AWEJ for Translation & Literary Studies, Volume 3, Number 2. May 2019

Team of This issue

Editor: Prof. Dr. Khairi Al-Zubaidi
Executive Director
Arab Society of English Language Studies

Associate Editors (Reviewers)

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank all those who contributed to this volume as reviewers of papers. Without their help and dedication, this volume would not have come to the surface. Among those who contributed were the following:

**Dr. Mohamed Elkamel Bakari**
Department of English, The English Language Institute, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia.

**Dr. Nadia GHOUNANE**
Department of English Language and Literature, Dr. Moulay Tahar University- Saida, Algeria

**Dr. Saadia Elamin**
Department of English and Translation, Prince Sultan University, Saud Arabia

**Dr. Leyla Savsar**
English Language and Literature, Faculty of Art and Science, Istinye University, Istanbul, Turkey
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article Titles &amp; authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connection and Disconnection in <em>Tom’s Midnight Garden</em></td>
<td>2-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mouhiba Jamoussi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Literature of Exhausted Possibility: The Entanglement of Postmodern Fiction</td>
<td>14-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nariman LARBI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Cultural Revolution in David Lodge’s Changing Places</td>
<td>22-36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noureddine Friji</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tragedy and social drama in Arthur Miller’s <em>Death of a Salesman</em></td>
<td>37-48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tahar Bayouli &amp; Imed Sammali</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kindness towards Others in Great Expectations</td>
<td>49-55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saed Jamil Shahwan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unraveling the System of Representation of the Colonizer in E. M. Forster’s <em>A Passage to India</em> (1924) and Louis Bertrand’s <em>La Cina</em> (1901)</td>
<td>56-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatima BENSIDHOUM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Jane Eyre’s Morality”: A Kohlberian Reading</td>
<td>66-77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali Sabri Mohammad Abu Hassan &amp; Mohd Nazri Latif Azmi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiction Stories and Poster Presentation in Teaching Indonesian EFL Students</td>
<td>78-90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asmi Rusmanayanti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills for Major Students in the Faculty of Education, Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia</td>
<td>91-113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatma Farid Fakhry Tharwa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Cognitive Study of Metaphors in the Glorious Qur’an: From a Linguistic to a Conceptual Approach</td>
<td>114-121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mashael AlAjmi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Translation Methods Used in Legal Documents: Translation of a Marriage Contract from Arabic into English</td>
<td>122-138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omar EL GHAZI &amp; Chakib BNINI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestication Versus Foreignization: The case of translating Al-Sanea’s <em>Girls of Riyadh</em> into English</td>
<td>139-151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salwa Alwafai</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter-mixing Indianesss with Thainesss in selected Thai Novels</td>
<td>152-164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophana Srichampa</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isyaku Hassan, Mohd Nazri Latiff Azmi, Mubarak Ibrahim Lawan Habibu Awais Abubakar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translating English Existential 'there' Sentences into Arabic: A Text-based Analysis</td>
<td>177-191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irfan Said</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Connection and Disconnection in Tom’s Midnight Garden

Mouhiba Jamoussi

Faculty of Language Studies, Arab Open University
Kuwait

Abstract

This paper entitled ‘Connection and Disconnection in Tom’s Midnight Garden’ aims to challenge a particular reading of Philippa Pearce’s novel Tom’s Midnight Garden (1958) as nostalgic and concerned with aging and death. Tom’s Midnight Garden is regarded by some literary critics as a nostalgic work concerned with the past rather than the present. Its protagonist Tom is sometimes considered as disconnected from the real world and living in the fantastic. This paper will argue that, quite the contrary, Tom’s Midnight Garden stands against disconnection, between the child and the adult, the fantastic and the real, and the past and the present. Tom’s Midnight Garden celebrates connection through the interrelation between the self and the other, through a fantastic world constantly interwoven with the real, and a past tightly tied to the present. This paper relies on a thorough reading of the novel, on findings on the child-adult relationship, and on the effects of connection and disconnection on the individual.

Keywords: 20th century children’s literature, connection and disconnection, fantastic and real, Philippa Pearce, tom’s midnight garden

Cites as: Jamoussi, M. (2019). Connection and Disconnection in Tom’s Midnight Garden. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 3 (2) 2-13. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.1
Connection and Disconnection in *Tom’s Midnight Garden*

Philippa Pearce’s (1920-2006) novel *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is regarded by some literary critics as a nostalgic work concerned with aging and death, and with the past rather than the present. Its protagonist Tom is sometimes considered as disconnected from the real world and living in the fantastic. This paper will argue that, quite the contrary, *Tom’s Midnight Garden* celebrates connection through the interrelation between the self and the other, between the fantastic and the real, and between the past and the present.

Some literary critics consider *Tom’s Midnight Garden* as nostalgic and melancholic. According to Montgomery (2009), literary critics find that *Tom’s Midnight Garden* positions Victorian England as a “lost golden age,” and that scholarly interest in *Tom’s Midnight Garden* has centered on the themes of “things slipping away,” “ravages of time,” and melancholy (p. 204). Montgomery herself believes that childhood is a “transient phase of life that can never be revisited,” and that *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is haunted by death and “imbued with a feeling of loss and longing for the past” (p. 204). Nikolajeva (2009) mentions the winter scene in *Tom’s Midnight Garden* as signaling “the inevitable movement toward growth, aging, and death” (p. 216), and argues that “Tom staying in the garden would be the same as dying” (p. 219).

As we will try to show below, *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is far from being nostalgic, or concerned with loss and death. It celebrates life and connects the child and the adult, the fantastic and the real, and the past and the present. *Tom’s Midnight Garden* does haunt: it has haunted me personally ever since I read it, but not because of ghosts or fear of death—*Tom’s Midnight Garden* moves, delights, instructs, and heals. The dramatist David Wood (2011) who adapted *Tom’s Midnight Garden* for the stage also describes it in one of his interviews as a “haunting book” which fascinates. In “Loneliness, dreaming and discovery,” Rustin and Rustin (2009) agree that Tom’s and Mrs. Bartholomew’s experience is not loss or death, but what we may call rebirth, with Mrs. Bartholomew, like Tom, emerging “from this deadness to the discovery of love buried or frozen within her” (p. 211). Rizq (2001) too insists that this novel is “not about a loss of enchantment,” but rather “a recognition of its continuing power, importance and potential meaning in a life” (p. 494).

*Tom’s Midnight Garden* is indeed neither nostalgic nor sad. In one of her interviews, Pearce (1985) explains that, like most writers, she based her novel on her childhood environment—a beautiful nineteenth-century house, and a garden that gave “safety for the child,” which became her “inspiration” for *Tom’s Midnight Garden* (p. 75). One may even suggest that writing about the house and the garden was for Pearce a way of coming to terms with the pain of having to move away from her childhood home. Pearce also expresses her joy that the house was still inhabited by someone who loves it very much, thus not expressing regret but sharing the new home-owners’ happiness. She herself spent her later years in a cottage opposite this house. So far from being nostalgic, Pearce remained connected to the house throughout her life, and made it for ever present in *Tom’s Midnight Garden*.

Not surprisingly then, Pearce (1985) considers *Tom’s Midnight Garden* “not at all sad” (p. 86) and finds pain and sadness rather in the real world and in the real fictional world of the
novel: “Power is the thing,” she concedes in this interview, and children are “powerless” though they “have such potential and such strong impulses and emotions,” and Tom knows he is “being manipulated in a way, like a dog put in kennels” (p. 84). Her interviewer Geraldine Deluca suggests that Hatty is sad and alone at the end, but Pearce responds: “Well, we are all alone at the end, aren’t we?” (p. 86). As for Roni Natov, the other interviewer, he reveals that he cries every time he reads *Tom’s Midnight Garden*, but adds “I’m not sure I cry because it is sad. I think it evokes deep emotions… there is something so incredibly moving” (p. 86). It is precisely because in the real world and in the real fictional world of the novel children are powerless and the old are alone that Tom and Hatty (Mrs. Bartholomew) enter the fantastic garden, which empowers them and gives them a much-needed companionship.

The fantastic world of *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is tightly related to the real world. According to Pearce (1985), there are no real differences between writing fantasy and writing realism (p. 83), thus connecting the two worlds. She explains that her use of time in the fantastic garden is based on a “perfectly respectable hypothesis of time” in J. W. Dunne’s *Experiment with Time* (published in the twenties) and which she heard her older brothers discuss with friends when she was young: “It sounded interesting and rather mysterious. It was about serial time, about how different times coexist together” (p. 78). For her, *Tom’s Midnight Garden* works “more effectively” because it is not totally realistic, at the same time, she never thinks of it as a “fantasy” (p. 78). Indeed, as will be shown below, *Tom’s Midnight Garden* does not attempt to distinguish, but rather connects, the real and the fantastic, the ordinary and the magical. *Tom’s Midnight Garden* also connects different generations: Pearce explains in her interview that *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is “an attempt to reconcile childhood and old age” and “to bring them together” (p. 79). In 2000, when asked about her works, Pearce still sounds, at the age of 80, “as powerful a communicator with children” as ever (still exploring).

The power of *Tom’s Midnight Garden* is indeed in more than one reconciliation. It is reconciliation between the self and the other, the fantastic and the real, and the past and the present. Tom and Hatty, each frustrated and lonely, meet through imagination and memories, in a world where the fantastic and the real intermingle, and where historical periods crisscross. We are invited to question our views on empathy and growth, on the link between the fantastic and the real, and on the connection between generations past and present.

From the very beginning of *Tom’s Midnight Garden*, all adults seem to be taking care of Tom and making their best to please him, but Tom looks and sounds quite unhappy. From page one, Tom is being sent to “Exile” as the title of the first chapter tells us, with a tie, i.e., a knot, round his neck (p. 1). After being sent away from home, Tom is no longer in contact with mother or father—both remain practically absent throughout the whole novel. It is only with his brother Peter that he remains connected, exchanging secrets in daily letters.

The encounter with Uncle Alan and Aunt Gwen proves not particularly happy. The Kitsons live in a house turned into flats, and Tom feels “a chill” in the “silent” and “unwelcoming” hall of a house whose heart is “empty—cold—dead” (p. 5). Aunt Gwen, a kind child-lover, as we are often reminded, tries to make Tom feel at home, but nothing seems to work. Tom feels treated like a baby, having to comply with rules and regulations over which he
has no say, which further isolates him and confirms his exile—he feels his self being shattered, eventually becoming “two persons” (p.10). When he decides to comply with the rules, more rules follow, through orders and violence, not explanations. The reader is reminded of the rigid rules of the 1950s English home, which continued long after the 1950s, strictly regulating behavior at home ranging from hours of sleep to leaving the dinner table. Tom therefore decides to disobey but Tom’s rebellion is short lived, and it triggers one of the most violent scenes in the novel.

Tom is overpowered and silenced, and so he starts ‘hating’ his uncle and feeling he is in the “worst hole,” “imprisoned in wakefulness,” with nothing to do, nowhere to go, and nobody to do things with (p.14). This is what the psychotherapist Jordan (2001) refers to as an “acute disconnection” when “people fail each other empathically, do not understand, or let each other down,” and she illustrates this disconnection with the example of the unequal parent-child relationship (p. 95). When disconnection becomes chronic, Jordan explains, the child feels “less real, less seen, and less understood” (p. 96), and this is what happens to Tom. He feels isolated, only connected to the grandfather clock which speaks to him in these “hours of darkness”—“still ticking, still alive… senseless” (p. 15) unconcerned with the rules of reasonableness at the Kitsons’ flat. So when he hears it strike thirteen, he decides this is an “hour of freedom” (p.15) and leaves the flat. The garden Tom discovers indeed frees him and empowers him: it reconnects him to nature, and offers him space and safety away from the tiny flat and from everyone’s strict rules and regulations.

The fantastic world of the garden is exactly how Tom wants his real world to be. What happens to him confirms that fantasy truly “speaks to our dreams and deepest desires” (Roslan et al., 2016, p. 221). Writing about satisfying human desires in fantasy, Ashitagawa (2009) asserts that the fantastic “consists in what is denied and desired in the ‘real’ world”—the need to survey the “depths of space and time,” and “to hold communion with other living things” (p. 39).

The discovery of the garden is accompanied by some magical happenings but Tom is only concerned with the garden, and that is “real” (p. 24). Tom becomes momentarily invisible and inaudible, and the hall empties itself of furniture, but the garden reminds Tom of home, of Christmas and the New Year. Wolf (1982) explains that contrary to most fantasies, Tom’s Midnight Garden does not use rational explanations to be credible: “Pearce gradually inspires belief without sacrificing any of the imaginative power of the mystery she unfolds,” she writes, and “much of Tom’s Midnight Garden’s credibility arises from Pearce’s limiting us to Tom’s point of view” (p. 142). Indeed, as mentioned above, Pearce never intended to write a fantasy, and so Tom’s Midnight Garden is rather a magical realist novel where supernatural events are not doubted. Watson (2000) explains that studies of magical realism tell us that the narrator “neither censures nor shows surprise,” that he is accepted as reliable because “he does appear to give an accurate portrayal of a different mentality” (p. 167). These “quirky things,” as Campbell (2015) puts it in her video on magical realism, are simply “taken as given.” It is also suggested that, through focalization, Tom’s experiences in the garden are “believable within the framework of Pearce’s constructed world” (Study Guide, 2009, p. 171). The reader is then likely to believe the garden is real and not to question what Tom is ready to accept.
The garden gives Tom extreme happiness, at the same time it further distances him from the Kitsons: his “surprise” when he discovers the garden turns into “indignation”: he thinks they “deceived” him and “lied to him” (p.19), so he decides to shame them. The confrontation that follows is for Tom one between him and those “wrongdoers,” whereas for them it is between adults and a child who needs to “grow up” (p. 27). While the uncle and aunt fail to believe what Tom is describing, the reader is, as in any magical realist novel, ready to accept fantastic elements that do not particularly surprise the narrator or the focalizer. The fantastic is indeed “another door into the truth” (Rushdie, 2015). It provides “a fresh perspective on the real world,” “a different way of apprehending existence,” and is not less true than the real (Roslan, 2016, p. 221). Ashitagawa (2009) goes further, explaining that the fantastic is “the other side of the real,” and that it even “flips over to be the ‘most real’” (p. 30).

Discovering the garden brought an end to Tom’s isolation and loneliness, and even when he thinks it is no longer there, he is determined to find it. For Natov (2009), what drives Tom to look for the midnight garden is “the ordinary and too common isolation of childhood”: Tom “is every child, tyrannized by adult reason,” and whose hopes are betrayed by the “impenetrability and tediousness of adults” (p. 221). Elements that seem unconnected and irrational come together—a clock striking “hours and hours that don’t exist” as if having “lost all count of time,” Mrs. Bartholomew dreaming of her childhood, and Tom entering the garden that he knows is “waiting for him” (pp. 34-35).

When Tom rediscovers the garden, he is finally happy—the garden is now “his” (p.35) and its inhabitants his new companions—birds that speak and geese that greet the new morning. Tom’s garden is certainly fantastic but real—it does not surprise him, for instance, that his own footsteps leave no trace on the lawn. After reviewing several magical realist novels, Bell-Villada (2014) finds that the reader encounters in these novels the supernatural not as an “intrusion” but as a “component part,” and that magical things “really happen,” are “really there”: “We are not in an alternate world,” Bell-Villada explains, and so magical realism is “a fusion,” “not an oxymoron,” a world where the supernatural is “not presented as problematic” and “does not disconcert the reader” (p. 53).

What Tom discovers further connects him to the fantastic world of the garden. He finds out that all the time spent outside the flat only shows as few minutes on the kitchen clock, which puts an end to his fear to be late. He is invisible and inaudible but he can see people, and is seen and heard by animals. He cannot open doors but he can go through them, and he can climb walls and go and explore the wood beyond the garden. The garden therefore offers Tom all that he was longing for and could not have in his real world—unlimited freedom, space, time, and company. According to Eşberk (2014), studies of fantasy reveal that fantasy refuses to observe unities of time, space and character, thus “doing away with chronology, three dimensiality and with rigid distinctions between animate and inanimate objects, self and other, life and death” (p. 141).

Tom is not disconcerted by what he discovers in his new environment. He finds the garden and its surroundings not outside “the natural order of things” (p. 51), though he wonders why for instance time of the day in the garden is not the same as time in the flat. As Zipes (2009) explains, we have always tried to make sense of the world through fantasy, not through reason:
“Reason matters, but fantasy matters more” (p. 78). Tom realizes once again the limits of reason in his real world when he tries to discuss what he has observed in the garden with his aunt and uncle. His questions trigger a long heated debate, followed by greater tension, and total disconnection between Tom and the Kitsons. Uncle Alan finds Tom’s questions “odd,” and “lacking connection” and “seriousness” (p. 56), and Aunt Gwen typically links these questions to fairy stories and queer dreams. Tom is shocked but he continues to maintain that what he has seen is all “real” (p. 57).

Tom is emboldened by the fantastic to stand for what he believes to be true, which is not surprising. Zipes (2009) asserts that “we need the fantastic for resistance” (p. 79), and Eşberk (2014) depicts the nature of the fantastic as “rebellious” (p. 143). Tom’s Midnight Garden, it is argued, helps answer a fundamental question about the fantastic: “Is it simply any departure from reality, or will the best fantasy in some way provide insights into reality, or even undermine it?” (Study Guide, 2009, p. 170). The increasingly violent arguments between Tom and the Kitsons are clear evidence that they are worlds apart—Tom now lives in a different space and a different time.

The fantastic garden gradually becomes more real than the real. It becomes home, and Tom fears to go back to his real home which “seems a long, long misty way away” or to his brother Peter by now a “remote boy” (p. 60). Kurkjian et al. (2006) argue that despite some “bizarre situations,” fantasy helps us “better understand reality” (p. 492). Tom now understands for instance that invisibility is a form of freedom. He can reconcile the two Toms which make one again. Fantasy, Ashitagawa (2009) explains, is the exploration of the “inner self” and the “unknown in the mind” (p. 33). It is where “the ordinary and the extraordinary meet,” where Tom “reconstructs the lost harmony of his childhood” (Natov, 2009, p. 222). The connection with the garden allows Tom to heal, and when he later meets the little girl Hatty, the garden becomes even more significant and more fantastic.

Hatty turns out to be an ideal companion and her games not “silly girls’ games” (p. 73). Like Tom, she feels isolated and lonely and is looking for a playmate. She can see Tom and hear him, so Tom can now connect with a human, not just with nature and animals, which makes the garden more real. Hatty gives a sensible explanation to Tom’s queer feeling that he was watched, which makes anything senseless in the garden likely to prove sensible. Hatty is an excellent story-teller, telling stories from the Bible and fairy tales and calling herself “Princess Hatty” (p. 71) which Tom does not mind. More importantly, Hatty is an expert on all matters pertaining to the garden, and a very clever partner. Tom too has skills to offer. He teaches Hatty how to make a bow and play shooting games, and how to climb trees. She is triumphant on top of Tricksy and he is jubilant on top of a high wall “gazing freely about him,” walking “like a king” (p. 120)—for Tom, Hatty might not be a princess, but she has certainly made his garden “a kind of kingdom” (p. 81).

The relationship between Tom and Hatty allows both to enjoy the garden like never before, and to mature and grow. Contrary to traditional theories of psychological development which stress the importance of autonomy, separation, and self-sufficiency, Jordan (2001) explains, the relational-cultural theory proves that “maturity involves growth toward connection and
relationship throughout the life span” (p. 92). According to this theory, most people suffer because of isolation, and so healing comes through connection and mutual empathy. Basing his analysis on the same theory, Ben Moussa (2016) explains that Pearce does not see the self existing without the “other”: in his connection with Hatty, Tom’s individuality is not threatened but rather asserted, and his empathy is an “important factor in his growing up, in constructing his identity, and in shaping his relational self through reaching out to the ‘other’, Hatty” (p. 33).

Tom’s and Hatty’s joy and happiness is sometimes interrupted, but not their communion and empathy. For instance following the damage done to the flower-beds and the lawn, for which they are responsible, Hatty’s aunt insults and humiliates Hatty who stands isolated, while Tom, invisible and inaudible, cries out at “his own powerlessness and fears” (p. 94). Tom finds Hatty worse off than him, though he often encounters violence at the Kitsons. Pearce reminds us here of the well noted harsh educational approach in Victorian times. She also draws the reader’s attention to the blame put on the poor, in the class-ridden Victorian society, for their poverty and for being a burden on others. Only with the advent of the post-war welfare state did poverty, together with the blame put on the poor, come to be considered unfair and unacceptable in Britain. This incident which causes so much pain to both Tom and Hatty is at the same time an extraordinary moment of empathy. When Tom later meets little Hatty in black, and sees a grief never seen before, he decides he will always let her claim she is a “royal exile and prisoner” (p. 97).

Tom’s life in the fantastic gives him confidence and enforces his agency. He decides to overstay for some more time, thus disrupting his family’s earlier plan. He ignores the Kitsons’ attempts to understand or to amuse him, which could have been appreciated had they come at an earlier stage. Outings arranged by Tom’s aunt further distance him from the real world: for instance the river once clear and pure is now polluted (Pearce stands as an early environmentalist, drawing our attention to the need to preserve nature). So Tom prefers to live his “real and interesting life” (p. 99) at night in the garden, and to have during the day “only peace” (p. 100) to think of the garden. When he is sick, it is the greenness of the garden which has a soothing and healing effect on him.

Nevertheless, the garden and Hatty remain quite enigmatic to Tom, and he sometimes wonders if they are not all ghosts. Tom decides therefore to confront Hatty about this matter, but this leads to a very heated argument, with each one of them angry and resentful, accusing the other of being a ghost. Tom insists that the whole garden is a ghost, and that Hatty is “dead and gone and a ghost!” (p. 107). Hatty, who seems to have grown so much, calls Tom a silly little boy. But this unique confrontation, instead of disconnecting them for good, brings them closer together—Tom is moved by Hatty’s tears and decides not to reopen a subject that upsets her so much. This scene, Natov (2009) suggests, is meant to show the need to respect “otherness,” to show that there is “more than one reality,” and that “neither the self nor the other is... a ‘ghost,’ but rather that both are real” (p. 224). “The self and the ‘other’ are not mutually exclusive,” Ben Moussa (2016) argues, “one does not necessarily cancel out the ‘other’ in order to exist,” and both “can share the same space in a comfortable inter-dependent relationship of mutuality and respect” (p. 38).
This confrontation results in greater connection which corresponds to Jordan’s (2001) observation: when a serious disconnection is addressed, it can actually lead to “strengthened connection” (p. 95). Indeed, following this confrontation, Tom feels greater empathy and admiration towards Hatty, and is impressed by Hatty’s particular argumentation, so he embarks on a “pursuit of knowledge” (p. 108). He also becomes more attached to Hatty and feels that without her, the garden seems “a green emptiness” (p. 114). The tree-house Tom and Hatty decide to build is to be their own house—Hatty’s home and her best hiding-place in the garden.

Another disruption in Tom’s and Hatty’s relationship is when Hatty falls, and Tom finds himself in another period of time when he visits her. Everyone Tom meets has grown much older, and the aunt looks like a stepmother or witch in a fairy tale. She unsurprisingly puts all the blame on Hatty for her fall and for not growing up. Her cousin James tries to defend Hatty: she should be allowed to earn her own living, or make acquaintances and marry. This scene once again plunges us into an upper-class Victorian family where the family power structure allows the head of the family, Hatty’s aunt here, to rule and to force all members of the family to obey through moral and financial blackmail. We are given a whole range of leisure activities offered to upper-class young men and women but in which Hatty is not participating because she does not truly belong to that class. Like these young women, Hatty is not supposed to earn a living, but unlike them, she does not have a chance to meet a future husband who would be her financial supporter. Pearce thus reveals the traps in which Victorian young women could find themselves, and their likely financial dependence later within marriage.

In this period of time, Tom fears he and Hatty are growing apart. She is delighted to see him, but she has grown much older, and is indeed planning to take part in activities of people of her age. Besides, though Tom is warmly welcomed, he is grateful to find himself the next morning in his own world. Matters seem rather complex and choices not easy to make: Tom wishes to stay longer in his fantastic world, but he misses his family and his home—“a desperate situation” where time is both his “friend” and his “enemy” (p. 157). When Tom later meets Hatty, they disagree on the meaning of “Time no longer” (p. 164)—she thinks it means the end of the world, and he thinks it may have more than one meaning.

Throughout Tom’s Midnight Garden, the fantastic gives space and time for Tom to better understand the real, or to rebel against the real, but at this later stage, the fantastic leads to very sophisticated discussions of extremely complex issues. Roslan et al (2016) argue that “Through fantasy we are able to group, explain, alter and comment on reality” (p. 212), and to engage with “genuine problems in the real world” (p. 221). Eşberk (2014) quotes several critics on the role of the fantastic in creating the need to “search, resist, think and criticize” (p. 143), and on the proper function of fantasy to “transform this world” (p. 142). Indeed, for the first time, Tom leaves behind Hatty and the garden and goes back to the Kitsons’ to think about the issue of Time.

Once again, Tom goes to his uncle and aunt for an explanation: “What is Time?” (p. 167). As usual, his aunt’s answer is simplistic and his uncle’s confusing, and this leaves quite a wide gap between them and Tom. The uncle’s theories confuse and depress Tom, and Tom’s mention of angels makes his uncle angry and violent. Whereas Tom’s encounters with Hatty allow him to grow and mature, every encounter with the Kitsons reduces him to a child. Tom seems to be
Connection and Disconnection in Tom’s Midnight Garden

Jamoussi

gradually entering into what Jordan (2001) calls “chronic disconnection,” feeling “ineffectual and helpless” (p. 96). Once again his uncle’s theories do not help, but what the angel reveals to him in his dream, and what he discovers through literature, do help him understand time: his case is Rip Van Winkle’s but in reverse. He realizes that in the garden, he stepped back into the Past, Hatty’s time, and Hatty stepped into the Future, his Present. So he concludes they are all real: “We are neither of us ghosts; and the garden isn’t either” (p. 171).

Pearce here fully attacks post-war fascination with the rational, and rather celebrates religion, literature, and even dreams in helping better understand complex issues. In the last lines of her book chapter on the fantastic, Whitehead (2012) asserts that the role of the fantastic is to challenge earlier wisdoms—“notions such as the hegemony of post-Enlightenment rational-scientific discourses,” and “the dominance of monolithic constructions of truth and reality” (p.15). The aim of the fantastic, she adds, is “to empower readers to construct alternative discourses,” and “to question the existence of a single truth” (p. 15).

While Tom’s relationship with the Kitsons further deteriorates, he remains fully connected to Hatty. Hatty accepts to leave her skates, at Tom’s request, in her own cupboard where Tom will later find them. Even in his dreams, Tom is still in Hatty’s world where he is skating to the end of the world, and the end of time. Next time she sees him in the garden she tells him she is waiting for him, wishing to see him and no one else, and Tom chooses to go skating with her rather than enter the garden. Later their skating on a single pair of skates and in total communion is to Tom “the eeriest” yet “the most natural thing in the world,” giving Tom a “new skill and power” and Hatty freedom from “muffs or improprieties or aunts” (p. 188).

This scene is ironically followed by disconnection and great pain by the time they reach Ely Cathedral. Tom’s brother who joins them at the Tower points out that Hatty is a grown-up woman not a child, while Hatty finds both brothers hardly visible. Tom is speechless and when he speaks it is to defend himself and Peter: “He’s real, like me. You agreed I was real, Hatty” (p. 196). But doubt and concern are now replacing the extraordinary connection that the two enjoyed on their way to the Tower. Anxiety and fear increase when they leave the Tower, and by the time the new friend Barty takes them home, Hatty ceases to see Tom, and Tom feels isolated and lonely.

Tom becomes aware that though time is endless, he is no longer sure of mastering it and living in the garden forever. Indeed, next time he tries to enter the garden, the garden is gone. He springs, turns, and runs, “like a rat with the dogs after it” (p. 209), and when carried by his uncle, he cries and feels like someone “taken prisoner,” going back into exile (p. 210). As usual, his uncle and aunt totally fail to understand what he is going through, and he is not ready to share his story with them. But when Tom decides to apologize to Mrs. Bartholomew for the noise he made, his tone and manner force them to respect his wish.

When Tom and Mrs. Bartholomew meet, they immediately reconnect—Mrs. Bartholomew realizes Tom is a “real, flesh-and-blood boy” (p. 215) and Tom understands they were “both real,” “then and now” (p. 224). This is a great moment of epiphany about the self and the other, concerning existence and co-existence: one can be, and still let the other be. Mrs. Bartholomew
is a more mature Hatty: “nothing stands still, except in our memory” (p. 221), she tells Tom. Tom too sounds, through his questions and answers, much more mature. Writing about the experience of growing up in Tom’s midnight Garden, the therapist Rosemary Rizq (2001) celebrates the role of the fantastic in this novel, and asserts that Tom’s Midnight Garden reminds us that growing up is “truly a counsel of despair, a sell-out, a loss” (p. 494). She insists that contrary to traditional psychoanalysis for which growth is a “journey from infantile dependence to independence,” and “from fantasy to reality,” we should “keep alive that enchanted place...within ourselves,” and that this place “can and must remain active and meaningful within us as adults” (p. 494).

Tom’s and Mrs. Bartholomew’s reunion illustrates once again how the fantastic is interwoven with the real. They resume fantastic stories left unfinished, stories about the Victorian home whose garden was replaced by houses, and whose furniture was scattered—a house which ceased to be “a gentleman’s house” (p. 222). Acquiring the Melbournes’ house also sounds like Hatty’s revenge on her aunt, and Pearce’s revenge on a Victorian class-ridden society. Any reference to the Victorian upper class is rather sarcastic, and the working class is not spared either: Abel the gardener and the maid Susan had a large family and lived happily ever after. Mrs. Bartholomew also speaks of the loss of her two children in the Great War, a pain shared by a whole generation of mothers. Tom’s Midnight Garden is thus far from celebrating the past and from being nostalgic.

Tom is now closer to home, but his reconnection with Hatty is now symbolized by the affection between him and Mrs. Bartholomew. They now have a past of their own which can always be there to remember, and future plans of reunion. Tom and his brother seem to “bring alive her two lost sons,” it is suggested, and Mrs. Bartholomew comes back as the “internal mother [Tom] has lost and found” (Rustin & Rustin, 2009, p. 211). Mrs. Bartholomew can also simply stand for the grandmother to whom the grandchild Tom rushes to hear stories—past and present generations, separated by the celebrated post-war nuclear family, and which, Pearce reminds us, need to remain connected.

Tom’s Midnight Garden ends with the most moving scene of the novel, a communal embrace between the child and the adult, the male and the female, the Victorian and the post-war friends, who meet in the magical world of the garden, and are now reconnected in the real world of the novel. The fantastic turns to a reality Tom and Hatty live in, with the promise of remaining connected and meeting again in the future. The reader ends the novel keeping in mind the promise that whenever lonely, there will always be some space, some time, for connection: “You look and see nothing, and you might think there wasn’t a garden at all; but all the time, of course, there is a garden, waiting for you” (p. 77).

Conclusion

Tom’s Midnight Garden celebrates connection between the self and the other, the fantastic and the real, and the past and the present. Tom leaves a world of loneliness, of solitude, and of disconnection, and enters the fantastic garden where he can heal and grow. Here he connects with nature and its inhabitants, and the most significant encounter is with Hatty who becomes his
AWEJ for Translation & Literary Studies Volume, 3 Number 2. May 2019

Connection and Disconnection in Tom’s Midnight Garden

Jamoussi

companion, his playmate, and his story-teller. Through their connection in the fantastic world of
the garden, both Tom and Hatty feel at home, no longer lonely or sad. Tom’s understanding and
empathy allow Hatty to surmount her pain and loss. Hatty on her part makes the garden special,
and helps Tom in his pursuit of knowledge. Indeed, Tom tries to better understand the real by
constantly contrasting it with the fantastic which gradually becomes more real than the real.
Thanks to the fantastic, Tom can understand and discuss complex issues such as Time. Philippa
Pearce takes Tom and the reader through a journey, comparing present and older times, and
selecting what is most formidable, to protect the present and preserve the future. Tom’s and
Hatty’s reunion at the end confirms the connections between the self and the other, the fantastic
and the real, and the child and the adult. The garden is not lost forever, nor is the relation
between Tom and Hatty. The garden is symbol of connection, empathy, and healing—a garden
which, we are promised, will always be there, waiting for us.

About the Author:

Mouhiba Jamoussi is Associate Professor of Literature. She has an MA in English Literature
from La Sorbonne University, and a PhD in English Language and Humanities from Tunis
University. Her research interests include race, gender, and power relations. Her latest publication
is a book chapter on Black Skin. She taught at Tunis University, and was later Department Chair at
Modern College, Oman. In 2014, she joined AOU, Kuwait Branch, where she currently teaches
literature. ORCID ID is https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2321-8200

References

Journal, Experiments, Summer, 29-51.

Bell-Villada, G. H. (2014). Magic and Realism in History: Magical Realism vs. the Fantastic
Today. Magical Realism and Subaltern Studies, Critical Insights, Grey House, 49-64.

Ben Moussa, M. (2016). Connecting with the Other: Empathy in Tom’s Midnight Garden, Arab
World English Journal (AWEJ) Special Issue on Literature (4), October, 33-42.

Campbell, J. (2015). Magical Realism: Recommendations and TBR.

Language and Literature Education, 10, 139-144.

the Menninger Clinic, 65 (1), 92-103.

Reading Teacher, 59 (5) February 492-503.

Literature: Classic Texts and Contemporary Trends (pp. 203-07). New York: Palgrave
Macmillan.

Literature: Classic Texts and Contemporary Trends (pp. 221-26). New York: Palgrave
Macmillan.


The Literature of Exhausted Possibility: The Entanglement of Postmodern Fiction

Nariman LARBI
Abdelhamid Ibn Badis University of Mostaganem, Algeria

Abstract:
Postmodern literature, fiction in particular, is, according to Barth (1984), a literature of *exhausted possibility* due to its entangled thematic and technical approach which defies the conventional modern fictional form. It reflects *the zeitgeist* or the spirit of postmodernism which is regarded as a revaluation of the modern enterprise; an enterprise that embodies universality and coherence. The present research paper attempts to address the recurrent thematic element that postmodern fiction revolves around: that of the presence of the historiographic element in postmodern fiction which reflects in itself the evaluation of past history; such a fictional preoccupation reflects the major postmodern philosophers’ and thinkers’ concerns, such as those of Lyotard and Baudrillard, on the impossibility for the existence of a universal coherent history. This criterion is one amongst other criteria that justify the exhaustion of postmodern fiction.

*Keywords*: John Barth, Postmodern Fiction, Postmodernism, Post-historicism, Historiographic Metafiction, Jean Baudrillard, Fredric Jameson, Jean-François Lyotard

Introduction

Postmodernism is essentially that movement which grew out of a reaction against modernism, the roots of which find their impetus in the revolutionary Age of Enlightenment. It was first coined and used in the 1870s with different connotations, and its usage differed from a field into the other. It was first used in the art field by the English painter John Watkins Chapman for the ascription of any form of art that went beyond the conventional impressionism. At a similar accordance, Cuddon (1999) postulates that post-modernism is a controversial term that started to reach its peak in the 1950s, and is ascribed to anything revolutionary to modernist tendencies. Postmodernism is more of an attitude than a historical period that started to emerge right after the Second World War, by the time of the Berlin Wall was erected. It came with the disillusionment to the modern enterprise which promised positivism, progress, and a general emancipation to the horrors and digression of human values to the detriment of economic, political, and geographical enlargement by the colonial rule. The major events that stressed the turning point against modernism are the Holocaust and the atomic bombings of the 40s.

The characteristics of postmodernism tend to be disintegrative to the modern structuralism, adopting an after structuralism, or what is known as post-structuralism; deconstructivism, thinkers of such a stream of conductive thoughts are: Baudrillard, Jameson, Lyotard, Habermas, and Derrida to name some. It is viewed as a solid historical and cultural reaction to the shortcomings of modernity, i.e., the Enlightenment enterprise, the death of the previous held options of a given structural uniformity.

This uniformity or what is termed as Universality, is rejected by postmodernists and is clearly reflected in the relevant postmodern literature. The criteria of such literature will be clarified in this article from the historicity of the emergence of postmodernism as a stream of thought to its reflection in literature, mostly fiction, along with the prominent elements that form its exhaustion.

Postmodernism

Any philosophical or literary movement tends to be either a reaction against the one which precedes it or an extension and an exaggeration of it. Postmodernism, a tendency which started to emerge by the late twentieth-century, from 1970s, is regarded to be both a transitional period and a self-critical evaluation of not only the transition in itself but mostly of the modernist enterprise of its yesteryears. The latter actually lasted for more than two centuries harking back to the Enlightenment project. Postmodern thinkers, such as Lyotard, Habermas, and Jameson to name some of the most prominent ones, tend to have a sceptical attitude to anything that belongs to the past. Lyotard’s definition of anything postmodern in his: The Postmodern Condition, A Report on Knowledge (1984), as “incredulity towards metanarratives” (p. xxiv). All of the past knowledge that was held as being The truth; absolute fixed narratives, came to be reacted upon, displaying a distrust to past narratives.

Postmodernism is essentially that movement which came as a reaction against modernism. The latter was influenced by the Enlightenment project and rejected tradition while it championed reason and science. Postmodernists, henceforth, ignore and reject the modernist belief that the
contemporary Man could reach an understanding of the world through rational reasoning. In this respect, Klages (2011) pontificates that:

Modernity is fundamentally about order: about rationality and rationalization, creating more order out of chaos. The assumption is that creating more rationality is conductive to creating more order, and that the more ordered a society is, the better it will function (the more rationally it will function). (para. 12)

Postmodernism, is most often than not, attributed to the term alienation; facing a turn down upon the notion of the world and human operations. Man is alienated due to the exile of the world’s modern cultures, and the westernization of societies. Man has become dehumanized due to the materialistic and capitalistic systems, leading him to a state of disillusionment in relation to the ideas and notions of existence. Individualism has thereafter played a major role in alienating and dehumanizing Man. It originated from the utilitarian character of the spirit of modernity.

Postmodernism is the new zeitgeist or l’ésprit du siècle representing a post-historical reaction against the uniformity and fundamentalism of modernism. It came as a counter-reaction to the structural view of human history progress, the basis of which is built upon a hyper-sceptical distrust of the past, and anything reported about it as being linear and integrative. The postmodern zeitgeist could be understood by its extent of measuring and evaluating the authenticity along with the legitimacy of the past historical records.

**Historiographic Metafiction: The Entanglement of Postmodern Fiction**

The postmodern sceptical attitude towards the past is what could sum up this transitional period. This scepticism veiled upon most fields, at least the philosophical, literary, and artistic ones. Most apparent this scepticism appears is when it comes to the literature of the age - in particular novelistic productions - as a literature of resistance that favors the implementation of historiography within a fictional account. That is to say the fabulation upon factual elements being implemented into and within a fictional account that leads to a multifold/multi-interpretative comprehension, enabling the readers to make up their own finality through the open-closure endings. One could almost think of the literature of the time as being vulgarised and democratized for there is no clear-edged finality/interpretation, an allusion to the state of loss and plurality of the time. The aim of postmodernist thinkers is, either consciously or unconsciously, an endeavour of reconstructing history with a sustainable authenticity away from the grand narratives that have overtaken on the world’s reportedness of The truth.

Postmodern literature is that literature which started to emerge by the end of the Second World War - by the erection of the Berlin Wall - characterized by the disillusionment with regard to the enthusiasm of the previous modern enterprise that failed into securing peace and justice. It reflects the malaise of the chaos that the world witnessed due to the Western aspired-domination of the world.

It tends to be ascribed to historiographic metafiction; an expression coined by the Canadian academic: Hutcheon, (1988) refers to the constant concern of postmodern fiction in reflecting and
revisiting history, and mainly the reportedness of history in an attempt to evaluate its authenticity and validation through fictional accounts. There exists a plethora of postmodern practitioners of historiographic metafiction. Amongst the most prominent British novelists whose works not only revise, but question and inquire the validity along with the authenticity of knowledge, history, and anything that belongs to the past; we have Julian Barnes and Graham Swift.

Postmodern fiction, for Hutcheon, is ironically contradictory since it converges and relates both the fictitious element with the factual historiographic mode of narration, and the meeting point of both represents the poetics of postmodernism. The concern with historiography is also displayed in postmodern women fiction with the works of Winterson *The Passion* (1987), Barker *Regeneration Trilogy* (1991), Kennedy *Day* (2007), and Smith *Autumn* (2016).

Postmodern fiction is, therefore, and most often than not, history-related thematically in the sense where it takes factual history to implement it with the fictional element, a criterion which renders postmodern fiction as being a literature of resistance. The latter addresses a genre which encapsulates both history reportedness and fictional creativity, or rather imagination, through the use of unconventional fictional techniques such as pastiche, intertextuality, temporal disorder, fragmentation, paranoia, and open-ending closures of narratives, all of which tend to give it a form of experimental literature (Sim, 2001, pp. 121-133).

**The Exhaustion of Postmodern Fiction**

Lewis appoints to postmodern literature as “the work of virtually any writer from an ethnic minority [deemed to be postmodern] by virtue of their hybrid status in a displaced, globalized society” (as cited in Sim, 2001, p. 111). Accordingly, postmodern literature is a literature which is galvanised by the extent of its experimental nature both technically and thematically, a literature that serves a new socio-historical context. It is that of the disillusionment from the outcome of hypermodernity which resulted in racial, ethnic, and religious wars/terror. Several commentators who contributed to the definition as well as to the accurate period within which postmodernism started to emerge, such as Barth, De Villo Sloan, and Bradbury with Ruland, all of whom worked on positioning the roots of the emergence of such a movement.

Barth (1984) refers to postmodern literature as being a literature of ‘exhausted possibility’ or ‘the literature of exhaustion’ (p. 64) when addressing the definition of postmodern literature in terms of its entangled forms in contradistinction to the modern form, he claims that:

Our century is more than two-third done; it is dismaying to see so many of our writers following Dostoevsky, Tolstoy or Balzac, when the question seems to me to be how to succeed not even Joyce and Kafka, but those who succeeded Joyce and Kafka and are now in the evenings of their careers [and that] one of the modern things about these two writers is that in an age of ultimacies and “final solutions” - at least felt ultimacies, in everything from weaponry to theology, the celebrated dehumanization of society, and the history of the novel - their work in separate ways reflects and deals with ultimacy, both technically and thematically. (p. 67)
Accordingly, when Barth claims the exhaustion of postmodern literature he does not mean "anything so tired as the subject of physical, moral or intellectual decadence, only the used-upness of certain forms or the felt exhaustion of certain possibilities - by no means necessary a cause for despair" (p. 64). Barth mentions that postmodern literature which became exhausted by the 1990s is aligned with De Villo’s stance in his essay; *The Decline of American Postmodernism* (1987), where he sketches that: “postmodernism as a literary movement … is now in its final phase of decadence” (as cited in Sim, 2011, p. 111). Bradbury and Ruland (1991) also suggest that postmodern literature is that writerly production of the period from the 1960s to the 1980s, and that anything that came after 1990 is to be under the category of ‘post-postmodernism’, or as *post-pomo*.

Since postmodernism is known for its hybrid criterion, pluralism and a culture of the *anything goes*, postmodern practitioners, regardless, tend to form “a unified movement for which a coherent theory could be formulated” (Sim, 2011, p. 112). On similar grounds; Aldridge (1983) describes postmodern fiction as a fiction where:

"Virtually everything and everyone exists in such a radical state of distortion and aberration that there is no way of determining from which conditions in the real world they have been derived or from what standard of sanity they may be said to depart. The conventions of verisimilitude and sanity have been nullified. Characters inhabit a dimension of structureless being in which their behaviour becomes inexplicably arbitrary and unjudgeable because the fiction itself stands as a metaphor of a derangement that is seemingly without provocation and beyond measurement." (p. 65)

Assumingly, postmodern literature defies the structures of fictional narration on the one hand, and on the other, it tends to self-ascribe the authority of knowing more than what the official historiography has acknowledged the generations all along. It is a literature which revises the past in a condescending or mocking sense that unravels and shatters the authority of factual reportedness inviting the history readers, and the post-historical Man to an evaluation of the means that the construction of past history has been elaborated and disseminated, and is then uncertain and in defiance of universality. A literature which merges facticity with fiction is often straddled and torn between literature and paraliterature. It resists both fictional conventions as well as factual historiographic reportedness, defying the fundamental criteria of official history in its assumed function of critical counter-inspection of the past. Otherwise explained, historiographic metafiction tends to measure the extent of authenticity and truthfulness of the grand official history, hence the implementation of historical facticity with fictitious elements. Its structure, as well as its underlying themes unveil a self-conception of a self-ascribed epistemological superiority with regard to its imaginary/fictional element over historiography when condemning the latter as being a *virtual tantalization* of civilization’s history.

**Historicising the Philosophical Entanglement of Post-historicism**

The post-historical period is characterized by the disillusionment inflicted by the World Wars. Jenkins (1997) suggests that our assumptions about history and the form in which modern historiography reported them are being suspected, i.e., "no longer so readily acceptable” (p. 6).
Postmodern reading of history is, accordingly, defined by the sceptical view it holds upon the reliability of what universal history discloses. In similar respects, Young (2004) defines postmodern historiography as the ‘European culture’s awareness that it is no longer the unquestioned and dominant centre of the world’ (p. 75).

The major post-historical thinkers ascribed to postmodern deconstructive approach upon history are; Jameson (1991) who dreads the end of, and replacement of culture by hyper-consumerism due to the post-industrial enterprise that has been inflicted upon the Western hyper-modernized societies, and that knowledge and culture are now replaced and dominated by mass-media. He further suggests that the narrated history of the previous modern “old certainties, aims and ideals … are now insecure and debatable" (2009, p. 267). Lyotard (1984), on the other hand, defines postmodernism as “the incredulity towards metanarratives” (p. xxiv); that the end of universal history is here and now taking place. Baudrillard (1998), aligned with Lyotard’s position, theorized on the simulation of history, i.e. the inability of making sense of what is authentically defined as The Truth in contradistinction with what he conceives of as Grand Narratives being within the category of framed simulation, or monolithic block-representation of truth. Both Lyotard and Baudrillard share a dismantled view of history which rejects and opposes Hegel’s Universal History.

Truth, for Baudrillard, Jameson, and Lyotard represents nothing but a sheer simulation (created representation) of authentic reality. Roland Barthes sketches that “the historian is not so much a collector of facts as a collector and relater of signifiers; that is to say, he organized them with the purpose of establishing positive meaning and filling the vacuum of pure, meaningless series” (as cited in Jenkins, 1997, p. 121). It is this ‘filling the vacuum’ that postmodern history thinkers react upon. Postmodern historiography would be represented as:

Instead of the traditional modern metanarrative prescriptiveness, postmodern narrative is more disjunctive, inhabited by the stories of those excluded by previous historical accounts, and more ‘heteroglossic’ awareness of the way that history can be found in a wider range of ‘types’ of sources. (Acheson & Ross, 2005, p. 7)

Other prominent thinkers whose critiques stand against the uniformity and universality of history are Michel Foucault and Walter Benjamin with their deconstructive heteropic, or counter-utopic view upon history and its reportedness against the conventional metanarrated history. Both of them argue that the formalist form of historiography is irrelevant to the postmodern reading of history for it does not engage with minor histories; the oppressed voices, instead, it stresses “the movements of accumulation and slow saturation, the great silent, motionless bases that traditional history has covered with a thick layer of events” (as cited in Adshead-Lansdale, 1999, p.11). History is, from a post-historical perspective, regarded as a simulation of authentic historicity, the validation of which is rejected by many grand history philosophers who theorized against the conventional monolithic reportedness of truth, their works not only represent the rejection of monolithic historiography, but they also reflect the entangled spirit of postmodernism, contributing
either directly or indirectly into shaping and delineating its criteria, and paradoxically enough all of whom share a dystopian view about how the world’s societies operate.

**The Reader-response Theory: A Response to Modern Formalism**

Contemporary postmodern fiction is entangled and multidimensional, oscillating between the fictional and the factual. It is a fiction that could therefore serve as a historical record for those *minor histories* that the factual historiographic mode of reportedness failed to engage with.

The German literary theorist Jauss, (1984) shares this assertion of a multi-faceted version of history and the past, responding to the modern formalist approach which inverts the conventional formalist analysis of a text from a single biased view to a three-dimensional construction of view between: “the author and the work to the text and the reader” (as cited in Holub, 1984, p. xii). The theory represents a revolutionary approach to contemporary literary criticism, reflecting the postmodern spirit that denounces the validation of universality.

Indeed, Jauss’s theory came as a reaction to the “social, intellectual, and literary developments in West Germany during the late 1960s” (p. xiii), a theory which revolves around the reader-response theory that emanates in the open-ending finality of narratives and opposes the limitations of literary analysis that belong to the conventional school of formalism. The latter tends to measure literature as serving itself only away from the historicity that surrounds its context. The aesthetics of reception, termed in German as *Rezeptionasthetik*, involves a major contribution of the reader when it comes to synthesizing the coherence and structure of a literary text.

Jauss, (1982) considers literature as a dialectical process of production and reception in that:

The relationship of work to work must now be brought into this interaction between work and mankind, and the historical coherence of works among themselves must be seen in the interrelations of production and reception. Put another way: literature and art obtain a history that has the character of a process when the succession of works is mediated not only through the producing object but also through the consuming subject. (p. 15)

Accordingly, Jauss views literature; and fiction in particular, from the perspective of the reader, that is for a text to fully form its completion, the reader is inevitably to be involved, and the finality of the narrative is therefore individualistic and differs from a contextually comprehension background into another.

**Conclusion**

To conclude with, the literature of the postmodern transition reflects the philosophy as well as the ideologies of the postmodern zeitgeist, a zeitgeist which is entangled in its existing nature. Such literature is not only entangled, it is exhausted by the realism effect and its factual implication in what is termed as historiographic metafiction, it is also tormented by the unconventional techniques that shape the skeleton of postmodernist fiction. When it comes to the reception theory, it actually portrays the Barthesian stance on the inconsistency of a static mono-narration of history.
An invitation of the audience into the formation of the narrative is what one could relate to the democratization of literature. The democracy of the age has come to be pinned to the literature of the age.

About the Author:
Dr. Nariman LARBI is a Lecturer (Assistant Professor) of British Literature: the English Novel and Literary Movements, at Mostaganem University, Algeria. Graduated in 2008, she was granted a BA in Australian Studies from University Rennes 2, Brittany - France. She took pre-graduate linguistic courses in Cambridge University, England, obtained a Magister Degree in British Literature from Oran University and a PhD Degree from Tlemcen University, Algeria. She is fascinated with the Philosophy of Literature and researches on Modern and Postmodern British and Arabic fiction. ORCid ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0888-2741

References
The Cultural Revolution in David Lodge’s *Changing Places*

Noureddine Friji  
English Language Institute  
King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia

**Abstract**  
Utilizing Herbert Marcuse’s *One-Dimensional Man* (1962) and *Counterrevolution and Revolt* (1972) as a theoretical backdrop, this article seeks to gauge the extent to which the teachings of the German philosopher and political theorist lay the groundwork for the protests mounted by the university students in David Lodge’s campus novel *Changing Places* (1975). Admittedly, the Student Revolution spilled over into numerous fields. However, given space restrictions, only its cultural manifestations will be examined. It will be clear that at the root of Lodge’s students’ uprising lies an overpowering urge to break with the cultural heritage and with the academics upholding it. It will be equally clear, nonetheless, that these young activists’ faith in Marcuse’s political doctrine is unwelcome to conservative academics on the ground that it has diverse adverse effects on universities. Not only are politically oriented texts and discourses given precedence over traditional ones but also teachers and administrators are, at times, hindered from doing their duties. The plausible conclusion to draw, in the light of the research’s findings, is that although cultural revolutions undeniably pave the way for a number of personal and collective achievements and help us modernize many aspects of life, they should not blind us to the enduring significance of previous cultural traditions and of the aesthetic value of literary works.

**Keywords**: cultural revolution, david lodge, herbert marcuse, the new left, proletarian, radical

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.3
Introduction

General background
The 1960s witnessed an explosion of changes in Western societies. Gitlin (1993) finds historical precedence for these events in the sixteenth-century Reformation, which took place in Germany, where “the urgent young, disgusted by the corruption of values, beat on the doors of established power in the name of reform” (p. xxii). Chief among these movements is the Student Revolution, which started in 1963 as a “‘minor counterrevolt’” (Kerr, 2001, p.101) but soon “materialized into a series of cyclones” (p.101). New Left campus activists, disappointed with the political and moral failure of the fifties’ Old Left (Gitlin, 1993) and, inspired by Herbert Marcuse’s ideas (Kellner, 1991; Heineman, 2001), emerged “in the guise of single-issue movements: civil rights, civil liberties, campus reform, peace” (Gitlin, 1993, p. 83). They challenged the dominant ideology; disapproved of the Bomb, which they saw as a threat to the affluent society and to humanity; and discredited mainstream culture, which valorised middle-class norms. Predictably, they collided with “a leftover segment of the moribund social-democratic segment of the Old Left, huddling around its embers” (p. 110).

As the war in Vietnam intensified, the New Left identified with revolutionary movements and heroes abroad and drew inspiration from the Cultural Revolution in China (Gitlin, 1993), the National Liberation Front in Vietnam and revolutionary movements in developing countries. This accounts for the rapid rise of militancy among student activists, as illustrated by the huge May–1968 movement in France and Prague. Militancy grew more prominent as pickets, petitions, sit-ins, marches, and protests escalated among students. Not unexpectedly, violence broke out more frequently. At Columbia University, for example, students occupied a number of buildings; messed up things, including books; had sex; and consumed drugs during the occupation.

It is little marvel that this decade was called the “psychedelic years” (Byatt, 1991, p. 13) and that it saw the contagious spread of the “‘Three Ds’” (divorce, drinking, drugs) (Jones, 1993, p. 11) and the rise of a deracinating counterculture, or rather “encounter culture” (Gitlin, 1993, p. xviii). As a legacy of the beatnik culture of the fifties and a hybrid of “black culture and American Indian tradition, eastern religions and American utopianism” (Fraser, 1988, p. 113), the counterculture had its genesis in San Francisco, where several young people lived together in poverty, had their own style and experimented with LSD and marijuana, and it spread fast thanks to Rock ’n roll music, among other things. Premised on the “idea that the personal was political, that personal liberation was an essential part of creating a new and better society” (Fraser, 1988, p. 121), the counterculture gave an impetus to the transformation of sexual mores. Notwithstanding the wide-scale spread of sexually transmitted diseases (Heineman, 2001), women activists called for more sexual liberation and for the right to unwedded sex and abortion (Kurlansky, 2005).

In view of these all-encompassing changes, students were no longer the “Silent Generation,” the “listeners,” and the “goalkeepers” (Anderson, 1996, p. 19) of the previous decade. Indeed, they strongly objected to parental rules and to universities’ tendency to act in loco parentis with respect to their personal lifestyles (Fraser, 1988; Heineman, 2001). The phrase “Don’t trust anyone over thirty” (Heineman, 2001, p. 107), which was coined by a mathematics graduate
student at Berkeley, adumbrates the young generation’s distrust of their seniors. Traditional curricula and literary subjects were prime targets for the Student Revolution. American students objected to being taught subjects based on European civilization alone and requested that studies related to Native Americans, African Americans, Jews and women be included in the curriculum (Anderson, 1996). These changes challenged the authority of administrators and teachers. Lionel Trilling, among other conservative American academics, grew increasingly concerned about the fate of departments and of traditional curricula as dissent swept across campuses. He also feared that modernist writers, whose novels allegedly contained and maintained general truths, fell out of favour with the rebelling students on the ground that they were supposedly hostile to civilization and that they engendered a sense of alienation by stressing the primacy of style over ethics (Kernan, 1990).

**Literature review**

Several critics have investigated Lodge’s *Changing Places* from different critical perspectives along with other (academic) novels by Lodge (Ammann, 1991; Bergonzi, 1995; Li, 1998; Martin, 1999; Sant, 2006; Sava, 2006) or along with other (academic) novels by other writers (Ommundsen, 1985; Wiegenstein, 1987; Morace, 1989; Fullerty, 2008). Notwithstanding the useful insights they give into the novel in question, these studies fail to have an in-depth look at its most absorbing themes as they have to allot equal attention to other novels. Arizti (2002), however, stands out in the critical crowd in this regard, as it were, thanks to her comprehensive analysis of the engaging themes of intimacy and sexual liberation in Lodge’s *Changing Places* and *Small World* through Herbert Marcuse’s combination of Marxism and Freudian psychoanalysis to underline and undermine the repressive nature of capitalism. She holds that Marcuse’s theory of “over-repression” (p. 66) reveals the excess of repression in sexual as well as economic areas and the necessity of rejecting heterosexuality and achieving the eroticization of society through polymorphous sexuality as manifested in experimentation with sex, explicit sexual images, premarital sex and pornography. Preoccupation with intimate love relationships and adultery in *Changing Places*, Arizti goes on, is meant to divert attention away from potential social rebellion in that it identifies “emancipation almost exclusively with sexual liberation and thus conforming to Marcuse’s theory of the repressive desublimation of genital eros” (p. 165).

It is obvious from the above that Arizti’s book somehow treads the same theoretical turf as my present paper. Although it undeniably makes a valuable contribution to the field of study under consideration, it falls short of an analysis of the cultural and intellectual aspects of the Student Revolution because it mainly focuses attention on such issues as comedy, love, marriage, romance, private versus public relationships, gender roles, and intimate mores from the sixties to the eighties. For instance, it traces the radical changes in these mores to the Industrial Revolution and the French Revolution, which heralded the birth of “Liberty, Equality and Fraternity” (Arizti, 2002, p. 61). Postmodernism, Arizti claims, has helped change the moral and cultural scenes by prioritizing the particular over the universal. As the latter was the cornerstone of the Enlightenment and metanarratives, its decline expedited the collapse of all the values and institutions connected with it:
Postmodernity’s radical individualism and antiessentialism have challenged the dominant discourse of sexuality, declaring the obsolescence of the institutions based on dated metanarratives. Tradition, the family, the state, society in general, are divested of their normative power. There is no grand narrative of sexuality but a myriad of models of intimacy. Its positive and liberatory politics of desire have questioned the traditional epistemology of sexuality, helping to empower dissident sexual minorities. From queer theory, the well-established hetero/homo divide has been subverted, and the new nomenclature of the sexual points at the existence of gladly assumed identities where before there were only shame-faced attitudes. (pp. 81-82)

Now, given the dearth of research on the Cultural Revolution in Lodge’s Changing Places, this study, building on Herbert Marcuse’s One-Dimensional Man and Counterrevolution and Revolt, will try to determine the extent to which his call for radical cultural changes finds favour with Lodge’s fictional students. It will also argue that the reactions, actions and frictions generated by Marcuse’s arguments, one way or another, challenge the venerated literary tradition universities have always boasted and boosted. Another aim of this paper’s author is to demonstrate how Changing Places, casting a retrospective look at the sixties’ Student Revolution and cleaving closely to Lodge’s academic experience, ventures into the controversial territory of politics instead of confining itself to well-trodden ground such as the publish or perish dilemma, promotion, tenure, academic power, the ups and downs of academic marriages, teacher-student relationships, and so on. Finally, the article’s writer emphasises the need to strike a balance between past and present cultures and the reasonableness of fostering constructive criticism and mutual respect in academic circles.

Methodology
Mounting a scathing attack on capitalism, Marcuse (1972) theorises that it can be combated only through a “Cultural Revolution” (p. 79) and through the subsequent transformation of “the entire traditional culture” (p. 79). Premised on the assumption that arts have an unmistakable “political potential” (p. 79), this radical revolution aspires to create alternative languages, arts and images with a view to helping man’s body and mind break free from the “domination, indoctrination, and deception” (p. 79) imposed on them by “the established language and images” (p. 79). The alternative languages, Marcuse hypothesises, exist in arts such as literature and music and in “the folk tradition (black language, argot, slang)” (p. 80). The tradition of protest negates what is taken for granted and subverts it:

The subverting use of the artistic tradition aims from the beginning at a systematic desublimation of culture; that is to say, at undoing the aesthetic form. “Aesthetic form” means the total of qualities (harmony, rhythm, contrast) which make an oeuvre a self-contained whole, with an order and a structure of its own (the style). By virtue of these qualities the work of art transforms the order prevailing in reality. The transformation is “illusion,” but an illusion which gives the contents represented a meaning and a function different from those they have in the prevailing universe of discourse. (p. 81)
Challenging the main features of the aesthetic form, namely the illusion of harmony, “idealistic transfiguration” (Marcuse, 1972, p. 81) and the disconnection between the word and the world necessitates the inauguration of “immediate” (p. 82) art forms which activate a “natural” sense experience freed from the requirements of an obsolescent exploitative society” (p. 82). Thanks to this “sensuous culture” (p. 82), the body and the soul are treated as means of emancipation rather than as victims of labour and as guarantors of productivity. While emphasizing the possibility of achieving the long-awaited deviation from serious and popular bourgeois art forms, Marcuse urges the creation of a “proletarian literature” (p. 123) or a “working class literature” (p. 123) marked by “anti-intellectualism” (p. 126) to maintain “the progressive function of art and develop a revolutionary consciousness” (p. 123) that is of the essence in class struggle.

While society and high culture have always inhabited separate spheres, with the former having its own ideals which only a privileged few enjoyed and boasting the ability to preserve truth through its idiosyncratic sublimations, Marcuse (1991) explains, today’s situation has changed drastically:

Today’s novel feature is the flattening out of the antagonism between culture and social reality through the obliteration of the oppositional, alien, and transcendent elements in the higher culture by virtue of which it constituted another dimension of reality. This liquidation of two-dimensional culture takes place not through the denial and rejection of the ‘cultural values,’ but through their wholesale incorporation into the established order, through their reproduction and display on a massive scale. In fact, they serve as instruments of social cohesion. (p. 57)

Like a number of ideals in society, higher culture, Marcuse (1991) adds, has undergone a process of “materialization” (p. 58) and has, as a result, lost a great deal of its truth. In fact, it is, lamentably, associated with a pre-technological world which cannot be recaptured. Additionally, Marcuse (1972) calls upon educated people to rally behind the cause of the downtrodden and to help them “realize and enjoy their truly human capabilities” (p. 47) by organizing their spontaneous protests. This task can be achieved, among other things, through the establishment of “an intensive counter-education and organization” (p. 47) and through a complete break with the “intensive indoctrination” (p. 47) applied by the system. Radical Left revolutionaries, Marcuse goes on, can use the university to train their “future counter-cadres” (p. 54). They also need to set up their own “counterinstitutions” (p. 55) and their own radical media in order to disseminate their ideas.

This is prompted by the fact that mainstream mass media are at one and the same time means of information and entertainment and “agents of manipulation” (Marcuse, 1991, p. 8). Together with political decisions, they enhance one-dimensional thought through a discourse saturated with “self-validating hypotheses which, incessantly and monopolistically repeated, become hypnotic definitions and dictations” (p. 14). Market values are also believed to infiltrate the field of mass media:
If mass communications blend together harmoniously, and often unnoticeably, art, politics, religion, and philosophy with commercials, they bring these realms of culture to their common denominator—the commodity form. The music of the soul is also the music of salesmanship. Exchange value, not truth value counts. On it centers the rationality of the status quo, and all alien rationality is bent to it. (p. 57)

Having mined two books of Marcuse’s for arguments that lie within the present paper’s scope, the paper’s writer now sets out to analyse how the students in Lodge’s Changing Places, armed with the German philosopher’s teachings, embark on a cultural revolution on their campuses by employing a variety of cultural tools such as radical media - newspapers and radio shows, proletarian literature, unconventional literary genres, music and dance.

**Analysis**

**Radical media**

Aboard the plane bound for the United States, a British student called Charles Boon informs Philip Swallow, his compatriot and former teacher at Rummidge University, that there is an underground paper called Euphoric Times at Euphoric State University and that he does a weekly column in it (Lodge, 1992). He also boasts that the students want him to be the main editor and that he is, however, considering starting a rival paper. Of course, Boon is not unused to newspapers of this kind. While still an undergraduate student at Rummidge, he edited a student newspaper called Rumble and “involved” it “in an expensive libel suit brought by the mayoress of Rummidge” (p. 36). Taking this student’s radical leanings into account, his last name, Boon, may safely be said to evoke the word bomb rather than the positive connotations of the word boon. The chapter “Reading” (pp. 153-166), featuring extracts from a number of newspapers, among other things, reveals the extent to which students’ media can enhance their revolutionary cause. Advertising the People’s Garden in Plotinus, Euphoric Times refers to it as a “new Eden” (p. 155) and as “the most spontaneous and encouraging event so far in the continuing struggle between the University-Industrial-Military complex and the Alternative Society of Love and Peace” (p. 155). It soon later reiterates the need to guard the Garden and to stand united against police authorities’ oppressive policies:

> Our land is desecrated, but the spirit of the Garden is alive . . . . The people of Plotinus are united against the pigs and tyrants. The bull-shit barriers are coming down, the barricades of love are going up against the pigs. (p. 162)

Finally, it accuses Chancellor Binde, Sheriff O’Keene and a “nameless pig” (p. 161) of having killed the student John Roberts while he was taking part in a riot. The Charles Boon Show is bathed in the same radical light, in a manner of speaking.

> Boon’s journey to the States does nothing to excite his interest in study. He confides to Swallow that he is still doing a Master’s, a kind of course work, “a little baby dissertation” (Lodge, 1992, p. 49), that he has no time for study and that he is chiefly preoccupied with the Charles Boon
The Cultural Revolution in David Lodge’s Changing Places

Friji

Show, “a late-night phone-in programme” (p. 50) on the radio in which callers discuss a wide range of topics. In addition, the programme is “free from business and political pressures” (p. 74) in that it is publicised by the non-commercial network, QXYZ, “which was supported by listeners’ subscriptions and foundation grants” (p. 74). Not unexpectedly, it points an accusing finger at capitalist policies and glorifies revolutions. For example, Swallow hears the Black Pantheress “explaining to a caller the application of Marxist-Leninist revolutionary theory to the situation of oppressed racial minorities in a later stage of industrial capitalism” (p. 103).

The association between such programmes and youthful enthusiasm is articulated through the fact that when Désirée, Zapp’s wife, expresses her aversion to the Charles Boon Show, Boon counters, “If someone your age liked my show, I’d know I had failed” (Lodge, 1992, p. 145). The casual character of the programme finds further illustration in Boon’s tendency, at times, to start it by reading a poem of his own composition. It is not insignificant, therefore, that “the death of the novel” (p. 198) is one of the concerns Swallow discusses on the phone with the audience of the Charles Boon Show alongside burning issues like “the Garden, drugs, law and order, nuclear testing, abortion, encounter groups, the Underground press . . . the Sexual Revolution . . .” (p. 198).

The mounting pressure exerted by the spread of such means of communication goes hand in hand with the enthusiastic welcome given to their champions at a time when the representatives of traditional literary culture are receding into the background. To Swallow’s “considerable mortification” (Lodge, 1992, p. 73), for instance, his “chief social asset at Euphoric State turned out to be his association with Charles Boon” (p. 73). Worse still, people are eager to be acquainted with him merely “for the sake of some anecdote of Charles Boon’s early life” (p. 73). When the British professor arrives at Luke Hogan’s house to attend a party, Mrs Hogan asks him if Boon is with him. As soon as Boon shows up, everybody turns to see him. Meanwhile, Swallow, “who had counted on being himself the evening’s chief focus of attention, found himself standing neglected on the fringes of this little court” (p. 77). In a letter to his wife, he complains that Mrs Hogan “enlisted my help in coaxing Charles Boon to come and be lionized, an irony I could have done without” (p. 123).

**Proletarian literature**

The ghetto novel which the campus militant activist Wily Smith is working on (Lodge, 1992) may be said to fall within the scope of Marcuse’s category of proletarian literature in that ghetto inhabitants are, by definition, at the bottom of the social hierarchy. It is both relevant and revealing that when this student bursts into Swallow’s office to escape the police, the British professor is reading John Milton’s *Lycidas*. Smith’s sudden and unbidden appearance may, in other words, be said to symbolise the encroachment of emergent genres like the ghetto novel on traditional literary works like Milton’s above-mentioned text; on Jane Austen’s works, on which Swallow has written an MA thesis; and on other literary works for which Swallow has “a genuine love” (p. 17), namely those of Beowulf and Virginia Woolf as well as “medieval sermons, Elizabethan sonnet sequences, Restoration heroic tragedy, eighteenth-century broadsides, the novels of William Godwin, the poetry of Elizabeth Barrett Browning . . .” (p. 17).
The surname Smith itself brings to mind the working-class job blacksmith. Smith’s insistence that he is black although he is not so (Lodge, 1992) adds more credibility to this conjecture. A name like Black Smith, one may surmise, would be of immense significance in that it brings together racial and working-class aspects and, by so doing, it subverts not only conventional names but also the positive characteristics associated with them. This is consonant with Smith’s antagonism to traditional courses and educational policies on the whole. When Swallow first meets him, he is, significantly enough, wearing “some kind of army combat jacket with camouflage markings” (p. 66). As he puts his hand in his jacket’s pocket, Swallow fears that he is going to produce a bomb, but it turns out to be only a catalogue of courses. Once again, this opaque analogy is suggestive of the potentially explosive nature of radical ideas. Smith’s adoption of confrontational tactics finds its best expression in the fact that when Swallow allows him to enrol in his creative writing course, he urges his fellow students to boycott not only this course but also other classes, by way of supporting the strike.

This occurs at a time when minorities’ increasing demands for reform oblige universities to make concessions in matters pertaining to curricula and recruitment (Lodge, 1992). For instance, Luke Hogan, the Head of the English Department, advises Swallow to write a book or two in order to secure a job at Euphoric State and confides to him that if he were a black man or an Indian, he would be offered a job because the University, like a number of other academic institutions across the nation, has made a settlement to employ more Third World faculty as a result of the pressure triggered by strikes. Universities are also aware of the sharp rise in the number of radicals and of the influence they may have exerted on students, several of whom purchase their books from such places as “the Beta Bookshop, a favourite gathering-place for radicals” (p. 193). Strolling across Howle Plaza after taking part in a faculty vigil, Swallow is left in no doubt as to the ballooning fame of political activism in the States. The area is depicted as “a kind of ideological fair” (p. 192) where “you . . . buy the literature of the Black Panthers . . . and express yourself in a hundred other interesting ways” (pp.192-193). Obviously, Smith’s novel is not the only instance of proletarian literature. Nor is it the only living witness to the snowballing popularity of emerging radical genres.

While Charles Boon is apprising him of the agitations on the Euphoric State campus, Swallow notices that his former student’s lapel buttons carry several slogans adumbrating the situation in question (Lodge, 1992). Interpreting this as irrefutable evidence of the birth of “a new literary medium, the lapel button, something between the classical epigram and the imagist lyric” (p. 49), he presumes that a postgraduate student may one day write a thesis on it and that Boon may already be doing so as part of his MA research. The proletarian orientation of the aforesaid genre is attributable to the working-class background of its adherents, namely Bates and Smith. Swallow recalls that Bates:

belonged to a category of students whom Philip referred to privately (showing his age) as ‘the Department’s Teddy-Boys’. These were clever young men of plebeian origin who, unlike the traditional scholarship boy (such as Philip himself) showed no deference to the social and cultural values of the institution to which they had been admitted, but maintained until the day they graduated a style of ostentatious uncouthness in dress, behaviour and
speech. They came late to classes, unwashed, unshaven, and wearing clothes they had evidently slept in; slouched in their seats, rolling their own cigarettes and stubbing them out on the furniture . . . answered questions addressed to them in dialect monosyllables, and handed in disconcertingly subtle, largely destructive essays written in the style of F. R. Leavis. (pp. 35-36)

Swallow will soon later note a note reading “KEEP KOOP” (Lodge, 1992, p. 65) printed on a button on Wily Smith’s lapel. Soon later, he learns that this subgenre is being publicised in support of Karl Kroop, an Assistant Professor in the English Department who has recently been denied tenure. The intrigued British professor intimates to Luke Hogan that he cannot wait to meet Kroop, having “read so much about him, in buttonholes” (p. 75). Kroop will later continue wearing “a KEEP KROOP BUTTON in his lapel, as a veteran might wear a combat medal” (p. 183). Emphasising the potentially violent nature of radical genres, this analogy brings us back to the disguised resemblance between the catalogue of courses held by Smith and the bomb. Having witnessed the importance of enlisting the help of the students and the academic staff through this so-called genre, Howard Ringbaum, a teacher of Augustan pastoral, fears that no one will support him during his upcoming tenure campaign by wearing “RETAIN RINGBAUM buttons” (p. 76).

To be sure, the cultural climate in America, as depicted in the novel, is hospitable to the rise of unconventional genres of this kind. Indeed, American students have “read the most outlandish things and not read the most obvious ones” (p. 123), as Swallow puts it in a letter to his wife. One of his students, for example, has read such unknown writers as Gurdjieff and Arismov but, oddly enough, he is not conversant with E. M. Forster’s works.

**Music and dancing**

Having got into the habit of watching TV programmes such as *Top of the Pops*, Swallow envies “the Dionysian horde” (Lodge, 1992, p. 28) their infinite enjoyment of the “deliciously mindless, liberating” (p. 27) atmosphere. Later, the narrator zeroes in on the dance in which Melanie Byrd, Morris Zapp’s daughter, and her friends engage, paying special attention to the effect music has on their senses and responsive bodies and to their clever way of keeping up with the pace of the “accelerations and slowings” (p. 99) of the rhythm. The liberating character of the dance is articulated through the attendant actions and through the excitement they generate:

> Then the tempo became faster, the twanging notes louder, faster and louder, and they moved more violently in response to the music, they writhed and twitched, stamped and lifted their arms and snapped their fingers and clapped their hands. Eyes rolled, sweat glistened, breasts bounced, flesh smacked flesh; cries, shrill and ecstatic, pierced the smoke. (pp. 99-100)

In the light of its reaction to and interaction with music, the body assumes an expressive function. As a student called the Cowboy instructs Swallow, “What you have to do is communicate by rubbing against each other . . . Through your spine, your shoulder-blade” (Lodge, 1992, p. 99). Significantly, when the middle-aged professor joins the group of students in “the free, improvised,
Dionysian dancing he had hankered after” (p. 99) and presses himself against Melanie, she asks him, “Hey, Philip, what are you trying to tell me with those shoulder-blades?” (p. 99).

Rock music, of all the musical subgenres mentioned in the novel, seems to be the most closely connected with revolutions; while students’ protests are gathering pace in Plotinus, “the record shops were playing the latest rock-gospel hit Oh Happy Day through their external speakers” (Lodge, 1992, p. 193). It is small wonder that “rock bands and topless dancers” (p. 248) take part in the March on Plotinus. It is also not insignificant that the same musical subgenre is a firm favourite with striptease clubs in Soho, where the idiosyncratic treatment of the body betrays an overwhelming desire to break loose from conventional moral constraints. Granted its revolutionary character, rock music is associated with the younger generation. By contrast, the older generation have a liking for other types of music. Désirée, for example, spends her free time reading and listening to classical romantic music. Similarly, invited by Zapp to dinner in a small club called Petronella on the occasion of her birthday, Hilary, Swallow’s wife, settles herself into the comfortable grip of “the entertainment . . . provided by a so-so folk-blues group called Morte D’Arthur with a wistful girl singer who sang pastiches of recordings by Joan Baez” (p. 201). This accords with the club’s custom of playing “decent music” (p. 201). The celebration would have been spoilt, however, if the entertainment had been provided by “a heavy rock band for instance” (p. 202).

Discussion
All the aforementioned tools of the Cultural Revolution seem to have had a few dramatic effects on the academic scene. Chief among these is the decline of literature. In actual fact, the course taught by Karl Kroop is entitled “English 213. The Death of the Book? Communication and Crisis in Contemporary Culture” (Lodge, 1992, p. 68). Worse still, by ultimately removing the question mark, he seems to announce the death of literature rather than simply posing questions about its imminence. As Swallow resignedly concedes towards the end of the novel, “Well, the novel is dying, and us with it. No wonder I could never get anything out of my novel-writing class at Euphoric State. It’s an unnatural medium for their experience” (p. 250). What is more, students’ rejection of traditional teaching approaches and traditional genres root and branch explains why they consider Howard Ringbaum “[d]ull, dull, dull” (p. 68) and why Zapp, like Lionel Trilling, finds it difficult to teach. Being sick and tired of “student intimidation” (p. 39), “the Student Revolution, its strikes, its protests, issues, non-negotiable demands . . . ” (p. 39), the American professor decides to fly to Rummidge and to “condemn himself to six months’ hard labour” (p. 39). When he pleads with the Dean of Faculty at Euphoric State to give him a chance to go somewhere to Europe, the Dean rightly guesses, “Students getting you down?” (p. 43). Indeed, Zapp finds it hard to apply his teaching style and to teach his favourite subject and writer as students are:

openly contemptuous of both the subject and his own qualifications. . . . Jane Austen was certainly not the writer to win the hearts of the new generation. Sometimes Morris woke sweating from nightmares in which students paraded round the campus carrying placards that declared KNIGHTLEY SUCKS and FANNY PRICE IS A FINX. (p. 46)
Naturally, this comes as a shock to the renowned champion of the works of Jane Austen, one of the twenty-six writers the American critic Bloom (1995) greets as the vanguard of an impregnable literary canon whose aesthetic value has stood the test of time. With four books on Austen to his name, Zapp embarks “with great enthusiasm on an ambitious critical project: a series of commentaries on Jane Austen which would work through the whole canon, one novel at a time, saying absolutely everything that could be said about them” (Lodge, 1992, p. 44). He looks forward to exhausting these novels by applying a variety of critical approaches to them with an eye to putting “a definitive stop to the production of any further garbage on the subject” (p. 44). The American scholar’s obsession with Austen is common knowledge. In a letter to his wife, for example, Swallow, Zapp’s opposite number, reveals that Zapp’s twins are called Elizabeth and Darcy because Zapp is “a Jane Austen man, of course – indeed the Jane Austen man in the opinion of many” (p. 123).

After learning that Hilary wants to send a book entitled Let’s Write a Novel by A. J. Beamish to her husband, Swallow, Zapp presumes that this book will not stir the attention of the students in English 305 at Euphoric State, “lazy, pretentious bastards, most of them, who thought they could write the General American Novel by just typing out their confessions and changing the names” (Lodge, 1992, p. 88). As they wage war on the traditional curriculum, British students, too, show disrespect for the individuals associated with it. Hilary stresses the stresses and strains generated by the news of the impending sit-in at Rummidge, especially as far as the older staff members are concerned. Gorden Masters, the Head of the English Department, is the chief victim in this respect. The students’ protests do not only precipitate his resignation but also impair his physical and mental health, hence his being treated at a private psychiatric clinic. Driven to despair, he later leaves Rummidge “for a period of rest and recuperation” (p. 162).

Given its disruptiveness and its aftermath, the Revolution comes under fire from many circles. The narrator seems to indict the students’ behaviour and to caution that by ousting academic leaders like Masters, revolutions are bound to plunge universities into endless chaos (Lodge, 1992). The Rummidge English Department is thus likened to a sinking ship which cannot be rescued because its captain took the “sealed instructions about the ship’s ultimate destination” (p. 214) with him as he fell aboard. Having joined the chorus of protests by taking part in the faculty vigil and by siding with and guiding the students, as per Marcuse’s teachings, and having experimented with music and dance, Swallow finds rebelliousness too hard to swallow and sees sense. The change he undergoes towards the end of the novel belies his wife’s charge that he seems to have turned into “one of these violent snobs, who think that nothing’s important unless people are getting killed” (p. 247). Watching the Plotinus March on TV, he launches into a passionate argument for liberal humanistic ideals. He would not choose to be with the marchers, he insists, because “‘[t]hat is no country for old men . . .’” (p. 249) and because he would simply “be an imposter there” (p. 249). His generation, he adds, observe “the old liberal doctrine of inviolate self” (p. 250) as represented by the realistic novels of Jane Austen, which attach great weight to private life while relegating history to the background and dismissing it as “a distant rumble of gunfire, somewhere offstage” (p. 250). This probably explains why he earlier turns off the radio after hearing the Black Pantheress speaking about the way Marxism can inspire revolutions.
Austen’s ahistorical perception of reality is confirmed by Zapp. Having succeeded in ending the sit-in at Rummidge, in bridging the divide between the students and the staff and in winning his colleagues’ respect, he tells his students that Austen:

> came down on the side of Eros against Agape – on the side, that is, of the private communion of lovers over against the public communion of social events and gatherings which invariably caused pain and distress (think for instance of the disastrous nature of group expeditions, to Sotherton in *Mansfield Park*, to Box Hill in *Emma*, to Lyme Regis in *Persuasion*). (p. 215)

The implication, one may suggest, is that Austen’s novels, like other canonical works, teach and preach discipline and peace, as against the emergent literary genres and the other means of expression connected with radical thinkers, which seem, to conservative academics like Swallow and Zapp, to leave only distraction and destruction in their wake. Indeed, they may be said to challenge the conventional stability of the cultural and literary scenes by bringing political ideologies to bear on time-honoured works of art in the name of righting wrongs and addressing and redressing injustices when they may, if indirectly, encourage suggestible youths to adopt confrontational tactics and violent demeanour.

Predictably, the students’ revolt somehow revolts not only academics but also some students. For instance, a student at Rummidge submits a notice to *Rumble*, indicting students’ protests and dismissing the protesters as “big fools” (Lodge, 1992, p. 164) who are wasting the University’s as well as policemen’s time and pointing out that when they grow up, they will realise that the University was run in a good way. To him, most of these activists are “hippeys” (p. 164) and “stupid” (p. 164) people who have not showered for a long time and “a load of old tramps with their long dirty hair” (p. 164). He winds up by reiterating that he loathes students and that he would hang them if he could.

Additionally, the peacefulness of the long-awaited march is in tune with the novel’s opaque call for peace. The TV channel’s commentator expresses his surprise at the fact that no violence has erupted by stating, “And it certainly looks as though the great march is going to pass off peacefully after all . . .” (Lodge, 1992, p. 247) and by adding, “. . . a lot of people feared blood would run in the streets of Plotinus today, but so far the vibrations are good . . . .” (p. 248). This climate climaxes in the marchers’ throwing of flowers instead of rocks at the guardsmen, who merely stand by and wave at the passing crowd.

It is also enlightening that Swallow’s abandonment of his revolutionary zeal takes place at a time when he and his wife as well as Zapp and his wife are having a “summit meeting” (Lodge, 1992, p. 236) in New York to resolve their marital conflicts. Given that the novel does not offer any clear clue as to the end of this state of affairs, we can only guess that each couple will reconstruct their marriage and start afresh. In point of fact, in the sequel to his *Changing Places*, Lodge (1984) reveals that the two couples are still married notwithstanding the ups and downs marking their matrimonial relationships. This could be considered further proof of the survival of
the bourgeois family ideals preached by novelists like Austen in the face of the changes and challenges sweeping society.

Be this as it may, it may be better to ply a middle ground between the radical and conservative positions. As the university is an honourable and vulnerable institution which is populated by educated people, it would be more reasonable to have a debate based on mutual respect to settle quarrels and to reach a compromise between the students on the one hand and between the administrative and academic staff on the other. What is more, students should be encouraged to help bring about fruitful social and cultural changes. They should also be allowed to enjoy the fruits of their revolutionary labours, to have a say in the curriculum and assessment and to have their own media of expression and communication. At the same time, they should not assault or insult their teachers. Nor should they reject the cultural heritage and the aesthetic aspects of literary texts offhandedly as they are eternally informative and appealing.

Conclusion
Investigating the extent to which Marcuse’s ideas fire the university students in David Lodge’s Changing Places with enthusiasm for change and inspire them to a cultural revolution, among other things, the present study has sought to illuminate the clash between canonical and iconoclastic trends of thinking. It has been demonstrated, for instance, that students’ impatience of discipline and of established disciplines is frowned upon by conservative scholars on the ground that it expedites the rise of politically oriented discourses and sparks off unwanted and unwonted changes. Once again, however, it is useful to emphasise that student activists should not be demonized. Given the proliferation of global cultural and social changes, they cannot help hitching their wagon to the zeitgeist. They cannot, in other words, keep pace with the modernization of life and academic standards while drawing inspiration from past texts and contexts only. To achieve the desired goals, therefore, it may be useful for them to work towards more cultural innovation without breaking with precedent irrevocably. On the other hand, the literary tradition’s enthusiasts had better reconcile themselves to the impossibility of imposing their own lifestyle as well as their presumably unassailable cultural values and ideas on new generations. They should not also lose sight of the fact that several achievements in the fields of civil rights, work, gender, politics and education are generally credited to the struggle of post-war radical activists and political theorists (Gold & Villari, 2000; Ezra, 2009; Hoefferle, 2013).

It may, at the same time, be helpful for these advocates of the literary canon to give it a new lease of life by organizing conventions like the one held by the literary characters in Textermination, a novel by Brooke-Rose (1992). Flocking to the Hilton Hotel in San Francisco on the occasion of the ‘‘annual Convention of Prayer for Being’’ (p. 25), they hope that their prayer for the revival and survival of literature will bear fruit in the face of the all-encompassing rise of television and cinema and of the decline of readership. Although their efforts come to nought, their unflagging enthusiasm should be an inspiration to the fans of traditional literary works.

Lastly, the author of this paper hopes that the foregoing investigation of Lodge’s Changing Places from Marcuse’s angle of vision has helped in cutting across the lines of fact and fiction, or
rather history and story. It is also hoped that this study will stimulate more interest in Lodge’s novel, whose rich thematic structure fosters myriad interpretations. It would be useful, for instance, to draw on Mikhail Bakhtin’s concepts of dialogism and polyphony to detect and inspect the diverse narrative choices and voices used therein.

Endnotes
1 See also Bradbury (1981) and Cross (2001) for further fictional handling of the Student Revolution.
2 The list of canonical writers, Bloom (1995) suggests, includes, among others, Dante, Shakespeare, Wordsworth, Chaucer, Cervantes, Goethe, Dickens, Tolstoy and Joyce. What sets them all apart from the less distinguished writers is their authoritativeness, “sublimity” (p. 2), “strangeness,” “originality,” “uncanniness,” and “aesthetic supremacy” (p. 3).
3 Zapp later boasts that he has written five books about Jane Austen and that he has exhausted her works from all angles, leaving other scholars nothing to say on the subject (Lodge, 1984, p. 24).
4 Swallow is here quoting from Yeats’s poem “Sailing to Byzantium,” which opens with the line “That is no country for old men” (Yeats, 1994, p. 163) and glorifies youth while accentuating old people’s desperateness

About the author:
Noureddine Friji has a PhD in English language and literature. His research interests include contemporary and old Anglo-American literature, literary theory and criticism, translation, historiography and critical discourse analysis. He is currently an English language instructor at the English Language Institute, King Abdulaziz University, Jeddah, Saudi Arabia.
Orcid: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4418-3542

References


Tragedy and social drama in Arthur Miller's Death of a Salesman

Tahar Bayouli
Majmaah University, Azzulfí College of Education
Department of English, Saudi Arabia

Imed Sammali
Majmaah University, Azzulfí College of Education
Department of English, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
This paper examines the issue of genre classification in Death of a Salesman by focusing on the dialectic relation at the heart of the play’s structure between tragedy and social drama. It argues that the tragic resolution brought to the theme of social protest and the characterization of the protagonist is what gives the play its unique place as the quintessential modern tragedy. It is concluded that tragedy and the social theme are not mutually destructive in Death of a Salesman as some critics stated. Rather, they are combined to make an intense dramatic treatment of the modern American individual’s most pressing issues. Without being constrained by prescriptive standardized rules, Miller produced a dramatic form that rightly claims the status of what can be labeled a modern tragedy, appealing to modern audiences as rarely any other modern play did.

Keywords: Arthur Miller, catharsis, dramatic structure, social drama, tragedy.

Cites as: Bayouli, T., & Sammali, I. (2019). Tragedy and social drama in Arthur Miller's Death of a Salesman. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 3 (2) 37-48. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.4
Introduction
The question of genre classification in relation to modern drama is all the more problematic as the experimentation and the eclecticism characterizing modern dramatic production have eroded the notion of the purity of genre. George Steiner’s *Death of Tragedy* is an expression of the fact that "the tragedy of pure form" seems to have lived its day and to become too inadequate an expression for the age's conflicts and interrogations. Yet, it is a fact that the presence of the tragic as such is far from being dead and it still marks many modern plays, and in criticism on the other hand, the question remains a major issue for debate. Between the critical view that tragedy is a dead literary form and the belief that tragedy is needed and can still have a vital role in modern drama, *Death of a Salesman* stands as one of the most popular modern plays while claiming for the possibility and even the vital need for tragedy as an expression of modern man’s experience. However, more than any other play, *Death of a Salesman* has, right from the date of its composition, never ceased to arouse controversies as to its classification as a tragedy. Indeed, Miller's play epitomized the period's preoccupation with the issue of dramatic genre and certainly fostered the debate over the relevance and legitimacy of the tragic form in modern drama.

Focusing on the interrelation between the social drama and the tragic form in *Death of a Salesman*, this paper deals with the paradoxes involved in claiming tragic status for a play produced in the context of the un-tragic orientations of contemporary drama, mainly social realism.

Which drama for the modern stage?
It is often stated that the history of modern drama is the history of realism and Ibsen’s type of social drama is regarded as the gateway by which the theatre regained a place on the contemporary literary scene. After Ibsen, the tradition of social drama, most notably continued by Bernard Shaw and John Osborne, may certainly be qualified as serious drama but it certainly is more comic than tragic in its mood and in the generic sense. Writing towards the close of the nineteen sixties, that is a decade after the production of *Death of a Salesman*, Durrenmatt (1958) argued that comedy rather than tragedy was the suitable form for the modern stage:

> The task of drama today, is to create something concrete, something that has form. This can be accomplished best by comedy. Tragedy, the strictest genre in art, presupposes a formed world. Comedy … supposes an unformed world, a world being made and turned upside down, a world about to fold like ours. (p.30)

Other critics suggested a form that is a middle way between comedy and tragedy. The label “Comic tragedy” is suggested by Styan (1968 p.52) and nearly two decades earlier Samuel Beckett subtitles his play *Waiting for Godot* “a tragicomedy in two acts”. In fact, as from the revival of drama in the late 19th century, the general tendency has been to the blending of genres and styles. The “mixed mood” identified by Cohn (1969 p.17) in plays ranging from T.S. Eliot's *Family Reunion* (1939) to Beckett's *Waiting for Godot* (1952), is in fact a hybrid form which is essentially un-tragic in the strict generic sense. In Beckett’s plays, which embody a turn to surrealism, meta-
drama and philosophical and aesthetic skepticism, tragedy figures in a parodic way and the very concept of heroism is deconstructed.

However, it is a fact that in criticism, the debate over tragedy is far from being closed, and a survey of dramatic literature would reveal that writing in the tragic vein constitutes a prominent crosscurrent in modern drama. In his survey of 20th century dramatic literature, Schmidt (2001) identifies what he calls “the turn to tragedy” as “the form that most eloquently dramatizes the stubborn persistence of human blindness, vulnerability and error”. He sees tragedy as all the more relevant in the intellectual context of “the growing self-doubt of philosophy, the questioning of reason, and of the analytical method and conceptual knowledge” (p.1). On the other hand, the issue of tragedy continues to be debated in drama criticism and the critical reception of every new serious play does concern itself with the question of whether it is or not a tragedy. Significantly, the plays for which tragic status has been claimed have widely given rise to controversies centered on the issue of generic classification. That a form of tragedy is needed in the modern age many drama critics have asserted it. Joseph Wood Crutch, as one of the most outspoken representatives of this view, wrote about “the supreme necessity in the 20th century for the artistic creation of the ambiance and consolation of tragedy if the modern individual is to survive in terms of what has traditionally been known as ‘human’” as cited in Fiet (1976 p.63).

A tendency towards rethinking tragedy came to occupy more recent drama criticism and many critics are now in the belief that a modern play can achieve the stature and the role of tragedy without necessarily conforming to the strict structural standards of classical tragedy. In his seminal book The Tragic Fallacy (1929), Crutch rightly asserted: “Though tragedy is timeless, the form which it takes varies with the age which creates it, and no spiritual epoch has realized itself until it has created its tragedy, stating the gravamen of its protest and the terms of its acceptance” as cited in Fiet (1976 p.61).

Indeed, Miller’s Death of a Salesman, with its enduring national and international success, stands as a living example of the type of play that modern drama can produce to respond to the ‘necessity for tragedy’ in the modern times. Arthur Miller's play is certainly first inscribed in the turn to realism and social drama established by Henrik Ibsen's tradition, but he also wrote it with the full belief in the relevance and the power of tragedy as a perfectly valid modern dramatic form. About Death of a Salesman, Bloom (2007) asserts, “Whether it has the aesthetic dignity of tragedy is not clear, but no other American play is worthier of the term, so far” (p.5).

A survey of modern drama would reveal that writing in the tragic mode is a characteristically American tendency, compared to the orientations of European drama to the parodic and the formless play. Eugene O’Neill, then Tennessee Williams played a crucial role in establishing this tradition of tragedy in American drama. Yet, it is Miller’s Death of a Salesman, despite all the controversies it created, that unquestionably occupies the most prominent place in the rehabilitation of tragedy. The fact that it is a generically self-conscious tragedy adds to its unique importance, and its perennial popularity is itself an evidence of the validity of tragedy in the modern world.
Writing in the tradition of 20th century realism, Arthur Miller meant to give his social drama the dimensions of tragedy and this is an essential element of his play’s design and intent. Most important in this respect is that, in *Death of a Salesman*, the style and the tragic form are determined by a thematic that is primarily social. Therefore, the claimed tragic status can be instructively discussed in the light of the dialectic connection between the social theme and the tragic form. For Bentley (1976 p.183), the social theme and the tragedy are mutually destructive in Miller's play. However, this view does not seem to take into account the very conception of tragedy the play professes and discloses. It is the kind of critical judgement described by Sewall (1954) as based on a prescriptive and inhibitive conception of tragic form.

The theme and the structure of Miller's drama is pervaded by social realism in the tradition of Ibsen. Yet, Miller's intention in *Death of a Salesman* is also to achieve a highly intense dramatic form by giving his social theme a definitely tragic expression. His ‘tragedy of the common man’ constitutes a major modification of classical standards of tragedy pointing to the possibility of tragedy through adapting it to the nature of modern drama. It exemplifies Maeterlinck's view that “there is an everyday tragedy which is more real, deeper and more in keeping with our true existence than the tragedy of great adventures” (1952) as cited in Styan (1968). In introducing major changes on the classical conventions of tragedy, Miller adapted it to the modern experience, which is radically different from the experience and the world dramatized by classical tragedy. The unconventional features of tragedy in *Death of a Salesman* constitute an adaptation of the tragic form that become necessary once an everyday type of action and of character are introduced. Otten (1999) rightly describes such a change in modern tragedy: The differences that emerge in modern tragedy when realistically described social forces usurp the role of the gods transfigure tragedy profoundly – but not unrecognizably” (p.285). Social drama and tragedy are not mutually exclusive, they are mutually self-sustaining. In the following terms, Miller himself explains, in his essay “Tragedy and the common man” (1949), the mechanism by which tragedy becomes a powerful expression of modern man’s plight and a tool of social criticism:

It is true that tragedy is the consequence of a man’s total compulsion to evaluate himself justly, his destruction in the attempt posits a wrong or an evil in his environment and this is precisely the morality of tragedy and its lesson.” (p.1).

The tragic downfall of the protagonist is thus meant to be an indictment of the social forces of his environment whose dehumanizing corrosive effect is presented through the poignant paradoxes of the ‘salesman’s death’.

**Social drama and the necessity for tragedy**

The fact is that well before *Death of a Salesman*, the tragic vision of American reality had marked American drama as it grew to maturity and shaped its distinctive styles and themes. With Miller however, this drama became even more concentrated on the theme of the social condition of the contemporary American individual living the paradoxes of the so-called ‘American Dream’. In dealing with this theme, the combination of tragedy and social drama distinguishes Miller’s play
Tragedy and social drama in Arthur Miller's Death of a Salesman 
Bayouli & Sammali

from the other major representatives of the Ibsenian tradition including Bernard Shaw and John Osborne whose social dramas are certainly not categorized as tragedies. It is the fact that a tragic form is claimed and opted for in the dramatization of the social theme that places Death of a Salesman in an outstanding position within this tradition of modern social drama. This distinction is obvious even in comparison to plays that comprise tragic elements. Indeed, the generic questions involved in a discussion of tragedy in Death of a Salesman are not the questions involved in discussions of any play by Eugene O'Neill or Tennessee Williams, also categorized as tragedies. The writer's article in defense of the tragic status of his play has certainly been a helping factor in the focus on the issue of tragedy from a generic point of view. The play’s structure, the character and experience of its hero along with its ending, point to the generically self-conscious nature of the play. For as long as tragic form shapes the dramatic construct in its totality, the question of purity and authenticity of that form is inevitably involved, not because the play has to be measured against a set of generic requirements and conventions, but more importantly because the specific tragic effect wanted from such a form does not admit mixed tones and moods.

While admitting that Death of a Salesman is “a slippery play to categorize”, Miller (1987) defended it against critics’ attacks upon it as a “pseudo-tragedy”: “I need not claim that this is a genuine solid-gold tragedy for my opinions on tragedy to be held valid” (p. 146). Many critics are now in the belief that the irrelevance of ‘absolute tragedy’ does not mean that tragedy has no place in modern drama. In Tragedy After Darwin, Freeman (2010) writes: “What consistently remains important about tragedy, is not its literary structure, but the sense that Western culture employs tragedy to understand itself when it is in crisis” (p.202). Tragedy needed a rehabilitation and an adaptation to the modern condition and most importantly to the essential shift in the nature of the forces that are presented as shaping the modern tragic hero’s destiny. Grochaha (2012) writes “High tragedies are replaced by modern domestic tragedies, the heroes’ tragic destinies are shaped not by Fate but by the equivalent to fate: the social, economic circumstances in which they live”. (p.26)

In Death of a Salesman, it is obvious that the social and economic circumstances constitute from the very beginning the element that shapes the action and determines the role and tragic destiny of the main character. Therefore, the interrelation between the social theme and the tragic form in Death of a Salesman can enlighten the play’s tragic texture by means of an examination of the dramatic process and above all, the kind of effect produced by the resolution brought to the theme of social protest. First, the play certainly stands out in ending with the death of the main character, an element that is quite uncommon and significant of the play's distinctive position in modern drama. The death of the hero is meant to bring a tragic closure to the play while functioning as a comment on the social reality portrayed from the start.

Dramatic structure and effect

With its blend of social drama and tragedy and its focus on the individual versus the system theme, Death of a Salesman meant to address the ethical crisis in the Western post-industrial society by dramatizing what is most deeply tragic in the predicament of the modern individual.
For this, it very much relies on the element of tragic tone and tragic effect while experimenting with new dramatic techniques and structures.

Most importantly, the death of the main character is meant to give the social drama in the play a tragic dimension. The nature of the dramatic use of death is the most important structural element that gives *Death of a Salesman* its distinctive place as the most typical tragedy of modern drama. Arthur Miller certainly introduces the death of the main character as the culmination of the action that gives the dramatic intensity and effect of tragedy. Yet, if the neo-classical, most notably the Elizabethan drama, established the death of the hero as the archetypal tragic situation, the characteristics and orientations of modern drama are such that death no longer has this kind of presence and function. In such a landmark of modern drama as Beckett’s *Waiting for Godot*, death is a constant concern of the characters in their grappling with the inextricable issue of existence. However, when death seems to be preferred to life, it does not happen. Vladimir and Estragon cannot accomplish suicide because the rope they use to hang themselves is too short and is needed to keep Estragon’s trousers up, and the situation turns to farce. In fact, unlike in Miller’s play, death in *Waiting for Godot* is not given a tragic but a parodic and comic treatment. The distinction here is between an ontologically oriented drama showing death and life as equally absurd and Miller’s social drama that uses the death of the protagonist as a supreme expression of the tragic in the modern individual’s reality. Discussing the place of tragedy in modern drama, Wallace (2010) contrasts what she calls “American tragedy” to Beckett’s plays described as “tragic parodies of modernity” (p.13).

In fact, nothing is more significant of the radical shift in the conception and the dramatization of the tragic than the fact that real death seems to become irrelevant on the modern stage. The contrast can be still more instructively seen through a comparison between *Death of a Salesman* and other American plays of the same period. In many of these plays, death is introduced in a dramatic process that is primarily psychological. If it occurs, it is imaginary and allegorical and is connected to a decisive moment of psychological regeneration and rebirth. Death is then the culmination of a whole process, which is psychoanalytical. The death of the child in Edward Albee’s *Who’s Afraid of Virginia Woolf* is a good instance of this. A shift to optimistic pragmatism is probably the explanation of this orientation in American drama represented by Albee’s plays. The emphasis is on an active and constructive role given to the individual in bringing about some kind of regenerative change. The play’s concerns are psychoanalytical in addition to being socio-political. It achieves its effect by means of a ‘happy ending’ that introduces a message of hope and faith placed in the individual as an agent of change. In exposing the state of alienation of the character, the American playwrights, including Arthur Miller, tend to attribute it to the oppressiveness of an encroaching social order. Rather than just showing the individual as confronting the system, the tendency in Albee’s plays is to evolve an emotional and psychological process, which shapes the dramatic development and ultimately regenerates the individual through an awakening and breaking with the illusions of recognized false values. In *Death of a Salesman*, this element of awakening is excluded from the central character’s role, precisely because it would not be in keeping with the coherently developed character of Willy Loman as ‘the common man’ and Willy is meant to embody to the end the notion of tragic blindness. The fact that the element
of awakening or recognition is eventually introduced and is shifted to the second character Biff, may be explained by the fact that a thoroughly tragic form is felt to be insufficient for the modern spirit of pragmatism and optimism.

**Psychological realism and the function of the retrospective technique**

It is thus noticeable that *Death of a Salesman* denies its hero recognition and change but sets out to show his death as inevitable in the light of his being a coherently developed psychological entity. Miller’s play displays this tendency of post-war American drama in its psychological orientation. Yet, the introduction of expressionistic elements in a realistic framework distinguishes the play in its psychological dimension. A central device in the dramatization of the protagonist’s state of mind is Miller’s ingenious handling of time. The action begins quite realistically in the present with Willy Loman returning home from his day’s frustration, and as it becomes obvious that the focus is primarily psychological, the technical means of staging it becomes clear. Quite unexpectedly in the third act, the characters appear younger thus indicating a flashback in time. This is in fact no interruption of the present by a shift to a past action, but still part of the present, a moment in the current dramatic process in which what is presented on stage becomes an internal kind of action, an action of the mind. In *The Legacy of Miller*, Otten (2012) interprets these memory scenes in terms of the impossibility to elude what she calls the “Presentness of the past” and Miller’s use of “the elemental condition of tragedy that there are inevitable consequences to our choices, which constitutes the moral spine of his dramas” (p.141). However, Miller’s use of this past-into-present technique cannot be rightly understood without linking it to the essentially satirical and political purpose of the playwright. Interpreting Miller’s integration of retrospective technique and tragedy in moral terms would be a misreading of the nature of his drama, and as Otten (1999) asserts, Miller himself views his “artistic end in *Death of a Salesman* as closer to Ibsen than to Sophocles” (p. 286).

It is obvious that the function of this presence of the past in the play is primarily psychological and is meant to show the progression of Willy towards his inevitable tragic end. The technique of the memory scenes makes the audience quite naturally follow Willy’s mind each time it delves into the past or surges off dreaming. In the introduction to his *Collected Plays*, Arthur Miller says that he initially thought of “The Inside of his Head” as a title of his play. The playwright is so entirely devoted to dramatizing the reality of the protagonist that what is lived internally and what goes on in his mind in the form of memory or hallucination are all acted out on the stage. This way, an internal or psychological type of realism superimposes external realism that first marks the play. What is remarkable is Miller’s exploitation of the technical possibilities of the modern stage including alternation of offstage and onstage scenes, carefully calculated shift and focus of lighting, visual and sound effects. These tools are efficiently handled to achieve a total flow of action with a double dimension, the immediate/actual and the retrospective/mental. This elaborate fusion of past with present does not only proceed from the premise that the difficulties of the present have their roots in the past. It is also used as a device to dramatize the invisible workings of Willy’s mind. It aims at giving a full image of the character’s alienation; an image of a mind that has sunk into unreality and is shrinking from confronting the imminent truth and indulging in
selective recollections of the past. The isolation of the character from the world around him is only increased by self-delusion as he refuses to recognize what is really wrong in his life.

Thus, the function of the memory scenes are twofold. They are first expository in that they contain information about the character’s past life. Second, they are analytical as they explain his situation by showing its underlying causes in the past choices of the character. These latter are socially and culturally determined since they are fostered by a set of values fixed by a system seen to be oppressive and deceptive. Information about Willy’s past also sheds light on his son Biff whose character is shaped by his father’s obsessive interference, thus preparing the ground for the father-son relationship to occupy a central place.

More importantly, and as long as Willy is concerned, the memory scenes are necessary in the dramatization of a continuous psychological process, as they show Willy increasingly sinking into emotional and mental alienation. It also becomes apparent along the play that what is at stake is Biff’s as much as Willy’s psychological balance. The action propels the elder son to the role of a potential agent of change as he realizes that it is vital for his own as well as his father’s redemption that the latter be brought back to reality. Within the tragic structure of the play, the memory scenes constitute an episode in Willy’s tragic struggle not to collapse in defeat and to maintain a sense of dignity through re-visiting what he sees as a glorious past.

A place for recognition

The encounter between Willy and his sensitive neighbor Bernard offers a first glimpse at recognition as the only process by which things might change. It is then duplicated at a more emotional and dramatic level in the encounter between father and son. Recognition resulting from a confrontation within a domestic conflict is a key element in the plays of the two most important contemporaries of Miller: Tennessee Williams, and Edward Albee. In such plays as Cat of a Hot Tin Roof and Who’s Afraid of Virginia Woolf, confrontation is instrumental in stirring a numbed conscience and extracting the individual from the trap of fantasy and illusion. The process involves a character whose fate is tied to the chief protagonist (George in Who’s afraid of Virginia Woolf and Big Daddy in Cat on a Hot Tin Roof). This is the role that, in Death of a Salesman, Bernard undertakes for some time before Biff in turn does. In a kind of interrogation that sounds in keeping with his newly established image as a prominent lawyer, Bernard questions Willy about a precise fact in the past which underlies Biff’s abject stance in life but to which Willy remains insensitive. The scene stands as an ironic counterpart to all the scenes of the past lived individually by Willy. For the first time in the play, the past can no longer be a refuge for Willy’s faltering mind but is at the heart of a possibly factual recognition, which might awake him to his present realities. This casual confrontation is nevertheless inconclusive and is interrupted before reaching a possible turning point and this is where Death of a Salesman differs from the other two plays.

Rather than bringing a resolution to the psychoanalytical process, the play takes a turn towards a tragic ending that gives a tragic resolution to the social theme. The last confrontation between Biff and Willy is not conclusive even though it is prepared for by the emphasis on the great intensity of the relationship between father and son. Willy seems to stand at the crossroad of a
psychologically redeeming process and an ultimate form of alienation that is suicide. The play emphasizes the presence of the two alternatives. For a certain time, hope is raised for Willy’s awakening yet it is frustrated by his repeated failure to respond to or understand Biff. Fixed on the idea of redeeming himself from the unbearable perspective of what he sees as undeserved failure, his mind is incapable of seeing things in any terms other than material achievement. Redemption is for him in an act of self-sacrifice that, as he tells his dead brother Ben in yet another hallucination scene towards the end of the second act, can change “all the aspects”.

Unlike the plays of Tennessee Williams and Edward Albee, the psychological process in *Death of a Salesman* is undercut by the play’s orientation towards a tragic end as it establishes Willy’s mental reactions as inevitably self-destructive. This functions as a tragic flaw leading to tragic blindness. The confrontation has fostered Biff as having an insight and recognition of which Willy seems incapable. This is one of the arguments put forward by some critics to deny the play its tragic status. However, such a view does not seem to take into account a major feature of the play that is the duality of its dramatic structure and effect. Biff is represented as a parallel center of interest to Willy in this phase of the action but it is obvious that it is Willy who is destined to the role of the central figure accomplishing the play’s tragic structure. Willy’s last act maintains the consistency of tragic blindness leading to his tragic end. The final scene is structured as to give the play the dimensions of tragedy. The element of identification and cathartic effect are ensured by the fact that Willy’s tragic end is brought about by feelings that are fully human and universal. The recognition element is associated with Biff and is retained to a post-tragic phase in the ‘Requiem’ scene. This double aspect marking the play’s resolution- Willy’s tragic blindness and Biff’s recognition is central to the play’s message about the individual versus the system theme, even though it constitutes in our sense, an element of weakness in the tragic structure.

In fact, the final scene is poignantly marked by the lonely figure of a man racing into his death with the exalted spirit of victorious achievement. Change and recognition seem insignificant and invalid since they would have been contradictory to a coherently developed psychological entity. In Willy’s perception, salvation from failure, guilt and self-betrayal can only be achieved through an act of self-sacrifice to signify his triumph upon life and the system. Arthur Miller seems to privilege here again a certain psychological realism. In the light of his characterization throughout the play, Willy Loman must not be capable of the insight and recognition allowed another character like his son Biff, yet he is not shown as the kind of man to surrender passively. Commenting on the tragic status of his play, Miller (1957) writes:

> I did not realize how few would be impressed by the fact that this man is actually a very brave spirit who cannot settle for half but must pursue his dream of himself to the end. … I thought it must be clear, even obvious, that this was no dumb brute heading mindlessly to his catastrophe. (p.34)

It is remarkable that the terms of the debate about tragedy seem to figure within the play itself. Biff shouts these words at Willy as he discovers his planned act:”What is this supposed to do, make a hero out of you? This supposed to make me sorry for you? (…) There’ll be no pity for you,
you hear it? No pity”(p.104). Earlier, the visiting figure of Ben has warned him: “It’s called a cowardly thing, William.” (p.100) But, it is in remaining alive that Willy would see himself as cowardly. Hallett (1978 p.21) links the inadequacy of the tragic role of Willy to the absence of transcendence consisting in what he describes as "something beyond human comprehension" in the hero’s tragic experience. However, Willy is certainly not destined to embody the transcendental type of tragic hero. The Hamlet dilemma of "to be or not to be" is for Willy easily resolved because transcendental "conscience" is not there to complicate his decision. Willy’s intellectual limitations indeed confirm his tragic flaw and sustain the meanings of his tragic role.

In the last scene, triumph is for the other characters merely the work of Willy’s fantasy and self-delusion, but in Willy’s soul and mind it is tangible and real enough as he says to the visiting Ben with the tone of exalted victory:

Oh, Ben, that’s the whole beauty of it! I see it like a diamond, shining in the dark, hard and rough, that I can pick up and touch in my hand. (Act II, p.100)

Most importantly, Willy gains tragic stature through the intensity of his experience as a human being who is left no other alternative but to seek assertion of his self and sense of dignity in suicide. It may be contended that Willy falls victim of his own delusions, but it is an undeniable fact that something of hubristic pride and bravery characterize him especially in the last scene. Indeed an essential aspect of his characterization as a tragic figure is the fact of being the common man while having a mythic image of himself and of his sons, and, as such, in Miller’s own words he “cannot settle for half”(1949 b p.2). His struggle to redeem himself and his son from defeat is what makes his tragic end ennobling and exalting, no matter how futile his attempt is.

The Requiem scene is in a certain sense, the element of weakness in the play’s dramatic structure and specifically the role attributed to Biff. In contrast to his father, Biff seems to be vindicated by a change he has undergone in his character and outlook. And it is through confronting reality that he achieves the self-knowledge he repeatedly stresses. However, although Willy is not allowed conventional anagnorisis, his character comprises an element of mystery and uniqueness that aggrandizes his tragic stature. He too struggles all along the play to face harsh reality but rather than withdraw or surrender, he chooses an ultimate act of self-assertion that is also an act of self-sacrifice and expression of love. Audiences naturally identify with his tragic plight as a man who, in Harold Bloom’s words “wants only to earn and to deserve the love of his wife and of his sons” and who is “self-slain not by the salesman’s dream of America, but by the universal desire to be loved by one’s own”(2007 p.38). The final tragic scene becomes the assertion of Willy’s true self and his tragedy exemplifies what Arthur Miller describes as “the tragedy of displacement” in which “the tragic dimension surfaces in the protagonist’s struggle for a lost personal identity displaced by the social mask” (Conversations, 347).

However, if the final scene in Willy’s life brings the play to a climax of tragic effect, the meanings associated with Willy’s tragic end and the intensity of its tragic effect are undermined
by the Requiem that comes as a post-tragic-end sequel to the play. Biff announces that he is going West to lead the kind of life he described in Act I in terms of a romantic longing which has always been one of Willy’s vaguely sensed dreams:

This farm I work on, it’s spring out there now, see? And they’ve got about fifteen new colts. There’s nothing more inspiring or beautiful than the sight of a mare and a new colt. And it’s cool there now, see? Texas is cool now, and it’s spring.  (Act I p.11)

This pastoral dream is about an America that is shown throughout the play to be superseded by an increasingly urban and commercial America. Biff also complains: “We don’t belong in this nuthouse of a city! We should be mixing cement on some open plain, or – or carpenters. A carpenter is allowed to whistle” (p.22). The son in fact withdraws from the social reality that his father has tragically confronted and the stance Biff finally assumes turns out to be an evasion of the conflict raised. The juxtaposition of two responses to this conflict that are opposed in nature is the source of weakness in the tragic construct. Had the tragedy been without the “Requiem”, it would have better preserved its unity and the coherence of its message.

To conclude, the domestic setting, and the dramatization of the everyday life of common people are elements that ground Death of a Salesman in modern realism and social drama more specifically. Yet, analysis shows that the play is meant to take on dimensions of tragedy that are essentially achieved through the turn of the action towards a tragic ending. Most importantly, the final act brings the play to a climax of tragic effect with the figure of its protagonist seeing in death the assertion of his self and the realization of his sense of dignity. The play succeeds in making social drama acquire the intensity and the universal cathartic effect of tragedy and this is perhaps the magic that lies behind its perennial appeal to audiences identifying with the experience of its hero. The controversy about the play as tragedy may never be closed but this paper came to the assertion that ‘tragedy as social drama’ is quite an accurate definition and interpretation of Miller’s play. Examination of the Requiem has revealed that such a post-tragic-end weakens the tragic effect, as it comprises an element of dramatic irony and ambivalence with the characters expressing their divergent responses to Willy’s death. Thus, Death of a Salesman gives evidence that a non-tainted resolution is necessary for the tragic construct to preserve the force of its effect and the coherence of its message. The temptation of the regenerative, perspective-opening ‘happy ending’ seems to lie behind the adding of such a post-tragic Requiem, making the play fluctuate between a wholly tragic from and a second ending that undermines the tragic effect.

Acknowledgements:
The authors would like to thank the Deanship of Scientific Research at Majmaah University for supporting this work under the project: (1440-89).

About the authors:
Tahar Bayouli is an assistant lecturer of English language and literature at the Department of English, Azzulfi College of Education, Majmaah University, KSA. He obtained his PhD from the
University of Paris West France in 1994. Thesis "The Image of the Orient in Elizabethan Drama". His research interests include drama, semiotics and orientalism.

Imed Samaali is currently a lecturer of English language and Applied Linguistics at the Department of English, Azzulfi College of Education, Majmaah University, KSA. He obtained his Master's Degree from the Faculty of letters, Arts and Humanities Manouba, Tunisia in 2011. He taught from 2011 to 2014 at the Higher School of Economic and Social Sciences of Tunis, Tunisia. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6173-8840

References:
Freeman, S. (2010).‘Tragedy after Darwin’ Comparative Drama 44 (2)
Grochaha, S. (2012). ‘Tragedy Now?’ In Visions of Tragedy in Modern American Drama Edited by David Pahna
Maeterlinck, Maurice: (1952) Le Trésor des Humbles, translated by K. Eliott Oxford
Sewall, R. B. (1954). “The Tragic Form” in Essays in Criticism 6 (October)
Steiner, G. (1961). The Death of Tragedy Faber and Faber London
Styan, J. L. (1968). The Dark Comedy Cambridge University Press
Kindness towards Others in Great Expectations

Saed Jamil Shahwan
Department of English, Faculty of Arts
Hail University, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
The novel, Great Expectation (1861) revolves around the universal theme of love and conflict, which influences the protagonist, Pip. Many critics have commented on the plot and background of the novel. The main aim of this study is to reveal various instances projecting kindness and sympathy in between the social conflict and social tension at the background of the novel “Great Expectation. The study will focus on the concept of kindness towards others which has been incorporated throughout the story of the novel between the narrator and the characters. Charles Dickens (1812-1870) has shed light upon the theme of social mobility, manners, social injustice and prospect towards tangible reality. This study answers the question whether Dickens could be able to reflect the concept of kindness in the novel or not? Moreover, it will search whether the concept of kindness has been explored well in the story of the novel that it contains probable educational contents of kindness for research. To prove that, the article will explore various aspects of kindness, which has been observed during the course of the novel. The study would be based on qualitative research method from secondary resources. The aspect of kindness would be analyzed and highlighted through multiple scenes from the novel. The study would be concluded on the point where Dickens stresses on the dialect for upgradation of social status in Pip in order to establish himself as a desired partner of Estella despite having a social difference of class during the Victorian period.

Keywords: Charles Dickens, dialect, expectations, kindness, mobility, social injustice, social tension

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.5
1. Introduction

1.1 Overview

It depends on the narrative pattern of an author, which reflects the concept of kindness in the roles of the characters. The inclusion of a simple and humble boy of the marginalized section at Victorian age in England represents an intellectual goal, an emulation of desirable moral and social values indicating the ideological shift in the creation of English identity in Dickens’s novels. The nature of gentleness and compassion survives in the protagonist of the novel, who takes the challenge of the society in every aspect to bring stability in his personal life. The concept of kindness, love and conflict and injustice mainly seems in the incidents present in the story. As stated by Sznycer et al, (2017), the incorporation of the idea of social mobility and kindness work hand-in-hand at the bottom of the story as drawn by Dickens. In addition, some critics believe that the progress of the boy justifies the class mobility of the mid-Victorian era of “great expectations”, which tries to demonstrate the struggle for existence in such a society. As opined by Petrunina, Gredina & Pilyukova (2017), it considers the fact that, the behavior of the narrator and the others and to the society is influential.

On the other hand, most of the novels written by Charles Dickens usually based on the concept of class mobility or social mobility and gentleness or kindness as stated by Runnells, (2017). Moreover, the other concept, which symbolizes within kindness, is the mobility of notion and lot of expectations dominantly present in the plot. However, it is the author’s contribution that has been skillfully prearranged keeping the mid-Victorian period at the backdrop intermingled with a complicated love story, which is not easy to achieve by any other writers.

1.2 Background

Dickens’s effort behind the story is to offer the readers a leaning towards the characters and the social circumstances that is spoken about. In fact, the author has clearly tried to make sure about the concept of kindness and thoughtfulness to be fulfilled even within the complexity of social tension during the period of mid-Victorian 1850 – 1899. Moreover, the author has also given importance to the fact that although the novel was published in the mid-Nineteenth Century, which was popularly known as a mid-Victorian age in history, should be valued as an educational masterpiece for many students. It is the art and skill of storytelling of the novelist, that binds the novel together by connecting with kindness and social conflict that is identified well in the core of the story (May 2017). Therefore, the kindness of love, affection, and the social conflict that are recognized in the novel, actually is translated into education. The boundary breaks between the author and the story in a point where all the extremes of kindness are enclosed.

1.3 Problem statement

The concept of kindness has not been openly discussed or subjugated in the storyline of the novel. Rather, Dickens has thrown an insight upon the concept in some of the incidents of the novel. In addition, the author touches the concept completely, when the boundary breaks between the narrator and the character itself. Therefore, the research and analysis of the novel will eventually identify the places, which focus on kindness, gentleness and the ground of sympathy played by the
characters. However, much of the reflection of kindness and sympathetic nature of the narrator has been portrayed in the opening scene of the novel, where readers study the graves of both his parents and all five of his brothers.

1.4 Research aim
The main aim of this study is to reveal various instances showing kindness and sympathy in between the social conflict and social tension at the background of the novel “Great Expectation.” The study and research will evidently provide appropriate information about the topic with justification.

1.5 Research questions
- Did the author Charles Dickens tries to focus on the concept of kindness and sympathy well in the novel?
- What are some of the evidence, which highlights the circumstances related to the above question?
- Do the social conflict and social mobility still remain when other roles are not in place?

1.6 Justification
The article will try to make probable findings based on the research made by secondary resources studied by others about the concept of kindness towards others in the novel “Great Expectation.” Throughout the article, there will be some review of a few instances, which will discuss kindness towards others in the novel. Moreover, the author will bring forward the concept of kindness towards others with clarity, as he is one of the graceful writers of his age. However, the article ensures that not a least of instances related to kindness laid back that can justify the concept of kindness presented in the novel.

2. Literature review
Great Expectations features some of Dickens’s best characters and the tone of his complex art of plot. Throughout the novel, the tune of generosity is felt and is reflected by the protagonist Pip and other characters as well. Dickens paints different shades of generosity and kindness with the help of various psychological and emotional aspects of his characters. At one place he states genuine kindness but at another place the meaning of it changes with a different understanding of it (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

The novel, with the vast presentation of the life of the boy named Pip, gradually depicts the transformation of his status, his expectation towards life, and his emotions towards people. Being a protagonist of the novel, Pip carries the responsibilities to shape up the main tunes of the novel. Among the main tunes of the novel, generosity may claim to be one of the most reflected tunes as it defines Pip’s character with its way (Clarke 2018). Throughout the novel, Pip shows his care for others even when he is seen to be cruel towards his brother-in-law and his second wife. Throughout the novel, the journey of Pip in both spiritual and emotional aspect is depicted thoroughly.
If the story is thoroughly followed, a series of incidents will come out that refers the kindness and generosity towards others (Barr, 2018).

The incident where Pip is seen to bring Magwitch a bottle of brandy and a generous assortment of food, consisting of mincemeat, meat-bone, bread, cheese, and pork pie, can claim to play an important role to carry the tone of kindness (Panou, 2018). Tough Pip is acting out of terror, but he also feels pity for the wretched man who seems to starve for days. He shows how fear wins over kindness when he decides to serve the wretched man ignoring all his fear. He can easily ignore that person out of his safety as he is completely unknown and suspicious too, but he did not, and thus, so tenderly, he paves the path of kindness in the novel (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

In book 1, chapter 19, Pip is seen to be sympathetic towards the poor fellows while passing the church and he promises himself that he would do something for them one day and would form a plan for a dinner of roast beef and plum pudding, a pint of ale, and a gallon of condescension upon everybody in the village (Clarke 2018).

The relationship between Pip and his friend Herbert is also essential to be mentioned here in this respect. The way Pip contributes to his friend’s career growth secretly, his friend too, is seen to help him continuously through his entire struggle (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

Moreover, Pip’s love affection for Estella is also important to discuss here, as it is one of the products of his kindness for a human. Estella’s behavior towards Pip at very first interaction is noticeable. Under the surface of courtesy, she literally ignores him out of her proud nature as well as social status (Panou, 2018). Not only that, she continued her ignorance throughout the novel. However, that does not stop Pip to love her. Even after achieving the social and economic transformation, he nourishes that feeling for her and it takes the ultimate form when he accepts her by marrying Widow Estella (Clarke, 2018).

Pip’s kindness again appears when he forgives Miss Havisham in spite of receiving many cruel approaches from her. She is even seen to plot against him full of evil plans, and she does not leave any scope to humiliate him (Barr, 2018). However, towards the end of the novel, Miss Havisham repents on what she did and comes to him with a full heart expectation to get forgiveness and Pip, with his kind heart, is seen to give her so. It should be mention here that revelation of the truth behind Estella’s birth that her father is none other than Magwitch himself, somehow motivates him to do so (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

In addition, it can be stated as the example of kindness that the orphan children like Pip, Estella and Biddy are found to be fortunate enough to have people around them to care for. Pip gets kind and affectionate assistance from his brother-in-law Joe (Panou, 2018). On the other hand, Estella, in spite of being orphan gets a lavish life with reflects her mother’s passionate love and kindness for her. Then comes the example of Biddy getting social growth after her marriage with Joe (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

Though the examples that are stated above shows the kindness in the vein of the novel, it is also undeniable that Dickens represents several understandings of service among the characters.
(Clarke 2018). Pip’s first kindness for the convict can be stated as the product of his fear, where Provis's understanding of generosity is to devote his life for Pip's future entirely. Again, Mr. Joe and uncle Pumblechook, though being kind, are fonder of being type than being acting kindly. For them, generosity is a status maker (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018).

However, with the course of time and the flow of the novel Pip’s maturity develops and approaches to getting a concrete shape and his early ingratitude towards Joe and Provis evolves into deep appreciation. Not only that these two men inspire him as well and he is seen to devote himself to Provis in part III (Clarke, 2018).

It would not be justified if another most important character that depicts kindness in a completely selfless manner would not be mentioned here. Magwitch, one of the aspects of Dickens’s Great expectation, having a different upbringing, makes so many bad choices in his life (Lopez, Pedrotti & Snyder, 2018). He has severe criminal records as well and almost in half of the entire novel, he is seen to be imprisoned. Later he realized his errors in life and devoted himself to Pip's life unconditionally at the time of need.

3. Methodology
The article is based on the study and analysis of the secondary source of data collected from internet, journals, articles, and books. A qualitative method of approach has been followed during the research and study of the topic. Therefore, it includes various arguments and perspectives of authors collected from other researchers that have been analyzed and utilized with innovation in the article.

4. Research findings
The research clearly depicts the very concept of kindness at the beginning of the novel itself. Dickens's is all conscious about kind behavior showing love and sympathy towards others in the novel. Kindness is evidently present in the chance encounter of Pip with the convict Magwitch at the beginning of the novel. The moment, when the convict puts up with a question of the family details in a rough way was still answered truthfully and respectfully by the young Pip. In addition, Pip seems to have revealed some good spirit and manners with kindness in his nature that gains the readers’ attention. Moreover, on his second meeting with the convict, Pip offers food to the convict and the convict accepts the food showing gracious thanks to Pip. Later, the convict protects Pip by filing himself for stealing the food. Such kindness and affection towards a childlike Pip shown by the convict Magwitch gains respect in the eyes of the readers (Seal, 2015).

In fact, during the course of the novel, when Dickens brings a change in the nature of Pip and reveals him as a Gentleman figure in the society, it once again wins the heart of the readers despite being born and brought up within the hardships of life. It was Pip’s loyalty and sincerity towards Magwitch that has created compassion for Magwitch and rekindled the love for his lost daughter at the end of the novel. Moreover, Pip has learned to appreciate Magwitch's humanity as well as he feels ashamed of showing thanklessness towards Joe and Biddy before. Therefore, the novel ends with not only showing kindness in the relationship between Pip and Convict and his final reconciliation with Joe and Biddy, but also kindness and love have been revealed at the end
from Estella towards Pip after her painful suffering in her conjugal life with her brutal husband. In addition, Pip forgiving Miss Havisham, after a span of long years shows respect for the sake of his love Estella, finds a great social stature as a Gentleman in the society.

The novel runs with the functions of Bildungsroman by using many tropes of gothic romance invoking ambiguity and saddened love in the story. Dickens has criticized the educational system and the legal system of Britain during the time of the Victorian period that has been juxtaposed in the underlying theme of the novel. A typical Victorian sympathy lies in the tone of the novel. The father of modernized novels ensures that Dickens use of theory and style of writing goes in the same manner as reflected in the novel itself. The author’s use of the concept of kindness effectively in the relation of the protagonist with the other characters finely justifies Dickens’s use of theories.

5. Discussion

Pip is the central character of the novel despite his several mistakes committed in the course of action placed in the novel. It is the characteristics and significant changes in his psychology after being encountered with various incidents and reality of life has won the heart of the readers at the end as stated by Hammond, (2016). Pip and the Convict Magwitch and Estella are the three main characters around whom the novel revolves on and they show kindness in the novel. From the conversation of Pip with Magwitch reveals out the fact that he has sympathy and kindness towards the poor class of the society. In fact, it was Pip who realizes the pain of the convict itself and another similar fate as himself. That was the reason why Pip could empathize with the pain and suffering of Magwitch.

On the other hand, as per Clarke, (2018), it was Pip’s crave for getting education and knowledge that enables him to see the status difference between him and Estella mainly due to Miss Havisham was rather a sense of revenge reflecting in Pip’s nature in order to show social status in front of Estella. Although, Miss Havisham knew well that the subversive potential of education might bring a feeling of subjugation towards the lower class or might be even more dangerous. However, in the later part of the novel situations and reality made Pip learned some big lessons of gratitude and sympathy for all sections despite gathering education. Moreover, as per Lee, (2016), Pip believes the fact that kindness comes from the instinctive nature of a human being, not from social status. Therefore, such a sense of maturity has gained a lasting impression on the nature of Pip. Similarly, the readers gain a good intuition about Magwitch and Estella for her father and Pip. Dickens knew well about his endeavor of what he is going to show in the characters. Despite certain mistakes in Pip’s life, the nature of kindness did not misplace in the novel. It was rightly placed through some significant changes in Pip, Magwitch, and Estella as well.

6. Conclusion

Charles Dickens does an implausible job in his novel giving us the opportunity to peep into the life of three main characters in the book. The theme of social injustice, mobility and kindness, and expectations to become successful has been well portrayed in the novel. There is no feeling of resentment seen in Pip and he accepts the society as the way it is, as he no longer stands as a
marginalized member and his new position as a colonial businessperson conforms to the English society in the East. For the time being, the novel loses its focus from kindness in the nature of Estella and Magwitch but later it brings back the concept with much equality among these three main characters. However, it states that the society is mobilizing and therefore, there is social mobility. Dickens captures the condition of society during the mid-Victorian period and looks into the lifestyle of the English society.

About the author
Dr. Saed Jamil Shahwan is an associate Professor of English Literature in the Department of English Language, Faculty of Arts of Hail University. He teaches many subjects in the field of English Literature. He published many articles in many international journals.

References


Unraveling the System of Representation of the Colonizer in E. M. Forster’s A Passage to India (1924) and Louis Bertrand’s La Cina (1901)

Fatima BENSIDHOUM
English Department
Faculty of Letters and Languages, University of Mouloud Mammeri
Tizi Ouzou, Algeria

Abstract
The main focus of this research paper is to study one of the key concepts of postcolonial critical theory which is “Identity and Representation”. It is based upon a textual reading and analysis of two texts as representatives of colonial literature written about British-India and French-Algeria, namely A Passage to India by E.M. Forster and La Cina by Louis Bertrand. Relying on Albert Memmi’s foundational postcolonial theory developed in his The Colonizer and the Colonized, we assume that both texts obey and reflect a similar ideological discourse. The narratives are revealed to operate through a complex system which tends to (re)fashion and to (re)mold the identity of both the colonizer and the colonized. We demonstrate that Forster and Bertrand shape the main characters into two types which Memmi labels as: ‘the Colonizer who Accepts’ and ‘the Colonizer who Refuses’. We have also showed that the writers though belonging to different imperial powers and writing in two different languages, they could not but adhere and support the colonial practices of their countries. What comes also of this study is that Forster, though most often known for his Liberalism, vehicles a racial discourse which accounts for the superiority of the British colonizer. Bertrand is much more racist and jingoist, his attitudes are reminders of what Achebe said about Conrad; ‘a bloody racist’.

Key Words: A Passage to India, colonial discourse, E.M. Forster, identity, La Cina, Louis Bertrand, representation, ‘the colonizer who accepts’, ‘the colonizer who refuses.’

Cites as: BENSIDHOUM, F. (2019). Unraveling the System of Representation of the Colonizer in E. M. Forster’s A Passage to India (1924) and Louis Bertrand’s La Cina (1901). Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 3 (2) 56-65.
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.6
Introduction

“The colonial situation manufactures both the colonialists, just as it manufactures the colonized” (Memmi, 1974, p. 56). The thrust of the present study is to read two representative texts of colonial literature through the Memmian concepts exposed in his foundational critical book *The Colonizer and the Colonized*. The literary works that we intend to shed light on are E. M. Forster’s *A Passage to India* (1924) and Louis Bertrand’s *La Cina* (1901). What we intend to demonstrate is that literature, be it English or French, is an ‘Invisible Bullet’—using Greenblatt words— that acts as an ideological weapon to support and accompany colonialism. Literature, as Edward Said (1993) rightly contends cannot be politically innocent. The issues of identity and representation of the colonizer in the respective novels are to be analyzed with special focus on the ideological outlooks of both writers. In the discussion below, we explore the discourse of identity in the colonial context and its intricate relationship with what Memmi recognizes as ‘the Colonizer who Accepts’ and ‘the Colonizer who Refuses. Hopefully, we are to prove that the writings devoted to British-India and French-Algeria, as the sample texts disclose, vehicle and operate through a similar ideological stance which shapes and forges the image of the colonizer to obey the exigencies of imperialism.

To our best knowledge, little attention to date has been accorded to the study of both writers and their works together. No study has been developed or joined the two works despite the fact that they are loaded with significant insights which make them paramount in studying issues related to colonial literature written about British-India and French-Algeria. Indeed, the present study focuses and is particularly interested in exploring the way Forster and Bertrand work through their novels to depict the colonial system as engaged in (re)furbishing, (re)molding and (re)shaping the identity of the colonizer. The analysis is, as said, conducted following the theoretical auspices of Memmi’s critical canon.

Discussion

1)- Memmi’s Notion of ‘The Colonizer who Accepts’ in the Novels

Memmi defines ‘the colonizer who accepts’ as the colonizer who accepts his role as usurper because of his illegitimate privilege. The theorist assigns the term “colonialist” to the colonizer who agrees to be a colonizer. He maintains that this type “will defend his role and must absolve himself by demonstrating the merits of his culture and the faults of the native’s” (1974, p.52). Memmi (1974) also states that the way in which the colonialist wants to see himself plays a considerable role in the emergence of his final portrait.

*A Passage to India* and *La Cina* displays two devotees of the colonialist ideology who put no avail to embrace the new identity it imposes. Both Ronny and Claude are young men who easily adopt the colonial situation and act according to its principles. The change which is entailed by the move and the establishment in the colony is part and parcel of colonialism. Memmi contends that the identity of the colonizer undergoes a radical change by the new role and status colonialism confers to the colonizer: “being a mediocre man in his country, the colonizer suddenly turns to a master, giving orders, earning money which he cannot dream about, having facilities at his disposal” (p.53). The colonizer in the colony enjoys privileges that he never dreamt of in his
homeland. Ronny, the protagonist of *A Passage*, becomes the City Magistrate in India. He is portrayed as a ‘farouche’ and diehard colonialist whose engagement and commitment to the ethos of British imperialism are unshaken. Mrs Moore is even shocked at the metamorphosis of her son: “The traces of young’s man humanitarianism had sloughed off” and deemed that “one touch of regret…would have made him a different man, and the British Empire a different institution” (Forster, 1979, p. 42). After the Bridge Party, the old woman reproaches the way Ronny treats the Indians. She remarks addressing him: “you never used to judge people like this at home”. Ronny asserts that “India isn’t home” and vehemently uses phrases and arguments that the narrator qualifies as “picked up from older officials” (p. 26) and as belonging to the British order. When turning to Bertrand’s novel, the change is rather announced and applauded right at the beginning of the narrative. Claude and Michèle headed to Algeria hoping for a new practical life far from the ‘isms’ of a sterile existence of the French society in the closing years of the 1890’s. Both young men are inclined to action and convinced of ‘la nécessité d’agir’ and sought an active, fruitful life: “nous sommes enervés d’émotions factices, accablés de science stérile […] Il faut tout jeter à bas, il faut tout jeter à bas, il faut nous refaire de font en comble […] Il faut nous refaire: Nous referons là-bas!” (Bertrand, 1901, p.5) [“We are fed up of false emotions, overwhelmed with sterile science […] We have to throw everything down, We have to throw everything down, we have to rebuild ourselves from top to bottom […] We have to do it again: we'll do it again!”]. Claude asserted.

In fact, the move to Algeria is heralded to bring a remarkable change in the destiny of Claude and Michèle who are initially described as educated and learned. The narrator stresses the fact that the protagonists lead a passive and monotonous life in France devoid of practicality and serious engagement. Their lives are, as held by them, ‘spoilt’ with idealism and abstractism of science, religion and art. The new colony provided for both a new existence and a promising future. Michele inherited a large estate from his father General Botterie, almost two thousand hectares, and a villa in Tipaza built in a Roman style. He is also encouraged to apply for candidacy as a deputy of Algiers and is thus offered many opportunities to emerge as a well-established politician who enjoyed both the power of money and influence. Claude, on his behalf, having sold his land in Lorraine, wanted to invest his money in a thriving business. In this context, Memmi (1974) asserts that the change involved in moving to a colony must first of all bring a substantial profit and the best possible definition of a colony is:

A place where one earns more and spends less. You go to a colony because jobs are guaranteed, wages high, careers more rapid and business more profitable. The young graduate is offered a position, the public servant a higher rank, the businessman substantially lower taxes, the industrialist raw materials and labor at attractive prices (p. 48)

In their work, both Forster and Randau maintained that India and Algeria, respectively, are to trace and to forge a new identity but also a distinctive personality to their characters. Ronny and Claude underwent a metamorphosis that made even their close relatives hardly recognize them. Besides his mother who recognizes in her son a different man, Adela also notices the big change in Ronny and declares that “India had developed sides of his character that she had never admired. His self-complacency, his censoriousness, his lack of subtlety” (Forster, 1979, p. 68). In addition,
Claude is to be reproached by his close friend Michèle who accuses him of opportunism and corruption; he even breaks relation with him: “Il me fait horreur ton opportunisme morale […] Va_t’en, faux ami! Va_t’en! Je te chasse!” (Bertrand, 1901, p. 314). [How awful is your moral opportunism […] Go, fake friend! Go! I'm chasing you!]

In contrast to Ronny’s strong and faithful support of colonialism, the individualism and humanism of Mrs Moore and Adela are rejected because they endanger the ethos and principles of the British colonial system. Their insistence on having relation with the Indians and their sympathy with them is seen as a threat to the social order based on racism. When Mrs Moore tells her son about her discussion with Aziz, Ronny inquires about the feelings of the doctor in an attempt to assess the potential threat he would represent:

Did you gather he was well-disposed?” Ignorant of the force of this question, she replied. Yes, quite, after the first moment.” “I mean, generally. Did he seem to tolerate us—the brutal conqueror, the sun-dried bureaucrat, that sort of thing? (Italics added) (Forster, 1979, p.25)

The italicized words denote that the colonizer is aware of the ‘other’s’ gaze to him as a usurper. The same attitude is also found in La Cina when Sidi Brahim, an assimilated native, is thought to hide hostile feelings towards the colonizer: “Qui sait les pensées qui couvent au fond de son coeur? Vous prétendez qu'il est comme tous les Arabes, que son silence ne cache que le vide ou la vanité puérile. Qu’en savez vous?... Mais il peut se lever un jour contre vous, ce petit fils de l’Emir” (Bertrand, 1901, p. 370). [“Who knows the thoughts that smoulder at the bottom of his heart? You claim that he is like all Arabs, that his silence hides only the emptiness or the childish vanity. What do you know?... But he may rise one day against you, this little son of the Emir”]. The colonizer assumes a negative approach and endorses a series of negations towards the colonized that, according to him, can never be fully scrutable. He is constantly suspected, challenged and opposed in the least insignificant action.

To justify colonization, false images need to be created so that the subjugation makes sense. These images become the identity of the colonized. Memmi (1974) notes that “one after another, all the qualities which make a man of the colonized crumble away” (p. 129). One universal image that has been associated with the native people is the fatalistic laziness. The Indians in A Passage are said to be with parasitic tendencies owing to their ‘indolence’. Aziz is thought pretending illness by Ronny and Major Callendar who sent Panna Lal to inquire after him. The narrator’s and Major Callendar’s views amount to the same as regards Oriental behavior: “Major Callendar always believed the worst of natives” (Forster, 1979, p. 93). The elaborated image of the lazy is also found in Bertrand. The Alsacian landowner Emile Schirrer expresses his belief in the ingratitude of the Arabs who, according to him, are irredeemably indolent. When his foreman Julie Berton informs him about the absence of two workers, he immediately orders for their dismissal: “régelez leur compte ce soir et vous me les flanquerez à la porte![…]. D’ailleurs ils sont continueulement en ripailles. Quant se n’est pas la fête du Mouton, c’est la fete de la Grenade…Ça
n’en finit plus” [give them their due tonight and kick them out! [...] Besides, they’re always on holiday. When it is not the Festival of the Sheep, it is the Feast of Grenada... It never ends] (Bertrand, 1901, p. 400). Laziness is obviously seen as constitutional in the very nature of the colonized for whatever they may undertake, whatever zeal they may apply could never be anything but lazy.

Three factors typify the colonizer according to Memmi. These are profit, privilege and usurpation (p.48). Forster and Bertrand invest them in their characters that embody the shallowness of the white men’s burden. The colonizers claim that they have the mission of “bringing light to the colonised’s ignominious darkness” (pp. 74-76). Hence, Ronny announces that “we’re out here to do justice and keep the peace. Them’s my sentiments”. A pretention to which Mrs Moore protest saying:

“Your sentiments are those of a god.” [...] Trying to recover his temper, he said, ‘India likes gods.’ ‘And Englishmen, like posing as gods’ [...] and the country’s got to put up with us, gods or no gods [...]’ [...] We’re not pleasant in India and don’t intend to be pleasant. We’ve something more important to do’ (Forster, 1924, p. 41)

So, under the cloak of bringing civilization and order, Ronny and through him, the British colonizer justifies his acts and policies. When, for example, the Mohurram troubles take place, Ronny feels elated because the riots “proved that the British were necessary to India; there would certainly have been bloobshed without them” (p. 82). Undoubtedly, what is at stake in his assertion is the fact that the Indians are in a dire need of the British to install justice and peace, for ‘without them the country is in a state of total chaos and disorder’. Perhaps the most significant and revealing instance which accounts for the hypocrisy of the civilization mission is the one encompassed in Ronny’s words when his mother expresses her compassion and sympathy with the Indians saying that “India is part of the earth. And God has put us on the earth in order to love our neighbours and to show it, and He is omnipresent, even in India, to see how we are succeeding” (p. 42). Ronny answers without hiding his arrogance allowing the narrator’s comment that he “approved of religion as long as it endorsed the National Anthem, but he objected when it attempted to influence his life” (p. 43). Thus, as Abu Baker asserts “Ronny’s religion only conforms to the needs of the Empire” (2006, p. 78) which fosters the discrepancy between the colonizer and the colonized at a great scale to insure its permanence.

A similar civilization discourse enrobed in politics and religion is also to find its echoes in La Cina wherein Bertrand adopts a purely racist stance. The archbishop Monseigneur Puig incarnates to a great extent the Memmian conception of the colonizer which is pushed to its extreme. Throughout the novel, Mgr Puig is cast plotting, conspiring and planning to achieve purposes which are too far from those assigned to the church. The opportunist and profiteering spirit of the archbishop is made apparent when concerting with the Abbey Lalouette about the elections and the inherent profit they would gain in terms of allies and material gain. Having already the first candidate Carmelo in their hands “celui-là est à nous: avec de l’argent on en fera tout ce que l’on voudra!” [This one is ours: with money we will do whatever we want!] (Bertrand, 1901, p. 249), they planned to have the second candidate Michele and the third one Delieu and the
means to that end were immoral. In fact, Mgr Puig hankered after Michel’s land and was too ambitious to enlarge the church properties; he even wanted to turn against him Father Lechapeller and the Jesuits of Lyon that supported his candidacy in case of refusal to sell him his estate. The abbey Lalouette states: “On pourrait lui démontrer que cette candidature serait préjudiciable au parti, qu’il se trompe sur le compte de M. Botteri, que ce jeune homme n’est pas un catholique sérieux …” [“It could be shown that this nomination would be detrimental to the party, that it is mistaken on Mr. Botteri's account, that this young man is not a serious Catholic...] but if he accepted “ sans le mettre en avant, nous lui ferons donner de l’eau bénite de cour par l’Espérance, notre journal ” [“ without putting him forward, we will give him holy water from the Courtyard by l’Espérance, our newspaper”] (Bertrand, 1901, p.249). Mgr Puig harshly criticises the Cardinal Mgr Lespèse because of his commitment to convert the non-Christian with peaceful ways. For him the primary mission of the church is not to spread Christianity but to serve France and its “oeuvre civilisatrice’. He declares:

Le devoir de l’église est tout tracé, c’est ce people neuf qu’il s’agit de conquérir et non les sauvages […] Commençons par être riche et par posséder. Thésaurisons au lieu de jeter notre argent par les fenêtres pour l’émerveillement des badauds ! Ce pays qui nait a besoin de crédit pour s’outiller—supplantons les Juifs, ouvrons notre bourse aux colons, dont nous sommes surs en n’exigeant d’eux qu’un intérêt modéré […] Quand on a besoin d’argent, on ne regarde pas d’où il vient. (p. 262)

[The duty of the Church is all traced, it is this new people that it is to conquer and not the Savages […] Let's start by being rich and owning. Hoarding instead of throwing our money out of the Windows for the amazement of the onlookers! This country that is born needs credit to equip itself — supplant the Jews, open our purse to the settlers, of which we are sure, requiring only a moderate interest […] When you need money, you don't look where it comes from ] (Italics added)

The last chapter entitled ‘Le Concile de Carthage’ [The Council of Carthage] emphasizes and shows Mrg Puig as the embodiment of a mature colonizer who succeeds in achieving his goals. He was promoted to cardinalship and thanks to his tricky schemes, he gained government’s privilege and was granted three thousand hectares.

Thus, Forster and Bertrand through Ronny, Claude and Mgr Puig respectively, supply a full portrayal of the colonizers who not merely accept colonialism but further its ends and support its practices. Still, colonialism is a complex situation which also gives birth to another type of ‘colonizers who refuse’, the instances of which are also to be found in both A Passage to India and La Cina.

2)- The Concept of ‘The Colonizer who Refuses’ in the Novels

In contrast with the notion of “colonialist who accepts”, the “colonialist who refuses” is the one who “having discovered the economic, political and moral scandal of colonization, he can no longer agree become what his fellow citizens have become; he decides to remain, vowing not to accept colonization” (Memmi, 1974, p.56). This type of colonizers is to find its corresponding
example in Cyril Fielding and Michele Boterie in *A Passage to India* and *La Cina* respectively. The two characters fail to conform to the standards and adopt the ideologies of their countrymen. They prefer, either to side with the colonized, as it is the case of Fielding or, simply to remain indifferent with regards to the positive attitude of Michel.

Cyril Fielding refuses change and colonization and believes in racial friendship which makes him at odds with his British fellowmen. His belief that the world “is a globe of men who are trying to reach one another and can best do so by the help of goodwill plus culture and intelligence” was “a creed ill suited to Chandrapore” (p.52). In the same way, Michel who is initially zealous to change and ‘la nécessité d’agir, the necessity of action, fails to be like Claude and his fellows who embrace the colonial system and lived in accordance to its rules. He, for instance, rejects the opportunistic political schemes which his countrymen wanted him to be thrust so as to take advantage: “Tous les partis se confondent dans une égale malhonneteté. Tous se trainent dans une même bassesse, tout ont peur des idées! ” [All parties merge into equal dishonesty. They are all base and corrupt, all are afraid of ideas!] (Bertrand, 1901, p. 313). So, both of them feel and resist the injustice underlying the colonial situation in the name of a self-centered set of principles which resisted any adjustment.

Both Fielding and Michel do not have the racial feeling or antipathy their countrymen feel and show towards the Indian and the Algerian respectively. This attitude is quintessential in the colonial world to assure its permanence. In *A Passage to India*, Fielding befriends the Indians and takes the side of Dr Aziz when he was accused of attempting to rape Adela Quested. The narrator accounts for this saying that: “Fielding had no racial feeling...because he had matured in a different atmosphere, where the herd-instinct does not flourish” (Forster, 1979, p. 52). The “herd-instinct,” understood as the tendency to group oneself with ones fellows, is made apparent in Aziz’s charge because Fielding/the colonizer, who is supposed to share the views of his countrymen, prefers to take the defense of Aziz/ the colonized. Mc Bryde is surprised that Fielding “had not rallied to the banner of race” (p.146) as a reaction to the supposed rape of Adella and warns him that “there’s no room for well-personal views. The man who doesn’t toe the line is lost” (p.152). The Collector even reprimands him saying: “You can’t run with the hare and hunt with the hounds, at least not in this country”(p. 166). Likewise, in *La Cina*, Michele does not show derision or contempt towards the colonized. He even takes side with the persecuted Jews who undergoes harsh treatment and persecution during the anti-jewish crisis of the 1890’s. Perhaps the most important proof which attests for this is his thrust to defend an old Jew who is beaten by a frenzy crowd of anti-Semite students, thus acting against the principles of his own people. Michel even reacts against his own party which advocated and supported the anti-Jewish movement.

Memmi maintains that “humanitarian romanticism is looked upon in the colonies as a serious illness, the worst of all dangers” (p. 66). Consequently, the colonizer who has this illness suffers from the scorn and contempt of the other colonizers: “he is considered nothing but a traitor [...] His friends will become surly; his superiors will threaten him; even his wife will join and cry” (Ibid). Fielding is suspected of conspiracy and is blamed of the Mohurram troubles, he is even thought to be “a Japenese spy” (p. 218). Likewise, Michel suffers from the misjudgment and
ridicule. Mgr Puig considers him “un reveur, un dilettante, un catholique amateur, ayant des idées à lui—des idées absurdes” [“a dreamer, a dilettante, an Catholic enthusiast, having ideas to him — absurd ideas”] (p. 249). His close friend, Claude, quarrelles and breaks relation with him in a significant verbal tiraillade saying: “ta lacheté devant la vie m’indigne. Tu es une loque, tu es le déchet d’une génération… [your cowardice towards life disgust me. You are a wreck, you are the outcast of a generation] (p. 314). Even his wife reprimands and denounces him as a fake individual (358). Thus both characters suffer from their own humanitarian attitudes towards the colonized and are looked upon as endangering the colonial system because of their compassion and sympathy.

Both Fielding and Michele are rejected and marginalized against because of their humanistic attitude towards the colonized and the persecuted minority. Their refusal to adopt the same positions like their countrymen cost them a lot. Fielding is thought to “inspire confidence until he spoke”. The reader is warned of “an evil of brains in India, but woe to him through whom they are increased” (p. 52). Fielding, himself, is aware of the doubt and suspicion he inspires owing to his friendship with Aziz and his fair sentiments towards the Indians. “He regretted taking sides. To slink through India unlabelled was his aim. Henceforward he would be called ‘anti-British’ ‘seditious’-terms that bored him, and diminished his utility” (p. 155). The same goes with Michele who is condemned as a weak and effeminate individual, as someone who remains imprisoned in the past. He is deemed too sentimental and romantic to face reality or live in accordance with the prevailing events.

To refuse an ideology while continuing to live with its actual relationship,’ Memmi asserts, makes the colonizer live “his life under the sign of contradiction.” Contradiction deprives the colonizer “of all coherence and all tranquility” because “he participates in and benefits from those privileges which he half-heartedly denounced” (p.52). Thanks to his new status, Michele becomes a rich landowner who owns, by right of inheritance, two thousand hectares of a fertile land and a beautiful villa in Tipaza. But this does not grant him peace of mind and conscience because he, unlike Claude, refuses to deal with politics and to thrust himself in fructifying and enlarging his wealth. His withdrawal from candidacy and most outstandingly his decision to sell his land denote his inability to live in tune with the colonizer’s policy of exploitation. This is in a way or in another a tacit refusal of colonization and its practices. Indeed, unlike Fielding who ends with regaining or joining the camp of his countrymen espousing an Anglo-Indian, Michele breaks with his close friend, abandons politics and sell his large estate.

Though suffering from “humanitarian romanticism”, the colonizer, who refuses colonization, cannot get rid of the superiority complex. In other words, he “cannot help judging the colonized and their civilization”. “How can one deny that they are under-developed, that their customs are oddly changeable and their culture outdated?” The colonizer “admits to a fundamental difference between the colonized and himself” (p.22-25). In Forster’s novel, Fielding, who sympathizes with the Indians and who befriends Dr Aziz, cannot help but feeling a fundamental difference. He does not, or rather, cannot equate himself with the Indians. Several instances in the novel account for this. For instance, Aziz’s remark that Adela practically has no breasts makes
Fielding feel uneasy: “this deprived sensuality...was alien to his own emotions, and he felt a barrier between himself and Aziz whenever it arose” (p. 214). The same barrier is also felt when Fielding sent his Indian friends postcards from Venice. The narrator asserts that Fielding “feels that all of them would miss the joy he experienced now, the joy of form, and that this constituted a serious barrier” (p.250).

In La Cina, Bertrand, unlike Forster, does not bother to show the feeling of the colonizer towards the colonized because for him the colonized is of little importance. Bertrand not merely relegates the Algerians into an inferior position but, he completely eradicates and debars them from the scope of his novels. In this respect, Maurice Ricord contends that: “Nous savons qu’il ne faut pas chercher dans l’oeuvre de Louis Bertrand, ni l’Islam, ni l’indigène” (1947, p. 204-205) [“We know that we should not look in the works of Bertrand neither for Islam nor for the indigene”] Bertrand, does strongly reject and maintain the racial superiority of the European over the non-European. The author puts no avail in expressing his view against naturalization or assimilation of the ‘natives’. His characters express vehemently the belief in the absurdity of this policy. When an anti-Semitic discussion is held in Michel’s villa whereby all the guests consider the illogicality of assimilation and express their racial hatred towards both the Arabs and the Jews, Duranti de la Bégasrière maintains that assimilation is a vain sentimentality: “l’Arabe est inassimilable [...] Les Arabes, il n’en faut plus!...” [The Arabs are inassimilable [...] The Arabs are to be irrevocably excluded...] (p. 191). Another guest, Prince de Lamballe, thoroughly condemns assimilation because for him: “L’Arabe est comme le Juif !”, “il faut les traquer comme les Américains ont traqué les Peaux Rouges !” [“The Arab is like the Jew! “we have to chase them as the Americans chased the Indians!” (p. 191). Undoubtedly, for both Forster and Bertrand the colonized are definitely kept on a lower pedestal compared to their oppressors.

The twice fold representation of the colonizer underscores and accounts for the ambivalence colonialism creates within the colonial subject who proves to be a manipulable object in the hands of colonial power. What sort out also from the above analysis is that the authors are “constructions by current forms of ideology” and “thus the texts are the discursive formations engendered by conceptual and power configurations in history” (Abrams, 1999: 140).

Conclusion:
The study of representation of the Colonizer in Forster’s A Passage to India and La Cina using Albert Memmi’s foundational text The Colonizer and the Colonized shows us the double conceived identity the colonial system imposes on the colonizer. ‘The colonizers who A agents accept’ exemplified in A Passage to India by Ronny and in La Cina by Claude and Mgr Puig, thoroughly embrace the colonial system and adopt its practices. These colonialists are aware of their roles as usurpers and illegitimate possessors of privilege, for this they are depicted as strong defenders and farouche supporters of their roles. In contrast, ‘the colonizers who refuses’ as seen through Fielding and Michèle, respectively, recognize the colonial system as unjust; they are politically ineffective because they are plagued and overwhelmed with the worst and most serious illness –using the Memmian terminology- namely ‘humanitarian romanticism’. Yet, Fielding who joins the camp of his countrymen later in the novel proves the impossibility of the colonizer to
align himself with the colonized. Indeed, the “gulf” between the races created by the colonial system remains a serious barrier that casts shadows at the possibilities of friendship and equality between them. More important is the fact that Michèle’s end wallowing in the midst of his weakness and Claude’s active engagement in his new life as a colon do reinforce the creed of Bertrand that the colony’s future would be guaranteed by the likes of Claude. In one way or in another, both writers maintain that colonization is solely and should only be maintained by “the colonizers who accept.”

About the Author
Fatima BENSIDHOUM is a senior lecturer of British Literature at the Department of English, University Mouloud Mammeri of Tizi Ouzou, Algeria. She is currently doing a doctoral research in comparative literature with a particular focus on the literary relationships between French and British authors. https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3736-5970

References
“Jane Eyre’s Morality”: A Kohlbergian Reading

Ali Sabri Mohammad Abu Hassan
Department of English, Faculty of Languages and Communication
Sultan ZinalAbidin University
Terengganu, Malaysia

Mohd Nazri Latif Azmi
Department of English, Faculty of Languages and Communication
Sultan ZinalAbidin University
Terengganu, Malaysia

Abstract:
Classified as a bildungsroman novel, Brontë’s Jane Eyre (1847) is a work of fiction which deals with the moral development of the main character as an essential ingredient of the genre. Jane’s journey towards maturity and independence is a long rocky way that shapes her identity and finally harmonizes her with society. Through many stations in her journey, Jane has to make tough moral choices and decisions to obtain healthy moral reasoning. Thus, this paper is meant to trace the protagonist’s moral development in the light of Lawrence Kohlberg’s moral theory. Jane’s journey starts when she is ten years old, and ends at the age of thirty. At the end of the novel, Jane is married and has a child aged ten. Her twenty-year-journey locates her in the three consecutive stages of moral development. Depicting the influence of the main and minor characters in the novel, this paper seeks to illustrate how Jane develops a sense of moral reasoning and acts accordingly.

Keywords: bildungsroman, conventional morality, kohlberg’s moral development, postconventional morality, preconventional morality

1.1 Introduction

Bildungsroman is the term labels to literary works that trace the protagonist's journey from childhood to adulthood, from immaturity to maturity. When Murfin and Ray (1997) describe the genre, they state that it is a novel that traces the protagonist’s process of development from the early stages of his life to maturity, the process continues until he comes to understand and perceive his position and his function in the world. Hirsch (1979) has a narrower description when she states that the genre refers to novels that depict the "all-around" development of the protagonist, where the individual develops and grows within the frame of a "defined social order" (pp.293-311). The genre also focuses on the protagonist's change through a journey, which might be physical or metaphorical, that reshapes his/her character; it mainly focuses on the protagonist’s psychosocial and moral growth. Sometimes, the protagonist is already an adult but not yet mature. The term is a combination of "Bildung" meaning development, and "roman" meaning novel. Johan Wolfgang von Goethe's *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*, written in 1795, is considered to be the prototype of this genre and a primary resource for every study in the field. Bildungsroman novels are meant to take the readers from their comfortable chairs to join the protagonist with his/her journey which is usually a journey full of difficulties, challenges, and tests. These obstacles the protagonist faces are meant to form his/her growth and transformation, taking him/her to a state of self and social reconciliation.

1.2 Methodology

1.2.1 Kohlberg’s Theory of Moral Development

Lawrence Kohlberg (1958) presented his theory of moral development which states that the individual has to go through universal consecutive stages of moral development. The different previous experiences of solving problems play a major role in developing the way we think (Hayes, 2013). The individual must be mentally engaged to pass to a higher stage of moral development because every higher stage activates more complex and high-level thinking. Personal experiences, as well as, social attitudes are principal considerations to complete the moral development in each stage (Power, 2004). The ability to make a judgment or a decision is an indicator of moral reasoning which determines our behavioral conduct. According to Kohlberg, it is not the decision itself that matters, but how the decision is made. Kohlberg (1981) asserts that moral behavior is the result of many factors, among them is the moral reasoning or judgment which acts as the most effective element (Reynolds, 2007). Similarly, Tsui (2001) referred to the universal acceptance of Kohlberg's theory as it establishes the practical and experimental confirmation of the moral reasoning and its effect on the moral behavior. Talwar (2011) was more specific than Reynolds when he explained that the meaning of reasoning and judgment is the process in which the individual can evaluate, interpret the moral situation, and then conduct a moral behavior accordingly.

Kohlberg (1971) believes that individuals in any given society practice universal principles of morality whatever their culture is. He says that there are thirty common and mutual fundamental categories, concepts, or principles like law, property, authority, trust, and so on, that people have to deal with in their lives. Kohlberg’s claim is that people in all cultures are encountered with struggles within these universal realms. Since there are worldly moral issues and struggles, the moral stages of individuals are usually measured by staging dilemmas that are intended to be settled in any culture. In this context, Kohlberg (1984) emphasizes that moral judgment occurs
according to a universal order of stages where the judgment evolves through three levels: pre-conventional, conventional, and post-conventional. Each level includes two stages which are further explained as follows:

**1.2.1.1 Pre-conventional level**

Preconventional moral reasoning is the base of Kohlberg’s hierarchy of Moral Development. This level as the other two levels, includes two stages, where the second stage is always a more complicated and advanced socio-moral view than the former stage (Kohlberg, 1984).

Stage one of this level is known as the Obedience and Punishment Orientation Stage (Kohlberg, 1984). This stage is characterized by individuals, especially children, who do what they have been told to do in order to avoid punishment by adults whom they look at as authority. The driving force at this stage is the individual’s egocentric standpoint, that is to say, the individual is much more concerned about his own interest rather than others (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991). Obeying the rule is not driven by an internalized understanding of what is safe for him/her but by fear of being punished.

The second stage of this level is known as the Naively Egocentric Orientation Stage or as the Exchange Stage. In this stage, individuals, particularly children, decide what is right and what is wrong from a tangible individualistic perspective (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991). In this stage, children realize that others have their own interests as well. Hence, they tend to exchange their interests with others and focus on fair deals. For example, a child will give his sister a piece of his cake, if she gives him a piece of her chocolate. So, the favor is done conditionally, and only if something in return is gained (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991).

**1.2.1.2 Conventional level**

The next level of moral reasoning is Conventional Moral Judgment. In this stage, the rules and the expectations of those who are close to the individual like family and friends, are unconsciously assimilated within the individual, and his moral judgments and behavioral actions are governed by how they expect him to act. (Colby & Kohlberg, 1987).

The first stage of this level is known as, Good-boy/Good-girl Orientation. In this stage, the social perspective is the driving force that leads the individual’s conduction of making relationships with others, and where he/she gives the priority for mutual feelings, expectations, and agreements over the personal interests. The act of doing what is right is mainly to keep relations with others and to reach the level of expectations of those around him/her. To maintain relations with others, the individual usually follows certain principles such as; trust, loyalty, gratitude, caring and concern of others (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991). It is worthy of mentioning here that, the individual may behave caring, trustworthy, and loyal to those in his circle, but might not behave the same outside his/her social group.

The other stage of this level is best identified as Authority and Social Order Maintaining Orientation (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991). During this stage, individuals can differentiate between a wider societal perspective and interpersonal bonds:- they are also capable of recognizing the social system as establishing and generating rules. For individuals to fulfill their duties and
requirements towards their society is considered the right conduction. Individuals at this stage obey laws and rules, hardly willing to break them, while they also contribute to the society to keep it as a unit. (Kohlberg, 1984; Kuhmerker, 1991). For instance, the individual concedes the far side of rules, and he perceives rules such as jumping a red light are enforced keep order in the society, and he accepts it in order to sustain the structure of the society. Law and order are meant to stay. Otherwise, chaos will ensue.

1.2.1.3 Post-conventional level

In this level, the individual is free from the restrictions of the past two levels; the authority of the adult around and the social norms. The individual’s reasoning of morality is no longer subjected to the authority around him/her or to the laws and rules enforced by the society. In this level, the driving force behind moral reasoning is subjective, and based on personal beliefs of what is right and what is wrong. The moral choices exceeded the societal perspective and are elevated into a universal standpoint. The moral orientations turn to be “society-creating” rather than “society-maintaining”. The post-conventional morality does not view what is right or wrong as an absolute concept to be taken for granted, rather, the concept of right and wrong is subjected to arguments, debates, and compatibility, and it is determined by the degree of acceptance. (Rest et., 1999, p. 41). This level also comprises of two stages:

The first stage is known as Social Contract Orientation. In this stage, individuals perceive “the right” as supporting the primary rights, values, or beliefs of the individual, even if those rights contradict with the present laws and rules of the social group. The individual is conscious of the rights and values that everyone should enjoy in a moral society.

Moral behavior in a particular situation is not determined by relating to a list of laws but from rational employment of universal moral beliefs. The individual's natural rights and privileges are a priority to society and must be shielded by society. This perspective creates a different and most likely opposing view between the morality of the individual and his society. The social group is viewed as a social contract between the individual and the collective. (Kohlberg, 1981, p. 382).

The next stage in this level is known as the Universal Ethical Orientation. If an individual reaches this stage, the universal principles define his/her actions. Equality and worth of living are a right for every human being. In this stage, the individual puts himself in other's shoes and takes the role of every other individual in a given situation. Choosing the right action is a matter of universal morality. The individual identifies and acts out of universal respect for all human beings, asserting that every human is precious and entitled to be dressed with dignity and justice. Martin Luther King Jr., is an example of this stage.

1.3 Analysis
1.3.1 Jane’s Preconventional Morality

In Kohlberg’s (1958) pre-conventional level of moral reasoning, the concept of ‘right’ and ‘wrong’ is “a matter of personal values and opinion” (p.1067). According to Kohlberg (1958), in the first stage of this level there is always the fear of punishment; hence, the child tends to obey rules in order not to be punished. The main concern of this stage is to stay safe and to avoid pain.
where the individual is driven by his egocentric and his own interests rather than the interests of
the society (Kohlberg, 1984). Kohlberg believes that in the pre-conventional stage, the individual
seeks to care for self and strives to keep secure at any cost, and there is also a sense of selfishness
at this stage. This stage does not consider the interests of other members of society. It is incapable
of making a relation to another’s viewpoint (Kohlberg, 1984).

After the death of her uncle, Jane does not feel safe at Gatesheed house. Mrs. Reed and her
three sons are not really willing to host Jane or accept her as a family member. On the contrary,
Jane is always subjected to blame and punishment either guilty or not. Jane is aware that she is
considered as an undesired outsider who is not welcome to the family, so she restlessly strives to
keep herself safe and not to stir anyone’s hostile feelings. In order to stay safe, Jane seeks to hide
herself and stay away from punishment. In one occasion, she takes a book and starts reading it on
a seat where she draws the “red moreen curtain nearly close, I was shrined in double retirement.”
(Brontë, p. 8). Jane is more interested in hiding than in reading the book, and she hopes that no
one will notice her absence. Being out of sight is one of Jane’s strategies to avoid punishment as
Kohlberg (1984) states there is always the fear of punishment and the individual learns to care for
self and seeks to survive at any cost. Unfortunately, her cousin Liza notices her, and John asks her
to get closer to him. Although Jane knows that John hates her, and he is used to punishing her three
times or more in a week, she obeys his order hoping if she does so, he might not have an excuse
to punish her. Again, Jane believes that obeying authority might be the right decision to make in
order to stay safe. However, contrary to her hope, her belief is sound; John hits her with the book
she reads and her blood sheds over her neck, announcing the start of her rebellion to be free. Jane’s
blood stirs “different feelings” (Brontë, p.15) where she for the first time fights back. Jane’s action
against John is viewed as a wicked, unfamiliar behavior which needs to be treated soon. So, Mrs.
Reed asks the servants to lock Jane in the red room. The servants take her to the red room where
her uncle died as a kind of punishment to treat her body and soul, as Mrs. Reed tells her after.
However, in the red room, the servants tend to tie Jane to the chair so as not to move which makes
Jane cry, ‘I will not stir.’ In guarantee whereof, I attached myself to my seat by my hands” (Brontë,
p. 17). Jane now does not seek to avoid the punishment but seeks a lesser punishment. While in
the red room, Jane addresses herself wondering why she is treated badly even though she follows
the rules and regulations in the house in an attempt to please Mrs. Reed. She does not understand
why she is punished while her cousins get rewarded even when they break the rules. “I dared
commit no fault: I strove to fulfil every duty; and I was termed naughty and tiresome, sullen and
sneaking, from morning to noon, and from noon to night.” (Brontë, p.22). Jane’s moral reasoning
at this stage does not go further than seeking the reason she is treated badly for. She does not really
understand her position:- she just feels wronged.

Falling in the preconventional stage of moral reasoning, Jane asserts her tendency to avoid
punishment in different ways. Driven by her egocentric force, she starts thinking of paying a very
high cost for her redemption; to escape the oppression or to kill herself. This kind of reasoning is
emphasized in Kohlberg’s theory. The red room reveals a lot of Jane’s moral thinking, her ability
to distinguish between right and wrong perfectly fits the first stage of Kohlberg’s diagram where
the individual does what he thinks is right in order not to be hurt. Because Jane cannot simply
avoid being punished, she begs to be punished in some other less harmful ways ‘O aunt! [h]ave
pity! Forgive me! I cannot endure it—let me be punished some other way!” (Brontë, p. 28).
When Mr. Brocklehurst asks Jane how she can avoid going to hell, she tells him she “must keep in good health and not to die” (Brontë 34). Jane’s naïve strategy to avoid biblical punishment reveals her childish moral reasoning that if she is not to be punished in hell, she must not die. She believes that the right thing to do is to stay healthy. However, before being sent to Lowood School, Jane confronts her aunt and reveals her true feelings of hate and anger where she for the first time feels strong and free, but soon she realizes her immoral reaction when she states “its after-flavor, metallic and corroding, gave me a sensation as if I had been poisoned.” (Brontë, p. 66). Jane feels guilty for being immoral that she thinks of apologizing to her aggressive aunt who never misses an opportunity to punish Jane.

As a poor orphan, Jane is lower than the servants in the Reed family. She is totally different from them, both in nature and in interests. As a child, she grows angry and disdains their judgment over her. Despite the Reeds’ insulting and harsh treatment, Jane develops a strong sense of self, and is determines to seek independence.

During her stay at Gatesheed, Jane is indeed willing to conform to the expectations of the authoritarian power represented by her aunt so as to avoid punishment, but being punished with or without reason makes Jane act oppositely. She might rebel against the unjust treatment, but this rebellious attitude is not naturally innate, rather, it is a reaction to unjust actions. Ironically, Mrs. Reed asks Jane to lead a "natural" child behavior. Although, her children learn to conform to expectations, they demonstrate hypocrisy in their manners to Jane and even their behavior with their mother. The novel's consistent juxtaposition of social expectations with true morality thus opens with the contradiction between Jane and the Reed children. The children's aggressive behavior toward Jane is never questioned. Thus, Jane understands and scorns her aunt's self-indulgence and hypocrisy and refuses to obey her unworthy authority. As a result, Mrs. Reed labels Jane as a deceitful child when Mr. Brocklehurst comes to take her to Lowood School, and she warns him to keep an eye on her and to be strict with her. Mrs. Reed said “I should be glad…keep a strict eye on her, and, above all, to guard against her worst fault, a tendency to deceit. (Brontë, p.57). Mrs. Reed is not entirely satisfied with her cruel actions towards Jane:- She hopes that Lowood School will teach Jane how to submit to discipline, rules, and distinguish the difference between right and wrong behaviors.

1.3. 2 Jane’s Conventional Morality

At the first stage of this level, which is the good girl/ boy; children from ages (8-16) shift from their pure egocentric interests to please older people in authority, such as parents, teachers, and usually friends (Kohlberg, 1984). The goal of this stage is to elevate to the expectations of others and behave well to gain approval.

For most women of the Victorian-epoch, staying at home and conducting family concerns, as well as rendering comfort and satisfaction for their husbands, were essential duties. Tyson (2014) demonstrates this patriarchal paragon as an idea perceived as the angel of the house and declares that Victorian women are viewed in two perspectives; the good or the bad girl. She also
“Jane Eyre’s Morality”: A Kohlbergian Reading

Abu Hassan & Azmi

states that the model of the good girl is the one who "accepts her traditional gender role and obeys the patriarchal rules" while the bad girl is “violent, aggressive...[and] monstrous” (p. 89). Consequently, the woman who does not abide by the patriarchal rules is labelled a monster.

Jane tries hard to be the good girl in Gatesheed to gain a natural social position as any child and a “more attractive and sprightly manner, something lighter, franker, more natural as it were” (Brontë, p.8), but it seems that she is always viewed as not good enough. Jane, the narrator, describes how the Reeds treat her “I was a discord in Gatesheed Hall: I was like nobody there” (Brontë, p. 43), and she believes it might be her unbeautiful appearance that makes the Reeds reject her. Jane assumes that due to her low social position and because she is not a pretty girl, she deserves to be treated in such an unjust ways. The threat of being sent to the “poor-house” makes Jane obedient, and she tries “to make [herself] agreeable to them” (Brontë, p.18). When she is locked in the red room for defending herself against John who is used to beating her, Jane realizes that the bad treatment she receives has nothing to do with her behavior, because her cousin John goes unpunished for the same behavior. The unfair treatment urges Jane to rebel against the oppressive society, especially the patriarchal society, who expects Jane to be a submitted typical Victorian woman, but Jane rejects to admit this arrangement. When Mrs. Reed recognizes that she is unable to control Jane, she decides to send her to a more rigid and tougher environment to teach her “conformity to her position and prospects” (Brontë, p.60).

The dispatch of Jane to Lowood School is not but a desperate attempt and great unfulfilled expectation to break Jane’s pride and prejudice. Those hopes have gone with the wind as for the first time, Jane finds herself surrounded by a fair number of teachers and students who treat her fairly and equally. In order to have the greatest number of friends, Jane works hard to be a good girl, seeking respect, justice, equality, and affection. Although Mr. Brocklehurst’s warnings to the students and the teachers that Jane is a deceitful and bad girl and urges them to stay away from her, Jane does not hesitate to be a good girl who captures the hearts of others despite her fear of them believing him. Despite the very bad conditions at Lowood School, it is still a good start for Jane to prove herself as a good girl “I had meant to be so good, and to do so much at Lowood, to make so many friends, to earn respect, and win affection” (Brontë, p. 68). It is obvious that Jane's desire to be a "good" girl is striking and insistent, especially when she tells her friend, Helen Burns, that thinking well of herself does not satisfy her if she does not gain love from others. Jane wants to be loved by those around her because she knows that she will not gain a natural social position unless others love and accept her. She prefers death than to be hated. Helen does not appreciate Jane's pursuit humanly love and affection, but Jane is willing to sacrifice herself for that

I would willingly submit to have the bone of my arm broken, or to let a bull toss me, or to stand behind a kicking horse, and let it dash its hoof at my chest" in order to "gain some real affection from you, or Miss Temple, or any other whom I truly love (Brontë, p. 129).

Jane is not satisfied with the fact that she is a good girl unless approved by those around her, she wants to prove to others that she is not as Mr. Brocklehurst claims. Jane's good relationship with the other girls and the teachers makes her capable of overcoming Mr. Brocklehurst’s tyranny, and she comes to realize that she is inherently a good girl. She also comes to realize that in order to be a functional individual in the bigger society, she needs to show goodness. Miss Temple is a good
model for Jane to follow; Miss Temple offers Jane the chance to defend herself against Mr. Brocklehurst’s accusation of being a liar (Brontë, p.71). Miss Temple then clears Jane from any wrongness after receiving a confirmation from Mr. Lloyd, the doctor who treated Jane at Gatesheed. This incident makes Jane flourish and teaches her that her determination to be a good girl will guarantee respect and affection. Miss Temple encourages Jane to be a good girl when she instructs her to conduct herself accordingly to satisfy her and those around her. For Jane to prove her goodness, she works and studies hard because she knows that her teachers will admire her efforts as a good student. Jane’s efforts are crowned by elevating her to a higher class in the school and she gains her teachers’ affection and support. Miss Temple’s kind treatment makes Jane see Lowood with its physical deficiencies as a better place than the luxurious, but terrifying Gatesheed where she experiences no love, friendship, or affection.

Even though Jane opposes many of Helen’s beliefs, she unwillingly takes Helen’s advice to endure punishment: “It was as if a martyr, a hero, had passed a slave or victim” (Brontë, p.124). This endurance of punishment indicates Jane’s strong desire to be viewed as a good and obedient girl. It is worthy to say that Jane endures the punishment but does not accept it. By trying to act well and be a good girl in order to satisfy upper authority, Jane is a typical model of Kohlberg’s first stage of conventional moral development. The right and wrong concept is determined by being labeled either a good or bad girl. Jane strives hard to be the good one.

The second stage of this level is concerned with conformity to social rules. At the age of eighteen, Jane, unlike the conventional Victorian woman, does not move to a husband’s house. Instead, she moves to Thornfield to be a governess for the little Adele. Being a governess is not an easy position to occupy for a middle class Victorian woman. This stage of moral development trims most of Jane’s moral codes since her behavior, actions, and decisions are the result of mixed social conventions, conformity and self-respect.

Jane moves to Thornfield to work as a governess where she falls in love with Mr. Rochester and soon their wedding is planned. However, Jane comes to know that Mr. Rochester is already married to the lunatic Bertha Masson and if she agrees to marry him, she will be breaking the law and the religious interpretations. Law and religion do not allow a man to have two wives. Bennett (1978) declares it is religiously and legally wrong for a woman to live with an already married man, under any circumstances. Jane also understands that she will be despised by social conventions. These three authorities prevent Jane and Rochester to be spouses. Jane abides by these rules and states that “I will keep the law given by God; sanctioned by man” (Brontë, p. 319). In this quotation, Jane makes clear that her moral integrity is more abided by legal, religious, and social laws rather than her own feelings.

Although Jane is almost convinced by Rochester’s argument for staying with him, she realizes that she would be scorned by society. Being a mistress is never accepted by religious or social norms as Henry Mayhew, puts it “. . . any woman who lived or had sexual relations with a man outside of marriage was a prostitute” (Poovey, 2009, p. 131). For Jane, it is not possible to go against the rules if they are to protect her reputation. Rochester tries to insist that Jane can discard conventional morality since she is an orphan with no family to be offended by her decision, but she recognizes that she has to make the right decision and do the right thing which is not to marry
him. This is a clear indication of Jane asserting her conventional morality and not compromising her moral codes. Jane's moral codes are the guide of her journey towards maturity and self-actualization especially when she is under pressure to make a decision. This quotation also shows how Jane’s sense of conventional morality guides her to make right choices and distinguish between what is right and what is wrong. It is worth noting here that although Jane opposes social values that restrict her independence or make her subject to masculine powers, she adheres to these laws as long as they serve the concept of right and wrong. Jane is able to balance what is right and wrong, and she differentiates between the concept of defying societal values or submitting to them.

The concept of "conventional morality" (Basch, 1974, p. 171) is "internalized" in Jane (Figes, 1987. p. 114). Although Jane is in deep love with Rochester, this love is not blessed by all laws, which prevent a man to have two wives. Jane dare not to violate the laws. “Laws and principles are not for the times when there is no temptation” (Brontë, p.606). To marry Rochester is impossible for her and she refuses to join him as a mistress out of her moral judgment. Rochester's temptations are far from changing her moral values, so she decides that her flesh and blood are to leave Thornfield while her heart is to stay. Craik, (2011) states that Rochester “tempted her to violate her moral standards” (p.100), but her conscience warns her against it. Bernard (2013) describes Jane’s inner moral conflict as a regulation between mind and desire, while Scargill (1950) describes it as an “eternal conflict between the flesh and the spirit” (p.121). Jane describes leaving Rochester as ‘It was a barbed arrow-head in my breast’ (Brontë, p. 613). However, she prefers to sacrifice her feelings to meet the rules of the law even if that means torturing herself. Jane's fleeing of Thornfield protects her from psychological disintegration and moral degradation and permits her to warrant her will. Jane makes a series of tough moral choices, none more pressing than to leave Rochester. Outweighing moral and social commitment over her feelings, Jane leaves Rochester who opposes all constitutional, theological and cultural rules. Because he believes that he and Jane are in true deep love, he dares to create his own morality and reject the already existing morals. Although Rochester is the most influential in Jane’s journey, she never argues about her moral identity. What is right or wrong is unnegotiable. Jane’s focus is more on avoiding chaos and the unstructured deconstruction of the society.

1.3. 3 Jane’s Post-conventional Morality

The seeds of moral judgment and reasoning are getting their fruits in the post-conventional stage of moral development. When Jane arrives at Moor House, Hannah deprecatorily and bluntly inquires her social position: "Did you ever go a-begging afore you came here?" (Brontë, p. 651). Hannah believes that Jane is a lower-class beggar. She even believes that beggars are criminals. However, when she realizes that Jane is none of what she assumes, she begs Jane not to judge her harshly. But Jane is harsh in her response not because Hannah does not shelter her, but because she refers to poor people as criminals. Jane strongly believes that being poor is not a crime and true Christians do not consider poverty a sin. Jane's response is not an act of self-revenge but an act of universal respect and equality for all people no matter what their social status is. This reasoning makes Jane act in the post-conventional morality of Kohlberg’s theory where right and wrong is determined by a universal view that seeks justice and equality for all. The same attitude arises against Rochester when Jane earlier tells him that the poor are not less or inferior to their superiors. Of course, as Jane tells, this attitude is not based on conventional beliefs or customs, but rather based on a belief that goes beyond all material considerations, something highly elevated
known as the post-conventional morality. Jane’s moral defense of the poor is the result of accumulated circumstances and experiences she has to deal with unconsciously as a child and consciously as an adult. Jane’s moral development is a chronological understanding of what is right and wrong. As a child she did not want to go to the “poor house” because poverty used to mean rough clothes, insufficient meals, cold relationships, rude behaviors, and degrading vices. For Jane, poverty used to mean “degradation” (Brontë, p. 40). As an adult, she comes to realize that poverty is not a vice, and it does not hinder virtue. Jane is quite truthful when she recoils from the moral degradation and when she advocates the moral integrity of the lower class and poor people.

St John acts another moral dilemma for Jane when he asks her to marry and join him to India as a missionary. He warns her that if she rejects his proposal, it would be a rejection of God. St. John is degrading love to a gloomy duty, and he imposes the burden of guilt upon her if she denies the noble duty he offers. However, Jane remains sincere to her individuality and to her heart and morals and refuses the proposal. Once again directed by a higher level of reasoning and moral beliefs, she does not violate her morals to accept St. John’s abstract concepts of devotion. Jane disdains this distorted obscure sense of love that disregards the feelings of the heart. She feels no responsibility to join him to India as a wife because she believes that God has given her a life to be appreciated and respected, she believes if she accepts St. John’s proposal, she will be throwing her life away which is a matter of suicide. This incident shows the extreme change in Jane’s reasoning where at the beginning of her story, she thinks of suicide to get rid of punishment, but now she rejects the idea and believes that she has a life to live. Jane does not adhere to the tradition of love either in the frame of uncontrolled emotions or self-denial. In the time that Jane rejects Rochester’s proposal out of conventional morality, she rejects St. John’s proposal out of post-conventional morality where rights take priority over what others believe (Kohlberg, 1984). Within the inner conflict between love and duty, Jane express her feelings in both cases when she say “To have yielded then would have been an error of principle; to have yielded now would have been an error of judgment. (Brontë, p. 802).

By “then” Jane refers to the past time of intense difficulty of temptation she encountered in her strong wish to stay with Mr. Rochester as a mistress, a decision that could have broken her moral principles to which she resumes to stick through her journey. For her, however, the alarming outcomes of "an error of principle” include more than simply a fear of God’s punishment. To have compromised her moral beliefs for Mr. Rochester, she affirms, would have destroyed herself, and just as “now” to yield to St. John’s wish, would be a wrong moral decision. Seemingly, St. John wants to marry Jane and be his lawful wife, which is the extreme opposite of Rochester’s offer. It might seem confusing for the reader that Jane rejects both, but a deeper investigation reveals that Jane is progressing from a conventional moral reasoning to a post-conventional judgment. Jane’s rejection of both proposals is based on different perspectives of moral thinking. The former is based on conformity to social and religious regulations while the latter is paradoxically based on confrontation of these regulations. The confusion between conforming to and confrontation with laws is a healthy state of making decisions in Kohlberg’s moral development where the individual does not always have to yield to laws as long as they hinder his rights. For Jane, love is an essential priority from the very beginning of her journey, and she is not willing to sacrifice it at any cost now. Brontë meant to create a character who is bendable but unbreakable to conventions.
In another situation that highlights Jane’s sense of the highest level of postconventional morality is when she decides to equally divide the sum of money she inherited between herself and her relatives. St. John himself does not understand this kind of behavior. Jane is aware that the money is legally hers, but in the sense of justice it is not. Jane explains that “it would torment and oppress me to have twenty thousand; which, moreover, could never be mine in justice, though it might in law” (Brontë, p. 868). Jane does not only believe that keeping the whole sum of money for herself is a kind of oppression, but also a kind of selfishness and injustice. Her universal view of justice and equality put her in the highest level of Kohlberg’s chain of moral development. Jane’s moral development was woven skillfully that many contradictions and extremes could have hindered it, but the protagonist manages to overcome all the opposites. According to McFadden (1996), Jane goes against the expected type of woman by rejecting the submission, opposing her superiors, fighting for her rights, and being courageous enough to come up with new, unfamiliar thoughts. Jane is morally conscious that she is able to make challenging decisions which drive her to achieve her full maturity. At the end of her journey, Jane returns to her heart at Thornfield, where Mr. Rochester is no longer engaged with another woman since his legal wife is dead. Jane simply marries Mr. Rochester and they have a child.

1.4 Conclusion

This paper presents how the main character progresses morally from the early stages as a poor dependent girl into a fully matured wife. Through a series of social and moral dilemmas, Jane is capable of creating a balance between adhering to and rejecting the social norms that might hinder her maturity. It also illustrates how the other characters in the novel affected her moral development. During her journey, Jane could develop a sense of what is morally right and what is wrong. Since moral development is an essential component of the bildungsroman novel, Jane Eyre is a perfect model of this type of genre. Through her journey, Jane achieves the most important ingredient of the bildungsroman, which gives the novel a sound credit to be classified as such. Bronte brilliantly presents Jane as a character who develops a strong sense of moral development against injustice. Jane is a protagonist who thinks, feels, and acts out of moral reasoning which leads her to distinguish between what is right and what is wrong and makes decisions accordingly.

About the Authors:
Ali Abu Hassan
Ali Abu Hassan is a PhD student in English Language Studies at Sultan Zinal Abidin Universiti, Kuala Terengannu, Malaysia. He is also a lecturer of English Language at the Northern Border University (Saudi Arabia). He is also a secondary school English teacher (Jordan). His main area of interest is English Literature. ORCID ID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8735-0908.

Dr. Mohammad Nazri Bin Latif Azmi
Dr. Nazri's specializations are on literacy and comparative literature studies. He attended several long-term professional courses in education and comparative literature in the USA and Portugal. He has been a keynote speaker at several international conferences in Asia and presented more than 15 papers inside and outside Malaysia and published more than 20 papers in indexed journals. His passion towards education and literature is overwhelming due to realizing that language is a beautiful art and education is the root of any civilization.
References
Kohlberg, L. (1971). *From is to ought: How to commit the naturalistic fallacy and get away with it in the study of moral development*. Place of publication not identified: publisher not identified.
Fiction Stories and Poster Presentation in Teaching Indonesian EFL Students

Asmi Rusmanayanti
English Department
Faculty of Teacher Training and Education
Lambung Mangkurat University, Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Abstract
Literacy is a crucial topic for most countries around the globe. As in Indonesia, literacy becomes a major issue since most of young Indonesian people decrease their tendency of reading books in their free time. Reading, either it is extensive or intensive ones, is an essential knowledge for everyone. Fictions are needed to be explored for better literacy. As English as a Foreign Language (EFL) students, English fiction is one of a good source to improve students ability in using English. By reading more fictions, EFL students can gain many benefits directly or indirectly to their English, and it can be seen easily from their fluency by using a special model named Poster Presentation. Furthermore, poster presentation can be used in teaching and learning as variations in reading activity. This research is to explore the use of fiction stories and Poster Presentations for Indonesian EFL students at Lambung Mangkurat University. There were some stages during the Fiction stories and poster presentation project which involved tutoring, group work, and the poster presentation. The students were asked to read short fiction stories, make a summary of it, and finally design the summary into posters. The tutoring part was beneficial to keep students understand the project. The questionnaire by using Likert-scale was distributed which to investigate students’ perception on the use of poster presentation in learning fiction stories. The results showed that the students interpret poster presentation to improve their reading comprehension, communication, cooperation, collaboration, and creativity during the classroom interaction.

Keywords: Extensive reading, fiction stories, poster presentation, reading comprehension

Cite as: Rusmanayanti, A. (2019). Fiction Stories and Poster Presentation in Teaching Indonesian EFL Students. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 3 (2) 78-90. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/aweetedl/vol3no2.8
Introduction

Background of the study

Reading is one of the four skills that hold big roles in learning English. It is a skill that is essential for students because it influences their ability in English communication. For reading is a skill that could be used to gain information and to gain access to alternative explanations, whether it is for work or study. Teaching reading in Indonesia is classified into teaching reading comprehension, and according to snow (2002), reading comprehension is the process of simultaneously extracting and constructing meaning through interaction and involvement with written language.

Considering the importance of reading comprehension, it is highly recommended for teachers to teach reading using things which motivate students. Extensive reading is one of them since it is a situation when students read extensively, they read very easy, and also could enjoy their reading material. It is also regarded as beneficial activity to give rich input for students’ language development. Furthermore, to make extensive reading more interesting for students, poster presentation can be integrated as the variation in the reading activity since using media is one of the ways to motivate students in teaching reading progress.

The objective of the study

This study aimed to investigate students’ perception on the use of poster presentation in learning fiction stories.

The Scope of the Study

The scope of the study is intended for the Extensive Reading class that it is held at Lambung Mangkurat University. The focus of this research is to find out students’ perception on the use of poster presentation in learning fiction stories.

The Significance of the Study

This research is expected to give an input on teaching and learning about fiction stories for Indonesian EFL students, especially about information related to the usage of poster presentation in Extensive Reading class. The result of this research also expected to be an additional source, especially to another researcher who wants to conduct research on the same topic, either at the same level or different level.

Literature Review

Poster Presentations

According to Yale Center of Teaching and Learning, ctl.yale.edu (2018), posters are tools that enable visualization in the classroom to foster student learning. While a poster presentation, according to Handron, as cited in Bracher, et. al (1998), is an experiential learning activity that stimulates curiosity and interest, encourages exploration and integration of concepts and provides students with a novel way of demonstrating understanding. Thus, it is a condition where the presenter combines text and graphics to make a visually pleasing presentation (Kiefer, et. al, 2012). This presentation can take place in one large room, several smaller rooms, or even on a balcony.
Hence, as their visitors walk by, the poster should quickly and efficiently communicate the points which the presenters want to tell. Unlike the fast pace of a slide show, a poster presentation allows the visitors to study and restudy the information and discuss it directly with the presenter. Furthermore, there are many advantages of using posters; in this case, poster presentation; as a visual aid in the learning process (Print MePoster.com, 2018), those are:

a. It's an effective way to catch and hold the attention of pupils or students as well as maintain their interest in the subject.
b. Posters can motivate students to learn a specific topic.
c. They can help learners to focus on a certain idea, fact, event or process.
d. They are convenient both for pupils and teachers as they help students to absorb the material faster.
e. Images are more “evocative” than words and can lay the foundation of a variety of associations.
f. 65% of people worldwide find learning most effective when it is transmitted visually and a poster is one of the best ways to do that.
g. By having a poster in the classroom, you induce the students to constant learning, even if they just look around the classroom.

Thus, according to explanations above, posters provide an opportunity to pair visual learning with textbook reading, lecture, and traditional homework assignments. As such, posters are often created by students to visually display a significant course project, developing research, or a particular perspective for class to consider. Moreover, such practices have been shown to improve metacognitive practice too (Logan, et. al, 2015).

**Extensive Reading**

According to ERF (2011), extensive reading is a situation when students read extensively, they read very easy, enjoyable books to build their reading speed and reading fluency. Extensive Reading aims to help the student to be better at their reading skill rather than reading to study the language itself.

**Genres of Literature**

There are many genres of literature which can be read, but all of them can be categorized into two, which is non-fiction and fiction. According to Einstein (2003), non-fiction is a type of literature which tell the reader about something really happen, to be exact, tell about several facts. It is also in line with statement from Harvey and Goudvis (2000) who says that one of the most important goal of non-fiction is to answer specific question. Thus, non-fiction is usually written with specific, or specialized, text features and text structures. There are several types of non-fiction that mostly read by people, they are letters, articles, editorials, speeches, brochures, biographies, essays, academic journals, etc.

As for fiction, according to Literarydevices.net (2013), fiction consist of many kinds of stories such as dramas, novels, and the likes which based on fabricated or made-up stories
characters and can represent symbolic or thematic features – known as literary merits. The aim of a fiction story more than simply a story. It comments on something substantial to social, politics, human issues, and the like. There are many types of literature which can be considered as fiction, there are romance, science fiction, horror, thriller, etc.

1. **Romance**
   According to Romance Writer of America (2018), Romance is a genre which has two basic elements, a central love story and an emotionally satisfying ending. Beyond that, romance novels or short stories may have any tone or style, which can be set in any place or time, and have varying levels of sensuality—ranging from sweet to extremely hot. An example of romance story is *Romeo and Juliet* by William Shakespeare.

2. **Science Fiction**
   Science fiction is a genre of fiction in which the stories often tell about science and technology of the future (Read Write Think, 2005). Even though it considered fiction, it is important to note that science fiction has a relationship with the principles of science. Thus, this kind of stories involve partially true partially fictitious laws or theories of science. An example of science fiction story is *The Time Machine* by H. G. Wells.

3. **Horror**
   According to Cuddon (1984), has defined the horror story as "a piece of fiction in prose of variable length... which shocks or even frightens the reader, or perhaps induces a feeling of repulsion or loathing ". Thus, it can be concluded that horror is a genre which is intended to, or has the capacity to frighten, scare, disgust, or startle its readers or viewers by producing feelings of horror and terror. An example of horror story is *Dracula* by Bram Stoker.

4. **Thriller**
   Thrillers could be stated as the mood of suspenseful excitement. Thus, thriller as defined as thrills. According to Patterson (2006) Thrillers could be provided as a rich literary feast. The kinds of thrillers such as Spy Thriller, The Legal Thriller, Medical Thriller, Action-adventure Thriller, Political Thriller, Religious Thriller, Military Thriller and High-tech Thriller. Those Genres should have several characteristics in terms of creating an emotion in each genres. Therefore, It should have a thrill to be a good thriller.

   The story of thriller which is broadly known is *The Da Vinci Code* by Dan Brown. Other famous stories which considered as a thriller are stories written by Stephen King.
Reading Comprehension

Wooley (2011) states that reading comprehension is a process to gain understanding through describing meaningful text. To gain an overall understanding of text in a meaningful way, the readers need to integrate the meaning of successive sentences, to establish the local coherence and to establish how the informations fits together as a whole or global coherence. For both local and global coherence, the readers need to incorporate background knowledge to make sense of details that are only implicit. The interaction is done by decoding words and using background knowledge to get an understanding of the writer message. Based on the two explanation above, It can be concluded that background knowledge plays important role in achieving comprehension. This idea also supported by Anderson and Pearson in as cited in Hudson (2007), who noted that the interaction of new information with background knowledge is meant by comprehension.

The Methodology of the Research

Participants

This study involved 61 fifth semester students who took Extensive Reading course in Lambung Mangkurat University, Banjarmasin, Indonesia. The students were from two different classes.

The Procedure of the study

The topic in Extensive Reading course used in this study was fiction short story. The students were given some choices of genres of fiction short story and were asked to vote which genre they wanted to read, namely romance short fiction story, science-fiction short fiction story, and horror/thriller short fiction story. Both classes voted horror/thriller short fiction story the most.

The students from each class were divided into eight groups consisting of three to four students. The groups were given a poster presentation project which involved tutoring, group work, and the poster presentation itself. The students in their groups were asked to read a short story they chose and they had to understand the story well. Afterwards, they were required to make a summary of the story, and put the summary as well as design it into a poster. The title of the short fiction story they selected was informed to the lecturer. The allotted time for both extensive reading and poster making is two weeks.

To keep the students on the right track while doing the project, the tutoring activity was conducted by the researchers outside the Extensive Reading course schedule. The tutoring activity was equipped with a record form to monitor the groups’ progress. The aspects of the groups’ progress that were monitored were as follows:

1. Reading the selected short story (knowing topic, characters, gist of the story)
2. Making a summary of the short story (exposition, raising action, climax, falling action, resolution)
3. Identifying the moral values from the story
4. Making poster
The tutoring activity was done for maximum four times within two weeks before the deadline of the project. In the tutoring, the student groups reported their progress on the aspects in the record form of tutoring activity and. The tutor might do discussion with the students about their progressive work. The students also got feedback from the tutors related to their work.

Here is the guideline in designing the poster:

1. Word limit of the summary is 250 words.
2. The images can be drawn by the students themselves or taken from other sources like magazine and the Internet which are considered relevant to the story.
3. The general structure of the poster is given, yet the students are allowed to modify it by using their creativity.
4. At the end of the summary, the students need to write the moral value of the short story.

Figure 1. The Comparison of the Changes in Average Scores of Pre-Test and Post-Test between the Experimental and the Control Group
After two weeks since the project was given, the poster presentation was held during Extensive Reading course schedule. This session consisted of five rounds and each round had 15 minutes. In each round, some members of each group should stay close to their poster and the other members should visit other groups’ poster. One of the representatives of each group presented the poster and did storytelling according to the summary they made to the visitors from the other groups. The students who visited the poster should listened to story and were required to ask questions related to the poster or the story. After the five rounds were finished, the remaining 25 minute time was used as the feedback session.

After the whole project was finished, the students were asked to fill a questionnaire about their perception on the project. The major components of this questionnaire include tutoring, group work, and poster presentation. The questionnaire consisted of two parts. Part one consisted of 11 items, while the part two consisted of five open-ended items. For part one, the students gave their perception on each statement of the questionnaire by ticking option ‘Strongly agree’, ‘Agree’, ‘Undecided’, ‘Disagree’, or ‘Strongly Disagree’. For part II, the students were requested to explain their own answer.

**Research Results and Discussion**

*First component of Part I: Tutoring*

Table 1. The result of questionnaire related to tutoring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire items</th>
<th>Percentage of Students’ Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tutoring</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Tutoring activities help me to check my comprehension of the short story.</td>
<td>55.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Tutoring activities provide useful feedback to my group’s summary and the formulation of the moral value of the story.</td>
<td>47.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tutoring activities provide useful feedback to my group’s poster design.</td>
<td>29.51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data of students’ responses on tutoring activity as the first component of Part I showed that the students had positive perception on tutoring activity since the majority of the students considered that the activity helped them to check their understanding of the short story and gave them useful feedback to complete the project. This finding is also supported by the results of students’ responses for the first open-ended item which is related to their opinion about the tutoring activities you have experienced while doing the task of extensive reading and poster making. Some of the sample answers from the students are as follows:
1. In my opinion, it’s really helpful. We used to be confused and got problem in determining few parts of the summary, yet the tutor helped us and gave us solution.
2. I think the tutoring was helpful to solve our group problem when we got confused to make the summary.
3. The tutoring activity helps us to make the summary easier to understand. The feedback that we got was very useful.
4. It is really fun. We can discuss it with our tutor and it makes the story easier to understand.
5. I think tutoring activity and poster making are more fun than ordinary short story assignment.

Although most of the students showed their positive perception, there were few students (3.28%) who stated that they disagreed that tutoring activities provide useful feedback to their group’s poster design (item No. 3). It might be due to our intention to let their creativity play major role in designing the poster, so the students felt that feedback on poster design was not given much.

**Second component of Part I: Group work**

Table 2. The result of questionnaire related to group work

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire items</th>
<th>Percentage of Students’ Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group Work</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The group work on the extensive reading and poster making helps me understand the short story more easily.</td>
<td>57.38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. During the group work, I learn how to make a summary: selecting main ideas and eliminating unnecessary details.</td>
<td>40.98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The group work enables me to be engaged in communication, collaboration, cooperation and creativity to finish all the tasks.</td>
<td>54.10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Similar to the finding from tutoring component, the students’ responses for group work component was also mostly positive. The majority of the students considered the group work beneficial for them in helping them understand the short story easier, finishing the project, and engaging in communication, collaboration, cooperation and creativity to finish all the tasks. The results of students’ responses for the open-ended item related to group work also confirm the students’ positive perception. It can be seen from the following samples of students’ answers.

1. I think group work is really needed and from my experience we learn how to find ideas together, work together or even find the solution for obstacles that we had in the process of making a poster.
2. It was interesting. I could share the idea. We got a lot of different opinions, but it made our ideas develop.
3. I have to say thanks to my group, with our teamwork we can finish our task no matter what is the result. I am so happy and I do not regret what we do for this poster.
4. I think the group work is so effective to make us understand about extensive reading task and also efficient.
5. The group work is fun and we can learn more and learn together when doing the task. It develops our creativity.

The small percentage of disagreement responses was also found in the group work component. From the students’ responses, it was found that the students who showed disagreement preferred individual work rather than group work. The other response stated that the students encountered disagreement among their group members in doing the project. Moreover, this negative response might be also caused by the absence of particular student’s participation in doing the project as indicated by a student’s response “The group work is fun because I got more ideas from my peers and it made me have more courage to do better.

However, when I work in the group, there are some students who do not participate.” This suggest that the group work will give more optimal benefits if there is equal participation from each member of the group.

**Third component of Part I: Poster Presentation**

Table 3. The result of questionnaire related to poster presentation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaire items</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Undecided</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7. Poster presentation facilitates me to demonstrate my comprehension of the short story.</td>
<td>52.46%</td>
<td>42.62%</td>
<td>4.92%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. During poster presentation, I can practice my speaking skill.</td>
<td>85.25%</td>
<td>11.48%</td>
<td>3.28%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. A conducive classroom interaction among the students is created during the poster presentation</td>
<td>44.26%</td>
<td>39.34%</td>
<td>13.12%</td>
<td>3.28%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. During poster presentation, I can improve my comprehension on plot of various short stories.</td>
<td>44.26%</td>
<td>50.82%</td>
<td>3.28%</td>
<td>1.64%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. During poster presentation, I learn various useful moral values from other groups.</td>
<td>60.66%</td>
<td>32.79%</td>
<td>6.56%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For the third component of Part I in the questionnaire, the students also showed positive perception on poster presentation. It means that the majority of the students thought that they obtained benefits from poster presentation in demonstrating their comprehension of the short story, practicing their speaking skill, having conducive classroom interaction, improving their comprehension and learning various moral values for daily life. The students’ positive perception on poster presentation was further supported by their responses on open-ended question related to poster presentation. It can be seen in the following samples of students’ answers:

1. It helps us to practice speaking in English. I become braver to speak (in English).
2. In my opinion, poster presentation gives us deeper understanding than just read short story and make a summary. I personally like the time of explaining my own story and listen to other stories.
3. It helps us to improve our confidence to speak in front of people and think critically about other posters, for example, by asking questions.
4. It’s really interesting. I learn how to present confidently in front of my friend, and listen to the other group’ presentation.
5. It was great. I could explain my story happily. I was so enthusiastic to present my poster and excited too. In addition, I got many stories from my friends’ poster.

Some students who showed their disagreement on the questionnaire items no 9 (A conducive classroom interaction among the students is created during the poster presentation) and 10 (During poster presentation, I can improve my comprehension on plot of various short stories) explained that the poster presentation had limited time, so they felt that the benefits of poster presentation related to the questionnaire items were not optimal. Some of them also stated that they did not have enough time to ask questions to other groups because of the limited time. Moreover, the room to conduct poster presentation was not big enough, so it resulted in difficulties in moving from one group to another and listening to the other groups’ story since each representative told the story at one time. These students’ responses will be used as constructive feedback for the betterment of poster presentation activity in the future.

Second Component: Whole Task (group work on extensive reading, tutoring, & poster presentation)

The results of the next open-ended question revealed that all of the students consider that the whole task (group work on extensive reading, tutoring, & poster presentation) is fun and interesting.

It is evident from the following samples of students’ answers:

1. Yes. It develops team work. In group, we worked and helped each other. While in tutoring, we got new knowledge or additional knowledge. At the end, in the poster presentation, we were really excited in presenting our work.
2. Yes. Because if the short story is just told by usual/ordinary presentation, it makes us so bored. However, if we have group work like this, we want longer time of study.
3. Yes, because we were guided from the beginning until the end. We could share our ideas and got feedback.
4. Yes, because it is more fun to read through poster rather than just a plain sheet of paper. It is more interesting. Tutoring also helps us to make a good poster and to learn how to summarize a story and to take the moral value of the story we have read.
5. Yes, because it improves so much on the group work, makes us respect others’ opinion, and help us to understand more about the story.

The results of the last open-ended question showed that all of the students prefer the project (group work on extensive reading, tutoring, & poster presentation) to the other activities/tasks/strategies previously used by their lecturer. Here are some samples of students’ answers:

1. Yes, because the other activities are kind of boring for us. We have the class at 1 p.m., so we often feel sleepy during the class.
2. Yes, it is more challenging than the ordinary extensive reading assignment.
3. Yes, because this way is more fun, more enjoyable, and can give me more experience.
4. Yes, I prefer having the project of poster presentation rather than just presenting the stories using PowerPoint.
5. Yes, it is more interesting and fun than we just sit in the class and listen to the lecturer. It will improve so much, I guess.

Furthermore, there were 2 students who gave suggestion in addition to their preference of the whole project.
1. I think doing the project of poster presentation once is enough for all of us college schedule this semester is so hectic. It was fun, but to do it again for the second time, I am not sure I will be excited. The project may be given once or twice as the variation of our activities.
2. Yes, I prefer this one because it is communicative and trains us to be creative and it’s fun, but I don’t suggest this whole task to be implemented too often. Afterall, this whole task is interesting.

**Conclusion and Suggestions**

**Conclusion**

The results revealed that the students perceived the whole project of poster presentation in learning short fiction stories to be beneficial in improving their reading comprehension, classroom interaction, communication, collaboration, cooperation and creativity of the students. Poster presentation can also be integrated in extensive reading class with tutoring and group work to enhance its benefits. It can also be used as variation or complementary activity in Extensive Reading course. Improvement of the poster presentation project in the future based on the feedback found in students’ responses: managing sufficient time allocation for conducting poster presentation (presenting the poster, retelling the story, asking questions to other groups’ presentation), providing enough space for poster presentation, and ensuring equal participation from each member of each group.
**Suggestions**

Since the research revealed that the students perceived the poster presentation project to be beneficial, therefore it is suggested to be applied in teaching and learning process of extensive reading, especially in learning short-fiction stories. It is also suggested to be implemented in learning other English skill such as writing and speaking.

**About the Author:**

Asmi Rusmanyanti is a lecturer at English Education Department, Faculty of Tacher Training and Education, Lambung Mangkurat University. She obtained her bachelor degree at Lambung Mangkurat University and continued her Master degree et Educational Effectiveness and Instructional Design at Groningen University, Netherland. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6795-9804

**References**


Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills for Major Students in the Faculty of Education, Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia

Fatma Farid Fakhry Tharwa
Department of Curriculum and Teaching Methods
Faculty of Education, the New Valley University, Egypt
&
Faculty of Education, Majmaah University, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
This paper aims at identifying the effectiveness of using the SCAMPER model in developing translation and raising the attitudes towards adaptation among major students in the faculty of education, Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia. It tries to answer the following questions: To what extent would using the SCAMPER model raise translation skills among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah University? The second question is To what extent would using SCAMPER model raise the attitudes towards translation among major students. To accomplish the purpose of the study, the researcher showed the experimental group with a sample involved (40) students for the SCAMPER Model in the first term of the school year 2018-2019. The researcher used (pre -post & delayed) translation test, a scale of students' attitudes towards translation to collect data. The study's results suggested that there were statistically important differences at ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) in the whole mean grade in the pre post translation test to the group in favor of post test. Also, there were statistically important differences at ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) in the whole mean grade in the pre-post scale of students attitudes towards translation to the group in favor of post implication. Also, the researcher recognized these differences in using the SCAMPER Model in teaching English language translation. In light of these outcomes, the study suggested the necessity of applying the SCAMPER Model in teaching the English language to get better results in students’ translation learning and retention in English as a foreign language. Similarly, the SCAMPER Model would be used with other English skills and sub-skills.

Keywords: Model, SCAMPER, skills, translation

Cites as: Tharwa, F. F.F. (2019). Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills for Major Students in the Faculty of Education, Majmaah University, Saudi Arabia. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 3 (2).91-113
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.9
1. Introduction and background:

SCAMPER is a mnemonic acronym that provides a structured way to assist students and teachers with understanding creative problem solving and developing extension building activities based on prior ideas and processes (Serrat, 2009). SCAMPER is a very powerful idea generation and creativity technique. It is an especially useful technique to generate ideas if you intend to improve a service or product. This program is based on the premise that innovation really stems from the order and the addition of new ideas Moreno, Hernández, Yang & Wood (2014).

Michalko, (2010), defines the SCAMPER Model as an acronym that provides a structured way of assisting students to think out of the box and enhance their knowledge. It is thought to protect students' creativity as they mature. Majid, Tan & Soh., (2003) define it as "one of the Educational strategies based on six key elements: switching or replacement, assembly, adaptation, Modification, other uses, deletion and reordering "(p96). "It defines as an activity-based thinking the process that can be performed by Cooperative learning. Here the teacher assists the students in choosing a particular topic and helps them to develop it through a structured process. After choosing an idea, the students are given a tale where they perform the activity in steps corresponding to the letters in the name the full form of the individual letters is given below: S – Substitute, C – Combine, A – Adapt, M – Modify, P – Put to another use, E – Eliminate, R – Reverse.

In the current world, the distance between different countries is getting shorter, and cultures have more and more contact with each other. Getting a deeper insight into foreign cultures is derived from translating literature; therefore, intercultural communication comes out of knowledge and understanding of others’ cultural features and peculiar customs. So, translation has contributed, largely, to the national and international revolution of knowledge; and such a contribution maximized the necessity of systematic teaching of translation and integrating its courses into university levels. According to Leonardo (2010) Translation plays a vital role in an increasingly globalized world and in increasingly multilingual Europe where it is used daily (p17). Translation has always been the core of the controversies on whether it can be a valid and effective tool in foreign language learning. Until recently, translation was out of favor with the language teaching community. Translation as a language learning activity was considered as being unsuitable within the context of foreign language learning (Brown, 2002). It is still ignored as a useful language learning tool because of being not a communicative activity that is not suited to the general needs of the language learner. Translation is considered as time-consuming, boring, and irrelevant. Translation courses are also used as assessment techniques to check students’ linguistic and communicative abilities.

Oxford (1992) defines translation as the communication of the meaning of a source-language text using an equivalent target-language text. N-Eldin (2010), says that translation consists of reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message. The translation is an art, and, like all other arts, it is difficult to master, for it seeks to convey the exact meaning of what is expressed in one language into another. So the whole art of translation lies in expressing exactly and precisely without either omitting thought from the
original passage or adding any unnecessary or superfluous idea to it, the sense and meaning of the Vernacular passage in simple, idiomatic English. The translation is a success if It is a faithful translation of the original into English., It conveys exactly the sense and meaning of the original, It reproduces all the details, omitting nothing, It is a translation as a whole. And Its total impression is the same as that of the original.

1.1 Problem statement

Accordingly, translation courses represent a basic component in most English undergraduate programs in Saudi' Faculties of Arts and Education. Thus, it is necessary to use new approaches and methods of teaching English as a foreign language in designing and teaching translation courses. So, this research suggested the SCAMPER model teach translation.

Teaching English is considered an important means to help students to lead their life. The translation was a significant part of English language teaching for a long time, and then a significant missing part for a long time also. With the arrival and then total dominance of communicative methodologies, translation was quickly consigned to the past, along with other ‘traditional' tools such as dictation, reading aloud and drills. However, it and these other abandoned activities are now a feature of many communicative classrooms and successful aids to learning, although the approach to using them has changed. As Duff (1989) says, teachers and students now use translation to learn, rather than learning the translation. Modern translation activities usually move from the first language to the second language, (although the opposite direction can also be seen in lessons with more specific aims), have clear communicative aims and real cognitive depth, show high motivation levels and can produce impressive communicative results. From the real life we live development in Saudi Arabia, Teaching English in universities is one of development. To be acquainted with the current situation of teaching English at the faculty of education, in Majmaah university. A pilot study was conducted to provide data about teaching English there. It involved the teachers and the students. The researcher noted the following:

1. Translation is the least skill in which students shows real desire and willingness to carry out. This may be due to the prevailing traditional method of teaching writing in which teachers concentrate on the final product, i.e., correct grammar and spelling. In addition, they know nothing about the new trends and methods of teaching translation. They do not know how to translate a good sentence following a systematic procedure.

2. Teachers complained about students' inability to organize their ideas logically, lack of suitable information to cover the assigned topics, poor vocabulary, structure and spelling mistakes when they translate any topics.

3. Most of the teachers do not give their students enough choice. They still impose certain topics on their students to translate on regardless of their various interests and needs. They rarely offer their students two or at most three topics to select from.

4. Some teachers are preoccupied with teaching students lists of new vocabulary and sets of grammatical rules.

Also, the researcher conducted a translation exam to the students in the faculty of education in Majmaah university to measure their actual level. Analyzing students results in exam revealed
remarkable weaknesses in translation skills. Their translation showed lack of sentence organization skills. Most of them start their translation by using the wrong words and using a dictionary in the wrong way. They seldom use any coherence markers or present a clear, logical well-developed content. So, the problem of the research could be summarized in the following statement: The students in the English department at the faculty of education in Majmaah university suffer from a low level of translation skills. This might be due to the methods used in teaching translation at this stage and other factors. Therefore, the current research attempted to use scamper model in developing translation skills to major students in the faculty of education.

1.2 Objectives of the research:
The present research aimed at:
1- Identifying the effectiveness of using the SCAMPER model in developing translation skills among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah University.
2- Raising the attitudes towards translation among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah University.

1.3 Questions of the research:-
This research attempted to answer the following questions:
1- To what extent would the use the SCAMPER model raises translation skills among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah University.
3- To what extent would the use the SCAMPER model raise the attitudes towards translation among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah University.

1.4 Significance of the research:
The importance of the current research can be summed up in the following points:
1- It may help in developing English translation skills for major students in the faculty of education.
2- It is an attempt to draw teachers’ attention to their real roles as facilitators and supervisors for their students.
3- It offers EFL teachers a manual for using the SCAMPER model in teaching translation.
4- Benefits of those responsible for the strategies of teaching the English language in the Ministry of Education in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia.

1.5 Review of related studies:
A- studies about the effectiveness of using the SCAMPER model
- Elbadarin (2006)
The study aimed to identify the effectiveness of the strategy of generating ideas (SCAMPER) to teach thinking in a sample of the students and its impact of the program on their creativity and self-concept. The study consisted of 97 male and female students divided into two groups. The researcher used the semi-empirical approach as a method of study and adopted a Skamper's model to generate ideas. The study reached several results, the most important of it is the impact of using the strategy of generating ideas (Scamper model). Also raising of the score in measuring creative abilities and subtotals of different dimensions. Also, raising the score of the self-concept for the
sample of the study by using the SCAMPER model. There is no trace of the sex variable on the total score of the self-concept scale.

- **Buser, Buser, Gladding & Wilkerson, (2011):**
  This study explores and examines the experiences of extension students in learning and applying the SCAMPER model for creative thinking and innovation. The sample of the study consisted of (54) male and female students who were selected from the universities located in the north-east and south-eastern regions, in the United States of America. The researcher used the experimental approach based on the Scamper model. This study has reached several results; the most important of it is the statistical relation significant correlation between the Scamper and the main aspects of thinking and creativity thinking among students. It also has contributed to the improvement of continuous modeling in improve and facilitates the training of students over time. Also, the results indicated that Scamper approach is one of the ways to stimulate thinking patterns among students in counseling. It was also supported both concentrated and broad thinking patterns, which students associate with their ability to generate new Ideas.

- **Masoudi, (2012):**
  This study identifies the effectiveness of a training program based on the Scamper program in the development of the cognitive survey for talented kindergarten children in Tabouk City, Saudi Arabia. The study consisted of (43) kindergarten children divided into two groups. The researcher used the semi-experimental method and Cognitive Imagery Survey' scale as a tool of the study. The study has reached many results, the most important of it is differences in statistical significance (0.05) between the two groups of study and comparison for the benefit of the study group, indicating the effectiveness of the program Training in the development of cognitive curiosity among talented kindergarten children in all dimensions.

- **Malvira, (2012):**
  This study describes the nature of reading as an educational process, and clarifying the strategies that can be Used by the teacher in teaching reading, and clarifying the role of Scamper in teaching students. The researcher used the documentation method based on the presentation of the Scamper program in the educational process Reading the analytical texts. The results showed that reading is an activity process used to read some texts, and to understand what the text is about. Through reading, students can obtain . Many strategies have emerged used by the teacher in the teaching reading, but the researcher uses an effective strategy which is Scamper to develop the thinking and creativity of students.

- **Sabri and Ruwais (2013):**
  The study aimed to examine the effectiveness of Scamper's science education program in developing thinking skills and Innovation of students in the Primary School of Madinah. The study sample consisted of (54) talented students. The study used innovation thinking scale as a tool for study, and adopted the semi-experimental approach as a method of study. The study has reached many results, differences of statistical significance between average scores of each group and
comparative about the acquisition of thinking skills in scale' application dimension for the study group. Also, the impact of scamper' scale on skills is much greater than that of the ETA square.

Studies about investigating translation:
Gabr (2002) surveyed to investigate the actual practices of teaching and learning translation in some Egyptian universities. The study results showed that both learning and teaching translation need a systematic change on the part of the teacher and the student. His investigation revealed that the scene of translation teaching in Egypt is very peculiar; what is actually offered is quite arbitrary and depends almost entirely on personal initiatives on the part of teachers.

Safwat (2002) has drawn attention by his investigative study to the low level of New Valley faculty of education's English majors in translation. He identified the main features of the problem in the poor practices of teaching translation courses, a system of testing and evaluation, and consequently, the under-average performance of students.

2. Methodology:
2.1 Participants: The participants in this study consisted of 40 students enrolled in the English department at Majmaah University, identified as intermediate proficiency level students of EFL. The native language of all participants was Arabic.

2.2 Design of research: Due to the nature of the research, one group pre-posttest design was utilized in the present study. A translation test was designed and administered on the students before and after the experiment.

2.3 Procedures of the research:
The following procedures were followed to conduct the research:
1. Reviewing related literature.
2. Designing the materials and tools of the study.
3. Validating the materials and tools by a group of jury members.
4. Selecting the sample of the research from students in level six in the English department in the faculty of education in Majmaah University.
5. Pre testing the sample using the translation test and a scale of assessing students' attitudes towards translation.
6. Implementing the experiment based on the SCAMPER model.
7. Post testing the sample using the translation test and a scale of assessing students' attitudes towards translation.
8. Analyzing students’ scores on the exams statistically using a T-test.
9. Reporting and discussing results.
10. Presenting recommendations and suggestions for further studies.

2.4 Data Collection:
In order to collect the data the research included the number of tools:
2.4.1. Pre - Post Test in Translation.
Stating the Aims of the Test: The test aims to assess the English majors’ use of translation, and assess the degree of development in the participants’ proficiency of translation.

Preparing the Instructions of the Test: Instructions were written in a clear simple English language and they were discussed by the examiner before starting the test. They include all information needed by students to complete the test; items of the test, scoring points, time allowed and how to give answers.

Constructing the Test: Before constructing the test, a table of specifications was developed to specify the content and number of items to guarantee that all the learning intended outcomes were measured, and assured that the numbers of items were suitable for assessing all the objectives. (Refer to table “1” for table of specification)

The test was designed and implemented to tap into developed translation skills of the students, commensurate with the syllabus and the objectives of the course. The test was made up of five questions. Criteria of assessment included accuracy in reaching the intended meaning in the translation language and choice of words (semantic accuracy), contextual appropriateness of whole text meaning (pragmatic competency), grammatical and syntactic accuracy, and stylistic appropriateness of the translation language.

Scoring the Test: The total test score is 60 points. They are assigned as follows:

→ The first question as true or false was assigned ten marks with ten points, the second question was choosing the type and it was assigned ten marks with five points. The third question was correction of the errors and matching and it was assigned fifteen marks with 15 points. The fourth question was translating three passages into English and it was assigned fifteen marks each passage was five marks and scoring according to the rubric (1). The fifth question was translating passages into Arabic and it was assigned fifteen marks each part was five marks and scoring according to the rubric (2).

Piloting the Test: One month before the experiment, a group of (25) students was selected randomly for piloting the test. Piloting the test helped to determine the following:

(a) Test' Clarity:
The test was found to be very clear and learners answered the questions without finding any ambiguity.

(b) Test' Validity:
Face validity: According to Heaton (1988) "if a test item looks right to other testers, teachers, and moderators, it can be described as having at least face validity". A jury of EFL teachers, supervisors, and EFL experts has approved the test to be valid and consistent with the objectives aimed to be measured. (P.153)

- The internal consistency: To expense the internal consistency, the researcher used (SPSS) program by the correlation coefficient between each question and total score for the test.
Table (1) shows the value of the correlation coefficient between each question and the total score for the test and its statistical significance.

### Table 1

**The correlation coefficient between each question and total score for the test**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Correlation coefficient</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.44</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td>.58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(C) **Test Reliability:**

Cronbach’s alpha was used through an SPSS program to compute the correlation between the scores obtained by the students on each question of the test. The reliability coefficient was (.799). According to Heaton (1988), Allam (2000), it was suitable.

### Table 2

**Cronbach’s alpha coefficient for each question and total score for the test**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cronbach’s alpha</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(d) **Preparing the Final Form of the Test**

In the light of TEFL experts’ modifications and the results of piloting the test, the test was built in its final form to be used students in the basic experiment. (Refer to Appendix “1”)

2.4.2. **A scale of assessing attitude towards translation.**

In this research, the researcher implemented the scale was made up of a 25-item, 3-point Likert scale. The purpose of developing this scale was to reveal the attitudes of students towards translation. The attitude scale first draws background information and nature of translation in the first dimension, and then it elicits the participants' reactions to using Translation in the second dimension (See Appendix(2)). The researcher judged the scale with a jury of EFL teachers, and EFL experts were consulted to judge the content, form and validity of the scale. The scale was piloted twenty students with two weeks as a breaking time - professors of Translation, TEFL, and Applied Linguistics from five universities in Saudi Arabia. Using a test-retest method, reliability was assessed using Cronbach's alpha coefficients and intra-class correlation coefficients. The item-to-scale correlation was assessed using Spearman's rank correlations (ρ) between scale scores and their constituent items. The reliability coefficient of the scale using Cronbach Alpha was (α = 0.94) which is an appropriate value.

**The procedures of implication:**

Teaching translation during the implication of this research following the SCAMPER model because learning English translation isn’t easy task, it requires using effective strategies to help students understand the nature of translation and how to employ them in different contexts whether in English classrooms or in situations occurred in daily life taking into account the importance of forming grammatically corrected sentences. Among the different learning strategies proved to be effective and efficient in the teaching and learning processes is the use of the SCAMPER model. Taking into account that the current teaching strategies used in teaching the English language aren’t so efficient in achieving the educational objectives. The researcher seeks to make full use of this model in the
process of teaching English rules and translation for major students in the faculty of education. Also using the SCAMPER model in order to improve the English translation of major students in the English department in the faculty of education – Majmaah University.

Under the main objective of the experiment, there are many sub- objectives that can be shown as follows:

- Improving major students’ capacity to use English translation.
- Promoting major students’ capacity of expressing the meaning using the appropriate English translation.
- Improving major students’ capacity for communicating with their peers in the classroom.
- Developing major school students’ capacity for using grammatically correct sentences based on the words and rules they have studied.

The researcher implicated this experiment in 6 session to the major students to teach translation based on the SCAMPER model. The steps of each session as following:

- The researcher gave students the passage , then divided them into groups , ask them to generate ideas for new products and services by encouraging them to ask different types of questions, which will help them understand, translate and produce good production .

The researcher explain each step of the SCAMPER model to use it in translate the passages as the following:

**Step 1: “S” for Substitute**

Take away a part of the selected thing, concept or situation and replace it with something else. Anything can be an item for substitution. The possibilities include steps in a process, product parts, the people or the place. Substitution is a technique of trial and error, of replacing one object with another till you are able to determine the correct idea.

For example, there is a lot of rice in the pot. 

- **يوج دلة م الذي يالفوعاء**
- **يوجد أرز وفير في الوعاء**

Here we make substitution (plenty word instead of a lot of ) the translation is not change.

**Step 2: “C” for Combine**

The next step is to contemplate combining elements of the situation or problem you’re facing so as think up something new. This is in line with the view of many creativity experts that creativity has to do with combining already existing things in a fresh way.

So join, force together or affiliate two or more elements pertaining to your subject matter and contemplate routes by which such a combination could possibly take you to a solution.

For example :

- **Dairy protects give us calcium which makes our bones and teeth strong.**
- **ن تعطينا الكالسيوم الذي يجعل عظامنا واسناننا قوية**

Here we use step 2 (combine ) the words bones and teeth combine together and write body.
Step 3: “A” for Adapt
Think if there’s a solution for another problem that you may mold to suit your situation.
For example, he is 1.98 cm. he is tall
He is 2.00 m, he is very tall
So, here we put very to make the meaning strong and to adapt.

Step 4: “M” for Modify/Magnify
Pose a question to yourself about which ideas you can produce if you magnify or modify your situation or problem. Magnifying parts of or the whole of your idea may enhance its perceived worth or furnish fresh insight pertaining to which components are most significant.
For example, Ali: I watched the film. it was good
Karim: i watched it, it was fantastic
So, here we change the word fantastic instead of good to implicate modifying in the sentence.

Step 5: “P” for Put to another use
Contemplate how you can put your current idea to different uses or what could be reused from elsewhere so as to fix your own problem. Frequently, an idea only turns out to be great when applied in a different manner than first imagined. Modify the goal of subject. Contemplate why it exists, its purpose of use and what it is assumed to do. Confront all of these suppositions and propose new and strange purposes.
For example, they played football yesterday.
Bassim played the piano.
We went to the theater to watch a play
Here we use the word ( play ) in three sentences with different uses
Another example, using the word focus in many uses
Kate's newest poem will be the focus of today's discussion.
The tennis player never lost his focus through the match.
Jams will focus on writing gold at the Olympic games rather breaking the 400 m world record.
He adjusted the slide projector to focus on the image.
She focused all day after taking a new medicine.

Step 6: “E” for Eliminate (or Minify)
Contemplate what would happen if you eliminated components or elements of your idea or if you minimized, reduced or simplified aspects of it. By way of repeated elimination or trimming of ideas, processes and objects, it is possible to steadily constrict your challenge to that function or part of the most significance.
For example: the shirt is too big to wear.
The shirt is too big.
Here we use (eliminate step ) the same meaning when translate after deleting the word to wear.
Example: Apply cream liberally into clean and dry skin.
Here, deleting liberally to clear the meaning.
Another example:

للاستاذ الدكتور علي الملاحترم

The translation of this sentence (the respected doctor Ali)

Here deleting the word (للاستاذ) because there is no this word in English (dr professor)

Step 7: “R” for Rearrange or Reverse

Rearrange – Contemplate whether you can do some kind of rearranging whether
hanging the sequence, pattern or layout; interchanging components; changing schedule; changing pace; or interchanging cause and effect. Contemplate changing the order of processes or other hierarchy involved. Reverse the orientation or direction. Turn it inside-out, upside-down, or backwards – just make it go against the direction it was meant to be used or to proceed.

For example, it was a beautiful cold day.

آلة يوما باردا جمال

It was a beautiful cold day.

لاية يوما باردا جمال

Here we rearrange the sentence to be correct.

Another example, the boy ate the apple

اكل الولد التفاحة

3. Results:

The Finding and results of the current research showed after using the SCAMPER model for one semester, the participants were use it in translation in an eight-week treatment and submit them to the researcher in order to obtain feedback and rewrite based on the feedback. The sample of the study (n=40) do translation exercises and were checked by the researcher. The group was post-tested using translation test. At the experimental design of the study depended on comparing students' scores in the test before and after using the SCAMPER model. Therefore, it was concluded that the resulting differences regarding the dependent variables were due to the experimental treatment and accordingly to the independent variable. “T” test formula was used to analyze the differences between means of scores of the study subjects in the Pre and the Post-measurements. To answer the first question (To what extent would using SCAMPER model raise translation skills among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah university).

Table (2) shows the results for the pre-post testing of the sample’s translation skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Post test</th>
<th>Pre test</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>²η</th>
<th>d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Test</td>
<td>Means</td>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
<td>Means</td>
<td>Standard Deviation</td>
<td>62.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>41.12</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>6.68</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*it dedicated in 0.05 and 0.01.

It is clear from table (3) that there were statistically significant differences between the pre and posttests mean scores favoring the posttest application, and it indicted that the objective of the experiment are achieved in raising the level of the students.
Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills

Tharwa

Also, It is clear from table (3 ) that the size of the impact in translation test before and after the experiment by the value of double ETA (0.45), and the strength of impact (d) is (1.8), and these values indicate a very significant effect for the translation development through using SCAMPER model, according to Fouad Abu Hatab and Amaal Sadiq (1996.443), and Reda Aser (2003.672): If the value of double Eta is = 0.15, this indicates a large value (0.15) .The variance in the dependent variable can be due to the impact of the independent variable).If the value of Eta is = 0.20, this indicates a very significant impact (0.20 ).The variance in the dependent variable can be traced to the impact of the independent variable).

To answer the second question (To what extent would using SCAMPER model raise the attitudes towards translation among major students in the faculty of education – Majmaah university ), Table (4) shows the results for the pre-post testing of the students’ attitudes towards translation scale .

Table 4
"t" test and the level of significance of the differences between the pre and post application of the group in the students’ attitudes towards translation scale as well as the effect size (the value of (² η)) and the strength of influence (d) (n = 40)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Application</th>
<th>Means</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>t value</th>
<th>§η²</th>
<th>D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First dimension(nature of translations)</td>
<td>Pre</td>
<td>13.53</td>
<td>2.223</td>
<td>4.378-a</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post</td>
<td>22.52</td>
<td>4.611</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second dimension (using translation)</td>
<td>Pre</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>1.080</td>
<td>4.293-a</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post</td>
<td>71.80</td>
<td>12.169</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Pre</td>
<td>14.28</td>
<td>2.407</td>
<td>4.374-a</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post</td>
<td>39.52</td>
<td>6.029</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is clear from table (4) that there were statistically significant differences between the pre and post application mean scores favoring the post application, and it indicted that the objective of the experiment are achieved in raising the level of the group.

Also, It is clear from table (4) that the size of the impact in the students’ attitudes towards translation scale before and after the experiment for the group of the study by the value of double ETA ((0.45), the strength of impact (d) of (1.9), and these values indicate a very significant
impact for the development of students’ attitudes towards translation through using SCAMPER model.

4. Discussion:
Upon reviewing the data and analyzing the results, the following points were concluded:

1. Students appeared more motivated which was sustained over using SCAMPER model in learning translation. Students appeared more enjoyed, and engaged in many activities than previously. Even students who had previously been fairly passive in the class became more involved. Also, the researcher was impressed by the persistence of the group to ensure that each member of the group had achieved a thorough understanding of whatever was being discussed.

2. Using SCAMPER model help students to provide information and repeat it as their desires, and deal with their abilities appropriately, and provide immediate feedback to determine position and to achieve their goals more admirably.

3. Scamper model is characterized by its integration of content and mind-raising elements suitable to the students’ abilities.

4. Using SCAMPER model helped to establish a positive relationship between learning translation and positive attitudes towards it. This conclusion can be elaborated as follows:

   A. Since a positive attitude change occurred due to the introduction and implementation of using SCAMPER model in this research, it is important to realize that teaching translation by using SCAMPER encouraged students to become translators. Students learned by being active participants rather than by passively absorbing information. Using SCAMPER model encouraged students to become participants in their learning.

   B. Through making Translation purposeful, students became better translators because they had a sense of audience.

5. Using SCAMPER model provided the kind of climate conducive to the growth of translation sub skills and meeting the individual needs of the students.

6. The change in the EFL teacher's role from the traditional role which has been evaluating the learner's first draft as if it were the final product, and assuming the role of a consultant, facilitating the learner's step-by-step creation of the piece of translation, is crucial in helping students translate better.

7. Evaluation sheets developed by the researcher and filled by students after each session provided another new evidence of how much effectiveness was there as a result of using the SCAMPER model in training students on develop their translation skills. Students’ responses to the items of the sheet offered valuable feedback of how students advance and feel toward the course. Students also reported their opinions of the degree of achieving session’s goals, materials, teacher’s performance, activities, procedures of teaching, group work and time of sessions besides the additional free comments.
5. Conclusion:

The current research may include an important implication based on the improvement in one of the important language proficiencies. That is to say improvement in translation may lead to the improvement of the other language abilities and arts. This is due to the general nature of the language learning process and the nature of translation as a proficiency that depicts many other analytical, receptive and productive language abilities.

Finally, results of the current study may draw the attention of researchers, teachers and educators to the real need for developing systematic and humanistic training courses of translation in particular and English language courses in general in faculties of educations. Thus, these results may be of some profit to those who are currently dissatisfied with the predominant practices and models of teaching translation in faculties of education and who are seeking an alternative approach that may function as a solid foundation for effective and successful institutional teaching approaches to teacher education. The results also may be of great importance for educationalists who are responsible for putting the criteria and qualifications of prospective English teachers and the kind of teacher training that should be provided to them to ensure that the educational system is founded on a solid pedagogical framework. It can be said that if these courses are pursued with enthusiasm, comprehensibility and interests of graduates, it can then help radically improving the efficacy of English language teaching program and the quality of the graduate teachers.

To conclude, the afore-mentioned discussion indicates that there were many incorporated aspects and many elements and practices that paved the way for the success of the current study. The achieved level of effectiveness cannot be attributed to any other factor but using well-structured and highly judged materials, practicing integrative activities and drills, following systematically sequenced steps of a highly interactive method of teaching (the SCAMPER model) and using well-adapted and accurately developed tools of assessment.

6. Recommendations:

In the light of the results of the research the following recommendations are made:

- Pre-service, as well as in-service English teachers should be trained on conducting the SCAMPER model as a leading trend in both teaching and learning foreign languages.
- There must be a real shift from individual to collaborative learning as a means for building up learners’ knowledge and providing learners with varied opportunities for interaction and negotiation of meaning.
- The role of the teacher, in translation classes should be changed from a lecturer to a co-learner to promote and facilitate a student-centered approach to learning in which students become responsible for their own learning.
- Utilizing a variety of instructional aids in order to teach translation.
- In successful translation classes students need to be reminded of the purpose for their translation: publishing and communicating. Teachers are expected to help students make connections between translation in the classroom and in the world at large.
- Students-translators should choose their own topics or situations that are of interest to them and their lives.
teachers should give students translation activities related to their thinking.

Teachers need to encourage their students, guide and support their hesitant steps, reassure them it is acceptable to make mistakes on first drafts and remind them the purpose of the initial translation is to communicate ideas.

Students should have the chance of self-evaluation by providing them with guidelines and basics of evaluation process to maximize the role of the learners in the process of learning and minimize the effort that the teacher may do.

Translation courses should integrate both translation theories with translation practices.

Translation assessment should be objective and formative in a process of providing clear and reliable criteria.

7. **Suggestions for Further Research:**

The following points are suggested for further research:

- Examining the effectiveness of using the SCAMPER model in teaching other courses of EFL to English majors.
- Examining the effectiveness of using other variations of the SCAMPER model in teaching English courses for beginners.
- Examining the effectiveness of the SCAMPER model of assessment with different levels of language proficiency.
- Conducting a comparative study of the SCAMPER model and other teaching approaches to investigate the most effective in developing social and communicative abilities of EFL students.
- Conducting a study to analyze the relation between translation proficiency and other language skills.

**About the Author:**

**Fatma Farid Fakhry Tharwa** is a faculty member at the Department of Curriculum and Teaching Methods, College of Education in the New Valley, The New valley University, Egypt. She earned his PhD in TEFL from Assiut University, Egypt in 2012. She worked as assistant professor in Majmaah university, Saudi Arabia. Her major areas of research are teaching English, translation skills, SCAMPER model.

ORCID ID:- https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1210-1805

References:


Duff, A (1990) Bringing translation back into the language class (Practical English Teaching 10/3)

Deller, S & Rinvolucri, M (2002), Using the Mother Tongue: making the most of the learner's language, Delta Publishing.

El -Badarin, Shade, (2006), the effectiveness of generating thoughts strategy (SCAMPER) in
developing the ability to creative and self-concept among a sample of Jourdan students, journal of education studies, vol. 11, N.(5), Alokia university, Aman.


Murphy, B (1988), Teaching translation and teaching through translation (MET 15/4)

Tudor, I (1987), Using translation in ESP (ELT Journal 41/4)

Nasr El-Din, A.M. (2010). A Proposed Program for Developing Translation Strategies and Skills of English Department Students in Faculties of Education. PhD, Faculty of Education, Mansoura University, Damietta Branch.


Appendix (1) Translation Test

Dear student: this exam for the research please answer the questions and you have 120 minutes:

Student' name:

Question 1: Decide if the statements are TRUE (T) or FALSE (F) (one point each)

1. In translation, we translate meaning (       )
2. English and Arabic languages belong to the same families (       )
3. Translation means transferring the text from the SL to TL (       )
4. Interpretation is a written form of translation (       )
5. Machine translation is also known as human translation (       )
6. One common problem in translation is the lexical problem (       )
7. To be a good translator you must have the ability to write well in the TL (       )
8. TL means the text language (       )
9. Free translation also known as idiomatic translation (       )
10. It is only the human translator who is able of interpreting certain cultural components (       )
Question 2: Choose the correct translation: (one point each)

1. **Birds of feather flock together**
   - ظهرت عذره معه
   - ظهرت عذره معه
   - ظهرت عذره معه

2. **Every cloud has a silver lining**
   - لطيفين من ذلك الاستلاب
   - لطيفين من ذلك الاستلاب
   - لطيفين من ذلك الاستلاب

3. **A flash in the pan**
   - لا خاب محشي شئ
   - لا خاب محشي شئ
   - لا خاب محشي شئ

4. **Do as you would be done**
   - عامل الناس كما تحب ان يعاملوك
   - عامل الناس كما تحب ان يعاملوك
   - عامل الناس كما تحب ان يعاملوك

5. **There is a black sheep in every family.**
   -偉(offset)ة لتتمام مه المتلمد
   -偉(offset)ة لتتمام مه المتلمد
   -偉(offset)ة لتتمام مه المتلمد

6. **Let us turn a new page**
   - دعنا نتألف كتاب جديد
   - دعنا نتألف كتاب جديد
   - دعنا نتألف كتاب جديد

7. **It is a donkey work to write a book.**
   - أنه عمل حمار لتأليف الكتب
   - أنه عمل حمار لتأليف الكتب
   - أنه عمل حمار لتأليف الكتب

8. **A friend in need is a friend indeed**
   - لصديق قت لحاجة
   - لصديق قت لحاجة
   - لصديق قت لحاجة

9. **He killed him in cold blood.**
    - قتله بدم بارد
    - قتله بدم بارد
    - قتله بدم بارد

10. **A creaking gate hangs long**
    - الباب ذو مسمار يعيش طويلا
    - الباب ذو مسمار يعيش طويلا
    - الباب ذو مسمار يعيش طويلا
Question 3: Correct the errors in the Arabic translation (one point each)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The errors</th>
<th>The corrections</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. I will do my best</td>
<td>فعلت مابوسعي</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. She didn’t eat much</td>
<td>هي لن تسألالشفراً</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. He doesn’t like coffee</td>
<td>لا يريح ب</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Where have you been?</td>
<td>أي لنفتي تنظن؟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. He is eating an apple</td>
<td>قد أكل التفاحة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. You can do it.</td>
<td>قد تستطيع فعلها</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. No children allowed</td>
<td>للطفل</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Never say this again</td>
<td>بدلا قول دناشيهة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Do you play tennis?</td>
<td>هل لعبت التنس؟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. We must talk</td>
<td>يمكننا التحدث</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Match the sentence with accurate translation: (one point each)

1. The boy broke the car | نأس سريلب |
2. You can take a break | تسير للهدقية |
3. Some people break the law | ينام الأطفال وما علقا |
4. Children sleep a sound sleep | ميتيت عانشترتاح |
5. It is a sound basis | يخلف عن ضرلانون |

Question 4: Translate the following from English to Arabic 10 marks

1. Eid al-Fitr is a very important Islamic celebration. It’s my favorite time of year. It happens at the end of Ramadan. People dress in their best clothes and put lights and decorations on their homes. Many streets have fairs with music, dancing, fireworks and kids’ games.
Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills

Tharwa

2. Fruits such as mango, banana, strawberry, apple, watermelon, pear and others are rich in various essential nutrients like folate, iron, calcium, fibre, vitamin A, vitamin B, Vitamin C etc, which are very important for your kid's health.

3. Anxiety is a feeling of unease, such as worry or fear, that can be mild or severe. Everyone has feelings of anxiety at some point in their life – for example, you may feel worried and anxious about sitting an exam, or having a medical test or a job interview.

Words list: ( Anxiety= (نداء التوتر) unease= عدم الراحة

Question 5: Translate the following from Arabic to English 10 marks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation Rubrics</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clarity of meaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Similarity to SL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Format and style</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choice of words</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy of TL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies
ISSN: 2550-1542 | www.awej-tls.org
Using the SCAMPER Model to Develop Translation Skills

Tharwa

1. ترجمة عملية نقل من لغة (اللغة المصدر) إلى لغة مختلفة (اللغة الهدف). على سبيل المثال، في ترجمة نص من الإنجليزية إلى العربية، النص المصدر (اللغة الإنجليزية) يتكون من أحرف وصيغ، أما النص الهدف (اللغة العربية) فيتكون من الكلمات والجمل. عند ترجمة النص، يكون المترجم أحد أعمال الترجمة،مهما كان النص المصدر صاخبًا أو صامتًا، يجب أن يقرأ أو يفهمه ويجعل النص الهدف مفهومًا جيدًا. وعندما يصوب المترجم النص، يجب أن يعرف ما إذا كان النص الهدف سليمًا ومفهومًا جيدًا.

---

Appendix (2)

Translation Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Clarity of meaning</th>
<th>Similarity to SL</th>
<th>Format and style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Choice of words</td>
<td>Accuracy of TL</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A scale of assessing 'attitudes towards translation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>disagree</th>
<th>No opinion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-</td>
<td>When I learn any course, I want to look up a word I do not know.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-</td>
<td>I spend many times on translate tasks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-</td>
<td>I like translation course in the faculty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-</td>
<td>I practice translation in all English courses.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-</td>
<td>I think I have no difficulty translation activities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-</td>
<td>I feel comfortable when learn translation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7-</td>
<td>Translation tasks was enjoyable and interesting.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-</td>
<td>I think the translation as a course of English department is a waste of time.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-</td>
<td>It is fast and convenient to update information on translation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-</td>
<td>I like translation from Arabic to English</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-</td>
<td>I like translation from English to Arabic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-</td>
<td>I get constant, handy feedback on my translation tasks more easily</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-</td>
<td>Searching for the right meaning, using the facilities of the Dictionary is a useful experience for language learning, especially the Translator facility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-</td>
<td>I feel that translation activities have prepared me for the Level C1 language competence exam</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-</td>
<td>I think you could make faster progress in the foreign language learning through other means</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-</td>
<td>translation as a means of learning English is useful</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-</td>
<td>Translation helped me improve reading skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17-</td>
<td>Translation helped me improve writing skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-</td>
<td>Translation activities can use in other courses in the classroom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-</td>
<td>I like making comments on my classmates’ translations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-</td>
<td>The use of the dictionary is helpful for learning the usage of vocabulary.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21-</td>
<td>I feel that learning translation is a useful for me to share ideas with others.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22-</td>
<td>The use of the translation strategies is helpful for learning the grammar of English.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-</td>
<td>I have some difficulty in translation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-</td>
<td>As I have learned more about translation, I have come to like it more</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-</td>
<td>I think learn translation help me in work in the future.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Cognitive Study of Metaphors in the Glorious Qur’an: From a Linguistic to a Conceptual Approach

Mashael AlAjmi
Department of Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Languages
Princess Nourah bint Abdulrahman University
Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
The current study investigates the use of conceptual metaphors in the glorious Qur’an, focusing on four abstract concepts represented in the Qur’an through metaphors. These concepts are REWARD, HUMILIETY, HYPOCRISY, and ARROGANCE, which recur in many positions in the Qur’an. The researcher takes up selected Qur’anic verses that carry these abstract concepts and analyzes them at two levels: linguistic and conceptual. The study’s main theoretical contribution is to show how a linguistic approach can be transformed into a conceptual one and how this enriches our understanding of abstraction. The linguistic analysis of the verses is supported by translations of Qur’anic meanings, interpretation of the verses, and cultivating the use of Arabic and English dictionaries. To perform the cognitive analysis, the researcher uses Lakoff and Johnson’s Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT), which examines metaphor from two domains: the target domain, which is the abstract concept to be explained and the source domain, which is the mental mapping that helps us understand that abstract concept. The study finds that metaphors in the Qur’an are meant to be understood not only linguistically but conceptually too. It concludes by emphasizing the significance of a conceptual approach to the study of metaphor in the Qur’an not only for conceptual metaphor theory but also for the interpretation of the Qur’an and for Arabic linguistics.

Keywords: abstract concept, cognitive, linguistic metaphor, conceptual metaphor, Qur’an, source domain, target domain

Introduction: Metaphor Definition in Language and Psychology

Metaphor in the *Oxford English Dictionary* is defined as “a figure of speech in which a word or phrase is applied to an object or action to which it is not literally applicable.” It is employed for the sake of making an implicit comparison between two different objects (Knowles & Moon, 2006). Geraghty (2013) notes, however, that Arabic does not have one single term for ‘metaphor’, but rather three more specific terms covering different aspects of the concept specifically than how it is in English. Abd Al-Qahir Al-Jurjani, known as a “master of Arabic grammar,” devised the theoretical framework that describes poetic imagery in Arabic and presents these terms: *tashbih* (تشبيه), *tamthil* (تمثيل), and *isti’arah* (استعارة) (Geraghty, 2013, p.1). *Tashbih* can be translated as ‘simile’, in which two unlike objects are compared explicitly. *Tamthil* is similar to ‘extended metaphor’, where the comparison between unlike objects needs a deeper kind of analysis to infer the meaning. *Isti’arah* also roughly means ‘metaphor’, but a comparison made by referring explicitly to only one of the two meaning-elements that compose the comparison. These definitions, however, are purely linguistic, and do not get at the concept of metaphor held in the field of cognitive psychology, which involves mapping one experience into another through analogies in order to understand complex concepts (Vosniadou & Ortony, 1989).

Conceptual Metaphor Theory

In the field of cognitive linguistics, which is rooted in cognitive psychology (Moser, 2000), the word *conceptual* was first assigned to the word *metaphor* in 1980, when George Lakoff and Mark Johnson proposed Conceptual Metaphor Theory (CMT) in their book *Metaphors We Live By*. According to them, metaphor should not be viewed as part of “extraordinary language,” but as something that is common in our daily life, language, and thinking (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, p. 4). Knowles and Moon (2006) similarly describe metaphor as “a basic phenomenon that occurs throughout the whole range of language activity” (p. 2). In fact, metaphor in this view is not exclusively language-related; instead, metaphors also structure our thoughts and actions—the way the conceptual system in our brain works is “metaphorical in nature” (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, p. 4). Lakoff and Johnson (1980) state that “the essence of metaphor is under-standing and experiencing one kind of thing in terms of another” (p.5). Thus, understanding metaphor thoroughly involves investigating not only its linguistic aspect but also how language helps people acquire an understanding of abstract concepts in daily life.

Lakoff and Johnson (1980) examine metaphor from two levels: those of the *source domain* and the *target domain*. The latter relates to the abstract concept to be examined, while the former relates to the mapping process that occurs in the brain to understand that concept. In order to demonstrate how their theory works, Lakoff and Johnson give an example that we encounter frequently in our daily life. ARGUMENT is an abstract concept that can be processed mentally through the use of the conceptual metaphor ARGUMENT IS WAR. They suggest that WAR is a physical experience that involves the existence of proponents and opponents, in which each side must or is generally expected to either lose or win. Processing such an experience in such terms mediates our understanding of what the abstract concept ARGUMENT means and what actions are usually associated with it.
Types of Conceptual Metaphors

Lakoff and Johnson (1980) classify conceptual metaphors into three types: structural, orientational, and ontological. A structural metaphor is one in which the subject concept, that is, the target domain, can be understood and explained through the source domain it corresponds to. A good example is ARGUMENT IS WAR, given above: the source domain, WAR, “structures the actions we perform in arguing” (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980, p.5).

The second type of conceptual metaphors is orientational metaphors. As the term suggests, these are based on orientation in relation to space: “up-down, in-out, front-back, on-off, deep-shallow, central-peripheral” (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980, p.15). This kind of spatial orientation does not explain the target domain in terms of the source domain, as in structural metaphors; instead, concepts are organized with respect to one another—an example given is HAPPY IS UP, in which the source domain, which is UP, imparts an orientation to the target domain which is HAPPY. The same goes for SAD IS DOWN, for example. Such metaphors can be found in many utterances used in everyday communication, such as I am feeling high/low.

The third type is ontological metaphors, which go beyond orientational metaphors in the rich basis they give us for understanding and interpreting complex abstractions. Through ontological metaphors, our experiences are explained in terms of objects, entities, or substances that can be referred to, counted, and/or categorized. These entities can include ideas, emotions, and events. An example is INFLATION IS UP, where the experience of prices increasing is perceived as an entity through the noun inflation (Lakoff & Johnson, 1980).

Studies on Conceptual Metaphor in the Holy Qur’an

The Qur’an is well known as the foundation of Islamic faith, viewed by Muslims as the most glorious book, from which they take guidance for this life and the hereafter. The language of the Qur’an manifests the richness of the Arabic language across realms of knowledge and expression. It is viewed by believers as a miraculous book that contains incomparably eloquent rhetorical language that cannot and will never be matched by humans. Furthermore, it is understood to include news from the past, the present, and the future, making it a wonder (Salamah, 2002). Gaining more knowledge about and from the Qur’an has helped many people develop different and better explanations of what they may encounter in life.

Studying the use of conceptual metaphor in the Qur’an is a new way of appreciating this glorious book and the Arabic language. Some studies of metaphor in Arabic tackle how abstract concepts are rendered and clarified through the use of metaphor with specific reference to the Qur’an but without referring to any theoretical framework. For instance, the way Al-Handiyani (2008) examines the use of metaphor in Surat Al-Baqarah (the second chapter of the Qur’an), is at a purely linguistic, superficial level. Al-Turk (2011) studies metaphors in the Quran in relation to their meaning, but only descriptively, grouping them under abstract concepts without explaining the mental mapping process that occurs to allow the reader to grasp such concepts. Hypocrisy, stinginess, forgiveness, and patience are some abstract concepts she includes in her study. She classifies such concepts into two groups: prohibited attributes/manners Muslims should avoid and
good attributes/manners Muslims should have. Al-Ameer (2007) published a book on how description is employed rhetorically in the Qur’an, including a chapter on how abstract concepts in the Qur’an are represented through physical experiences in order to transfer something abstract to something concrete. Al-Ameer (2007) and Al-Turk (2011) illuminate our knowledge of the effectiveness of these Qur’anic metaphors to illustrate abstractions, but this knowledge needs to be systematized into a theory to enrich Arabic linguistics and our knowledge of the language of the Qur’an. This is basically what Lakoff and Johnson’s CMT provides.

However, there are a few studies that give a theoretically supported cognitive-linguistic analysis of metaphors in the Quran. Berrada (2006) examines the metaphorical meanings of LIGHT and DARKNESS in the Qur’an using a CMT approach, relating LIGHT to positive qualities and DARKNESS to negative ones. He stresses that the Qur’an (like any other text) must be interpreted using a conceptual approach to show how metaphors assist the process of comprehending complex concepts, because this is what metaphors were meant for, that is, intrinsically how they work. Sani and Ruma (2014) investigate the use of conceptual metaphors in the Qur’an supported by Lakoff and Johnson’s theory, focusing on LIFE and DEATH as target domains, concretized in source domains such as the life cycle of plants, which germinate, bloom, and wither.

Abu Libdeh (2015) studies the way human beings are conceptualized through metaphors and how such metaphors represent our actions. He explains how the human body represents human actions. An example is the HEAD, the upper part of human body; in Arabic culture, raising one’s head is associated with dignity, a positive quality that is thus associated with the upper part of the body, while the lower part is undignified. Like the other writers cited in the previous paragraph, Abu Libdeh too emphasizes that Qur’anic metaphors should be conceptualized to reach a better translation of the meanings of the Qur’an.

Methodology and Data Analysis

In this study, the researcher employs a qualitative research method, describing the focal metaphors used linguistically first and conceptually second. Nassaji (2015) states that “qualitative research collects data qualitatively, and the method of analysis is also primarily qualitative. This often involves an inductive exploration of the data to identify recurring themes, patterns, or concepts and then describing and interpreting those categories” (pp. 129–130).

The resources that have supported the researcher are several. The first one is, obviously, the glorious Qur’an itself, which, as an article of Muslim faith cannot be translated and remains miraculous in itself, only approximated. The second resource is then Al-Hilali and Khan’s English translation of the Qur’an (1984). The third is the exegeses of the Qur’an by Ibn-Katheer, Al-Tabari, and Al-Qortoby compiled in the King Saud University Online Electronic Qur’an Project. The classical Arabic dictionary the Lisan Al-Arab (Ibn Manzur, 1290) and several English dictionaries were consulted to examine the linguistic meaning of key words related to the metaphor investigated. The abstract concepts the researcher selected are REWARD, HUMILITY, HYPOCRISY, and ARROGANCE, each of which recurs in multiple places in the Qur’an. Last
but not least is research presenting the theoretical framework of CMT, primarily Lakoff and
Johnson (1980), which shifts the interpretation of metaphors from a linguistic to a conceptual
orientation. Using these works, the researcher attempts to show how the conceptual approach of
analysis contributes to the linguistic interpretation of metaphors in the Qur’an.

Abstract Concepts Represented through Metaphors in the Qur’an:

1. REWARD:
‘Who is he that will lend to Allâh a goodly loan so that He may multiply it to him many times?
And it is Allâh that decreases or increases (your provisions), and unto Him you shall return.’
(Sura 57:11)

The metaphor in this verse comes in the form of a question. Linguistically, the two objects
being compared in this verse are a man who lends money to whomever needs it and a man who
lends money to Allah. The difference between the two loans is that the man who lends to somebody
in need may not get his money back, and will take a loss, whereas the person who lends Allah
money will see his money multiplied by Allah, which has been stated by Al-Tabari. The
comparison was made to explain the unseen reward a Muslim gets from the deity when he gives
his money to people in need (LENDING TO THE NEEDY IS LENDING TO GOD).

The linguistic interpretation provided above can be transformed into a conceptual one
through CMT as follows. The metaphor employed in this verse concertizes the abstract concept
REWARD that a Muslim will get in the hereafter. REWARD as a concept deals with feelings that
cannot be expressed physically. This is where CMT is needed. In this verse, the source domain is
INVESTMENT. The amount of money s/he gets back will be much more than what s/he may
expect; this represents the REWARD s/he will get in the hereafter.

2. HUMILITY:
‘And lower unto them [parents] the wing of submission and humility through mercy, and say: “My
Lord! Bestow on them Your Mercy as they did bring me up when I was young.”’
(Sura 17:24)

This verse involves a compound metaphor that comes in the form of an imperative
structure. The first comparison made is between the man who acts with mercy towards his parents
and a bird that lowers its wings when landing. The second metaphor, ‘the wing of submission and
humility’, compares humility to a bird that lowers its wings. The two comparisons together explain
the meaning of the humility and submission that people should have towards their parents in Islam
(Ibn-Katheer). Lowering the bird’s wings reflects the man’s affection towards his parents (Al-
Qortoby). Humility as represented by the verb root form in the past tense (توضع) means ‘to put
something down’, hence the opposite of holding something up (Ibn Manzur, 1290).

Thus, HUMILITY IS LOWERING SOMETHING. Humility, the target domain, is figured
as a bird’s wing, which the bird lowers in love, respect, and care, much as Muslims bow down and
kneel when they pray, indicating submission and humility before Allah, or as Western people traditionally took off their hats when greeting someone to show respect.

3. HYPOCRISY:

They are deaf, dumb, and blind, so they return not (to the Right Path)

(Hypocrisy is defined in the Cambridge Dictionary as “a situation in which someone pretends to believe something that they do not really believe, or that is the opposite of what they do or say at another time.” In Arabic, as explained by Ibn Manzur (1290), the concept is culture-specific, dealing with hypocrites’ attitude to Islam and Muslims (Ibn Manzur, 1290). The two definitions show that in both languages hypocrisy can be explained through what hypocrites do. The verse above describes hypocrites as deaf, since they chose not to hear what the Prophet Muhammad says; “dumb” or mute, in the sense that they can’t even talk about Islam; and blind, since they chose not to see where the right path (which is Islam) is (Ibn-Katheer).

In these three (sub-)metaphors of deafness, muteness, and blindness, the recurring theme is loss of the senses and abilities that can help the person to rightly perceive and reason about the things around him or her. Deaf people have “lost” their sense of hearing; mute people, their ability to speak; and blind people, their sight. The metaphor emerges because hypocrites do not physically lose such senses and abilities, but choose to be like the deaf, blind, and mute in order to disbelieve or disregard what Allah has expressed through his messenger Muhammad (peace be upon him). Thus, HYPOCRISY, which is the target domain, can be explained through the conceptual metaphor HYPOCRISY IS A DELIBERATE LOSS, where DELIBERATE LOSS is the source domain. When a person deliberately decides to lose something or somebody, it means that s/he will not pay attention to or care about that thing anymore, or will not listen or speak to that person. That is, loss means a reduction to zero in all aspects. The process of mental mapping between the two domains help us understand who hypocrites are and what they do.

4. ARROGANCE:

Saying: “I am your lord, most high.”

(The metaphor drawn in this verse is direct: Pharaoh compares himself, illegitimately, to Allah, Almighty, saying he is the “lord” and “most high”—that no one can be higher or above him (Al-Tabari). This metaphor conveys Pharaoh’s arrogance—thus, the conceptual metaphor that best corresponds to it is ARROGANCE IS ABOVENESS, in which the target domain is the abstraction ARROGANCE and the source domain is ABOVENESS. In our physical world, if something is put onto something else, nothing below it can be seen unless you remove it. This applies to people as well as objects—one high up may be unable to see or hear what is below him/her. The researcher chose ABOVENESS as a source domain and not HIGHNESS because ‘above’ is a
relative term, entailing being ‘superior’ to someone, whereas ‘high/the highest’ is truly applicable only to Allah Almighty, carrying the meaning of ‘elevation’ (Merriam-Webster’s Online Dictionary, 2019).

Conclusion:
The present study has taken up the CMT approach to metaphors, which shifts them from the linguistic to the conceptual domain, revealing their source and target domains and the relation between them, and has asserted its significance for and applied it to the analysis and interpretation of metaphor in the Holy Qur’an. The examples explored have provided insight how linguistic interpretations of abstract concepts can be transformed into conceptual ones. Lakoff and Johnson’s theory proved significant in the way it shows how metaphors concretize abstract concepts, allowing them to be grasped more easily. Arabic linguists should be advised to adapt this scientific linguistic theory to Arabic and formulate new theories informed by it that enrich the way Arabic and the Qur’an are studied.

About the Author:
Mashael Al-Ajmi is a faculty member in Princess Nourah bint Abdulrahman University since 2009. She completed her M.A in applied linguistics from Al-Imam Muhammad Ibn Saud Islamic University in 2014. She is mostly interested in cognitive linguistics to find more on how language and mind work. She is also interested in many fields of applied linguistics in English as well as Arabic such as language acquisition, pragmatics, discourse analysis, educational development and many others. https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3949-2383

References


Major Translation Methods Used in Legal Documents: Translation of a Marriage Contract 
from Arabic into English

Omar EL GHAZI
Department of English Studies, Faculty of Arts and Humanities Ben M’sik
Hassan II University of Casablanca, Morocco

Chakib BNINI
Department of English Studies, Faculty of Arts and Humanities Ben M’sik
Hassan II University of Casablanca, Morocco

Abstract
Throughout history, the use of translation methods has constituted a source of lots of debates; some scholars advocate literal translation, others advocate free translation. In legal translation which is a special and specialized area of translational activity (Cao, 2007), and where documents are characterized by brevity, economy, and neatness to prevent fraud, additions, omissions or alterations in the text (Crystal & Davy, 1969), mistakes or mistranslations can lead to disastrous repercussions. The present study deals primarily with the methods that translators of legal texts follow and adopt when rendering a legal document. A concise account of translation theories that have been adopted and are still being applied to legal translation is offered to attempt to show the main views towards the application of such translation theories to legal translation. Major methods often used in the translation of legal documents are then presented, discussing their validity to legal translation. This presentation includes literal translation, free translation, the functional approach to translation, transliteration & transcription, loan translation, adaptation, description by definitions, lexical expansion, and descriptive substitution. The empirical part of this study is concerned with the analysis of a marriage contract translated from Arabic into English in an attempt to shed some light on the major methods adopted by the translator of this document and the reason behind using such methods.

Key words: Legal system, legal translation, marriage contract, methods of translation, source text, target text

Introduction
Translation is considered a gateway for understanding and dealing with others and their civilizations (Al-Aqad, 2014). Its significance and relevance in our daily life is multi-dimensional. It is through translation that we learn about developments in communication and technology and follow the latest innovations and novelties in the various fields of knowledge. Since translating is a communicative process from the source language (SL) into the target language (TL), or a process of conveying the sense of the text from one language into another language, this process involves a wide range of methods and techniques ranging from “word-for-word translation” or “literal translation” to “sense-for-sense translation” or “free translation”.

The significance of the study
The significance of this study lies in the fact that there is a lack of research on the translation of private legal documents in Morocco, especially the translation of marriage contracts between Arabic and English. It is hoped that this paper will contribute to raising the awareness of Moroccan and Arab researchers about the area of marriage contracts. This study recommends the use of functionalist theories of translation that take into consideration the context and the target user of the final product.

Corpus and Methodology
The corpus used in this paper comprises the translation of an authentic marriage contract translated by a sworn translator certified by the Ministry of Justice and Liberties in the Kingdom of Morocco. The translator was commissioned to translate the document from Arabic into English the way he is used to dealing with legally-binding official documents without informing him of the purpose of the translation.

The article starts by offering a succinct account of legal language as a genre and its characteristics with a special focus on contracts. Important methods of legal translation are presented, mentioning the different views of scholars with regard to each one. The practical part is concerned with analyzing an example of a marriage contract translated by a sworn translator certified by the Ministry of Justice and Liberties in the Kingdom of Morocco.

1. Legal discourse
Mattila (2006) considers legal language as a language for special purposes (LSP) which is distinguished from ordinary language or any other language for specific purposes. So, there is a specific legal style which may not be comprehensible to the public. He goes on to discuss legal language as an instrument for achieving justice, communicating messages of legal significance, bolstering the authority of the law, and creating a shared identity among lawyers as a professional category.

According to Bhatia (1982; 1983; 1993) legal discourse is considered notorious for its complexity, repetitiveness, and tortuous syntax. The intention is always to write clearly, precisely, unambiguously, and all-inclusively, with detailed specification of the scope of legislative provisions.
Maley (1994) indicates that present day legal discourse retains its identity as a highly specialized and distinctive discourse type or genre of English. He points out that there is not one legal discourse but a set of related legal discourses. Each one has its distinct characteristics, but each differs from the other according to the situation in which it is used. He mentions judicial discourse (the language of judicial decision, either spoken or written), courtroom discourse (used by judges, court officials, witnesses, and other participants), the language of legal documents (contracts, regulations, deeds, wills, Acts of Parliament, or statutes) and the discourse of legal consultation: between lawyer and lawyer, lawyer and client.

1.1. English legal discourse

Tiersma (1999) shows to what extent ‘legalese’ is a product of its past, when Anglo-Saxon mercenaries, Latin-speaking missionaries, Scandinavian raiders, and Norman invaders all left their marks on the language that lawyers use today. On his part, Mellinkoff (1963) conducts a historical approach to describe how the language of the law developed to its present state. He investigates the continuous and successive influence of Old English, Latin, various forms of French (especially Anglo-Norman), Middle English, and Modern English on the words and expressions in law throughout history. He describes the language of the law as the customary language used by lawyers in those Common Law jurisdictions where English is the official language. He indicates that there are nine distinctive characteristics of legal English:

1. Frequent use of common words with uncommon meanings.
2. Frequent use of Old English.
3. Frequent use of Latin words and phrases.
4. Frequent use of old French and Anglo-Norman words.
5. Use of terms of art.
6. Use of argot (the jargon of a particular group or class).
7. Frequent use of formal words.
8. Deliberate use of words and expressions with flexible meanings.

Crystal and Davy (1969) indicate that “of all the uses of language, it [legal language] is perhaps the least communicative, in that it is designed not so much to enlighten language-users at large as to allow one expert to register information for scrutiny by another.” (p. 112) Accordingly, a legal text exhibits a high degree of linguistic conservation, incorporated in written instruction such as court judgments, police reports, constitutions, charters, treaties, protocols and regulation. They describe legal texts as formulaic, predictable and almost mathematic indicating that “a common linguistic formula in legal texts is ‘if X, then Z shall be Y’ or ‘if X, then Z shall do Y.’ (p. 203).

1.2. Arabic legal discourse

Legal language in Arabic has two principal foundations: Islamic Law and Common Law. Legal discourse has its own idiosyncratic features and distinctive structures. Emery (1989) states that:
Arabic legal texts exhibit their own features of structure and style. They make more use of grammatical cohesion (through reference and conjunction) and of finite structures than their English counterparts, and less use of passives. In addition, they are not characterized by the use of archaic vocabulary and morphology. The two languages differ in their patterns of nominalization, creation of binominals and in their use of highlighting and text markers. (p. 10)

Arabic legal language incorporates a wide range of terms and expressions emanating from the Islamic law the sources of which are the Holy Quran and the Sunna (Prophet Muhammad’s legal decisions, deeds, and utterances). Together, they form what is called in Arabic “Shari’a”.

According to El-Farahaty (2015, pp.31-51), Arabic legal language is generally characterized by the following features:

**Lexical features**
- Religious, culture-specific and system-based terms and expressions; e.g. (الله على كتاب وسنة رسوله: According to the Holy Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Messenger)
- Formality; e.g. (حضره صاحب اجلالة: His Majesty)
- Gender-based terms: terms that are marked for masculine (المتعاقد: the contracted party) or feminine (الشاهد: the witness)
- Archaic terms; e.g. (المذكور لا شيء: the above mentioned)

**Syntactic features**
- Nominalization; eg. (تحقيق التنمية...ورفع مستوى المعيشة: achieving development….raising the standards of living)
- Passivisation; eg. (يفسخ هذا العقد فورا: This contract is revoked immediately)
- Modals; e.g. (يجوز، يجب: may, must)
- Complex sentence structure: Lack of well-defined sentence boundaries and inconsistent use of punctuation marks result in long, complex sentences.
- Doublets and triplets; e.g. (إنذار أو تنبيه بدون أي prior notice, fault, harm or damage
- Participles: There are some grammatical features in Arabic legal texts, such as (العذر, the passive participle) and (العذر المطلق, the absolute object), or ‘the cognate accusative’; e.g. (عاين الشقة معاينة: he has fully inspected the apartment).

**Textual features**
- Lexical repetition: the occurrence of a word, phrase or structure more than one time in text,
- Reference: using cohesive devices to trace participants and establish cohesive links in a text,
- Conjunctions and punctuation: Arabic uses conjunctions such as (also / in addition), (this). In terms of punctuation, the full stop and the comma are the most common punctuation marks used.
2. The field of contracts

Contracts fall into the category of written legal genres with a great formality in style caused by the use of some formulaic and fixed expressions. Newmark (1982) suggests that when dealing with legal documents like contracts that are concurrently valid in the TL, the translator should focus on a communicative approach. Vermeer (1989), on his part, contends that legal criteria should be taken into account when opting for a particular translation strategy since the meaning of legal texts is determined by the legal context: "for instance, in regard to contracts, the decision whether and to what extent target language formulae should be used is determined primarily by the law governing the contract. This fact is essential because it determines whether the contract will be interpreted according to the source or the target legal system." (p.99). In official translations of contracts, the strategies used must focus on the principle of fidelity to the ST. Sarcevic (1997,) indicates that:

Legal translators have traditionally been bound by the principle of fidelity. Convinced that the main goal of legal translation is to reproduce the content of the ST as accurately as possible, both lawyers and linguists agreed that legal texts had to be translated literally. For the sake of preserving the letter of the law, the main guideline for legal translation was fidelity to the ST. Even after legal translators won the right to produce texts in the spirit of the target language, the general guideline remained fidelity to the ST. (p.16)

Saqf Al-Hait (2010) suggests that contracts have substantial and formal elements that should be taken into consideration when preparing contracts. These elements are: the title of the contract, the contract parties, the legal capacity of the contracting parties, the preamble, mutual obligations, payment and method of payment, duration of contract, general provisions, law and the court of jurisdiction over contractual disputes, date of signing the contract, number of contract’s articles and copies, and signature.

3. Translating Legal texts: an overview

El-Farahaty (2016, p. 475) indicates that legal translation from English into Arabic or vice versa is more difficult because of the wide gap between English and Arabic language systems, on the one hand, and legal systems, on the other. She further points out that both languages belong to different language families, Arabic being a Semitic language while English belongs to the Indo-European languages. Thus, translators from and into Arabic face difficulties at different linguistic levels, such as terminological (Shari’a Law vs. Common Law terms), syntactic (modals and passive structures incongruities) and textual (lexical repetition and punctuation marks). Accordingly, translating a legal text from Arabic into English requires a painstaking effort on the part of the translator as he needs not only the target language but also the source and target legal systems. Sarcevic (1997, p. 13) postulates that the rendering of legal texts from the SL into the TL is rather ‘a translation from one legal system into another – from the source legal system into the target legal system’.

As legal documents vary considerably, the legal translator needs to take into consideration the categorization of each legal text. Cao (2013, p.1) provides a classification of legal translation
Major Translation Methods Used in Legal Documents

EL GHAZI \& BNINI

4. Methods of Translation

4.1. Vinay and Darbelnet’s model:

The term used by Vinay and Darbelnet (1958) to describe the methods is “procédés” in their seminal work “les procédés techniques de la traduction” (pp. 46-55). They identify seven basic procedures operating on three levels of style: lexis, distribution (morphology and syntax) and message. The procedures are classified as direct (or literal) and oblique (or free).

Literal translation occurs when there is an exact structural, lexical, even morphological equivalence between two languages. According to the authors, this is only possible when the two languages are very close to each other. Oblique translation occurs when word-for-word translation is impossible. The seven procedures are as follows:

- **Borrowing:** it is a word taken directly from another language; for example, the English word “bulldozer” has been incorporated directly into other languages.

- **Calque:** it is a special kind of borrowing whereby a language borrows an expression form from another but then translates literally each of its elements; e.g., “fin de semaine” from the English “weekend”.

- **Literal Translation:** or word-for-word translation is the direct transfer of a SL text into a grammatically and idiomatically appropriate TL text in which the translators’ task is limited to observing the adherence to the linguistic servitudes of the TL; e.g., “the ink is on the table” and “l’encre est sur la table.”

- **Transposition:** it involves replacing one-word class with another without changing the meaning of the message; e.g., “as soon as he gets up”: “Dès son lever”. The word class of the English verb “gets up” is replaced by a noun in French “son lever”.

- **Modulation:** it is a variation of the form of the message, obtained by a change in the point of view. This change can be justified when, although a literal, or even transposed,
translation results in a grammatically correct utterance. It is considered unsuitable, unidiomatic or awkward in the TL; e.g., ‘it is not difficult to show...’: ‘Il est facile de démontrer...’

- **Equivalence:** in this procedure, the same situation can be rendered by two texts using completely different stylistic and structural methods; e.g., ‘too many cooks spoil the broth’: ‘Deux patrons font chavirer la barque.’

- **Adaptation:** it is used in those cases where the type of situation is referred to by the SL message is unknown in the TL culture. In such cases translators have to create a new situation that can be considered equivalent; e.g., “cycling” for the French, “cricket” for the English and "baseball" for the Americans.

4.2. **Newmark’s model:**
Newmark (1988, pp. 45-53) considers that the central problem of translating has always been whether to translate literally or freely. He identifies the following translation methods:

- **Word-for-word translation:** it is a method in which the SL word-order is preserved and the words translated singly by their most common meanings, out of context.

- **Literal translation:** in literal translation, the SL grammatical constructions are converted to their nearest TL equivalents but the lexical words are again translated singly.

- **Faithful translation:** a faithful translation attempts to reproduce the precise contextual meaning of the original within the constraints of the TL grammatical structures. It 'transfers' cultural words and preserves the degree of grammatical and lexical 'abnormality' (deviation from SL norms) in the translation. It attempts to be completely faithful to the intentions and the text-realization of the SL writer.

- **Semantic translation:** ‘semantic translation’ differs from 'faithful translation' in that the first is uncompromising and dogmatic, while the second is more flexible. In other words, the central concern of the translation is to convey the meaning of the phrase and sentence through paraphrasing, or even literal depending on the purpose of the translator.

- **Adaptation:** it is the 'freest' form of translation. It is used mainly for plays (comedies) and poetry; the themes, characters, plots are usually preserved, the SL culture converted to the TL culture and the text rewritten.

- **Free translation:** using this method, the translator reproduces the matter without the manner or the content without the form of the original. Usually, it is a paraphrase much longer than the original; it is also called 'intralingual translation'.
- **Idiomatic translation:** it reproduces the 'message' of the original but tends to distort nuances of meaning by preferring colloquialisms and idioms where these do not exist in the original.

- **Communicative translation:** this method attempts to render the exact contextual meaning of the original in such a way that both content and language are readily acceptable and comprehensible to the readership.

4.3. **Sarcevic’s model:**
Sarcevic (1985, p.128) considers that the following translation procedures are used by translators of laws to fill lexical gaps resulting from SL culture-bound terms: transcription, transliteration, the functional approach to translation, loan translation, adaptation, lexical expansion, and descriptive substitution.

- **Transcription:** it is an acceptable translation procedure only if the SL term has already been naturalized into the terminology of the TL or the meaning of the term is evident from the context.

- **Transliteration:** it points to the transcription of the SL term with the use of the TL alphabets where the SL term appears as a loan word in the TL, and is often placed between inverted commas or is italicized.

- **Functional Approaches to Translation:** they are derived from a general theory of translation called “Skopos theory”, brought forward by the German scholar Hans J. Vermeer in the late 1970s and early 1980s. It was soon taken up by several scholars who were teaching at the schools for translator and interpreter for its application in their translation classes. The functional approach to translation aims at producing a text which goes in line with the cultural expectations of the target reader. Unlike traditional translation approaches, the functional approach to translation claims that the same text can be translated differently on the basis of the communicative function of the translated text.

- **Loan translation:** in loan translation, a compound word or expression is translated literally into the TL. Word-for-word translation is used whenever the source term is semantically motivated or transparent.

- **Adaptation:** in adaptation, the SL term is adapted to designate something in the social reality of the TL with a similar function. In other words, a cultural equivalent is used. In our case, this would mean replacing the recognized loan translation by a cultural equivalent in the TL.

- **Lexical expansion:** the primary procedure of over-translation used by legal translators to compensate for under-translation is lexical expansion. In lexical expansion, supplementary
information is either inserted into the text itself or provided in marginal help such as glossaries or marginal notes.

- **Descriptive substitution:** it is used as a part of translation couplet, which consists of the transliterated SL term, followed by descriptive substitution in brackets. It is adopted when there is no one-to-one correspondence between the SL culture-specific term and the TL legal terminology which can designate the same legal concept.

5. Discussion and analysis

5.1. Quantitative analysis of the frequency of translation techniques in the TT

Table 1 shows the techniques used in translating the marriage contract:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation techniques</th>
<th>No. of occurrences</th>
<th>Proportion of techniques</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Word-for-word translation</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literal translation</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation by omission</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicative translation</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation by adaptation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>95</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in the above table, ‘word-for-word translation’ comes in the first place with a percentage of 37 percent. In the second place comes both ‘literal translation’ with a percentage of 26 percent. ‘Translation by omission’ comes in the third place with a frequency of 21 percent, whereas ‘communicative/functional translation’ and ‘translation by adaptation’ have registered only eleven and five percent respectively.

5.2. Qualitative analysis of the frequency of translation techniques in the TT

2.1 Word-for-word/literal translation:

In order to preserve the religious nature of the text, the translator opted for the techniques of word-for-word translation and literal translation (for the distinction between the two techniques, see Newmark’s model above) as the following examples show:

**ST**

- بناء عل الإذن بتوثيق عقد زواج معتنقي

- الزواج بالغير من مواعظه

- يجوز لجهة إطام تعجري للمواطنين

**TT**

- On the basis of authorization…to contract marriage for foreigners and those converting to Islam

- fit for marriage and free from impediments thereto

- they could, regarding the investment and distribution of the property to be acquired during the matrimonial time, write a separate document therefore.
The layout of the marriage contract in the source text (see Appendix A) follows a standard skeletal plan; a heading containing a Qur’anic version, the Ministry of Justice and Liberties and its logo, the court contracting the marriage, a margin specifying the registration number, record number, marriage record number…etc. The body of the document is a one-paragraph text characterized by long sentences and lack, if not absence, of punctuation marks. To convey the meaning to the target reader, the translator changed the layout of the original text (see annex 2) in such a way that the target reader smoothly understands the target text. This change of layout helped the translator to escape from excessive literalism that faces the overwhelming majority of legal translators of marriage contracts between Arabic and English. The table and the chart above show clearly that word-for-word translation and literal translation are the most frequent techniques used by the translator; altogether with a percentage of 60%. This percentage is quite normal with regard to the kind of religious and cultural-specific terms and expressions characterizing Arabic legal marriage contracts.

2.2 Translation by omission

Arabic official documents such as marriage contracts include Islamic elements referring to Allah at the beginning of the contract such as the basmala "بسم الله الرحمن الرحيم" in the name of Allah, Most Gracious, Most Merciful) on the top of the contract, followed by a Qur’anic benediction verse "ربنا هب لنا من أزواجنا وذرياتنا قرة أعين واجعلنا للمتقين إماما" translated into English as "Our Lord! Grant unto us wives and offspring who will be the comfort of our eyes, and give us (the grace) to lead the righteous." (Yusuf Ali, 1938). Another expression is used in the ST "صدق العظيم" (True are the words of Allah the Almighty). The translator has used omission fully or partly; sometimes he omits part of a phrase, other times, he omits the whole phrase. Below are some examples of omission used by the translator, the omitted elements are underlined:

2.2.1 Fully omitted phrases/elements:

- بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَٰنِ الرَّحِيمِ
- اللَّهُ هَبَّ لَنَا مِنْ أَزْوَاجِنَا وَذَرِيعَتِنَا قَرْةً أَعْيُنٍ وَأَجْمَالَ الْفَتْحَةَ إِمَامًا
- صَّلِّ رَحْمَةَ اللَّهِ عَلَى عَبْدِنَا مُحْمَّدٍ
- وَاللَّهُ سَبَرَ اللَّهِ وَلَفْسَاتُهُ مَلِيِّا وَهُوَ مَتَّعٌ

2.2.2 Partly omitted phrases/elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>حَبَّةُ الْمِزْوَاجِ ْعَبْرَتَ اللَّهِ</td>
<td>- Praise be to God…the bonds of marriage are established between…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>وجُنُونِ عُزْنِهِ وَفَوْقُهُ</td>
<td>- single</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عَبْدٍ مَبْذَكِرٍ</td>
<td>- The dowry was fixed at…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>فِي صَرْفِهِ عِبَادِ اللَّهِ</td>
<td>- …which the wife received in full</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>قِيَامَتُ الْمِزْوَاجِ مِنْ الزَّوَجِ الْمَكَرِّرِ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الْوَصْرِ أَعْيُنَتُهُ أَفْعَلَتْهُ دِينَانِ يَمِينِيَّةً</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The fully omitted elements, benedictory formulas, are perhaps omitted because the translator thinks that they are not relevant to the target culture and are not legally-binding. Mayoral Asensio (2003) comments on this as follows:

Documents under Islamic law traditionally use a set of formulas of salutation referring to God. Very often these are fragments, more or less literal, from the Koran. They are inter-textual references, fully meaningful in the Arabic text, but this inter-textuality is lost in non-Islamic cultures... These ritual formulas do not have any relevance for the legal validity of the document; consequently, the possibility of omitting their translation remains open. (p. 21) Aixela (as cited in El-Farahaty, 2015, p. 80) justifies the omission of culture-specific elements in cases where they are either unacceptable in the target culture or irrelevant to the target reader or when the item in question is ambiguous.

2.3 Communicative/ functional translation:

The examples below show that the translator rendered the contextual meaning of the original text so as to convey the overall meaning to the target reader. In the first example, he translated the word "الترجمة" (translation) as "communication" which is literally translated "تواصل". The choice of the translator is suitable in this context because the intended meaning is facilitating communication rather than translating or interpreting which is often conducted by a professional translator or interpreter.

In the second example, the translator translated the phrase "字母" as "while the persons concerned being sound in mind and memory and legally competent" which is more comprehensible to the target than the literal translation "while enjoying competency, distinction and choice".

In the last example, the translator used the loan words “Qur’an” as an equivalent to "الله كتاب تعالى" and “Sunnah” as an equivalent to "سنة رسوله الكريم" both composed of three words.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>قام علية بالترجمة ممزوجة اللغة العربية واللغة الإنجليزية</td>
<td>Communication was facilitated by Mr...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>وما تما ممزوجا بلغة الإنجليزية واللغة العربية واللغة الإنجليزية</td>
<td>while the persons concerned being sound in mind and memory and legally competent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>نزوجها في الكتاب الكريم</td>
<td>in accordance with the Qur’an and Sunnah</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.4 Translation by adaptation:

In order to translate the term “sadaq” into English, the translator used the technique of ‘cultural adaptation’ by providing the nearest equivalent in the English culture “dowry”. Looking up the word “dowry” in different dictionaries, we find the following definitions:

1- The definition provided by Collins Online Dictionary:

**Dowry**: the money or property brought by a woman to her husband at marriage
2- The definition provided by Oxford Online Dictionary:

   **Dowry**: An amount of property or money brought by a bride to her husband on their marriage.

3- Definition provided by Black's Law Dictionary Free Online Legal Dictionary:

   **Dowry**: The property which a woman brings to her husband in marriage; now more commonly called a “portion.” By dowry is meant the effects which the wife brings to the husband to support the expenses of marriage… This word expresses the proper meaning of the “dos” of the Roman, the “dot” of the French, and the “dote” of the Spanish law, but is a very different thing from “dower,” with which it has sometimes been confounded. By dowry, in the Louisiana Civil Code, is meant the effects which the wife brings to the husband to support the expenses of marriage. It is given to the husband, to be enjoyed by him so long as the marriage shall last, and the income of it belongs to him. He alone has the administration of it during marriage, and his wife cannot deprive him of it. The real estate settled as dowry is inalienable during the marriage, unless the marriage contract contains a stipulation to the contrary.

The three definitions show that there is a contradiction regarding the beneficiary of the dowry. In Western culture in general, the amount of money is given by the wife to her husband as opposed to the Islamic culture. In this case, the translator should have used the technique of descriptive substitution (see 2.9 above) which consists in the transliterated SL term (sadaq), followed by descriptive substitution in brackets (dowry). In this context Mayoral Mayoral Asensio (2003) argues:

   The Arabic sadaq is regularly translated as dowry. But the dowry (in fact, shiwar) is offered to the bride by her father as a custom whereas the sadaq is offered by the bridgetoom as an element necessary for the legal validity of the marriage. This is usually law-risk information but could become critical. For instance, it could lead to the annulment of the marriage by a Spanish judge applying Moroccan law. (p. 62)

The translator further opted for the techniques of adaptation and lexical expansion to render the term “adlayn” (the plural form of “adl”) as “notaries of Islamic Law” using a general word “notary” plus “Islamic Law” to compensate for under-translation. A notary according to Collins Online Dictionary is “a person, usually a lawyer, who has legal authority to witness the signing of documents in order to make them legally valid”. However, other Moroccan legal translators prefer the word “two aduls” to preserve the cultural connotations for the original word.

   The translator translated the expression “الحمد وحده لله” using its nearest equivalence in English “Praise be to God”. According to the online dictionary Merriam-Webster “[It is] used to express happiness or relief that something did or did not happen.” However, “God” is differently conceived by Muslims and Christians, although the definitions roughly mention no difference between the two cultures. Oxford Online Dictionary provides the following definition: “(In Christianity and other monotheistic religions) the creator and ruler of the universe and source of all moral authority; the Supreme Being.”
Regardless of the definitions provided above, Islam emphasizes that God (Allah) is strictly singular (Tawhid), while Christians believe that there is one God who is embodied in three gods (Trinity): God the Father, the Son (Jesus Christ) and the Holy Spirit.

Conclusion
This paper explores a number of techniques followed and adopted in the field of legal translation, with varying degrees. Among these techniques and strategies are literal translation, free translation, the functional approach to translation, transliteration/transcription, loan translation, adaptation, translation by omission, lexical expansion...etc.

In translating religious and culture-based terms and expressions in marriage contracts, it is noticed that the translator chiefly used the techniques of literal translation and word-for-word translation in order to preserve the specificity of these terms. However, in several cases, this literalism proves meaningless, hence resorting to other techniques such as translation by omission, communicative translation and translation by adaptation.

It is concluded from the analysis of the translated marriage contract that legal translators need to familiarize themselves with the legal systems of both the source and target languages before they start translating; because the difference of the legal systems imposes on the translator a painstaking effort to decipher the meaning of the source text and convey it to the target language. To do so, translators need training and coaching that focus on the integration of functional and pragmatic perspectives to legal translation.

Limitations of the Study
The study is only a preliminary step in investigating major translation methods used in the translation of private legal documents, especially marriage contracts. The work provides some translation methods used in legal translation, but it does not cover the methods in an exhaustive way. This could be explained, on the one hand, by the scarcity of research in this field and, on the other hand, by the corpus used in this study which is restricted to a single example of marriage contract which could be oblivious of other methods and techniques of translation.

About the Authors:
Omar EL GHAZI, PhD student at the Department of English Studies, Faculty of Arts and Humanities of Ben M’sik, Hassan II University of Casablanca. He graduated from King Fahd School of Translation in Tangiers. His research interests are in legal translation between Arabic, French & English and the translation of minority languages (Tamazight as a case). He is Head of the Department of Cooperation and Partnerships at Hassan II University of Casablanca. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6447-9351

Dr. Chakib BNINI received his Master's degree in Descriptive and Applied Linguistics from Essex University, UK, in 1985, before obtaining his PhD degree in Translation Studies from Heriot-Watt University, UK. He is currently a Professor of Translation Studies and Linguistics at the Faculty of Arts and Humanities of Hassan II University, Morocco, where he is also an active
member within the Centre of Doctoral Studies. His areas of academic interest include translation studies, cultural studies and linguistics. ID ORCid: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0955-4419

References:
APPENDIX A. (ST)

The court of first instance has decided on the 10th of May 2016 to register the marriage under the following conditions:

- The parties are of legal age and consented to the marriage.
- The marriage will be performed according to the legal requirements.

The registrar of the court will issue the marriage certificate.

APPENDIX B. (TT)
ARABIC-ENGLISH TRANSLATION

Kingdom of Morocco
Ministry of Justice and Liberties
Court of First Instance of Kénitra
Family Justice Division

MARRIAGE CONTRACT

Recorded under xxxx, marriage record xxxx, on October 11th, 2016.
Registered under xxxxxxx, marriage register xxxxx, on October 11th, 2016.

Praise be to God. On the basis of authorization xxxxxxxx to contract marriage for foreigner and those converting to Islam, issued by the Family Judge in charge of marriage, on October 10th, 2016, file of marriage documents xxxxxxxx, held by the Registry Office of the Court of First Instance of Kénitra, the undersigned notaries of Islamic law, Mr. xxxxxxx and Mr. xxxxxxxxxx, accredited to receive and issue testimony within the jurisdiction of the said court, received at 03:30 p.m., on October 10th, 2016, the following testimony filed under xxxx, folio xxxxxxx, record book xxxxxxx, held by the first notary:

The bonds of marriage are henceforth established between:

Mr. xxxxxxxxxx, British citizen, born in Rawalpindi, Pakistan, on xxxxxxxx, to his father xxxxxx xxxxxxx son of xxxxxxxxxxx and to his mother xxxxxxxxxxx, Muslim, holder of passport xxxxxxxxxx, issued by the British authorities, on August 16th, 2016, valid until August 16th, 2026, Accountant, divorced, residing at xxxxxx Malmesbury Road South Woodford, London xxxxxxxxx, England, and;

Miss xxxxxxxxxxxx, Moroccan citizen, born in Fes, on xxxxxxxxx, to her father xxxxxx son of xxxxxxxx, and to her mother xxxx daughter of xxxxxx, holder of National ID Card xxxxxxxxxx, student, single, residing at Lot. Menzeh xxxxxxxx, Bir Rami Est, Kénitra, fit for marriage and free from impediments thereto.

The dowry was fixed at xxxxxxxxxxx Dirhams (xxxxxxxx MAD), which the wife received in full.

With her full consent, the bride was given for marriage in accordance with the Qur’an and Sunnah, by her father born on xxxxxxxxxx, Moroccan citizen, holder of National ID Card xxxxxxxxxx, retired, residing at the same address as his daughter, which the groom and the bride fully accepted after they were informed that they could, regarding the investment and distribution of the property to be acquired during matrimonial time, write a separate document therefore. Communication was facilitated by Mr. xxxxxxxxxx, born on xxxxxxxxx, to his father xxxxxx son of Said and to his mother xxxx daughter of xxxxx, Moroccan citizen, student, holder of National ID Card xxxxxxxxxx, residing at the above address. The said spouses signed hereunder after the content herein was explained to them.

In witness whereof, this contract was transcribed on the date hereof, while the persons concerned being sound in mind and memory and legally competent.

Follow the signatures of the groom, bride and Tutor.

Follow the signatures of the aforementioned notaries of Islamic Law, and the authentication by the Notarial Judge Mr. xxxxxxxxx, his signature and seal on October 11th, 2016.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

I, xxxxxxxx, sworn translator, hereby certify that the above is an exact and accurate translation of the submitted document.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Translation # 16-0239
Kénitra, on October 11th, 2016.
Domestication Versus Foreignization: The case of translating Al-Sanea’s Girls of Riyadh into English

Salwa Alwafai
Department of English, College of Arts
Imam Abdulrahman Bin Faisal University (IAU)
Dammam, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
This paper aims to shed more insights onto the relationship between ideology and literary translation through analyzing and exposing scandalous stories of girls of Riyadh in Al-Sanea’s novel (2005) and its English translation (2007). It tackles how the idea of over-domestication could manipulate the source text and sometimes change its core message for commercial and ideological reasons. It addresses the following question: how (un)faithful is the published English translation of Al-Sanea’s Girls of Riyadh to the original Arabic text in terms of evoking the same conceptual frames and maintaining the same lexicogrammatical relations. A frame-based cognitive analysis is used as the methodology of the study. Results show that the author, publisher, translator and pro-translator scholars enacted disgraceful situations which can be attributed to subjective desirability.

Keywords: Domestication, foreignization, ideology, over-domestication, (un) faithful translation.

1-Introduction

Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh* (2005) represents a literary revolt against the mainstream norms in Saudi Arabia at both content and form, since it addresses one of the major taboos, represented in laying bare the secret affairs of Saudi girls through narrating their stories and their different aspects of socialization in the Saudi Community. Al-Sanea was daring enough to discuss publicly in her novel highly controversial issues in Saudi Arabia, such as patriarchal society, gender relations, female vocational aspirations, political clout hierarchy. The novel is not written in Modern Standard Arabic; it is, however, written in vernacular speech, as informality and dialectal expressions and terms have dominated the scene in the novel to appeal to a broader readership in Saudi Arabia. The novel was forbidden in Saudi Arabia simply because it was accused of being an immoral work of art that helps spread vice and nudity and it was allowed to circulate in Saudi Arabia only after winning a court case (Sakr, 2008). Much as the original translator has ascertained the successful rendering of the polyphony of languages and dialects in the original text, the published version is devoid of such a stylometric signature. (Booth, 2008).

A FrameNet (FN), a language resource pairing cognition with corpus linguistics, based on Fillmore’s frame semantics (1976) is used to not only compute the resulting frames in the rendered version and but also to correlate such a cognitive realization in the source text. The vertical hierarchy of FN helps to attribute specific acts to their original conceptualization; therefore, linking the dots helps to understand the reported misconduct of the author, translator, publisher and other contributing scholars (Al-Ghadeer, 2006; Allen, 2015, Booth, 2008). The idea of the intervention of the author in the translation is critically examined in the light of Venuti’s domestication versus foreignization, as it explains to what extent the interference of the author in the translated text could efface the translator’s signature and manipulates and distorts the translated text. The remaining parts of the paper are made up of five parts. Part two buttresses the related works that tackle similar conflicting cases between the original author and the translator. Part three is meant to discuss the theoretical background that explains how translation theories are re-ushered towards studying the idea of effacing the translator's signature. Part 4 states the methodology of analyzing the (mis)conduct in the reported case study of translating Al-Sanea’s “*Girls of Riyadh*” into English and the research questions of this study. Part 5 discusses the results. The last part draws the concluding remarks.

2-Related works

Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh* has gained a wider popularity due to the hotness and daring nature of its themes, which represent a kind of resistance against the hegemonic long-life inherited tradition and deep-rooted cultural paradigms in Saudi Arabia. As such, several publishers were encouraged to translate this Chick-lit novel into several languages. The novel was translated by Penguin, a prestigious publishing house. The novel was translated by Marilyn Booth. The translated version was exposed to the intervention of the novelist, as she asked the translator for structural changes in the target text in order to adapt her novel culturally and ideologically to the norms and the values of the receiver. A negative result of such over-domestication is the distortion and misrepresentation of the original text that breaks with the idea of fidelity. However, the translator has refused to submit to her intervention in the translated work (Booth, 2008).
published a review of Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh*, Al-Ghadeer argues that Al-Sanea’s novel is considered poor in terms of aesthetics, style, plot, and depth of characterization (2006, p.299).

The Arabic literature should not follow the cultural norms and ethical values of the Western literary works without changing the message of the original next nor does it distort its message or its structure (Booth, 2008). Booth tries to balance between domestication and foreignization, as he endeavors hard to present a conceptually comprehensible translation to the American reader without affecting the meaning of the original text. He refuses to change the dogma, the ideology and the values communicated through the original text. He colors his translation with the American mood to effectively communicate the meaning to the readership. However, the author attempts to make her novel more apt to the Western readership for commercial purposes. Therefore, she asks the translator to over-domesticate the translated text at the expense of the original text. Such intervention distorts and manipulates the original text and negatively affects the core message of the original novel. Resonating on their personal experience and ushering the author-translator-publisher conflict to academia, Allen (2015), Hartman (2012) and Booth (2010) argued that the published version would have read better if Booth’s *foreignizing* attitude was maintained. Stressing the sociological studies of translation, translation is not only regarded to be a representation of the contemporary socio-political realities but also an invisible medium that helps consolidate a prevailing attitude Asscher (2000). Translation is a rather complicated process which is a product of overlapped and intertwined factors such as author, publisher, translator’s, audience and so on (Alvastad, 2014). These factors have an enigmatic force that make the translated text consistent with their nature.

The intervention of the author in the translation process may be classified under the rubric of self-translation. Popovič,(1976, p.19) defines self-translation as “the translation of an original work into another language by the author himself.” In the same vein, Koller argues that a major problematic issue arising from self-translation is the idea of *faithfulness*, “as the author-translator will feel justified in introducing changes into the text where an “ordinary” translator might hesitate to do so” (1995, p.197). However, sometimes, self-translation is inevitable, when it is used as an inevitable tactic of resistance, by Afrikaans, against the ideology of apartheid (Kruger, 2012). Irrespective of reliability, Al-Sanea justified her interference with Booth’s translation as an act of resistance against imposing the translator’s ideology.

3-Theoretical Framework

Gutt (1996, p. 241) emphasizes that the ultimate goal of a translation is focused on translator’s ability of rendering the implicit information in the original text and communicates it as clearly as possible in the target text, which demystifies the concept of the identical equivalence. Aside from the rarity of full-equivalent and the (un)intentionality of imposing the translator’s voice, ideology or style, words live within a certain cultural system, either in verbal or in written discourses, which defy being typically transferred, across different languages and cultures, on the sameness scale (Boase-Beier, 2004).
Adamska-Sałaciak (2010, p.379) examines the available taxonomies of translation equivalence to present four major equivalence types: cognitive, explanatory, translational and functional.

(C) cognitive (semantic, systemic, prototypical, conceptual, decontextualised, notional);
(E) explanatory (descriptive);
(T) translational (insertable, textual, contextual);
(F) functional (situational, communicative, discourse, dynamic).

First, a cognitive equivalent is unconsciously recalled to the mind of a bilingual user regardless of the context, since it is “primarily concerned with the processes inside the minds of agents involved in communicative acts revolving around translated texts” (Sickinger, 2012, p.216). This equivalent type is related to the prototypical sense of a headword and is salient in back-translation. In this way, the cognitive equivalent seems to isolate the translated text from the contextual realities of the target text, and focuses on bringing the meaning into light in relation to the realities of the original text. In addition, it is suitable for conveying the overall meaning of the original text. The cognitive equivalent includes semantic equivalence, which “emphasizes the translation and the source text should achieve equivalent results in the expression” (Fu, 2017, p.165). It is a matter of convergence and symmetrical unity between the original lexical unit and the target one. However, such a cognitive equivalent is not applicable to the lexical units bearing cultural or religious implications, nor does it efficiently work with literary expressions and terms. It can be accurately used in the back translation. Second, explanatory equivalent is descriptive in nature and is almost used when the target language lacks a cognitive equivalent to the source language. In other words, the idea of the explanatory equivalent refers to paraphrasing or explaining a single lexical item through various words. When lexical units cannot be rendered through using the cognitive equivalent, the explanatory equivalent should be used as an alternative solution. Third, translational equivalence helps a translator considers the intertextual and contextual aspects of both source and target languages, including the linguistic aspects such as polysemous words, various language systems, collocational and idiomatic uses of a word, and other changeable factors. Therefore, translational equivalent provides a wide variety of equivalents for a headword. Finally, functional equivalence can be used to communicate the ST meaning without violating the TL rules. Producing a communicative translation, functional equivalents of the same word situationally change according to the translator, target reader and the mode (Adamska-Sałaciak, 2010).

Literary texts are difficult to render, and these texts are often described as untranslatable due to their syntactic ambiguity, lexical variety and density, accompanied by a totally distinct cultural, historical, esthetic and socio-political realities. The singular nature of literary texts often requires the intervention of the translator to adapt the source text both culturally and aesthetically to the norms and the standards of the target text. A literary text like a novel may include dialectal terms and expressions, which have no corresponding equivalence in the target culture. (Boase-Beier, 2004; House, 2014; Scott, 2017). One of the most applauded esthetic aspects is successfully rendering the register diversity especially in heteroglossic novels. Register is defined as “a semantic configuration that we associate with a particular situation type and characterized on the basis of three variables or components: field, tenor and mode” (Marco, 2000, p.3). Although the
detailed implication of register analysis for literary translation can be manifold, only a few items are singled out for illustration: degree of technicality and marked field mixing with regard to the variable of field, terms of address, and modality with respect to tenor, and the interplay between grammatical complexity and lexical density as markers of oral and written language in the area of mode.

Regardless of the nuisance of providing equivalence at the lexical, sentential, pragmatic-stylistic levels, the dichotomy of domestication and foreignization complicates the non-standardized criteria of translation tactics. Venuti (1986) dichotomizes ‘alienating/exotizing’ and ‘naturalizing’ translation approaches as ‘foreignization’ and ‘domestication’ respectively. Foreignization, on the one hand, “entails choosing a foreign text and developing a translation method along lines which are excluded by dominant cultural values in the target language” (Venuti 1997, p. 242). Domestication, on the other hand, embraces ‘an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to [Anglo-American] target-language cultural values’ (Munday, 2013, p.6). Domestication can be described as “indirect translation”, “covert translation”, “naturalization”, “illusionism”, “communicative translation”, “instrumental translation” and “participative reception.” Domestication is more convenient for translating a literary text since it naturalizes the translated text and turns it more comprehensible to the receiver, as the text is oriented toward the norms and the cultural values and ideology of the targeted text (Ožbot, 2016).

In a trial to reduce the noise in such a complex multi-dimensional crisis, natural language processing (NLP) tools and cognitive theories have presented practical instruments and linguistic resources which can achieve similar effective conceptualization and psycholinguistic impact of the rendered text. Such interoperability has also made an inter-language to which all languages can be paired. Thus, the problem of equivalence has been dashed and replaced by “semantic similarity”. This success is attributed mainly to WordNet (Fellbaum, 1998) and FrameNet (Ruppenhofer et al., 2006) and to other similar NLP-based language resources. Princeton WordNet (WN), built after the evidenced structure of the “mental lexicon” in a trial to understand human semantic memory, provided a fine-grained division of meaning sorted in a hierarchical hypernym/hyponym structure that is exported from an ontological processing.

Replacing the alphabetic sorting (orthography) by the thematic and the morphological perspective, save for inflectional morphology in WN’s interface, by the relational semantic link, is enabled to connect WN’s lexical entities into a large network of linguistically labeled nodes. Of these relations, WN is mainly concerned with lexical inheritance system; giving a brief definition (gloss) for every sense; enumerating ‘coordinate terms’ to cluster hyponyms, which share the same hypernym and lies at parallel distance of semantic relatedness. Synonymous words, or synsets, are linked via an “equivalence relation”, to an interlingual index, for rendering a multilingual expansion and for comparing coverage, relations, and overall lexicalization patterns across the covered languages (Fellbaum 2014; Miller, and Fellbaum 2007). The paradigmatic relations assigned in WN, which denote links and semantic relations between lexical units within a language system, include hypernymy, hyponymy, troponymy, meronymy, antonymy, synonymy, and entailment (among verbs). The main semantic relation among words is synonymy, as between the
words assume and suppose and between *shame* and *disgrace*, which are grouped into unordered sets (synsets).

The criterion for joint synset membership is merely that the words denote the same concept. Each of WordNet’s synsets is linked in turn to other synsets by means of a small number of “conceptual relations.” Also, one-to-many mappings of word forms and word meanings govern polysemy and synonymy. A single word form expressing several meanings is a case of polysemy. Highly polysemous words in English are check, case, and line. Polysemy requires the reader or listener to identify the context-appropriate, intended sense of the word form. Hyponymy is a semantic relation between word meanings: e.g., tree is a hyponym of plant while obloquy and odium are hyponyms of shame. Hyponymy is, therefore, a relationship found in many nouns, in quite a number of verbs, and in some adjectives. Its major significance for lexicographers is that the ‘genus expression’ in a definition should be the hypernym of the headword. Hyponymy holds more often between nouns while antonymy ‘belongs’ more to adjectives. Meronymys reflect the relationship of part to whole and vice versa (Fellbaum 2014; Miller & Fellbaum 2007). Studying all these relations among senses has expanded and enriched the scope of translation theories about “translation equivalence”.

The linguistic unit employed by a user is the figure, while the human experience behind it is the ground (Fillmore,1976). The semantic frames theory is deeply rooted in cognitive psychology. It is based on the figure-ground gestalt trend. Any experience in the physical world can be segmented in terms of figure and ground. Figure is the predominant constituent in the figure-ground system; it is placed within certain surroundings; ground. Human experience here refers to the encyclopedic knowledge associated with this linguistic unit, ‘frame’. Fillmore (1976) the founder of frame semantics theory, describes a frame as:

any system of concepts related in such a way that to understand any one of them you have to understand the whole structure in which it fits; when one of the things in such a structure is introduced into a text, or into a conversation, all of the others are automatically made available. (p.373)

FrameNet (FN), a language resource pairing cognition with corpus linguistics, which is based on Fillmore’s frame semantics, enrolls more than 13,000 lexical entities, which are designated ‘lexical units’ on being assigned to a specific frame. The basic constituents of FN are lexical units and frame elements (FEs). Between different frames, FEs liaise to each other and create interconnectedness between pertinent frames. Both LUs and FEs are annotated and featured, using large-scale American and British corpora, to specify dynamic uses and lexical valence. Connecting frames, which share broad and complex cognitive parameters, cognitive matrices develop. These are inheritance, perspective on, uses, subframe of, see also, causes and inchoative of. FN specifies a great deal of structural information both within and among frames. For frame identification we make use of frame-evoking lexical units, the (lemmatized and POS-tagged) words and phrases listed in the lexicon as referring to specific frames. For example, listed within the Desiring frame are 54 lexical units.
They include 12 adjectives (covetous, desired, desirous, dying, eager, hungry, interested, loath, raring, reluctant, spoiling and thirsty); 17 nouns (ambition, aspiration, craving, desire, hankering, hope, hunger, impulse, longing, lust, thirst, urge, wants, will, wish, yearning and yen); 2 prepositions (in hopes of and in the hope of) and 23 verbs (ache, aspire, care, covet, crave, desire, fancy, feel like, hanker, hope, hunger, itch, long, lust, pine, thirst, want, will, wish(that), wish, yearn and yen). Of these lexical units, verbs are the most powerful in evoking frames. Thus, in computational tasks, identifying the predicate and its dependent arguments in the sentence is dependent on the main verbs and the syntactic realization captured from the surrounding context.

Given that FN reports a general frame for ‘disgraceful situations’, this paper the lexical units of this frame as well as the lexical units of the pertinent ones (figure 1) to be measured, and their translations, in the published translation of the novel as well as in the published articles about the scandalous act of the interfering author and publisher.

![Figure 1. Frame-to-Frame relations of ‘Disgraceful situation’ in FN](image)

4-Methodology

This study attempts to answer three main questions. First, how (un)faithful is the published English translation of Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh* to the original Arabic text in terms of evoking the same conceptual frames and maintaining the same lexico-grammatical relations? Second, how objective are the criteria of evaluating Al-Sanea’s interference with Booth’s translation in the relevant academic articles? Third, what implications can be concluded from this case study as well as from similar cases in the translation literature?

Experiment 1

To answer the first question, I measured computationally the number of the evoked frames and the frequency of evoking them in source and target texts. I also compiled a parallel corpus of both
source and target texts to study the lexicogrammatical relations, retrieve the keywords and clusters and visualize the distributional semantic relations of selective keywords. For creating a parallel corpus, I preprocessed the data by removing punctuation marks, non-words, redundant character, repetitions and symbols. The source and target texts were aligned at the sentence level. Then, the parallel corpus was uploaded on Sketch Engine to be analyzed.

Lexical units expressing desiring and desirability were measured and so were the lexical units of the relating frames (Group 1). Other corpora, representing the scholarly articles which addressed the publisher’s and the author’s unethical conduct, were similarly processed. Penguin owns the translation and I am not at liberty to supply it.

Experiment 2
To answer the second questions, all articles about translating Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh* were collected. The exemplified mistranslations were annotated. The criteria of translation Al-Sanea’s discarded were also classified. The classified errors were generally measured in the published version of the English translation to quantitatively evaluate such an accusation.

Experiment 3
Rejuvenating Scheherazade, the anecdotal Arabic female narrator, Al-Sanea’s “*Girls of Riyadh*” was translated into approximately 18 languages from 2007 to 2015. The English, French, German, Croatian, Danish, Greek, Italian, Portuguese and Romanian translations are available on Amazon. We back translated the French, German and Croatian translations to English and Arabic for matching their similarity to the primary version (original) and to the second primary (self-translation) one. Multilingual WN was used to measure the lexical coverage, richness and familiarity of each version.

5-Results and Discussion
The published English translation of Al-Sanea’s *Girls of Riyadh* evoked the same frames the original Arabic text triggered. However, the difference in the incidence of evoking some conceptual frames was statistically significant. These frames included ‘Attempt_susasion’, ‘Cause_emotion’, ‘Desiring’, ‘Disgraceful_situations’, ‘Experience_focused_emotion’, ‘Fame’, ‘Gradable_attribute’ and ‘sensation’. On the one hand, the retrieved Arabic keywords included negation particles, characters names, spatial references and narration verbs (Group 2).

On the other hand, keywords retrieved from the English corpus included more name entities, social roles and semantic agents with no reference to the narration verbs and negation particles (Group
3). Taken together, this suggests that the narration style has been modified in the published English translation.

Sadeem, Gamrah, Lamees, Michelle, Riyadh, Firas, Saudi, Rashid, Faisal, Um, Waleed, Nuwayyir, seerehwenfadha7et, Subject, Nizar, Tariq, Fatimah, Arabia, Matti, Tamadur, Tahir, Khobar, Hessah, Nuri, Jeddah, Musa, Kari, Ramadan, Shiite, Badriyyah, Sultan, thobe, Hamdan, Saleh, Aquarius, Meshaal, Hijab, Scrapbook, Shimagh, Fadwa, Arwa, Auntie, Bedouin, Khalid, Naflah, Jumana, Najd, Shillah, Saddoomah, Olaisha, Najdi, Chelle, Shahla, Wallah, Shari, Sadeem, Horaimli, Mashael, Qabbani, Sheikh, Kuwaiti, Gamrah, Ghadah, Malaz, Hijazi, Abdulrahman, Shisha, Fiancée, Milkah, Gammoorah, Sattam, Mudi, Gradu, Qusmanji, Lamees, Shaikhah, Jeddawi, Tanbal, Eqal, Alhamdu, Lillah, Fatin, Qatif, Divorcée, Riyadh,

**Group 3.** Keywords retrieved from the English corpus
Because processing English corpora is more productive than processing Arabic ones, the retrieved clusters in the English translation (Group 4) were manually traced back to the original text. All clusters were detected in both source and target texts.

Blue scrapbook, Marriage contract, Saudi society, Eastern province, Dance floor, Real name, Whole time, Eastern region, Medical student, First love, Milkah period, Engagement period, Wedding night, Other girl, Wedding party, Bad luck, Dawn call, Saudi guy, Capricorn man, Young Saudi man, Famous Saudi singer, Saudi singer, Gemini woman, Hadith collection, Saudi man, Reception room, Only love, Wedding celebration, First girl, Marriage proposal, Twin sister, First marriage, TV program, U r, Real man, Old home, Good girl, Islamic law, Summer break, Other man, Paper bag, Chat room, Perfect American accent, Eldest aunt, Enormous bag, Poor bride, Ethiopian driver, Sky-blue scrapbook, Little Shillah, Female medical student, White thobe, Egyptian actor, Hair cover, Blank message, Religious type, Natural distribution, Few min, Enormous hall, Friend Michelle, Nearby mosque, Rubber ducky, Legal husband, Strange guy, Dental student, Innocent face, Confident smile, Quick mind, Conservative society, Same sky, Bouquet toss, Invitation card, Bright red lipstick, Single evening, Big nose, Ordinary woman, Islamic country, Heavy makeup, Beautiful love, Native city, Ultimate destiny, Holy month, Worldly life, Successful marriage, Closet door, American accent, Signing ceremony, True reason, Prayer service, Bad girl, First wedding, Prayer time, Grocery shop, Black bear, New husband, Red lipstick, Cell phone number, First son, Daily schedule.

**Group 4.** Clusters retrieved from the English corpus

The heteroglossic effect of the Arabic novel has been totally effaced in the English translation despite its value for sociolinguistic studies. The register was not successfully rendered. The distributional semantics of the word friend(s) in Arabic (Figure 2) and English (Figure 3) were totally different. This heightens the impression that Al-Sanea modified the narration in the English version.
Domestication Versus Foreignization: The case of translating Al-Sanea’s “Gi
tls.org

Figure 2. Distributional semantics of the word friend in the English translation

Figure 3. Distributional semantics of the word friend in the English translation

To enumerate the criteria of evaluating Al-Sanea’s interference with Booth’s translation in the published academic articles, all articles about translating Al-Sanea’s “Girls of Riyadh” were collected.

The main accusation leveled at the published translation is over-domestication. However, Al-Sanea retained several relexified words to maintain the foreignizing effect. Examples include Allah, Masha’lla, Eqal and thobe among others. Booth (2008) emphasized that she wished to replace ‘Allah’ by ‘Lord’ as is consistent with Christianity. Booth (2008) did draw on Venuti’s
invisibility and Baker’s re-narration. Although the two theoretical perspectives are incongruent, objective evaluation of the translator’s voice cannot be assessed because Penguim retains Booth’s translation.

More important, academic implications can be concluded from this case study as well as from similar cases in the translation literature. However, the case of self-translation, in which the writer enjoys an authority and a liberty that other translators usually lack, can prove effective in resisting imposed ideologies. This goes hand in hand with Afrikaans’ tactics for resisting the ideology of apartheid (Kruger, 2012).

On comparing the three non-English studied translations to the published one, the back translation was more similar to the published version than to the original Arabic text. This suggests that either Al-Sanea has stipulated that the translation must use the second primary version (self-translation) or the translators used the published English novel “Girls of Riyadh” as a pivot text. Interestingly, the Croatian and French translations have domesticated the name entities especially the names of the major characters. This was not heralded as a breach to Venuti’s invisibility.

6-Conclusion
Controversial as Al-Sanea’s Girls of Riyadh seems to be, lessons can be learnt from the publisher’s, translator’s and author’s attitude towards stylometric authority of source and target texts. This study suggests that Al-Sanea has structurally changed the narration style in her self-translated version. However, the conceptualization of central themes remains similar. This might explain why newer translations are given to date. It is also suggested that professional translators customize their discussion of the proposed translation theories in the most convenient way that serves their agenda. Therefore, using NLP and cognitive tools may be recommended to avoid, as much as possible, subjective evaluations.

More important, cases of self-translation should be studied adequately with reference to the stylometric signature and matriculation of practical translation. Corpus tools can provide empirical evidence in descriptive literary studies. In this case, Booth’s translation, if available, would add much to exploring any plagiarized style and to fathoming the mental spaces of the translator. Lexical richness and diversity, translator’s signature and voice as well as authorial extended liberty should be assessed on reporting similar cases.

About the author:
Salwa Alwafai, Ph.D. in Linguistics and Translation (Delhi University), A faculty member at Al-Baath University (previously), Assistant Prof. of Linguistics & Translation, Department of English Language, College of Arts, Imam Abdulrahman Bin Faisal University (IAU), Dammam, KSA, (currently). ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1424-8897
References


Inter-mixing Indiannesss with Thainesss in selected Thai Novels

Sophana Srichampa
Centre for Bharat Studies
Research Institute for Languages and Cultures of Asia
Mahidol University, Thailand

Abstract
This article studies the Indian settings and plots of eight Thai novels by seven writers based on the period of the works and the relative experience of the writer. The results are as follows: During the early Ratanakosin period, only one piece of Thai poetry recording the lives of two Hindu Indians fighting over a Melayu woman was written using a Thai setting. In the Middle Ratanakosin period, one renowned book about India recounted the visit of a young King Rama V of Siam to India to experience and learn from the positive and negative experience of colonized countries. His Majesty was inspired by that visit and reformed Siam (former name of Thailand) into a dynastic state with numerous new economic political and social developments. In the current Ratanakosin period of rampant globalization, “Indianness” presented in the settings and protagonists are plotted in many Thai novels mixing with “Thainess” through Thai or Indian-Thai characterisation and aspects of culture and concepts related to Hinduism and Buddhism. “Dharma” and “Karma” are the main key reflections found in Thai works. It can be concluded that, through their art, Thai novelists serve de facto roles as cultural ambassadors linking Thai readers to India.

Keywords: Buddhism, Hinduism, India, novel, Thailand

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.13
Introduction

Thailand, as a part of Suvarnabhumi, has had a long relationship with India—thousands of years in fact, with trade being the main objective of Indians sailing from India to Southeast Asia. Hinduism, introduced by brahmins who accompanied Indian traders, was accepted and adapted by rulers in the region. In the 3rd century BCE, Buddhism was spread by Sona and Uttara in Nakhon Pathom province. Buddhism and Hinduism mixed with local administrative systems and beliefs to become the raja system. Venerable Buddhadasa, the most famous Thai monk and social reformer, once stated that Hinduism, Buddhism, the four basic human needs, and the language and culture of India all influenced Siam to become the Thai society we know today. There is a combination of Indian flesh and blood in ours. We unconsciously have Hinduism as our mother and Buddhism as our father. Buddhadasa asked Thai people to express their gratitude to India. (Buddhadasa, 1980, p. 18, 24).

During the time of colonization under the British up to the post-colonization era, waves of Indians from Punjab, including today’s Pakistan and other areas, migrated to Siam as it was the only country in Southeast Asia not colonized by Europeans. They sought to make their living there, often by selling clothes in Bangkok’s Pahurat area or by walking door to door sometimes as far as neighboring provinces. Earlier arrivees helped the newcomers and once able to stand on their own feet, they would venture off to make their own way in life. Clothes and textiles are part of Indian identity in Pahurat despite many of the later generations of Indians in Thailand choosing not to take up the business given the new career opportunities afforded them by their higher education, which the first and second generations never had. Most have forgone the textile trade in favour of technology and other commercial pursuits. The new generation is Thai but they look Indian and although not many Indians cross-marri with Thais, they mix with them in their daily life through work, study, religious and social activities.

The early generation of Indians in Thailand, without the benefit of a good education, was a forced to sell goods such as cloth and mosquito nets door to door, usually financed by loans from money-lenders who charged high daily interest. Thus the Thai saying “Meet an Indian and meet a snake, beat the Indian first” (Kaew-Uraj, 2011). This depicts the long held negative reputation of Indians, that remains deeply imbedded in the Thai mindset to this day.

Nonetheless, the Indian government opted to apply cultural diplomacy to develop a positive profile by focusing on arts, languages and culture and offering annual scholarships for various education programs to students in many countries. As a result, over 50 years, more than a thousand Thai students have graduated from India by virtue of various Indian scholarship schemes. Today many Thais study there of the own accord or at the numerous Thai universities that teach about India as part of eastern civilization, history, literature, religion, languages and culture studies. In 2009, the Indian Cultural Center was established in Bangkok, which functions as a hub of Indian
Inter-mixing Indianness with Thainess in selected Thai Novels

Srichampa

Arts, languages and culture promotion and exchange between India and Thailand. Its aim is to bring the peoples of both countries closer for better understanding. Also, many Thai Buddhists choose to go on pilgrimages to sacred Buddhist sites in India or visit renowned tourist places such as Taj Mahal, Kashmir, Chennai, Mumbai, New Delhi and Kolkata. Air connectivity between India and Thailand is very convenient nowadays with direct flights every day that facilitate travel and opportunities to learn about and know each other. With their knowledge, experiences and perceptions of India, many Thai writers use Indian setting and protagonists inter-mixing in their Thai novels.

Objective
The objective of this paper is to discover the Indian settings and genres presented in selected Thai novels.

Methodology:
Seven writers and eight works were selected for analysis: one literary work, one historical documentary, and six novels were reviewed which varied according to the period in which they were written and the seniority of the writers.

Results and findings:
The selected works are presented according to the periods as follows:

Early Ratanakosin Era
The early Ratanakosin era included the reigns of Kings Rama I to III (C.E.1782–C.E.1851) (Terwiel, 1983). One outstanding novel that was composed in this period is “Radenlandaj” which is described below.

This first work of literature about India was written in the reign of King Rama III and comprised various styles of Thai poetry. The setting for Radenlandaj is Bangkok, Thailand. The poems describe the life of a Hindu Indian named “Landaj” who is a wonderer, does not speak Thai well, lives near the Devasthan (Brahmin temple) and earns his living as a beggar by singing and playing the fiddle. There is another Indian character known as “Khaek Pradu” who owns cows. His wife is “Pradae”, a Melayu woman. One day both men have a fight over this woman. The story was already well known but Phra Maha Montri reinterpreted it as a play representing the first written work based on the true story of a Hindu Indian. In an amusing way, he used royal vocabularies to describe the life of an ordinary man like Landaj, a story described as “one of the most parodical stories which is hardly comparable” (Vitchayaprakorn, 2006, http://www.human.nu.ac.th/jhnu/journal_detail.php?m=4&a=50).

Radenlandaj reflects on the life of a beggar who earns his living playing music in exchange for offerings. Landaj represents the wonderer who appears at different times and in different
contexts through history. The setting of the story is in the proximity of the Brahmin Swing near the Devasthan which is on the Ratanakosin Island in Bangkok and is a place where many the wonderers today pass their time (Nathi, 2010).

Radenlandaj was the first work of social satire in Thai and the first to record the existence of a beggar: “This is the story of a beggar. Before that, in the Sukhothai and Ayutthaya Kingdoms, there might have been burglars too, but there is no record” (Pitak, 2014, p. 2).

The Middle Ratanakosin Era
The middle Ratanakosin era covered the reigns of King Rama IV–King Rama VI (from C.E. 1851–C.E. 1926) (Terwiel, 1983). One renowned book about India from that time is discussed below.

During the British colonial period, King Rama V, as the 19 year old young king of Siam (Today is Thailand), visited India in 1872. The purpose of his visit was to survey the situation there in terms of military, politics, and socio-cultural scenario to be used as possible models for Siam (Sahai, 2002). Kasetsiri (2016) opines that:

His visit during the early reign of the young king, especially to the British colonies of Singapore (1870), India (with Burma) in 1871, was extremely important to the “reform” and the royal policies of Siam during the reign of Kings Rama V, VI and VII (until Revolution 24 June 1932). Such reforms in the reign of King Rama V made Siam a “dynastic state” that centralized power with the king and became “absolutism” more than a “nationstate” (p.4).

There is a book written in 2002 about his visit entitled “India in 1872: As Seen by the Siamese” by the Indian scholar Professor Dr. Sahai Sachchidanand, which was translated into Thai by Kanthika Sri-udom in 2003. This book is a good reference to India under the British Raj from the viewpoint of the young Siamese king.

During the period of colonization in Asia, which impacted Siam less than its neighbours, the young Siamese king sought to learn how those colonized countries were affected, India in particular. He visited them to learn how best he could rule and keep Siam safe from being colonized itself. He sailed to the port of Calcutta, the then capital of British Raj, and stayed for 47 days. At that time, India had been under British rule for more than a hundred years and had had its infrastructure developed and modernized: railways, telecommunications, telegraph systems, roads and canals connected to the main rivers. Western education, a western-styled military, foundries, coins, docks, prisons, museums, zoos, religious places and palaces were all provided by the British. All this represented “westernness” or “modernity”. At the same time, the young king experienced the abolition of the Maharaja system in the process, so he witnessed both positive and negative aspects of western colonization in India. Upon returning to Siam, he instigated development
projects by applying “western” concepts and using “India as a role model for Siamese reform” (Muksri, 2003). The King together with leaders of the nobility, drove the modernization process quickly by introducing a taxation system, reengineering the political system and abandoning outdated traditions such as slavery and crawl. (Wongthet, 2016).

These two works provide a positive view of India from a Thai perspective. In “Radenlandaj”, the presentation of the poor Hindu beggar reflects a Thai predisposition to have fun. “India in 1872: As Seen by the Siamese” on the other hand, is a valuable historical record compiled by the renowned Indian scholar and translated into Thai as an inter-cultural work for both sides to learn from.

Current Ratanakosin Era
In the reign of King Rama IX, there were numerous Thai novels written with foreign countries as settings. India was one such country that inspired Thai writers. The selected works studied in this part are presented according to the periods of publications and the seniority of the writers in Thai society.

A number of Thai writers have used elements of Indian history, geography, literature and knowledge in their plots and settings, and the first writer introduced here is Phnomthien. He wrote his first novel, “Chulatrikhun”, in 1948 when he was in secondary school. It is a tragic romance novel. Chulatrikhun is the point where two rivers the Ganga and the Yamuna merge with the milky way from heaven to become three rivers. He describes the tragic romance as follows: Dararai-philat is a beautiful princess from Varanasi who prays at Chulatrikhun to become an ugly woman because she does not want her life to end like that of her beautiful mother. She meets Ariyawat, the king of Magadha who falls in love with her at first sight. Their destiny is complicated and tragic when, in the end, Ariyawat betrays her by marrying another princess, leading Dararai-philat to take her own life at Chulatrikhun.

This retro fantasy is one of the most popular novels in Thailand and has been reproduced as a radio drama, film and stage drama at various times. Moreover, five songs related to the story were composed.

By the same writer, with another Indian setting is “Sivaaraatri”. Sivaaraatri means “A night of sin floating; it is Siva night”. This is a beautiful novel by Phnomthien and written in a style that cannot be copied. (Kananurak, 2001). Four volumes have been published at various times. The plot revolves around a battle between Aryan and Milakha (Dravidian), but is sprinkled with romantic elements. In the story, the Aryans, led by Phitsanu Maharaja, invade the lands of the Dravidians. They want to kill all new born Dravidian babies because a prophesy foretells that on Sivaaraatri,
Dravidian babies will defend their ancestral lands and defeat the Aryans. Three babies are born to the Dravidian King on Sivaaraatri and protected by various groups: one baby is cared for by a bandit; the second baby by a magician and the third baby by a priest. They do not know each other, only that the babies have the same royal seal on their backs. Twenty years later, now men, the three join together to fight for their freedom. The war causes losses on both sides, but finally the Dravidians prevail and soon realize what a disaster war brings. As a result, they succeed in uniting all groups and declare that, no matter who, they are one Jambudvipa people.

Phnomthien, who is a renowned writer of Bharat novels, explained the background to this novel saying: “I wrote this novel after studying the theology and indology of India and literature written by King Rama VI which inspired me... It was the history of India when Aryan invaded Jambudvipa where Dravidian resided around 1,500 B.C.E. establishing the myths that eventually produced the Hindu gods” (Soythong and Tulaphitak, 1999, p. 4).

The following are examples of two Thai readers' impression of this novel.

(1) “Whoever reads Sivaaratri three times need not worry about how to use Thai anymore”.

(2) “It’s very long, more than two thousand pages. But it is fun and captivates readers with good advice”.

The second renowned writer is Thommayanti. She wrote “Sivalaj” which has two settings. One setting is in India during the time of King Ashoka, and the other is Thailand. The main characters are Thais of Indian extraction. The genre is mystery. Wamarin, the female protagonist, is an Indian-Thai model, who her Thai diplomat family adores. She often experiences strange premonitions which are familiar to her but she does not know why or where. When she is contacted for a fashion shooting in India, she accepts the job and decides to explore the area around Rishi Gate, the origin of the river Ganges. She gets lost but meets her Thai mother. The photography production team includes Ruthara, who is working as a coordinator shooting at the Taj Mahal. Along the way, Wamarin comes face to face with her karma and Ruthara tells her that he was the mouth of Mahadeva (Siva). They go to ‘Sivalaj’ together to change her bad karma, which she is constantly trying to avoid. This story mixes Buddhist and Hindu elements as well as the reincarnation of the male and female protagonists.

Examples of the reflections of some readers of this novel include:

(3) “I like this novel very much because of the beautiful language. The story appeals to me.”
The third well-known writer is Sophak Suwan. She was the first writer to introduce to readers the nature of different races, religions, politics and cultures in the foreign lands. Although these issues are not insignificant, equality of human beings is more important (Satjaphan, 2013). Two of her novels involve Indian settings. The first one is “Meet Each Other under the Stars” which is set in the British colonial period and is an adventure romance story. The male protagonist, Khich-han Salim Agbar, is a descendant of the Mughal King Agbar. The female protagonist is Iris, the daughter of Doctor Schneider, a German doctor, and his English wife. Iris spends her childhood with her English aunt and an Indian uncle who is the private doctor to Khich-han's mother, a princess Khich-han is sent to study in England with Heirich, Iris's brother, at the same time that Iris has to move back to stay with her family in Austria. Doctor Schneider loves to climb mountains. His dream is to climb in the Himalayas, and luckily one day he and his team are sent to survey there. But the mission has not yet finished when World War II breaks out and they are arrested and ultimately disappear. After the war, Iris and her brother go to India. Together with Khich-han, they search for their father as far as Tibet with the help of Junk Yimpa, a Tibetan man who is a friend of Khich-han and Doctor Schneider's family. Finally, they find Doctor Schneider and they all decide to help Junk Yimpa find work in Lasa. Unfortunately, the Chinese invade Tibet and they all have to flee back to India. Iris becomes a volunteer teacher in Dhammasala, and in the end, Khich-han, who becomes an Indian diplomat, marries Iris and all live happily ever after.

One reader of this novel commented as follows:

(5) "Reading about the 50th anniversary of the Tibetan occupation made me think of this Sophak Suwan novel, which is one that I like very much. The story begins about a decade before the Second World War. It starts in India and concludes in Tibet. The writer added a lot of information, but it’s still readable.

The male protagonist, Khich-han, speaks very little and there are only two romantic scenes in the story between Khich-han and Iris, but Sophak Suwan was able to make us feel the romance and love between the two."


The second novel by Sophak Suwan about India is “Justmina-Mahal”. The setting is in India which is full of geographic and cultural diversity. The genre is romance. Malatee Mala is an Indian princess engaged to a prince since she was 5 years old by her Indian grandmother. After her Indian
father and Thai mother, the King and Queen, die in an accident when Malatee is 8 years old, she and her nanny go to stay with her Thai grandparents in Thailand. As a teenager, she goes to England to study nursing and returns to India to work in public health with an NGO. There she meets her fiancé, Ronnachit Jirendra Gandawhar and Major General Isara Jairaj Gandawhar who is his step brother. In a happy ending, she marries her step brother who is Maharaja of Arunapura and becomes Maharani.

Reviews of this story include likes and dislikes:

(6) “This novel is fun but it’s difficult to read; too much of description, letter writing to each other and a lot of English vocabularies…”

(7) “This novel also mentions the Thai family. I like the impressive advice of the grandfather to his granddaughters”.

(8) “I’ve already read it. It’s lovely. The male character is very tender as is the female one since she is so young… I like it”.

Warangkhana is the pen name of the Thai writer who wrote “Sari”, a Thai novel set in both Thailand and India. The main character, Trat, is a Thai student who earns a scholarship to study science at Aligarh Muslim University in India. He is attracted to an Indian Muslim princess who is around ten years older than him, but he also loves the princess’ niece, Praveen, who is studying at the same university. The princess is a kind-hearted woman who is well regarded and respected by others because of her charity. Trat is offered private English classes with the princess as he is almost retired. He eventually agrees to become her husband and moves to live with her in the palace. Although he feels as if he has sold himself out for success, he believes he had no choice as he does not want to go back to Thailand as a failure, so he serves her as she demands. However, he soon attracts the attention of another niece, Muni, who has fallen in love with him. He does not really love her but an affair together leaves Muni pregnant. The princess soon learns of this but decides to help Muni, who is stubborn and rejects the princess’ advice. In the end, the princess arranges the marriage of her other niece, Praveen, whom Trat loves, as she feels guilty for stealing Trat from her. But Muni prevents the marriage out of jealousy by fatally shooting Praveen. Muni also dies, but her daughter, named “Little Praveen”, is saved and taken care of by Trat who returns to Thailand after graduation. Trat finally gets married to his cousin, Amravadi, who looks after “Little Praveen” as her mother. This novel is a love triangle and tragedy.
The last writer is Chayaphim. Her novel is “Love Solok beneath Star Ray”. The setting is in India. The male protagonist, Ram Anderson, is an English-Indian, and the female is Laksmi who is Thai. The story is a romance. Broken hearted, Laksmi departs Thailand for India with the idea to write a new novel. She meets Ram who is a guide and henna artist. Feelings for each other gradually form into a deep relationship but there are many obstacles that test their love. But as this is real love, like that between the goddess Laksmi and the god Ram, it has a happy ending.

The following are comments by readers:

(9) “The story is about Indian people and tradition. It’s hard to find novels like this in my opinion. I’ve never read other such novels. The writer depicts the beauty of this country which we never thought of visiting before. But after reading this novel, I am inspired to go there. I have learned about the customs and gained other knowledge...”.


(10) “This novel covers various genres. The first part is romantic, and at the same time, it documents the arts and culture of India. The last part is romance mixed with drama...”


Discussion

During the Ratanakosin dynasty, there was significant Indian migration to Siam. Indianness is the theme of the Thai literary work, “Radenlandaj”, which is based on a real story recounted in a humorous style using high language. It is an outstanding piece of literature and is included in the curriculum for secondary school students. In general, Thai people do not discriminate against “otherness” by using vulgar words, and this work exemplifies the keen potential of the writer as teacher. Moreover, the story underlines two facts: 1) wonderers like Landaj have been a part of Thai society since the beginning of the Ratanakosin era; 2) Thailand has always been a multicultural society.

The historical documentary “India in 1872: As Seen by the Siamese” by Indian scholar Professor Dr. Sahai Sachchidanand follows King Rama V’s 92 days of travel throughout India, recording the history and events of the time in detail never before available to Thai readers. The writer, as an Indian who knew and understood Indian culture well, included items from the mass media written by both westerners and Indians in English and Hindi to supplement his descriptions. It shows how truly important India has been to Thailand (Sri-Udom, 2018) and offers a view of India as a reflection of the British raj, with both positive and negative consequences. As an outsider from a small independent country, the then young King of Siam learned many new things from the experience, demonstrating that no matter how seemingly different, Siam (Thailand) could and can learn much from India as the links between the two are so long and strong.
The selected Thai novels from the current Ratanakosin period reviewed in this study represent modernization through which the writers express both ‘Thainess’ and ‘Indianness’. India and Indianness has been an inspiration for many Thai writers throughout their lives and has enriched the knowledge and experiences through study, travel and musings that are ultimately expressed in their stories. Aiewsriwong (2017) said, regarding the foreign settings in Thai novelism, “Even though the novel used foreign scenes and foreign protagonists throughout the story, foreign lands are not important except it is exotic background, like spices we never taste...”. But if we consider readers' comments, it is clear that when writers of these genres of fiction insert South Asian elements through characterization and settings, readers are able to taste the essence of India and learn from it. Aiewsriwong also insists that the writers should pay attention to the ‘otherness’ that reveals the diverse ways of thinking, ways of life and beliefs of foreign lands, as depicted in the settings and exposed by the characters, without resorting to full blown representations and explanations. Nevertheless, some writers are unable to do this well so readers responded quite negatively to the overdetailed descriptions of the Indian scenes in the stories.

‘Thainess’ is expressed through the Thai or Indian-Thai characters' behavior as well as aspects of culture and concepts which are a blend of Hinduism and Buddhism. A feature of most Thai novels is the principle of karmic reward and retribution-Do good things and good things will be done to you. Do bad things and bad things will be done to you. Phnomthien, for example, states that

Humanity is the first instinct of humans. Humanity will cause conscience, ethics and morals to follow later... I think ‘Dharma’ is the most important thing in human life and I try to reflect it in all of my literary works in order to lend this conscience to readers indirectly.

(Sophapong, n.d.)

At the same time, ‘Indianness’ is represented through the Indian characters and setting, which convey the history, geography, religion, beliefs, language and culture of the time. The writers combine their knowledge of India with their creative imaginings and experiences of India and blend them into the stories. Therefore, not only are these novels sources of entertainment, but the mix of ‘Indianness’ and ‘Thainess’ offers insight and knowledge for readers through the beautiful prose and mesmerizing use of language. Some novels are admired by the readers and fans of respected older writers such as Phnomthien, Thomayanti and Sophak Suwan. But there are also some readers who may not appreciate certain over-stylised descriptions in the stories, as stated in some comments by readers. A number of these novels have been republished many times and produced in other entertainment forms such as films, dramas, TV series and songs, which serve to promote India to Thais through popular culture. New writers inspired by these stories, increasingly
choose India as a travel destination for real experiences and inspiration for modern Thai novels, often with Indian settings.

The image of India in Thai society is one of a civilized country that has strongly influenced Thai religion and culture throughout history. Many Thai novels prefer to present “Indianness” based on historical, spiritual and cultural sources in attractive literary styles. In so doing, “Thainess” is portrayed through the Thai characters in a glamorized setting. The works of Thai novelists can thereby serve as cultural ambassadors linking Thai readers to India, encouraging readers to survey more about India for themselves after turning the final page. By the same token, if Thailand is used as their setting, reciprocal promotion will open readers from both countries to the delights and wonders of each other’s societies, history and peoples.

**Conclusion**

In the early Ratanakosin era (C.E.1782-C.E.1851), Indianness was reflected through descriptions of real life two Hindu Indians and one Melayu woman. The setting was Thailand. In the current period of globalization, although many Thais still have negative attitudes towards Indians, many Thai writers are inspired to mix both Thai and Indian elements into settings and protagonists in their novels without feeling “otherness”. According to the data, five types of settings were identified: 1) Thai setting with Indian males and foreign female protagonist, 2) Indian setting with Indian male and female protagonists, 3) Indian and Thai settings with local Indians, 4) Indian and Thai settings with Indian and Thai male and female protagonists, and 5) Indian setting with Thai protagonists. In terms of genres, an Indian perspective and flavor is also added to the content of some Thai novels—mostly mystery, adventure and tragedy mixed with romance. Thai novels reflect “Indianness” and “Thainess” through karmic reward and retribution which are based on Buddhism and Hinduism. These selected novels not only entertain Thai readers, but also encourage Thai readers to feel closer to India.

**About the Author**

**Dr. Sophana Srichampa** is an Associate Professor in Linguistics at the Research Institute for Language and Cultures of Asia, Mahidol University, Thailand. One of her research interests is the relation between India and Thailand in terms of socio-cultural perspectives. She is the author of several articles related to language, culture and society. ID ORCID is https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3936-4963.

**References**


Muksri, S. (2003). India was a role model of the Siamese Reform in the reign of King Rama V. Available at http://54408.activeboard.com/t26194295.


Pramaha Montri. (2017). Radenlandaj. Available at https://pantip.com/topic:340539325%EQ0% B8%89%E0%88%89%E0%88%89%E0%88%8D94.


Drama, History, and Postcolonial Résistance in Northern Nigeria:  
A Review of Ahmed Yerima’s *Attahiru* 

Isyaku Hassan  
Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin  
21300 Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia 

Mohd Nazri Latiff Azmi  
Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin  
21300 Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia 

Mubarak Ibrahim Lawan  
Department of English and Literary Studies, Al-Qalam University Katsina, Nigeria 

Habibu Awais Abubakar  
Kano State College of Education and Preliminary Studies, Nigeria 

Abstract  
The relationship between history proper and African historical plays drew much attention of researchers in recent years. Many theatre scholars and playwrights argue that the value of these plays, which were primarily regarded as fiction or imaginative reconstruction of the past, may prevail over history. Theatre, which is considered the most symbolic form of art, can be historically educative and evocatively accurate. Based on the aforesaid arguments, this study aims to explore the dramaturgicals, theatricals or thespians used in Yerima's *Attahiru* (1999) in order to repudiate and resist the distorted versions of the colonial history of Sokoto Caliphate in an effective and affective way. To achieve this aim, textual analysis is used by combining its important approaches: author-oriented approach and context-oriented approach. This analysis is significant because the researchers investigated the colonial resistance captured in the play through postcolonial theory. In addition, this paper explores the attitudes of the colonialist and the colonised reproduced in the play and how the play helps in the decolonisation process, as well as how the images of the damaged heroes are reconstructed in the play in order to restore national pride and integrity. The play reconstructs and corrects a seriously damaged and awfully misrepresented African spiritual leader, Caliph Attahiru of the old Sokoto Caliphate in Northern Nigeria. 

Keywords: Attahiru, drama, Nigeria, postcolonial resistance, Sokoto Caliphate 


DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol3no2.14
Introduction
Ahmed Yerima’s *Attahiru* (1999) is a historical drama that recreates a long-gone past in theatre to protest and resist historical misrepresentation. Historical drama is defined by Etherton (1979) as “a shift from the re-creation of oral traditions in dramatic terms to the re-creation of a past contained in written histories” (p. 65). According to Etherton, drama is concerned with the colonial and immediate pre-colonial periods as well as the powerful African empires such as Benin empire which has an indigenous chronology of rulers giving some access to a more remote past.

*Attahiru*, which reveals the pre-colonial encounter between colonial masters and indigenous Africans, can undoubtedly be classified as a historical play. In this regard, Akoh (2007) states that over time, history has remained a dynamic source material for play creation and writings. From the first to the present generations of playwrights in Nigeria, the trend remains the same. Whether the focus is on distinguished figures or events, the historical material is adapted, recreated or subverted to serve a purpose, depending on the social vision or ideological persuasion of the individual writer (Adeoti, 2007).

The above description is true to Ahmed Yerima’s plays such as *Attahiru*, *The Trials of Oba Ovonramwen* (1998) and *Ameh Oboni the Great* (2006). These three historical plays have a nationalistic theme as evinced by the subject matter of colonialism which connects them together. Therefore, the Nigerian colonial history serves as a dramatic material to Yerima. His plays do not aspire to literal representations of the past in the way historical texts do. They are imaginative recreations of the past based on the author’s interpretation of the historical events. Therefore, drama and history may appear to be inextricable, but they are not the same. They are two different but mutually related disciplines, as both complement each other. Scrubber (2001) notes that the value of drama will prevail over history to the audience if there is a clash with history.

Moreover, while dramatists may adhere strictly to historical facts, they are often at liberty to add or deduct or even refract the facts in order to suit the purpose of their writing. Therefore, dramatists have a creative license that allows them to distil their opinions, thoughts, and wishes in the text. Therefore, there is possibility of recreating history in a significant way. However, this does not mean that the creative license permits the dramatists to extend their input to fabrication of facts. Rotimi (1978) suggests that “the dramatist’s input does not forget historical truth” (p. 10). Similarly, Yerima (2013) notes that the use of historical materials in the work of art is an attempt to further explain the significance of the historical event in a less serious story-telling version or style even while using the facts of the historical event.

In addition, dramatists are free to select the aspect of history which they feel could enhance their creativity and offer a new interpretation for the satisfaction of their audience. According to Soyinka (1988), “the artist or the ideologue is quite free to reconstruct history on the current ideological premises and, thereby prescribe for the future through lessons thus provoked” (p. 126). Incidentally, for African writers, whose history was disputed, damaged and misrepresented, dramatizing the historical materials can be a process of imaginative recovery and an affirmation of existence, culture and tradition. This is because colonialism undermined and misrepresented
African people and their cultural practices (Umar-Buratai, 2007). There is a need to project the people’s precolonial and colonial histories in an imaginative form, in order to correct the colonial misrepresentation. Accordingly, the historical play presents and re-asserts what it adjudges as the authentic history of the people in order to achieve a kind of self-appreciation (Adeoti, 2007).

Through the visual and auditory advantages of theatre, historical plays have the tendency to change, recreate and resist the distorted history of Africa in a more revealing and descriptive way. Therefore, African playwrights, like Yerima, choose to use historical materials to create their scripts. Yerima is widely recognised as a playwright of repute whose plays treat historical, political, social, economic, religious and cultural issues. Using the medium of theatre, Yerima calls on the general public to revolutionize or bring a change to their regretful status quo, re-enact the distant past in a resistive method and style, and finally contrast the African culture with that of the colonialist. Therefore, Yerima’s plays can generally be divided into religious, political and historical plays. Adeoti (2007) states that Yerima’s historical plays seek to dramatize, redefine, and interrogate the African history. They draw a connection overtly or covertly between the past and the present with a view to shaping the course of future actions. Sometimes, the stage presentation tries to redress the perceived gaps and omission in a particular strand of extant history, while paying attention to the artistic and entertainment goals of drama (p. 34).

The above quotation corroborates the fact that through historical reconstruction, Yerima probes and protests the European imperial discourse that controls the means of representation. In this way, Yerima substitutes the hegemonic versions of the history of Attahiru, the twelfth caliph of Sokoto Caliphate. Therefore, the veracity of hegemonic or euro-centric history is woefully reproduced in Yerima's play. This paper focuses on the resistive techniques and mechanisms that make Yerima's Attahiru succesful in “re-making” the counteracts of European historians in their hegemonic and perverted representations of Africa. Hence, this paper aims to explore the dramaturgicals, theatricals or thespians used in Yerima's Attahiru in order to repudiate and resist the distorted versions of the colonial history of Sokoto Caliphate in an effective and affective way.

Biography of Yerima (1957)
Although an Edo man by origin, speaking his native Auchi dialect, Yerima is fluent in Hausa and Yoruba languages. This is because he was born in Lagos in May 1957 to Alhaji T. Musa Yerima, a police officer who moved everywhere with his family where ever transferred. Ahmed Parker Yerima attended St. Bernadette’s Primary School in Abeokuta and later moved to University of Ife where he obtained a certificate in Dramatic Arts and later a Bachelor of Arts in 1981. In 1982, Yerima moved to University College Cardiff, where he pursued a postgraduate diploma in Theatre Arts, specializing in playwriting and acting. Yerima attended the prestigious Royal Holloway College, University of London where obtained a Doctorate degree in Theatre Studies and Dramatic Criticism.

Yerima is one of the most prominent Nigerian dramatists who emerged in the last decade of the twentieth century. Apart from being a playwright, Yerima is an artistic director, a theatre manager, a teacher and a researcher. Yerima's dramaturgy combines the practical orientation of a
theatre practitioner with the aesthetic consciousness of a critic. He draws broadly from generic elements of tragedy, comedy, tragic-comedy and satire (Adeoti, 2007). This description encapsulates the basic profile of Yerima’s successful career and provides a fascinating insight into his world of theatre. In addition, if ideological commitment and dramatic style are anything to go by, Yerima belongs to both the second and the third generations of Nigerian playwrights.

On account of the thematic pre-occupation of Yerima's historical plays, the playwright fits in the generation of those who opt for the recreation of history to protest, confront and nullify some historical misrepresentations. On the other hand, Yerima is a third-generation playwright who is dissatisfied with the Nigerian status quo, and therefore becomes committed to promoting a revolutionary change through his plays. Yerima himself says:

In some of my plays, sometimes I find out that I have to make a social comment. I look at contemporary Nigeria and I find that, for instance, the tragedy that exists is no longer that of Aristotle or even Soyinka (Inegbe & Uwemedimo, 2007, p. 6).

This indicates that Yerima uses the medium of drama to comment on the Nigerian socio-economic and political situations. His central focus is Nigeria, and indeed, life in post-independence Nigeria as well as the history, culture and traditions of the people constitute the ‘muse’ that inspires Yerima’s ‘mimesis’. Yerima treats history with freedom and imagination (Adeoti, 2007). This is exactly the root of argument in this paper; Yerima's theatre recreates the African history in order to respond to the biased imperial presentation.

Yerima authored more than twenty plays and various scholarly publications. He is described by some scholars as a “historical realist” who documents the relationship between powerful rulers of Nigerian kingdoms and their colonial masters. Yerima uses theatre to remind us of the long lost glory and the richness of our culture and tradition. His historical plays include Attahiru, The Trials of Oba Ovonramwen, Ameh Oboni the Great, and The Angel. He also authored and edited several other works, such as Theatre and Democracy in Nigeria (with Ayo Akinwale) in 2002, Fragmented Thoughts and Specifics: Essays in Dramatic Literature (2003), Basic Techniques in Playwriting (2004), Ideology and Stagecraft in the Nigerian Theatre (with Olu Obafemi) in 2004, and Modern Nigeria Theatre: The Geoffrey Axworthy Years (1956-1967) in 2005.

**Research on Yerima’s Attahiru**

Studies on Yerima’s Attahiru are mostly limited to issues such as the historicity and historiography of the play, cultural identity, and the contribution of historical drama towards nation building. For instance, in an essay entitled “Towards a Historiography of the Text: The Plays of Ahmed Yerima”, Akoh (2007) discovers that “the playwright is not wholly faithful to the full text of the history, but to the specific events surrounding it” (p. 121). Akoh is certainly right that the playwright’s reproduction is not truthful to the history proper. Yet, the play resists and corrects hegemonic histories of pre-colonial Nigeria. Akoh states that nothing about the level of this postcolonial resistance is put up by the plays. Therefore, this paper explores this resistance and arguably equates the dramatic text with the historical account in credibility or faithfulness.
Uwatt (2007) explores Yerima’s justifications on resorting to history in his play. Uwatt found that Yerima’s resort to history is for “a specific dramatic purpose of either absolving the Nigerian monarchs from alleged guilt of complicity, or celebrating their heroism in resistance of imperialism” (p. 142). But how can Yerima exonerate these monarchs if historical drama is not equated with history proper. How can we honestly celebrate the heroic deeds of the "make-believe historical hero" if somewhere in the corners of our hearts we know of their otherwise adventure? May be the answer is, as Linderberger (1975) puts it, “reality or plausibility exists essentially within the consciousness of the audience” (p. 2). Therefore, it can be argued that as drama creates and gives pictures of make-believe reality in theatrical performance, historical drama can be more truthful, and hence a substitution of history proper.

Moreover, in his effort to re-create the past on stage, Yerima comes up with The Trials of Oba Ovonramwen, a play that dramatizes the British invasion of Benin Kingdom at the dawn of colonial rule in Nigeria. This is another attempt by the playwright to counteract both the European colonial history and a previous play by Ola Rotimi based on the same historical figure, Ovonramwen Nogbaisi. Adeoti (2007) summarises that the play “pays particular attention to the gaps, omissions, silences and absences in Rotimi’s Ovonramwen Nogbaisi” (p. 85). Yerima portrays the Oba as a courageous character, like Attahiru, who stands against all odds. However, both playwrights are successful in changing the course of history to the favourable direction.

Idegu (2007) sees Attahiru as a play that politically promotes the identity, honour, glory and pride of Caliph Attahiru in the face of colonial domination. Because of the religious fervour shown by the Caliph and his followers in the play, Idegu concludes that “the war recorded is not only a resistance against political domination but also a defence of the Islamic faith by the Sokoto Caliphate” (p. 165). As Idegu studied the religious elements of the play, the efforts made by Luggard to avoid religious conflict and the Sultan’s faulty interpretation of the situation as such, this paper looks at resistance contours that lie in the language and theatricals used by the playwright.

In another development, Dorcas (2013) studied Yerima's Attahiru and its reasons for the zero use of women in representing history. This attracts the attention of feminist writers and other women activists in academia. Although Yerima responded to the criticism, some readers are still unsatisfied. Therefore, more comments and interpretations on the issue are surfacing. In addition, Odebunmi (2007) conducted a study entitled “Pragmatic Reading of Proverbs in Yerima's Drama”. According to the study, Yerima’s proverbs in Attahiru “explore the flora and fauna resources of the environment (p. 211)”. Therefore, Yerima’s style of handling proverbs shows that his plays are accessible to both local and foreign readers who desire to come to terms with Nigerian culture and tradition (Adeoti, 2007). Because postcolonial playwrights hybridize the language, theatricals and setting of their plays, proverb is a good way of showing cultural resistance. This paper extends the exploration to include the techniques deliberately used by the playwright as a way of cultural resistance in theatre.
Plot Summary of *Attahiru*

*Attahiru* is a play that re-enacts the controversial history of the last Caliph of Sokoto Caliphate in pre-colonial Northern Nigeria. In the play, Ahmed Yerima dramatizes the clash between the imperial, colonialists’ ideology under Lugard, and the patriotically Islamic fervour that reigns the Caliphate, which results in the heroic death of the Caliph and hundreds of his followers at the battle of Burmi. This is at the height of the scramble of Africa when the Great Britain was eager to take control of the Caliphate before France as they were fast approaching through Niger. Therefore, Lugard started to speed up and extend his encroachment to Sokoto by sending a “so-called” friendship letter that asked the Caliph to either consciously or unconsciously befriend the European “infidel”. After consulting the Sokoto warriors, the Caliph refused and chose to go to war with Lugard. However, this history is much repudiated by some prejudiced historians (Balogun, 2000) who eclipsed this exceptional and fearless resistance to colonialism by the Northerners in Pre-colonial Nigeria. Therefore, this paper argues that *Attahiru* is a piece that resists such a hegemonic and biased presentation of history. Its theatrical performance is a corrective attempt to straighten the crooked and distorted history. The paper also argues that the play reconstructs the historically damaged hero of the event by arguably assuming the same veracity or credibility as history.

Analysis of the Play

The following description is captured in Ahmed Yerima’s *Attahiru* (Jibiya, 2000:1-2).

*You said Attahiru died when*
*You were only ten.*
*At Burmi you said*
*A heroic death indeed*
*After him, many came.*
*Hardly any the like of him*
*Many that came very unlikely him*
*Few indeed a facsimile of his former self*

The historic death captured above is vividly brought back to life in Ahmed Yarima’s *Attahiru*. In a simple and down-to earth style, Yerima “gives life to the past and to the dead”, or rather takes history from the written word into the visual images on stage. In effect, the play portrays the conflict between the colonial past and the post-colonial present, between the pre-colonial identity and the colonial legacy, and finally reveals the “hybrid” situation of the playwright himself who is now searching for his cultural identity prior to colonization. Thus, Yerima attempts to rediscover a cultural identity obliterated by the hegemonic power structures of colonization.

Although Yerima selects and organizes the facts, as every work of art imposes an order, an organization, and a unity on its materials (Wellek & Warren, 1978), the facticity is not marred but arguably corrected by the imaginative construction in the work. Therefore, the work is successful, to a greater extent, in portraying a historical ecolonial rresistance in Northern Nigeria. The play is opened with the information of the death of Caliph Abdurrahman who is to be succeeded by a prince. Muhammad Attahiru I, being one of the princes, emerges as the new caliph. He ascends
the throne during a hard time of colonial domination as he himself confirms this threatening, gloomy and uncertain time: “I am becoming the Caliph at a time when the history of our lives is at a delicate balance. At a time when the white man is determined to upset the peace of our lives” (Wellek & Warren, 1978, p. 21). However, the degree of this tension is dramatically reduced in the opening discussion of the play by Ahmad, Abbas, and Yakubu:

Yakubu: “We got over Kano, but when we heard about what the Whiteman did to the people of Zaria, we started to worry about the safety of Sokoto and the Caliph’s untimely death” (p. 17).
Ahmad: “A thousand curses on his white evil soul. Did you hear what they said he did to Kontagora, Bida and Yola?” (p. 17).
Abbas: “We cannot waste much time my friends. The first gun shooting of the Whiteman spits bullets of death. It talks to soldiers from far. The princes should not squabble over who should be caliph, there is no time” (p. 17).

The characters, two beggars and a soldier, although minor, are important and they provoke laughter or comic relief that eases tension as the events in the play rise to climax. They also represent the major cultural attitudes and impressions of the general public in the North. Although, as Balogun (2000) points out, some historians in the Southern part of the country deny the resistance in the North, Yerima, in the above quotation, disproves this assertion. He showers curses on the white colonialists and shows, in a sort of alarming cum rhetorical question, the people’s disapproval of the colonialists’ wantons physical domination. Yakubu's words established the same resistant attitude.

Because language is a political medium and an index of the ideology and social class of dramatists, some syntactic structures should be studied. To begin with, looking at the structure of the English used by Yerima to curse the Whitemen, there is a tinge of contamination of Standard English, or rather, there is a hybrid mix of Western and African/Hausa syntax. In Hausa Language, people use the expression “Thousand curses” to damn an extremely abominable or condemnable deed or person. Here, Yerima indigenizes words, phrases, and local idioms of Hausa language in order to give English language an indigenous flavour. By using native language as well as appropriating the colonial one, Yerima makes a fitting linguistic medium to express his postcolonial experiences. Yerima, a hybrid African, uses a hybrid narrative language, a programmatic strategy to reach the common people by appealing to their sensibility and to subvert the power of the Colonial superincumbent language. Moreover, even if English was used as a means of imperial oppression, its transformation can potentially turn it into a tool of resistance.

Furthermore, this fusion of native and western conventions reflects the playwright’s desire to express his own postcolonial identity and heritage. In effect, this is viewed as part of cultural resistance by the colonized people who try to naturalize the western forms. In this context, Ashcroft (2001) observes that the most sustained, far-reaching and effective interpretation of postcolonial resistance has been the ‘resistance to absorption’, the appropriation and transformation of
dominant technologies for the purpose of re-inscribing and representing post-colonial cultural identity (p. 143).

Subsequently, the play moves to the Court where the new caliph, seated in the courtroom, invites his warriors to deliberate on the situation. A letter from Lugard, of the so-called friendship, and which shows how the British erode the power of the Emirates under the Caliphate, is read by Waziri, thus:

Since the Emirs of Kontagora and Bida have been oppressing the people, engaging in slave trade, attacking traders, organising stealing parties, I have because of these evils of theirs, taken their crowns from them and banished them (Clears his voice), signed, Sir Frederick D. Lugard (p. 27).

This letter portrays the British’s false and baseless claims for perpetrating their colonial activities in the Caliphate. Nevertheless, the quiet murmur that goes round among the court officials is a sign of disapproval of the reactions and deep distrust of the friendship.

Furthermore, the letter, instead of generating diplomatic relationship between the two opposing powers, spoils that which lingers, because the caliph and his court officials interpret it as usurpation of the caliph's power. As it appears, the caliph has to either succumb and become just an advisor to the British officials or go to war. Yet, the caliph seeks an advice from his court officials. In this regard, different opinions are offered. Some of them (Marafa) opt for peace while others (Waziri, Madawaki, Sarkin Kwanni) opt for war. Nevertheless, majority of them (including Galadima and Dan-Magaji) choose emigration from Sokoto before the arrival of the British. Madawaki, being one of those who subscribe to the idea of war asserts that ”No matter how well one glorifies a donkey with beautiful apparels of a horse at a durbar, a donkey is still a donkey, and a horse is still a horse. I beg his royal highness to ignore the Whiteman” (p. 28). He further states “The Whiteman is a uninvited guest to our land, he must observe not dictate, he must appreciate not criticize. Allah picks the caliph not man!” (p. 29).

Madawaki, in his pointblank statement, expresses the view of the majority that insists upon going to war, to resist the white political and cultural domination. They refuse to be 'stooges' of the Whites for they fully understand the corrosive nature of such political and cultural domination. This is another combative scene that counteracts many historians. This daring resolution is more vivid in Madawaki’s angry reply to Ubandoma. The reply shows their valor which, if hands were put together, would usher them into victory. Madawaki asserts that: The black race makes me want to cry. The Whitemen are only a handful, then how come they are such a big bully, that we all shiver because we all are to blame...(30).

Ubandoma, on the other hand, disapproves of the war. He goes against the war when he asks:
But my concern is how prepared are we? How safe is it to dare the Whiteman? We heard how Zaria walls fell and how quickly the Whiteman filled the Kano moat with the bodies and bones of Kano warriors. Sad, we must ponder deeply great one (p. 30).

Similarly, Marafa, another court official at a later meeting, has the same idea in his remark: Your highness, if reason can prevail on an issue, why rush to spoil blood? Right now, Sokoto is not ready for war. Being a dedicated, honest and patriotic leader, who prefers to die defending his honour, people and political integrity, Attahiru, gallantly and bravely orders Waziri to reply the Whiteman that “We did not invite him to interfere with our problems. He has his religion and we have ours” (33). The caliph once again at another occasion declares that “You spoke well Sarkin Kwanni. I now decree, as with my earlier letter to the Whiteman, war is our only answer to his threats (47).

According to Yerima (2003), “this daring resistance reflects the first spirit of nationalism in Nigeria” (p. 187). However, the caliph’s choice of action, at this tragic moment, can be interpreted as his hamartia, error, mistake of judgement or tragic flaw which makes him a tragic hero like Oedipus in Sophocles’ Oedipus the King or King Odewale in Rotimi's The Gods are Not to Blame. The caliph’s action moves readers to pity and tear for the catastrophic turn of the events. Heedless of all the observations of some court officials regarding their unpreparedness, lack of sophisticated weapons compared to the Whiteman’s, and the futility of bloodshed, the caliph goes on with the preparation for the war.

The powerful character of Attahiru is infused with the maximum level of human traits, although at a time, he moves to a higher level. This occurs when Attahiru accepts and embraces death in place of dishonor. He sacrifices his life for what he believes to be just. Therefore, Yerima dramatizes the tragic mental set-up of Attahiru, which is indubitably an accurate portrayal of the hero’s praiseworthy hubris and legendary guts to defend the honor and cultural institutions of the caliphate. The surrender to this fatalistic death is captured in the caliph’s words “If indeed, there is a prophecy that must end in Shehu’s empire in my reign as a caliph, then this is no time to mourn, but a time of gratitude, a time of prayers and great thanks to Allah that I am the chosen one (43).

Subsequently, Lord Lugard, the high commissioner, decides to attack Sokoto since the caliphate refuses his invitation of friendship. Lugard is eager to take Sokoto of course when Willcocks, an important officer observes “My major worry is the French. They are moving closer to Sokoto through the north of Katsina” (35). Lugard, in whose office the discussion takes place, replies “I have studied the situation myself. It means that we either fight and take Sokoto now, or the French would cross Niger and join Sokoto, and thereby cutting us off totally (35). All these are overt political statements that are translated in Lugard’s long speech delivered on 15th March, 1903, after the departure of the caliph.

The real motive of colonization is to exploit or siphon off the wealth of the colonized countries, not that what they claim with regard to Fulani rule. This explains their rush to take over
the caliphate before their rival France does so. The most unfortunate thing is the betrayal act of prince Muhammad al-Tahiru Aliyu who allies with Lugard at this delicate moment. Muhammad al-Tahiru Aliyu Babba dan Caliph Muhammad Bello is the popular choice of most Sokoto king-makers to succeed Caliph Abdurrahman in October 1902, but he was “forced to step down in favor of Muhammad Attahiru dan Ahmad Atiku dan Caliph Abubakar Atiku who is his closest rival, to avoid civil strife” (Last, 1967, p. 175).

By the same token, the suppressed sentiments of the sons of Ali Muhammad Bello means that the caliphate is internally divided at such a crucial moment. The British takes advantage of the succession matter, and thus makes the most of it by appointing Muhammad Al-Tahir Aliyu as caliph, to intentionally aggravate the fugitive caliph. Furthermore, Muhammad Al–Tahir is not alone in accepting and collaborating with the British. Marafa and Muhammad Mai Turare also join him. Incidentally, the pre-existing division in the caliphate also fans the flames. This has to do with an indifferent attitude of the caliphate toward the invasion of the weak emirates by the strong ones. When the caliphate refuses to intervene, the weak emirates are forced to invite the British to interfere. Ubandoma confirms this when he says “When Zaria fell, I ran to the house of some of you here. And, what did they say?.. Sokoto and Zaria have not been friends” (pp. 31–32).

Sokoto is captured by Lugard, but Caliph Attahiru flees to Burmi, where he gathers brave warriors from Kano, Gombe, Kontagora, Nupe, Bauchi, Misau, and Katagun. He gives a morale boosting speech before the war begins. The war scene is clearly explained in stage direction: In darkness, noises of fighting men, cannons booming, metal clapping, swords cutting into swords. Noises of wounded and dying, etc. coming from all around the stage and backstage, auditorium and wings (p. 61). Through this description, the detail of the war comes to mind. But the gory picture of the battle field and the courage of Attahiru are captured more vividly in the account of a survivor, Yakubu: Yet, the greatest moment was when the caliph fell. As the bullet struck him, he raised up his sword and screamed. With the bullet he still cut down two more soldiers, then his Rawani loosened, and his cap fell (p. 63).

Of course, Caliph Attahiru I and his warriors are venturesome and courageous. They show a sheer resistance against the British political, religious and cultural domination. However, more gallant and venturesome patriotism is seen through the action of the blind beggar Abbas and his friend Ahmad who decide to join the fighters. Despite their helpless situation, when captured sneaking out of Sokoto in disguise, they refuse to divulge the hideout of the caliph. Abbas tells Lugard to his face that “It will be better for me to die on the side of my caliph than to die a coward” (p. 55). This admiring act shows how common people of the pre-colonial Northern Nigeria, represented by these characters, stood for the cause and resisted colonialism. In the play, the people's determination to fight alongside the caliph is first captured in Abbas’ proclamation: The caliph. I must get to him. I must fight by his side. I must give up my life for him. I must be somebody for once in my life, eyes or no eyes I must be somebody (48).

In a nutshell, the ideology of Yerima manifests itself in the content, techniques, and devices he uses to present the content. The colonial resistance dramatized by in the racy and urgent work
of Attahiru is also seen in characters and action. The structure of the play itself seems to be signaling such a resistance, as it lacks all the conventional arrangement of Western Theatre. There are no scenes, acts or any form of division. The end of each segment and the beginning of another is illustrated through the use of stage lighting. Therefore, Yerima's theatre can be seen as a visual presentation of the resistance to Colonialist discourses of theatre. In a hybrid style, the playwright develops a syncretic or interfusional Postcolonial Theatre, indigenizing each of the western dramatic elements in the play.

Conclusion
This paper analysed Ahmed Yerima’s Attahiru in relation to post-colonial resistance in Northern Nigeria. In effect, the play portrays the conflict between a colonial past and the post-colonial present, between the pre-colonial identity and colonial legacy, and finally reveals the “hybrid” situation of the playwright himself. Therefore, the work is successful, to a greater extent, in portraying the colonial resistance in Northern Nigeria. Because language is a political medium and an index of the ideology and social class of dramatists, some syntactic structures should be studied. In addition, Yerima, a hybrid African, uses a hybrid narrative language and a programmatic strategy to reach the common people by appealing to their sensibility to subvert the power of the colonial superincumbent language. Furthermore, this fusion of native and Western conventions reflects the playwright’s desire to express his own postcolonial identity and heritage. This is viewed as part of cultural resistance by the colonized people.

The play shows how common people of the pre-colonial Northern Nigeria, represented by the characters, stood for the cause and resisted colonialism. The play shows how literature counteracts historical records of such a historical pandemonium, which indelibly remains part of the history of Northern Nigeria. Today, this play is remembered and discussed more than the crooked history in schools, colleges, and universities. Any time the play is read, studied or watched, it touches and enlivens the patriotism in the audience, which consequently promotes a particular social agenda. Yerima focuses immensely on the events leading to the war, which makes the play very moving and compelling. This way, Yerima corrects the erroneous teachings in schools for several years, especially in the southern part of Nigeria, regarding the relationship between the North and the colonial government. It was baselessly taught that there was not any form of indigenous resistance to foreign rule in Northern Nigeria.

About the Authors
Dr. Isyaku Hassan is a Post-Doctoral Researcher in the Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Sultan Zaining Abidin, Malaysia. Isyaku holds a Bachelor of Science in Mass Communication, an MA in English/Communication and a PhD in Communication. His area of research interest includes Communication and Literature. https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8260-2894

Dr. Mohd Nazri Latiff Azmi is an Assoc. Prof. of English Language at Universiti Sultan Zaining Abidin (UniSZA), Malaysia. He is a former Dean and Head of English Department in the Faculty
of Languages and Communication, UniSZA. Nazri specializes in Literacy and Comparative Literature Studies.

**Mubarak Ibrahim Lawan** works at Al-Qalam University Katsina, Department of English and Literary Studies. He previously worked at Kano State College of Arts, Science and Remedial Studies, Nigeria. He holds an MA in English Literature.

**Habibu Awais Abubakar** is a Principal Lecturer in the Department of English and European Languages, Kano State College of Education and Preliminary Studies. He holds BA and MA degrees in English and currently pursuing his PhD at Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia

**References**


Translating English Existential 'there' Sentences into Arabic: 
A Text-based Analysis

Irfan Said
Department of English, College of Arts and Letters, 
Cihan University, Erbil, Iraq

Abstract:
English existential 'there' lacks equivalent in many languages, yet it has attracted the attention of linguists working within contrastive linguistics and translation studies. The aim of the present paper is to investigate how translators deal with English 'there' sentences in two translated Arabic texts. The method adopted in the study is a descriptive-analytic one. In Arabic the words 'hunaaka' and 'tammata' are usually used to render English 'there'; however, the data of the study show that in many cases translators avoid using these two words. The flexibility of word order in Arabic, in addition to the use of full lexical verbs, more frequently than English does in 'there' sentences, help to translate these sentences adequately into Arabic. It is also found that syntactic restrictions are not the only reason for the fact that many 'there' sentences are not translated using 'hunaaka' and 'tammata'; the discourse and stylistic levels, play a role in the translator's decision to use other means. In some cases, the use of 'hunaaka /tammata' is shown to be optional and in other cases to be obligatory, unless an alternative construction is produced. Major translational changes affecting the information structure of the texts, are not found in the target language.

Key words: Arabic existentials, Arabic-english translation, existential –there, tammata, hunaaka

1. Introduction

   English existential 'there' as in:
   
   (1) There is a pencil on the table.

   lacks equivalent in many languages, yet it has attracted the interest of linguists working within contrastive linguistics and translation studies (see Creissles, 2014). In Arabic to say:
   
   (2) qalam –un fawqa–l-ṭawilātī
   
   pencila on the table

   'A pencil is on the table'.

   is usually unacceptable since it starts with an indefinite expression. So, a structure is used in which the locative phrase 'fawqa –l- ṭawilātī' is placed before the indefinite noun phrase 'qalam-un':
   
   (3) fawqa –l-ṭawilātī qalam-un
   
   on DEF table pencil a

   'There is a pencil on the table.'

   In modern standard Arabic the words 'hunaaka' and 'ṯammaṭa' are usually used to translate the English 'there' sentences into Arabic, though the present study will show that they are not the preferred translations in many cases. The purpose of this study is to answer the following question: how are the different roles of the English existential 'there' sentences dealt with in Arabic; particularly, how translators treat 'there' themes when translating into Arabic which has a different information structure system from English? It is hypothesized that the functions that are attributed to the English existential 'there' can be expressed in Arabic in a variety of ways.

2. Data collection


3. Existential 'there' sentences in English

   English has two kinds of 'there': existential and adverbial. For example, in:

   (4) There is a chair over there.

   The first 'there' is a dummy word, a mere place holder, used to introduce the existence of the indefinite noun phrase 'a chair'; and the second one is an adverb. This clearly shows that the first 'there' functions as the organizer of the message in (4). Collins (2001, p. 1) states that "existential-there sentences have been characterized as serving a ‘representative’ function, drawing attention to an element that comes into view or to the attention of the addressee."

   According to Quirk et al., (1985, pp.1402-08) existential 'there' sentences in English are, generally, of these types:

   A. there + be + indefinite NP + place
(5) There was silence in the room. (Lawrence, p.48)
B. there + be + indefinite NP
(6) There was a pause (Lawrence,p.69)
C. there + be + NP + relative clause
(7) There was a thistle which pricked him vividly. (Lawrence, p. 119)
D. there + be + NP + to infinitive
(8) There was no need to be nasty about it (Lawrence,p.106)
E. there + be + definite NP
(9) How could we get there? – Well, there's the trolley (Rando &Napoli, p 306)
F. there + a verb other than be + NP
(10) In 1873, there had appeared in Paris, a book of poems called 'le Amous Jaunes'(Wilson, p. 80).

4. Existential sentences in Arabic
As mentioned in the introduction, in modern standard Arabic the words 'hunaaka' and 'ṯammaṭa' are used in many cases to render the English existential ‘there’. 'Hunaaka' and 'ṯammaṭa' are almost synonymous, but it seems that 'ṯammaṭa' sounds more formal than 'hunaaka'. Aziz(1995,p. 49) states that "The dummy hunaaka was introduced at the beginning of this century [20th century] by translators, under the influence of the European languages, much to the chagrin of the purists, who have been fighting a losing battle against this use of hunaaka". Arab grammarians consider 'hunaaka' and 'ṯammaṭa' referring expressions(literally:referring nouns) and adverbs at the same time (see Hassan, 1974,p. 295). For example:

(11) sirtu min huna 'la hunaaka.
walked-I from here to there
'I walked from here to there.'
(12) ṣammaṭa hall -un li ḥaḍihi -l – muškilaṭi.
there solution - NOM for this DEF problem
'There is a solution for this problem.'

Arabic has a rather flexible word order and this enables it to express existentials by exploiting this characteristic. As said earlier, in Arabic a sentence starting with an indefinite noun phrase like (2) is unacceptable. Instead, the word order is reversed to get (3). This is in agreement with the general restriction on existential sentences concerning an indefinite expression at the beginning of a sentence. The verb 'yūgadu=exist', and other full lexical verbs giving a sense of existence, are also used to refer to something or someone as will be shown later.

5. Information structure
Many linguists have dealt with the different aspects of the English existential sentences. The present study adopts the version of analysis presented in Quirk et al., (1985) which draws upon the idea of 'given', 'new', and 'focus' information in describing such sentences. Information structure, or 'information packaging', denotes the ways in which thoughts are packaged into sentence structures to express information progress in discourse (Doherty, 2002). It shows how the status
of information is encoded in the interaction of grammar and cognitive systems. For instance, it is possible for one meaning to be expressed by a number of different structures, as is seen in the following examples from English and Arabic respectively:

(13) A. The boy was chasing the girl.
   B. The girl was chased by the boy.
   C. It was the girl the boy was chasing.
   D. What the boy was chasing was the girl.

(14) A. īṣṭaraa zayd-un kitab-an
    bought-he zayd-NOM book-ACC
    'Zayd bought a book.'
B. zayd-un īṣṭaraa kitab-an
    zayd-NOM bought-he book-ACC
    'Zayd, he bought a book.' (i.e., Zayd, not someone else)
C. al- kitab-u zayd-un īṣṭaraa-hu
    DEF-book-NOMzayd-NOM bought-it
    'The book, Zayd bought it.'
D. al- kitab-u īṣṭaraa-hu zayd-un
    DEF-book-NOM bought-it zayd-NOM
    'The book, Zayd bought it.'
E. zayd-un kitab-aniṣṭaraa
    zayd-NOM book-ACC bought
    'Zayd, it was a book that he bought.'
F. kitab-an īṣṭaraa zayd-un
    book-ACC boughtzayd-NOM
    'A book, Zayd bought.'
G. īṣṭaraa kitab- an zayd-un
    bought-he book-ACC zayd-NOM
    'It was a book that Zayd bought.'

Examples (13) and (14) reveal that English and Arabic differ in selecting their information items and structuring them.

6. Sampling and statistics
Since two texts are used in this study, I will start by examining them and then present text-derived statistics on the translation of 'there' sentences into Arabic. I will mainly look at how many 'there' instances are translated into Arabic using 'hunaaka', 'ṭammaī'a', word order, 'yuḡadu', and other lexical verbs indicating 'existence'. As the number of words in 'Women in Love' is more than the number of words in 'Axel's Castle', only the first seventeen chapters of Lawrence's novel are examined in order to get approximately similar sizes of the two texts. Table1) displays the frequency of ‘there’ sentences in the two texts.

Table1. Frequency of 'there' sentences in the two English texts
Table 1 indicates that existential 'there' is used in the narrative text more than in the expository text. For the purpose of this study, 100 instances of the translated 'there' sentences (50 from each text) are selected covering all the existential types in Arabic.

7. Data analysis
The two selected samples of 100 instances of 'there' constructions are translated into Arabic using: 'yuğadu' and other lexical verbs 49 times, 'hunaaka' 24 times, 'ţammaţa' 14 times, and the word order device 13 times. Table (2) illustrates these results.

Table 2: Types of existentials in the Arabic texts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>No. of instances of 'yuğadu' and other lexical verbs</th>
<th>'hunaaka'</th>
<th>'ţammaţa'</th>
<th>word order</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jabra</td>
<td>yuğadu</td>
<td>other lexical verbs</td>
<td>11=22%</td>
<td>6=12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3=6%</td>
<td>21=42%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hussein</td>
<td>6=12%</td>
<td>19=38%</td>
<td>13=26%</td>
<td>8=16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 reveals that the Arabic existentials: 'hunaaka', and 'ţammaţa', constitute only 38% of the data, whereas the exploitation of other devices such as full lexical verbs and word order constitutes 62%. This fact indicates that in the majority of cases, the two translators avoid the use of 'hunaaka' and 'ţammaţa'. In what follows, I will examine how each of the devices mentioned in Table 2 is dealt with in the two texts under study.

7.1.1. 'Yuğadu'
The verb 'yuğadu' = exist' and its variant morphological forms (tuğadu, wağadna, ngağidu...etc), constitute 6% in Jabra and 12% in Hussein, i.e., 18% in the 100 instances. Examples:
(15) They walked on for some way in silence, under the trees. Then he said slowly, as if afraid: 'There is life which belongs to death, and there is life which isn't death' (Lawrence, 1960, p. 208).

Saraa ba 'da- l - masafatı şamit-ayni tahta - l - aşgari şumma qala walked-they some DEF distance silent-both under DEF trees then said-muta'nıyan ka'na-hu  haţf : tuğadu hayat-ın tahusu - l - mawta wa tuğadu
slowly as if he afraid exist life –NOM belong DEF death and exist ḥayat-un laysat mawt – an
life NOM not death ACC (Hussein, 1990 p. 343)
‘…there exists life which belongs to death, and there exists life which is not death.’
In (15), it is possible to use 'hunaaka' or 'ṭammaṭa' instead of 'yuḡadu' (fem. form of 'yuḡadu'), but it seems that the translator prefers 'yuḡadu' for both instances of the 'there' in order to render faithfully the essence of the original English sentence.
(16) 'If there is no love, what is there?’ she cried almost jeering (Lawrence, p. 162)
hatafa-t bima yašbahu –l – istiha’a in lam yakun hunaaka ḥub-un fama
cried-she as resemble DEF jeering if not is there love-NOM what -l- laḏi yuḡadu?
DEF that exist (Hussein, 1990, p. 269)
'…if there is no love, what is there?'
The second 'there' in (16) is rendered as 'yuḡadu' apparently to avoid the repetition of 'hunaaka', and also to emphasize the content of the question: what is there? as 'yuḡadu' explicitly expresses 'existence'. What is interesting here is that 'yuḡadu' in this position can't be replaced by 'ṭammaṭa' without reorganizing the structure to get:
'in lam yakun hunaaka ḥubun, fā ṭammaṭa maḏa?
if there is no love, then what is there?'

(17) And whereas in 'Ulysses' there is only one parallel, in this book there is a whole set (Wilson, 1961, p. 187).
Wa baynama waḡad-na fi yulsees muwaziy –an wahid –an naḡidu fi haḍa:
and whereas found we in Ulysses parallel ACC one ACC we find in this -l- kitab –l- ḡadid maḡmu ‘a mutakamila min-l-muwaziyati.
'And whereas we found in 'Ulysses' one parallel, we find in this new book a set of parallels’
In (17), the structure of the English sentence is: locative + there + be + NP; it is related to the normal pattern: there + be + NP + locative. In the Arabic version, we observe that 'naḡidu = we find' precedes the locative phrase 'fi haḍa –l-kitab= in this book' obviously to emphasize the core information element, i.e., ‘this new book’. I think this method aids the information to flow effectively.

7.1.2. Other lexical verbs
Table 2 demonstrates that 40% of 'there' sentences in the sample texts are translated by using full lexical verbs indicating, explicitly or implicitly, appearance or existence on the scene (see Breivik, 1981:18). Most of these verbs are similar to the lexical verbs used, instead of 'be' in the English 'there' sentences. The following are examples of such verbs used in the texts without resorting to 'hunaaka' or 'ṭammaṭa'.

(18) Then, sure enough, there came a note from him, asking if she would come to tea with Gudrun to his rooms in town (Lawrence, p., 160).
ṭumma ta’akada–l-’amru ʾiḏ waradat risalat-un min–hu yāḏ u –ha fi–ha li
then sure DEF matter as came letter NOM from him asking her in it to
tanawili a šayifi maskani–hi bi-l- madinati mustašhibat–an gudrun
have DEF tea in house his in DEF town with ACC Gudrun (Hussein, 265).
'Then the matter became sure, as a letter came from him inviting her and Gudrun to tea at his room
in town."
In (18), the particle 'iḏ =as ' together with the verb 'waradat=came ' replaces 'there'. In Arabic,
this particle usually introduces a verbal element,i.e., it has a representative function similar to that
of 'there' in English.

(19) *There had* already set in, about the middle of the century, quite independent of the theory of
Evolution a reaction against the sentimentality and the looseness of Romanticism,…(Wilson,,p.,13).

*fa fi awasiṭi –l–qarni aḥada yatabalwaru radu filin mustaqilaṭ n*
in middle DEF century began crystallize reaction independent from
theory DEF evolution and DEF rising against sentimentality DEF romanticism
wa ḥalṭalati –ha
and looseness its (Jabra,p.13)

'In the middle of the century, a reaction began to crystallize, independent…'
A reordering is taking place in (19). The phrase 'fafiawasiṭi –l–qarni=in the middle of the century'
is fronted as a theme. Quirk et al., (1985) define thematic fronting as "the achievement of marked
theme by moving into initial position an item which is otherwise unusual there."(p, 1377) In
Arabic, as said in section (1), this structure helps to avoid starting the sentence with an indefinite
expression. The verb 'yatabalwaru=crystalize' is exploited to embody the existence of 'radu fi'
lin=a reaction'.

(20) *There is* a conflict here which cannot be evaded and Yeats, even in his earliest period, is
unceasingly aware of this conflict (Wilson,p.34).

*Huna yakmunu šīrā –un lā nastaṭi ʿu taḡanubu-hu wa yeats ḥatta fi awali*
here exist conflict NOM not can we evade it and Yeats even in early
bawakiri-hi yaš ṭu bi-hi dunama inqīṭa′
period his he feel of it without ceasing (Jabra,p.34).
'Here exists a conflict which we cannot evade…'
In (20), the original English sentence is basically of this type: there+be+indef.NP, whereas the
rendered version is of the type: place+a lexical verb+indef.NP. The locative 'huna=here' in the
initial position serves to avoid using an indefinite expression at the beginning of a sentence, but it
also makes a change in the information structure. In the English sentence, 'a conflict' is considered
as the given information, and 'here' as the new one, whereas in the Arabic sentence, 'huna' is the
given information and 'šīrā ′un' is the new. In this text, the translator resorts to the verb
'yakmunu=exist' as it plays a major role in showing the existence of 'a conflict'.

(21) *There was* a shout from the people (Lawrence, p.20).
fa -inṭalaqa hutaf -un min-l- ḡamî i
particle came shout NOM from DEF all (Hussein,p.34).
Here, the characteristic of Arabic as being basically a verb initial language is invested by using the particle 'fa' plus the verb 'inṭalaqa=came'. This particle is used to introduce an element in a sequence and together with the verb serves as a point of departure from which the sentence is developed toward the real subject: 'hutaf-un=shout'.

(22) Yet, there has never been a poet who enjoyed the sensuous world with more gusto than Valéry or who solidly bodied it forth (Wilson,p.65).
Wa ma’ a ḡalika fa la’ala – na la nalqa ša ra – an ḥara rā yamatama’u
and with that part. perhaps we not find poet ACC another enjoy
b -l-’alamī ḥissi bi -ḥarara tin aṣadu min ḥarara tin valery aw šawara
prep. DEF world sensuous with warmth more from warmth Valery or pictured
-hu bi-taṭasudin aqwā
it with depiction stronger (Jabra,p.64)
'Yet, perhaps we don't find another poet…'
In (22), the word 'nalqa=we find' replaces 'there'. But this option for 'nalqa' with only the negative particle 'la=no' makes the English 'never' lose its emphatic sense in Arabic. However, the information structure of the original sentence is almost maintained.

7.2 Hunaaka
'Hunaaka' is found 13 times (26%) in Hussein and 11 times (22%) in Jabra. Examples (23-26) show how this word is used.

(23) At these two opposite poles of the circle, human life is impossible: there exist only anti podal types of supernatural beings. But along the circumference of the circle, between these two ultra-human poles, there occur twenty-six phases which cover all possible types of human personality (Wilson,p.47).
wa . nda ḥaḏayn – l- qaṭbayni min – l-da’ra takunu ḥa yaḥū – l - insani
and at these DEF poles from DEF circle is life DEF human
mustaḥila wa laysa hunaaka ila aanmaṭun mutaḍadā min ka’natin ḥariqa
impossible and not there only types anti from creatures super
walakin la muḥīṭ – l- da’ra bayna ḥaḏayn - l - qaṭbayni – l –
conj. but on circumference DEF circle between these DEF poles DEF
ḥariqayni lil insane hunaaka situn wa ’ṣruna marḥala’i – an taṭsmalu al-
super of human there six and twenty phase ACC cover DEF
anmaṭa – l – munkina kuluha lil ẓaḥṣiya - l – insaniya
types DEF possible all of personality DEF human (Jabra,p.47).
'And at these two…there is only anti podal…., there are twenty-six phases…'
The first 'there' in (23) is translated using 'hunaaka' together with the negative particle 'laysa=not', though it is acceptable to translate the verb 'exist' by saying: 'tuḍadu faqat ammaṭun mutaḍadā=exist only anti podal types.' The second 'there' also realizes as 'hunaaka'+ NP, i.e., the verb 'occur' is not rendered and the resultant structure is similar to the English bare existential: 'There are twenty-six phases….'
(24) 'There are my sons-in-law' she went on, in a sort of monologue. 'Now Laura's got married, there's another.' (Lawrence, p. 27).

\( \text{ṯumma māda – t tatahadətu bima yāʃbahu –l– ḥadiṭa ila– l– _dati }\) hunaaka:
then went she talking in sort of DEF talking to DEF self there
\( \text{aʃhar } \) -i wa ha hiya laura qad tazawağ – t fa ḥalla šihrun
sons-in-law my and now she Laura has married she conj.replaced son-in-law another (Hussein, p. 45)

'Then, she went on in a sort of monologue, 'There are my son's-in-law and now Laura's got married, there's another son-in-law'.

The first 'there' in (24) is rendered as 'hunaaka' but the second one as 'ḥalla', a semantically rich verb referring to someone or something which comes into being. This verb is preceded by the conjunction 'fa' which, besides its usual function here (see 21), serves as a focusing element emphasizing the existence of a new son-in-law.

(25) 'Of course, there are children-' said Ursula doubtfully (Lawrence, p. 9)

\( \text{ama }\) urursla fa qala –t murtabaï–an hunaaka –l– afalū tab an
as for Ursula conj. said she doubtfully ACC there DEF children of course (Hussein, p. 17)

'As for Ursula, she said doubtfully, 'There are the children, of course.' In the source language, 'there' is preceded by the focusing phrase 'of course', whereas in the Arabic version the 'hunaaka' sentence is preceded by the focusing phrase 'am aursula= as for Ursula' and 'tab ' an= of course' is moved to the end. In spite of this minor change, the main focus of the sentence is maintained.

(26) 'To know, that is yours all. That is your life-you have only this, this knowledge', he cried.'There is only one tree; there is only one fruit, in your mouth.' (Lawrence, p. 43).

\( fa \) hataf–a qa't-an an talami ḥağa huwa anti kuliki ḥağa
conj.shouted he saying ACC to know-you this is you all you this
\( \text{ḥyaruki la tamlukina siwa ḥağa siwa ḥağhi } \) – l– ma'rika hunaaka
choice-your not possess-you only this only this DEF knowledge there
\( \text{ṣa} {\text{g}a} {\text{r}a} {\text{t} } \) –un wahidai–un faqat ṭammaïa ṭamaraï–un wahidai–un faqat fi
tree NOM one NOM only there fruit NOM one NOM only in
famiki
mouth-your (Hussein, p. 70)

'...There is only one tree; there is only fruit, in your mouth.'

Again, in (26), 'there' is used twice. Here 'ṭammaïa' can be replaced by 'hunaaka', but it seems that the translator tries to avoid the repetition of this word. However, there are cases where these two words can't be replaced by each other without making changes in the structure of the sentence (see 29).

7.3 Ṭammaïa
As table (2) exhibits Hussein uses 'ṭammaïa' 8 times (16%) and Jabra, 6 times (12%). Examples:
(27) 'There is', he asserts in his early essays on the symbolism of Shelley, "for every man some one scene, some one picture that is the image of his secret life, for wisdom first speaks in images…” (Wilson, p.40).

In (27), Wilson splits the 'there' sentence by inserting the focal clause 'he asserts…'. In translation, Jabra thematizes the PP ‘‘for every man’’ and presents the sentence as:

PP+\textit{\textit{tamma’a} + NP. By this change, the translator creates a cohesive text in Arabic. Concerning the use of \textit{\textit{tamma’a}}, one can consider it, together with \textit{hunaaka}, an optional element here, since it is possible to translate the sentence without using them, a case preferred by the purists.

(28) There seemed a dual consciousness running in him. He was thinking vigorously of something he read in the newspaper, and at the same time, his eye ran over the surface of the life round him, and he missed nothing (Lawrence, p.58).

Kana \textit{tamma’a} fi qararati \textit{nafsi} –hi \textit{wa} ‘y-an ‘ la ma yaluq faqad kana was there in side self him consciousness two seem part. was yufakiru maliy-an fi šay'in ma qara'a –hu fi a šahifa’i wa fi he thinking vigorously ACC in something read he it in DEF newspaper and in -l- waqti ynihi kanat 'ynu –hu tahumani ' ala awguhi- l - ḥayati ġawla –hu DEF time same was eye his ran over on surface DEF life round him wa lam yafut –hu ayusay' and not missed him anything (Hussein, p.95).

'There seemed a dual consciousness in the depth of his heart…'

In (28), the phrase ‘‘la mgyaluq’, the equivalent of the English verb ‘seem’, is moved to the end of the Arabic sentence, and ‘kana=was’ is used to show past tense. Again \textit{\textit{tamma’a}} can be optional here, i.e., without it, the sentence reads: kana fi qararati nafshi\textit{i} wa ‘yan. In this case, the verb 'kana' embodies the sense of existence.

(29) There is a curious fascination about becoming gradually acquainted with a character whom we know only from the inside and from his dreams(Wilson, p.188).

\textit{\textit{tamma’a} sihr -un garib -un nahišu -hu bi 'tila' ina} there fascination NOM curious NOM we feel it by acquaint we šay'an fa šay'an 'la nawaḥi šahşiya’-in la na’risu –ha illa min –l– dahiľī gradually on aspects character GENnot we know it only from DEF inside wa min ahlami –ha

Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies
ISSN: 2550-1542 | www.awej-tls.org
and from dreams it's (Jabra, p. 184)
'We feel a curious fascination by acquainting ourselves with a character…'
Unlike (28), the use of ‘tamma‘ in (29) is obligatory. It can be replaced by 'hunaaka', but it cannot be omitted without changing the structure. For instance, it is possible to exploit the verb in 'nahisu—we feel' to get: nahisu bi sihrin ǧaribin biṭila‘ina…'we feel a curious fascination by acquainting ourselves…'

7.4 Word order
The flexibility of word order in Arabic allows it to readjust the elements of a sentence in order to achieve different communicative effects, and also to avoid starting a sentence with an indefinite noun phrase (see example 2). Nine existential sentences (18%) depending on word order are attested in Jabra and four (8%) in Hussein. The following are examples of the use of this device in the sample texts.

(30) And there is more substance in Valéry than in Mallarme (Wilson, p. 64).
wa fi valery madaṭ–un aḵṭaru mima fi malarme
and inValéry substance NOM more than in Mallarme' (Jabra, p. 63).
'And there is more substance in Valéry than in Mallarme.'
In (30), the translator does not opt for 'hunaaka' or ‘tamma‘. He prefers to reorder the elements of the sentence to avoid mentioning an indefinite phrase at the beginning of the sentence. Here, there is also a change in the information structure. The ‘new’ information of the original sentence is thematized as 'given' and the subject 'madaṭun=substance' is driven to the end as 'new' information.

(31) 'I'm not afraid of anything except black-beetles', said Minette, looking up suddenly and staring with her round eyes, on which there seemed an unseeing film of flame, fully upon Gerald (Lawrence, p. 76).
qala-t minet innani la ut‘abu min ayi șay‘ni ada-l–ḥanafis -l–
sud wa hiya tarfa‘u waghā–ha fiq‘at-an tuḥadiqu fi ǧerald bi
black and she lifting face her suddenly ACC staring at Gerald with
kamili aynay–ha –l– mudawaratayni allatayni ǧadat ʿalayhima ǧašawaṭū
full eyes her DEF round which seemed on them film
lahab -in la tura
flame GEN not seen ( Hussein, p. 127 )
'… on which there seemed an unseeing…'
Example (31) needs an extended context in order to understand how the readjustment of the linguistic elements helps to avoid using 'hunaaka' or 'tamma‘ for 'there'; rather it exploits the sense of existence in the word 'badat=seemed' to achieve what 'there' achieves in English. As a matter of fact, using 'hunaaka' with 'badat' is not possible, but ‘tamma‘ can be employed: '… allatayni ǧadat ʿalayhima ḥanmaṭa ǧašawaṭū lahabin…', though it sounds rather clumsy.

(32) There is a good deal in Dante's morality which he never got out of the scholastics as, for all we know, there may be a good deal in Lucretius which he never got out of Epicurus. (Wilson, p. 100)
translating English existential 'there' sentences into Arabic

8. Findings and discussion
The data of this study have shown that English 'there' can be translated into Arabic using, mainly, the words 'hunaaka' and 'tammaaṭa'. However, the sample examples of the 'there' sentences reveal that only 38% of these instances are rendered by using the above two words. The relative flexibility of word order in Arabic enables it to express the content of 'there' sentences by either reordering the elements of the sentence or using a rich lexical verb to refer to the existence of someone or something. The decision of the translator to use either 'hunaaka' or 'tammaaṭa' may not be purely syntactic; rather, the discourse functions, the rhetorical, thematic or stylistic aspects, may play a role in this decision. Therefore, it seems that some of the functions which are characteristics of the English existential 'there' sentences can be displayed in Arabic using different strategies. For example, for (33), we can have more than one possibility concerning information structure, as shown in a, b, c, and d:

(33) 'There is something', he says, 'of an old wives' tale in fine literature (Wilson,p.40).
A. yaqulu "fi rawā' - l - adabišay'un min ḥikayati - l - āgā'zi" he says in fine DEF literature something from tales DEF old wives (Jabra,p.40). He says,"In fine literature, there is something of old wives' tales."
B. yaqulu "tammatā ṣay'un min ḥikayati - l - 'āgā'zī fi rawā' - l - adabi" he says there something from tales DEF old wives in fine DEF literature. He says, "There is something of old wives' tales in fine literature."
C. yaqulu "hunaakāfi rawa'" - l - adabišay'um min ḥikayati - l - 'āgā'zi": he says there in fine DEF literature something from tales DEF old wives. He says, "There is in fine literature something of old wives' tales."
D. yaqulu yuġadu ṣay'un min ḥikayati - l - 'āgā'zī fi rawa' - l - adabi. he says exist something from tales DEF old wives in fine DEF literature. He says, "There exists something of old wives' tales in fine literature."

Sentence (33) could be translated as (a) in which Jabra renders 'there' exploiting the word order device. He moves the locative phrase 'fi rawā' - -l - adabi= in fine literature to the beginning of the sentence to become the 'given' information, and positions the phrase 'ṣay'un min ḥikayati-l-āgā'zī=something of old wives' tale' at the end as 'new' information. Another choice is (b) where
the role of 'given' and 'new' is reversed and 'hunaaka' stands for 'there'. In (c) 'fi rawa' '-l- adabi='in fine literature' is introduced by 'hunaaka' as 'given' information. Finally, in (d) the verb 'yuğadu=exist' is used to replace 'there'. What these possibilities show is that the translator has the choice to thematize any of the two phrases in (33), and also to use 'hunaaka', 'tamama' or 'yuğadu' for 'there', or do without them altogether.

Among other interesting cases in the translated data, the following attract attention. First, cases of 'there-less' sentences in the source language which are translated using 'tamama'; and second, the cases where the use of 'hunaaka' and 'tamama' is either obligatory or optional. Examples (34) and (35) illustrate these cases.

(34) The sisters were crossing a black path through a dark, soiled field. On the left, was a large landscape, a valley with collieries and opposite hills with cornfields and woods all blackened with distance, as if seen through a veil of crape. White and black smoke rose up in steady columns, magic within the dark air. Near at hand came the long rows of dwellings, approaching curved up the hill-scope, in straight lines along the brow of the hill (Lawrence,p.12).

(35) Among other interesting cases in the translated data, the following attract attention. First, cases of 'there-less' sentences in the source language which are translated using 'tamama'; and second, the cases where the use of 'hunaaka' and 'tamama' is either obligatory or optional. Examples (34) and (35) illustrate these cases.

The sisters were crossing a black path through a dark, soiled field. There was on the left….'…'There was, near at hand, long rows….' What is happening in (34) is that the clause: 'on the left was a large landscape….' is a variation of the usual pattern, there+be+N+locative: 'There was a large landscape on the left.' Hussein translates the clause by inserting 'tamama' in the Arabic version primarily to mark the subject 'saq un'=landscape' as existing and also as a representative element. Furthermore, 'kana=was' could be used here instead of 'tamama'. The order of the elements is acceptable since the indefinite noun phrase is not introduced at the beginning of the construction. The sentence beginning with 'near at hand….' is also translated by introducing it with 'tamama', though without 'tamama', it will read well.
Again it seems that the use of 'tammaāda' here serves to bring something to the reader's awareness.

(35) But in the newspaper office, for the first time, a general atmosphere begins to be created, beyond the specific minds of the characters, by punctuating the text with newspaper heads which announce the incidents in the narrative (Wilson, p. 167).

In (35), the English passive form is translated as an active form in Arabic. Arabic, as a matter of fact, prefers the active form to the passive form, in many cases. The insertion of 'tammaāda' here is optional since the phrase 'nağidu=we find', which gives the sense of existence, is used in the beginning of the construction. What is apparent here is that Jabra tries to emphasize the existence of the 'general atmosphere' in the office.

9. Conclusion
The present study has examined English existential 'there' sentences and how they are translated into Arabic. It is shown that these sentences can be rendered adequately not only by using words such as 'hunaaka' and 'tammaāda', but also--and in many cases preferably--by means of other devices. In cases where the translator is free to choose between 'hunaaka'/tammaāda', among other devices, his decision not to use either of these words, must serve to present a better translation. This is carried out through first, exploiting the relatively flexible word order of Arabic; and second, using full lexical verbs more frequently than English does in 'there' constructions. It is found that the syntactic restrictions are not the only reason for the fact that many 'there' sentences are not translated using 'hunaaka' and 'tammaāda', the discourse and stylistic levels play a role in the translator's decision to use other means. In some cases, the use of 'hunaaka'/tammaāda' is shown to be optional while in others to be obligatory, unless an alternative structure is produced. Major translational changes affecting the information structure of the texts, are not found in the target language. Finally, the analysis of the texts has revealed that compared with English, fewer existential sentences are found in Arabic.

About the author
Irfan Said: is an Assistant Professor holding M.A. in linguistics from London University, and author of a number of articles in the fields of applied linguistics, second language teaching, and contrastive linguistics, and has translated a number of books from English into Arabic. From
1980 to 2010 he taught at Al Mustansiriya University of Baghdad. He joined Cihan University in 2010. ORCiD ID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0086-8956

References