those who own the media and who have the financial means to own and manage the media” (p.122). In the play, the discriminatory and racist voice of the television can penetrate the silence with cruel and impolite comments, especially about the war against terrorism. The following lines are overpowered by feelings of revulsion, hatred, and discrimination.

The TV: (Voice–over) The president urged the nation today not to fear or doubt, even though the battle against extremism and evil will be long and painstaking, with unfortunate but inevitable sacrifices. According to the president, these sacrifices are necessary to ensure
our freedom and to help protect the liberties and values of all freedom-loving people against those dedicated to tyranny and hatred. (Ali, 2016, p. 44)

The play cleverly reminds the audience about the ancient notion of the White man’s alleged burden of civilizing human beings, which forcibly exhorts the false justification behind the colonial conquest of the indigenous lands.

CNN HEADLINES NEWS: (Voice–over) The Soldiers of Peace, an Evangelical group with a loyal membership headed by Revered Edwards, spiritual counselor to the president, say they are ready to send over two thousand, as they call themselves, ‘lovers of Christ’ to help preach the gospel as soon as the army decides it is safe for American citizens and missionaries to reside in Iraq. (p. 48)

These lines explain why such reporters believe that they make positive contributions to their nations by exposing the dangerous Muslims on television. Said (1997) discusses the same idea when he provides examples of several seemingly “prestigious, high-profile news programs [that] broadcast several segments discussing Islam as a crusading religion including the warriors of God” (p. xxvi). Such attempts by these writers, among others, help in clarifying the situation and show Muslims that they should not believe everything they see/hear in these media.

Correspondingly, Said (1997) manages to showcase the diverse and, usually, biased nature of Western and American news reporters and TV hosts in their coverage. The so-called experts have managed to supply their audience with many “coarse and blind” facts about Islam and Muslims (p. 93). These facts need to be corrected. It really does not matter “whether they did so consciously or not.” These media reporters “were, in fact, using their powers of representation to accomplish a purpose similar to that intended by the United States government in the past: namely, the extension of an American presence (. . .) the media’s purpose seemed to be to wage a kind of war against Islam” (p. 95). After consistent exposure to a particular narrative, people tend to believe what these TV. reporters say or as Said (1997) concludes, that “the scene before us is not what a television company has caused to appear before us in this way but that it is indeed the way things are” (p. 44). This situation is the real danger of the stereotypes promoted by the media about Islamic society. Said’s ideas are accompanied by the literary and theatrical talent in Ali’s Domestic Crusaders. The most important contribution of the play is that it allows Muslims to articulate their truth. Ali allows his characters the chance to remark on this discrimination.

Salman: Tired OF THIS GODDAMN HEAT . . . Goddamn media. Same nonsense every day! Blame Islam. Blame Muslims. Blame immigrants for everything! Tired of the daily propaganda! . . . Who’s that? Right—another Amreekan general telling me why the Muslim world hates us. Amreeka, everyone is an expert—morons, absolute idiot, liars running this country, the worthless media, the oil companies—Muslims—useless also—stabbing you in the back. (Ali, 2016, p. 23)
These angry words of the father succinctly express the grave condition that Muslims currently find themselves in and their reactions to the news they regularly watch, i.e., the reports produced by the biased Western media. He asked a very crucial question, “Who’s that?” The audience should make such inquiries before embracing the opinions of these reporters. Salman’s angry remarks are also echoed by his father, Hakim when he says the following:

Hakim: (Visibly disgusted) Just like the British—typical colonizers, imperialists, just like the ferengi Europeans. Come in—rape, loot, destroy, [and] turn brother against brother and countryman against countryman just for dawlat and power. Man never changes. (p. 48)

Here, he refers to the long colonial and postcolonial history of the relations between Muslims and Christians.

Interestingly enough, from the beginning of the play, we learn about “the injury” or “the bloody thing” in Hakim’s chest that “still lingers after all these years” (Ali, 2016, p. 36). We have to wait till the end of the play to know the story behind that injury. The old grandfather suddenly feels that he should tell his family “what [he] used to do in India (his eyes are glazed).” It is indeed in such times that the power of flashback is needed to highlight specific events and provide the necessary explanations. He “(positioned center stage and talking directly to the audience, begins his story. He is physically present but immersed in his nostalgia)” (Ali, 2016, p. 97). He starts narrating how he became a killer to avenge the murder of two of his Muslim friends, Amir and Umair, who were killed by a “Hindu mob.” One of them was stabbed with a knife and the other “was found hanging from a tree. They cut his stomach and let his guts hang out” (p. 98). The mob kept killing Muslims. He could not stand this and decided to take revenge. It is only then that he “learned how easy it is for a man to lose his soul.” After that, he tried to escape from India, but he was shot in the chest. “The scar is forever a part of me. It reminds me of the violence, the hatred, the death, [and] the suffering that I both experienced and was responsible for . . . it is my punishment.” Clearly, the guilt of his acts weighs heavily on him. He “would give anything, [his] entire life twice over, just for the memories to go away. Just to forget the screams. But [he] cannot” (p. 101). He concludes that during that time, violence was the answer to all his problems. Yet, when Fatima asked him if he regrets what he has done or if he would “have done anything differently after all that death and chaos,” he replies after thinking silently for a moment,

I don’t know. I just did what I felt was right at the time. Not a day goes by that I don’t remember my actions or the men, all of them, who were killed. The Muslims, Hindus, Sikhs, and Christians. But I cannot change the past. (p. 103)

Should someone like him be blamed or accused of terrorism because he decides to take the law into his own hands, even after he went to the police and they did nothing? This question is worth contemplating, especially since “a person can never really know [what he will do] until he faces that situation. You have to trust yourself at that moment and do whatever it takes...as long as you
take a stand and act honestly.” (p. 104). He knows that no one feels the way he has handled, not even TV reporters. He asks, “by talking about it, you think, they think, [that] you can understand what it means to kill someone?” (p. 101). This story has nothing to do with the media and its role in the propagation of Islamophobia. The fact remains that such incidents mirror the past experiences of some Muslims who have lived and suffered from racism, and they show how such attitudes against them shaped their present lives. It reflects the horrible outcomes of hatred, discrimination, and anger. The scar that this old man is carrying on his chest announces to the whole world that the true nature of Muslims is not that murderers, but they are often forced to commit criminal offenses.

After reading the play, it is clear that all the humiliation that these characters narrate is, as explained by FATIMA, the result of “a blatant racial profiling which any Muslim might face in life just ‘cause [he] has an Arab-sounding name.” There are real troubles that he will face if he has a beard, which is a clear “sign saying, I’M AN EXTREMIST. ONE WAY TICKET TO ABU GHRAIB, PLEASE.” (Ali, 2016, pp. 40-41). When SALMAN brings his nail cutter to the airport, FATIMA tells him, “you’re lucky they didn’t just strip-search you. Hose you down and do some Superman scan of your internal organs while they were at it” (p. 38). This humiliation and misrecognition “can inflict harm, can be a form of oppression, imprisoning someone in a false, distorted, and reduced mode of being” (Taylor & Gutmann, 1994, p. 74). In the play, Ali uses these examples along with many others to racialize the stereotypes against Muslims that are used viciously to portray them as violent terrorists and tricky, regularly disgusting, and hardly humans. Of course, it is clear after reading the play that Ali’s goals are articulated by Ghafur, who wants “to make people unlearn all the misinformation they’ve been forced [to learn] their whole lives about Muslims, Islam, Arabs, and the Middle East” (Ali, 2016, p. 55).

On the other hand, Said (1997) has another mission in mind, i.e., to dig deep into the reasons behind these situations and to explore their results. He confidently assures his readers that most of these false and biased ideas about Islam and Muslims are the results of “wild exaggeration of the sensationalist and ignorant American [and Western] media.” The fact remains that all these Islamophobic feelings and attitudes are “taken from anti-Islamic careerist publicists who had found a new field for their skills in demonology” (p. xxvii). He believes that this is a sign of power and dominance. In the world that we are currently living in, “the mere assertion of an Islamic identity” requires “a necessity for survival” (p. 72). For the Western media, this power gives them the right to say what they wish about Islam because they can, with the result that Islamic punishment and “good” Muslims (in Afghanistan, for instance) dominate the scene indiscriminately; little else is covered because anything falling outside the consensus on what is important is considered irrelevant to the interests of the United States and the media’s definition of a good story. (Said, 1997, p. 142)
To get a good story, they are ready to eliminate elements of the truth and misrepresent the other parts to fulfill their warmongering missions.

The focus of the two texts is the cross-culturalism perceived by the two writers from the Muslim world, and the paper intends to provoke more discussion and analysis. On the one hand, Ali’s play manages to discuss some identity abuse patterns or what Taylor and Gutmann (1994) call the “non-recognition or misrecognition.” They postulate that usually, the identity, especially of minorities, is partly shaped by [its] recognition or its absence, often by the misrecognition of others, and so a person or group of people can suffer real damage, real distortion, if the people or society around them mirror back to them a confining or demeaning or contemptible picture of themselves. (p. 25)

In the play, almost all family members suffer from certain kinds of misrecognition. On one side, because of their outfit or their names, they are either “Afghanis” or “related to Osama bin Laden” (Ali, 2016, p. 16). On the other side, everyone in this family has their problems and worries. For example, Salman, the father, regularly faces discrimination at work. For the men in the company, he is only the “brown, foreign, Muslim dog—a Muslim camel.” After working for thirteen years in the company, his boss “still thinks I’m from India. India, Pakistan, Afghanistan, what’s the difference?” The Americans, he knows, keep calling him SAL because it “was too hard for [them] to pronounce these A-rab names.” Unfortunately, Salman knows that “as a foreigner, you’re going to take a beating, you’ll always take a beating. But inshallah, when you make your gold, don’t wipe your blood off the street. Keep it there, to show all of them that you have earned it” (p. 79). This is the American dream or nightmare from which this family and almost all immigrants are suffering.

Conclusion
To conclude, it is noteworthy to say that this study was inspired by an interest in the field of the East-West relationships, especially after 9/11. The importance of the paper lies in its attempt to change Eurocentric sentiments against Muslims and Islam. In addition, the paper uncovers the media’s role in the spread of Islamophobia. The rereading of the two texts shows the cultural, social, and political dilemma of Muslims in the face of the ruthless policies of the Western media. Among the complications of 9/11, many Muslims all over the world find themselves forced to defend their religion, culture and their people. In the face of the vicious crusaders of the Western media, many writers and thinkers have started to use literature as the media to narrate the problems of assimilation and racism.

The two writers have attempted to confront the violent and stereotypical images of Muslims in political and social life using their art. Their contribution to this field is necessary and relevant, as Muslims have become the talk of the hour through false associations with terrorism and
fundamentalism. Almost all these writers have to try their best to defend Islam and Muslims from the stigma of terrorism is incredibly dehumanizing. Unfortunately, these writings that “aim to humanize [Muslims] can end up reconfiguring or reversing or even reinforcing [the] processes of dehumanization” (Franklin, 2017, p. 859). Such writers need to be careful when they pour their hearts out to their audience.

Ali (2016) endeavors to show the ambivalences and hardships experienced by Muslims after 9/11. His two-act play has managed to correct the disfigured, stigmatized, and stereotypical images of Muslims in general and Pakistanis in particular. The play narrates the instances of discrimination that all Muslims and even those who only look Muslim are subjected to. Said (1997) indeed focuses on American media while Ali focuses on the British media. However, both discuss the demonizing effects of these media on Islam. The views of the outstanding postcolonial critic are conveyed in the play with the aid of the literary and theatrical abilities of Ali. The two writers have helped portray this cultural issue as a modern religious crusade against Islam and Muslims using media. Hence, the research is a vital re-examination of Ali’s play in light of the postmodern ideas of Said’s book. The media’s role is significant in reshaping the opinion of the global audience. This could be a call to utilize the same weapon to defend Islam and Muslims if we want to change the widespread stereotypical image associated with them.

In addition, Said’s (1997) book indeed discusses certain historical events. His words and thoughts are expressive of severe and fundamental human interactions. He comments on the ideas of power and hegemony concerning to the false interpretations of Islam due to the stereotypical biased thinking of media reporters. These reporters use their authoritative voices to transform reality while reporting. Ali (2016), on the other hand, gives TELEVISION the voice to not only comment on the events that are going worldwide but also to lead to counternarratives that the characters relate to. Despite the differences in their methods, the two texts urge the readers to verify the validity of what is happening in front of them and what they hear and watch on the media.

About the Author:
Maram Mohammed Samman is an Assistant Professor of English Literature at Taibah University, Madinah, Saudi Arabia. She is the Deputy Head of the Languages and Translation Department. She earned her PhD in English Literature from King Saud University in Riyadh. Her current research interests focus mainly on drama and cross-cultural comparisons of postmodern cultural and literary movements. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2515-6987

References


Language as Students’ Artistic Value: Linguodidactic Dimension

Iryna Guslenko
Department of Theory and Practice of Translation, Kharkiv University of Humanities “People’s Ukrainian Academy,” Kharkiv, Ukraine
Correspondent Author: guslenkoir@gmail.com

Evgeniya Myropolska
Department of Social Sciences, Kyiv National I. K. Karpenko-Kary Theatre, Cinema and Television University, Kyiv, Ukraine

Natalia Myropolska
Laboratory of Aesthetic Education and Art Studies, Institute of Problems of Education, National Academy of Educational Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv, Ukraine

Received: 12/13/2020 Accepted: 1/8/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
The present paper focuses on the problem of values and representation of language as an artistic value. The main objectives of the research are to specify the role of artistic values for people, represent the methodology for the integration of arts into foreign language classes, evaluate its results. The research questions of the study aimed to investigate how the experimental course contributed to students’ attitude towards artistic values, the development of their language and communication skills. The outlined methodology of arts integration into foreign language classes involves teaching art terms, phraseological units about art, popular-quotations, and teaching through literary translation and dialogue of cultures. The one-term experimental integrated course of English and art classes was implemented by two secondary schools in Kyiv (Ukraine). The evaluation of the results was done with the method of qualitative research. The findings confirmed that language as an artistic value is a powerful instrument for students’ personal, artistic, and cognitive development.

Keywords: artistic values, art-terms and phraseological units, dialogue of cultures, linguodidactics, literary translation

Cite as: Guslenko, I., Myropolska, E., & Myropolska, N. (2021). Language as Students’ Artistic Value: Linguodidactic Dimension. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1) 248 -261. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.18
**Introduction**

Values comprise different aspects of human life reflected in feelings, relationships, and interests that guide people’s mental processes and behavior. This indicates the pedagogical imperative in values investigation and teaching.

Artistic values are seen as crucial factors in the progressive advance of students’ emotional, sensory, and mental spheres. By introducing the works of art, students appreciate the values of other peoples and cultures, become aware of the national and global values. Through the works of art, artistic values impact the viewers’ or listeners’ feelings, their emotional experiences, cognitive and moral improvements.

Whereas the development of students’ artistic values is considered a time-consuming process, it occurs not only in art classes. Art provides many resources for teaching languages because a language itself as a cultural phenomenon is a huge tool for teaching artistic values. That can be done through the integration of arts into foreign language classes.

The main objectives of the research are to specify the role of artistic values for people; represent the methodology for the integration of arts into foreign language classes; evaluate its results. This research is expected to give input on the implementation of the experimental course of integrated art and language classes on a long-term basis. It will promote a more profound understanding of students’ native artistic values and appreciation the other cultural values. The methodology and findings of the research are also expected to be interesting to those who investigate similar issues.

**Literature Review**

**Value Dimensions**

The concept of values has been investigated by philosophers, psychologists, sociologists, and other scholars from ancient times to the present, e. g., Adler (Adler, 1956), Dilthey (Dilthey, 1995), Frese (Frese, 2015), Rokeach (Rokeach, 1973), Spengler (Spengler, 1991). Hence, the essence and nature of values are incredibly diverse. They touch upon the material and spiritual assets, social and political issues, ethical and aesthetic ones. Values can be universal and personal; they can concern the needs and interests of individuals, groups, societies, and cultures. They include the values of good, freedom, and truth; national values are linked to independence, patriotism, etc.

In Maslow’s hierarchy of needs, they are regarded as lower (material) values and higher (spiritual) ones. Spiritual values embody both highly semantic ethical imperative and cultural values such as traditions, customs, and established norms, ensure the connection with the past and the like. It explains why there is no one generally accepted definition of the term. Nevertheless, they have something in common. For instance, Dilthey (1995) connects values with the significance of life. He proves that it is values that direct the person’s desires and ambitions (Dilthey, 1995).
From Adler’s point of view (1956), the person’s behavior and actions are the reflections of the personal values:

values are seen as located in man, originating in his biological needs or in his mind. Man by himself or man in the aggregate, variously referred to as group, society, culture, state, class, is seen as ‘holding’ values. (p.272)

Russell (1995), while analyzing the views of cynics and skeptics, emphasizes the same idea and stated, “Only subjective goods – virtue, or contentment through resignation – are secure, and these alone, therefore, will be valued by the wise man” (p. 232).

According to Pedagogical Dictionary (2001), value denotes the positive, or negative significance of real-world objects to individuals, social groups, or society that is determined not by the properties of the objects as such, but by their involvement in the sphere of human life, interests, needs, and social relations. Moral principles, ideals, attitudes, and goals become the criterion for assessing the significance of values.

Therefore, values represent a real-life space that comprises many aspects; each of them relates to life and “requests and hopes of an individual” (Tabachkovsky, 2002, p.124).

Values guide a person’s mental processes and behavior because the roots of values lie in human feelings, relationships, and interests. The aesthetic categories of beauty and ugliness, the sublime and the low, good and evil do not exist by themselves, but only when a person attaches particular importance to particular objects, phenomena, and actions. The entity acquires axiological significance only when the subject favors or prefers it.

**Artistic Values**

While speaking about artistic values, some scholars feel skeptical, e.g., Lopes (2011) and Stecker (2012) identify them with aesthetic values. While Hanson L. (2013) offers arguments in defense of artistic values, separating them from aesthetic, ethical, and moral ones.

Artistic values refer to spiritual ones. Although they are not compulsory in their character, they can act as regulators for people due to their incentive component that shapes the individual’s personality on an ethical basis. Concerning the virtues infinity and human being’s multidimensionality, they become the constituent part of human life.

Artistic values reflect core life values, and they are expressly embodied in the works of art. Artistic values address the person’s feelings and mind, stimulating the comprehension of certain value aspects, which in the end will or will not become the recipient’s asset. Taking actions from a position of observation and assessment, incorporating values into the personality’s dimensions are the constituent elements that affect people in their upbringing. However, if people do not
perceive the inherent meanings of the works of art, they will not strive to make them the part of their hierarchy of virtues to emulate. Therefore those artistic values cannot be among their motivational preferences.

Artistic values facilitate the individual representation of a young man, so as not “to become a brick among millions of absolutely similar bricks,” to become “a person, who must live his own, and not someone else life, be true to himself” (Hesse, 1990, pp. 179-181). It means to be a person who is not vulnerable to manipulations and easily overcomes the stereotypes of the community.

**Development of students’ artistic values**

The artworks, having stood the test of time, address different people, circumstances, and epochs. They are not in the past; they never disappear; only the accents can shift. According to Spinelli (2009), creativity contains vital elements of something mysterious and unexpected. Even when the ultimate goal of the artist is clear, new opportunities, events, and methods can completely change the purpose, meaning, or outcome of the artwork (Spinelli, 2009). That gives it new dimensions or connotations suited to a particular time and space.

Sometimes the masterpieces of the past are represented as retro-works when they are studied at schools. This one-sided approach isolates artworks from today’s students. There is no single approach of introduction of artistic values so that they would effectively stimulate students' emotional, sensory, and mental spheres. Still, there is a *technique of emotional reinforcement in the upbringing of a personality*. Its author, the Ukrainian scholar Bekh (2018), states “When we increase the strength of a certain emotion it would serve as a meaning-making function of one or another spiritual value and would give an impulse for further actions” (p. 82).

The authors assume that all masterpieces exist, metaphorically, in the grammatical category of the Continuous Tense; that is, they are ageless; they belong to both the present, past, and future. They exist in *continuous time*; deal with the events that began long ago. Yet they remain to be influential and relevant till now (perhaps, just for this reason, *Continuous Tense* is also called *Progressive Tenses* in association with the movement and dynamics of time and events).

A continuous connotation accentuates the informal, hidden layers of the works of art and reveals their new aspects and dimensions that meet the needs of the age; only in this way, retro-dimension can gradually shift to the sphere of students’ reality so that they could enjoy the masterpieces and famous works of art.

Artistic identification that comes first of all as a result of aesthetic experience and empathy allows us to live the lives of other people from different times and places; it shapes universal values, both individual and specific ones, and is a manifestation of the universe itself and the reflection of the universal integrity of life. According to Spinelli (2009), such experiences take us beyond the ordinary, beyond the framework of concepts and categories (Spinelli, 2009).
Art classes empower students to get closer to the artistic values since they aim to form a comprehensively and harmoniously developed personality by fostering both the need in art perception and the ability to do it. Art classes focus on the identification, development, and realization of students’ creative skills. The individual artistic values develop when the person learns how to perceive and experience the art when the art becomes a part of the person’s inner world. As Bekh (2018) mentions, the formation of new personal values is a time-consuming process. Students should have some time, and only after that, they will accept a new value. This phenomenon should be taken into account by teachers in their educational work (Bekh, 2018). While providing the opportunity to go through something previously untried, compressing and concentrating the social and historical experience of the preceding generations to the forms that should inspire personal enculturation, the art is a kind of ‘data bank’ of behavioral archetypes. These archetypes shape the perception of reality and culture.

In this context, the hypothetical prospects of art classes in high school (grades 10-11 of secondary schools in Ukraine) are significant. The core academic subject ‘Art’ will help high school students become acquainted with the spiritual continuum of other peoples and cultures, appreciate the value of something new and different, and identify their cultural roots. The study of art facilitates the comprehension of the relationship between national art/cultural heritage and art/cultural heritages of other countries. The intercultural artistic and educational environment involves the comparison of local values with the cultural heritage of other civilizations without contrasting but demonstrating their mutual complementarity. After all, each culture, with all its specific nature, is a part of humanity.

**Integration of arts into foreign language classes**

Living in a world where cultures communicate too tightly, we assume that the confrontation of cultures will generate sympathy for other cultures and intuitive insights in detecting differences and subtle similarities that are not immediately obvious. The mission of the humanities disciplines study and art classes, in particular, is the search for balance between the native and the foreign, or, according to the outstanding Ukrainian thinker Zenkovsky (1997), “a free combination of two different principles in their unity, without suppressing one another” (p.343).

From this viewpoint, a language as a cultural phenomenon is a huge instrument and one of the national culture’s manifestations. The language learners can connect with artistic values by integrating arts into foreign language classes.

Let us consider several strategies to use for this purpose.

**Teaching art terms**

Learning art terms can shape students’ cultural orientation, build their intercultural skills. It is necessary to know the art terms to understand art values and be able to speak about art. The problems of teaching English language learners how to speak about art were studied by Gorjian (2012), Greer (2011).
By teaching terms from different branches of art, the teacher should draw students’ attention to the facts that terms are words or word-combinations with a specific meaning in the particular field of study (e.g., capriccio, biscuit, porcelain, theater, etc.); they are stylistically neutral; art terms are often borrowed and can be adopted by several languages, so they are international words.

Teaching terms is an excellent way to enlarge students’ vocabulary and create a feeling of enjoyment in making progress in speaking a foreign language. It also broadens students’ minds and develops contextual guesses. It is also useful to focus students’ attention on terms etymology, their pronunciation, and spelling. For example, the words that refer to the drama are of Greek origin (e.g., chorus, dialogue, dithyramb), ballet terms are borrowed from French (e.g., pas, pas de de, grand pas), opera terms come from Italian (e.g., bel canto, solo, vero). Thus knowledge of terms facilitates the cultural involvement of the person.

*Teaching phraseological units about art (idioms) and famous quotations*

The acquisition of phraseological units in an English classroom setting has been profoundly studied by Liu (2008), Tsui (2004), Thyab (2016), Wood (1981), and others. Idioms are expressions that often present a figurative, non-literal meaning. They can reflect the history, culture, and national peculiarities. That is why some do not have any translation equivalents, while the others do have functional analogs close in meaning. Idioms as a stylistic device, expand students’ vocabulary and broaden their outlook, making their speech more colorful, powerful, dynamic, and creative. The use of idioms is affected by various extralinguistic, social, and psychological factors. Idioms can be successfully used as artistic expressions to impress the listeners. However, effective communication is hard if people do not understand the symbolic meaning of the idiom or the idiom is misused. That can result in language and cultural misunderstandings.

The idioms related to art can contain words for art, e.g., *be no oil painting*, *blank canvas*, *drama queen*, *paint something with a broad brush*, etc.

Famous quotations and phrases often come to English from other languages. Sometimes, people use them in the original language (e.g., *Sancta simplicitas!*, *O tempora, o mores!*, *A la guerre comme à la guerre, C’est la vie*, etc.). Hence, to understand and use them correctly, the students should know more about their origin, where they come from, and how their meanings have transformed.

Art idioms and famous quotations can be practiced with language learners to develop their basic skills (i.e., reading, writing, listening, and speaking) and their cultural awareness consolidation via art-related activities. Thus, learning English through idioms and famous quotations offer possibilities for intercultural and cross-cultural education through the integration of art and language teaching.
Teaching through literature and the art of literary translation

Literature, unlike other kinds of art (e.g., music, painting, dance), is the art-form where words are the tools. That is why the incorporation of literature in language teaching is so widespread for gaining four basic skills (speaking, writing, reading, listening) and for mastering sub-skills (vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation).

The literary text of different genres, from novels and short stories to poems and song lyrics, constitutes a valuable, authentic resource for numerous reasons. One of them is cultural enrichment, which involves understanding other cultures and gaining awareness of difference. Another reason is that literary texts provide rich linguistic input, effective stimuli for students to express themselves in other languages.

Teachers exploit literary text in many ways to enrich students’ vocabulary, develop comprehension skills, reinforce abilities to verbalize their thoughts (orally or in writing), and participate in discussion or debate. These techniques proved to be useful. The use of literature for translation gives an opportunity to practice acquired lexical, syntactic, semantic, pragmatic, and stylistic knowledge and develop the fifth language skill, or intercultural awareness, which according to Kramsch (1993), “must be viewed as enabling language proficiency” (p. 8).

Intrinsically translation is conceived as an act of communication when translators, who play the role of intercultural mediators, remake a text from a source language to a target language. Translation does not merely involve two languages but includes the people and cultures of both languages. If the cultural values do not overlap, the translators, in some ways, translate cultures. Due to translators, literary characters begin speaking other languages. It enriches the worldwide culture and develops native languages. For instance, an outstanding Ukrainian translator Mykola Lukash, who knew 22 languages, made an exceptional translation of Goethe’s Faust (Goethe, 2013), and now the Ukrainians can enjoy the thoughts and ideas, which are still no less relevant than in the past.

The teacher should make the students realize that the essence of literary translation is not a matter of technique, it is not a photo of the text, and it is not a literal or word-for-word translation. When translating the literature, translators use their skills and talents to bridge the two cultures. They convey to readers (viewers, listeners) the closest meaning of the original text to understand and enjoy it.

Thus, literary texts used for translation develop students’ language skills and intercultural awareness.

Teaching through dialogue or polylogue

Communication is a fundamental need of the human community. The word dialogue comes from two Greek words, dia and logos, where logos can be translated as word or meaning, and dia does
not mean two; it means through. Thus, a dialogue is not restricted by two participants, either people or groups. Isaacs (1999), in his investigation of the etymology of word dialogue, concludes that:

In the most ancient meaning of the word, logos meant to gather together and suggested an intimate awareness of the relationships among things in the natural world. In that sense, logos may be best rendered in English as relationship. (p.19)

The center of the principle of participation is “the intelligence of our hearts, the freshness of our perceptions and ultimately the deep feeling of connection that we may have with others and our world” (p. 57). Consequently, dialogue involves interacting with people, their thinking together in a mutual relationship or the art of thinking together.

Through dialogue, we avoid one-dimensionality in our relationships. Because it is not merely a conversation between two people or two groups, it is the acceptance by all its participants of their respective arguments. One element integral in this process is the language that will be spoken to exchange different viewpoints.

Language is a great tool to interpret thoughts, amplify them, get into disputes with other people that can represent different cultures, so dialogue often turns into a process of communication between cultures, during which their mutual transformation takes place (Khamitov, 2017). The dialogue of cultures is based on the idea of a diverse community, where key aspects are remembering your own culture, knowing it and continuing to deepen the knowledge, creating new spiritual values, understanding the other, and learning to live together.

Increased communication between cultures, on the one hand, results in a clash of civilizations accompanied by misunderstandings and acts of intolerance. On the other hand, by meeting other cultures, people can learn how to understand them, compare, embrace the differences without labeling them as good or bad, right or wrong.

To overcome cultural barriers, we should teach students to understand how different cultures use literal and figurative meanings to express themselves, how to interpret the metaphorical language of art, which sometimes can only be intuitively guessed, foreseen. Feinstein (1982) points out that:

Metaphor, once regarded solely as an ornamental linguistic device, is now considered to be an essential process and product of thought. The power of metaphor lies in its potential to further our understanding of the meaning of experience, which in turn defines reality. In art and in language, metaphor urges us to look beyond the literal, to generate associations, and to tap new, different, or deeper levels and meanings. (p. 45)
Consequently, metaphor is not only essential to thought, art (including visual art) as a product of human thought can also be metaphoric by character. The difference between them is that metaphor of thought can be expressed through words, but the metaphor of visual art is expressed through images.

Through visual art in the foreign language classroom, students learn how to construct metaphoric meanings and interpret feelings translated by the artist into visual form. According to Feinstein (1985), “construction of metaphoric meaning begins by viewing the work as a whole, becoming aware of the visual attributes and nuances, and then by asking, other than obvious, what do these works suggest?” (p. 28).

It is only by dialogue or discussion that we can unveil the symbols of works of visual art and construct meanings that expand the reality. Only through dialogue does the individual broaden the horizons of a personality and civilization – the horizons of culture; only in the dialogue each historical epoch is a living culture, and not a star that went out (Bibler, 1997). From this perspective, art can be viewed as an invitation to dialogue.

To develop the skills of understanding the artist’s ideas, revealing the metaphoric language of art, and grasping how art is involved and integrated with many other human pursuits, the teachers need tools that help students articulate their values. For instance, they can find something similar and something different in the works of the artists who represent different cultures and thus reflect different life philosophies and reflections of the artist’s inner self.

The authors offer to compare the works of an American artist, Georgia O’Keeffe, with paintings of an acknowledged Ukrainian artist Kateryna Bilokur (1900 – 1961), a master of primitive art who painted flowers, herbs, fruits, and whatever she could find in gardens and orchards. She was one of the greatest painters who ever emerged from Ukraine. Although both painters were contemporaries and many of their creations feature colorful and vibrant flowers, their styles and artistic manners are distinct, and it provides the matter for discussion.

To speak about arts and the peculiarities of two artists’ styles, the students should revise active vocabulary so that it could help them in revealing their deep understanding of the issue. The teacher asks the students to say who the words and word combinations refer to Georgia O’Keeffe, Kateryna Bilokur, or both. The students should be ready to explain their points of view. After that, the students answer questions about the lives and creative works of both artists.

Another task is to write a dialogue essay in Google docs entitled Flower-soul after one of Kateryna Bilokur’s pictures. The format of Google docs makes it possible for a group of students to write an essay together. They can give feedback to other students’ opinions, agree, or agree with them, respond, and give new ideas. It is a form of collaboration through dialogue as the art of
thinking together; it is based on mutual participation that shows how the students can respect other people’s values and points of view, or respond to students with different opinions, etc.

The Study
The Sample
The research sample includes 40 secondary school students (grade 10) learning English in two schools in Kyiv (Ukraine). The primary data for this study were collected from the students after they completed the experimental integrated course of English and art classes.

Methods of Study
The scholars assume that the measurement of aesthetic and cultural growth is complex and problematic, and very much still in the development stage (Carnwath, 2014), and the most frequent method used in the investigations of this kind is the method of qualitative research (e.g., questionnaires, classroom observations, interviews).

The 3-item questionnaire used in this study assessed how the experimental course contributed to students’ language skills, attitudes towards artistic values, and communication skills.

Data analysis and Study Findings
In the first item of the questionnaire, the students were asked whether the experimental course contributed to their language skills.

Language skills
Table 1. Assessment of students’ language skills development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 1 to Item 1</th>
<th>To some extent</th>
<th>Not really</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>reading skill?</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>writing skill?</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>listening skill?</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>speaking skill?</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The experimental course lasted only one term, and it aimed to determine if the course would have any positive influence on the development of students’ language skills. Since the course includes many tasks in speaking and discussing, 80% of the participants suggested that their speaking skills improved to some extent. Next, come reading and writing skills (67% and 65% correspondingly). Listening, according to the participants, is the least developed skill in the result. Only 12% of the students felt such an improvement.
Table 2. *Impact of literary translation on language skills*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 2 to Item 1</th>
<th>To some extent</th>
<th>Not really</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did the tasks on literary translation contribute to your language skills in English?</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukrainian?</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The participants’ answers proved that translation needs a profound mastering of English as a source language and Ukrainian as a target language. Translation increases students’ vocabulary, develops a sense of language, and deepens their cultural understanding.

*Attitude towards artistic values*

Table 3. *Development of awareness of the artistic values*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 1 to Item 2</th>
<th>To some extent</th>
<th>Not really</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did the course help raise your awareness of artistic values of different cultures?</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The main objective of the experimental course was to raise the students’ awareness of the artistic values of different cultures. As a result, 90% of the participants felt the positive outcomes of the course.

Table 4. *Impact of arts engagement on personal development*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 2 to Item 2</th>
<th>To some extent</th>
<th>Not really</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you feel the impact of arts engagement on your personal development?</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results shown in Table 4 reveal that the participants understand the importance of arts in human life, passive and active participation in it.

*Communication skills*

Table 5. *Development of communication skills*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 1 to Item 3</th>
<th>To some extent</th>
<th>Not really</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did the course help develop your communication skills?</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The experimental course aimed engagement to artistic values through dialogue and polylogue; thus high priority was placed on students’ communication skills. The students’ answers reflect positive results.
Discussion
The findings represented above have reflected a positive impact of the experimental course on the participants’ language and communication skills; their awareness of artistic values has also improved. The course has proved to be important for students’ personal development, openness, and tolerance to other cultures. It promotes the upbringing of people who are not mere consumers of art but people who feel the need for art engagement.

Classroom observations showed that learning idioms and famous quotations became a powerful instrument in increasing students’ vocabulary, developing their confidence, and teaching them the language etiquette rules.

Through the students’ engagement in literary translation, they become aware of overlapping and differences between the cultures. Besides increasing English vocabulary, the students also developed their native language skills when they creatively rendered stylistic devices of the text without using the clichés. In this way, the students perceived the language as an artistic value.

Teaching students through dialogue meant not only teaching the norms of communication concerning conflicting ideas but also teaching them to conduct the dialogue of cultures with the appreciation of different values. The classroom observation showed that in comparison of two or more cultures, the participants first determined the similarities between them and then found out something different. That enhanced students’ skills in communication, encouraged them to have a dialogue developing their critical thinking.

Conclusion
Ultimately, this study proves that students’ artistic identification occurs when the art becomes a part of their inner world, and when students are taught how to perceive and experience the art. The presented methodology investigated the prospects of incorporating art into a language class where art is used as a resource for improving four language basic skills (reading, listening, speaking, writing) and developing the fifth skill of cultural and intercultural awareness. The latter includes respect for values of other cultures and the ability to enter into a dialogue to deepen students’ knowledge, create new spiritual values, and foster their understanding of the other. The results revealed the positive impact of the experimental course on the students’ level of art engagement, language skills, and personal development.

The findings of the study raised concern that the presented experimental course needs pedagogical support from school authorities, development of educational programs for other age groups of students, and their implementation.
About the Authors

**Dr. Iryna Guslenko** is an Associate Professor working at the Department of Theory and Practice of Translation, Faculty of Translation and Interpreting in Kharkiv University of Humanities since 2015 after obtaining her Ph.D. in Pedagogy (2014). There are a number of publications in the field of Teaching English and Translation on the basis of Lingua-cultural Approach.

ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0785-0000

**Dr. Evgeniya Myropolska** is an Associate Professor working at the Department of Social Sciences in the Kyiv National I. K. Karpenko-Kary Theatre, Cinema and Television University since 2006. She obtained her Ph.D. in Philosophy in 2006 in Kyiv. Her area of research interest includes aesthetic education of arts students.

ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9570-5641

**Dr. Natalia Myropolska** is a Doctor of Educational Sciences (2003), Professor, and Senior Scientific Associate of the Laboratory of Aesthetic Education and Art Studies at the Institute of Problems of Education of the National Academy of Educational Sciences of Ukraine, Kyiv. She is an author of a number of books and monographs on the problems of aesthetic education and aesthetic aspects of written and spoken word.

ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7469-5111

References


Pip's Ego Oscillations in Charles Dickens's *Great Expectations*

Bechir Saoudi
English Department, College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam Bin AbdulAziz University, Al-Kharj, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
English Department, ISEAH, Kef, Jendouba University, Tunisia
Correspondent Author: ctat.ctat@yahoo.com

Lama Fahd Al-Eid
English Department, College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam Bin AbdulAziz University, Al-Kharj, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Noura Mohammed Al-Break
English Department, College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam Bin AbdulAziz University, Al-Kharj, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Rahaf Saad Al-Samih
English Department, College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam Bin AbdulAziz University, Al-Kharj, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Tarrafah Abdullah Al-Hammad
English Department, College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam Bin AbdulAziz University, Al-Kharj, Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Received: 12/10/2020    Accepted: 2/2/2021    Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
This research project studies Pip's ego fluctuations in Charles Dickens's *Great Expectations*. Freud's division of the human psyche into id, ego and superego is appropriate for the analysis of the rise and fall of the hero in his pursuit to attain gentlemanhood. Four main questions have been addressed: First, what makes up Pip's id? Second, what are the main components of his superego? Third, does Pip's ego succeed or fail in striking a balance between his id and superego? In what ways does it fail? And fourth, how does Pip's ego eventually succeed in striking a balance between his id and superego? The study finds out that Pip's id is demonstrated through his fascination with high-class lifestyle and relinquishment of common life. It shows that his superego is constructed from the hurdles that prevent him from pursuing gentlemanhood, namely past common life restraints and present high class deficiencies. It also demonstrates how Pip's faulty ego comes as a result of his frustration at high class lifestyles and resentment of his old common life. The study eventually reveals that two important factors contribute to the success of Pip's ego: His reconciliation with the past and appreciation of the present in order to have more realistic expectations of the future.

Keywords: Charles Dickens, ego, Freud, Great Expectations, id, oscillations, superego

Introduction
Charles Dickens (1812–1870) was one of the most important and influential British writers of the Victorian Era. He was also an editor, social commentator and journalist. He wrote such cherished classics as *Hard Times*, *A Christmas Carol*, *David Copperfield*, *Oliver Twist*, *A Tale of Two Cities*, *Nicholas Nickleby* and *Great Expectations*. He heavily influenced such predominant writers as Kipling, Conrad, Joyce, and Eliot.

*Great Expectations* is "one of its author’s greatest critical and popular successes" ("Great," 2020, para. 1). It has been extensively admired as the Dickens's greatest literary achievement. It was first published in book form in 1861. It is a serialized account of the psychological development of its hero, Pip, "from an innocent, unsophisticated orphan to a pseudo-aristocrat and snob" and beyond (Allingham, 1861, para. 2). It also addresses such issues as ambition, self-improvement, social class, crime, guilt, innocence, sophistication and human worth. *Great Expectations* is popular both with readers and literary critics (Schlicke, 1999). It has been studied from numerous perspectives including psychoanalytic criticism. Yet within this type of criticism, Freud's three divisions of the human psyche, the id, ego and superego, have not been fully investigated in relation to the central character. This is a great opportunity for the researchers to fill the gap and explore and experiment with a very important tenet of psychoanalytic literary criticism.

Thesis Statement
This research project aims at studying Pip's psyche using Freud's notions of id, ego and superego in relation to his journey to attain gentlemanhood. It is important to investigate the various facets of a personality created by one of the most distinguished authors through a psychoanalytic critical lens.

Key Research Questions
The study seeks to answer important questions posed in Psychoanalytic literary criticism through the personality of Pip in *Great Expectations*. What represents Pip's id? What are the main components of his superego? Does Pip's ego succeed or fail in striking a balance between his id and superego? In what ways does the ego fail? How does it succeed in putting things right for the protagonist?

Significance and Purpose of the Study
This literary study is very beneficial in that it fills a gap in knowledge that has not fully been dealt with previously, namely the application of Freudian criticism to *Great Expectations* in the pursuit of getting to grips with the complexity of relationships between a person's id, ego and superego. It aims at scrutinizing the work in order to find out about the oscillations of the ego between the id and the superego and assess the outcome thereof. The study is also particularly critical in that it deals with literature, one of the three main disciplines studied at Prince Sattam bin AbdulAziz University, the other two being linguistics and translation. In fact, most research projects have so
far dealt with education sciences and language teaching issues at the expense of the other
disciplines. This project will encourage more researchers to opt for literary projects so as to address
the disproportion. The article also makes a significant contribution to the existing literature on
psychoanalytic approaches to the novel in terms of the focus and depth of its analysis.

**Literature Review**

*Great Expectations* has stimulated various reactions from different critics using a range of critical
approaches. What the researchers are interested in in this project is the psychoanalytical theory
whose progress has had an enormous impact on literary criticism. One of the ways researchers
could study *Great Expectations* from a psychoanalytic perspective is to explore the relationship
between the author and his work, concentrating on how Dickens's own life influenced the novel.
Another way is to examine the readers' response to the novel and how they may psychologically
identify with the characters. A third way focuses on the construction of a character's identity in
relation to society. Other critics may be interested in the analysis of characters from a
psychoanalytic angle. The researchers' endeavor falls within this last realm.

Numerous studies have read the novel from psychoanalytic standpoints. One reason is that
"because it enters the abyss of Pip’s inner self" (Bloom, 2010, p. 1). Dessner's 1976 "*Great
Expectations*: The Ghost of a Man's Own Father" investigates the complex relationship between
Dickens as a dreamer and Pip as his dream. In "Repetition, Repression, and Return: *Great
Expectations* and the Study of Plot", Brooks (1980) reads *Great Expectations* with Freud’s *Beyond
the Pleasure Principle*, using Freud’s concept of repetition to explore the novel.

Lehman's 2004 "Repressions in *Great Expectations*" studies the ways "repressed feelings,
thoughts, and actions" in the novel "offer greater depth of meaning to the plot and its characters"
(para. 1). Ingham's 2008 "The Superego, Narcissism and *Great Expectations*" focuses on the link
between the superego and narcissism and how the latter may be seen as a product of the former.
In "Feeling for the Future: The Crisis of Anticipation in *Great Expectations*", Tyler investigates
the "delineation of Pip’s future-oriented psychology" and describes "Pip’s feelings of uncertainty
about the future" (2011, p. 1). In "Desiring Estella in *Great Expectations*: Understanding Pip’s
Fantasy", Reynolds focuses on the love relationship between Pip and Estella and the way they
"have resolved some of their maladaptive psychology" (2015, para 8). Within psychoanalytical
criticism, Freud's basic notions of the id, ego and superego have not been fully investigated in
relation to the hero of *Great Expectations*. Hence, it is essential to fill the gap and explore Pip's
psyche using basic Freudian terminology in an innovative way.

**Theoretical Framework**

The present study is concerned with discussing three fundamental parts of personality or psyche
in Freudian psychoanalytical literary criticism. In *The Ego and the Id* (1927), Freud conceives of
the human mind as made up of three components, the id, the ego, and the superego.
The id is the center of a person's instincts. It is predominantly sexual and violent in nature and is determined by the pleasure principle (Snyder and Lopez, 2007, p. 117). The superego represents the common ethical principles and social rules that define what is right and what is wrong, what is acceptable and what is frowned upon. It is driven by the reality principle, the aptitude of the mind to evaluate the reality of the outside world, and to react to it (Freud, Strachey, & Richards, 1984, p. 278). It counterbalances the pleasure principle that controls the id.

In Freud's theory of the psyche in general, the ego is to be understood as the moderator or arbitrator responsible for striking a balance in mind between the id and the superego. If the ego fails to manage or cope with the id-superego struggle, or release repressed desires one way or another, it develops into a faulty ego, as opposed to a healthy ego if it succeeds. In the current study, the notions of id, superego, faulty ego and healthy ego shall be respectively applied to the four main parts of the project, as shown in the research design section below.

**Research Design**

The study of Pip's ego oscillations in his pursuit of gentlemanhood in *Great Expectations* is divided into four main parts. The first part concerns the study of the ways Pip's id is revealed through his yearning to become a gentleman. Pip's id is demonstrated by his infatuation with the Satis house lifestyle, his cover-ups on its flaws, his abandonment of his own common life, and his thirst for education.

The second part studies Pip's superego as displayed through the factors that stand in the way of his pursuit of gentlemanhood: namely past common life limitations and present high class defects. Common life limitations are demonstrated through a carrot-and-stick strategy from Pip's neighborhood, whereas high-class repulsion is revealed through the Satis House aversion and gentlemanly life repellents.

The third part discusses the failings of Pip's ego in reaching a compromise between his id and superego, resulting in a faulty ego. Pip's disappointment in the repulsion from the Satis House and discomfiture at certain gentlemanly aspects leads to his distress. The situation is aggravated by his frustration at Joe and Biddy, the villagers, and the reemergence of Magwitch in his life.

The fourth part deals with the successes of the ego in learning from its failures in order to ultimately reach a certain level of satisfaction in achieving genuine gentlemanliness. Two vital components lead to the triumph of the ego. First, Pip learns how to build great relationships in the present instead of relying on unrealistic expectations of the future. Second, Pip succeeds in reuniting with his past, making it part of his present as well.

**Part I - The Id**

Pip's id is expressed through manifestations of his pressing need for becoming a gentleman. It is brought to the fore through his interactions with the Satis family, reactions to his past common life, concealment of the drawbacks of a rich life, and his earnest plea for education.
The Satis House Trigger
Pip's intense desire to rise above his social station and become a gentleman is first unraveled in chapter 9 when Mrs. Joe announces that Pip is going to "play" for Miss Havisham (Dickens, 1861, p.92). It meant a lot for Pip even though his journey towards gentlemanhood would merely start with him acting as Miss Havisham's mere walking stick (chap. 14). Ever since he visited the Satis House, he developed a longing to be part of the upper-class life he had a small taste of (chap. 15). He continues to visit the Satis house for eight months to learn more about the new life. In chapter 17, Pip goes for a walk with Biddy to whom he openly confesses his desire to change and become a gentleman. He decides to embrace wealthy society values and hold them up as ideal against his own common life background.

Common Life Renouncement
Pip's desire to become a gentleman is related in his mind to getting rid of his old common lifestyle. In chapter 10, he clearly expresses his desire to be uncommon. He starts despising the common worker as less worthy than the well-mannered gentleman leading a well-off, restful way of life (chap. 14), basing his thoughts on society's discriminatory ideas of "gentleman" and "common". Pip classifies the convict as less than common even though he does not know either about the kind of crimes he committed, or their circumstances (chap. 39).

Cover-up on High Life Downsides
Pip's yearning to achieve gentlemanliness leads him down the way of dishonesty and deceit in his attempts to cover up on the newly discovered shortcomings of high-class life. He actually lies in order to vindicate an ideal portrayal of the gentleman-like life he appears to be bent on pursuing until the end no matter what happens in the process. Pip tries to become uncommon and climb the social ladder by being crooked, as Joe puts it, and lying about his experiences (chap. 9). He lies to the impatient Mrs. Joe and Mr. Pumblechook in a wondrous manner, inventing stories about Miss Havisham reclining on velvet couches and dogs feeding on veal, glorifying the wealthy Satis House lifestyle (chap. 9).

Craving for Education
Pip's insistence on becoming uncommon and a gentleman is further emphasized by his determination to get educated immediately after his great expectations were announced. Pip is dissatisfied with the education he gets from the "ridiculous old woman", Mrs. Wopsle (chap. 7, p. 75) and is motivated by the prospect of refining himself into becoming uncommon (chap. 10). That is why he asks Biddy to help him learn the basics (chap. 10). She agrees and gives him some books to start with. She even teaches him a ditty about a man who goes to London and leads an extravagant life (chap. 15). A further incentive for Pip to insist on a gentlemanly education was Estella's being sent abroad to be educated as a lady (chap. 15). But Pip is not contented with only educating himself, he is also concerned with raising the level of his acquaintances. When he realizes that Joe is illiterate (chap. 7), he, in turn, starts to teach him everything he has learned regardless of how much Joe is actually capable of taking in (chap. 15).
Pip's id, particularly his strong desire to become a gentleman, is illustrated in his fascination with the Satis House high class lifestyle, his cover-ups on its deficiencies, his relinquishment of his own common life, and his hankering after education. This paves the way for the forces that would stand in the way of achieving his dream, the superego.

**Part II- The Superego**

In Freudian theory, the human mind is structured around an id-superego relationship that represents the struggle between the pleasure principle and the reality principle. The id is driven by the former principle whereas the superego is driven by the latter (Freud, 1927). In Pip's case, the superego is mainly constructed from past common life restraints and present high-class repulsion.

**High Class Repulsion**

People representative of high class life are inclined towards belittling Pip and rejecting his plea to become one of them. Besides, their lifestyle, Pip discovers, is full of deficiencies, which might tune down his resolve to become a gentleman altogether. Ironically, the higher society Pip would like to rise to is represented by the cruel environment at the Satis House.

**The Satis House Repugnance**

Pip's first taste of high-class life was bitter. The Manor House, where the hostile Miss Havisham and the aggressive Estella live, is depicted as a gloomy place devoid of any form of life or feelings. "The cold wind seemed to blow colder there, than outside the gate" (chap. 8, p. 116). Miss Havisham, who is always strangely in the dark, seems to have stopped living since the day her lover jilted her many years before. Her relationship with her relatives, Georgiana, Sarah Pocket, Cousin Raymond, and Camilla, is even harsher than her relationship with Pip (chap. 11). It is based on money and power rather than mutual respect as is Pip's relationship with Joe at the forge (chap. 11). In fact, their visits to Miss Havisham is built on satisfying their insatiable greed for her money after she dies. Miss Havisham knows their intention very well as she often refers to herself as a corpse laid out as a meal for her hungry relatives to feast on (chap. 11). They visit her once a year on her birthday which turns out to be her supposed wedding day as well, the day she stopped all the clocks at home. Ever since that day, the wedding food and cake have been left untouched by anyone, exception made of rats, beetles and spiders that creep at liberty through the house. The abandoned meal and cake are a blunt reflection of the absence of love and human friendship that meals usually connote (chap. 13). Thus, while pursuing his dream of becoming a gentleman, Pip finds himself heading towards a life of death, decay, and empty relationships where he merely plays the role of Miss Havisham's walking stick.

Apart from the serious deficiencies of high-class life, Pip is denied access to its sphere because of his disqualification and ineligibility from a high-class viewpoint. Miss Havisham suddenly turns into a happy and contented creature when Estella scorns Pip for his coarse hands and thick boots (chap. 8). As a result, Pip loses his self-esteem, thinking that there is really something wrong with him, seeing Estella always ahead of him (chap. 8). Furthermore, Estella
rewards Pip with a kiss not for his love but for his violent behavior against Herbert Pocket (chap. 11). Estella even intervenes in the choice of Pip's own friends, especially Joe and Biddy: "What was fit company for you once, would be quite unfit company for you now," she tells him (Chap. 29, p. 419). And even though Pip decides to stay away from both friends (chap. 29) in order to please Estella and Miss Havisham, the latter makes a decisive move in the way of demolishing Pip's expectations to become a gentleman: She buys Pip's indenture as a blacksmith from Joe for twenty five guineas (chap. 13).

Gentlemanly Life Repellents
Setting the Manor House lifestyle shortcomings aside, Pip's practice of "gentlemanly" life involves a number of other inconveniences that can subdue his dreams. Matthew Pocket's definition of a gentleman, as stated by his son Herbert is dispiriting for Pip: "[No] man who was not a true gentleman at heart, ever was [...] a true gentleman in manner" (chap. 22, p. 290). Besides, unlike Pip who refuses Biddy's love, Herbert's gentlemanhood does not prevent him from loving a common woman, Clara, even though Herbert's mother is totally opposed to his marrying below station (chap. 30). Also the disparity between Wemmick's private and public lives in London seems incomprehensible for Pip.

Common Life Restraints
Pip's past life environment is among the factors that stand in the way of his desire to become a gentleman. Strategies of his old life acquaintances to hold him back from proceeding with his resolve to join the rich people club oscillate between reward and punishment.

The Carrot
As soon as Pip's great expectations are announced, his old life suddenly becomes appealing. When Pip decides to become uncommon, Joe reassures him that he is already an uncommon scholar (chap. 9). His sister gets assaulted, suffers some brain damage, and her "temper [is] greatly improved, and she [becomes] patient" (chap. 16, p. 261). With her new attitude towards Pip, he starts calling her "my sister" instead of Mrs. Joe Gargery (chap. 16, p. 263). Biddy is employed to look after her, and becomes "a blessing to the household" (chap. 16, p. 261).

In chapter 27, Joe visits Pip in London and asks him to leave his pretentious lifestyle, come back to the forge and his natural old life, and sit down and talk to the real Joe like old times. In order to remind him of his past generosity, Joe uses the word "wittles" to refer to the food Pip stole in order to feed the convict (chap. 27, p. 395). He succeeds in bringing to the fore the conflict between Pip's new gentlemanly life and his supposedly better old common life at the forge (chap. 27). Pip answers Joe's call in chapter 35 and realizes that, as Joe anticipated, the situation at the forge is indeed a better setting for an honest, unpretentious relationship between friends. They feel much more comfortable in the coziness of home, with Joe smoking his pipe by the fire. That was the carrot style, but after promises come threats.
When Pip insists on his dream to become a gentleman and uses lies to convince others of his desire, Joe informs him that "[if] you can't get to be oncommon through going straight, you'll never get to do it through going crooked" (chap. 9, p. 150). After Miss Havisham bought Pip's indenture from Joe, Mr. Pumblechook insists that Pip be bound by law at the Town Hall so that he cannot escape the type of life and job they projected for him (chap. 13).

Pip's common past is going to scarily haunt him almost until the end as he tries to climb the social ladder. In chapter 10, he is reminded of his illegitimate past by a stranger in the pub. Pip's assistance of the convict at the beginning of the novel continues to disturb him as he tries to become educated and far distanced from it (chap. 16). In chapter 28, he surprisingly shares a carriage with two convicts who sit behind him. In Chapter 39, the convict himself visits Pip and the latter treats him with disdain before recognizing him as the convict he, as a child, helped at the graveyard. The convict proves to be very generous and compassionate towards Pip: "Look'ee here, Pip. I'm your second father" (chap. 39, p. 316). Violence and crime in general keep recurring in Pip's life as when in chapter 15 he witnesses a fight between Orlick and Joe.

Pip's superego is constructed from the factors that stand in the way of his pursuit of gentlemanhood: past common life restraints and present high class norms. Common life limitations are demonstrated through a carrot-and-stick strategy, whereas high class repulsion is revealed through the Satis House repugnance and gentlemanly life repellents.

Now, will Pip's ego be able to negotiate a deal between his id and superego? The answer is two-fold: no and yes. He first fails before he can learn from his faults and end up embracing success in achieving genuine gentlemanhood. The next section deals with Pip's ego's failures.

Part III- Faulty Ego
This part of the article explores Pip's ego as he observes his great expectations starting to crumble, accompanied with the recurring feelings of guilt and shame when answers to all the ambiguities of the novel finally start to unravel. By the end of chapter 39, Pip appears to be achieving very little in life. His life soon starts to disassemble with neither a good honest living nor a good loving wife, finding himself unemployed and Estella married to his bitter enemy. He realizes that he has actually been proceeding towards what he was trying to flee as he fails to achieve any of his expectations. In chapter 57, we find him in the worst of his states, destabilized by the burns he sustains at the Satis House, his fight with Orlick, and the trauma related to Estella's marriage.

One of the reasons behind Pip's ending up with a faulty ego is his acting against his own nature. Wemmick maintains that society forces us to act against our nature, demeaning those who stand in the way (chap. 37). There are very few moments in the novel when we find him happy. He often feels sad not only because of his conditions but also because of the peculiar way he perceives them (chap. 41). He feels unhappy through thick and thin, through his apprenticeship at
Pip's Ego Oscillations in Charles Dickens's *Great Expectations* by Saoudi, Al-Eid, Al-Break, Al-Samih & Al-Hammad

Pip's ego oscillations are a significant thematic development in Charles Dickens's *Great Expectations*. Pip, the protagonist, is initially characterized as an idealistic youth who dreams of a life of gentility and refinement. However, his experiences in the Satis House and subsequent events in the novel lead to a profound sense of disillusionment and frustration with his old common life antagonism.

**High Lifestyle Disillusionment**

*The Satis House Distress*

Pip's frustration with his ideal of gentlemanly life starts at the Satis House where he first gets a taste of a high class lifestyle. His experience of higher society proves to be acrimonious from day one when he walks home from the Satis House ashamed of, and embarrassed by, his supposedly low life (chap. 8). Besides, early in chapter 11, he feels sickened by the rotten food and cake and surprised at the lifelessness of the stopped clocks at Miss Havisham's. He is equally surprised at the strange characters of Miss Havisham's relatives: the "vicious," "dry, brown, corrugated" Sarah Pocket, the "grave" Georgiana, and the old melodramatic Camilla (chap. 11, p. 183). Estella tells Pip that these people are jealous of him and hate him because they believe Miss Havisham is his benefactress (chap. 33). Pip is of course unhappy with the way Miss Havisham deceived him into thinking that she was his benefactress. His prospects to become a gentleman had already been damaged by her sponsorship of his indenture as a blacksmith (chap. 12) even though the news pleased everyone except him (chap. 13). Pip's acquaintance with Miss Havisham symbolically leads to his burning himself badly and putting his life at risk while trying to extinguish the fire at her house.

Pip feels unnatural with the way he reacts to these people's bizarre manners. Compeyson, the violent criminal who jilted Miss Havisham on her wedding day, is considered an ideal gentleman by high society (chap. 42). He is surprised at the violent life of these people as he runs into a young gentleman who dares him to fight. He then feels guilty for hitting him against his nature (chap. 11). Estella's insults of Pip even make him feel ashamed of the environment in which he has been raised and even of his own relatives as he "wished Joe had been rather more genteelly brought up" (chap. 8, p. 130).

**Gentlemanly Life Discomfiture**

Apart from the Satis House negative influence on Pip's prospects to become a gentleman, other high life factors also play a role in his astonishment and frustration at his life as a gentleman in the city. He soon discovers that London, the ideal setting of his great expectations and bright future, is an "ugly, crooked, narrow and dirty" place (chap. 20, p. 286). He has to pay visits to Jaggers whose office is located in a macabre "Little Britain" with a chair made of material like that of a coffin (chap. 20, p. 286). Wemmick accompanies him to his residence at Bernard's Inn, and it turns out to be a decaying place that is fallen into disrepair and worse than Pip's own rural poverty at the forge (chap. 21). Pip also witnesses a chaotic scene over a meal at the Pockets' (chap. 23). He
loathes city people's obsession with titles. The useless lazy Mrs. Pocket, for instance, spends her whole day reading about titles and ancestry (chap. 23). Drummle, the dispirited, gloomy, insulting and irritating aristocrat is respected, revered and taken as a model for being high class (chap.s 26 and 44).

Pip is also dissatisfied with his own extravagant wealthy life in London and feels guilty for leading his only true friend, Herbert, and himself into a prodigal lifestyle they would not ultimately be able to afford (chap. 34). "We spent as much money as we could," says Pip, "… We were always more or less miserable... our case was in the last aspect a common one" (chap. 34, p. 487). Pip's choice of lifestyle estranges him from his own nature and from his friends (chap. 34). He soon goes through financial difficulties, runs a fever for almost a month and, during the same period, creditors keep demanding repayment of his due debts.

Pip makes it clear that he is not proud of his state of mind and lifestyle as a gentleman in London (chap. 34). The hollowness he feels with being a gentleman is confirmed by his joining the disreputable worthless Finches of the Grove club whose members meet only to argue and get drunk (chap. 34). He stops being tutored by Mr. Pocket and does not adhere to any of the jobs he starts (chap. 39).

Even though Pip becomes rich and educated, he still cannot see himself as a true noble gentleman (chap. 39). On the contrary, he feels he has become less inclined towards generous acts than when he was in the past as a young boy with the convict at the graveyard (chap. 39). Pip's disillusionment with high class lifestyles is revealed through his distress at the repulsion from the Satis House and discomfiture at certain gentlemanly aspects. Pip is also frustrated at his old common life antagonism.

Old Common Life Antagonism
While pursuing his dream of becoming a gentleman, Pip finds himself being held back and repressed, not only by high-class people, but also by his old hometown acquaintances. Ever since he visited Miss Havisham's, he has developed a feeling of shame towards his upbringing in a lower class family (chap. 8). The embarrassment affects his respect and love for his best friend, Joe, to whom he confesses his concern about being a commoner (chap. 9). Yet, he starts his journey towards becoming uncommon by first being dishonest, or "crooked", as Joe puts it (chap. 9, p. 125). He finds himself compelled to invent imaginary stories to convince his people of the superiority of high-class life (chap. 9).

The first real setback to his attempt to climb the social ladder comes through Miss Havisham's sponsorship of his indenture to be a blacksmith at Joe's forge. People at Joe's house enjoy the news and celebrate the event. However, Pip articulates his misery as follows: "I was truly wretched, and had a strong conviction on me that I should never like Joe's trade. I had liked it once, but once was not now" (chap. 13, p. 187). He is ashamed of both his home and of his trade, no
matter how honest it might be (chap. 14). As he refuses his current situation, he begins to feel isolated and spends a restless evening with Joe and Biddy despite the dramatic change in his fortune (chap. 18).

The Joe and Biddy Displeasure
Pip feels that Joe and Biddy are among the first people to try and hold him back from achieving his dream. He looks down on Joe as common and low class, but attempts to raise him to a higher level by asking Biddy to educate him. Biddy declines immediately informing him that Joe, unlike him, is in no need for altering his current social level (chap. 19). When he finally leaves for London, he still feels torn between his old life and new prospects. In the carriage, he contemplates turning around to spend more time with Joe and Biddy (chap. 19).

Pip's past will continue to disturb him even after he embarks on his new life as a gentleman in London and pays occasional visits to his old village. When Pip is informed of Joe's intention to come visit him in London, he does not look "with pleasure" on the news (chap. 27, p. 386). He simply gives him the cold shoulder and it continues for years. But he later regrets it because he realizes that Joe was in fact his real benefactor who never asked for anything in return (chap. 52, p. 748). Pip's relationship with Joe and Biddy crumbles down as he becomes more and more hostile and pretentious as in chapter 39. Pip promises Biddy that he will be back in the village soon but Biddy honestly alludes to the opposite. Pip feels offended even though he knows well that she is right (chap. 35). He refrains from visiting Biddy and Joe for a long time before becoming conscious that he was in fact once again wronging them (chap. 39). His conscience disturbs him as a result of his ongoing disregard of both (chap. 34).

Villagers' Reprisal
Joe and Biddy are not the only acquaintances that seem to be pulling Pip back from his resolve to become a gentleman. Other members of his community also play their roles in the same line. While Pip is proudly enjoying a pleasant walk back in his home town, he is disturbed and made fun of by the Trabb boy who emulates the arrogant way Pip walks, shouting out, "Don't know yah!" to bystanders. Pip feels he has become a mockery (chap. 30, p. 436). On another visit to the village, an innkeeper tells Pip a distorted version of his own story and how he would ignore Pumblechook, the man who had been his benefactor (chap. 52)! Pumblechook himself rejoices in Pip's misfortune, believing that Pip had failed to show him any gratitude for having been his initial "true" benefactor (chap. 58, p. 847). In fact, the whole village starts to treat him with indifference after being so gentle with him at the beginning of his great expectations (chap. 58). That is not the end yet; another main figure from Pip's past unexpectedly reemerges in his life, choking off his dream. Pip's feeling of frustration aggravates as the convict astonishingly turns out to be his real benefactor and the one who made a gentleman out of him (chap. 39).
Magwitch, the Last Straw

Pip feels horrified and devastated when he learns that the real benefactor behind his great expectations is no other man than the same convict who was running away from justice at the beginning of the novel. "I've made a gentleman out of you," the man exclaims (chap. 39, p. 569). The money which set Pip on the way towards great expectations is no other than that of a criminal! He has been leading a profligate life profiting by the toil of a lawbreaker from the lowest of classes, no matter how kind to him he can be! It means there is no secret plan by Miss Havisham to make Pip's life happy or prosperous (chap. 39)! Pip sits by the fire contemplating his disgusting wretched position, being associated with the lowest of the low. He cannot indeed believe his eyes before he asks Jaggers to confirm the news (chap. 40). Magwitch has indeed once again turned Pip's life upside down as he did years back in the churchyard. Pip's pride, however, prevents him from taking any more of a criminal's money (chap. 41). And in any case, Pip feels he has not grown into the type of gentleman that Magwitch had anticipated (chap. 50).

Pip's disillusionment with high class lifestyles, revealed through his distress at the repulsion from the Satis House and discomfiture at certain gentlemanly aspects, is aggravated by his frustration at his old common life antagonism: the Joe and Biddy displeasure, the villagers' reprisal, and the reemergence of Magwitch that was the last straw that broke Pip's back. Pip's faulty ego cannot be in a worse situation. But how does Pip eventually succeed in finding a way for his id through all of those superego repressions?

Part IV- Healthy Ego

The journey of Pip's ego towards achieving his dream of becoming a gentleman finally comes to a happy ending. Two important factors contributed to the success: First, Pip reconciles with his past making it a part of his life, and then learns, through his rise and fall, and push and pull between his id and superego, how to find happiness in the present, and what it takes to have more realistic expectations of the future. He realizes that he can never live his life to the full without improving and cherishing relationships and friendships from his past and present.

Beginning of a Dream: Great Expectations

The announcement of the first of Pip's "great expectations" through a job given him "to play" for Miss Havisham mark a happy much longed-for turning point in the young boy's life (chap. 7, p. 92). It proclaims the beginning of his transition from the humble inadequate life with Joe and his wife at the forge to the company of high-class society. "This boy's fortune," says Mrs. Joe introducing his great expectations, "may be made by his going to Miss Havisham's" (chap. 7, p. 90). Then much to Pip's pleasure, the second of his great expectations is announced by lawyer Jaggers who says that Pip has been granted a large amount of money to be "brought up a gentleman" (chap. 18, p. 245). He buys new clothes and moves to London within a week. He is given lessons about life in the city and spends a lot of time reading (chap. 39).
Advantage of Nightmare

Then it was necessary for Pip to go through unexpected misfortunes in order to start seeing the truth about his false expectations to become a fake gentleman (chap. 53). Hardships allow Pip to be transformed into an actual gentleman who discards social value judgments and values honest relationships in order to start living a fuller life (chap.s 55 and 58). He embarks on a new definition of himself and of others, his own reevaluation, not society's labeling, of individuals. He used to judge himself in a punitive manner because of the supposedly criminal and violent surroundings that kept haunting him. Now he becomes conscious that convicts can be kind, and blacksmiths loyal, while high-class ladies may be the offspring of lawbreakers, and gentlemen villains (chap. 48). And above all, the convict, his merciful benefactor, turns out to be the father of his beloved Estella. He has made a great achievement, though unintentionally, by giving him a very uncommon and high-class lady to love (chap. 50).

The Awakening: Great Relationships

Setting aside the process of his "great expectations", Pip is now contemplating the worthier true personalities of Joe and Magwitch and others, and how having great relationships with the people who matter to him can heal his wounds (chap. 52 and 53). Furthermore, from Biddy's unexpected marriage to Joe, Pip learns that one should never indulge the hope of pursuing any hollow expectations whatsoever (chap. 58). Thus Pip becomes more generous and kind to the supposedly low and common (chap. 58). After all, Magwitch has sacrificed a lot, including his own security, in order to promote Pip into a gentleman (chap. 42).

Even though the bighearted Wemmick regrets the loss of Magwitch's fortune to the crown, that does not seem to trouble Pip in the least. He decides not to live off the money of others any more, substantiating the extent of his healthy transformation from pursuing the material selfish "great expectations" towards a quest for value-based altruist great relationships (chap. 54). He becomes an honest and loyal hard-working partner at his friend Herbert's firm and succeeds in paying off his debts on his own (chap. 58).

High Class Relationships

Pip realizes that the "lap of luxury" does not necessarily lie in material gain. It could be articulated through sincere friendships (chap. 22). Pip finds Matthew Pocket a sincere tutor, so he, in turn, feels serious in learning from him (chap. 24). At Bernard's Inn, Pip lives for five years with Herbert. Matthew Pocket's cheerful son, who becomes one of his best friends. Pip adores Herbert's honesty and upright (chap. 22). He finds sharing city life with him very attractive. That is why he asks Jaggers to allow him to continue living with Herbert (chap. 24). Pip accompanies Herbert to go and enjoy seeing Wopsle in a laugh-out-loud comical performance of *Hamlet* (chap. 31). In the evening, they invite Wopsle home for dinner to listen to him rant and rave about his role in the play (chap. 31). Pip also grows fascinated with Wemmick's slogan "Office is one thing, private life is another" (Chap. 25, p. 369). He enjoys his entertaining hospitality and humane compassion.
at home, far distanced from the office in which Wemmick seemed to Pip to be like a machine (chap. 25).

Close friends learn to go through thick and thin together. With the help of Wemmick, Pip anonymously grants Herbert one hundred pounds a year and helps him get a job. Wemmick describes Pip's gestures to assist Herbert as "devilish good" (chap. 37, p. 526). Again in chapter 55 Pip and Miss Havisham work together to secretly secure a job for Herbert. In his turn, Herbert takes care of Pip's burns in chapter 50 and unintentionally returns Pip's favors by offering him a job and a place to stay when he is in need (chap. 55).

At the beginning, Pip considers the simple act of seeing Miss Havisham on a regular basis a milestone on the way towards his promising gentlemanly future (chap. 12). He takes recommendations from the Satis House for an ideal, especially when he decides to ignore Joe and Biddy based on the way he thinks Miss Havisham and Estella want him to act (chap. 30). Yet, Miss Havisham's later transformation affects Pip deeply. In chapter 49, he finds her very lonely, looking almost fearful of him, without any trace of the former arrogance or pride. She even offers to help Pip assist his friend Herbert financially (chap. 49). She asks Pip for forgiveness which he immediately grants, telling her that he himself needs to be forgiven by others, especially Joe and Biddy.

"Common" Relationships
Pip, now a genuine gentleman, learns how to reconcile with his past and cherish old time relationships with Joe, Biddy, other villagers and Magwitch.

Joe and Biddy. After the announcement of his great expectations, Pip starts to treat people differently, including Joe and Biddy (chap. 19). Fortunately, Joe pardons Pip for everything he did in order to disassociate himself from them. After the death of Pip's sister, he finds out that she, in turn, had indeed asked Joe to pardon him (chap. 35). The proof of Joe's forgiveness comes to the fore as he stands beside Pip when he slips into a long coma, eventually helping him to heal (chap. 57). Pip is again assisted, as in his childhood, by the exceptional support of Joe (chap. 57). Furthermore, as Pip starts to recover from his illness, he learns that Joe has repaid all his debts, substantiating his true friendship, leaving it to Pip to prove his (chap. 57). Pip then transforms into a much different person from the proud snob who would ignore Joe and Biddy because people would talk (chap. 56). After all, it was Biddy who agreed to help Pip with books and education so that he can be eligible for gentlemanhood (chap. 10). Yet, Pip met her generosity with vanity and arrogance going as far as pretending to correct his teacher Biddy's grammar (chap. 19). Eventually, Pip asks Joe and Biddy for forgiveness which they grant with pleasure much to his delight. Even more, they give birth to a little boy whom they name Pip.

Villagers. There is no record of an ameliorated relationship between Pip and his neighbors after his awakening. Yet, before that, when Pip first comes into fortune, people start treating him
differently (chap. 19). He walks around town, delighting in the appreciative looks of his neighbors (chap. 30). Pumblechook treats him like a king, and Pip enjoys it from the pretentious idiot he used to loathe (chap. 19). Even the marshes, the symbol of Pip's common past, are now appreciated by Pip who finds them, through his rose-tinted glasses, beautiful all of a sudden (chap. 19).

**Magwitch.** Magwitch, the convict, has changed Pip considerably. In chapter 39, Pip becomes aware of Magwitch's gratitude to him for the kind act of providing him with desperately needed food back in the marshes. "You acted noble, my boy," says Magwitch, "Noble Pip!" (chap. 39, p. 563). Then Magwitch puts his life in harm's way to come back inside the country in order to meet the gentleman he conceived. Furthermore, Pip starts sympathizing with Magwitch when he realizes that he has actually been a victim of social prejudice and labels (chap. 42). People labeled him as a criminal who would spend most of his life in prison, and so it was (chap. 42). Yet, he mostly stole out of desperate need of food and shelter. Even though Compeyson, a gentleman in the eyes of society, was the mastermind behind Magwitch's crimes, he gets a lesser sentence than the socially labeled common Magwitch (chap. 42).

For all of those reasons Pip tries his utmost to protect Magwitch and ensure he does not get arrested and executed (chap. 40). He disguises him as a wealthy farmer and hides him (chap. 40). However, he gets arrested, but Pip remains on his side. At the court, he assists him out of the chambers much to the disapproval of the audience. Pip is cured of his pride and is no longer afraid of what people might think of his acquaintances. His hate of Magwitch has turned into a love that is worth being shamelessly expressed in public (chap. 56).

Pip's ego fluctuations between his id and superego close on a high note when he eventually achieves his dream of becoming a genuine gentleman. Two important factors contributed to the success of the ego. First, Pip learns, through the push and pull between his id and superego, how to find happiness in building great relationships in the present, not in relying on unrealistic expectations of the future. Second, Pip succeeds in reconciling with his past, making it a part of his present as well. He recognizes that improving and cherishing relationships and friendships, past and present, is the cornerstone of happiness and reconciliation between the pleasure and reality principles.

**Conclusion**

Studying the fluctuations of Pip's ego between his id and superego in Charles Dickens's *Great Expectations* has proven effective through the use of the three Freudian divisions of the psyche. Four main questions have been addressed: 1) What represents Pip's id? 2) What are the main components of his superego? 3) Does Pip's ego succeed or fail in striking a balance between his id and superego? In what ways does it fail? And 4) How does Pip's ego eventually succeed in putting things right for the hero? The study has managed to answer its key research questions and reached the following results: First, Pip's id, particularly his strong desire to become a gentleman, is illustrated in his fascination with the Satis House high-class lifestyle, his cover-ups on its
deficiencies, his relinquishment of his own common life, and his hankering after education. Second, Pip's superego is constructed from the factors that stand in the way of his pursuit of gentlemanliness: past common life restraints and present high class shortcomings. Common life limitations are demonstrated through a carrot-and-stick strategy, whereas high class repulsion is revealed through the Satis House repugnance and gentlemanly life repellents. Third, Pip's disillusionment with high-class lifestyles, revealed through his distress at the repulsion from the Satis House and discomfiture at certain gentlemanly aspects, is aggravated by his frustration at his old common life antagonism: the Joe and Biddy displeasure, the villagers' reprisal, and the reemergence of Magwitch in Pip's life. Fourth, the journey of Pip's ego towards achieving his dream of becoming a gentleman finally comes to a happy ending. Two important factors contributed to the success: Pip reconciles with his past making it a part of his life, and learns, through the push and pull between his id and superego, how to find happiness in the present, and what it takes to have more realistic expectations of the future. He realizes that he can never live his life more fully without improving and cherishing relationships and friendships from his past and present.

Applying Freudian psychoanalytic criticism to the study of *Great Expectations* has proven to be a fruitful exploration of literature. This study can be taken as a model to study other aspects of the novel, particularly love between Pip and Estella and the theme of security. The approach can also be applied to other literary works that lend themselves to examination through psychoanalytic criticism.

About the Authors:

**Bechir Saoudi** got his Ph.D. in English Literature and Cultural Studies from the University of Manouba, Tunisia. He is currently an Assistant Professor of English literature at the English Department of the College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University, Al-Kharj, Saudi Arabia. His research interests are in the literary and cultural studies domain. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/ 0000-0001-5593-6891

The rest of the authors are graduate students of English Language and Literature at the College of Science and Humanities, Hotat Bani Tamim, Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University, Al-Kharj, Saudi Arabia.

**Bechir Saoudi**, ORCiD: https://orcid.org/ 0000-0001-5593-6891
**Lama Fahad Al-Eid**, ORCiD: https://orcid.org/ 0000-0002-1092-400X
**Noura Mohammed Al-Break**, ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4337-0602
**Rahaf Saad Al-Samih**, ORCiD: https://orcid.org/ 0000-0001-9866-0426
**Tarfah Abdullah Al-Hammad**, ORCiD: https://orcid.org/ 0000-0001-7080-7393
References
Reading F.S. Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby* through Aristotle’s Eyes: Friendship, Gifts, and Commodities

**Ibrahim Henna**
University Mouloud Mammeri of Tizi Ouzou, Algeria  
Correspondent Author: hennaibra@hotmail.fr

**Sabrina Zerar**
University Mouloud Mammeri of Tizi Ouzou, Algeria

Received: 10/17/2020  
Accepted: 1/19/2021  
Published: 2/24/2021

**Abstract**
This research explores the interlocked notions of friendship, community, gift, and commodity culture in Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby*. It seeks to demonstrate that Fitzgerald’s ethical vision of friendship, community, the Bad, and the Good are deeply shaped by Aristotle’s works *The Nicomachean Ethics*, *The Politics*, and *The Metaphysics*. The extent to which Aristotle has shaped the form and contents of *The Great Gatsby*, a novel rightly described as a classic of its genre and how far the contentious aspect of its gendered and orientalized characterization can be traced to Fitzgerald’s dialogic relation with the Greek philosopher are among certain questions that this research addresses. The approach to the issue and the related questions stated above is eclectic. It draws its paradigms, partly from Bakhtin’s dialogical theory, partly from economic and cultural anthropology, and partly from postcolonial, historical theory of the type elaborated by Said and Fanon.  

**Key-words:** Aristotle, 1920s America, community, commodities, friendship, Fitzgerald, gifts

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.20
Introduction

None of F. Scott Fitzgerald’s other literary works, whether in poetry or prose, has received as much critical attention as his *The Great Gatsby* (1925). If it is true, as it is sometimes claimed, in critical circles, that authors really produce only a single book that they keep re-writing in different forms, *The Great Gatsby* is certainly the case. Among all his books, it is this novel that has earned Fitzgerald the title of the novelist. To date, it has been read from so many perspectives that it has become very difficult, indeed, for belated researchers to carve a niche in the huge of scholarship that it has already amassed. However, notwithstanding the intimidating volume of literature presently at hand, *The Great Gatsby*, just like the Sphinx, never ceases to invite the reader to try to solve its hidden mysteries. The purpose of this research is to do just a little of that in its focus on the interlocked issue of friendship, gift, commodities, and social bonds in the novel.

The issues of the gift, commodities, and social bonds in American literature have already attracted the attention of Hyde (2007), who has opened new avenues in American literary studies ever since the publication of his first book in 1983. The works by Emerson, Whitman, and Pound, among other American writings, have been analyzed from the anthropological perspective to show to what extent artistic creativity and the artist in American culture are deeply steeped in the world of the gift and gift exchange contra the money-centered drive of capitalism. Following in Hyde’s steps, scholars like Zerar (Personal communication made at the 15th International F. Scott Fitzgerald Society Conference, June 24-29, 2019) and Laceb (2018) have recently applied the theory of the gift as Potlatch in a tentative attempt to shed new light into *The Great Gatsby*. However, though these critics are to the point in ranging Fitzgerald alongside his American fellow writers as an author interested in the “world of the gift,” an aspect of Fitzgerald’s novel, consciously or unconsciously overlooked by Hyde, their studies concentrate so much on the negative perception of Potlatch, as a warlike conception of gift exchange, that they sidestepped its positive aspect, which is the strengthening of social bonds in a world dominated by commodity exchange.

How does this issue of the gift link up with the equally important theme of friendship in *The Great Gatsby*? From which philosophical and ethical sources, Fitzgerald draws the concept of friendship? On what types of friendships do the imagined communities in Fitzgerald’s novel rest? In what ways these types of friendships contribute to or unravel social bonding in the novel? These are some of the questions that previous studies of *The Great Gatsby* have not yet fully attended to. The central claim of this research is that friendship is the core around which the themes of the gift, commodity exchange, and social bonding coalesce. Unless consideration is accorded to the manner Fitzgerald makes use of the gift to critique the American consumerist society of the 1920s, the social, moral, and aesthetic significance of *The Great Gatsby* for both Fitzgerald’s contemporaries and today’s readers, the issues that the novel raises will not be appreciated at its real value.

The approach to this above-stated issue is basically dialogic or intertextual in Bakhtin’s sense of the word. The intertext that is considered as the key text for grasping the social, moral,
and cultural implications of the friendship of *The Great Gatsby* is Aristotle’s *The Nicomachean Ethics* (1987), *The Politics* (1992), and *The Metaphysics* (1998). In the former work, Aristotle defines friendship in terms of virtue, which he holds as “natural, as the bond of society, and as morally noble. (1987, p. 204)” He distinguishes between three distinct types of friendship, a friendship of utility and pleasure on the one hand, and friendship of virtue, on the other hand. The latter species is higher in personal and social ranking, for contrary to the two other types, it has a permanent rather than an accidental quality. The “perfect type of friendship,” as Aristotle (1987, p. 204) has written, “is that between the good, and those who resemble each other in virtue.” Further details from *The Nicomachean Ethics* and the two other works by Aristotle are proffered as the discussion below goes along. Here it is important to add that this ethical, political, and philosophical approach to friendship and related themes like the gift, commodities, and social bonding is supplemented by studies of the complex issue of gift and commodity exchange by scholars like Malinowski (1922), Mauss (2002), Schrift (1997), Weiner (1992), Godbout (1998), Gregory (2015), to mention but a handful.

**Tom Buchanan’s self-exclusion of the world or community of the gift**

All of Tom Buchanan’s friendships in Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby*, including the one he has presumably developed during his school days with Carraway, the narrator-character, at college are friendships of utility, friendships intended primarily to show off his virility with both sexes, by resorting to bullying. For instance, as a college boy, born with a silver spoon in his mouth, he bestows his beneficence to those he considers his most intimate friends, such as Carraway, on the condition for them to be at his beck and call. From the outset he is depicted as a bulky, racist man, looking at the world from a narrow-minded perspective. Tom is not even capable of developing a friendship of the pleasure type that Aristotle holds as superior to friendship of utility. At home, he fails to appreciate the pleasure of being in the company of his wife with his mind perpetually distracted by his adulterous relationships. We see him standing aloof and declining to meddle with other guests attending Gatsby’s party, which he churlishly dismissed as a “menagerie.” The only person to have bonded with him in terms of the friendship of pleasure is Myrtle. Even so, Myrtle suffers severe bruising at the hands of her paramour Tom for having dared to divulge the name of his wife before the guests in Myrtle’s New York City private apartment. He presumably does not want to lose his social respectability because of an adulterous relationship, which paradoxically he is proud to share with Carraway, as an old school chum of his. The purpose of letting out the secret is to show that he has not lost the success that he used to have with women at college.

Zerar (2019) and Laceb (2018) have analyzed the mythical aspect of Tom by referring to the monstrous figure of Cyclops in Homer’s *Odyssey*. The clue to this archetypal interpretation of this character, a foil to *The Great Gatsby*, is his dismissal of the latter as a “Nobody from nowhere” during their confrontation for the love of Daisy in the Plaza Hotel. “Nobody” is the name that Odysseus cries out to the blinded Cyclops to trick out his fellow monsters and escape identification by the patron sea god of the Cyclops, Poseidon. Indeed, the Cyclops holds the clue to the archetypal identity of Tom given the moral and the physical monstrosity, or deformity of the latter described.
above. However, in stating their case, Zerar and Laceb have missed the important detail that the Cyclops, as Vernont (1965), has rightly put it belongs to a place, the Island of Sicily, imagined in Homer’s *Odyssey*, as a place that refuses gift exchange and hospitality. In other words, Tom does not belong to the world (Godbout, 2000) or the community of the gift (Hyde, 1983). Completely ignorant of the “logic of the gift,” both Tom and his archetype, lack the disposition “toward an ethic of generosity” (Shrift, 1997), which Aristotle places at the core of the friendship of virtue and the community of friends it is associated with.

What is said about Tom’s typically utilitarian “friendship” holds true for many other friendships in *The Great Gatsby*. The case is the same for the relation between Wolfshiem, the Jew, and Gatsby; Myrtle and her husband, Wilson; Jordan and Carraway; Carraway and Tom; Tom and Daisy; and the established residents of East Egg and the *nouveau riche* world of West Egg; and finally the miserably poor residents of the Valley of Ashes and the rest of the New Yorkers. In *The Nicomachean Ethics*, Aristotle writes that friendship, especially in its civil concord aspect, is the cement of the polity. For Fitzgerald, through his character-narrator as participant-observer of social life in New York City, the predominance of the two inferior, perverted types of friendship – in other words, the pleasure and utility types of friendship – and the scarcity of the perfect third type of friendship, called the friendship of virtue are strong indications that the American society of the 1920s had trodden the dangerous path of unraveling its social fabric.

**Gatsby’s friendship of virtue in the world of commodities**

Whatever has already been said about inoperative friendships in Fitzgerald’s novel, it would be stretching the truth a little if no exceptions to the rule are allowed. One such exception is the posthumous friendship that Carraway avows of the hero at the beginning and the end of the novel, when all the utilitarian friends of Gatsby have deserted him. Whatever negative characteristics can be attached to Gatsby, as the main romance character, he still embodies the good that is usually the hallmark of the protagonists in the romance genre. His agonistic relationship with Tom is also conventional in the sense that, in romance, there is a conflict between the good and the bad. However, this being said, he is the one man whose friendship has the attributes of that perfect type of friendship Aristotle calls the friendship of virtue. Hence, in the course of the romance, Gatsby keeps alive the friendship with his mentor Dan Cody/Buffalo Bill by having a portrait of his place in his library. To Carraway’s question as to the identity of the man in the portrait, Gatsby unhesitatingly responds that he is “my friend.” Keeping a memory of a friend, who in his words has fashioned his character through appropriate education, shows the extent to which he appreciates the good that is done to him, regardless of the fact that he is tricked out of his pecuniary gains by Dan Cody’s mistress. The other characteristic that makes his friendship a friendship of virtue is that “smile” of his, which distinguishes him from churlish and fawning people around him in the days of his magnificence. It is this smile that has compelled Dan Cody to make him his closest friend.

However, we would say that Gatsby’s virtuous friendship shows mostly his devotion to his love in the Platonic sense of the word. Though unrequited in his love, he sticks to it up to his tragic
fall at the end of the romance, which, in this particular case, really deserves the qualification of “secular scripture” that Frye (1976) has accorded to it. The character of the good man, or the perfect friend, Aristotle tells us, is steadfast. It does not “ebb and flow like the tide” (1996, p. 242). Though crossed in his love, Gatsby never despairs, or loses his sense of chivalry and his gallant disposition. Unrequited in his love, Gatsby practically falls in love with love, in other terms with the Platonic idea that he makes of love. From the outset of the romance, Gatsby, as a clam-digger and salmo fisher, is figured out as a “fisher of men,” particularly when this trade is associated with that enticing smile of his. It is true that he is recruited as a bootlegger gangster. However, this does not throw a shadow over his character, for as Red and Edwards, have pointed out, the gangster at that time “was elevated to a sort of public hero as though American worship of success had finally burst out all bounds in its admiration for the slick operator” (1967, p. 309). Indeed, Gatsby’s gangster activity may be out of moral bounds, but he has been reluctantly enticed into it. If he is drawn to this immoral activity, it is not because he has an evil purpose in mind, but he desperately lacks the wherewithal to re-gain that supreme good, which is love.

The issue in Gatsby’s romance or novel is that love has become a commodity. Just like any other marketable good, love can be bought and sold. To use Weiner’s book title (1992), love no longer belongs to that category of things, which in the world or community of the gift, are called “inalienable possessions.” Furthermore, as Carraway tells the reader, Gatsby “has an extraordinary gift of hope, such as I have never found in any other person and which it is not likely I shall ever find again” (p.8). It is such a permanent and absolute attribute that makes Gatsby’s friendship, a friendship of virtue. As a donor of immaterial, spiritual goods such as the gift of hope, of love as a gift, and an ever-ready winning smile, Gatsby cuts the high figure of Christ. Romance is displaced by tragedy toward the end of the novel, but like all heroes he leaves behind him a literary testament written by his disciple/friend (Carraway). This testament reminds the reader that love and the community of friendship will ultimately triumph, though the world of commodities has temporarily encroached on the inalienable possessions called love and the friendship of virtue. These non-reciprocated, immaterial gifts that Gatsby bestows on his friend, and which in his turn transmits to his readers in his tragic romance, or “secular scripture” to employ Frye’s words again, belies Derrida’s (1994) strong claim that free or “pure” gifts belong to the world of the impossible.

Carraway’s conversion into the community of the gift

As Aristotle recognizes, there are some gifts between equal friends that cannot be repaid because “their worth cannot be measured against money.” The Greek philosopher gives the typical illustration of a friend who has learned philosophy from another friend to support his case. Thus, Aristotle, contra Derrida (1994) and Mauss (1990), admits that there is, indeed, such a thing as the free gift, or “transfer that need not be returned” (1941 a: IX. 1.11164b2). This Aristotelian definition of gift fits well with the immaterial gifts that Gatsby bequeathed to his comrades-in-arms and friend of virtue, Carraway. Though the latter expresses his gratitude to Gatsby, Gatsby’s gift-giving underscores the possibility of annulling the reciprocal obligation or debt generally associated with gift-giving, and of going beyond monetary calculations and the economy of the
market place. For all the reasons stated above, there is the need to re-evaluate the critique that Riche (Personal communication made at the 15th International F. Scott Fitzgerald Society Conference, June 24-29, 2019) has leveled against the character-narrator, Nick Carraway, whom he has off-handily dismissed as a failed Wall Street bondsman turned artist writer (2019). On the contrary, when Carraway is considered, in the light of his change of attitude toward Gatsby, the former does not look as a failed businessman in the bonds market, who is compelled to fall back on writing commercially successful books as an alternative to the bonds business to make up a return on investment. He cuts the high figure of a constant friend who has rallied to Gatsby’s call for love in the same way as Christ’s disciples, such as Jean did in the Christian love book par excellence, which is The New Testament. This comes with the reminder that Aristotle’s conception of the friendship of virtue finds an echo in Christian love as depicted in The New Statement.

A huge number of critics have the tendency to link romance in Fitzgerald’s The Great Gatsby only with the central hero, overlooking the fact that Nick Carraway is also involved in a romance by leaving the Middle West. Deeply traumatized by his participation in the Great War, he grows restless in “that the ragged edge of the universe [and] goes East to learn the bond business” (p.9). This quest motif is a hallmark of the genre of romance typically illustrated by the story of the Holy Grail. As already suggested above, his initial quest to make pecuniary gains by initiating himself into the trade of bondsman does not turn as well as he has expected, so he involves himself instead in an alternative spiritual enterprise by trying his hand at writing about social bonds. In his first observation of social life in New City as a participant-observer, Carraway has a very negative attitude to Gatsby’s princely pretentions, going so far as to dismiss him as a “Turbaned character leaking sawdust [in other words an effigy] at every pore as he pursued a tiger through the Bois de Boulogne” (p.71), a red district in Paris, France. Thus Gatsby’s pretention to a courageous big game hunter is, in Carraway’s eyes, reduced to a chasing of women of ill-repute in the notorious red zone of the French capital.

However, in the course of the narrative, Carraway comes to make a distinction between Gatsby and Tom, appreciating the former at his real value as the Grail he is looking for to heal his war-psychopathological wounds. Toward the end of the novel, he becomes an intimate good friend of Gatsby, joyfully accepting rides in the front seat of Gatsby’s Rolls Royce; giving him good advice in the extremely difficult situation that he has landed himself in the run-and-hit accident; admiring his generosity in covering for Daisy and taking the blame for what his golden girl, or girlfriend has done; and waking up in the early morning just to hurry to Gatsby’s home, to share a cigarette smoking with him and see how well he has managed the situation. After giving him advice to run away before the police track his Rolls Royce down in his garage, he expresses his admiration for Gatsby before he reluctantly leaves his friend Gatsby for work, fearing what might eventually happen to him. As he tells the reader, “Before I reached the hedge, I remembered something and turned around. “They are a rotten crowd,” I shouted. “You are worth the whole damn lot of them together” (1994, p. 160). Thus, swept along by the force of affection of friendship, Carraway clears his friend’s name that has been muddied throughout the romance. The
force of his ethical friendship is such that it is the only friend to stay in Gatsby’s home to take in charge of the funeral ceremony.

**Gatsby’s magnificence**

Critics have paid little attention to the title of Fitzgerald’s romance, *The Great Gatsby*, which in the French language translates as *Gatsby le Magnifique*. This title shows the extent of respect and the touching devotion that Carraway has for his deceased friend. The reader remembers that at the outset of his romance, in consequence of his father’s advice, Gatsby is “inclined to reserve all judgments, a habit that has opened up many curious natures to me and made me the victim of not a few veteran bores” (p.1). As shown above, this parental advice to get rid of judgmental attitude toward people helps him to play perfectly the role of a participant-observer of social life in New York City. Still, he does not totally manage to hold his tongue, particularly with regard to women, the colored people, and the Orientals. With Gatsby, he makes a short case of his father’s piece of advice, moving from an adversarial to a friendly judgment with this ultimate statement that “Gatsby turned out all right at the end, it is what preyed on Gatsby, what foul dust floated in the wake of his dreams that temporarily closed out my interest in the abortive sorrows and short-winded elations of me” (1994, P. 8). These attenuating circumstances in Carraway’s tribute to and sanctification of Gatsby have the Christian overtone of the absolution of temporary temptation by sin. Even Jesus is not exempt from the temptation of evil, given his nature as both human and divine.

Writing a book about a remarkable friend that he entitles *The Great Gatsby* is a way of cherishing his fond memories of an honorable man and perpetual friend. In Fitzgerald’s romance, reference is made several times to tableaux. At its outset, Carraway ironically points to his resemblance to the war profiteering great grandfather’s brother, the one who established the fortune of what he calls the Carraway “clan”. “I never saw this great-uncle,” he tells the reader, tongue in cheek, but I supposed to look like him – with special reference to the rather hard-boiled painting that hangs in father’s office” (p. 9). As the romance unfolds, Carraway again observes that Gatsby has placed a portrait of Dan Cody whom he calls a friend on the dressing table of his room. Carraway’s story of the great Gatsby cannot be set apart from this predominant iconology. In other words, the story that he sets out about his friend is intended as a portrait, or rather an icon that will be a lasting memorial to a remarkably good man, comrade-in-arms, and virtuous friend. He makes a second homecoming to Louisville a healed man, just as if he had touched the Grail, which Gatsby has vainly pursued. He also comes back to the West as a born-again convert to the community of the gift. It is as a convert to Gatsby’s virtue of love and friendship that he writes down the following lines:

When I came back from the East last autumn, I felt that I wanted to be in uniform and at a sort of moral attention forever; I wanted no more riotous excursions with privileged glimpses into the human heart. Only Gatsby, the man who gives his name to this book, was exempt from my reaction – Gatsby, who represented everything for which I have an
unaffected scorn. If personality is an unbroken series of successful gestures, then there is something gorgeous about him; some heightened sensitivity to the promises of life, as if he were related to one of those intricate machines that register earthquakes ten thousand miles away (p.8).

In consigning the above words in his testament, he seems to observe the solemnities of a deceased comrade-in-arms, who, in his uniform, stands in moral attention to salute the memory of an exceptional knight of love who fell in battle in the world of commodities prevailing in the East. The superlative title of the book, The Great Gatsby, which Carraway gives to his romance, leads us back to Aristotle’s The Nicomachean Ethics in its evocation of what its author calls Megaloprepeia, in other words “magnificence,” best rendered in the French title of the book, Gatsby le Magnifique. “Magnificence,” as Aristotle tells the reader, means “a fitting expenditure involving largeness of scale.” It is closely related to civic and religious expenditure on a large scale of generosity, anticipating in these words what George Bataille says about the economy of sumptuous squandering in his Accursed Share. Aristotle adds two important remarks about “magnificence” and the “magnificent man” that can help get a short glimpse into what Carraway means by calling the hero of our romance, The Great Gatsby. The first remark is that a poor person could be generous, but he could by no means pretend to reach magnificence. The second remark is that the “magnificent man spends not on himself, but public objects and gifts [which] bears some resemblance to votive offerings.” Much more importantly, the “magnificent man is like an artist, for he can see what is fitting and spend large sums tastefully,” avoiding in this way the sense of vulgarity.

Aristotle’s interweaving of the artistic and ethical standards of magnificence associated with generosity, gift, and friendship, prefigure the great importance that philosophers like Hegel and Nietzsche and modernist artists in general accord to aesthetic objects, not necessarily in the form of the absolute autonomy of art for art’s sake, but in their potential to operate both inside and outside the commercial circuit of commodity exchange. The portrait that Carraway draws of the Great Gatsby falls in this type of aesthetic objects. The sentimental wrappings, in which he packages the portrait of Gatsby for the readers, makes it look like an illiquid gift that sets it quite apart from the ordinary, consumer commodities.

It follows that the epithet of “great” attached to the name of Gatsby by Carraway does not solely invoke the idea of magnificence (Megaloprepeia in Greek), as the French translation of Fitzgerald’s book as Gatsby le Magnifique, rightly suggests. The epithet “great” is also linked to what it exactly says in English, greatness or greatness of soul which Aristotle calls megalopsychia. Just like “magnificence,” “greatness,” or “great souledness” is the third and highest of Aristotle’s virtues of giving in Aristotle’s ethical scheme. The reader remembers that Carraway avows that when he comes back from the East, he “wanted no more riotous excursions with the privileged glimpses in the human heart” (1994, p. 8). However, immediately after he revises his attitude and makes an exception to his resolution as regards Gatsby the man for whom at his first encounter
with him “represented everything for which I have an unaffected scorn (p.8). In hindsight, the fond and cherished memories of the man, who has become a remarkable friend of his in the course of the narrative, loosens his tongue saying the words that accounts for the qualification of Gatsby as a man with a great soul: “There was something gorgeous about him, some heightened sensitivity to the promises of life, as if he were related to one of those intricate machines that register earthquakes ten thousand miles away” (1994, p. 8).

Aristotle has called the greatness of soul, “a sort of crown of the virtues, for it makes them greater, and is not found without them.” These are the virtues that will be celebrated later in The New Testament about the spiritually remarkable figure of Christ, who, among other things, has chastened the world of commodities then prevailing in Jerusalem. Aristotle has noted an asymmetry in the practice of giving, for the man with a greatness of soul is “a sort of man to confer benefits, but he is ashamed of receiving them.” The man with the greatness of soul is a man who is always in search of opportunities of acting as a doctor in order to impose his social superiority. We might read Bataille’s idea of potlatch as a social rivalry in Aristotle’s words. For Aristotle, the man with a great soul is always inclined to do everything on a grand scale, and the most outstanding hallmark in his character is “pride,” which far from being a vice “implies greatness, as beauty implies a good-sized body.”

Aristotle’s interweaving of aesthetic and ethical virtues finds an echo in Carraway’s description of the Great Gatsby depicted at once as “great” and “gorgeous”. Pride is also one of his traits particularly with his rival Tom. It is arguably because of Gatsby’s behavior as a proud man always inclined to give gifts to impose his superiority on Tom, the representative of the established wealthy class, which partly accounts for Carraway’s initial “unaffected scorn.” Aristotle offers the reader a key for understanding why he comes to appreciate Gatsby despite what looks like a defect for people without Carraway’s aesthetic sensibility. In The Nicomachean Ethics, Aristotle has suggested that ethical friendship might overcome “pride” in the practice of giving and receiving gifts. His character being a compound of outspokenness, honesty, courage, disdain of pettiness and slavishness, the proud man-cum-good man with the greatness of soul, “must be unable to make his life revolve around another, unless it be a friend.” Martha Kendal Woodruff explains perfectly why pride attached to greatness yields to or is suspended in cases of ethical friendship of the type binding Carraway to Gatsby:

The perception that allows Aristotle to go beyond the calculation of gifts is the well-known idea of the friend as ‘another self’ [allos autos]. For Aristotle, friendship stimulates both ethical and intellectual achievement. Only through cultivating friendships of virtue do we realize who we are by recognizing ourselves in the other. The human self, to become fully itself, demands an “other,” not an anonymous or abstract other, but an equal, a friend. This relation suggests a far richer understanding of self and other than either a Cartesian model, dependent on an isolated self, or an economic model, dependent on competing self-interests (Woodruff, 2002, p. 124).
The contentious issues of Carraway’s imagined community of the gift

The community of the gift that the celebration of friendship implies is deeply controversial in the sense that it is gendered, racial, and class-based. Indeed, when we look into characterization, it is first the female characters, which are lumped together as an outside group, are shouted down one by one, as accountable for the dangerous shift of the American community from the world of the gift into the world of commodities. The conception of women as “poor,” “rotten,” “bad” drivers is typical of this gender bias. It is these pejorative epithets that Carraway employs to describe Jordan Baker’s drive to her home in Warwick for a house party after a summer golf-tournament. Carraway tells the reader that “It was on that same house party that we had a curious conversation about driving a car” (1994, p. 65). This conversation is preceded by Carraway’s description of how he has come across Jordan Baker in the golf tournament, and his remembrance of having read about the scandal she has nearly caused at her first golf tournament by shamefacedly breaching the rules of the game. The reminiscence about the scandalous beginning of her career as golf player is triggered by an equally scandalous behavior that of leaving “a borrowed car out in the rain with the top down, (1994, p. 64) and lying about it in the same breath. He closes this introduction to the conversation by making the misogynist qualification of Jordan Baker as “incurably dishonest” woman with “a cool, insolent smile turned to the world […] to satisfy the demands of her hard, jaunty body” (1994, p. 64-65. Making of Jordan Baker a typical case, the reflection jumps from the particular to the overgeneralization that “Dishonesty in a woman is a thing you never blame deeply” (1994, p. 65).

The curious conversation that Carraway has with Jordan Baker about driving a car comes as Jordan’s confirmation of his masculine prejudice toward females, most notably the emancipated types, such as the ones that Fitzgerald nicknamed “the flappers.” One particular incident sticks in his mind, and provides an occasion to start the argument of driving wherein Jordan Baker condemns herself as a reckless driver. The conversation, he says to the reader, “started because she passed so close to some workmen that our fender flicked a button on one man’s coat” (1994, p. 65). In her offhand response, his reminder about her incautious style of driving, Carraway has put these self-accusing words in her mouth: “They’ll keep out of my way […]. It takes two to make an accident” (1994, p. 65). When she is told to make the supposition that she “met somebody just as careless as herself, she is reported to have made this cynical statement: “I hope I never will […] I hate careless people. That’s why I like you” (1994, p. 65). Thus, Jordan Baker disqualifies herself as a totally irresponsible driver, selfishly interested in doing everything her own way, and more than that hateful of intelligent males.

Aside from the fact that Carraway is deeply anxious about women wearing men’s breaches, as one might say, female drivers as bad drivers symbolize the exclusion of women from the public space. In the American Republic, Carraway suggests, women are not qualified to steer what Plato calls “ship of the state,” because of their inherent dishonesty and their blatant lack of social responsibility. This American Republic, as imagined by Carraway, is threatened from the inside by self-willed females making a small case of male virtue, a word, it must be noted, is
etymologically derived from the same root as virility, which is “vir.” It has also to be observed that this gendered conception of females as anti-social, and non-friendly is equally powerful in Aristotle’s *The Nicomachean Ethics* and, most particularly, in his *Politics* wherein he describes women as monsters. For both Aristotle and Carraway, women do not have and cannot have their place in the beloved community, or the world of male friends, for they are naturally incapable of working for the common good. In other terms, they are reduced to a subhuman species, a chattel, or subalterns, which must, by all means, be confined to the household alongside slaves and house furniture.

As the major female character in *The Great Gatsby*, Daisy fares as badly as Jordan Baker at the hands of Carraway. The way the love story unfolds shows that they are not cut out of the same cloth, that is the same text(ile)s. Daisy’s character development and that of Gatsby go into two opposite directions. The least that can be said is Daisy Fay is at first described in a sympathetic way. She is given the floor to express her disappointment with her husband’s infidelity, bigotry, misplaced pride, and racist attitude. However, the arrangement of the events concerning her character is twisted in such a way that, from the role of victim, she shifts into that of Gatsby’s complicit tormentor. Progressively, the reader is presented with all her human frailties. Her love for Gatsby turns out to be a passing fad for a World War I soldier, an attractive doughboy stationed in Louisville. She too easily let go of her previous love to move on with life by riding the wave of conspicuous consumption that characterized the “Roaring Twenties,” as Fitzgerald has dubbed the decade of the 1920s. Instead of waiting patiently, in a Penelope fashion, for the return of the Ulysses figure, Gatsby, she quickly disposes of her love commodity to the highest bidder in the marriage or erotic market by marrying Tom to whom she bears a baby daughter, Pam. There is some truth in Woldsworf’s claim (2019, p. 236) that Daisy’s reality principle allows her to successfully negotiate her mourning over the loss of her lover, Gatsby. And yet the very citation he makes in support of such a claim shows that her mourning is all too brief to be true colors:

She began to cry – she cried and cried. I rushed out and found her mother’s maid and we locked the door and got into a cold bath. [...] Next day at five o’clock, she married Tom Buchanan without so much as a shiver and started on a three months’ trip to the South Seas (1994, p. 236).

Ironically, as Gatsby is making his pilgrimage to Louisville in a desperate attempt to recapture his love, Daisy and Tom are abroad in France for their honeymoon. When the forgotten lover shows up after a difficult nostos/homecoming, her love for the newly enriched Gatsby flares into life, but it almost immediately peters out in the Plaza Hotel scene. What is written about her sounds as she is determined to have her last flings with her former lover to pay back in kind the sexual infidelity of an adulterous husband. As the novel draws to the close, the plot is turned one more screw to show her to be as irresponsible as Jordan Baker in driving. Not only does she cause a hit-and-run accident, but she is also complicit with her husband in disclosing the identity of Gatsby, who has covered for her, in order to run away with the murder of Myrtle.
If the contrastive representations of Daisy and Gatsby have to be qualified at all, they can be described as, respectively, Ovidian and Platonic, or Aristotelian. Gatsby’s love, as Carraway has reported about it, is “Platonic,” that is to say, perfect. It is offered to the reader as a contemplative aesthetic ideal that endures the vicissitudes of time. By contrast, Daisy’s love is liable to metamorphosis, i.e., to easily change. Thus, Daisy, like all female figures in the novel, shows a lack of character. Carraway even uses irony to point out that Daisy is short of virtue. Indeed, it is irony that peeps out behind Carraway’s reference to Daisy’s daughter, Pam, who is presented to both Carraway and Gatsby. Pam is an oblique reference to Richardson’s, Pamela, the eponymous heroine. The reader remembers that the full title of Richardson’s book is *Pamela, or, virtue rewarded*. Daisy is strikingly different from Richardson’s heroine of virtue. Instead of being rewarded for virtue, Daisy is seen rather as an adulterous woman, at whom Pam, her daughter, points an accusation finger. In Carraway’s characterization, Pam is to Daisy what the elf-child Pearl is to the adulterous Hester Prynne in Hawthorne’s *The Scarlet Letter*.

In the final analysis, in accordance with clear-cut Aristotelian distinctions between the bad and the good that Carraway has made his own, Daisy is lumped together with the philosophical or ethical category of the bad, best represented by Tom. The following condemnatory lines about the cynical attitude to human life clearly make it clear that Tom and Daisy are cut of the same cloth or textile:

> I couldn’t forgive him or like him, but I saw then what he had done was, to him, entirely justified. It was all very careless and confused. They were careless people, Tom and Daisy – They smashed up things and creatures, and then retreated into their money or their vast carelessness, or whatever it was that kept them together and let other people clean up the mess they had made (1994, p. 186).

Carraway’s above final outrage at Tom’s and Daisy’s unethical complicity is misleading, for, from the outset, Carraway shows if they flock together, it is because they are of the same feather. It is not difficult for the reader to gather that Carraway’s characterization of Tom is that of a wealthy draft dodger and war profiteer trying to make up for his cowardice in the eyes of his community by playing on the cord of social, racial, and class prejudice. Licari (2019) and Laceb (2018) have superbly illustrated this character trait from this citation included in Carraway’s evocation of how Daisy comes to meet Tom while Gatsby is fighting in “that delayed Teutonic migration known as the Great War” (1994, p. 6). Tom and Daisy seem to enact the roles of the mythical figures of Aegisthus and Clytemnestra in Homer’s *The Iliad*: Daisy, the reader is informed, “didn’t play around with the soldiers any more but only with a few flat-footed, shortsighted young men in town, who couldn’t get into the army at all” (1994, p. 60). Carraway suggests through such derogatory statements that those who have come to inherit post-World War America are made of unethical stuff at the detriment of the real war heroes, like Gatsby, Carraway himself, and the Owl-Eyed man.
In The Great Gatsby, the disbanded or demobilized war heroes are forgotten because the people and the nation as a whole have decided to turn the page of the Great War, the Spanish influenza, kin to Covid 19 of our time, race riots, anarchist plots as well as labor strikes. President Warren Harding well summarizes the spirit of the second decade of the twentieth century in his Normalcy speech of May 1920:

America's present need is not heroics, but healing; not nostrums, but normalcy; not revolution, but restoration; not agitation, but adjustment; not surgery, but serenity; not the dramatic, but the dispassionate; not experiment, but equipoise; not submergence in internationality, but sustainment in triumphant nationality.

It goes without saying that adjustment to the normative model of society for which Harding has called is not easy to realize for traumatized veterans like Gatsby and Carraway. Harding’s emphasis on normalcy finds an echo in Carraway’s ironic reference to “war bores,” obliged to tell their stories in an erotic vein. As it is rendered, Carraway’s story of love in War- and Post- World I context, it is not just story of women that have unmanned the “band of brothers” (the words are Shakespeare’s) and threatened the social fabric through their erratic asocial drives, but also that of the threat of laborers, Orientals, and the black males. How far the community is at loose ends is expressed in the accident scene in chapter III, wherein a crowd is gathered around two collided cars. In the process of collision, one of the cars has one of its front wheels wrenched off. When its driver comes out to check why his auto is not moving, he stupidly asks the question whether it has “run out of gas” while “half a dozen fingers pointed at the amputated wheel” (1994, p. 61). Still not realizing the mechanical damage, he adds another stupidity to the first one by asking the crowd: “Wonder’ff tell me where there’s a gas’line station” (1994, p. 6). For Carraway, this car accident typically illustrates the extent to which American society has lost its direction.

In Orientalism, Said (1978) writes that Western authors often deploy the Orient in all its aspects for “local uses.” Such statement is true to facts in The Great Gatsby, where the eponymous hero is explicitly compared to Trimalchio. As is well-known from biographical information, the name of this mythological figure, inspired by the Roman author Petronius, was originally intended to be the title of the novel. A huge number of critics have tried to make a linkage between Trimalchio and Gatsby on the one hand, and their economic success and their quest for social prestige through the organization of banquets. To recap what has already been said above, the parties that Gatsby throws in West Egg resemble the ceremonies of potlatch. The latter are celebrated in a war-like spirit in Gatsby’s mansion, a glitz Camelot with the sole view to win back Daisy’s heart from Tom’s grips in East Egg. The literary “parallel lives” between Petronius’ Trimalchio and Fitzgerald is made by critics, who have accorded only a little attention to its Orientalism, and its political and socio-cultural implications.
Grimal offers the key to Carraway’s Orientalism when he writes that “De façon générale, tandis que le siècle d’Auguste avait prétendu amorcer une réaction contre le luxe et retourner aux vertus ancestrales, on assiste avec la période suivante, à l’envahissement de Rome par la civilisation orientale (Grimal, 1967, p. 84). Overall, while the century of Augustus had presumably sought to react against luxury and to return to ancestral virtues, in the subsequent period, we witness the overwhelming of Rome by oriental civilization. Grimal refers to Petronius’ Satyricon and Trimalchio, one of the major characters of the book, for evidence of his assertive claim. Among other things, he underlines how at the end of the reign of Nero, the fifth Emperor of Rome, infamously remembered for extravagance and debauchery, undermined the social and political fabric of the Roman Empire through the influx of newly enfranchised Semites like Trimalchio. Grimal goes on to explain how the frugal Roman way of life that had prevailed during the first century of the Roman Empire was shaken at its foundations by the introduction of the oriental, luxurious model of society brought into Rome by economically successful Orientals admitted not only as citizens of Rome but also as chief players on the political stage.

Looked at closely, the above surface parallel lives of Petronius’ Trimalchio and Fitzgerald’s/Carraway’s Gatsby is sustained by a deep parallel between the decadent careers of the Roman Empire and the United States of America. It has to be noted that America really started to play the role of empire only in the last years of the nineteenth and the first years of the twentieth with the annexation of Spanish colonies such as Cuba and the Philippines. Its participation in the Great War strongly consolidated its imperial status among the other empires of the time. The concern over empire in The Great Gatsby is not just a matter of literary reference to Petronius’ oriental character Trimalchio, but also of fantasized Orient that found its way into the American imagination and life through movies like Thomas E. Edison’s A street Arab (1898), Arabian gun twirler (1899) released by the American Mutoscope, The Sheikh (1921) by the Famous Players Lasky Corporation, and The Sheikh’s wife (1922) by Harilal C. Twitwedi, and The village Sheikh (1922). The rhyme sung by children in The Great Gatsby demonstrates how these movies about the oriental figure of the Sheikh entered into popular usage. Gatsby is doubly orientalized in Fitzgerald’s novel since he is associated with both Trimalchio and the Sheikh. It important to observe that Rudolph Valentino played the role of Sheikh Ahmed Ben Hassan in the 1921 version of the movie features. Obviously, Gatsby and his tragic destiny are patterned on the dark-skinned Italian-born actor, Rudolph Valentino, the sex symbol of the 1920s and his tragically premature death.

In elaborating his fictionalized drama, Carraway also makes Gatsby play a minstrelsy role. The reader remembers that Dan Cody, the fictional Buffalo Bill in Fitzgerald’s work, is a showman and that he is represented as Gatsby’s surrogate father. Apprenticed to a showman, it is not surprising that Gatsby is given several roles to play, at the same time, including that of a white man/actor passing for a black man by the blackening of the face just as in minstrel shows. Minstrel shows, it has to be noted, were still in fashion in the world of American theater of the 1920s, and their prevailing influence of Minstrelsy on American drama can be felt in O’Neill’s Emperor
Jones. Looked at from this perspective, Fanon (1967) provides a key for understanding the complexity of Gatsby’s desperate attempt to move from “rags to riches” to marry his golden girl, Daisy, and integrate the established white elite. Speaking of the black man’s alienation, Fanon writes what follows:

I wish to be acknowledged not as black but as white.
Now – and this is a form of recognition that Hegel had not envisaged – who but a white woman can do this for me? By loving me, she proves that I am worthy of white love. I am loved like a white man.
I am a white man.
Her love takes me onto the noble road that leads to total realization. …
I marry white culture, white beauty, white civilization.
When my restless hands caress those white breasts, they grasp white civilization and dignity and make them mine (Fanon, 1967, p. 63).

This situation of alienation described by Fanon finds an ironic echo in Carraway’s characterization of Gatsby’s erotic quest for Daisy and the civilization that she stands for. Such an interpretation is plausible in the light of the interest paid to Jazz in the novel, whose author is famous for the catchy phrase “the Jazz Age.” Moreover, this Jazz Age was marked by the Harlem Renaissance, whose white patron is Carl Van Vechten. And yet, no matter Gatsby’s success in playing a part in Carraway’s staged minstrel show, Gatsby, to come back to the metaphor of driving used in this section, is not spared the consequences of reckless driving that characterizes the whole community. As Carraway suggests to the reader in the culture of commodity peculiar to the community of the bad, such as Tom and Daisy, Gatsby’s romantic quest for the golden girl is doomed to failure before it even starts. On his road, he meets what Carraway calls a “colossal accident.”

Conclusion
To sum up, this research has demonstrated that the reader of The Great Gatsby is offered the gift of a hero and a book of which America is particularly fond at all times. Its narrator/character employs a moral or ethic framework (the first and last chapters of the book) inspired by an Aristotelian vision of ethics and politics to distinguish between the community of friendship or the community of the gift, and the community of the bad. However, as the second section of the research has shown Carraway’s ethic and political model of community rests on gender, racial, and class prejudices. As it is conceived and perceived in The Great Gatsby, friendship is a monopoly of white males, most notably the outrageously forgotten white World War I veterans in whose memory the book was written. It is highly symbolical that the funeral ceremony of the tragic hero is attended only by two friends of virtue, Carraway and the Owl-Eyed man, the literary surrogate of Roosevelt, a World War I veteran and creator of the American Legion. Thus, in a culture of commodity that has made short shrift of the virtue of heroism and friendship as social cement of the polity, The Great Gatsby can be read not as an elegy for the passing of a heroic age, but also a re-affirmation of ethical order in the face of the decadence of all sorts.
About the authors

Ibrahim Henna is currently teaching at the University Mouloud Mammeri, Tizi Ouzou, Algeria. He earned an MA degree from the same University, and is now carrying out a Ph.D. research in American literature with a focus on the multiple types of dialogic relations that modern American authors hold with Joseph Conrad. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8358-3250.

Sabrina Zerar is currently professor of American literature and civilization at the University Mouloud Mammeri, Tizi Ouzou, Algeria. Her research interests include issues of gender, film, and postcolonial studies. As director of the laboratory of foreign languages and cultures, she has conducted research groupings in these research areas. Some of her publications can be accessed at http://labs.ummto.dz/lecle.

References

The Evolution of Post-Postmodernism: Aesthetics of Reality and Trust in Jonathan Franzen’s *The Corrections* and *Freedom*

Mashael H. Aljadaani  
Department of European Languages & Literature  
College of Arts and Humanities, King Abdulaziz University  
Jeddah, Dahban, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia  
Corresponding Author: mhjadaani@uqu.edu.sa

Laila M. Al-Sharqi  
Department of European Languages & Literature  
College of Arts and Humanities, King Abdulaziz University  
Jeddah, Dahban, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia

Received: 12/26/2020  Accepted: 1/18/2021  Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract

This study aims to find out how literature moves from the postmodern thought, flourished until the 1990s, to the post-postmodern phenomenon. The study traces the evolution of this new phase as depicted in Jonathan Franzen’s *The Corrections* (2001) and *Freedom* (2010). It proposes these two works as examples of how over the past two decades, literature shifted from postmodernist fiction’s irony and skepticism that presents novels as “literature of emergency” to ethical objectivism and neo-realism (Franzen, 2002, p. 258). The purpose of the study is twofold. Firstly, it examines Franzen’s deployment of elements such as the subjective perception of truth, self-restraint, control, and knowledge, which he utilizes to understand reality. Secondly, it explores his employment of narrative tools (e.g., omniscient narrator, metafiction, intertextual dialogue) against postmodern fragmentation and deconstruction. By doing so, Franzen, this study demonstrates, reflects post-postmodernism’s core realist ideas that stress pragmatic interactions with the characters and readers’ cognizance of reality and encourage engagement with the narrative’s language to rework the novel’s social and cultural authority. These post-postmodern narratives reference fictional texts, real-life people, and authentic historical events that exemplify various models, simulations, and patterns of reality within and beyond the text, creating a mediated experience that enables communication with and understanding reality.


DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.21
Introduction

Between the 1960s and 1990s, many critical theories have described how the postmodern phenomenon influenced fiction’s subject and structure. Jean Baudrillard’s theory of *Simulacra and Simulation* (1994), about the loss of the “real” and emergence of the “hyper-real” (p.1) shaped the writings of many authors such as Paul Auster and Vladimir Nabokov attempted to represent aspects notions of the postmodern simulacra (i.e., copies that reflect something without an original version). These authors wanted to stress the disappearance of the real and colonization of reality’s simulacrum by presenting a non-referential characterization of individual identity. Another critical theory adopted by postmodern writers uses Derrida’s *Discourse of Deconstruction* (2007), which argues how “free play” in a text’s language deconstructs narrative structure (p.1). Another example is Donald Barthelme, a novelist, affected by the postmodern thought, and whose fictional writings, such as *Snow White*, show the death of language as a form of representation. In his fiction, Barthelme plays with the narrative’s language to present the novel structure as a “rupture” [series of substitutions], which refers to Derrida’s phrasing. The Postmodern thought questioned the central meaning of literary works, especially regarding their authority and knowledge. As a result, the reader must believe that the production of an authorial narrative or coherent subject in literature is uncertain and fragmentary.

Since the 1990s, however, new literary practices have undertaken a rigorous engagement with postmodern literary and social theory to understand its rapidly changing aspects. This engagement resulted in an emergence of writing modes that interrogated the values and theoretical perspectives of the postmodernist writing tradition. Indeed writers of this period, such as Franzen, David Foster Wallace, and Richard Powers, began to be critical of the postmodern forms of literary representation, which they believed, were insufficient to acknowledge the current literary and cultural conditions. Feeling the urgency to surpass/suspend irony and to celebrate sincerity and realism, these writers searched for new styles that celebrate truths, differences, and contradictions through the presentation of real-life people, authentic historical events, and mediated experiences that facilitate communication and contributes to the understanding of reality.

The term “post-postmodernism” describes a literary movement in American fiction in the late 1980s as a reaction to the growing discontent with values such as plurality, relativism, skepticism, and irony, as characteristics of postmodern literature. Instead, post-postmodernism expressed an interest in aesthetic and ethical values that enables them to engage and connect with the world around them. (Hartness, 2009). According to Smith (2005), “post-postmodernism” seeks to redress postmodern political influences regarding fiction’s representation of truth, rationality, or authority, which have been “threatened” by creating variant multiplicity in perceptions and evolutions. Meanwhile, Nealon (2012) defines “post-postmodernism” as a phenomenon that marks “an intensification and mutation” within postmodernism’s system (p. x) that is best understood as a as a “toolkit” for the “hermeneutics of [the postmodern] situation” since it is less like a continuous condition of the postmodern “hermeneutics of suspension” (Nealon, 2012, p. xii). While postmodern writers use theoretical tools of hybridity, contradiction, and fragmentation to develop new humanities in the period’s social, cultural, and political productions (Nealon, 2012), post-postmodernist writers sought new representations of truth and reality that exist beyond the
text (Burn, p. 21) through their discussions of topics on environmental future, social media, and ecological problems.

Although post-postmodernist discourse is not based on a theoretical framework, many contemporary writers (e.g., Richard Powers, David Foster Wallace, Zadie Smith, Michael Chabon, William Vollmann, Dave Eggers, Nicole Krauss, and Jonathan Safran) commented on the end of postmodernism, and the emergence of post-postmodernism in their attempt to provide a definition for this emerging trend. Wallace, for example, states that postmodern structures and the invention of irony in literature have reached their limit:

Postmodern irony and cynicism becomes an end in itself, a measure of hip sophistication and literary savvy. Few artists dare to try to talk about ways of working toward redeeming what’s wrong because they’ll look sentimental and naive to all the weary ironists. Irony’s gone from liberating to enslaving. There’s some great essay somewhere that has a line about irony being the song of the prisoner who’s come to love his cage (Wallace, 2012, p. 49).

On this debate, Timmer (2010) explains that the post-postmodern narrative mixes “high and low discourses on subjectivity” when analyzing an individual’s psychology (p. 360). He lists “sameness,” “inclusiveness,” and “willingness to believe” as primary concepts that reflect the post-postmodern self in its desire to heal from the angst and rage of postmodernism. Post-postmodernist authors move beyond postmodern irony to develop the potential of “language/textual determinism” (p. 360). Some postmodern techniques, such as metafictional devices, are reframed in post-postmodern narratives as realistic elements that reveal a narrative’s “realer, more sentimental parts” (p. 360).

Post-postmodern writers lengthily integrate authentic events and relevant issues into their narratives to engage the reader by combining fact and fiction (Yousef, 2017). Febleron explains that modern authors are interested in familial relations and cultural conflicts to illustrate identity issues, demonstrating a growing reemergence of authenticity in literature (cited in Yousef, 2017). The inclusion of these themes in post-postmodernist narrative expands the dimensions of humankind’s various particularities, including various social and cultural structures. So, the post-postmodernist narrative is a literary revolution that centers on realism and its representations.

Franzen is a prominent figure in contemporary literary discourse, and he has advanced the post-postmodernist approach through his writings. Even though his first two novels, The Twenty-Seven City (1988) and Strong Motion (1992), share some components of postmodern style and content, his subsequent novels, The Corrections (2001) and Freedom (2010), represents a move toward the techniques of a post-postmodern realist approach. These latest novels exemplify Franzen’s efforts to connect the new human condition with the existing set of politics to create a sense of engagement and wholeness in the narrative, which may allow for constructive change beyond postmodernism. Franzen demonstrates a commitment to aspects of the post-postmodern trend through his philosophical notions of identity and selfhood, his elaborate discussions on the
social, economic, technical, and ecological patterns of modern culture, and his revival of stylistic omniscience and metafictional discourse.

This study aims to identify elements of post-postmodernist fiction based on the aesthetics of trust and reality. By analyzing Franzen’s works, The Corrections, and Freedom, this study hypothesizes that his works call for a return to a more humanistic writing by depicting orderly worlds and real-life characters. Franzen’s post-postmodern character is assumed to have a distinctive identity (i.e., a real-life subject with a consciousness that expresses perceptions and seeks a meaningful existence). This study also seeks to identify Franzen’s attempts in the post-postmodern movement to legitimatize the individual’s personal experiences working toward identity stabilization. Furthermore, this study hypothesizes that post-postmodern fiction follows an increasing realist style by using the omniscient narrator to provide a broad perspective of the era’s socio-cultural politics with extensive insight. The study demonstrates that aspects of metafiction in post-postmodern works are integral to drawing connections between the narrator, reader, and reality, and to representing the post-postmodern tendency to accept differences, and to bridge the gap between the text and reality. This study will also reveal how current fiction, exemplified in Franzen’s The Corrections and Freedom, shifts from the postmodern complex narrative patterns employing pastiche, and irony, to celebrate a new version of realism that Franzen identifies as tragic realism.

This study is unique because it explores the specific details found in Franzen’s novels in order to trace the changes occurred in fiction since the postmodern time. The paper therefore adds to the literature exist a clear structure of the post-postmodern novel, its various patterns of reality, and its aesthetic views of the subjective truths through Franzen’s conception of characters and methods of narration.

Literature Review

Many critics studied interpreted Franzen’s works in the context of post-postmodernism. Tracing the revival of realist tendencies in his fiction in terms of form, characterization, and thematic concerns, these critics argued that like many present-day fiction, Franzen’s novels can no longer be adequately described as postmodern. Burn (2008) considers The Corrections to “simultaneously invokes and undermines millennial longing, so it simultaneously rejects and accepts the legacy of the postmodern novel”. He argues Franzen’s return to realistic techniques by depicting a well-recognized world and ordinary characters, and use of metafictional and intertextual devices, as markers of post-postmodernism. Dawson (2013) also explored Franzen’s post-postmodernist tendencies in a study investigating his use of the omniscient narrative technique. Dawson’s study classifies the new modes of omniscient narration and suggests that they do not show a nostalgic revival for traditional fiction or parodic critiques of classic omniscience. Instead, Dawson argues that contemporary modes of narration resulted from experimentations with narrative voices at the end of postmodernism. Dawson states that the omniscient narrator in post-postmodern fiction manifests the narrator’s knowledge, which is necessary for analyzing the era’s culture and represents them as a “public intellectual” (p. 150). Consequently, Dawson suggests that Franzen’s work, The Corrections, is an example of a post-postmodernist writer’s utilization of omniscient narration to reassert fiction’s authority in modern culture.
Gram (2014) also examines literary realism as a post-postmodern characteristic in Franzen’s novels. Gram argues that Franzen’s approach in *Freedom* goes beyond traditional literary realism. Although the novel’s representation of global capitalism, environmental degradation, and technological crises, Gram maintains, is akin to “Lukácsian realism,” in its use of “theses of scraps of reality with which they have no organic connection” (Lukács, as cited in Gram, 2014, pp. 296; 303), its critique of “growth capitalism”1 and its potential effects problematizes the novel’s realist approach because the demographical and ecological problems presented are “invisible” issues (pp. 311-12).

Annesley (2006) explains that *Freedom* connects private and public politics with individual and social psychology to reflect contemporary themes. According to him, these themes include strong ties between changes in the individual’s realities and globalization, manifested in the novel’s pattern and the global economy, consumerist culture, and technologized world. Annesley’s study demonstrates how Franzen reveals the realities of personal and social experiences heavily influenced and controlled by globalized consumer culture. Annesley explains that Franzen’s primary issue in making *The Corrections* a “social novel” involves having a level of “cultural authority” that presents globalization as a hegemonic power that shapes his characters’ thoughts and attitudes. Instead, Franzen only provides a satirical comment concerning globalization rather than critical insight. 2 Annesley suggests the novel’s “cultural authority” is probable when considering that Franzen’s characters take corrective actions regarding the capitalist system (p. 127).

Dubey (2011) also studies Franzen’s focus on reality as a post-postmodern approach and assumes that post-postmodernists’ “stronger drive toward referentiality” is marked by representing a critique of the social world (p. 365). He explains that current American novelists consider using language that communicates ideas and facts about an individual’s reality, aiming to revalue the social novel. Despite this attempt, Dubey argues that post-postmodernist authors (especially Franzen) could not instigate the realist social novel. Since Franzen’s account of “tragic realism,” as a complex representation of culture, affects his use of referential language, Dubey suggests that this may connect his fiction to the social sphere, a challenge that post-postmodern authors face in mapping the social novel’s content and new form beyond the framework of postmodernism.

Hosseini, Pirnajmuddin, and Abbasi (2018) discuss Franzen’s *The Corrections* from a post-postmodernist perspective. They argue that Franzen’s novel depicts a constructive rather than a deconstructive approach to reality by showing how Franzen’s new version of realism by conflating elements of “contemporaneity with naturalism’s determinism” to regain the reader’s trust. By highlighting aspects of “ethics, cognition and social minds”, the researchers argue that Franzen’s use of what he terms “tragic realism” enables him to revive faith in ethical and humanistic responsibility.

Concerning Franzen’s delineation of characters in *The Corrections* and *Freedom*, Tanenhaus (2010) demonstrates that he reveals several pathways toward “personal liberties,” publicly proving that American liberalism’s essential paradox is not created by American doctrines but is permanent due to Americans’ daily fabricated assumptions. Tanenhaus explains that Franzen illustrates his concept of a new, appropriate form of individual, personal freedom by focusing on
family life. When the socio-cultural atmosphere is engulfed by the growing American economy, he establishes “corrections” for depressing obligations and highlights that Franzen’s attempts to focus on real humanism subjects—at the social and individual levels—break postmodernism’s cycle (Tanenhaus, 2010).

Solomon (2001) highlights this realist identity and discusses subjectivity as a vital element for destabilizing the postmodern skeptical view. Solomon explains that the “break” with skepticism marks a “return to subjectivity” (p. 87), focusing on the individual’s personal feelings, aims, and attitudes toward his world. Solomon demonstrates that the shifting canon from a universal system to the individual level translates the philosophy of the “real or authentic existence” (p. 85) to a human, a theory that post-postmodernist writers currently aim to revive.

While these studies explore specific aspects of Franzen’s post-postmodern fiction, this study aims to provide an in-depth critical assessment of this phenomenon by analyzing The Corrections and Freedom. Primarily, this paper explores the ways in which the post-postmodernist approach moves beyond the uncertain, postmodern perception of fact-based knowledge towards the aesthetics of reality and trust in fiction. First, the study explores the various levels of subjectivity manifested in Franzen’s characters regarding the concept of truth in literature, which demonstrates the individuals’ “mutual respect of difference” in perceptions or ideologies (Rudrum, as cited in BOYNE’S, 2017). Thus, having various subjective truths is illustrated as a motive for strengthening the characters’ consciousness about reality. Second, the study analyzes Franzen’s use of specific narrative techniques, such as omniscient narration, intertextuality, and metafiction as narrative elements that enforce the aesthetics of reality and trust.

Discussion

Subjectivity and Truth

The aesthetics of reality and trust in literature require that characters be presented with a coherent identity that is not influenced by institutional powers, such as a culture or society. This approach involves handling various levels of subjectivity that provide justifiable reasons for the characters’ thoughts or behaviors through self-understanding (Van Katwyk, 2009). In The Corrections and Freedom, Franzen explores various levels of characters’ perceptions of truth; some create a story of authentic existence by extending dimensions of selfhood and self-knowing, which reveals that subjectivity is an essential component of the character’s consciousness of reality. Other characters maintain a lesser degree of subjectivity, as they are socially or culturally influenced, causing them to misdirect their life choices and become subservient to these powers. A culture’s political practices or any institutional capacity in the narratives seem unjustifiable compared to the individual’s consequent behaviors, attitudes, or ideologies. Franzen’s discourse attributes a character’s failures to creating a coherent self-identification that relates to the nature of their society and culture. His discourses are “modes of representation” that “endow the individual subject.”

They help humans develop a cognitive appreciation of their position in the world (Jameson, as cited in Hidalgo, 2017).

To justify their actions and empower their coherent identity, Franzen explores the relationship between individuals and their political systems: “if I could capture the way larger
systems work, readers would understand their place in those systems better and make better political decisions” (Franzen, as cited in Hidalgo, 2017, p. 106). In Franzen’s works, characters fail to embrace any level of subjectivity. They are either overwhelmed by social demands that diminish their sense of personal freedom, or are weighed down by the rules of social conformity, which influences their life decisions. This low level of subjectivity illustrates why post-postmodernists stress subjective self-recognition in their shifting world, as this kind of personal appreciation helps one regain the capacity to act and struggle.

Franzen’s depiction of a post-postmodern character reflects a tendency towards a coherent self, which modulates the postmodernists’ deconstruction of characterization. Franzen argues that “[p]ostmodern fiction wasn’t supposed to be about sympathetic characters. Characters, properly speaking, weren’t even supposed to exist. Characters were feeble, suspect constructs” (Franzen, 2002, p. 6). This means that a character’s consciousness overlaps with the plot’s complex, incoherent layers. Since postmodern characters lost their sense of identity, they experience a state of unknowing, ambiguity, and indeterminacy; their actions and thoughts seem unpredictable, even to themselves. These characters create an illusionary world to hide their fragmented psychology and alienate their identities from a contradictory world that they cannot harmonize with, becoming more “familiar with the void” (Hassan, Rudrum & Stavris, 2015, p. 211).

Contemporary authors primarily avoid the postmodern mode of characterization because they want to explore profound, authentic representations of emotion and experience, as they were informed by the postmodern critique of the ‘naïve’ belief that language can be a true mirror of reality” (Burn, p. 20). Like Franzen, contemporary writers aspire to “simultaneously invoke and undermine millennial longing by both accepting and rejecting the legacy of the postmodern novel (Burn, 2008). They were concerned with reviving realistic social novels because the period of postmodern narratives has ended, but they were preoccupied with theoretical explanations of non-referential language uses and dissociations from reality (Dubey, 2011). These deconstructive narratives were designed to cope with the aftermath of World War II and the cultural forces of Capitalism and Marxism. Although these theoretical representations successfully conveyed the fragmentary spirit of that period, the world is currently experiencing various crises. Brown (2012) emphasizes the importance of configuring the critical theories that a person inherits and stresses the dangerous effect of following postmodern theories of deconstruction. This danger lies in the individual’s mistaken belief in the collapse of everything valuable, including humans and their humanness. Thus, Brown emphasizes the need for radical responses to the era’s theoretical contexts and people’s genuine experiences. Otherwise, these theories will be denied.

The post-postmodernist narrative rejects postmodern notions of the fragmented character that lacks self-knowledge or self-control and embraces selfhood and subjectivity. With regards to subjectivity and its conceptualization of the individual’s consciousness in contemporary works, modern-day authors explicitly express emotions and opinions in enhancing existence and unity, as opposed to the postmodern era’s fragmented absence (Timmer, as cited in Hendry & Page, 2013). Post-postmodern fiction’s engagement with meaning, and presence can be attributed to the desire to develop meaningful presence, connectedness, and communication (Hendry & Page, 2013). This desire is anchored in common intersubjective perceptions of “emotions and experience”, (Hendry
& Page, 2013, pp. 56-57). Therefore, late postmodern fiction expands subjectivity to its highest level by placing “Man” and his consciousness as the “subject of art” (Hassan, Rudrum & Stavris, 2017, p. 287).

Subjectivity refers to a person’s realization of how they must create a coherent personality. In this psychological situation, a person becomes conscious about their identity (e.g., inner thoughts, characteristics, and ideologies), including what constitutes them and where they come from (Hall, 2004). According to the theory of knowledge and existence, subjectivity (with reference to the intersection between epistemological and ontological philosophical questions) demonstrates how “our understanding of knowledge [may] relate to, impact, and/or constrain our understanding of our own existence” (Hall, 2004, p. 4). Finkelstein (2007), however, analyzes the effects of high socio-cultural agencies on the individual to define subjectivity as the “condition between the inner and the outer in which thoughts and sentiments are parts of a political, economic, and historical flow of ideas” (p. 174).

In Franzen’s The Corrections and Freedom, the characters’ personal accounts are shaped on many levels to create multiple ways of being and different levels of subjectivity. The Corrections is “a theatre Franzen has designed to bring the different conceptions of selfhood his characters draft to explain themselves to themselves into conflict” (Burn, 2008, p. 115). Some characters have a coherent awareness of their subjectivity, providing observations and analyses of their actions, behaviors, thoughts, and ideologies to translate their experiences and understanding of the world. With this reliability, the characters cannot falsify or fabricate their experiences or views, even though they may contradict social or cultural doctrines. Other characters, however, cannot identify themselves within the scope of subjective identity. Franzen’s exploration of different personal accounts makes truth “so variable for each of us, that other people have difficulty in recognizing what it is” (Proust, as cited in Burn, 2008, p. 125). In a post-postmodern situation, social affirmations of an individual’s subjective history, actions and thoughts is unimportant. What matters, however, is these individuals’ mutual respect for one another’s personal ideologies. For mutual respect open possibilities for mutual understanding of motivations and choices (Burn, 2008, p. 24).

Franzen primarily depicts various levels of subjectivity to offer redemptive narratives and advocate for fiction’s role as a tool for social reform. Franzen provides several “salvational narratives” (Hidalga, 2017, p. 3), which serve as self-legitimatizing policies and ideologies. In other words, Franzen achieves personal and literary redemption through these salvational narratives. In his social novels of the twenty-first century, some of his fictional protagonists (like himself) are psychologically secure when they accept ethical commitments while rejecting the twentieth century’s sociopolitical practice of self-interest. Franzen emphasizes redemptive plots (e.g., reconciliation and self-development) as the keys for securing the individual from personal and social contradictions:

Writing is a form of personal freedom. It frees us from the mass identity we see in the making all around us. In the end, the writer will write not to be outlaw heroes of some
under culture but mainly save themselves, to survive as individuals. (Delillo, as cited in Hidagla, 2017, p. 4)

In the late twentieth century, the relationship between subjectivity and truth became essential subjects for debate. Foucault (1997) explores this relation not only by examining the effects of subjectivity on the individual’s conception of truth, but by tracing historical accounts of social politics and personal ideologies to define various ethics, techniques, and practices that form what her terms the “hermeneutic of the self” (p. 93). Foucault argues that the demand for a focus on the interiority of a subject in contemporary art is increasingly shifting from the “art of governing” (represented in three movements: “government, population, and political population”) towards the “art of living,” which emphasizes “self-understanding, “subjectivity,” modes of existence, and ways of being (cited in Lynch, 2012, pp. 160-198). To overcome problematic self-knowledge and identity issues, Foucault explains that creating new modes of expression through philosophy strengthens one’s sense of being, and broaden his/her choices in life: “what is philosophy after all? [I]f not a means of reflecting on not so much on what is true or false but on our relation to truth? How, given that relation to truth, should we act?” (p. xx).

Chirs Abani: Global Igbo (2015) also stresses the importance of presenting characters as humans searching for possibilities of political unity between and within cultures, societies, and relationships to secure personal redemption or survive trauma. Whether it involves the spiritual/secular, seen/unseen, or the metaphorical/material, this political unity is constantly changing and compelling humans to think of the self, identity, and being as thoughts and performances that fluctuate, like “simulacra.” For Abani, the “journey of consciousness” is “a composure” that is not based on a specific morality or doctrine but on finding one’s distinctive identity. To allow peaceful existence without “violence or shame,” a person must work with all these components to create an elaborate metaphor that is ethically accepted when compared to human nature (Chris Abani: Global Igbo, 2015).

Franzen conceptualizes various levels of subjectivity to reflect self-realization processes. The post-postmodern self may feel disconnected from reality but still provides solutions for this problem. Assuming that others share their skepticism, his works consider circumstances of hesitation, dispersal, and doubt. When experiencing the confusion derived from self-realization, these characters hardly change their priorities and values to avoid self-doubt, deception, or skepticism concerning their self-coherent experiences. They may easily conflate their sense of self and the period’s spirit by exploring practices that may secure their subjects. In other instances, they surrender to forces beyond their understanding to live in harmony with these powers. This identity- framing is reflected in most of Franzen’s characters, who tend to initiate different modalities of selfhood or embrace alternative ideologies to avoid self-deception, self-sacrifice, or self-doubt due to social, cultural, and economic forces.

The Corrections

The Corrections conceptualizes a mode of subjectivity that manifests possibilities of characters’ mental coherence, self-control, and self-knowing. For example, Alfred Lambert, a retired Midwestern father, presents a highly sophisticated level of self-control. At first, Alfred feels
confused about how to express his personality. Although plagued by the loss of concentration and its “complexity” as he ages, which makes expressing himself a struggle, he retains his strong masculine identity (Franzen, 2001). As a conservative, Alfred was the head of the railroad’s Engineering Department, until it was purchased by venture capitalists. He quits his job, sacrificing his pension, and he reflects that America used to belong to “upper-middle-class northern European men,” like him—hardworking and practical—but now, they are voiceless and cast out (Franzen, 2001, p. 372). Albert punishes whoever is opposed to his principles, demonstrating self-restraint and responsibility toward his persona.

To face his radical culture, Alfred resorts loneliness as a form of self-empowerment as a reaction to his misperceptions about his worsening health condition. His tendency towards self-isolation grows deeper when he discovers that his chair is not electronic but made of Popsicle sticks: “Maybe a floor became truly a floor only in his mental reconstruction of it” (Franzen, 2001, p. 355). Alfred even becomes more suspicious that every “real” instinct strengthens his consciousness with “righteousness, of uniquely championing the real” that is only abstract (Franzen, 2001, p. 355). Alfred’s feeling that the world is “uncaring,” makes him prefer isolation from the physical world, including others. It further increases his desire to dissociate himself from his intimate social relations, empowering himself against others’ sentimentality, which he believes weakens his self-control. Loneliness becomes his source of self-empowerment rather than social familiarity, even though he admits, “I’ve suffered from depression all my life” (Franzen, 2001, p. 29). His confession is not a request for empathy but a sign of self-realization. When a character realizes certain aspects of their personality and wants verification from others (even if it is negative), it illustrates Swann’s “Self-Verification Theory” (2011). This theory proposes that some seek self-verification because it gives them a sense of coherence and protection (Swann, 2012). This idea is indicated in Franzen’s essay collections, How to be Alone (2002). In this book, Franzen suggests that “the most important corrections [of The Corrections] are the sudden impingement of truth or reality on characters who are expending ever-larger sums of energy on self-deception or denial, [which affects] the more soul-like aspects of the self” (p. 80). Alfred’s responses to the changing world around him, his depression, and isolation are all corrections that he deliberately makes to prove his self-awareness (i.e., that he is different) to others.

Alfred estranges his aged identity from others to prove that he is aware of his inner personality’s uniqueness and does not need affirmations from external sources to assert his coherent subjective self. Kristeva argues that the elderly usually construct an “uncanny” conception of identity that works as a shelter from change, and this “uncanniness” presents the “self’s strangeness” to raise their awareness of being different from others (as cited in Defalco, 2010, p. 12). Old age is a stage to confront “the uncanniness,” which already exists within the mind and can present a new understanding of elderly identity (Defalco, 2010, p. 12). This realization allows for the self to be ethically accepted, helping the individual progress beyond self/other contradictions (Defalco, 2010). Alfred’s uncanny experience illustrates his restless psyche and provides him with self-appreciation, which elevates his potential to the highest level of moral consciousness (Defalco, 2010). Despite his worsening mental disorder, Alfred familiarizes his abnormal condition by demonstrating his differences, like when he tells Denise that his depression is unrelated to his
illness: “[h]e was depressed when he was still in perfect health” (Franzen, 2001, p. 278).

Despite his mental depression that worsened with his retirement and aging, Alfred’s self-control manifests the post-postmodernists’ preoccupation with a coherent identity. In post-postmodern contexts, the representation of the psychological difficulties facing the elderly (e.g., paranoia or other personal struggles) never shows “the inability of the body to adequately represent the inner self” (Defalco, 2010, p. 16), which is a situation that usually occurs in postmodern narratives. Instead, these struggles represent the elderly’s capabilities to hold still against the period’s socio-cultural changes. Alfred reinforces his unique identity against the cultural dynamics of the new world, such as consumer economics and the free market. These forces are presented in contemporary narratives (especially American novels) as a “colony,” or an authority that struggles to construct its characteristics based on those who fight to maintain their era’s beliefs and practices (Millard, 2007, p. 5). Consequently, Alfred creates his identity based on a different set of values and priorities; he retires when his workplace consists of people he believes are less worthy than him. He favors loneliness when others pity his illness and prefers a dignified death rather than being overwhelmed by social sentiments.

Denise also maintains a high level of subjectivity in the narrative; she is presented as a successful woman who continually cares for the Lambert family. However, she defines her subjectivity as not being “part of anybody’s life” (Franzen, 2001, p. 657). Regarding her personal freedom, she fights self-destruction and confusion by determining decisions without feeling distressed or explicitly recognizing social norms. For example, she marries her mentor, Emile Berger, against her parent’s will. Based on her desires that violate the typical social structure, she breaks off the marriage, longing for a love triangle between her boss, Brian, and his wife, Robin. Denise also struggles with her freedom and acts against societal standards when she has an affair with Don Armour, her father’s colleague, who had just blackmailed him. Although this relationship may ruin her father’s reputation and affect her family, she has no reluctance to pursue it, despite Armour’s old age—contrasting her teenage years—and married status. She proposes the affair and brings “her perfectionism to bear on a whole new world of skills” (Franzen, 2001, p. 485).

Denise underpins her subjective mode of existing without troubles. She never accepts the impossible while she develops her individuality, as her family does. Instead, she perfects her identity in various areas of her life, from her “sexual voyage” to the “restaurant arena,” to avoid the agonies of existence (Weinstein, 2015, p. 129). She realizes that her family is troubled by endlessly attempting to correct their poor choices, so she desires to take opportunities of pleasure when they arise: “By trying to protect herself from her family’s hunger, the daughter accomplished just the opposite” (Franzen, 2001, p. 648). Denise wants to hold on to her freedoms to break free from the oppressive feelings of self-denial and self-sacrifice. In this process, she deepens her self-admiration: “Maybe she wanted to make Robin like her simply to deny her the satisfaction of disliking her- to win that contest of esteem. Maybe she was just picking up the gauntlet. But the desire to be liked was real” (Franzen, 2001, p. 517). Feeling “sick of watching [her]self be cruel to [him], a state that can destroy her life’s model of self-control” (Franzen, 2001, p. 657), Denise, finally, breaks off her relationship with Robin, longing for personal freedom (rather than feeling obligated by societal norms).
Denise manifests a high level of self-knowing, revealing an elevation of the post-postmodern subjective character of conscious experience; she does not question her identity or opinions but criticizes others’ failure to appreciate her. Burn (2008) explains that Denise is “sufficiently self-conscious to detect different drafts of her identity” (p. 132). She filters her narrative perspective toward pleasure and provides explanations for her identity, like when she is fired from her job, “she told herself a story” to “recognize herself” to explain her behaviors rather than become overwhelmed by failure (Franzen, 2001, pp. 648-49). She interprets her experience solely from her perspective, which does not include others’ opinions. After breaking off her relationships, she does not justify her actions. For example, when her friend, Julia, asks if she had met anyone, she replies: “I’m seeing nobody” because she “didn’t want to hear her voice go small and soft with sympathy” (Franzen, 2001, p. 651). Therefore, she constructs her subjective reality without contradictions or confusion.

Other characters in the novel, like Chip and Gary, have lower levels of subjectivity to reveal their challenges facing the post-postmodern identity while trying to construct personal and subjective perceptions of reality. In the beginning, they cannot maintain coherent subjective perceptions of their actions and ideologies. Still, eventually, their unstable subjectivity is revealed as an effect of an imbalance between their inner feelings/thoughts and social constructs. Their mistaken beliefs and attitudes correspond to more extraordinary, external powers (i.e., socio-cultural values). For example, Gary is a “strict materialist,” who treats his father like “some worn-out old machine” and betrays his mother. Still, these misbehaviors are revealed to be destructive patterns that have resulted from the free-market, which is also responsible for his intense paranoia and depression. Similarly, Chip’s flawed behaviors are associated with his psychological “health” problems and involvement in “the consumer economy” (Franzen, 2001, p. 44). Since these characters cannot balance their minds with social and cultural authorities, they cannot construct their subjective principles or attain subjectivity. Their struggles against these forces embody the post-postmodernists’ interest in the self-confident, secure personality with faith in their ideologies over public politics.

Chip’s life complexities are framed by social and cultural influences that the author presents as hindrances to form his subjectivity. Chip is a college professor struggling to prove his identity at the personal and social levels. Since he is unable to develop a satisfactory perspective of socio-cultural conformity, he demonstrates immaturity. He believes that he “had almost nothing to persuade himself that he was a functioning male adult, no accomplishments to compare with those of his brother” (Franzen, 2001, p. 28). As he teaches the introductory theory course, “Consuming Narratives,” Chip must construct various assumptions and theories concerning social matters, which do not only influence others’ views of him but also his self-recognition (Franzen, 2001, p. 49). Chip’s student, Melissa, declares in class that he sketches fragmentary narratives of modern cultural studies to construct lies that enhance “the state of criticism” (p. 60). She states that while the society lives in a situation where “[n]obody can ever quite say what’s wrong exactly”, Chip tries to make effective judgments on his society and culture: “It is so typical and perfect that you hate these ads!” (p. 61). Melissa thinks that Chip criticizes cultural values (e.g., consumer capitalism) as “sick,” even if they are functional in society because it is “useful work” for him (pp. 61-62). It is paradoxical because although Chip is engaged in the problems of critique
and judgment, he, no longer able of recognizing his abilities and standards, cannot complete his film script, *The Academy Purple*, as he feels “powerless to keep the bitterness of his voice” (p. 60). Even when he celebrates its partial completion, he remains dissatisfied (p. 121).

Chip’s immature actions are not motivated by instincts. They are the products of social and cultural influence. Franzen manifests significant sympathy towards the young professor by making him “a victim of the social power of women and minorities” (Toal, as cited in Hidalgo, 2017, p.159). To overcome these powers, Franzen makes Chip commit social and moral violations (e.g., taking drugs and stealing money), causing him to be expelled from the university and to take a job in Lithuania, running a fraudulent investment scheme. This corruption scheme influences Chip, who states that his identity is deluged by the power of these institutions: “I personally am losing the battle with a commercialized, medicalized, totalitarian modernity right this instant” (Franzen, 2001, p. 44). When Lithuania’s government collapses, Chip transforms into a responsible person with the “emotional maturity” (p. 106) that he recognizes in his sister. He begins to value his moral duties towards his parents and feels guilty over past carelessness: “I could understand being responsible for them. Parents have an overwhelming Darwinian hard-wired genetic stake in their children’s welfare. But children, it seems to me, have no corresponding dept to their parents” (p. 563). After defeating socio-political influences, he reframed his life story, which was the novel’s most complete resolution; as Enid observes, “Chip, in particular, seemed almost miraculously transformed” (p. 728).

Gary’s identity is also conditioned by cultural constructs, including Western forces of fierce individualism and materialism, which create an inner struggle. Throughout the narrative, his identity shifts between being responsible and negligent and depressed and mentally stable. On the one hand, Gary’s materialism and individualism are evident in his response to his father’s retirement from the Midland Pacific Railroad when he suggests selling his parent’s house: “The first order of business, as Gary saw it, was to sell the house. Get top dollar out of it, move his parents into someplace smaller, newer, safer, cheaper, and invest the difference aggressively” (Franzen, 2001, p. 226). Moreover, he has several financial arguments with Enid, where he demands that she repay him $4.96 for six bolts, even while he earns thousands of dollars in investment. Gary’s market-oriented behaviors become part of his mental orientation: “although in general Gary applauded the modern trend towards individual self-management of retirement funds and long-distance calling plans and private-schooling options, he was less than thrilled to be given responsibility for his own personal chemistry” (p. 181). He believes that his “strict materialist” actions can give him a position of power as an active, responsible member of the family (p. 184).

Gary assumes the role of an economically minded individual, affirming his authority and power because he wants to persuade others that he is not “clinically depressed,” regardless of his symptoms (Franzen, 2001, p. 210). He fears to admit his problem and suspects that if he does, he will lose his right to have opinions: “He would forfeit his moral certainties; every word he speaks become[s] a symptom of the disease; he would never again win an argument” (p. 210). To continue disguising himself as a wise man, he attempts to enhance his mother’s expectations of him by adopting her “illusions” of life in the sixties (p. 342).
On the other hand, Gary will shift to his natural identity when he needs social sentiment. When Caroline thinks Gary is “changing the rules on her,” he states, “that the nature of family life itself was changing” rather than his persona (Franzen, 2001, p. 215). So, Gary relates his changing condition to the “nature” of his cultural life and not only to his mental disease, confessing that these cultural shifts are beyond his control. To comfort himself from his anxiety, he seeks protection under his wife’s psychological domination. Her constant remarks on his actions and feelings make him feel better: “he’d collected certain remarks of her into a kind of personal Decalogue, an All-Time Caroline Ten to which he privately referred for strength and substance” (p. 240). Gary is not only paranoid and irresponsible but “he was less than thrilled to be given responsibility for his own personal brain chemistry” (p. 182).

The representation of Gary’s struggles between personal will and cultural influences emphasizes culture’s role in obliterating self-awareness. Franzen describes how culture creates binary identities:

> We live in a reductively binary culture: you’re either healthy, or you’re sick; you either function or you don’t. And if that flattening of the field of possibilities is precisely what’s depressing you, you’re inclined to resist participating in the flattening by calling yourself depressed. (Franzen, 2002a, pp. 316-17)

Both sides of Gary’s character reflect processes of fabricating his identity, as he searches for explanations to justify his behaviors and live in harmony with a challenging culture. These hesitations are crucial in proving that “the great Materialistic Order of technology and consumer appetite and medical science really was improving the lives of the formerly oppressed” (Franzen, 2001, p. 61).

A third type of characterization in Franzen’s *The Corrections* proves that if a person does not construct their subjective perspective and way of life, they will not find a good sense of being. This is represented by Enid, the Lambert’s family’s loving yet demanding, mother. Enid constantly demands her children’s sentiment and desperately requests them to join her in “one last Christmas in ST. Jude” (Franzen, 2001, p. 101). She longs to build an image of a well-connected family, which contrasts with their reality. According to Gary, “Enid’s obsession with Christmas” is “a symptom of a larger malaise, a painful emptiness in Enid’s life” (pp. 192-93). Due to her sense of worthlessness, Enid pursues a plan for self-transformation that satisfies others, which misrepresents herself for the sake of social acceptance.

Enid’s constant self-deception is the only way to define her social identity as a wife or mother. She relinquishes her rigid identity to accept things that violate her standards to ensure that others feel her overwhelming compassion. For instance, she accepts her daughter’s homosexuality because she does not want to be critical and stand in the way of her daughter’s “happy and settled” life (Franzen, 2001, pp. 665-66). However, when she is not critical of acts that violate her ideologies, Enid feels ashamed and takes a medication called “Aslan” to cure her “chemistry of shame” (p. 412). Although she describes how her family causes her emotional trouble, she cannot resist others’ commitments. Alfred observes that Enid represents a
“[w]oman [who] pays the debt of life not by what she does, but by what she suffers; by the pains of childbearing and care for the child, and by submission to her husband, to whom she should be a patient and cheering companion” (p. 344). Her devotion in helping everyone but herself makes these social relations the “governing force[s]” that trouble her life. (p. 12)

Freedom

Franzen’s illustration of his characters’ subjective desire to come to terms with reality is further explored in *Freedom*, which dramatizes the role of subjective truth as a post-postmodernist technique to represent reality in fiction. In this novel, the characters’ subjectivity is associated with their desire to be liberated from demanding social obligations. Walter, for example, acts as an autonomous, independent identity who achieves a high level of subjectivity by managing to escape others’ influence. He utilizes his unique potential to accomplish certain goals, such as his environmental project. In this sense, Walter maintains a level of self-knowledge that empowers his coherent, stable existence. However, a character may fail in attaining a coherent subjectivity when they cannot detach their personality from others. Patty, the female protagonist, represents this characterization because she constantly seeks others’ agreeability. Her subjectivity appears as troubled throughout the novel, except in the chapters that are narrated as an autobiography of her reality. In these parts, Patty is redeemed by personal liberation. The memoir allows her to either compromise her failure, or reevaluate her success, and develop a level of subjective self-identification.

Walter’s identity develops from being a self-sacrificing member of the family to a self-interested individual. First, he relinquishes his desire to be an artist to pursue a career that consumes his free time to elevate his parents’ financial situation and meet his wife’s expenses. His voice is silenced, as he bears the pressure of his family’s mistakes: “Walter is a portrait in the displacement of unspeakable rage about what’s going on in his family through speakable rage about what’s going on in his country” (“Jonathan Franzen Takes,” 2010, para.1)

Walter builds his subjective identity by demonstrating personal power and confidence through self-discipline. During his interpersonal development, Walter insists on avoiding destructive habits. He believes that personal freedom causes the world’s troubles and is convinced that any “liberal state can self-correct” when “increasing restrictions on its personal freedoms” (Franzen, 2010, p. 138). Therefore, the only policy Walter pursues to confront disagreeable, painful, or embarrassing matters is limiting his freedom. When a person wishes to preserve their “moral subjectivity,” they may choose certain reactions in response to many experiences (Koubová, 2013, p. 33). Thus, to have a specific level of subjective moral personality, Walter assumes self-imposed restrictions. For example, Walter shows self-restraint toward his father’s abuse by refusing passive action and not complaining about his father’s cruel tasks. His restraint “showed his father that he could beat him even at his own game (…) if Walter hadn’t been perpetually occupied with hating him, he might have pitied him” (Franzen, 2010, p. 605). He also demonstrates self-discipline when he avoids engaging in family quarrels, like when he prefers not to argue with Patty about her support for their son, Joey, or exert any effort to stabilize his relationship with her.
Walter’s self-limitations enhance his rationality, allowing him to distinguish between right and wrong based on reasoning. For example, his copious research and statistical studies on the relationship between societal and environmental matters is what makes him able to eloquently justify the subversive idea that humanity is “A CANCER ON THE PLANET” (Franzen, 2010, p. 655). His rational thinking is aided by his inner will, a kind of control or authority within his psychological power. According to Koubová (2013), “the self-limitation of the will” motivates a person’s rational thinking (p.13), so reason (as a form of thinking that directs self-limitation) fulfills several methodological presumptions. For example, the notion of truth is direct evidence of existence because it presents a clear knowledge of all things. The result of this trust and knowledge creates a “principle of identity,” a specific explanation of one’s personality “being itself” (p. 9). Walter’s self-restriction allows him to develop his rational thinking and inner will to maintain his identity’s principle. Instead of putting significant effort into convincing others of his personality’s richness, he pursues his dream to enrich his interests and invests his time in a project to establish a campaign against humanity’s overpopulation and environmental destruction. His ecological engagement is not an act to retire the society, but it represents a free space to embrace an ethical commitment without indulging in social problems. Thus, the choice of existence is based on his identity’s principle, which is evinced in the “Free Space movement” project he initiates to create public, open spaces (Franzen, 2010, p. 492).

Walter’s self-management maintains his coherent identity, demonstrating an exceptional level of subjectivity. He does not align his narrative with any form of commitment to others in the social realm but assumes a level of self-discovery without externally imposed restrictions. As he reflects on how birds kill for food: “To me, that’s what makes nature peaceful… it’s not all poisoned with resentment and neurosis and ideology. It’s a relief from my own neurotic anger (…) and I’m not so compromised and I’m not having to deal with people” (Franzen, 2010, p. 663). Walter looks for “refuges” for the birds, but he finds one for himself, where his thoughts and actions can be “founded on accurate self-knowledge” (pp. 669-630). Rabinow (1997) believes that once a man designates a level of self-knowledge from an activity for “the care of the self,” he constructs a mode of living (p. 94) Therefore, Walter’s self-limited personality at the social level and his pursuit of a personal activity that does not require socializing with others does not show weakness or powerlessness but proves that Walter has chosen a mode of living based on his identity’s principles, empowering his subjectivity.

In Freedom, Patty represents the importance of subjectivity to reconcile truth. She is the devoted wife and loving mother of the Berglund family, who comes to this realization too late. She is presented as a burden to others and thinks of people’s “compliments” as “a beverage” to assert her social “agreeability” (Franzen, 2010, pp. 70; 50). In her youth, she devotes herself to basketball (“her religion”) and sacrifices everything to pursue it because it gives her space to be “the best… brilliant and beautiful,” according to others’ opinions (p. 114). Patty’s “thirst” for complements causes her to continually misjudge her personality. So, if she receives no praise, she cannot progress. Since she would rather see herself as “a person who, by her own admission, made nothing but mistakes” (p. 474), she cannot refrain from constructing her life on the choices others offer.
Patty’s search for agreeability stimulates unhealthy relationships, especially with her husband, Walter, and her college friend, Eliza. Her decision to marry Walter is crucial to change her sisters’ and mother’s the views about her lack of social credibility after her career-ending knee injury. This obstacle prohibited her from being a famous basketball athlete (Franzen, 2010). After their marriage, Patty is unsatisfied with Walter’s acts of civility and protectiveness show to express his desire for her. She even betrays Walter and becomes involved in a relationship with his best friend, Richard Katz. She knows that Walter's impression about her goodness is wrong, but she pretends to love him to continue feeling desired.

Her search for social acceptance is enhanced when she befriends Eliza, who remarks that Patty is the best basketball player on her team and needs “protection” (Franzen, 2010, p. 71). As a result, their unhealthy friendship strengthens although they have nothing in common. Although the psychologically damaged Eliza negatively influences Patty’s relationships, Patty still accepts her as long as her personal freedom is retained. While Patty’s life predominantly centered around sports, in ‘dark little Elizaworld,’ she ‘didn’t have to bother trying to be so good’” (p. 74). Patty fails to recognize that Eliza exploits her need for compassion. For example, Eliza tells Patty that has terminal cancer, although she is merely experiencing a drug’s poisonous effects. Patty’s fruitless search for social acceptance causes her to reject Eliza: “Patty’s entire document attested to the exhausting difficulty of figuring out… what was ‘good’ and wasn’t” (p. 509). Overtaken by Eliza’s recognition, Patty cannot “dedicate herself more intensely than ever” (p. 125).

Although the author presents Patty as irresolute, having to make her significant life decisions based on others’ agreeability, he offers her the opportunity to negotiate and elevate her subjectivity. In a third-person voice (at the behest of her psychiatric therapist), Patty writes her autobiography, which helps her identify herself as a distinguished subject. As she recounts her mistakes, she recognizes that “temptations of self-pity” make all her choices for social recognition “miserable” (Franzen, 2010, p. 246). Her autobiography provides a space for drawing her identity again and offers her the opportunity of self-reflection. She recognizes the erroneous decisions that lead to her “lowest of low points” (Bamberg, 2011, p. 323). The author gives her a new form of agency to elevate herself to become a new person (p. 323). She understands that she does not need to be agreeable for stability, as this desire is destructive to her self-discipline: “The autobiographer is almost forced to the conclusion that she pitied herself for being so free” (Franzen, 2010, p. 246).

Characterization in Franzen’s The Corrections and Freedom reflect the post-postmodernist focus on the importance of subjectivity in finding a stable mode of by adapting the aesthetics of trust and reality. It alters the postmodernist skeptical views concerning the representation of the individual’s consciousness about his identity. Since postmodern theories, which mirrored an age of fragmentation and contradiction, no longer fit the individual’s thinking in the late twentieth century, Franzen depicts a new identification of the individual who can find harmony in a radically changing world and create genuine connections. His characters demonstrate remarkable variations in their pursuit of subjectivity. Some successfully perceive the post-postmodernist conception of self-consciousness through their performance of various modes of subjectivity, while others struggle to recognize the total subjectivity of their narratives. In The Corrections, Franzen presents Alfred and Denise characters with coherent subjectivity, who are intensely aware of their life’s
ideologies, and whose consciousness flourishes as they legitimize their perceptions against social and cultural forces. For Alfred, self-isolation becomes a source of empowerment and self-recognition. Likewise, Denise’s multiple, non-traditional affairs are means to fight her self-destructive instincts and sexual confusion and break free from excessive self-denial and self-sacrifice.

**Narrative Style**

Contrary to postmodern novels, in which the omniscient narrator is almost absent, *The Corrections* and *Freedom* demonstrate how Franzen’s employment of the omniscient narrator and metafiction support the novels’ realistic approach. This narrative style is strongly associated with the post-postmodernist renewed engagement in social issues. The authenticity and sincerity of the post-postmodern narrative necessitate an authorial narrator to affirm the plot without casting doubt on its subjects’ validity that forces the reader to become involved in the subject “without falling back into a distanced mode” (Yousef, 2017, p. 39). The omniscient narrator has been reinstated in post-postmodern fiction with specific criteria. First, this all-knowing, all-seeing perspective on social, cultural, economic, or political conditions represents an objective view of the exterior details concerning society, culture, or history, impacting the reader’s perception of these issues. The reader’s perspective is manipulated by what the omniscient narrator reveals. The narrator builds a coherent role as the addressee; the reader is the addressee, thereby moving the narrative from a position of certainty, a narrative mode that contradicts postmodern narration in the authors’ attempt to liberate readers by enhancing their independence. By providing the reader with a broad perception of specialized knowledge about the world through an authorial voice, the text becomes the most satisfactory way to communicate with reality. Second, the use of the omniscient narrator allows for multiple individualized perceptions of truth since the author can control the amount of information the reader receives or recognizes about a character, which thus helps represent his/her subjective perception as truthful.

Another primary narrative method associated with the post-postmodernist narrative is metafiction, a technique which is also characteristic of postmodern literature. However, unlike postmodernist metafiction, which “self-consciously and systematically draws attention to its status as an artefact... [and] explore[s] the possible fictionality of the world outside the literary fictional text,” the post-postmodern metafiction focus on a pragmatic rather than ontological framework (Waugh, as cited in Bennett & Royle, 1995, p.170). As such, post-postmodernist writers’ use of metafiction “no longer seeks to expose and deconstruct fiction’s underlying premises. It does not subvert notions of truth and reality in the narrative (...) Instead, it reconstructs fiction as precarious communication and focuses on the ways in which we draw on fictions to make sense of ourselves, our past, our present, and our future” (Huper, as cited in BOYNE’S, 2017, pp. 27-28).

Choosing textual evidence that is either familiar or relevant to literary contexts has an immediate, practical effect on reality, limiting the readers’ and characters’ uncertainty of their realities, and
thus focusing on the reconstruction of humanist and ethical aims, such as truthful, meaningful communication.

Franzen’s metafictional style in *The Corrections* and *Freedom* significantly contributes to this effort, as they include elements of metafiction and intertextuality, which is considered a metafictional aspect that manifests the existence of “realities” outside of the text (Nikolajeva & Scott, 2001, p. 227). These elements represent reality within the text (i.e., the way a character makes sense of their reality) and outside of it (i.e., the reader draws connections between the fictional narrative and their reality). The structure of *The Corrections* and *Freedom* illustrates the deployment of omniscient narration as a post-postmodern tool, as both novels present the characters from multiple perspectives, and within a fluctuating time frame. *The Corrections*, for example, opens with a sketch of Enid and Alfred’s life from Enid’s viewpoint. Then, the second chapter illustrates Alfred and Chips’ perspectives in a new setting, while the third part presents the two characters from a myriad of other characters’ perspectives. The novel ends with “The Corrections” chapter, which demonstrates some of the characters’ resolutions. *Freedom* has a somewhat similar, though chronological and more straightforward structure. The novel begins with the presentation of the Berglund family from the external perspective of the neighbors. The family’s representation is then followed by an autobiographical account of Patty’s life. Subsequently, the rest of the novel is told from the perspective of three characters, Richard, Joey, and Walter.

As representations of the “Maximalist” novel, a new genre in contemporary American fiction that also gained popularity in Europe, Franzen’s use of the omniscient narrator in these two texts is significant. The term “Maximalist” narrative was introduced by Ercolino (2014) to characterize works that possess “a very strong morphological and symbolic identity” and are defined by the co-presence of ten elements: “length, encyclopedic mode, dissonant chorality, diegetic exuberance, completeness, narratorial omniscience, paranoid imagination, intersemiocity, ethical commitment, and hybrid realism” (pp. xiii-xiv). These elements are not consistently present in the same form for every text, but they are crucial for defining a maximalist narrative, which provides broad social and cultural critiques. The omniscient narrator is necessary for a maximalist novel because it allows for a holistic view. This mode controls the narrative’s materials, representing reality through the interplay of “macrostructural and the microstructural levels” (Ercolino, 2014, p. 100).

The authorial mode of narration in *The Corrections* and *Freedom* demonstrates different levels of maximalist narration. These texts represent stories that concern an individual’s subject and perspective by providing “a totalizing representation of reality” that manifests a maximalist aspect (Ercolino, 2014, p. 100). The most significant depiction of reality in these texts is evident in the broad descriptions of the American economy, which provides a broader scope of this period’s society, culture, and history. By representing these aspects of reality, the real world functions as a setting for the characters’ growth and development to engage the reader in understanding the characters. For instance, the omniscient narration of *The Corrections* mirrors the movements of financial markets and the collapse of Eastern Europe, like in Chip’s story about Lithuania:
Chip was struck by the broad similarities between black-market Lithuania and free-market America. In both countries, wealth was concentrated in the hands of few; any meaningful distinction between private and public sectors had disappeared; captains of commerce lived in a ceaseless anxiety that drove them to expand their empires ruthlessly; ordinary criticizes lived in ceaseless fear of being fired and ceaseless confusion about which powerful private interest owned which formerly public institution on any given day; and the economy was fueled largely by the elite’s insatiable demand for luxury. (Franzen, 2001, p. 574)

The novel also provides a list of the Lithuanian institutions’ tactics to tempt American investors, like including “the investor’s likeness on commemorative stamps” and a range of other materials to show the “extremeness” of American culture, like its “hedonism and empty materialism” (Franzen, 2001; Mulder, 2012). Franzen’s representation of America’s economic problems and the impact on its society/culture engages the reader because this knowledge already exists in their real-life surroundings, which gives the reader a fuller sense of the characters’ choices and motives.

In *Freedom*, Franzen uses the omniscient mode of narration to expand the novel’s political-economic dimensions. For example, Franzen presents these influences through the characters, like Joey, who is “feeling guilty” and Walter, who sees the news segment of “National Public Radio” as “worse” because it is “another voice of center-right-free-market ideology” (Franzen, 2010, pp. 520; 423).

Joey’s military supply business with the American Army and Walter’s projects that oppose overpopulation and the free-market are detailed illustrations of the country’s political and economic status.

In both novels, Franzen demonstrates omniscient knowledge through the use of metaphors or allegories. In *The Corrections*, this authorial consciousness is evident through the recurring metaphor of “corrections,” which links family members’ dynamic natures with the communal health industry and global market (Dawson, 2013). This metaphor is evident in the depiction of Gary’s depression, which makes him believe that “his entire life was set up as a correction of his father’s life” (Franzen, 2001, p. 181). One instance of this metaphor is evident in Gary’s obsession with correcting his father’s mistakes by embracing American capitalism. Another instance comes in his constant reassurance to others that he does not suffer from depression: “Depressed? He was not depressed. Vital signs of the American economy streamed numerically across his many-windowed television screen” (p. 292). Franzen’s use of the “corrections” metaphor to criticize materialist, capitalist culture is also evident in Chip’s connection with his health problems and consumerism: “The structure of the entire culture is flawed” (Franzen, 2001, p. 43). He dramatically and frequently embraces Foucauldian cultural thinking. Chip adopts Foucault’s perspective of discipline and punishment, elaborating a situation’s capacity for improvement or punishment (Carroll, 2013). Chip demonstrates the corrective metaphor when he explains that psychological problems are culturally constructed: “the very definition of mental ‘health’ is the ability to participate in the consumer economy” (Franzen, 2001, p. 44). Thus, through Chip’s embracing of the Foucauldian perspective, Franzen shows how late capitalism’s culture is “an all-
encompassing episteme,” a system in which individuals cannot be healthy if they do not ascribe to its beliefs, values, and practices. (Carroll, 2013, p. 111).

In *Freedom*, however, knowledge of the omniscient narrator is reflected in Walter’s symbolic view of the environmentalist project that stands in opposition to society’s liberal principles. Walter presents many scenarios of the planet’s overpopulation while planning financial schemes to save a non-endangered songbird because he believes American society’s fate relies on it. Walter thinks that his society’s obsession with freedom, as a model for happiness, for in his view, does not appeal to the common good of individuals. He explains to his neighbor, Linda, who wants to teach her children “to take care of a pet and have responsibility,” that it is not “a fair fight” to let nonnative cats kill songbirds (Franzen, 2010, p. 727). Ironically, his defense implies that “there is a kind of happiness in the unhappiness” (p. 603).

It can thus be argued that omniscient narration is an essential tool for the construction of “maximalist fiction” (Dawson, 2013, p. 156). At one level, the authorial narration establishes the author’s knowledge about current social problems and fulfills his desire to report these issues. Modern globalization widens the post-postmodern individual’s understanding of the world’s economic and scientific situations. Therefore, the narrator must be well-informed of international issues because they reflect the individual’s version of knowledge production and consumption. Post-postmodern authors analyze their contemporary culture by employing the omniscient narrator to contribute to solving the individual’s difficulties from a position of certainty, helping him understand his society and culture with a high level of confidence (Dawson, 2013). In other words, the omniscient voice presents a novelist’s political and social engagement with human experiences, which makes their arguments and critiques more convincing. On another level, authorial narration projects characters’ various perspectives by presenting the inner, subjective perspectives of single fictional characters as truthful. In post-postmodernist narratives, different perspectives of the same account are present throughout the text and are equally valuable. The element of reliability in omniscient narration makes each character’s narrative trustworthy and equally important to the other characters’ views. So, multiple perspectives are given equal attention by the omniscient narrator, who allots fair opportunities for the characters to deliver their personal accounts while being less influenced by an authorial “hierarchy” that differentiates them (Potgieter, 2012). In *Freedom*, for instance, the neighbors’ external perspective traces the Berglund family’s decline which begins when Joey moves next door with his girlfriend. The narrative then shifts to Patty’s autobiographical perspective, thorough which she reveals her guilt over her affair with Richard, and links it to the family’s dysfunctionality. All views are adequate and maintain the possibility of being right. Different analyses of an event are present in a set of discourses told behind the thread of a single story to deliver a variety of views that constitute meaningful patterns of equally important subjective realities.

In *Freedom*, the “autobiographer” allows for a deeper reflection on the aesthetics of reality and trust in the narration style (Franzen, 2010). Every aspect of Patty’s life is retold from the autobiographer’s perspective, with multiple comments expressing regret or providing explanations that enhance her self-esteem. Even though the autobiographer and Patty represent the same person, the former has a different voice to describe past events, which compels Patty to trust this voice...
over herself. The meaning of each detail about Patty’s life changes when it is recounted “in an irony then invisible to Patty but now plenty visible to the autobiographer” (p. 187). Patty’s autobiographical writing embodies truth because it presents her experiences as they occur, so they are without personal reflections. Olney (1980) writes, “an autobiography shares experience as its way of revealing reality” (p. 55). So, this omniscient style reflects a deep authenticity, as it articulates a narrative that represents realities:

The autobiographer, mindful of her reader and the loss he suffered, and mindful that a certain kind of voice would do well to fall silent in the face of life’s increasing somberness, has been trying very hard to write these pages in first and second person. But she seems doomed, alas, as a writer, to be one of those jocks who refer to themselves in third person. Although she believes herself to be genuinely changed, and doing infinitely better than in the old days, and therefore worthy of a fresh hearing, she still can’t bring herself to let go of a voice she found when she had nothing else to hold on to, even if it means that her reader throws this document straight into his old Macalester College wastebasket. (Franzen, 2010, p. 83)

Post-postmodernist writers use metafictional devices in their novels not to distance the reader from reality. Instead, they are used as modes of self-expression to enhance the understanding of the characters (Potgieter, 2012). In postmodernist literature, the primary effect of metafictional techniques is to reflect literary playfulness and explicitly expose fiction’s conventions. Still, the post-postmodernists argue: “[t]he only metafictional device that has utility for critiquing metafiction itself is metafiction’s own propensity toward self-theorization” (Little, 2004, p. 74). Therefore, they attempt to write an “anti-metafictional metafiction” (p. 14).

Many post-postmodernist critics reject the irony of metafiction, moving beyond skepticism towards authenticity (Funk, Groß & Huber, 2012). According to Wallace, metafictional elements are employed in the post-postmodern narrative “to expose the illusions of metafiction the same way metafiction had tried to expose the illusions of the pseudo unmediated realist fiction that came before it” (as cited in Conversation with David, 2012, p. 40). Burn (2008) stresses the metafictional aspects’ effects within the closed systems of the post-postmodernist novels and explains that contemporary writings rely on conventions of realism. Even though they embrace a level of ontology while inserting certain metafictional elements, one “hopes to draw the reader’s attention outside the book” to unfold different ways to construct life’s stories (p. 127). Franzen follows the post-postmodernist critique of metafictional devices and uses them to expose reality rather than the illusory. The Corrections and Freedom illustrate several intertextual dialogues with fictional texts or the inclusion of genuine people and historical events, which are all narrativized to develop a realistic sense within and outside the text.

A significant metafictional aspect in The Corrections is Franzen’s use of intertextual dialogue with William Gaddis’ work, The Recognitions. Chip’s email address, “exprof@gaddisfly.com,” which he uses to report to his job in Lithuania (Franzen, 2001, p. 559). Burn (2008) explains that the title of Franzen’s novel also has a symbolic allusion to Gaddis’s The Recognitions based on its desire to analyze those who are unable to “distinguish the false from the
authentic” (p. 98). According to Burn, Chip resembles Gaddis’ character, Otto Pivner, a money-obsessed writer whose observation that “a man does feel castrated in New York without money,” recalls the moment when Chip complains, “without money he was hardly a man” (p. 98). Franzen even admits that his novel pays homage to Gaddis’ first novel regarding its quest for the real:

The novel is like a huge landscape painting of modern New York… a quest for authenticity in a phony modern world. Improvising on the theme of art forgery, Gaddis fills his novel with every conceivable variety of fraud, counterfeiter, poseur, and liar (…) the main characters of ‘The Recognitions’ participate in the phoniness themselves. The young literary poseur, Otto Pivner, is working on a play whose plot, he says, ‘still needs a little tightening up’. (Franzen, 2002, p. 7)

Chip’s failure to complete his screenplay translates Franzen’s description of the “literature of emergency,” that “[t]he moderns employed” using “new, self-conscious methods to address the new reality and preserve the vanishing old one” (p. 11), a type of literature that Chip finally comprehends as he realizes ability to enact a “correction” to “be a man with dignity in this world,” thus proving Franzen’s argument that “[f]iction is storytelling, and our reality arguably consists of the stories we tell about ourselves” (Franzen, 2001, p. 141; Franzen, 2002, p. 12).

*Freedom* includes an intertextual reference to Tolstoy’s *War and Peace*, which has two effects. First, Patty reads this work due to Walter’s suggestion, ironically reflecting the love triangle between Patty, Walter, and Richard to Tolstoy’s characters: Natasha, Andrei, and Pierre. Patty links the feelings of these characters to her real story: “Patty felt she’d lived an entire compressed lifetime in those three days, and when her Pierre returned from the wilderness, badly sunburned despite religious slatherings of maximum-strength sunblock, she was ready to try to love him again” (Franzen, 2001, p. 239). In this way, she allows a fictional subject to serve as a realistic model rather than perceiving it as a preoccupation with the unreal. These intertextual references provide the narrative with a realist framework since the novel’s historical account mirrors the nineteen-century writers’ concern with realism. History and materiality are two primary themes of the nineteenth-century realist narrative (Hidalga, 2017). Franzen’s novel is set in a military-industry complex during the American invasion of Iraq. It references the epochal conflicts of the Napoleonic Wars in Tolstoy’s novel, echoing the novel’s realist account. Franzen’s intertextual dialogues represent the post-postmodern tendency to expand the story’s pragmatical dimension by stressing real-world elements beyond the text.

Franzen’s writing process not only consists of signifiers that refer to fictional narratives and describing relationships between literary books, but he also refers to real discourses, reflecting layers of realism. In *Freedom*, to bridge the gap between the text and reality, Franzen discusses the event of 9/11. Franzen depiction of the lasting impact of this real-life trauma on one of his characters, Joey, who escapes during the event transforms his work from the fictional level into the richer, more complex realm of the real (Franzen, 2010). Another example of metafiction is the author’s inclusion of real people, like Bill Clinton, which reveals a second layer of realism. For Patty, Clinton is a figure that “is no way intended to exculpate her but simply to elucidate her state of mind” (p. 201). By referencing real-life events and characters, Franzen deliberately blurs the
lines between fiction and reality. By so doing, he enhances the reader’s perception of reality, allowing him to develop a sense of familiarity with the fictional world, and to assimilate the fictional world with the authenticity of his lived experiences.

Conclusion

The new changes in novels’ style and characterization have not been outlined in a detailed ground since the 1990s. The long-term embrace of the hyper real than the real throughout the postmodern age has come to an end with the emergence of authors like Jonathan Franzen who contributed in a movement that hopes to reconnect the human to his real existence. Therefore, as As Franzen’s The Corrections and Freedom mirror, contemporary writing withdraws from the postmodern mode of disconnection and adheres to a style and language of engagement, a preoccupation with feelings, thoughts, and experiences concerning a period’s changes. This approach describes the post-postmodern movement, necessitating various transformations and redeployments of the postmodern delineation of identity and the definition of narrative tools. To explore the realistic tendencies in Franzen’s novels, this study approaches subjectivity as a productive, pragmatist discourse that helps reconstruct the post-postmodern character. The ideal post-postmodern identity in Franzen’s two novels is less concerned with how it is identified or recognized by others; it never changes based on social or political influence, but achieves self-control and self-recognition, by engaging with its transcendent realities beyond the scope of irony and skepticism.

The study reveals the renewal of the omniscient narrator in The Corrections and Freedom, which entails specific platforms that may alter the postmodern view of ending representations. As an effective conduit of faithful representation, omniscient narration is employed in contemporary fiction to report an all-knowing analysis of social and cultural structures. The maximalist and experimental voice of post-postmodern narration, which passes broad, superior judgment on the fictional world, has an overriding effect on the reader’s understanding of reality. In a variation of this trend, Franzen theorizes about a renewal of trust and reality in literature while critiquing social and ethical ills by utilizing omniscient narration to illustrate a preoccupation with societal and cultural progress.

By analyzing the two novels, The Corrections and Freedom, this study evinces how Franzen, as a post-postmodernist, offers a new version of realism by narrating new ways of remedying the contemporary individual’s existential crisis through the return to the aesthetics of trust. Both novels demonstrate Franzen’s efforts to enforce the notions of reality and trust through the use of intertextuality and metafiction as means that distinguish his works from postmodernist writings. His metafictional style constructs an exchange between consciousnesses (i.e., a character’s and reader’s understanding of the world) to allow needs to be freshly perceived. The aspects of metafiction do not disturb the characters’ realities but demonstrate how Franzen draws connections are based on realistic (rather than illusory) grounds. The reframing of metafictional elements in post-postmodernist fiction expands this movement beyond the development of deep layers of realism. It challenges the relationships between irony and sincerity, evident in Wallace’s fiction. The Corrections and Freedom, Franzen demonstrates how post-postmodern fiction utilizes the postmodern approach to reconnect humanity with various capitalist, ecological, and socio-
cultural systems, which caused humanistic shortcomings. Rather than criticizing the world, Franzen’s post-postmodernist fiction provides solutions to the individual’s problems, by assuming new corrective directions that acknowledges truth and reality beyond the confining boundaries of the text.

**Endnotes**

1. This refers to the unsustainable population under a capitalist system (Gram, 2014).
2. “The term globalization refers not to a stable, defined reality, but a complex debate about social, political, and economic processes in the contemporary period” (Annesley, 2006, p. 113).
3. This refers to the actions needed to buttress the individual’s identity (Hidalgo, 2017).
4. Yousef (2017) explains that this is “concerned with the nature of being” (p. 37).
5. The maximalist novel’s “macrostructural” structure stands for “the narrative as a whole,” or the entire narrative flow, while its “microstructural” level refers to a “single fragment” story within the text (Ercolino, 2014, pp. 99-100).

**About the Authors:**

**Mashael H. Aljadaani** is a lecturer at the English Language Institute at Umm Al-Qura University, Saudi Arabia. She received her MA in English Literature from King Abdul-Aziz University. Her research interests include postmodern literature and gender studies. “The Subversion of Gender Stereotypes in Donald Barthelme’s Snow White” is an example of her research. ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4252-3013

**Laila Mohammed Al-Sharqi** is an associate professor of English in the Department of European Languages and Literature at King Abdul-Aziz University, Saudi Arabia. She received her Ph.D. in literary theory and cultural studies from the University of Nottingham. Her research interests include postmodern literature, literary theory, gender studies. “Magical realism as a feminist discourse in Raja Alem’s Fatma” and “Twitter Fiction: A new creative literary landscape” are examples of her research. ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8142-1525

**References**


BOYNE’S, I. J. (2017). *Post-Postmodernist Humanism, Young Adult Literature And The Holocaust*, Ghent, Ghent University.


Reconstructing the Mother-Daughter Relationship:
Lydia Davis and Amy Tan

Hala Ewaidat
Department of Foreign Languages, Faculty of Education
Mansoura University, Egypt
halaewaidat@mans.edu.eg

Received: 12/18/2020 Accepted: 2/8/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
With four waves of women’s liberation movements in the twentieth century, the relationship between mothers and daughters has come under increasing, frequent, intense, and passionate examination. Scholars East and West have examined this bond, giving it a universal appeal. Among the voices that have come to create speech and meaning to this relationship are Fouad (1964), the Egyptian writer, in her book Ila Ibnaty (To My Daughter) and Rich’s 1976 classic feminist work, Of Women Born: Motherhood as Experience and Institution. Concerning their definitions, this paper discusses the oppositional forms of the mother-daughter relationship in Amy Tan’s Two Kinds and Lydia Davis’ The Mother. In both short stories, Tan, with her Chinese traditions and American education, and Davis, whose background includes no ethnic derivations, explore the breakdown in communication in this problematic bond, aiming at reconstructing this richly influential relationship.

Key Words: ethnicity, memory, miscommunication, mother-daughter relationship, motherhood, obedience, opposition, reconstruction, suffering

Cite as: Ewaidat, H.(2021). Reconstructing the Mother-Daughter Relationship: Lydia Davis and Amy Tan. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies 5 (1)
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol5no1.22
Reconstructing the Mother-Daughter Relationship: Lydia Davis and Amy Tan

The mother-daughter relationship is an extraordinary bond that transcends geographical, cultural, and ethnic boundaries and unites women of every race and a historical period when they write novels, short stories, and books. This paper discusses the oppositional forms of mother-daughter relationships in Amy Tan’s *Two Kinds* and Lydia Davis’ *The Mother*. Through short stories, they introduced a unique examination of an intricate association in the bond between two kinds of mothers and two kinds of daughters aiming at reconstructing this relationship. In Tan’s and Davis’ short stories, the nature of motherhood is complex and is often obscured by sentimentality, bitterness, and pain. Mothers are alienated from their daughters, who are infuriated either because they see their mothers as pressuring them to conform to their own or society’s expectations of girls and women or because they find their mothers disdaining those expectations. This anger and alienation grow not primarily from clashes between unique personalities and temperaments but rather from the external and internalized social pressures to relate and accept responsibilities to and for each other in terms of the culturally defined roles of mothers and daughters.

Motherhood and the mother-daughter relationship became the subject of literary discourse long before psychoanalytical discussion with Freud in the beginning of the twentieth century. Auerbach, (1989) noted that, in the novels of Jane Austen and other nineteenth-century women-authors, “mothers and daughters are at best indifferent and at worst antagonistic" (p,36). She pointed out that “motherhood was not merely a biological fact, but a spiritual essence inseparable from pure womanhood... Maternity alone was the seal of respectable female maturity” (pp. 173-4). Marianne Hirsch believes that “in conventional nineteenth-century plots of the European and American tradition, the fantasy that controls the female family romance is the desire for the heroine's singularity based on dis-identification from the fate of other women, especially mothers” (Mother p.10).

Scholars East and West have come to create speech and meaning to the mother-daughter relationship where there has been silence and absence. The Egyptian writer Fouaad, dedicated her book, *Ila Ibnaty (To My Daughter)* to her ‘beloved daughter’ asking her to give it to her friends, granddaughters and to “all daughters… and all mothers” (12). It won the UNESCO prize in 1964 as one of the best ten books worldwide written on motherhood and daughterhood. After 56 years the book has been perhaps her most famous and widely read; when reprinted in 1984, Amazon posted this commentary on the book: “After four decades, the book is more relevant than ever...[offering] surprisingly fresh thoughts and timeless values”. This book introduces universal guiding principles for constructing the mother-daughter relationship. Fouaad, (1964) defines ‘The art of motherhood’ as,

a process of creation: the mother creates men and women according to her own wish and will. History tells you endless stories of men who were made great by their own parents, even if they were not that smart.. motherhood is production not consuming. It is really a mixture of selfishness which is part of possessive instinct and altruism (unselfishness or
self-sacrifice) related to passion. A mother is usually a giver. A mother’s altruism appears in her wish to elevate her children above all even herself. (p. 151)

Thirty-four years later, Auerbach (1998) defined motherhood as the "spiritual essence of pure womanhood" (p.173 ). Fouad considers motherhood as an excess of compassion that does not stop or diminish with age, it increases to bestow a mother with sacredness. She asks her daughter to give her children compassion as long as she lives; cruelty in a mother shakes her children’s values because they see evil emerging from where goodness is supposed to spring. She believes that when values are shaken a mother’s throne is permanently threatened, and she can never restore it. “Nothing, then, can preserve what is left from the features of motherhood. Mothering is different, it refers to the characteristics of females of all species like labor and breast feeding”. (p.152).

Fouad describes a parent’s love for their children as unique in its purity and depth. Parenthood is the ultimate perfection because it is a purposeless, strong, and eternal passion that urges people to work and struggle and encourages them to be virtuous for the sake of their children. (160) Rich (1976) highlighted in her classic feminist work the serenity that has surrounded the relationship between mothers and daughters. She wrote:

This cachexia between mother and daughter essential, distorted, misused-is the great unwritten story… that awaited analysis and definition…Probably there is nothing in human nature more resonant with charges than the flow of energy between two biologically alike bodies, one of which has lain in amniotic bliss inside the other, one of which has labored to give birth to the other. (pp. 225-226).

Hirsch, (1989) points in her review that there has been no comprehensive study that takes into account a woman’s role as a mother of daughters and as a daughter of mothers or that studies female identity in relation to previous and subsequent generations of women (3). The earliest source of ‘identification’ for children, according to Chodorow(1989) is the mother. (pp. 78-9). As for daughters, she believes that the ‘daughter continues to identify with the mother’ (292), and this affects their ‘interdependence and continuity’ and ‘the role women play in the society overall’. (p.26).

Still, many novels stem from an explicitly feminist perspective; they are undoubtedly a welcome development that forces this long-submerged relationship into the cultural spotlight. Walters (1992) points out that most of the literary works that portrayed the mother-daughter relationship have self-consciously developed oppositional forms of this relationship. Most of them fall within the dichotomous framing of bond and separate the two sides of the coin of adult development (p. 163). Prince (2020) asserts that girls find it difficult to break away from the overpowering influence of the mother. This, sometimes, hinders the girls from developing a normal sense of self, which affects their entire life.

AmyTan is one of the pioneers whose work breaks new grounds in the treatment of the mother-daughter relationship in American fiction. Through her short stories and novels, she has brought fame and recognition, presenting a new perspective to this relationship as a theme in
American fiction. The short story *Two Kinds* from her book *The Joy Luck Club* (1989), introduces this theme which has also been explored in her novels, *The Kitchen God’s Wife* (1991) and *The Bonesetter’s Daughter* (2001). She investigates the nature of the struggle between Chinese mothers and their American daughters and its impact on the lives of both and the way they can resolve this problematic relationship reaching a peaceful reconciliation.

In Tan’s *Two Kinds*, the mother, Suyuan Woo, is a Chinese immigrant who is obsessed with the idea of her daughter, Jing-Mei Woo, becoming a child prodigy. This recalls Fouaad’s description of motherhood as “a process of creation: the mother creates men and women according to her own wish and will”. (p. 151) With high expectations for her daughter and avid belief in the American dream, the mother tells her, “you could be anything you wanted to be in America… America was where all my mother’s hopes lay (Tan 240).” The mother who encountered failure in her life strives for some sort of compensation and perfection in her daughter. As an American who believes in the freedom of choice, the daughter becomes “determined not to try, not to be anybody different (Tan 244),” because she has a different kind of personality, and she is the one to decide how to realize her own identity. The resistive daughter fails her mother’s high expectations. In *The Mother*, Lydia Davis demonstrates an oppositional mother-daughter relationship of an authoritative mother and a daughter who fails in gaining her mother’s satisfaction.

Pearlman(1989), the editor of a feminist volume analyzing fiction on mothers and daughters, proclaims in the introduction that, “[The]reality of the mother-daughter experience is that mothers are more disabling than enabling, that daughters are often more . . . detached from their mothers in ways that are disturbing and dis-hearting.”(7) He contends that these writers place a sort of either/or and life/death kind of emotional and psychological weight on this relationship . This “disabling” mother is the protagonist of Davis’s short story *The Mother*, her ‘micro- story’ that Adams(2019)describes as “witty, playful and pared to the bare essentials”. The one-paragraph short story reads as follows,

*The Mother*

The girl wrote a story, “But how much better it would be if you wrote a novel,” said her mother. The girl built a doll-house. “But how much better if it were a real house,” her mother said. The girl made a small pillow for her father. “But wouldn’t a quilt be more practical,” said her mother. The girl dug a small hole in the garden. “But how much better if you dug a large hole,” said her mother. The girl dug a large hole and went to sleep in it. “But how much better if you slept forever,’ said her mother. (96)

Instead of support and encouragement, the daughter constantly receives her mother’s criticism, opposition and dissatisfaction. The daughter’s actions represent her attitude to find herself. Genovese (1988) redefines the bond of mothers and daughters as an intimate relationship when they look to each other “for love, acceptance, and approval” (xvi). However, when the daughter loses her admiration for her mother, and the mother is tired of mothering, the bonds of intimacy between the two are broken. *The Mother* introduces in a paragraph a whole book of life...
when the mother is tired of mothering, contradicts her role of love and guidance to her daughter. On describing the world Lydia Davis creates in her tiny short stories, Romero (2018) believes that, 

The uniqueness of Lydia's astounding world lies in her way of seeing and perceiving life while making an effort to describe it carefully and with the exact amount of words. . . In The Mother, for example, she explains the entire essence of a complex mother-daughter relationship in just one short paragraph, and by the end we feel the daughter’s pain with absolute clarity.

From the beginning, Davis foregrounds the broken relationship by using nameless characters. The word daughter is not even used, instead, she is referred to as ‘the girl’. In the context of this hostile bond, only the mother’s voice is heard and the daughter is silent. For many women, silence is a coping strategy—a way to avoid pain or evade confrontation. It is a technique for negotiating anguish resentment and disgrace that leads to confusion, solitude depression, and even death. Silence between mother and daughter deprives both parties of a common emotional language, rendering them virtual strangers. Becoming voiceless, a woman is not entitled of her own life and deprived of the ability to speak her story.

Silence can result from the existence of so many variations of a story that the truth is obscured or remains unsaid. In Amy Tan’s Two Kinds, Jing-Mei Woo complains of her mother repeating the same story about her abandoned twins in China in various versions, “over the years she told me the same story, except for the ending, which grew darker and darker, casting long shadows into her life, and eventually into mine”. The social and cultural conditioning with the mother’s inability to speak the same language as her daughter result in silence, “Of course you can be prodigy, too” my mother told me when I was nine. “You can be best anything.” Huntley noted that the apparent folly of Mrs. Woo’s aspirations for her daughter can be learnt from her dogmatic belief that America is the ‘Land of Opportunity’. She places unreasonable expectations on the shoulders of her young, tender daughter. Nevertheless, the daughter is not the same “girl” of Davis’ The Mother, Jing mei disillusioned her mother, “And then I decided. I didn't have to do what my mother said anymore. I wasn't her slave. This wasn't China.”(p.719) This is what the author did in reality, according to Liu’s words on Tan’s life, “Caught in the conflicting pressure to conform to her mother’s Chinese traditions and to follow the example of her Western peers, Amy Tan rebelled against whatever her mother said and expected”.(p.9)

In The Mother, the unexpected, sudden and shocking ending, “evokes a note of the absurd, but also of a deep, troubling loneliness and senselessness in the worlds of Davis’ characters” as Deb(2007) noted, “Mothers usually experience internal turmoil as they prepare their daughters into a hostile world”. In The Mother, the daughter is the one in pain after her failure in her relationship with her mother. Her submissive, silent attitude gains the girl the reader’s sympathy while depriving the mother of understanding her objections. The mother in Amy Tan’s Two Kinds resorts to the silent attitude after struggling to secure a better future for her resistive daughter.

Fouad’s perspective of the ‘endless stories of men who were made great by their own parents, even if they were not that smart’, is the goal and sole interest of the mother in Two Kinds. She motivates, provides assistance and supports her daughter to be distinguished. Willard (1989) indicates that mothers want nothing less than perfection for their daughters. That is why they
demand perfect obedience. Willard explains that in Amy Tan’s novels, the American daughter of a mother of Chinese origin, like Tan herself, is not free to fall short of their mothers expectations in this free society. Therefore, even the most successful daughters are haunted by a sense of failure, and even the most determined mothers are dismayed to find their daughters repeating their own weaknesses. Jing-mei resists all her mother’s endeavors and high expectations. “At last she (her mother) was beginning to give up hope”. Women sometimes use the power of motherhood to abuse, manipulate, and dominate. The daughter really felt that her mother uses the power of motherhood to abuse and decide her future identity. The mother’s unceasing efforts to create a prodigy of her American-Chinese girl might be because of the lack of choice in her own life in China that causes her great suffering, misery, and grief, but the daughter understands that the power to make decisions and be only herself is her path to personal freedom. Greene (2020) interrelates the way a woman perceives herself to aspects of the oppression that she encounters in her life as the material reality of the surrounding conditions.

Firmly clinging to their memories in China even as they adapt to American culture, the mothers deliberately remain suspended between two worlds and two cultures. The daughters, on the other hand, are noticeably more American than Chinese despite their clearly Asian features, and since childhood, they have deliberately attempted to cultivate American ways and rejected much of their Chinese heritage. The daughters yearn for an Americanization that they can neither define nor describe. More than anything else, they are unhappy, unfulfilled, and uncertain about their identities, about their place in the culture that they want to claim as theirs. Jing mei knows that, “It was not the only disappointment my mother felt in me. In the years that followed, I failed her so many times, each time asserting my own will, my right to fall short of expectations. . . unlike my mother, I did not believe I could be anything I wanted to be. I could only be me”. (p. 718)

When the daughter fails, the mother has been forced to admit to herself that her dream will more than likely never find fulfillment. “And after seeing my mother's disappointed face once again, something inside of me began to die. I hated the tests, the raised hopes and failed expectations.” Rashid describes Jing mei’s mother as a “failure” whose mistake is enforcing not inspiring her daughter because the mother ‘suffers from unknowingness’, that is, a sense of loss of identity. Finally the mother compensates her own loss trying to find a prodigy in her daughter. Jing-mei says, “at first my mother thought I could be a Chinese Shirley Temple. We’d watch Shirley’s old movies on TV as though they were training films. Her mother tells -Ni ken- you watch”. (Tan, 1989, p.715). Going through various tests by Mrs.Woo, who expects Chinese obedience, Jing-mei reflects on free will when thinking of identity goals. The failure of the mother-daughter relationship becomes the ultimate end for the daughter’s rebellion that ended with a lack of effective communication.

Tan contends that being frequently labeled an Asian American writer, this issue is not her primary driving force. Huntley quotes her saying, “I don’t see myself writing about culture and the immigrant experience. That’s just part of the tapestry. What my books are about is the relationship and family. I’ve had women come up to me and say they’ve felt the same way about their mothers, and they weren’t immigrants.” (30) The inescapable fact remains that although Tan’s novels are indeed about universal concerns and commonly recognized themes, about the
relationships and familial bonds and self and identity, they also are about the members of an ethnic minority that has over a century or more developed a distinctive diaspora culture that exists within the larger framework of cultures in the United States. In *Two Kinds*, when the daughter faces her mother’s dream and tells her, “You want me to be someone that I'm not! I'll never be the kind of daughter you want me to be!” The mother-daughter conflict occurs when the daughter selects her own and rejects her mother’s lifestyle and non-American origin. In times of crisis in the their relationship the mother’s Chinese culture is present, “Only two kinds of daughters,” she shouted in Chinese. «Those who are obedient and those who follow their own mind! Only one kind of daughter can live in this house. Obedient daughter!” The major friction between Tan’s mother and daughter arises from the mother’s desire for her daughter to be successful by American measures while remaining culturally Chinese. In response, the daughter has—perhaps unconsciously—managed to subvert her mother’s plans by ignoring her attempts to instill the Chinese image of the “obedient daughter” into her mind and becoming so thoroughly Americanized believing only in what she is not what she can do.

The result is a breakdown in communication between a mother and a daughter; more like enemies than friends, the two are so wary about each other that they cannot voice their frustrations and fears. Unable to communicate with her daughter, the mother swallows her sorrow and withdraws into loneliness. But before that, the mother struggles to instill in her daughter a true desire to be part of her dream; the daughter wrestles with the need to resolve the equation of her American life and freedom with the incomprehensible expectations of Chinese rooted mothers. Alienation and silence between mother and daughter now exists, intensified by a wide gulf between generations. “I won't let her change me, I promised myself... I won't be what I'm not...I'm not a genius... No! I said, and I now felt stronger, as if my true self had finally emerged”. As a devoted mother Mrs. Woo tries to bring the best in her daughter, “but fails thoroughly in her attempt because Jing-mei comes between the socio-cultural influences of the American dream and her mother’s failure. . . Jing-mei cannot cope with her mother’s choice of way because she (Jing) is what she is and that is her own identity; and subjective way of thinking”, as Rashid noted.

Compassionate attempts of the two generations to understand each other at the end of the story when the mother decided to give her daughter the piano telling her it’s ‘yours’. Tan’s attitude towards this relationship changed before the mother’s death, as if there seems to be some kind of maturing on the daughter’s side inclining her closer to her mother. The shift mirrors the change in the writer’s own perspective in the course of time towards this universal bond in later novels. Tan’s fiction reveals that the writer had a complex relationship with her mother and that she needed to re-examine that bond to reach an understanding that would help her achieve meaning and sustenance. Probably one of the most adaptive responses was Tan’s use of their complex relationship in developing the distinctive mother-daughter relationships that characterize her fiction.

More than once, Tan explains the biographical elements that reflect the life of her mother, Daisy Tan, who died of Alzheimer’s disease. “The regrets are hers, the fear of the curse, the sense of danger she instilled in me while wanting me to have a better life. Asking forgiveness is in the book as well. That was part of saying goodbye” (Cujec 215). An emotional memory of her
childhood rings true to the author’s girlhood insecurities: “Moving to a new home eight times made her aware of how she didn’t fit in”. (The Bonesetter’s Daughter p.54)

In *Two Kinds* the daughter appears to be living out the American Dream, but as the story unfolds, her dissatisfaction becomes more apparent. In the story, the dreams and ambitions of an immigrant woman who has braved the unknown and traveled across oceans in the quest for better life with limitless opportunities for her daughter. Jing mei’s mother must overcome the sense that her daughter often looks at her as an outcast in America. Tan does not neglect to portray the serious dilemmas and ironies that the mother confronts in creating and maintaining a protective environment for her family in America (Ho, 2000, p.103). However, the daughter does not speak directly to her mother throughout the book because she is convinced that her mother is irrevocably disappointed in her, and certain that she can do nothing to win maternal approval or praise. Therefore, communication is almost impossible between them. She is sure of one thing of her need to an identity.

In American fiction, many works written by and for women examine the trauma of self-discovery and the struggle between mothers and daughters. In most known novels, writers tend to resolve the mother-daughter conflict by removing the mother either physically or emotionally. Physical separation by illness and death has existed in many novels or emotionally through dependence on alcohol or drugs. By removing the mother, these authors allow daughters more freedom to face and solve problems on their own. Tan’s novels offer equal stances for both mothers and daughters to explore their memories and articulate their sorrows through storytelling. While most novels focus on one side of the struggle, which is usually the daughter’s, Tan’s fiction, attempts to present a balanced treatment of the theme by assembling the two sides of the story and offering them equal chances to articulate their narratives. It is this balance, an essential constituent of Chinese culture that sets Tan’s approach as unique and appealing. Thus, the basis of Tan’s distinct approach to the mother-daughter relationship is evident in *Two Kinds* as both the mother and the daughter have been offered equal chances to narrate their part of the story allowing them to reach an understanding and appreciation. “So she surprised me. A few years ago, she offered to give me the piano, for my thirtieth birthday. I had not played in all those years. I saw the offer as a sign of forgiveness, a tremendous burden removed. «Are you sure? » I asked shyly. «I mean, won't you and Dad miss it? » «No, this your piano, » she said firmly. «Always your piano. You only one can play”.

Tan’s approach in treating the mother-daughter relationship differs from other writers as she presents both mothers and daughters in the same context and allows each one the opportunity to articulate and voice her experiences and memories. This echoed Hirsch’s words, “The story of female development, both in fiction and theory, needs to be written in the voice of mothers as well as in that of daughters. . . Only in combining both voices, in finding a double voice that would yield a multiple female consciousness, can we begin to envision ways to “live afresh” (161). In Tan’s novels, as in *Two Kinds*, memory becomes the vehicle by which the past reconfigures the present, which the present, and through which the present revisits the past. Mother-daughter relationship is not valued on a material scale but through the sharing of endearments and advice and the passing of tender memories to the next generations of daughters. Within this problematic framework, the mother and the daughter in Tan’s story struggle to maintain vital communication.
with each other and to piece together the fragmented memories through talk-stories of their actual lives. “And that's when I remembered the babies she had lost in China, the ones we never talked about”. Mother’s life stories, as Ho (2000) explains are “the valuable guides that help women survive with a certain amount of grace, anger, strength, connectedness, and love”. (p.106).

In 2019 The Literary Hub published, Amy Tan Reflects on 30 Years since The Joy Luck Club: Writing Fiction that’s Truer than Memoir. This is her comment on Two Kinds,

The characters are mothers who emigrated from China and their modern thirty-something American-born daughters. Their relationships are fraught with years of misunderstandings and accumulated pain. A mother’s hopes and expectations become a daughter’s sense of failure. A mother’s advice is received by a daughter as rejection of who she really is. The mother, in return, feels her daughter knows nothing about her and has learned nothing from her mother, the one who loved her best.

In most American fiction, mothers are removed from the narratives resulting in an irrecoverable breakdown in the relationship between mothers and daughters. Moreover, most of these stories reflect the daughter’s side of the story allowing her a greater opportunity to deserve reader’s sympathy while silencing the mother. Tan’s novels, on the other hand, offer equal opportunities for both to present their side of the stories reflecting on their experiences. Tan manages to achieve this purpose by creating natural, familial instances of mother-daughter storytelling in which women seize an opportunity to speak freely without being censored or stifled. By doing so, she allows them to build new bridges of communication and mutual understanding. Reconstructing the mother-daughter relationship is the ultimate end of her fiction. (P.)

Conclusion:

In Two Kinds and The Mother, both Amy Tan, with her Chinese traditions and American education, and Lydia Davis, whose background includes no ethnic derivations, explore issues of universal interests of which the problematic yet richly influential relationship between mothers and daughters is the most significant. In Two Kinds and The Mother, much miscommunication takes place between mothers and daughters. It is a complicated and perilous task for them to dredge up and decipher each other’s personal stories, sufferings, weaknesses and ambitions, which are covered in layers of silence, secrecy, pain, and ambiguity. Like their mothers, daughters must overcome their personal anger, resentment, guilt, and fear toward their mothers.

Whether mothers and daughters come to realize their fierce love and respect for each other as friends and survivors or stay alienated, they realize that there are rich challenges and meanings embodied even in the silences, fragments, tensions, and differences. This sacred bond endures all kinds of hurt, hardships, and wounds. Characterized by passion and intensity, it could be constructed.

About the Authors:
Hala Ahmed Kamal Ewaidat is a lecturer of English Literature and Culture at the University of Mansoura, Egypt. Her PhD was the first in Egypt on English Culture concentrating on Deism and its Manifestations in the major works of: Shaftesbury, Pope, Dr. Jonson and Voltaire. She
has published articles on ecology and culture in Arabic Literature.
ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3177-8723

References


Liu, Q. (2017). An ecological return to harmony in Amy Tan's novels. Literature. Université Toulouse le Mirail - Toulouse II.


The Integration of Computer-Aided Translation Tools in Translator-Training Programs in Saudi Universities: Toward a More Visible State

Lama A. Al-Rumaih
Translation Department, College of Languages
Princess Nourah Bint Abdulrahman University
Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Received: 1/4/2021 Accepted: 1/21/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
The paper aims to investigate the current state of Computer-Aided Translation (CAT) tools integration into the translator-training programs of some universities in Saudi Arabia, which are King Saud University (KSU), Princess Nourah University (PNU), Imam Mohammed Ibin Saud Islamic University (IMSIU), Prince Sultan University (PSU), and Saudi Electronic University (SEU). The investigation touched upon the sufficiency of this integration and the usability of these tools by the translation students and graduates of these universities in different translation courses and tasks, which contributes to enriching the field of translation technology, due to the scarcity of such studies in the investigated region. The study used a mixed-methods approach to enhance the validity of the data. The results showed that CAT tools have not been integrated effectively yet into the translator-training programs of the universities under study, as not all of them provide CAT courses. While the universities that do, lack some elements which can help to promote the integration of these tools into the programs. As for the usage of these tools, the findings revealed that a significant percentage of the participants do not use CAT tools in their translation tasks, and more than half of them do not use CAT tools in other translation courses. These findings suggest more integration of CAT tools in the universities’ translator-training programs to enhance their outcomes and increase their graduates’ opportunities in the job market.

Keywords: Computer-Aided Translation tools, job market, Saudi universities, technology, translation, translator-training programs

Introduction

Modern technology makes revolutionary changes in the world, and it becomes an inseparable part of people’s life. Almost all aspects of society are going through a series of continuous changes because of technology, and its effect has inevitably reached translation as part of society. With the expansion of technology, new inventions took place in the translation industry. Among these inventions were Computer-Aided Translation tools (CAT). These tools made a massive shift in the translation industry, and they have been discussed from different perspectives in the literature (Al-Jarfi, 2017; Alotaibi, 2014; Bowker, 2002, 2015, 2019, 2020; Sin-wai, 2010, 2013, 2015), among others. Some of these studies explicitly indicate the need for more technology and CAT tools integration into the translator-training programs.

Sin-wai (2010) argued that the academic institutions are “possibly the best places to acquire the knowledge and skills of computer-aided translation” (p.85) because of the opportunity that they offer to combine in-depth study with the practical experience from internships or “projects in a real-life setting” (p.86). Meanwhile, many universities worldwide, including some Saudi universities, integrated CAT tools into their translator-training programs. However, some evidence aroused the question about the sufficiency of this integration. For example, Samson (2005) mentioned that many companies in the translation industry constantly complain about the translators’ efficiency, including new graduates in using CAT tools. While Alotaibi (2014) stated that the participants in her study have never been acquainted with CAT tools, and they were advised to avoid using technology in translation with the exception of some electronic dictionaries. Moreover, Fatani (2009) indicated that the negligence of the translation industry by the governmental institutions, companies, and organizations in Saudi Arabia is due to the lack of qualified translators at different levels, including the technical level.

What is more, most of the studies conducted on Saudi universities did not mainly investigate the state of CAT tools in the translator-training program of the universities and their usage by the translation students and graduates, but other issues within the same context (e.g., the perception of the tools, the attitude toward the tools, the teaching of the CAT courses), etc. The scarcity of studies on this topic necessitates further investigations. Therefore, the aim of this study is twofold: first, to explore the state of CAT tools integration in some Saudi universities (the CAT tools investigated are the software packages and not the electronic dictionaries or search engines). Second, to investigate the extent to which the students and graduates of these universities use CAT tools in different translation tasks and courses.

The study aspires to contribute to the field of translation, especially translation technology, as it tackles a topic that has not been discussed mainly in the previous studies conducted on Saudi universities. Also, it can be beneficial to raise the awareness of the decision-makers and curriculum developers in the universities of the region to consider the state of CAT tools in their translator-training programs. Moreover, the study’s findings can motivate them to make some changes to the translation curricula of their universities in a way that addresses the market needs more and the technological developments in the translation field. All of which can contribute to enhance the universities’ outcome and increase their graduates’ opportunities in the job market.
A mixed-methods approach is used in this study as an attempt to answer the following questions:

1. What is the current state of CAT tools integration into the translator-training programs in Saudi universities?
2. To what extent do translation students and graduates of Saudi universities use CAT tools in different translation tasks and courses?

**Literature Review**

**Computer Aided Translation Tools**

European Association of Machine Translation (n.d.) has defined CAT tools as “translation software packages which are designed primarily as an aid for the human translator in the production of translations” (para. 3). Whereas, Bowker (2002) described them in a broader sense as “CAT technology can be understood to include any type of computerized tool that translators use to help them do their job” (p. 6). Both definitions indicate that the translation is mostly done by human translators, and the machine is utilized to facilitate the process.

In contrast to the MT goal, CAT aims to achieve a high-quality translation through human translators’ interaction with the computers that facilitate the process (Sin-wai, 2015). CAT tools have gained popularity in the translation market and among professional translators, which necessitated the teaching of these tools to the translation students to help them be familiar with such tools and use them in the translation process (Bowker, 2002). Some of the main tools that the students need to be introduced to and practiced are translation memory, terminology management systems, localization tools, and translation management systems, as Bowker (2015) stated that they are what the translators most commonly will encounter and be required to possess in the professional settings. These tools are usually not used separately, but rather with a large set of tools in the translation environment (TEnT) (McBride, 2009).

Since it is difficult to predict the future jobs of the translation students, introducing them to various tools can strengthen their technical skills and help them be more confident in a professional workplace (Bowker, 2015). In 2006, a survey of 874 TM users revealed that most participants use more than one tool, which was on the average of three to four tools (Lagoudaki, 2006). However, introducing the students to different types of tools without clear guidance can be misleading. Thus, part of the process should give priority to embedding the future translators with knowledge about when to use these tools and for what purpose and case (Bowker, 2019). Moreover, they should be introduced to the ethics of using technological tools in translation. This concept has recently come to the fore and soon held an increasingly significant place in the field (Bowker, 2020). The translation students need to be aware of such a concept before they enter the job market. One of the important aspects pertaining to the ethics of translation technologies is the over reliance on these technologies in translation. According to (Bowker, 2020), the translators’ over reliance on technological tools when translating can lead to ethical problems, such as jeopardizing the privacy and the confidentiality of the translated data. Therefore, the curriculum developers and course designers need to take these aspects into account to provide the students with well-planned courses to prepare them for the real-life work environment.
Translation Industry in Saudi Arabia

The translation industry in Saudi Arabia is flourishing year after year. However, there are a few research studies on the translation industry and translation production in Saudi Arabia (Abu-ghararah, 2017). According to the survey conducted by (Harabi, 2009), the role of supply especially the labor force in Saudi Arabia was poor and it consequently affected the contribution of the translation industry in the country. On the other hand, the role of the capital and local demand for translated books was good. Another problem indicated in the survey and had a negative impact on the development of the translation industry was the difficulty of determining the actual number of translators and interpreters, due to the absence of official authority for the translation industry that should be responsible for the translators’ registration and translation activities.

On a similar note, Fatani (2009) investigated the state of the translation industry in Saudi Arabia, mainly its state in the Saudi market. The study revealed various experiences; however, a great percentage of the companies surveyed did not have translation departments and they relied on other translation suppliers such as licensed translation offices, and sometimes the translation tasks were done by bilingual employees, due to the lack of qualified translators. Also, some organizations had no translation departments and they did not use technology in translation because they consider it a threat that jeopardizes the position of the human translators. Regarding the official institutions, such as the Chamber of Commerce, which is responsible for listing the licensed translation agencies and offices in the country, she indicated that the information offered by them was not always reliable, as a number of certified translation offices were not on their lists.

The need for an official authority for the translation industry has recently been discussed by some Saudi translators, especially those who hold higher degrees and have long experience in the field. They addressed in social media the need for an official authority and they succeed to some extent to draw the attention of other translators to consider this issue. The discussion and the demands to establish an official authority lasted for a long period of time, then some changes happened. At the beginning of the year 2020, the Ministry of Culture established “The Literature, Publishing, and Translation Commission,” among 11 new commissions. Regarding the translation, the commission aims to create opportunities for the Saudi translators, arrange translation activities, shed light on the Saudi literature and culture, and transfer knowledge about other cultures to Saudi Arabia through translation. Additionally, the Minister of Labor and Social Development announced his acceptance for establishing the “Association of Saudi Translators and Interpreters.” All of these developments can have a great impact on the future of the translation industry in Saudi Arabia.

In the academic context, Abu-ghararah (2017) asserted a significant gap between the academic training and what the Saudi translation market is looking for in the translators. Also, the Saudi market and many governmental organizations require qualified translation in various specialized fields. She stated that translator-training programs in Saudi Arabia failed to keep pace with the developments in the translation industry, which caused the gap in the first place. The same issue was mentioned by (Fatani, 2007) regarding the lack of reflecting the market needs in the academic training courses. Therefore, the translation programs in Saudi Arabia need to consider the translation market demands and equip their students with a set of required competencies to contribute to the translation industry. Among the competences Abu-ghararah (2017) highlighted was technological competence, which does not only mean knowing how to use the computer but
also understanding the role of technology in the translation industry to make use of it effectively in the translation process.

In regard to the Saudi market, Fatani (2009) believes that it offers plenty of opportunities for the translators. In other words, for her:

The recent entry of Saudi Arabia into the World Trade Organization, the irreversible globalization of Saudi businesses, the diversified and large number of local sectors that have recently entered into strategic partnerships with Microsoft, together with the internet revolution have made translating and interpreting services a rapidly growing area with excellent employment opportunities. (p. 2-3)

These opportunities need to be given to qualified translators with great technical skills to be able to meet the market expectations. To achieve this level of preparing professional translators, the universities' courses need to be designed for this purpose. Elshafei (2014) drew a correlation between the students' translation and the design of the translation courses, she indicated that the “weakness in students' translation can, in turn, affect the quality of their preparation for [the] labor market, resulting from the lack of well-designed courses of translation” (p. 146). Thus, she stated that the process of planning a curriculum should focus on “narrowing the gap between what the labor market needs from the modern translator and the courses offered by training institutions, universities and colleges” (p. 145).

For her part, Fatani (2007) suggested that providing the students with a lot of technology in the form of software applications, technically qualified instructors, and professional IT maintenance teams can improve the translation training programs, as the future of these students revolves around technology, whether as freelancers or employees. Translation technology has offered many new roles related to translation, such as post-editing, project management, quality assessment, etc. While these jobs may seem to be threatening to some translators, others can offer a range of services, and these jobs are not problematic for them.

In this day and age, everything is being digitized, which means that paper copies will be less used, as Krüger (2016) suggested that “the good old days of pen-and-paper translation are inevitably coming to an end” (p. 114). Thus, the translators who do not wish to work with technology and translate using traditional ways will be replaced not by the technology but by the translators who possess excellent knowledge and control of that technology (Pym, 2011). On the other hand, Bowker (2019) advised the translators who find translating with technological tools less satisfying to reject the jobs that require such practice, as they conflict with their interests.

The Integration of CAT Tools in Translation Programs

The development and expansion of technology made it imperative for the translators to possess some technical skills. Kenny (1999) mentioned that the integration of CAT tools into universities’ curricula could widely open the doors for new scopes of research and pedagogy. Many research papers have been conducted on the application of CAT tools and their integration in the curricula of translation programs. In China, for example, research studies on translation technologies seem to be gaining more attention by researchers. Some of these studies discussed
the status of using CAT tools in Chinese universities and how they still need to pay extra attention to the matter.

In this vein, Yao (2017) focused on the present situation of CAT tools adoption in teaching translation in China. To investigate the status of using CAT tools and the problems of adopting them in translation teaching, she conducted a survey, which was distributed to the English translation teachers in different cities in China. The results showed that the primary reason for the lack of integrating CAT tools in teaching translation in Chinese universities was the lack of the teaching staff's familiarity with CAT tools, as a great percentage of them were not very familiar with these tools and did not understand their purpose. Therefore, she suggested some solutions to enhance the situation, such as increasing the awareness of the importance of such tools for the students’ future career among translation teachers. Also, providing the staff in charge of teaching CAT courses with more training, as they showed a positive attitude and willingness to take CAT training courses.

On the other hand, studies of attitudes toward these tools can give a glance at the state of integrating them into the translator-training programs. This can be seen in Alotaibi’s (2014) study when she explored the degree of knowledge, expectations, and attitudes of 103 female translation students at KSU toward using CAT tools. The study revealed that the students had no prior knowledge of CAT tools, and most of the teaching staff do not use computers in the lectures. Moreover, it mentioned that free online services and tutorials were used regarding commercial applications, such as SDL Trados, due to the lack of the university’s fund. In the face of these issues, the researcher found a relationship between the students’ knowledge of CAT tools and their attitude toward the discipline. The more familiar they were with CAT tools, their potentials, and limitations, the more positive their attitude was toward them. In addition, the study emphasized integrating technology in general and CAT tools in particular in the translation program and encouraging the students to use these tools across translation courses and not only in CAT courses to enhance their technical skills and increase their productivity.

While professor Al-Jarf (2017) investigated the integration of technology in the translator-training program of the same university. In the study, she interviewed 72 female graduates from KSU who work as Arabic-English and English-Arabic translators and/or interpreters. The results revealed that the computer courses which the students took were inadequate to prepare them for their future job. Thus, she stressed on the importance of integrating technology into the translation curriculum, as the participants showed their resentment for not practicing such technological tools and software efficiently. In the end, she drew attention on extending the usage of these tools to other translation courses, which was noted by (Alotaibi, 2014) too.

Needless to say that both Alotaibi (2014) and Al-Jarf’s (2017) studies are limited to the female section in the university and do not cover the situation in the male section, which may have similar or different findings. In spite of this fact, they highlighted the same issue regarding the need for integrating more technology in the translator-training program of the university.

On a similar note, Mohammed (2020) dealt with the attitude of translation students at two universities in Yemen toward the translation programs offered by their universities. The analysis
was based on the Process of Acquisition of Translation Competence and Evaluation (PACTE) model, which includes six sub-competencies. One of these competencies is the instrumental sub-competence, which concerns the use of technology and CAT tools to enhance the students’ skills. The results showed that the programs neither integrate technology nor CAT tools. Also, some translation departments did not even offer a course in the computer for the students. Consequently, the students were not familiarized with the technological tools required in the translation market. As for the translation lectures, the traditional way of translating was more dominant and the labs were not used for practical lectures. Overall, the study revealed that the students had a negative attitude toward the translation programs for which they failed to improve their translation skills.

Meanwhile, Abu Dayyeh (2020) examined the usage of CAT tools in Arabic/English translation by Palestinian practicing translators and translation trainees from two universities in Palestine. The study investigated several aspects regarding CAT tools, such as the participants’ source of familiarity with CAT tools, the extent of their usage of CAT tools in the translation process, their perception of the reliability of these tools, etc. The results showed that a great percentage of the participants who used CAT tools highly suggested them to be used in the translation process, as they are convenient in saving the translators’ time. On the other hand, the study showed a lack in the usage of some tools, such as translation memories and terminology management systems by the participants, due to the lack of knowledge and training of such tools alongside the general perception of them as complex and insufficient for the Arabic language. In conclusion, he placed emphasis on the importance of technology for the translators’ future careers, and addressed the need for integrating CAT tools into the translation curriculum, as the majority of the participants confirmed the necessity of such integration.

Although all of the above studies explicitly reflected the need for more technology and CAT tools integration into the translator-training programs, some universities and academic institutions are still lagging behind. The ineffective integration of such tools was attributed to many factors, such as the lack of qualified teaching staff, the lack of awareness of the significance of CAT tools for the translation students and graduates in the professional settings, the lack of the universities’ fund, as some CAT programs are expensive to be installed and maintained regularly, and so forth (Al-Jarf, 2017; Alotaibi, 2014; Mohammed, 2020; Yao, 2017).

To activate the integration process of CAT tools into the translator-training programs, the curriculum developers should take the CAT courses into account, as they are at the heart of this process. Integrating CAT courses in the translation curricula and teaching the translation students such courses require an enormous amount of effort. There is no particular level in which CAT tools and technologies should be integrated (Bowker & Marshman, 2009). However, Bowker (2015) supported the integration of technologies at early levels and at a gradual pace, as it can help the students to build a firm technological base. If the teaching staff is not capable of handling the integration appropriately, the students’ experience can be negatively affected, which can affect their opportunities in the job market (Yao, 2017). The same attention should be drawn to the translator-training programs in Saudi universities, as the studies of (Al-Jarf, 2017; Alotaibi, 2014) indicated the lack of students’ usage of such tools, which requires further updates and considerations of the state of CAT tools integration in the translation program of the investigated university.
Moreover, translation instructors need to be aware of the importance of these tools and not just the students. This can be initiated by raising their awareness about the concept of Knowledge Sharing (KS), which was used by Ghabban, Selamat, and Ibrahim (2018) in their study that was conducted on some Saudi universities. The study indicated that practicing KS and using technology in the practice enhanced the scholarly publications in the Saudi universities included in the study, as the communication and sharing knowledge between the academic staff increased. This concept can be introduced to the teaching staff and encourage them to share the knowledge they have about their courses with each other. By practicing KS, the teachers of other courses will be able to perceive the importance of using CAT tools across translation courses and disseminate that to students.

In contrast, restricting the use of these tools to technology courses can result in a gap between theory and practice; consequently, the students’ preparations for the professional contexts can be adversely impacted (Bowker & Marshman, 2009). Pym (2013) advised that technological tools should not only be used in technology core courses but rather across translation courses as much as possible. While Kiraly (2014) touched upon an important aspect related to the CAT courses, which is the number of these courses in the translation program. He stated that providing only a course on technology cannot guarantee the students’ acquisition of the technical competence needed in the professional settings. Thus, the students need more exposure to technology and CAT tools to become aware of these tools, their benefits, drawbacks, and eventually become competent in using them.

Returning to the main question of the state and usage of CAT tools, the above studies did not focus primarily on investigating such matters, however, they focused on other aspects and issues within the same context. Some of them, especially those conducted on Saudi universities, were limited to one university or section. The variety of their explicit indications regarding the need for more technology and CAT tools integration necessitated further investigations. Therefore, the current study is an attempt to fill this gap, by providing answers to the present state of CAT tools integration in some Saudi universities, which are the software packages, whether desktop-based or cloud-based, and the extent of their usage by the students and graduates of these universities.

Methods

The study utilizes a mixed-methods approach (convergent design). The mixed-methods approach is used to make the research problem more understandable (Creswell & Clark, 2017). While the convergent design is used to validate the study by comparing and contrasting the results of the quantitative and qualitative data in the interpretation (Creswell & Clark, 2017).

Participants

The study includes five universities, which are King Saud University (KSU), Princess Nourah University (PNU), Imam Mohammed Ibin Saud Islamic University (IMSIU), Prince Sultan University (PSU), and Saudi Electronic University (SEU). These universities were selected as they, to some extent, represent Saudi universities and meet the study’s criteria. All of them provide translation courses, regardless of the program’s name, and supply the market with certified translators and interpreters. Another rationale for the choice is their location. All of them are
located in the same city as the researcher, which facilitated the communication with the universities’ officials and the interviewees when needed.

Regarding the participants of the study, the main criteria for selecting them were their major, the university they study/graduated from, and the year of graduation. Therefore, the sample included male and female English-Arabic translation students/graduates at the universities mentioned above who graduated during (2017-2019) or expected to graduate in the next two years. The study included both genders to be more representative and explore the situation in both sections which most of the previous studies in the literature, especially the ones conducted on Saudi universities, did not focus on as they only investigated one section. The sample was collected from the groups of English/Arabic translation students in social media platforms, who belong to the universities under study. This method was created by (Alshrief, 2019) to make the data collection procedure from the students’ group on social media more structured and systematic.

As for the year of graduation, it is determined to guarantee that the data collected are recent and relevant to the present study. Also, to track the developments of the translation programs in terms of CAT tools integration and its benefits for the students and graduates. Therefore, the participants who graduated at least one year before or after the determined period were also included in the study.

**Materials**

**Study Plans**

They are documents that contain the plan of the entire program and give an overview of each semester and its courses. Some of them attach the course specifications, which are documents that contain detailed information about each course. To explore the current state of CAT tools integration into the translator-training programs, all of the programs’ study plans were checked. Some of the course specifications were obtained upon a formal request, and some were available on the universities’ websites. Only the courses related to CAT tools were focused on since these courses are of concern to the current study. They are six documents in total, as some of the universities have two study plans. These course specifications were found to be an efficient source to explore the state of CAT tools integration in the translation programs, as their content is detailed impartially. Also, the courses form the program’s curriculum, therefore, their course specifications play a central role in developing the students’ skills (Elshafei, 2014).

**Survey**

According to Saldanha and O’Brien (2014), “questionnaires have been used to some extent in research on translation, most notably to research topics on the translation profession, technologies or to survey translation student opinions about teaching and learning” (p. 151). Hence, the survey was found to be an appropriate tool to explore the students/graduates’ usage of CAT tools in different translation tasks and courses. Also, to have a more inclusive view of the state of CAT tools from their perspective. It comprised close-ended questions and it was designed to assess four constructs, which are: the participants’ profile, their familiarity with CAT tools, their usage of CAT tools, and the situation of CAT courses in their universities and their opinions about them. Moreover, it was conducted in an electronic form (Google Form). Electronic surveys can reach a great number of people at a speedy pace (Taylor, 2000); consequently, it can help to
increase their participation as the internet is now available to almost everyone. Regarding the number of participants, 340 participated in the survey, and after excluding the irrelevant responses, the total number of participants was 318.

Semi-structured Interview

To assure the validity of the research data, a semi-structured interview was conducted. It was designed to obtain insightful details about the participants’ experience with CAT tools and their opinions about the CAT courses in the translation programs of their universities. The total number of interviewees was 34, and the interview took from 15 to 30 minutes each. As interviews involve a higher level of interaction and flexibility (Foddy, 1994), they enable the researcher to get more insights that he/she could not obtain by other procedures. All the interviews were recorded and transcribed with the consent of the participants. Since research ethics are of concern to the author, the participants’ anonymity was guaranteed.

Research Procedures

The data collected from the course specifications and interviews were analyzed using the content analysis method, which includes sorting the relevant responses into codes and assigning themes for them, searching for patterns, and making explanations (interpretations) (Dornyei, 2007). While statistical methods were used to analyze the quantitative data, which were collected from the survey. The analyzed data were triangulated to promote the reliability and validity of the study. The results then were correlated and contrasted with previous studies in the literature to draw conclusions on the state of CAT tools and their usage (see Discussion).

The process started by collecting the course specifications of the translation programs. Then, the materials were sorted, and only CAT-related courses were analyzed. The prerequisite courses, the graduation projects, and the other translation courses were also viewed to investigate whether the CAT tools were integrated into them or not.

After that, the process of conducting the survey began. The first step was determining the target population and the survey form. To draw an appropriate sample of the target population, the groups of the translation students of the five universities were targeted in three social media platforms, which are Twitter, WhatsApp, and Telegram. These groups usually include students and graduates of the same university and major. After determining the groups, their members’ information was collected and arranged in schedules using Microsoft Excel. The sample consisted of 1001 accounts and mobile numbers in total. After that, the survey was sent to them. It was distributed on February 1, 2020, and closed on March 15, 2020. Furthermore, the participants who agreed to provide their contact information were scheduled for further semi-structured interviews.

Since the interview is semi-structured, it involved a list of questions prepared in advance by the interviewer (Seliger & Shohamy, 1989). After interviewing the participants, the recorded interviews were transcribed. Then, the data set was filtered to find reappearing patterns that could emerge from it (Seliger & Shohamy, 1989) for the purpose of coding. To do so, the data set was reviewed many times by the researcher to be familiar with all of its features. Also, it was confirmed by checking the audio records of each interview while reviewing the data set simultaneously (Magnusson & Marecek, 2015).
Next, the entire data set was coded initially and followed by a second-level coding (Dornyei, 2007). MS Word 2019 was used to carry out the process, and each code was highlighted with a different color to be distinguished later. After assigning the codes, the data set was revised, and overlapped codes were identified (Saldanha & O’Brien, 2014). Several codes emerged from the data set, which are: disappointment, challenges, limitations, indication of difference, scale of knowledge estimation, resentment, adequacy of evaluation, high level of awareness, choice justifications, demands, opinions, suggestions, and expectations. Later, the codes were sorted and clustered into themes, which were derived from the data and not predetermined. Three themes yielded out of this process. They are: views on CAT tools experience, opinions about CAT courses, and suggestions for future curriculum. The analysis entailed considering how each theme is related to the interview questions and how both help to answer the research questions (Magnusson & Marecek, 2015).

Throughout the analysis, some correlations were found between some variables of the survey. The results were conveyed in a Pearson’s correlation coefficient (r). Correlations between variables do not mean that one variable causes the other, but they mean that the variables are related (Saldanha & O’Brien, 2014). Also, the statistical significance of the correlations was reported and presented by (P-value).

Results

The Study Plans of the Translator-Training Programs

The translation programs in the five universities have almost similar strategies in teaching the CAT course, which are as follows: in-class discussions, guided practical training, lectures, in-class exercises and handouts, presentations, computer lab tutorials, etc. The assessment methods go in line with these strategies to achieve the desired learning outcomes, which include: quizzes, in-lab practice and participation, constant indirect assessment, translation projects, midterms, assignments, in lab collective activities, and final exams.

Even though the universities have different names for their translation programs and diverse curricula, their objectives are nearly the same. They aspire to prepare professional translators and interpreters, promote the aspect of scientific research, meet the market demands, and contribute to the translation industry by enriching the translation from and into the Arabic language. Also, they supply the market with certified translators.

Regarding the CAT courses, all of the universities provided one course in CAT tools, except IMSIU, which instead provided a course in CALL. As for the study plans, KSU and PNU had two plans, one was old and one was new. Also, IMSIU had two plans; however, one was current and one was new, which has not yet been implemented entirely to the curriculum. The lectures were divided differently in each program; some were more theoretical than practical, some were the opposite, and some were not clear. Even though the CAT courses introduced the students to more than one tool, SDL Trados was the main software program that the CAT courses in most of the universities focused on. Since other translation courses and graduation courses were analyzed, some of them comparatively integrated CAT tools. While some of these courses mentioned CAT tools as an option to be used by the students in the course.
The number of CAT courses provided by the universities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Universities</th>
<th>Number of CAT Courses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KSU</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMSIU</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNU</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSU</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEU</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Furthermore, all of the courses aimed to achieve almost the same objectives. They had almost the same evaluation and improvement processes, regarding the courses, the students’ achievement, and the teaching staff. In addition, all of them had similar requirements, except the course provided by PSU, which fulfilled all of the requirements. In regards to the material used in the courses, all of them used textbooks, some electronic material, and the course’s software programs. On the other hand, the content of each course differed from one university to another, even from one plan to another of the same program, as the courses are updated periodically.

Survey

As stated above, an electronic survey was used to collect quantitative data. 340 translation students and graduates participated in the survey during a period of one month and a half. After excluding the 22 irrelevant responses, the number of participants became 318. The analysis was accomplished using statistical methods, and the results are presented below in four separate sections. They are as follows:

Respondents’ profile

This section addresses a categorization of the respondents into groups based on their gender, universities, year of graduation, computer skills competence, occupation, and the number of CAT courses they took in their universities. Since not all of the universities included in this study have a male section, the number of male participants was lower than the female participants. The male participants constituted only (8%) while the female participants constituted (92%) of the total participants. They are distributed as follows:
In terms of the graduation year, almost half of the participants (45%) were graduates, while more than half of them (55%) were students. They are divided as follows:

Then, the respondents were asked to rate their computer skills from excellent to poor. The majority (43%) rated themselves as ‘Good’ users of the computer and (41%) of them as ‘Excellent’ users. Whereas (14%) presented an adequate level of computer skills, only (2%) reported that their computer skills are poor.
Moreover, the occupation question was directed only to the graduate participants to discover whether the translation is their main or additional job. However, some of the student participants answered the question and showed some considerable results. The majority of the graduate respondents (51%) work as translators, while (42%) of them, translation was an additional occupation, and only (7%) had other jobs. As for the students, more than half of them (56%) work as part-time translators.

To delve deeper into the respondents’ profile and the situation of CAT tools in their universities’ translation program, the respondents were asked about the number of CAT courses they took in their universities. Most of the participants reported that they took only one course.
(49%) in PNU, (23%) in KSU, (4%) in SEU, and (3%) in PSU. By contrast, all IMSIU respondents (18%) reported that no CAT courses were offered by their university. Similarly, a few participants from KSU (3%) and SEU (1%) did not have the chance to take the course in the university.

**Figure 5. Number of CAT courses provided by the universities**

**Familiarity with CAT tools**

This section revealed whether the participants were familiar with CAT tools or not and how they first became familiar with them. Familiarity here means having knowledge of the CAT tools and not practical experience. It asked them to rate their familiarity level and source (university courses, online courses, training workshops inside or outside the university, or other sources). A significant percentage of the participants (65%) reported that they were ‘to some extent familiar’ with CAT tools, (22%) of them rated themselves as ‘very familiar,’ while (12%) of the participants were not familiar with these tools.

As for the sources of their familiarity, university courses were the primary source for (51%) of participants to be ‘to some extent familiar’ with CAT tools and (16%) of them to be ‘very familiar.’ While (8%) turned into 'to some extent familiar' and (1%) into 'very familiar' from online courses. Training workshops outside the university helped (3%) of the participants to be 'very familiar' with CAT tools and (2%) to be ‘to some extent familiar.” Similarly, (3%) of the respondents became approximately familiar with CAT tools from the workshops inside the university, and (1%) became "very familiar.” Whereas (1%) became very and relatively familiar with such tools from other sources.

**Figure 6. Participants’ level & source of familiarity with CAT tools**
Usage of CAT tools

This construct investigated the participants’ usage of CAT tools in their translation tasks and the extent to which they use them. Almost half of them (45%) do not use CAT tools in their translation tasks. As for the ones who use them, (12%) confirmed to use them frequently, (9%) occasionally, and only (2%) rarely. While the informants who partially use CAT tools, (26%) of them use these tools from time to time, (5%) use them frequently, and (2%) use them, but rarely.

Figure 7. Participant’s usage of CAT tools in translation tasks & the extent of their usage

CAT courses in the universities and the participants’ opinions

This section revolved around the state of CAT courses in the universities under study and the participants’ opinions about them. It asked the participants if the instructors of other translation courses encouraged them to use CAT tools in their courses or not. Also, it investigated the state of the CAT and technology-related workshops provided by the universities and the CAT labs’ infrastructure.

Regarding the utilization of CAT tools in other translation courses, more than half of the participants (58%) stated that they did not use them across translation courses but only in CAT courses. However, (19%) used them in some other translation courses, and only (3%) used CAT tools across all the translation courses. In contrast, (20%) of the participants had never used CAT tools.

Figure 8. Participants’ usage of CAT tools in other translation courses
Then, the participants were asked whether their instructors of other translation courses encouraged them to use CAT tools in their courses. More than half of the participants (55%) were not encouraged to use CAT tools across translation courses. However, (27%) of them were “to some extent” encouraged, and (19%) their instructors of other translation courses encouraged them to use CAT tools in the courses they teach. They are detailed below:

![Instructors' Encouragement of CAT Tools Usage Across Translation Courses](image)

*Figure 9. The translation instructors’ encouragement of the usage of CAT tools across translation courses*

The survey also investigated the role of the translation departments regarding the CAT-related workshops they provided to the translation students. Most of the respondents (46%) indicated that the university did not provide them with workshops related to CAT tools. On the other hand, (27%) reported being provided with workshops by the university, and (27%) indicated that they were “to some extent” provided with workshops. More details are provided below:

![CAT Tools Workshops Provided by the Universities](image)

*Figure 10. CAT-related workshops provided by the universities*

Afterward, the universities’ labs were explored in terms of being equipped with the software programs covered in the course and other necessary items. As their university offers a
CALL course, IMSIU’s participants were able to evaluate the labs in their university. More than half of the participants (59%) reported that the labs were not equipped with the necessary items; however, (20%) considered them partially equipped, and (20%) the labs were fully equipped for them. More details are presented as follows:

**Figure 11.** The infrastructure of CAT labs in the universities under study

**Correlations between variables**

Throughout the analysis, some correlations between the variables were spotted. The instructors’ encouragement to use CAT tools across translation courses was correlated with the participants’ usage of CAT tools in other translation courses, and the result was (1.0, \( p = 0.006 \)).

**Table 2. Pearson’s correlation coefficient**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Correlation coefficient (( r ))</th>
<th>P value (( p ))</th>
<th>Significance level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instructors’ encouragement &gt; Usage of CAT tools across courses</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.006</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

***. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

**Figure 12.** Correlation between the participants’ usage of CAT tools across translation courses & their instructors’ encouragement
Semi-structured Interview

The interviewees’ responses were based on their experiences with CAT tools. Since the interviews were analyzed using the content analysis method, three themes emerged throughout the analysis. They are: views on the CAT tools, opinions about CAT courses, and suggestions for future curriculum. They are summarized below:

Views on the CAT tools experience

This theme addressed the questions that revolved around the interviewees’ experience with CAT tools, which reflected both the situation of CAT tools in their universities and their usage of such tools either in the translation courses or translation tasks. When the participants were asked about their general experience with CAT tools, they highlighted the challenges and limitations, and developed some sort of disappointment toward the course they took in the university, mainly in terms of the course’s practicality. Then, they talked about their general experience with CAT tools. Below are some of their responses that were extracted from the interview transcript:

● I knew about CAT tools from the internet and I liked their concept in translation. Unfortunately, our university does not provide a CAT course in its curriculum.
● First of all, my experience as a BA student taking CAT tools was very limited. The programs that I was introduced to were very important in the field of translation, however, the scope of the practice was very limited… As for the rest of the programs, personally as a graduate, I can only remember Trados the other programs I remember them being useful but they didn't stick with me throughout my professional life.

Then, they developed some sort of resentment regarding the availability of the licenses and mentioned some differences between the male and female section in providing such licenses.

● No, we used the trail.
● No, not even a trial. The situation in the male section differs from the female section. Also, it depends on the coordinator of the course, some of them feel responsible for their students and make sure that they obtain the license and some are not.

After that, they showed some differences in their experience with their CAT instructors, regarding their scale of knowledge of the course material and technology.

● No, she was not informed of the course. She used to skip a lot of things.
● Yes, very qualified.

Opinions about CAT courses

This theme shed some light on the interviewees’ opinions about CAT tools in particular situations. The interviewees’ answers had a high degree of similarity in almost all the questions. They developed a negative attitude toward the course in terms of its adequacy to prepare them for the workplace. Some of their responses are presented below:

● No, the course was not enough.
● No, because the features that we were introduced to were very limited, so they were not enough to take you to a very technical place, where you can confidently use technology to aid your translation.
Then, they showed a high level of awareness of the CAT tools' importance in the job market. Most of them chose the translator with CAT tools experience, and they justified their choices when they were asked about which translator will get more opportunities in the job market.

- The one with definitely, because everything is integrated with technology nowadays.
- The one with, because he will do more work with CAT tools, because they help speeding up the translation and increasing the productivity of the translator.

Afterward, they showed some demands in their suggestions when they were asked about the effective ways of motivating them as translation students to use CAT tools. They focused mainly on three main aspects, which were: availability of the licenses, the role of the teaching staff, and more practical exposure to the tools.

- Give us unlimited access, by providing licenses for us. Also, the instructors play a key role in this regard.
- The best way to encourage us as students is by providing licenses for us so we can use them for the entire year not just for one month. Also, if all the translation courses and the graduation project were submitted through CAT tools, in this way I would investigate the program more and learn more about it, and then when I go to the workplace, I already know how to use them and I would be confident of my abilities.

Suggestions for future curriculum

This theme gave the interviewees the freedom to provide elaborative suggestions regarding their universities’ translation curriculum, whether enlightening ideas, workshops, or courses that they wanted to be added to the curriculum. The interviewees’ answers yielded several suggestions. However, most of their suggestions focused on three areas; in particular, they were: more technology involvement and more integration of CAT courses, more preparation for them to enter the job market, and more maintenance and equipment for the labs. They are as follows:

- The basic English courses should be less and translation courses should be more, individual feedback in the translation courses, more translation practice not just theories to prepare the students for the job market.
- The curriculum was dense and tough for BA translation students and there were no labs. So, I would suggest a rearrangement of the curriculum with more technology courses and maintenance of the labs.

Discussion

The present study utilized a mixed-methods approach to investigate the state of CAT tools integration into the translator-training programs of some universities in Saudi Arabia and the extent of the students/graduates' usage of such tools in different translation tasks and courses. Therefore, data were collected from diverse sources (the study plans of the translation programs, the electronic survey, and the semi-structured interview) and analyzed using different methods (content analysis method and statistical methods). The results yielded from the analysis are discussed, and correlations and contradictions are made to drive to new conclusions, which contribute to providing statistical data on the state and usage of CAT tools in some universities in Saudi Arabia. The information is important, as the study discusses a topic that has been notably reflected on in the previous studies, but rarely investigated. Therefore, it allows the decision-makers, curriculum developers, universities, translation departments, and teachers to consider the significance of
technology in general and CAT tools in particular to the future of the translation students and graduates. Also, how these tools begin to assume an important place in the translation market.

As mentioned before, not all of the universities included in this study have a male section therefore, the female participants (92%) outnumber the male participants (8%). As for their computer skills competence, the results show that the majority of the participants have Good (43%) to Excellent (41%) computer skills, which means that they are technically skilled and aware of the technology. Also, a great percentage of the graduates (51%) work as translators or have the translation as an additional job (42%). While more than half of the students (56%) work as part-time translators. This indicates that they have some practical experience in the job market, whether short or average.

Regarding their familiarity with CAT tools, the respondents show a high level of familiarity as (22%) are very familiar, and (65%) are to some extent familiar. Only (12%) are not familiar, which can be due to the year of graduation as some of the participants graduated before 2017 (6%) and did not have the chance to take CAT courses. Besides, some of them will graduate after 2021 (6%) and have not taken the course yet. This reveals that the developments of the translation programs and the addition of the CAT courses in the curricula make the students and graduates of later years more familiar with CAT tools and have a more positive attitude toward technology in translation, which was reflected in their responses throughout the interview. Similar findings were reached by (Alotaibi, 2014) when the students showed a more positive attitude toward CAT software at the end of the CAT course when they became familiar with the tools and their potential benefits and drawbacks.

As for the state of CAT tools integration into the investigated universities’ translation programs, which is one of the main objectives of the current study. It can be said that CAT tools are not integrated effectively into the translator-training programs, as the study plans indicate that not all of the universities provide CAT courses in their translation programs. This is also confirmed by the participants of some universities in the survey (18%). In addition, those participants show their disappointment in the interview that their university does not offer the course. Meanwhile, the universities that provide CAT courses lack some elements that hinder the efficacy of integrating these tools into their translation programs. Their study plans show that all of them provide only one CAT core course, and the majority of the survey participants (79%) indicated that as well. The number of the CAT courses was among the main aspects that the participants show their resentment about, as they state in the interview that one course is not enough for them to practice and explore the tools. Also, it was not enough to prepare them for the job market, and they suggest more integration of CAT courses in the translation curriculum. This goes in line with Kiraly’s (2014) statement about the inadequacy of providing one course to enable the students to acquire the technical competence required in a professional workplace.

Moreover, the workshops provided by the universities on CAT-related topics and the infrastructure of the labs can be additional indicators of the state of CAT tools integration. Most of the universities rarely provide workshops on such topics, and the majority of the participants proved that; for more details (see Figure 10). This suggests a lack of disseminating knowledge
about CAT tools among the students since only (4%) of the participants first became familiar with CAT tools through the universities' workshops.

Whereas, the infrastructure of the labs in almost all of the universities seems to be not fulfilling the course requirements, as they are reported to be not equipped by nearly all of the participants in terms of the availability of the necessary items such as enough computers, the installation of the course’s software, internet, etc. (see Figure 11). They repeatedly suggested more enhancement and equipment for them in the interview. Therefore, it could be inferred that both the CAT-related workshops and the infrastructure of the universities’ labs indicate a lack of CAT tools integration and a need for providing the students with more technology and an environment that supports the use of technology in translation. This is in line with Fatani's (2007) claims that providing the students with more technology and more IT maintenance will enhance the translator-training programs, which will reflect on their outcomes.

The study also aims to investigate the translation students/ graduates’ usage of CAT tools in different translation tasks and courses. Despite their familiarity with CAT tools, excellent computer skills, and their experience as translators or part-time translators, the results reveal that most of the participants do not use CAT tools in their translation tasks (45%). Also, more than half of the respondents (58%) report not using CAT tools in other translation courses; instead, the usage of these tools is limited to the CAT core courses. The lack of CAT tools usage across translation courses was also confirmed by (Al-Jarf, 2017; Alotaibi, 2014; Mohammed, 2020) as they suggest more integration and practice of such tools.

The participants are prepared to be professional translators, and not using CAT tools contradicts the findings of (Lagoudaki, 2006), as the majority of the participants in her study, who are professional translators, report using more than one tool. As well, this can affect the participants’ performance in the workplace, which may justify both Samson’s (2005) statement and Fatani’s (2009) indication. As the former stated that some companies are bitterly disappointed about the performance of the translation graduates with CAT tools. While the latter attributed the negligence of the governmental institutions, organizations, and other corporations of the translation industry in Saudi Arabia to the lack of qualified translators in the market at various levels, along with the technical level.

The lack of usage can be derived from many factors; one of them is the absence of the instructors’ motivation. Many studies (Alotaibi, 2014; Bowker & Marshman, 2009; Elshafei, 2014; Yao, 2017) have mentioned the critical role of the instructors in motivating the students and facilitating the learning process. In this regard, the results show a strong positive correlation between the students’ usage of CAT tools across translation courses and the instructors’ encouragement ($r=1.0, p=0.006$). This indicates that the less the instructors’ motivation, the lack of CAT tools usage across courses. Also, the participants emphasize in the interview that their instructors do not motivate them to use CAT tools either in other translation courses or in the graduation project, which contradicts some course specifications that stated that the students are encouraged to use CAT tools in other translation courses and the translation project.
The unfamiliarity of the instructors of other translation courses with CAT tools can be the reason behind not motivating the students to use them in their courses. The findings of (Yao, 2017) revealed that the majority of the translation instructors indicated to be not very familiar with CAT tools, which affected their integration in teaching translation. Even though the CAT instructors in this study are evaluated to be technically qualified by most of the participants in the interview, they seem to be not disseminating the importance of CAT tools among their colleagues, which led to the lack of encouragement.

The results reveal that the usage of CAT tools by the majority of the participants (58%) was restricted to the CAT core courses. This implies the lack of Knowledge Sharing, which was explored by (Ghabban et al., 2018) to enhance the communication between the academic staff in some Saudi universities. The instructors responsible for the CAT courses in the universities under study seem to be not sharing the importance of these tools for the students’ future career with their fellow instructors of other translation courses, which made the latter less supportive of using CAT tools in their courses. Nevertheless, exchanging experiences and sharing knowledge between the teaching staff may not be activated not because of their unwillingness to share, but it may be due to the absence of the concept of KS, which could be related to the nature of knowledge or any other factor that affects its practice.

What is more, the design of the course could be one of the factors of the participants’ lack of practice of CAT tools. The results of the course specifications point out some sort of unclarity of the CAT lectures’ structure, as some were more theoretical than practical, some were the opposite, and some were not clear. Also, the participants indicated in the interview that the course was limited and not enough to prepare them for the job market. The relationship between the course design and the students’ experience was highlighted by (Elshafei, 2014), as she drew a correlation between the weakness of students’ translation and the lack of well-designed translation courses. All of which can affect the preparation of the students and graduates for the marketplace and widen the gap between the translator-training programs and the translation market. This goes in line with Abu-ghararah’s (2017) claims, since she asserted a huge gap between the academic training and the needs of the translation market in Saudi Arabia.

Furthermore, the software’s licenses can be a potential factor of the limited usage of CAT tools. Nearly all of the respondents use the trial version, which lasts only 30 days. Besides, some of them mentioned some differences between the sections (male and female) in terms of providing the licenses. This can be due to the lack of funds, which correlates with (Alotaibi, 2014; Yao, 2017), where both stressed the lack of the university's funds and how it affected the students' experience with CAT tools. Although the participants are introduced to more than one software during the course, the main focus is on SDL Trados. This program is not cloud-based; therefore, it needs to be installed on the computer. Using the trial version affected the participants' experience, as they adversely stressed that in the interview. They were limited to a specific time, which prevented them from exploring the program.

On the other hand, the results show the participants’ awareness of the importance of CAT tools for them as translators. In the interview, most of them consider having CAT experience as a factor that can increase their opportunities in the job market. Similarly, they strongly reflect on
more integration and positively suggest it in their responses to more than one question in the interview. This can be correlated with Abu Dayyeh's (2020) findings, when the majority of the translators and translation students reported the necessity of integrating more CAT tools in the translation curriculum of their universities.

Conclusion

With the widespread use of technology and the increasing demand of the translation market for technically qualified translators, the education industry tried to cope with these demands. Therefore, plenty of universities around the world, including Saudi universities developed their translator-training programs and integrated some technological tools to prepare their translators to be for the job market. Also, many scholarly works have been done in an attempt to investigate the integration of technology in general and these tools in particular into the translation programs, yet little was conducted on Saudi universities.

To bridge that gap, the current study investigates the state of CAT tools in both sections (male and female) in five Saudi universities, which are IMSIU, KSU, PNU, PSU, and SEU. Also, the usage of these tools by their translation students/graduates in various translation tasks and courses. The findings prove that the state of CAT tools integration in the universities is still in its initial stages and needs more consideration, as not all of the universities provide CAT courses in their translation programs. While the ones that offer them, do not effectively integrate CAT tools into their translation programs. They only offer one CAT course, which was indicated to be not enough by the participants to practice these tools and be prepared for the professional settings.

In addition, the present study reveals a lack of CAT tools usage by the translation students and graduates in the translation tasks and across translation courses. It is attributed to many factors, such as the absence of the instructors’ motivation, the lack of sharing knowledge with the teaching staff of other translation courses, and the lack of practice of these tools. Also, the CAT software licenses and the design of the translation courses were among the potential factors that hindered the usage of these tools. Furthermore, the participants’ awareness of the benefits of CAT tools for them and their future career was revealed, since most of them positively supported more integration of courses related to CAT tools and technology. As well as, they highly suggested more integration of CAT tools across translation courses.

These tools have been a topic of interest for a myriad of researchers and their insights proved that the translators are the main factor of the success of the translation process. Also, such tools were not meant to replace human translators at all, but to aid them, since they are in charge of the translation, even with technology. Regardless of the negative effects of these tools that may run across the border, the rapid technological changes in the translation industry and the demand of the translation market for professional translators with excellent technical skills make CAT tools integration into the translation programs more important than ever before.

The current study poses some suggestions to be followed in future research. The state of CAT tools was investigated in an academic context in a particular city in Saudi Arabia, which cannot be generalized to other contexts. Thus, it is recommended that this investigation be carried
out in other universities in Saudi Arabia or around the world, because of the importance of such tools for the translation students and graduates.

About the Author
Lama A. Al-Rumaih is an English/Arabic translator. She translated a great number of articles and texts in different fields and some of her translations are published. She has a Master’s degree from Princess Nourah University in the field of Specialized Translation. She is a member of some platforms in social media that aim to enrich the Arabic content through translation, such as Ollemna. Her research interests include translation studies, translation technology, post-editing, and audio-visual translation. ORCiD: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3506-2757

References
EAMT - European Association for Machine Translation. (n.d.). Retrieved from


The Integration of Computer-Aided Translation Tools

Routledge.
A Cognitive Analysis of Si Mohand’s Translated Poetry L’Amitié Bafouée

Kahina MECHAT
Department of English
Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi-Ouzou
Tizi-Ouzou, Algeria
Correspondent Author: kahina.mechat@ummo.dz

Souryana YASSINE
Department of English
Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi-Ouzou
Tizi-Ouzou, Algeria

Received: 1/4/2021 Accepted: 2/11/2021 Published: 2/24/2021

Abstract
Kabyle oral poetry is the spirit of Kabyle literature. Si Mohand’s poetry was and still is the subject of many studies. The current research is Cognitive and analytical and aims to explain the English translated version of poem 16 taken from L’Amitié Bafouée, using schema theory, following Semino’s (2014) proposed approach to poetry analysis. Terminologies advanced by Schank and Abelson (1977), Schank’s Dynamic Memory (1982), and Cook’s Schema Refreshment (1994), will be used in the analysis. The study’s significance is firstly shown through its corpus, i.e. previous works dealing with Si Mohand’s poetry mostly made use of either the French or Kabyle versions. And secondly, through the use of a combination of terminologies advanced by the previously mentioned scholars. The study aims to answer the following main question: what is the main scene projected by the poem? And the following sub-question: what is the impact of culturally translated metaphors on readers? Results show that nine scripts need to be activated to form the betrayal Scene. Moreover, the use of literal translation in cultural metaphors specifically, led to difficulties in activating appropriate scripts in order to allow understanding to take place. In fact, understanding is determined by the reader’s background knowledge. The current analysis can also be used in translation assessment, detecting cultural misunderstandings, comparative studies of poetry, and can even be introduced to teaching.

Keywords: scene, schema refreshment, schema theory, Si Mohand’s translated poetry “l’Amitié Bafouée”, thematic organization point (TOP)

Introduction

The current study is analytical, aiming to explain the English version of a Kabyle poem of Si Mohand, who was born around 1840-1850 and died in 1902. He is considered as a philosopher and a poet whose poems are generally seen as a replica of his own life yet reflecting the spirit of his country (Feraoun, 2012). His poems’ topics are, most of the time, related to love, destiny, and exile. Kabyle poetry needs to target a wider audience which is not fulfilled through the use of the Kabyle or French versions. With that said, using the English translated version will logically increase its visibility and reach a larger audience. Si Mohand’s poetry was translated multiple times by different translators. But the current study relies on the French version translated by the Kabyle writer Feraoun (1960), which was later on translated by Pierre Joris into English i.e. the version used in the current analysis. The main aim of the study is to answer these questions: what is the main scene projected by poem 16? and what is the impact of cultural translated metaphors on the readers? The first hypothesis states that the main scene is related the title of the collection “L’amitié Bafouée” i.e. broken friendship. The second hypothesis asserts that the impact of the translated metaphors is the same as the one of the cultural metaphors of the French version.

Literature Review

Schema Theory: Its Background and Application in Poetry Analysis

Schema theory is a cognitive theory that sheds light on the way prior knowledge and previous experiences stored in memory interact with the input to comprehend a current situation. Semino (2014) asserted that, it was first referred to by Immanuel Kant, as structures that organize knowledge in the brain. However, its modern use is attributed to Bartlet (1932), who ascribes it to Head (1920).

The complementarity of Schank and Abelson (1977), Schank Dynamic Memory (1982) and Cook’s Schema Refreshment (1994), when it comes to their views about schema theory, was the reason behind the use of a mixture of their terminologies in the current study. All scholars agreed that the activation of appropriate schemata related to the proper prior knowledge (if available) at the right time is crucial to the understanding process and determines the degree of comprehension. Schank and Abelson (1977) introduced script along with plans, goals and understanding to make sense of events using the background knowledge stored in memory. Schank and Abelson (1977) defined script as follows: “A script is a structure that describes appropriate sequences of events in a particular context…Scripts handle stylized everyday situations … [A] script is a predetermined, stereotyped sequence of actions that defines a well-known situation” (p 41)

Semino (2014) asserted that Schank and Abelson (1977) differentiated between three types of scripts, personal ones like being nervous, situational ones like taking a taxi and physical ones like driving a car. A plan is used to make sense of an input (unknown script) i.e., plans are used to understand a situation and reach a given goal; these plans can be a script (a script used within another script), or become one after sufficient information is gathered (Semino, 2014).

Schank and Abelson’s (1977) case study in the development of knowledge structures was performed on a child named Hana. They started with the idea that “an important part of the language acquisition process is the acquisition of scripts” by being dragged into an experience...
“enough times”. They give the example of the acquisition and development of Hana’s restaurant script at different ages. After that, they noticed her storytelling development at different ages. They deduced that “her understanding seems proportional to her limited world knowledge” when dealing with scripts or plan inferences. Their “main assertion is that first Hana knew standard scripts and then she knew how to do some rudimentary planning.”

Schank’s model of dynamic memory (1982) took into consideration the flexibility of memory and its ability to develop, adapt and adjust to new experiences. He advanced the following terms: scripts, scenes, memory organization pockets (MOPs), and Meta MOPs. His term “Thematic Organization points (TOPs)” is essential in the current analysis. It highlights the ability to pick up information across different domains to understand a given situation (Semino, 2014). According to the definition given above, a script is one possible realization of a scene. According to Schank (1982), a scene is underlined by the achievement of a goal, within a setting and having actions happening towards the achievement of that goal. Semino (2014) explained that Schank (1982) differentiated between three types of scenes; physical scenes dealing with settings, societal scenes taking place in a given setting between people having a relationship to accomplish a given purpose, and personal scenes are determined by personal goals.

Important notions advanced by Cook, including Schema preserving, reinforcing and adding alongside schema disrupting, are used in the current analysis. Semino (2014) mentioned that Cook distinguished between schematic knowledge based on the effect it has on the discourse. Schema reinforcing or adding, indicates that an already existing schema has been proved and confirmed by adding additional information to background knowledge forming that schema. Schema preserving means that the schema is kept as it is while schema disrupting would lead to schema change by destroying an old schema and building up a new one (Hidalgo-Dawning, 2000).

Foale and Pagett (2009) claimed that “schema theory suggests that we tend to store much of what we know in schemata, which are simply ‘containers’ for our experiences”. They gave the example of having a “poetry schema” that contains everything in relation to poetry, then, further argued that it wasn’t sufficient to understand all poems, as readers need to make connections between what they know and what they “are struggling to understand”. This could be done by relating previous experiences to the real world.

Semino (2014) proposed an approach to analyse poetic text worlds based on schema theory by systematically relating it to the linguistic analysis of texts. She analyzed two poems, namely: ‘A Pillowed Head’ by Seamus Heaney and ‘Morning Song’ by Sylvia Plath”. She asserted that both “are similar in two main respects: they both deal with the birth of a child and they both project worlds that, in possible-world terms, are fully compatible with the world we live in” (Semino, 2014). She further added that worlds that are considered as being realistic could represent different views of reality and “therefore be perceived differently by readers”. According to her, this difference could be explained using schema theory. Semino (2014) pointed to the fact that the use of schema theory accounts for her interpretations which means that other readers with different backgrounds may interpret the poems differently. In this sense, Freeman (2020) claimed that “neuroscientists have discovered that certain synaptic pathways in the brain develop their use
depending on exposure to environmental experience, so that every human brain is slightly different”. Semino (2014) made use of terminologies advanced in: Rumelhart’s Schema theory and Cognition (1980), Schank and Abelson’s View on Schema Theory (1977), Schank’s Dynamic Memory (1982), and Cook’s Schema Refreshment (1994).

Schema theory was not used in analyzing English translated versions of Si Mohand’s poems, by Joris (2012). As far as authors know, the original Kabyle versions and French translated versions were the subject of various research in different fields. The majority of the studies conducted were initially done to gather the poems and transcribe them to preserve them and get to know the Kabyle culture. This is the case of Boulifa (1904), Feraoun (1960), and Mammeri (1969), who transcribed Si Mohand’s Poetry and translated it into French. Other studies on Si Mohand’s Poetry in literature in general and comparative literature, in particular, were undertaken by scholars such as Connolly (2020) who shed light on the original version of the first poem of Si Mohand “Bismilleh” found in Mammeri (1969) and introduced its English version translated by Walid Bouchakour and himself. His analysis was based on the impact of the poet’s life experiences, Qur’anic education mostly, on his poetry and career.

The Poet
Si Mohand’s date of birth is unknown since his name does not figure in Kabylia civil status records. However, his date of death is: 1906 (Feraoun, 2012). Boulifa noted that he died in his forties i.e. when he was 46 years old. With that said, Feraoun (2012) mentioned that other testimonies confirm that when he died, he had more than sixty years old. After the rebellion of 1871, Si Mohand’s father was executed and their fortune was seized by the state. This broke the family apart and Si Mohand became a vagabond. He died in 1906 at Sœurs Blanches Hospital and was buried at Sidi Said Taleb sanctum.

The Translators
Mouloud Feraoun, who transcribed and translated Si Mohand’s poetry, was born on March 8th, 1913, in a village called Tizi-Hibel (Fort-National). He went to l’Ecole Normale de Bouzareah in 1932. In 1935, he became a teacher at Tizi Hibel. In 1957, he moved to Algiers and became the director of Ecole Nador. He was killed by l’OAS in March 1962.

Pierre Joris, who translated Si Mohand’s poetry from French into English, is a poet, a translator, and a professor at the University of Albany. In 1990, he got a Ph.D. in Comparative Literature from Suny-Binghamton. In 1975, he got an M.A in Theory and Practice of Translation.

Materials and Methods
The study is qualitative and analytical, aiming to explain the English translated version of Poem -16- taken from L’Amitié Bafouée, in Si Mohand’s poetry translated by Pierre Joris (2012), using schema theory, based on Elena Semino (2014) proposed approach.

The Corpus
Si Mohand’s poetry is oral and was first transcribed by Si Said Boulifa (1904). Yet, Si Mohand’s name does not appear in the title of his book: Recueil de Poésies Kabyles (Feraoun,
2012). However, he was the one who attributed the poems to Si Mohand by mentioning his name and the oral specificity of his poetry. Feraoun (1960) was the first to mention the poet’s name in the title of his book. He, furthermore, takes into consideration the historical context of the poems, gives the poet’s biography and presents his work.

Finnegan (2017) classifies oral poetry within “oral literature” and claims that “oral poetry essentially circulates by oral rather than written means; in contrast to written poetry, its distribution, composition or performance are by word of mouth and not through reliance on the written or printed word” (p.16). Lahlou (2013) claims that till the XX century, Kabyle literature was mainly oral and expressed through poetry. He adds that a poem is called “Assefru” which comes from the verb “ssefru” which means “enlighten or clarify” (p.108). This means that Kabyle oral poetry tends to maintain, to clarify, and interpret reality. Social life in Kabylia is seen through oral poetry and topics such as friendship, betrayal, ingratitude, civic responsibilities, knowledge, etc. One of the well-known poets of that period is Si Mohand Ou Mhand, as mentioned by Assaf (2019): “the works of the most famous Kabyle poet of that time, Si Mohand Ou Mhand, whose family was crushed in 1871 repression, are a constant opposition between ‘then’ and ‘now’ (zik/tura)” (p. 78). This confirms the fact that Kabyle oral poetry clarifies, shows, and represents Kabyle life just like Si Mohand’s poetry.

**Analysis Procedure**

The analysis procedure is simple. Scripts embodied within the main schema, or scene, will be examined in the English version of the poem, translated by Pierre Joris. To do so, terms previously mentioned within Schank and Abelson (1977), Schank’s Dynamic Memory (1982), and Cook’s Schema Refreshment (1994), will be used accordingly. The figurative language and metaphors will be analyzed using TOP, a term advanced by Schank (1982). Finally, Cook’s schema refreshment is introduced to put forth the poem’s impact on the audience.

The activation of the Formal Schema enables the reader to know, just by taking a look at poem 16 within collection III L’Amitié Bafouée, that it is poetry and is translated into poetry as well. The original poem is oral and transcribed by Feraoun into Kabyle language. The transcribed version and the French and English translated ones are all divided into three stanzas with three verses each, organized as A-A-B/A-A-B in the original poem and rendered into free verse stanzas in both translated versions.

The analysis starts with a description of the Discourse Situation of the Poem. Then the use of definite reference is explained and linked to the activations of scripts. After that, scripts are advanced gradually to determine the main schema or scene. In fact, the analysis is going to be done stanza by stanza and then, each verse within each stanza is analyzed alone and in relation to other verses to determine, using Schank and Abelson’s script (name and type), Goal, plan and understanding, the scripts incorporated within the scene projected by the translated version of Si Mohand’s Poem, translated by Pierre Joris.
Analysis and Results

The Discourse Situation of the Poem

The poet Si Mohand captured a period in Kabylia’s history in this poem, seen as a form of resistance against the French colonial acts as he complains and shares the Kabyles’ suffering and shame (Feraoun, 2012). The poet mentioned the traitors who have chosen to live a life of humiliation and abjectness. While he declared himself in civil disobedience and made the decision to never have an identity card or be registered anywhere in the civil status register, never take the train, the bus or use any colonial means of transportation or even have a picture, he would rather travel by foot in his homeland (Oulebsir, 2017). The focus is on the poet himself and how he unmasked the traitors. The poet makes its appearance right at the beginning of the poem through the use of the personal pronoun “I”. The use of “we”, in the first verse of the second stanza, “we will break but without bending”, refers to all those who are still standing and fighting, including him, against these traitors, their chiefs and the colonial forces. In the second verse of the third stanza, “I prefer to leave my country”, the poet joined the act of exile to himself as a preference rather than living among traitors and colonial forces that destroyed everything in his beloved region.

Definite Reference and Schema Activation

The use of definite reference means that a schema is already activated. Its use in the poem indicates that the projected communicative situation is personal and shared by the poet and the target audience. The definite article “the” was used first in the second verse of the first stanza of the poem indicating that a schema is already activated i.e., the fact that the itinerary was established by saying “from Tizi-Ouzou all the way to Akfadou”, which explains the use of definite reference. The definite article “the” is also used in the third verse of the second stanza in “the chiefs”, which is explained by the expectation of shared background knowledge between the poet and his audience living in the same context. The third stanza is initiated with “Exile”, but then the definite article appears in “the forehead” at the end of the verse. The use of “my” in the second verse of the third stanza is, again, due to the expectation of a shared background knowledge of lecturers and the poet, which would easily understand that it refers to their own country, which is clearly stated as “my country”.

The Main Schema/ Scene

The poem was taken from a collection named L’Amitié Bafouée, which indicates betrayal. This poem initially deals with the betrayal towards the land and its people by individuals who decided to work with the French colonial forces. Other subschemata are initiated in relation to this main schema.

Analyzing the Stanzas

Stanza 1
I have sworn that from Tizou-Ouzou
All the way to Akfadou
No one will impose his law on me.

The first and second verses infer the activation of two scripts. The first puts forth the act of swearing and is complemented by the third verse where the reason behind the act of swearing is
shown. While the second delimits the borders of Kabylia region where the act of swearing is applied. Through the use of Schank and Abelson’s typology of schemata encompassing scripts, plans, goal that lead to understanding (the type of the script is also mentioned), the first, second and third instantiated scripts are advanced in tables one, two, and three.

### Table 1: Swearing script

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Swearing</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>-Believing in a given religion</td>
<td>-Showing pride</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Having a reason behind the act of swearing</td>
<td>towards himself and anger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>towards traitors.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2. Indicating the borders of Kabylia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Borderline of Kabylia</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>Knowing the region</td>
<td>Show the borders of the area where the act of swearing is applied</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(from the east and west)</td>
<td></td>
<td>and the itinerary.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These two scripts contain two” fleeting scripts”, a term advanced by Schank and Ablson (1977) to refer to non-instantiated scripts (Semino, 2014). They are not necessarily activated as they take part in a bigger script activated and already understandable by itself. Those two fleeting scripts are the Tizi-Ouzou script and Akfadou Script, which are both situational. There is no need to activate those scripts since they are there only to show the borders of Kabylia. This is the case only when background knowledge is shared by the readers as they already know both places. Other readers can consider them as fleeting scripts, since understanding happens without them being activated. They also can choose to search about them and add additional knowledge to their already existing knowledge, an act called by Cook in his schema refreshment theory, schema reinforcing.

The poet declares himself in civil disobedience in the Kabylia region as no one can impose any kind of law on him. The Civil Disobedience Script, mentioned below, gathers all the previously mentioned scripts, and are in this case considered as its Plans.

### Table 3. Civil disobedience script

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Civil disobedience</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Swearing that no one in Kabylia region</td>
<td>Avoid living in humiliation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>would impose his law on the poet</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Stanza 2

We will break but without bending:
It’s better to be cursed
When chiefs are pimps.
The first verse outlines a cultural metaphor that infers self-esteem and relates it to strength and resistance. The second and third verses introduce the poet’s choice to being cursed since chiefs are pimps. Both verses are introduced to explain and expand the meaning of the first verse. The scripts and the metaphors within this stanza are further defined.

Table 4. Self-esteem script

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>and - love of the land - having courage and</td>
<td>-resistance strength and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>personal</td>
<td>strength</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The term “Thematic Organization Points”, advanced by Schank is used to make a link across domains to understand the metaphor used in “we will break, but without bending” (p241). The activation of TOP relating breaking, like an object, to the internal suffering of the poet and people sharing his beliefs is accompanied by the instantiation of a script through the use of the negative form of the gerund “bending” to indicate courage, pride and love of the land. The fifth script introduces the choice of the poet to be cursed.

Table 5. Being cursed by choice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Being cursed by</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Taking the decision and having the courage to assume it</td>
<td>Searching for peace of mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>choice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sixth script completes the fifth script, and explains why the poet had chosen to be condemned or cursed.

Table 6. Pimping chiefs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pimping Chiefs</td>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>-betrayal and treason - having no pity for colonized people, especially women</td>
<td>Showing anger towards traitors and French colonialism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A metaphor is introduced in “When the Chiefs are Pimps”, by linking between the chiefs, i.e. traitors and colonial rulers, and pimps. To comprehend this metaphor, a TOP must be used to create, a link across these two elements. Usually, this later is used to indicate that those chiefs are like pimps i.e. men controlling and using prostitutes to get money as traitors and colonial rulers were known for having no pity or remorse when it comes to using women to get profit, which is the common point between the chiefs and pimps.

Stanza 3

Exile is inscribed on the forehead:
I prefer to leave my country
Than to be humiliated among these pigs.
This stanza contains three scripts that introduce strong emotions felt by the poet as a reaction to the treason of people of his own region, and the massive colonial destruction of the majority of Kabylia’s villages, including his own.

The first script introduced in this stanza is Exile Script:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exile</td>
<td>Being in a position that entails leaving the country</td>
<td>Changing the country</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first word of the first verse in the third stanza, “Exile”, instantiates the activation of exile script. The reader forms a general idea about the act of being obliged to leave his country.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inevitable exile</td>
<td>Deciding to leave the country</td>
<td>Searching for peace</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This script complements the former and gives the reader additional insights concerning the act of exile. The poet is forced to leave the country, but this decision was taken by the poet himself as it is further mentioned that exile is inevitable through the use of the metaphor “inscribed on the forehead”.

This later is an ancient well-known cultural metaphor among Kabyle people. In their culture, such expression is used to infer destiny. Anything inscribed on an individual’s forehead can’t be changed and is meant to happen no matter what. Those two scripts i.e., the destiny script, the inscription on the forehead script, have a common point that can be deduced by using TOP, and is the fact that either cannot be avoided or changed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leaving the country by choice</td>
<td>Not being able to adjust to the new way of life imposed by colonial rulers</td>
<td>Showing preference and choice</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This script adds new information in relation to the three previous scripts in this stanza. Factually, the idea of preferring to leave the country by choice reinforces the inevitable exile script as it enhances the fact that exile is an inevitable decision made by the poet himself as it is his destiny, because he can’t live a life of humiliation among pimping chiefs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My Country</td>
<td>Having a country</td>
<td>Express and show belonging</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is specified through the use of the possessive article “my” that the country in question is the poet’s country. In this case, it necessary to be aware that the country of the poet is Algeria and that the poem in question is initially transcribed in Kabyle language, and that the poem which is being analyzed is its English translated version. This information is already given at the beginning of this article and is considered as stored background knowledge for the reader. The activation of the appropriate schema by the reader would lead to comprehending and deducing that the country is Algeria.

Semantically, My Country Script brings to the surface another script, which is Borders of Kabylia script, extracted from the first and second verses belonging to the first stanza, as it extends the geographical area that the poet spoke about at the beginning of his poem to include all Algeria after mentioning Kabylia region at the beginning of the poem. The poet, then, pictures the reason why he cannot live in his country in the following script presented in table 11.

Table 11. *Life with no dignity script*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Life with no dignity</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>- Self-esteem and</td>
<td>Draw a clear picture of the life the poet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>situational</td>
<td>- Having dirty and</td>
<td>does not want to live.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>pimping chiefs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This script shows why the poet can’t live in his own country. It is a personal decision yet taken while being obliged because the poet can’t accept being humiliated in his own land. Within this script, two other scripts are activated when “humiliated among these pigs” is advanced. This expression contains a metaphor and includes two domains that are typically not related to one another but share one thing when used metaphorically. A TOP brings the two scripts into one i.e., pigs script and chiefs script. This later is activated because of the use of “these”, meaning that the script is previously activated. Which is the case as it was activated in the third verse of the second stanza. After being metaphorically compared to pimps, the poet, this time, compares those chiefs to pigs which are known for being unclean and nasty as they love playing in the dirt. Again, the poet points to the fact that those chiefs have no conscience since they like playing in the mud just like pigs. He also repeats and upholds his disgust towards those chiefs once again at the end of the poem. A simile is advanced in the second and third verses of this last stanza: “I prefer to leave my country” and “than to leave among these pigs”. The previous script Leaving the Country by Choice is compared to the last one, which is life with no dignity, to highlight the choice of the poet as it is a turning point in his life and the life of the people of Kabylia and all Algerians.

**Impact of Cultural Metaphors on Readers**

When readers have the same background knowledge, the schema is either preserving (leaving the already existing schema as it is) or reinforcing (adding new information to the already existing schema). This is the case of Kabyle readers who master the English language and are familiar with some notions in translation, this category of people has enough information to decode both metaphors “we will break but without bending” and “exile is inscribed on the forehead”. When readers do not have the same background knowledge as the poet but are, to a certain degree, familiar with his culture, they can decode the metaphors and understand them basically by
searching for equivalents in their own language and culture. This is the case of Arabic Speaking community that live in Algeria, have a good level of the English language, and again, are familiar with some basic notions of translation. These individuals can deduce the meaning of these cultural metaphors since both are directly linked to two expressions used in colloquial Arabic, and are utilized in everyday communication. The use of one language to understand another is not new in the Algerian context. Bouhadiba (2012) states that:

Competency in the mother tongue is, we believe, the starting point to learn other foreign languages at school for the simple reason that be it a child or an adult, learning a foreign language always takes as a prime reference what is already acquired in term of languages (the mother tongue for the child and/or another FL for the adult (cf. learning English with transfers from Arabic or French). (p. 22)

This is further discussed by Tomas (1992) as he argues that using appropriate exercises, for one event in two different languages, can help learners to know cultural differences and develop relevant schemata. In the first previously mentioned cultural metaphor, the schema formed is reinforcing as it adds new information to an already existing schema (adding an expression in another language to the mother tongue and/or L1 expression). This shows the complexity of the sociolinguistic situation in Algeria. The example given by Mammeri (1985) (as cited in Chachou (2013), states that a Kabyle Algerian who lives in Algiers speaks Kabyle at home, but when he goes out, he has to speak Arabic, while in his job, he has to use both Arabic and French. According to Bouhadiba (2012), “Algeria is characterized by the use of three languages in contact (Arabic, French/Berber)”, and specifies that Arabic and French are used in the administration and English along with French are used in scientific research while Arabic, French and Berber are used “for informal purposes” ( Lakhdar, 2012, p.15).

When readers have no clue about any of the cultures (Kabyle or Arabic), the two metaphors would sound ambiguous and awkward. The schema formed most of the time is disrupting, as confusion may happen since not all readers know about the existence of such culture in Algeria in particular and the North African region in general. This confirms Cook’s Claim concerning schemata since “what is schema refreshing for one reader, or one culture, may not be schema refreshing for another reader, or another culture” (Semino, 2014, p. 154)

Joris (2012), translated Mouloud Feraoun’s French translated version of Poem-16-. This later translated the original version, he transcribed himself, into French using literal translation in rendering both cultural metaphors: “Nous nous briserons sans plier” and “l’exil est inscrit au front” (p 94). This means that both translators opted for literal translation to keep the original Kabyle culture present in the French and English translated versions. It is important to mention that Feraoun is familiar with the Kabyle culture as he is from Kabylia, he went to the French colonial school, and was known for introducing Kabyle words to his writings, which means that using literal translation to keep the original language identity within the French translated version is not so surprising. Pierre Joris, on the other hand, is a Luxembourg-American poet, translator, anthropologist, and essayist. According to Almeida’s (2021) interview published in The ASYMPOTOTE Journal, he had contact with the Algerian culture as he was an English literature
teacher at Mentouri University in Constantine from 1976 to 1979. This might have influenced him in choosing a literal translation in these cases, as it might be a decision made by the translator since he is familiar with the French language and can easily know that such expression is the result of a literal translation and kept it as it is in the English version using a literal translation.

Finally, mastering the English language, being familiar with the Kabyle culture, and deducing that literal translation was used in translating cultural metaphors are required to activate proper scripts to reach the appropriate TOP so that understanding takes place. The confirmation and disconfirmation of the second hypothesis is conditioned by the readers’ prior knowledge.

**The Main Schema or Scene Type, Plans and Goal**

According to the categorization of Schank (1982), Betrayal Scene is a personal and societal scene as it deals with personal emotions felt by the poet. Yet, it has a relation to all the Kabyles, in particular, and Algerians in general. The following table illustrates better the type, plans and goal of this scene.

Table 12. Betrayal scene

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Plans</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Betrayal</td>
<td>Personal and Societal</td>
<td>-declaring himself on civil disobedience.</td>
<td>Draw a clear picture of Kabylia region under the French colonization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-self-esteem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-being cursed by choice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-pimping chiefs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-exile is destiny</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-leaving the country by choice, to avoid living a life with no dignity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scripts that are previously mentioned are all considered as “plans” of the Betrayal Scene. This means that the activation of all these scripts gradually leads to the formation of the Betrayal scene. The goal of this scene can be considered as the reason why this poem was written i.e., picturing life in Kabylia during French colonization. The projected world by the poem happens to be related to the poet’s life which means that it is compatible to the real world at a given period of time of the poet’s life. Factually, the first hypothesis was is partially confirmed since the overall broken friendship scene can be seen as a part of the betrayal scene.

**Discussion**

The analysis of Si Mohand’s poem, which is a corpus-based analysis, took into consideration the result of Schank and Abelson (1977) case study on Hana as a starting point. Factually, the ability to extract scripts then do some planning to reach understanding is the basic idea of the analysis. Throughout the poem, the researchers extracted the scripts stanza by stanza and determined the types of the scripts and their goals and all that is presented in tables. Schank and Abelson (1977) asserted that the lack of Hana’s world knowledge was the reason behind not
understanding the whole script adequately, which is the second important point in the analysis and the reason behind introducing Semino’s proposed approach to poetry analysis.

Semino’s (2014) approach incorporated schema theory into a linguistic analysis of texts to analyze poetic text worlds. She chose two poems fully compatible with the real world and argued that they could be seen differently from readers having different backgrounds. Similarly, the current analysis highlighted these differences through the application of Schank’s TOP to understand cultural metaphors. Additionally, the poem under study, though it projects a realistic world, can be challenging to people having different backgrounds i.e. not familiar with Kabyle culture, not knowing some notions in relation to translation and not mastering the English language. Contrary to Semino’s analysis, the poem used in the current analysis is an English version, first translated from Kabyle into French then from French into English. The translation process made the application of a schema theory approach more complicated since it dealt with the interference of three languages along with the poet’s and the translators’ backgrounds, which is noticed through the use of cultural metaphors as explained in the analysis section.

In her discussion of “Pillowed Head” and “Morning Song”, Semino (2014) made use of Rumelhart’s Schema theory and Cognition (1980), Schank and Abelson’s View on Schema Theory (1977), Schank’s Dynamic Memory (1982) and Cook’s Schema Refreshment (1994). In “Pillowed Head”, She focused on deixis and other patterns and deviations then she discussed in detail the schemata involved in her interpretation of the poem. Furthermore, her analysis of “Morning Song” started by determining the discourse situation of the poem and figurative language used in it and then advanced the main schema and other schemata. In both poems and throughout her analysis, Semino (2014) used terms such as scene, script, MOP and TOP to describe particular types of schema. In the analysis of Si Mohand’s translated poem, researchers made use Schank and Abelson’s (1977) all along the analysis in addition to terminologies required in the analysis, which are: scene or main schema along with its types and TOP. In Semino’s (2014) analysis, the term TOP was advanced by Schank (1982) and used in the explanation of metaphors. The main goal of Semino’s analysis was to compare the worlds projected by the two poems to explain that even if both of them were fully compatible with the real world, people may still have different views about reality which would mean that they may construct different views about the same poem. The authors’ goal in the analysis of Si Mohand’s poem was to gradually determine the main scene of the poem, i.e. projected world which happens to be compatible to the real world of the poet’s life at a given period of time. The use of TOP to explain the translated cultural metaphors highlighted the fact that the readers’ background knowledge highly influenced their interpretations.

The findings of this research put forth the historical context and the poet’s life as it advanced a way to understand the overall scene of the poem. Moreover, it underlined the way in which cultural metaphors were used in the French and English translated versions. Furthermore, it highlighted Kabyle culture just like Boulifa (1904), Feraoun (1960) and Mammeri (1969). If we compare it to Connolly (2020), the present study considered the poet’s religion as a part in understanding the overall scene and was only mentioned in the first script of the first stanza.
Conclusion

In this study, the researchers analyzed the English version of Si Mohand’s poem using schema theory while previous works only dealt with the original Kabyle version or the French translated one. Moreover, schema theory, as far as authors know, has never been used to analyse Si Mohand’s English translated poetry. The first hypothesis was partially confirmed, as the betrayal scene is related to the title of the collection “l’Amitié Bafouée”, i.e. broken Friendship. While the confirmation and disconfirmation of the second hypothesis is conditioned by the readers’ prior Knowledge. It is essential to mention that the study partially indicated the sociolinguistic complexity in Algeria. However, it is not a sociolinguistic study; it is a cognitive one. The occasional reference to translation is inevitable since we used the English translated version of the poem. Finally, this qualitative, cognitive and analytical study explained the English version of Si Mohand’s poem using schema theory to increase the visibility of a legendary Kabyle poet and his culture.

About the Authors:
Kahina MECHAT is a Ph.D. student in the Department of English at Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi Ouzou, Algeria. Her research interests include, Cognitive Linguistics, Neurolinguistics, Contrastive Linguistics, Translation Studies and Poetry Analysis.
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1115-3427

Dr. Souryana YASSINE is a professor in Language Sciences and Applied Linguistics in the Department of English at Mouloud Mammeri University of Tizi Ouzou, Algeria. She is an elected member of the scientific committee of the Faculty of Letters and Languages. He has the position of Head of the Doctoral Program of Master’s course entitled Didactics of Foreign Languages. Her research interests include, Language Education, Sociolinguistics, Gender Studies, intercultural Communication, Discourse Analysis, Social Semiotics and Multimodality.
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6014-2543

References


**Appendix**

**Appendix A: Poem-16-**

I have sworn that from Tizi-Ouzou
All the way to Akfadou
No one will impose his law on me.
We will break, but without bending:
It’s better to be cursed
When the chiefs are pimps.
Exile is inscribed on the forehead:
I prefer to leave my country
Than to be humiliated among these pigs. (Joris & Tengour, 2012, p. 241)