Team of This issue

Editor: Prof. Dr. Khairi Al-Zubaidi

Editorial Board Member
Prof. Taher Badinjki, Ph.D.
Department of English, Al-Zaytoonah University
Amman, Jordan

Associate Editors (Reviewers)
Acknowledgement
We would like to thank all those who contributed to this volume as reviewers of papers. Without their help and dedication, this volume would have not come to the surface. Among those who contributed were the following:

Assoc Prof. Pam Allen, Ph.D.
Associate Dean (Learning & Teaching), and Associate Dean (Internationalisation) in the Faculty of Arts, University of Tasmania, Australia.

Wajih Ayed, Ph.D.
Head of the Department of English, Faculty of Arts and Humanities, University of Sousse, Tunisia.

Amer Al-Adwan, Ph.D.
Translation and Interpreting Studies Department, College of Humanities and Social Sciences, Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha, Qatar.
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article Titles &amp; authors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reclaiming the Lost Hero in Girish Karnad's <em>The Dreams of Tipu Sultan</em></td>
<td>2-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imad M. Khawaldeh &amp; Shadi S. Neimneh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translating Idiomatic Expressions from English into Arabic:</td>
<td>22-31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties and Strategies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mostafa OUALIF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s works: A Vehicle for Creating Peace</td>
<td>32-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chekra Allani</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Translatability of Schemata in the Holy Quran: Seeing the Invisible</td>
<td>46-61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adnan Abumahfouz &amp; Yasser Al-shboul</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Pragmatic-linguistic Study of Hybrid Speech Acts in Selected Dramatic Texts</td>
<td>62-77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riyadh Khalil Ibrahim &amp; Khamail Ali Waheeb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecofeminism in Doris Lessing’s <em>Mara and Dann: An Adventure</em></td>
<td>78-85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Najla R. Aldeeb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literary Translation Teaching/Learning as a TRI-PHASE PROCESS:</td>
<td>86-105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Case Study: Arabic-English and English-Arabic Translation of Novels</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammed MEDIOUNI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Attempt at Applying Vladimir Propp’s <em>Morphology of the Folktale</em> on Charles</td>
<td>106-120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dickens’s <em>Great Expectations</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Khalid LAHLOU</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transadapting the Cultural Realia of Soviet Russia to an Arab Audience: The Case of the</td>
<td>121-138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film <em>Утомлённые Солнцем</em> <em>(Burnt by the Sun)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Katsiaryna Panasiuk &amp; Rashid Yahiaou</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Use of Tautology in “<em>The Thorn</em>” by William Wordsworth: A Stylistic Study</td>
<td>139-161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nawar Hussein Rdhaiwi Al-Marsumi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Usefulness of Translation in Foreign Language Teaching: Teachers’</td>
<td>162-176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitudes and Perceptions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dalila Benelhadj Djelloul &amp; Bel Abbes Neddar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Culture in Dubbing TV Advertisements into Arabic: The Case of Chocolate</td>
<td>177-195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ameena Haroun Abdulla Al-Haroon &amp; Rashid Yahiaou</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Visibility of the Translator: A Case Study of the Palestinian Translator</td>
<td>196-222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammed El-Haj Ahmed &amp; Ghadeer Jamal Shabana</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poetry as a means of revolt against the tribe: The experience of poet Suhaym as a model</td>
<td>223-236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Khaliq Esa, Oqab Jabali &amp; Kamel Yaseen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptation in Translation: Howells’s Short Story “Christmas Every Day”</td>
<td>237-251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohsine Khazrouni</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reclaiming the Lost Hero in Girish Karnad's The Dreams of Tipu Sultan

Imad M. Khawaldeh
English Department, Hashemite University
Zarqa-Jordan

Shadi S. Neimneh *
Corresponding Author*
English Department, Hashemite University
Zarqa-Jordan

Abstract:

This article examines how theatre functions as an effective means for exploring an occluded pre-colonial period by constructing an alternative history that refracts the official accounts of colonialist history. Here we study Girish Karnad's The Dreams of Tipu Sultan (2004), which re-writes the tragic decline of Tipu Sultan who governed the Kingdom of Mysore in the southern parts of India during the last two decades of the eighteenth century. The article concludes that what Karnad wishes to achieve, through this counter-historical theatrical project, is to dismantle the image of the ruthless and unprincipled 'Other' propagated by British historians, dramatists, and performers by creating or even recreating an alternative humane and noble character of Tipu Sultan.

Keywords: counter-discourse, counter-history, The Dreams of Tipu Sultan, Indian drama, Karnad, Orientalism, the Other, postcolonial studies

Reclaiming the Lost Hero in Girish Karnad’s The Dreams of Tipu Sultan

This article explores how theatre can function as an effective means for restoring an occluded pre-colonial period by constructing an alternative history that undermines the official accounts of colonialist history. Girish Karnad’s The Dreams of Tipu Sultan (2004), we argue, re-writes the tragic decline of Tipu Sultan, who governed the Kingdom of Mysore in the southern parts of India during the last two decades of the eighteenth century, to offer a counter-historical theatrical project dismantling the image of the ruthless and unprincipled ‘Other’ propagated by British historians, dramatists, and performers and thus recreating an alternative humane and noble character of Tipu Sultan. The first version of The Dreams of Tipu Sultan (hereafter abbreviated as The Dreams) was written for the British audience. Karnad writes in the Preface to his 2004 version of the play in 1996, that BBC commissioned him to write a radio play to celebrate the Fiftieth Anniversary of Indian Independence. And as the plot obviously had to deal with some aspect of Indo-British relations, Karnad immediately thought of Tipu Sultan, "one of the most politically perceptive and tragic figures in modern Indian history" (2005, p. 3), to offer a counter-discourse against dominant colonialistic ones.

The playwright constructs The Dreams as a form of counter-history by bringing together two elements: using colonial and native historians as characters, and rewriting imperial performance history. Karnad’s mission in writing this play is to remind his contemporary audience and readers that the Sultan’s relatively progressive attempts to undermine the emerging colonial project, by building an advanced and self-sustained country, were the factors that led to his controversial and demonized image throughout history.

The play begins where it ends: the tragic downfall of Tipu Sultan with an interesting interaction between two historians—one belonging to the side of the colonizers, the other to the side of the colonized. Karnad skillfully subverts official colonial history by creating the characters of Mir Hassan Ali Khan Kirmani, the court historian and Colonel Colin Mackenzie, the British Orientalist. Mackenzie’s historical remarks about the Sultan are incorporated within the larger narrative frame created by Kirmani, and thus become subordinate to the prevailing re-written history of the colonized in the play. Through Kirmani's act of remembering and narration of a sequence of historically documented dreams alongside the colonizer's narration of the historical events, Karnad succeeds in humanizing Tipu Sultan and giving him his due as a major pre-colonial figure in Indian history.

In Foucault’s terminology, the play, especially the figure of Kirmani, represents a kind of an “insurrection of a subjugated knowledge” (Medina, 2011, p.12). It is some sort of remembering that resists oblivion – a counter-memory. What Foucault calls “subjugated knowledges” are forms of experiences and remembering that are pushed to the margins and rendered unqualified and unworthy of epistemic respect by prevailing and hegemonic discourses (p.12). Foucault suggests that critical genealogies contribute “to desubjugate historical knowledges, to set them free” (2003, p.10). Critical genealogies facilitate the production of counter-histories, which narrate those experiences and memories that have not been heard and integrated in official history. As Foucault (2003) postulates:
Counter History…breaks the continuity of glory… It reveals that the light – the famous dazzling effect of power – is not something that petrifies, solidifies, and immobilizes the entire social body, and thus keeps it in order; it is in fact a divisive light that illuminates one side of the social body but leaves the other side in shadow or casts it into darkness. (p.70)

A counter-history is the dark side of those people who have been forced to remain in the shadows, a history that outcries “from within the shadows”, “the discourse of those who have no glory, or of those who have lost it and who now find themselves, perhaps for a time–but probably for long time – in darkness and silence” (Foucault, 2003, p.70). According to Foucault, a counter history is linked to those “epic, religious, or mythical forms which … formulate the misfortunes of ancestors, exiles, and servitude” (p.71). This notion is obvious in remembering the history of Tipu Sulta in The Dream sin which Tipu’s military defeat at the hands of the British and their allies is revisited. In “What is an Author?”, Foucault proposes some useful observations to effectively resist the “omissions” and active oblivion sanctioned by discursive practices, i.e. how to listen to the lost, silenced voices. Foucault is concerned with those forms of silencing produced by a discursive practice which are foundational and constitutive (Medina, 2011, pp. 15-16).

As Foucault puts it, in counter-history, the fight against the discursive omissions and exclusions necessitates a “return to the origin”:

If we return, it is because of basic and constructive omission that is not the result of accident or incomprehension… This non-accidental omission must be regulated by precise operations that can be situated, analyzed, and reduced in a return to the act of initiation. (1977, p. 135)

Foucault distinguishes this critical “return to the origin” from two other similar concepts, namely “rediscovery” and “reactivation” – all of which are essential features of the plays discussed. A “rediscovery,” writes Foucault, promotes “the perception of forgotten or obscured figures”, while a “reactivation” is achieved through “the insertion of discourse into totally new domains of generalizations, practices, and transformations” (p.134). Thus, any attempt to transform a discursive practice by resisting its silences and omissions needs a “return to the origin”. This return entails revisiting the texts that are considered foundational for the practice and developing a new way of rendering them. So, to train one’s eyes and ears to new meanings and voices: “particular attention [is paid] to those things registered in the interstices of the text, its gaps and absences” one must “return to those empty spaces that have been masked by omission or concealed in false and misleading plenitude” (Medina, p.16). The Dreams is a vibrant example that illustrates this critical “return to the origins.” It shows how a postcolonial counter-memory dramatic text engages the task of exposing and eroding the dominant discourse about the history of one of India’s earliest anti-colonial leaders. Interestingly, Karnad's play was inspired by the 18th century Sultan's personal diary which was first discovered after he had been killed by the British. The diary was translated
into English by Mahmud Husain in the early 1920s as *The Dreams of Tipu Sultan*. Hussain’s translation is the embodiment of the critical moment of “rediscovery”. Tipu’s diary was also rescued from oblivion when Karnad “reactivated” it in his play. Thus, what was once a material archive is now restored and preserved through Karnad’s imaginative return to the sultan’s original text.

Furthermore, by beginning with the death of the Sultan—one of the last major independent rulers in pre-colonial India—the play forces us to contend with a primal scene that is often obscured in the standard genealogies of colonial power. Being aware of the many British performances which were put on during the Sultan's life and immediately after his death, Karnad recalls the life and death of Tipu Sultan as a counter-history narrative to subvert the imperial Orientalist discourse about this controversial historical figure. Since the Sultan was a source of “fascination” especially during the 1790s, his image was conceived in a skewed way by European readership and audiences. Karnad's Tipu states: “Today I am the only one in India who won't bow and scrape before them. So they want to crush me. I'm told England is buzzing with stories of what a monster I am and how I need to be chastised… Shall I allow myself to be chastised?” (2005, p. 60). In fact, many military-based historical accounts and captivity narratives contributed to the “fascinating” Orientalist lore about Tipu who was referred to as Tippo Sultaun (or Tippoo Sultan). In the early phases of the Anglo-Mysore conflict, both Haider Ali and his son Tipu Sultan were predictably depicted as cruel tyrants and proponents of religious intolerance in various military accounts - a typical process of demonization in the nineteenth century.

When applying Foucault's theory of counter-history, one should also keep in mind that Gayatri Spivak's criticism in her seminal essay “Can the Subaltern Speak” (1981) succeeds in exposing varied Western attempts to create historical texts about the “Other” that maintain Western hegemony over the colonized peoples. Spivak's principal claim and opening statement in this essay is that Western academic knowledge is primarily produced with the purpose of supporting western economic interests. In fact, the historical accounts and performances created by British writers about Tipu reflect the purposeful project of recreating the image of Tipu as an antagonistic “Other.” Like Edward Said in *Orientalism*, Spivak argues that Western knowledge is never innocent and that it expresses the interests of its producers. She even maintains that knowledge is like any other commodity that is exported from the west to the Third World for financial and other types of gain. Spivak's remarks about the manipulation of knowledge produced by Western writers about the “Other” are applicable to the many Western (chiefly British) texts written about Tipu Sultan and Anglo-Mysore wars in India during the late 18th century. As Spivak puts it, the Third World subject cannot be studied by western writers without cooperation with the colonial project. The task of the Third World writer is to counter these cooperative colonial narratives and define the “Other” and “over there” subject as the object of a new kind of study and as something from which new knowledge should be extracted and brought back “here.” Karnad's work is a postcolonial attempt to bring Tipu back from the domain of Western knowledge and resurrect it in the domain of the “subjugated knowledge”.
In the same context, Helen Tiffin (1995) describes in her essay “Post-colonial Literatures and Counter-discourse” how postcolonial literary counter-discursive rewriting becomes a pressing demand and an urgent need for postcolonial writers:

Processes of artistic and literary decolonisation have involved a radical dis/mantling of European codes and a post-colonial subversion and appropriation of the dominant European discourses. This has frequently been accompanied by the demand for an entirely new or wholly recovered ‘reality’, free of all colonial taint. Given the nature of the relationship between coloniser and colonised, with its pandemic brutalities and its cultural denigration, such a demand is desirable and inevitable. (p.95)

Tiffin's description corresponds with *The Dreams*, which appears to be a conscious attempt to re-create an “entirely new” and “wholly recovered reality” of Tipu Sultan, whose history was phantasmically reconstructed in the imperial historiography. Interestingly, the initial broadcast of the play by BBC in 1997 came within the flow of a considerable body of postcolonial scholarship dealing with the re-presentation of Tipu Sultan. According to Narasingha Sil, active postcolonial revisionism of Tipu’s representation in colonial texts started in 1999 (2013, p.5). This postcolonial-postmodernist revisionist movement has produced a new mythology to replace what it considers imperialist-colonialist demonology in which Tipu is always portrayed as an “oriental despot with a diabolical design of oppressing his people and subverting the Company’s prospect in India” (p.5).

Expressing their distrust of the grand narratives or hegemonic discourses, many postcolonial scholars –such as Kate Telttscher (1995), Amal Chatterjee (1998), and Ruchira Banerjee (2001) – have contributed to the counter hegemonic discourse meant to replace the imperialist ideology. They disparaged all reports testifying to Tipu’s inhumane treatment and forcible conversion of war prisoners by the EIC’s military officers as downright propaganda by a bunch of “fighters as writers” (Colley, 2000, p. 277). In these revisionist accounts as well as in *The Dreams*, Tipu Sultan appears as "a fallen nationalist leader whose vision of a modern industrialist and enlightened free India failed to materialize because of the grand alliance forged by the East India Company (EIC) with Mysore’s inimical neighbors, the Nizam of Hyderabad and the Maratha Confederacy of west central Mughal India” (Sil, 2013, p.5). Teltcher, for instance, argues that the British paranoia about Tipu Sultan was mainly due to their fear of an exceptional adversary who challenged the West by mastering the secrets of Western science and technology, thus meeting the Western power on its own terms (1995, p.238). This is expressed in *The Dreams* by Earl of Mornington, the Governor General of India:

In fact, Tipu should have been got rid of after the last Mysore war by Cornwallis. But he didn't. And since then Tipu has grown in power and prestige… It's my duty as the new Governor General of India to set things right... Tipu is building a trading empire on the European model and succeeding eminently. We have driven the French and Dutch out of
India, contained the Portuguese. Is there any reason why we should tolerate an upstart native? The longer the peace, the stronger will Tipu become. (Karnad, 2005, p.56)

Karnad suggests through Mornington’s statements that the success of Tipu as an “enlightened” leader who built a trading empire that competed with the developed European models of trading could be one of the most conspicuous reasons behind the systemized defamation of the man and his rule. The play as a whole exposes how the British, who could not tolerate a prominent economic-minded Indian leader, worked systemically to tarnish his image among the natives of the Indian subcontinent to prevent any similar nascent attempts by other leaders of Indian pre-colonial states. Hence, the mission of the playwright is to remind his contemporary audience and readers that the Sultan’s modernizing attempts to undermine the emerging colonial project, by building a relatively modern and autonomous state, were the factors that led to his controversial and demonized image throughout history.

The mission of Karnad’s narrative as a counter-historical postcolonial work is obvious from its outset. The play opens with a fictional dialogue between two real historical figures, Mir Hussain Ali Khan Kirmani (active 1781-1802), and Colonel Colin Mackenzie (1754-1821), the first Surveyor – General of India. The first act begins where the play ends, as the subsequent acts are being recalled in the manner of chronologically organized flashbacks by both Kirmani and Mackenzie who appear as characters, and then as chorus/commentators. Karnad begins the first act with a description of the setting of the scene where the process of “counter-historical” recalling starts:

1803. The house of the historian, Mir Hussain Ali Khan Kirmani, in the city of Mysore. Colonel Colin Mackenzie, the Oriental scholar, is taking off his shoes, as though he has just arrived. He looks around at the notes, books, and manuscripts littering the floor. Kirmani enters with a jug of water and a tumbler, and places them next to Mackenzie. (2005, p.7)

The setting of the opening scene is of crucial importance as it locates Kirmani’s counter-discursive re-writing of imperial history in his house and in the onset of the Nineteenth century, just few years after the emergence of several British historical accounts and performances about the defeat of Tipu Sultan. Kirmani is the court historian who is being encouraged by the colonial orientalist to remember and “speak objectively” and to write an impartial history of the deceased Sultan – one that is based on "bits of evidence" (p.8). The first dialogue between the two historians is very significant as it describes Kirmani’s (and of course Karnad's) difficult mission in recalling the history of Tipu: “MACKENZIE. How's the work progressing? KIRMANI. Not at all well. MACKENZIE. Why not? KIRMANI. It's not easy. It hurts.” (p.7) Karnad, through Kirmani, draws his audience's attention to the difficulty of re-writing the early part of the colonial history in India and the disputed figure of the Sultan. Indeed, it is not an easy task to resurrect a history that has generated a current of unprecedented controversy around the character, deeds, and misdeeds of the
Sultan of Mysore. The difficulty of this counter-historical mode of recalling becomes more sensible once we realize that a large number of imperial narratives about Tipu Sultan and his encounter with the British were written by the Sultan’s contemporaneous imperial historians and writers. Kirmani wonders why Mackenzie insists on hiring him to write his version of history while tens of historical accounts about this encounter were going viral in Britain and India:

KIRMANI. … You have your version of history, all worked out. Why do you want my side? Why do you care?
MACKENZIE. I am interested in the other side. You could say that's how we Europeans are brought up ... to be interested in the other side as well. That I suppose is our strength. (p.8)

Mackenzie's rationale reflects his desires as an Orientalist to gather “objective” information about the "Other" and his views about the struggle between the anti-colonial leader and the colonizers. It is an embodiment of what Spivak calls the “colonialist theory of most efficient information retrieval” (1981, p.390). Does Colonel Mackenzie’s request mean that he will accept Kirmani's version of history according to the non-Western methodology of historical and biographical writing? The answer to this question is simply “No.” Mackenzie reminds Kirmani that “Our loyalty is to history” and that he (Kirmani) must “keep emotion out [and] stick to the facts” (Karnad, 2005, p.8). According to Colonel Mackenzie, writing history should be based upon the reality of documentary evidences. But, how can the court historian keep a “dispassionate distance” from the object of his narrative? If memory is truth, then it is unique as it “selects, eliminates, alters, exaggerates, minimises, glorifies and vilifies also; but in the end it creates its own reality, its heterogeneous but usually coherent version of events; and no sane human being ever trusts someone else’s version more than his own” (Rushdie, 1981, p.211). Thus Kirmani’s “truthful” and “passionate” memory counteracts the “dispassionate” imperial historical “fact” and renders it a fabricated lie. By selecting and reactivating certain moments of the Sultan’s last days, the playwright, through Kirmani’s act of remembering, eliminates the imperial written narrative and alters it by substituting it with another one – a counter-memorial narrative that both glorifies the “Other” and vilifies the “Self”.

Kirmani cannot but feel loyal to the memory of his Sultan. His conscience is tortured at the start of the play as he thinks that he has betrayed the memory of Tipu by attempting to aid the colonizer in their Orientalist project: “I spent my life serving him and his father. And now I work for you, his enemies. What does that make me? A traitor? Am I trustworthy anymore? Doesn’t that worry you? It worries me” (Karnad, p.8). Kirmani admits that he could not remember what Tipu looked like on his last day, and he equates forgetting such an important detail with betraying. Yet, this bad feeling soon disappears when he remembers Tipu Sultan's last recorded dream, with which his “history ends” and “[Mackenzie's] begins”; on this note, Karnad ends his play (p.9).

Kirmani’s counter-hegemonic version of history starts with remembering Tipu's last dream. Remembering the night when Tipu was buried, Kirmani, the “Other” historian, declares that his
version of history will depend mainly on remembering rather than on recorded facts: “[The thunderstorm] destroyed all my papers. Wiped away every word written in ink. Within a night, all my recorded facts became memory” (p.17). Kirmani’s personal remembering as opposed to Mackenzie’s insistence on following the principles of objective history writing reflects the clash between “objective,” scientific history and other ways of recalling history. Remembering through postcolonial performance subverts the supposedly objective and scientific history of the documented grand narrative of the Empire. As performance theorist Diana Taylor (2003) remarks in The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas, oral performance rather than written texts are more often than not the dominant ways of representation in postcolonial locales. Karnad’s performance, which celebrates the power of remembering, interrogates the authenticity of scientific historical texts.

To use Pierre Nora’s terminology, Tipu’s remembered last dream becomes a lieu de mémoire, or “a site of memory” where the figure of the Sultan is being recalled in a new light. Talking about the impact of objective history on the sites of memory, Nora writes:

[Objective history] would no doubt preserve some museums, some medallions and monuments – that is to say, the materials necessary for its work – but it would empty them of what, to us, would make them lieux de mémoire. In the end, a society living wholly under the sign of history could not, any more than could a traditional society, conceive such sites for anchoring its memory. (1989, p.9)

Nora contends that the concept of lieu de mémoire has three aspects: material, symbolic, and functional. The material site, like an archive, becomes a lieu de mémoire only if the imagination invests it with a symbolic aura. (p.19). Karnad’s play was inspired by the Eighteenth-century Sultan's personal diary which was first discovered after he had been killed by the British. The diary was translated into English by Mahmud Husain in the early 1920s as The Dreams of Tipu Sultan as it primarily consisted of a number of the Sultan’s personal dreams together with his own interpretations and comments on these dreams. The original text of the sultan’s diary was rescued from oblivion when Karnad rediscovered it in his play. Thus, what was once a material archive now enters, through Karnad’s imagination, into symbolic and functional circuits.

As a site of memory, Kirmani’s act of personal remembering is activated in the play to defend Tipu from the distorting power of British official History. According to Nora, the defense, by certain minorities, of a privileged memory that has retreated to jealously protected enclaves “intensely illuminates the truth of lieu de mémoire—that without commemorative vigilance, history would soon sweep them away” (p.12). He further contends that “we buttress our identities upon such bastions, but if what they defended were not threatened [by history], there would be no need to build them” (p.12). Kirmani takes upon his shoulder what Nora calls the “obligation of personal remembering”, a private individual act of remembering categorized under “duty memory” (p.16). From that epiphanic moment (when the thunderstorm destroyed Kirmani’s papers), in spite
AWEJ for Translation & Literary Studies Volume, 1 Number 3, August 2017

Reclaiming the Lost Hero in Girish Karnad’s Khawaldeh

Kirmani’s private act of remembering can be looked upon as an effort to reiterate his allegiance to the memory of “the real Tipu who is lost somewhere within the layers of history” (Sharma, 2012, p.54). As a form of “representation” of the Sultan’s life, Kirmani’s recalling of specific memories “proceeds by strategic highlighting, selecting samples and multiplying examples” (Nora, 1989, p.17). As Sharma puts it, Kirmani’s act of remembering “appears to be a case of ‘selective memory’ where he tries to save his Sultan from being further vandalized on basis of evidence against him by the English historian” becoming the voice of the silenced colonized Indians (p.54). Kirmani, as a native historian, “creates a place for the subaltern in history there by going against the norm of traditional history writing” (Kaushik, 2010).

The first remembered scene in the play dramatizes the long search for the body of the defeated Sultan. Colonel Mackenzie enters the scene with Qilledar Nadeem Khan to look for Tipu's body. Khan finds the body and confirms that the Sultan is dead. And before moving the body to a nearby palace, a soldier chops off one of Tipu’s moustaches with Colonel Mackenzie’s penknife to take it as a present to his friend Dr Cruso (Karnad, p.15). Back to Kirmani’s house, Mackenzie recalls the act of chopping “the tiger’s own whiskers” and describes it as an “act of vandalism that will not be forgotten” (p.15). Kirmani agrees and calls it a “perfect prelude to a night of unprecedented rapacity” (p.16). He recalls how “every house was looted; every available woman was raped; and soldiers were throwing away precious jewelry because they could not carry any more” (p.16). Karnad’s imperial choric character shows indifference towards these inhumane acts and seems more concerned with cutting off the dead Sultan’s mustache than with the rapacity of the British army upon entering the defeated city of Seringapatam. His only comment on these acts was “Wellesley had to hang three soldiers before the pillage was over” (p.16). Ironically, the colonel tries to evade the discussion about these dreadful imperial acts of vandalism by stating that he needs to get back to reading the classic Sanskrit book The Arthasastra (The Science of Governance). He asks Kirmani to “get over [his] despondency… and get on with [his] writing” (p.16). But what sort of writing does the representative of the colonial Company want from Tipu's court historian? Kirmani says he will try to write but he does not know what to put down on paper. The colonel's response is “For the hundredth time, Kirmaniji, I wish you would write about Tipu’s embassy to Mauritius – the Malacarctic adventure. It proved to be his undoing and yet we don’t have enough data” (p.16). The shocked native historian who is being asked to forget the grievances of his people after the defeat of Tipu Sultan denies that the Malacarctic deal has ever happened. In fact, although we do not know whether Kirmani is deliberately lying or is unaware about this historical incident, a few scenes later we come to know more details about Tipu’s plans to forge an alliance with the French in Mauritius. Indeed, such a revelation complicates Kirmani’s conflict between history and loyalty as loyalty might lead the court historian to exaggerate or even refuse to believe
certain universally-approved historical events so to remain loyal to the refined memory of the remembered lost hero.

Throughout the two-act play, both Kirmani and Mackenzie appear as choric characters in some of the intervals between the unnumbered scenes to comment on the historical events occurring in them. Although Mackenzie reminds Kirmani that he is “interested in the people who spoke to Tipu and the ones he spoke to” and to “keep the dreams to [himself]”, the play seems to be composed of a sequence of Tipu’s dreams which are intermingled with the actions (p.17). At times, a few choric sections interconnect the dreams with the rest of the dramatic actions. In these pieces of the narrative, Mackenzie acts like an automaton as he briefly narrates the events which took place during the Sultan’s life. It is worth noticing that Mackenzie’s objective factual narratives are never left without parallel narration or comment by Kirmani. These mechanical pieces of factual narration are interrupted and disrupted by long dramatic ruptures that reflect how the Sultan really feels about these events. These scenes of the Sultan’s life are Kirmani’s remembered history. In this sense, Kirmani’s prolonged remembered version of history surrounds Mackenzie’s short factual pieces and ultimately deprives them of their agency. In fact, Mackenzie’s version of a monumental history is interrupted by a discourse that “humanizes” Tipu and depicts him as a caring father– an image that is rarely present in the imperial accounts about the Sultan of Mysore. Depicting Tipu in such a humanizing way seems to be the uniting thread of the whole drama.

In addition to Colin Mackenzie, Karnad chooses to deploy other imperial historians such as Captain Mark Wilks and Colonel William Kirkpatrick as active characters in The Dreams. Through these historians, Karnad brings our attention to the fact that an imperial fighter can only function as a writer who peddles in propaganda. The second scene of the first act involves the character of Captain Wilks who wrote a book about India. When one reads Wilks’s book, the only image of Tipu that the reader can conjure up is that of a barbarian and treacherous Sultan. For example, Wilks describes Tipu as a ruler who had “little compunction in using severity, and sometimes direct force, to procure the services of gunners and artificers. But here terminated the sum of his barbarity; it was reserved for Tippoo Sultaun to destroy his prisoners by poison and assassination” (p.95). Wilks’ portrayal of Tipu as a fearful and unprincipled enemy is brought into question in the first remembered scene of Karnad's play which is set in the “[r]ampart of the Seringapatam – or Sriranga patna fort– … there has been savage fighting and the ground is thick with the bodies of the dead and the dying” (Karnad, p.9). Here, it is seen Captain Wilks leading the British soldiers in their feverish search “through the piles of bodies for Tipu’s corpse” with the aid of Tipu’s servants (p.9). Wilks appears too eager to confirm the death of the warrior who was the worst nightmare for his military officials in India:

CAPT. WILKS. Corpulent with big twirly moustaches, round face….
SOLDIER 2. Yes, sir. We know that by heart now. But the description seems to fit most of these bastards.
CAPT WILKS. Ask the black there.
SOLDIER 2. These swine have already identified a
dozen corpses as the Sultan’s – they’re making fools of us.(pp. 9-10)

This interlocution between Captain Wilks and his soldiers demonstrates the language of haughty imperialism. It presents a racist, imperial, and privileged “Grand Narrative” in which the “Other” is that inferior and insignificant “black [over]there”, or the fearful leader of bandits whose death puts an end to an epoch of barbarism and unprincipled acts of violence. Such images of the fearful and repulsive “Other” are what Karnad wishes to dismantle by creating or recreating a humane and noble character to substitute the established imperial archive about Tipu and his men.

Karnad’s humanizing approach toward Tipu can be detected in several places. For instance, the Mysorean delegate to the British, Ghulam Khan, addresses Tipu and the crowd of senior citizens, generals, and courtiers who are attending to hear the terms of peace with the English:

Discussions of this condition [namely the release of English prisoners] were accompanied by much vituperation by the English. They said that we had ill-treated our English prisoners of war. We pointed out that we had treated them as we treat our own prisoners – despite much provocation. And then we pointed out that the English who had surrendered to us were at least alive as prisoners of war while our men who surrendered to the enemy – where were they? What happened to them? There was no answer. (p.39)

This speech rebuts Wilks’s historical allegations that the Sultan poisoned and assassinated his prisoners. To Helen Tiffin, since it is not possible to create or recreate national or regional formations wholly independent of their historical implication in the European colonial enterprise, it has been the task of post-colonial writers to “interrogate European discourses and discursive strategies from a privileged position within(and between) two worlds” (1995, p.99). In fact, Karnad, through the Ghulam Khan’s speech, interrogates not only Wilks’s accounts but also all other discursive imperial narratives about Tipu Sultan.

In order to assert that imperial writers had a considerable role in the process of producing a false history, Karnad also relies on Colonel William Kirkpatrick whose comments on Tipu's correspondences reflect the British systemic demonization of the Sultan. For instance, Kirkpatrick writes that once the Sultan ordered his brother-in-law Burhanuddin Khan to launch a fatal attack on a region including “every living creature in it, whether man or woman, old or young, child, dog, cat, or any living thing else” (p.114). As Kate Teltscher points out, Kirkpatrick’s translation of the Sultan’s letters is unreliable, especially because “he describes Tipu’s epistolary self-portrait in terms drawn largely from the vocabulary of despotism: the cruel enemy, intolerant, fanatic, oppressive ruler, harsh master, the sanguinary and perfidious tyrant” (1995, p.235).

In The Dreams, Colonel Kirkpatrick is implicated in the imperial scheme led by the newly-appointed Governor General of India, Lord Mornington (Richard Wellesley) to liquidate Tipu
Sultan. Karnad shows Kirkpatrick as an officer who is submissively loyal to the British imperial system. He is dramatized as being fully capable of inventing false correspondences between the Sultan and the French to make it easy for the British to find a sufficient reason to end the period of seven years of peace which followed the peace treaty signed by Cornwallis and Tipu Sultan in 1792:

MORNINGTON. Quite! (*French pronunciation*) Malarctic asking for dispatch of ten thousand French and twenty thousand African troops. And Malarctic puts up a proclamation asking for volunteers… Let's take the shortest route. One of our newspapers in Calcutta gets hold of a copy and publishes it.

KIRK. I shall contact a local editor, Your Lordship. (Karnad, p.57)

Regardless of whether the Tipu-Malarctic deal has ever occurred in history, Karnad’s historical play casts doubts on the imperial version of Tipu’s life story by representing British historians as untrustworthy. Thus, while the British “fighters as writers” paint a picture of a treacherous Sultan, Karnad’s play presents treacherous British generals and officers whose Machiavellian mindset justifies accusing the Sultan with their invented conspiracies. In his discussion of the plans of liquidating Tipu Sultan with his brother Arthur Wellesley and Colonel William Kirkpatrick, in spite of the peace treaty which was signed in 1792, the British Governor General proves to be a no match to the Sultan. Furthermore, the cowed British historian cannot but comply with the orders of the Governor and ultimately to be involved in his unscrupulous schemes.

In addition to rewriting part of Tipu's history as a postcolonial theatrical revision that subverts British historical accounts by including British historians as characters, *The Dreams* operates as a counter-discursive drama that subverts the imperial performative discourse enacted around the history of Tipu. In the preface to his play Karnad states that:“Tipu has always fascinated playwrights. *Tipu Saib or British Valour in In India* was put on at Covent Garden, London, as early as 1791 and was followed by a series of spectaculars” (2005, p.3). Yet, none of those who studied *The Dream* have referred to any of these performances (or spectaculars) about the encounter between Tipu and the British which were performed in England (and even in India) during the 1790s until the dawn of the nineteenth century. An exception here is Daniel O’Quinn who in his (2005) book examines some of the reviews about the imperial performances dealing with Tipu Sultan during the last decade of the eighteenth century.

A look at British imperial history tells us that unlike the 1770s and 1780s, the 1790s was a period of immense consolidation in the empire. This entailed tremendous growth of the body of Orientalism. According to Said,
Under the general heading of knowledge of the Orient, and within the umbrella of Western
hegemony over the Orient during the period from the end of the eighteenth century, there
emerged a complex Orient suitable for study in the academy, for display in the museum,
for reconstruction in the colonial office, for theoretical illustration in anthropological,
biological, linguistic, racial, and historical theses about mankind and the universe. (1995,
p.26)

As O'Quinn puts it, during that era “military victories over Tipu and the establishment of the
Permanent Settlement not only confirmed actual British domination in the Asian subcontinent but
also provided an occasion for phantasmatic constructions of supremacy” (2005, p.313; emphasis
added). Specifically, Astley's Royal Amphitheatre and the Sadler's Wells Theatre were competing
to offer spectacular versions of Cornwallis's (and later Harris's) campaigns against Tipu Sultan as
quickly as the news from India arrived in England. A number of theatrical and non-theatrical
performances [such as Astley's plays Tippoo Saib or British Valour (1791), The Siege of Bangalore
(1792), and The Siege and Storming of Seringapatam (1800); Sadler's Wells' plays Tippoo Saib;
or, East India Campaigning (1792), and Tippoo Saib's Two Sons (1792); and James Gobb's
Rammah Droog (1798)] promoted a new form of what O'Quinn (2005) calls “theatrical
imperialism.” Like his father Haider Ali, Tipu Sultan was demonized in these performances as was
the case with many military historical accounts about him. Thus, a great deal of Karnad's
dramaturgical project is devoted to refining the image of Tipu by emphasizing the positive aspects
of his character.

Karnad’s play projects the other side of the Sultan which belies much of what had been
included in these imperial performances about this anti-colonial adversary in early colonial India.
Here, Tipu emerges as a loving and caring father and husband, and as a kind and enlightened ruler
who believes that God is not confined to a specific sect or religion, and that all religions therefore
require equal respect. The first appearance of Karnad's Tipu (in the form of a dream) works to
assert this very idea of respecting others' religions.

While the late Eighteenth-century performances literally dramatized the incoming news
from the British campaigns against Tipu Sultan in India, they primarily attempted to build fantasies
of British valor and paternalism following Cornwallis's and Harris's victories over Tipu in 1792
and 1799 (O'Quinn, 2005, p.314). For instance, Astley’s The Siege of Bangalore was first staged
on 9 April 1792 at Astley's Amphitheatre, about one year after the events leading to treaty of
Bangalore and its aftermath had actually occurred. O’Quinn mentions advertisements that referred
to the play as “A Compiled, Wimsical, Oriental Tragic. Comic, Pantomical Sketch, in Three Parts”
(p.320). In its opening scene, Astley's Tippoo Sultan, stages two intertwined forms of tactical
resistance.

The exhibition of military drill figure for European modernity was meant to supplement
ethnographic fantasies of racial superiority (pp.324-5). In this play (as is the case with Astley's
other plays about Tipu), the procession of Indian arms “exhibits precisely the combination of antiquity and disorder that establishes the superiority of British order, which is itself enacted for the audience in Astley's practice” (p.323). This notion of oriental disorder and antiquity was present in most performances about Tipu. For example, Astley’s other performance of *The Siege and Storming of Seringapatam* which was premiered on 5 May 1800 dramatizes Tipu's defeat in his last battle with British forces under the leadership of General Harris. O’Quinn points out that the fifth scene constitutes the Clock-work regulation of human motion, and that the sixth scene stages the superiority of human-machine integration. He further argues that in this way that performance (the very staging of clock-work motion in Astley's) was meant to project British martial superiority.

Karnad's play, on the other hand, comes to denounce these imperial fantasies of racial superiority over Tipu Sultan and his subjects. Instead of this choreographed chaos which controls the movements of the automaton-like Oriental soldiers, *The Dreams* presents Tipu Sultan as a powerful and highly disciplined Oriental leader who is centrally concerned with strategic war planning against enemies. Throughout the play, Tipu is dramatized as a modernizer and an intellectual person who tirelessly works to modernize his armies and make his kingdom an advanced industrial country. Ironically, it is the British army which appears so uncivilized in the play. This is apparent through the British soldiers’ plundering of the city of Seringapatam after Tipu’s death which is referred to by Kirmani and Mackenzie when they recall the incident.

Interestingly, Karnad includes Tipu's dream about the white elephant to emphasize the Sultan's uniqueness as a military leader. In this dream, the envoys of the Emperor of China deliver his rare gift (the white elephant) to the Sultan. The envoys tell Tipu that “the Emperor has never sent a white elephant to anyone except the Great Alexander”(Karnad, 2005, p.20). This leads Tipu to believe that he will be “another Alexander” (p.20). This implied reference to Tipu Sultan as a “second Alexander” is suggestive of the sultan’s greatness as a leader of a well-organized army. In this sense, the sultan’s army becomes similar to the armies which were led by Alexander the Great and which were able to conquer several kingdoms and states throughout Asia within the span of ten years.

In fact, Tipu's efforts to modernize his army were proven in the historical accounts of both sides. Tipu's armies were able to defeat the English in several battles especially during the first two Anglo-Mysorean wars. Mysorean rockets were the first iron-cased rockets that were successfully deployed for military use. Both Hyder Ali and Tipu Sultan used them effectively against the British East India Company. Their conflicts with the Company exposed the British to this technology, which was, then, used to advance European rocketry with the development of the Congreve rocket ("Tipu's Missile Launch Pad in Shambles"). Karnad confirms through *The Dreams* that the reason behind the Sultan's defeat was not the lack of artillery or military organization. Rather this defeat took place due to two reasons: first, the grotesque acts of betrayal…
by a number of traitors among Tipu's confidants; and secondly, the collaboration of other Indian powers, such as the Nizam and the Marathas with the British against the Sultan.

Tipu's regional campaign of modernization was not confined to advancing his military power. The exceptional growth of Mysore's economical life was consistently demonstrated in several historical accounts about the kingdom under Tipu's rule. The portrayal of Tipu as a modernizer was reiterated in the first act of The Dreams. Instances of advanced toy industry, prosperous silk farming and manufacturing, and Tipu's innovative ideas in taxation and statesmanship are all abundant in The Dreams. For example, in his first appearance (outside the dream world), we see Tipu holding a conference (with his ministers Mir Sadiq and Poornaiya) in which he enthusiastically decrees some of his agricultural and commercial reforms. When he asks his Minister of Finance to add to the list drawn up for their delegation "silkworms and eggs from the island of Jezeriah Diraz near Muscat", Tipu's Grand Vizier, Mir Sadiq wonders why the kingdom would need these eggs when the ones they got from China are doing very well (Karnad, p.22).

Tipu's answer emphasizes his eagerness to develop his kingdom economically and militarily: “Of course we need others. These may be better. I'm told they are better suited to our climatic conditions. Five or six men who know the proper mode of rearing the worms will need to be brought along with them” (p.21). Rather than featuring Tipu as a man of wars and bloodshed, The Dreams in its personal recalling portrays him as a business man whom the British EIC sees as a very strong rival who poses a serious threat to their commercial interests in India. Karnad dramatizes Tipu as a caring and commercially-minded leader who yearns to achieve economic welfare among his subjects (2005, pp.22-25). This dramatization is meant to be a counter-memory whose function is to substitute the imperial portrayal of the Sultan as a cruel and bigoted tyrant in the performances that appeared at the end of the eighteenth century.

Another late eighteenth century performance that Karnad's play responds to is Sadler's Wells' Tippoo Saib; or, East-India Campaining[sic]. Sadler's Wells Theatre was quick to pick up on Astley's success in Tippoo Saib or British Valour and staged the play less than a month later. But the production's focus was more on the spectacle of captivity than on the thrill of militarized discipline (O'Quinn, 2005, p.325). Unlike Astley's production which enacted the logistical superiority of British warfare, the Sadler's Wells' production used the myth of the native loyal to the empire to do its ideological work. O'Quinn informs us that in the play, each spectacle of Tipu's strength, magnificence and cruelty is superseded by a scene of native loyalty to British rule. This is most conspicuous in the performance of “the signal bravery of a detachment of Sepoys, who released the English Prisoners, defeated a part of Tippoo’s army, and brought off an Elephant” (p.325). Interestingly, the reference to the elephant (here and in the British performances to be discussed later on) can be compared to the presence of the white elephant in Tipu’s dream. While the elephant in Astley’s production is an epitome of the submissive natives, the white elephant in Karnad’s work subvert this notion of submissiveness and transforms it into symbol of greatness.
and national resistance. Indeed, the Sadler's Wells' production was rooted in racial superiority as it consolidated the imperialist Orientalist narratives of the sepoys as faithful colonial subjects. This act of unquestioned faithfulness was developed and adopted by most late eighteenth-century performances about Orientals as an emblem for the continuation of British authority. This is how the Sadler’s Wells' production was operating at the time to promote this fantasy of native capitulation. This act of voluntary submissiveness of the black Other was best described in London's eighteenth-century newspaper *The Public Advertiser* as follows: “The interesting situation of several English officers when confined in the Prisons of Seringapatam, with extraordinary fidelity of a black servant, in forming and executing a plan of escape” (O'Quinn, p.325).

The presence of such a faithful “black” man was very essential for Sadler's Wells' performance to function as a systematic orientalist discourse that necessitated the projection of the difference and superiority of the British over the “black” Indian natives. As Edward Said points out, the presence of the Orient has been fundamental in defining the imperial West “as its contrasting image, idea, personality, experience” (1978, p.2). Hence the play's depiction of “British mastery as ardent desire of an Indian subject: The most flattering applause attended every scene of *Tippoo Saib* last night at Sadler’s Wells, but most particularly in that of the prison, where the faithful black discovers himself to his master” (O'Quinn, p.325). This performance and others contributed in the larger project of Orientalism which was purposefully perpetuated in the period to enhance the British imperial aspirations in the Indian subcontinent where “there [were] Westerners. There [were] Orientals. The former dominate[d]; and the latter [had to] be dominated” (Said, 1978, p.36).

Contra these imperialist performances, there are no submissive or faithful “blacks” in Karnad's historical play. Rather, almost all of the native characters in the play (including Tipu's rivals) are represented as respectful, self-reliant, and devoted generals and statesmen who despise the English and never feel obliged to obey them. Tipu's ministers and subjects appear utterly loyal to him. And even those who (historically) betrayed the Sultan –whom we never recognize as traitors until the end of the play – are dramatized as the Sultan's faithful patriotic followers. These traitors are not even explicitly named and they are not involved in any suspicious or collaborative relations with the English. Similarly, those who help the English against the Sultan are depicted as high-status individuals who deem the English tools through whom they aspire to achieve their own states’ strategic goals. For instance, when the representative of Lord Cornwallis meets Nana Phadnav in the Maratha Court at Pune, it is the Englishman who cringes and acts in a very servile manner to manipulate the Marathas and persuade them to withdraw the peace treaty which they signed with Tipu (Karnad, pp.30-33). In fact, even after the death of Tipu, the English officers and soldiers are struggling the whole night in their strenuous searching for the body of the Sultan as none of his subjects agrees to collaborate with them in identifying the Sultan's body: “These swine have already identified a dozen corpses as the Sultan's – they are making fools of us” (p.10).
Another Orientalist performative fantasy that Karnad's counter-memory drama attempts to dismantle is the depiction of the EIC's military paternalism as opposed to Tipu's defective role as a good parent. Cornwallis's victory over Tipu at Seringapatam in 1792 did not entail a decisive military annihilation. Rather it involved unprecedented diplomatic transferring of money, land, and two of Tipu's sons as hostages to the British General Governor in India. Interestingly, this historical transference was immediately reenacted in many performances in colonial India and in England. It was reported on 23 February 1792 that General Cornwallis “carefully staged a spectacle involving elephants, artillery, and soldiers in full ceremonial costumes, in which he publicly received Tipu's two sons dressed for the melancholy occasion in muslin adorned with pearls and assorted jewelry, with a gesture of paternal love” (O'Quinn, p. 326). Karnad’s play comes to shed some light on how the British acted as hostage takers and colonizers. Not only does the play question of taking prominent hostages by the British colonizers, but it also subverts the colonizers’ claims about their paternal role through which they manipulate their native hostages and their vanquished families.

In England, the relation between the military and parental care was repeated in Astley's extremely successful play Tippoo Saib's Two Sons which was performed in August 1792 (p. 330). The play consisted of three parts: The first part presented, beside the spectacular view of Tipu's capital city, “the affecting, pleasing and interesting Departure of TIPPOO'S TWO SONS from their FATHER, at the Gates of Seringapatam, previous to their being delivered up as hostages to his Majesties Forces”; the second staged “the noble reception experienced by the INDIAN PRINCES on their Delivery to the Commander in Chief”; and the third shows “an ORIENTAL MILITARY FESTIVAL, which took place on the occasion” (Oracle, 20 August 1792). In this scenario, O'Quinn tells us, “Corwallis becomes both the triumphant commander in chief and the father that Tipu's sons never had. The generation of affective sympathy for the hostage sons is managed such that it emphasizes Tipu's defective parental care and downplays systemic British aggression in the region” (p.330).

Karnad presents these moments in a way that projects Tipu's limitless love and parental care for his sons. After presenting the kids while leading a happy life with their father and mother Ruqayya in the first act of The Dreams, the second act presents Tipu, the bereaved husband and father who loses his wife and finds himself forced to part with two of his sons on the same day. The brokenhearted father is listening to the conditions demanded by the English for the release of his sons from their captivity (2005, pp.41-52). When the humiliating terms are announced before Tipu, he tries to suppress his sadness and appear more composed and resolute in front of his subjects. He assures his angry people that his sons will not be harmed by the English.

Yet his citizens feel honor-bound to protest and express their anger: “Please, please your Majesty, do not accept this humiliation. We would rather die” (p.40). Tipu tells his citizens that this is the only choice he has because he will not accept “the destruction of [their] city” (p.42). However, he does not hide his only fear: that the English will teach his sons their language: “[t]he
language in which it is possible to think of children as hostages. All I can try to do is agree to their terms and conclude the treaty in a hurry – before my children have learnt that language” (p.43). Thus, the distressed father considers the imperial “parenting care” – which comes through learning the enemy's language— as the real danger because this facilitates their colonial domination in his land.

Interestingly, the reception of the boys by Lord Cornwallis is not displayed in the play but rather described as a framed narrative by Kirmani— as an active character – whose role, now, is not to narrate the history of Tipu, but to relate a historical event to the main character of the play. Here Tipu is seen waiting desperately to hear from his court historian/diplomat and see whether his sons acted according to the way he nurtured them (chary of any kind of parenthood other than his). Kirmani’s description of their arrival at Corwallis's camp appeases him momentarily: “The English seemed stunned by our magnificence. The princes were received with a twenty-one gun salute” (p.48). But when Kirmani tells the Sultan that Ghulam Ali Khan (who accompanied the boys) said to Lord Cornwallis: “These children were this morning the sons of the Sultan, my master… Their situation is now changed and they must look up at Your Lordship as their Father”; Tipu starts to feel a deep sense of heartbreak:

TIPU. Oh God! Why didn't I die before I heard these words? Ruqayya Banu, why didn't you take me with you? How did I come to this?"

KIRMANI. Lord Cornwallis assured our Ambassador that the children would not feel the loss of a father's care –

TIPU. He must have known these words would reach me and pull out my entrails. (p.48)

Thus, Karnad's Tipu appears to be a sensitive and caring father who is aware of the game of imperial parenthood, which suggests his own deficiency as a father and as a ruler. In fact, the status of imperial paternalism enacted in the British performances is never accomplished in The Dreams because the boys rise above the imperial glamour of parenthood represented by General Cornwallis:

KIRMANI. …And then he gave each prince a gold watch.
TIPU. And what did my children do with the watches?
KIRMANI. They hardly looked at them. They passed them on to the attendants with barely a glance.
TIPU. That's it! That's it! They're well brought up, my sons. (p.49)

Through the images of the caring father and the tolerant leader, The Dreams succeeds in foregrounding Karnad’s mission as a counter-historical project that traversed a wide range of “objective” historical narratives and imperial performances.
To sum up, Karnad's play succeeds in re-writing the tragic decline of the protonational Indian historical figure Tipu Sultan who governed the Kingdom of Mysore in the southern parts of India during the last two decades of the eighteenth century. The play—an unique contemporary postcolonial drama—functions as an effective means for exploring the Sultan’s occluded pre-colonial history by constructing an alternative history that subverts/revises the official accounts of colonialist history and writes back to the imperial propaganda promulgated by the British military historians, dramatists, and performers. The result is a counter-historical discourse that depicts a humane and noble image of the Tipu Sultan and simultaneously revises prejudiced colonialist history.

About the Authors:
Dr. Emad M. Khawaldeh is Assistant Professor of English Literature/Drama in the English Department at Hashemite University, Jordan. He graduated from Ball State University, USA, in 2014. His main research field is postcolonial drama.

Dr. Shadi S. Neimneh is Associate Professor of Literary and Cultural Studies in the English Department at Hashemite University, Jordan, and Vice-Dean of Arts. He graduated from Oklahoma University, USA, in 2011. His teaching and research interests revolve around modern literature and literary theory.

References


Translating Idiomatic Expressions from English into Arabic: Difficulties and Strategies

Mostafa OUALIF
Department of English Studies
Faculty of Letters and Humanities Ben M’sik, Casablanca
Hassan II University, Casablanca, Morocco

Abstract
An idiom is a form of speech or an expression that is peculiar to itself. Grammatically, it cannot be understood from the individual meanings of its elements. Culture plays an important role in the course of the idiom interpretation. Only by having a solid foundation of the culture of the target language, the translator can catch the implied meaning. It, therefore, requires enhancing cross-cultural awareness and needs open-minded understanding of the culture of the second language from different aspects. Moreover, the difference between the source language and the target language as well as variations in their cultures makes the process of translating a real challenge. The present paper tries to investigate and identify firstly some existing obstacles in the process of translating idiomatic pairs, and then suggests some theoretical strategies to overcome such difficulties. Following Baker’s (1992) classification of difficulties and strategies and the related sub-categories, the findings show that there are number of factors which should be considered in order to translate idiomatic expressions correctly. The most important of such factors include socio-linguistic elements, cultural aspects, linguistic and stylistic considerations.

Key words: Arabic translation, classification of idioms, idioms, translation difficulties, translation strategies

I. Introduction

It is widely assumed that as far as intercultural translation is concerned, there is always a gap that is difficult to be bridged when translating idioms from one language to another. Idioms are an inalienable part of each language found in large numbers in most of the languages. Since the meaning of these collocations cannot be understood from the literal meanings of their constituent parts, this yields an array of problems in the process of understanding and translating them.

The process of translating idioms from one language into another is a fine work which obliges a translator to have a good knowledge of both languages and cultures. More precisely, a translator has to be not only bilingual but also bicultural. People of different languages use completely different expressions to convey a similar meaning, in a way that while an expression might be completely tangible and transparent for a particular community of speakers of a specific language, the same set of words and expressions may seem fully vague and opaque and even in some cases nonsense to the speakers of another language. This is due to the fact that each language has got some culture-specific items that are completely different from the corresponding items in another language. That is, language and culture are closely interrelated since the former reflects various aspects of the latter (Larson 1984, p. 432).

In the case of Arabic and English languages, they both belong to two different settings and different language families. Arabic is a Semitic language whereas English is Indo-European. They are culturally unrelated and alien. Besides, non-linguistic factors as religion, geographical locations, and different ideologies harden the process of understanding and translating idiomatic pairs from English into Arabic and vice-versa.

The purpose of this paper is to investigate the difficulties that arise when translating idioms and to recreate the same sets of idioms of one language in another language in a way that they might convey the same ideas of the original language. The structure of this paper can be seen along the following lines. Section I defines what idioms are and classifies them into different categories. Section II deals with the difficulties encountered while translating idioms. Section III discloses the possible ways put forward to overcome those difficulties mainly through applying those strategies proposed by Baker (1992), alongside with some other experimental findings mentioned by a number of experienced translators and scholars.

II. Definition of Idioms

Idioms are linguistic expressions or lexical items that have got a vast territory in a way that they can include many cultural aspects such as religious beliefs, culture-specific items, superstitions, and different ideologies of the people from diverse societies and nations. They are necessary to any language in order to keep the local and cultural color of that language. Idioms are defined in the Collins English Dictionary (2006) as “an expression such as a simile, in which words do not have their literal meaning, but are categorized as multi-word expressions that act in the text as units”. In Longman Idioms Dictionary (1998) idioms are referred to as “a sequence of words which has a different meaning as a group from the meaning it would have if you understood each word separately”. Accordingly, idioms should not be broken up into their elements because they are sometimes referred to as a fixed expression, Cowie & Mackin (1975). For example the idiom “conceited as a barber’s cat” refers to having a high or exaggerated
Translating Idiomatic Expressions from English into Arabic

Oualif

opinion of oneself or one’s accomplishments and can be translated into Arabic as مغرور مثل الطاوس. Here there is nothing to do with the cat or the barber. We can see that if this idiom will be translated word by word as مغرور كقطة الحلاق it will make no sense to the readers.

Newmark (1988), who considers idioms as “extended” metaphors, claims that an idiom has two main functions: pragmatic and referential. The pragmatic function is to appeal to the senses, to interest, to surprise, to delight, while the referential function is “to describe a mental process or state, a concept, a person, an object, a quality or an action more comprehensively and concisely than is possible in literal or physical language”. (p. 104)

Baker (1992) states that idioms are frozen patterns of language which allow little or no variation in form and carry meanings which cannot be deduced from their individual components. She also mentions that idioms allow “no variation in form under normal circumstances” (p. 87) and that a translator cannot do any of the following with an idiom:

1. Change the order of the words of an idiom. The way the words are put together is fixed and they cannot change their place. E.g. “go to rack and ruin” not “go to ruin and rack”.
2. The word in an idiom cannot be omitted. E.g. “shed crocodile tears” not “shed tears”.
3. There are no extra words that might be added to an idiom. E.g. “have a narrow escape” not “have a narrow quick escape”.
4. No word in an idiom can be replaced by another word. E.g. “out of sight, out of mind” not “out of sight, out of heart”.
5. The grammatical structures of an idiom cannot be changed. E.g. “ring the bell” not “the bell was ringed”.

Different scholars have categorized idioms according to their types of meaning. Some of them have spoken in general terms while others have used more specific classification.

According to Makkai (1972), as cited in Fernando (1996), there are two types of meaning: idioms of encoding and idioms of decoding. The idioms of encoding are those idiosyncratic lexical combinations that have transparent meanings and can be easily understood even by non-native speakers. For example, kill two birds with one stone, which could be directly translated into Arabic as ضرب عصفورين بحجرة. The idioms of decoding refer to those non-identifiable and opaque lexical expressions by using only independently learned linguistic conventions. This type of idioms can be further classified into lexemic and sememic. Lexemic idioms include strings of words like a) phrasal verbs (to come up with, to turn off, etc ...), b) phrasal compounds (black ice, black road), c) incorporating verbs (man-handle) and d) pseudo-idioms (spick and span, kit and kin). Whereas sememic idioms usually convey pragmatic meanings related to a particular cultural environment. They include a) proverbs (A bird in hand is worth two in the bush) and b) familiar quotations (not a mouse stirring).
Larson (1984) believes that there are two primary kinds of meaning; namely, *Explicit* and *Implicit* meanings. He states that these two primary kinds of meaning can be further categorized into three sub-categories:

1. “*Referential meaning*” in which a specific word “refers to a certain thing, event, attribution or relation which a person can perceive or imagine”;
2. “*Organizational meaning*” that deals with some aspects of surface structure and grammatical points of the sentence;
3. “*Situational meaning*” that is the meaning of an utterance in given communication. (Larson 1984, p. 41-43)

On the other hand, Nida (1964), as cited in Munday (2001), advances the following categorization:

1. *Linguistic meaning* that borrows some elements of Chomsky’s (1957) model and the fact that meanings are arbitrary;
2. *Referential meaning* that is called denotative meaning;
3. *Emotive meaning* that is called connotative meaning and deals with extra-linguistic factors and the figurative meanings that a word may concern.

Another classification of meaning types deals with Koller’s (1979) equivalence in which he proposes five types of meaning for the corresponding equivalents:

1. “*Denotative equivalence*” deals with linguistic content of a text and Koller names it “content invariance”;
2. “*Connotative equivalence*” deals with a feeling or idea that is suggested by a particular word although it is not necessarily a part of that word’s meaning;
3. *Text-normative equivalence* is related to different text types in which texts behave in different ways;
4. *Pragmatic equivalence* which deals with the influence of the text on the target language audience;
5. *Formal equivalence* that concentrates on “the form and aesthetics of the text and meaning.

It is worth mentioning that although all the scholars aforementioned have come up with different categorizations, they have all determined a kind of meaning that deals with a meaning type related to “non-linguistic” or “extra-linguistic” aspects of words. That is, all scholars have got a categorization which refers to idiomatic expressions of a language. For example, in the meaning types stated above, Larson’s (1984) “*situational meaning*”, Nida’s (1964) “*emotive meaning*” and Koller’s (1979) “*connotative meaning*” are related to the domain of idioms and fixed expressions.

**III. Difficulties in Translating Idioms**

Culture plays an important role in the course of the idiom interpretation. Only by having a solid foundation of the culture of the target language, the translator can catch the implied
meaning. It, therefore, requires enhancing cross-cultural awareness and needs open-minded understanding of the culture of the second language from different aspects.

Cultural roots, however, play a major part in the translation process. Words which have various connotations in one language may not have the same emotive associations in another. Different languages frequently reflect different connotations and associations of feeling because of the differences in cultural roots.

The differences between the source language (SL) and the target language (TL), as well as the variation in their cultures make the process of translating a real challenge. As indicated earlier, problems of translation involve not only the linguistic and stylistic features but also the cultural and social differences between SL and TL. Hence, the bigger the gap between the SL and the TL, the more difficult the transfer of message from the former to the latter will be.

The social factors of the Arabic and English cultures have their influence on the Arabic and English languages. They have a clear impact on their perception of social experiences that include every aspect of life: customs, morals, feelings, emotions, beliefs, etc. To explain this crucial fact of translating precisely, consider the following:

- رهظ ونسم: He is backed up.
- وطقم رجنم: He has no relatives.

Speakers of English will not understand the idiomatic meaning, if any of these Arabic idioms is translated into English.

The first idiom illustrates that Arabs prefer big and extended families with many sons and brothers, since they believe that this supports social rank and influence in their society. Therefore, the Arab feels proud to be a member of a big family. Whereas the second idiom is used in the opposite situation to mean that someone’s all family members are dead. Thus, the person needs help and sympathy from others around him, especially when his family is no longer a source of help and assistance.

Idioms are usually impossible to be translated literally because their meanings are not built up from the meanings of their parts. Thus, when it is said: "رهظ ونسم"i.e., his back is supported; it is actually not saying anything about his back or supporting. But when it is said that someone is cut off from a tree, it is not referring to anything about cutting off or a tree.

Culture is considered as all of human attitudes, assumptions, beliefs, and values. It is the product of his head and heart as well as his hands. So, human cultures are all alike in providing answers to the universal problems of human existence, but the answers are all different, and each culture is therefore unique.

In short, the main problems that idiomatic expressions pose in translation relate to two main areas: the ability to recognize and interpret an idiom correctly; and the difficulties involved in rendering the various aspects of meaning that an idiom conveys into the target language.
Therefore, translation involves far more than replacement of lexical and grammatical items between two languages. As can be seen in the translation of the previous idioms, the process may involve discarding the basic linguistic elements of the SL text so as to achieve the goal of 'expressive identity' between the SL and TL texts.

Moreover, an idiom may have no equivalent in the target language, i.e. the meanings cannot be predicted and only occasionally matches the same meaning in the TL. In some cases, a word for word rendering of Arabic into English seems to be impossible usually because the words simply do not exist in target language. The strategies that help to solve the problem of translating idioms of these types will be presented next.

IV. Translation Strategies

The way an idiom is to be translated depends on the context in which it is used. We have different and various translation strategies but the translator should see the use of which kind of these strategies can help the target language readers to better comprehend the meaning of the idioms. When translating a source idiom the translator should be conscious of the sense. He may change some aspects of the idiom to preserve the sense and to transfer it to the TL readers. In the case that the original idiom does not have its equivalent in another language, the translator should not delete that idiom from his text but he should clarify more on it to let the readers understand its meaning better. Fernando and Flavell (1981) express that there is “strong unconscious urge in most translators to search hard for an idiom in the receptor language, however inappropriate it may be” (p.82)

The strategies which are used in this article are those proposed by Baker (1992). They are going to be further illustrated by using some examples of idiomatic expressions in both English and Arabic as the source and target languages.

4.1 Total Equivalence (Form and Meaning)
According to Baker (1992, p.72), "this strategy of finding an idiom of similar meaning and similar form in the target language may seem to offer the ideal solution, but that is not necessarily always the case".

It is to be emphasized that idiomatic expressions are culture-bound. A great majority of idioms, in all languages, have cultural associations which make them peculiar. Inani (1998) argues that most English and Arabic idioms have appeared as metaphors which started to be used, bit by bit, unchanged until they have been recognized as established forms of a given language. This point is further emphasized by Al- Haddad (1994, p. 217), when he argued that "The meaning of many idioms results from the figurative extension of the original situation which is often unknown to the majority of speakers. This source may have been obscured by time".
Again, this aspect has been pointed out by Larson (1984, p. 21), when he mentioned that idioms are figures of speech and as such, “are often based on stories or historical incidents. Many times, the origin of the figure is no longer apparent”.

Such being the case, this kind of matching can only be arrived at in certain occasions, when both the source language and the target language belong to the same language family; hence, having cultural similarities, a matter which facilitates translation. When, on the other hand, two culturally remote languages such as English and Arabic are involved, it is not advisable to resort to total equivalence since the source language idiom and the target language idiom may have distinct cultural implications.

It is to be noted, however, that many English idioms have got currency in the Arabic language through translation, and have been used to a great deal in the daily journalistic register or present–day writing. In fact, such a phenomenon has become so common in modern Arabic that it might be thought, at times, that such expressions are originally Arabic. This is due to the fact that Arabic has a unique ability to digest the foreign terms and make them look like the genuine ones in it (Hijazi, 1978).

The following examples illustrate the usage of some of many foreign idiomatic expressions in present-day Arabic:

- To shed crocodile tears
- To fish in troubled water
- To digest ideas
- Lion’s share
- Crux of the matter
- To give green light

4.2 Partial Equivalence (Similarity in meaning not in form)

This strategy involves translating a source text (ST) idiomatic expression into its equivalent target text (TT) idiom which conveys the same meaning, but has a different form. It is often possible to find an idiom in the TL which has a meaning similar to that of the SL idiom, but which consists of different lexical items.

In this respect, it is advised that the translator possesses a good cultural background concerning the idiomatic expressions he may be faced with. A lack of such a background may hinder him from grasping the real image and the comprehensive idea and/ or meaning behind any idiom having a cultural specification. It is worthy to mention that having a good cultural background about idioms is a necessity which is supposed to make the translator not only get the true and complete meaning behind idioms, but also “to enable him to find equivalent idioms having the same or similar functions in the TL” (Sadiq, 2008, p. 50).

Furthermore, cultural background has been looked upon as a must in translating idioms if the translator seeks to produce a truly effective target language text” The cultural background is the only way out to translating idioms in an equivalent way” (Sadiq, 2008, p. 51).
The following are illustrative examples of ST idioms which have been translated into their TT counterparts which carry the same meaning, but differ in their forms:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Idiom</th>
<th>Arabic Idiom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To take the rough and the smooth</td>
<td>أتى على الأخضر والبرّيّس</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To keep a tight rein on someone</td>
<td>يضيق عليه الخناق</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through thick and thin</td>
<td>في السواء و الصفر</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To move earth and heaven</td>
<td>يقيم الدنيا ويعدّها</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To add insult to injury</td>
<td>يزيد الطين بلة</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is worth noting, here, that finding Arabic idioms carrying the same or almost the same meanings to those listed above – or even to any other idiom – is not as easy a matter as it appears to be. As a start, an interpretation of the intended meaning of the original idiom is required. To accomplish this, the translator begins his extensive search for genuine Arabic idiomatic counterparts to fit in place of the English ones. As a matter of fact, two – or even sometimes three source books are needed to fulfill this task. Not all idioms are included within English – Arabic dictionaries, and thus, English – English dictionaries are indispensable. Furthermore, Arabic – Arabic dictionaries are also needed so as to be sure of the meaning intended.

4.3 Paraphrasing

This strategy, as the name indicates, involves giving a brief explanation of the meaning behind the idiomatic expression being used in the ST. This is usually done when the translator is faced with idiomatic expressions in the SL which have no corresponding idiomatic expressions in the TL, or, more often, when he fails to find an idiomatic expression in the TL that matches the one used in the SL.

Paraphrasing may be considered the most common way of translating idioms when a match cannot be found in the TL or when it seems inappropriate to use idiomatic language in the TT because of differences in stylistic preferences of the SL and the TL. It might be suggested, however, that the translator is advised to apply this strategy only when he is left with no option but to paraphrase.

It is to be noted that this strategy is best applied to such idioms which are less culture-specific than others. Otherwise, the impact of the idiom and its cultural significance will be lost, (Baker, 1992). The following are some examples of paraphrasing:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English Idiom</th>
<th>Arabic Idiom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To walk on air</td>
<td>يشعر بسعادة غامرة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To live from hand to mouth</td>
<td>يحيا حياة الكفاف</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have no backbone</td>
<td>ضعف الإرادة والشخصية</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To let the cat out of the bag</td>
<td>يفشي سر</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To think on one’s feet</td>
<td>سريع البديهة</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4 Translating by Omission

The time that there is no close match between the languages' items or the time that the translator cannot find any equivalents, this strategy is used to completely omit the idiom from the
A translator can avoid translating an idiom appearing in original version if its meaning is verbose for a translated sentence, or a translator cannot find an equivalent word or idiom. To put a certain idiom aside by translating its meaning can provide the reader with an acceptable equivalent that is equal to the original version. Consider the following examples:

The Arabic idiom ابن تسعة أشهر which means a human being could be omitted in English translation and be substituted just by “One” or “human”. Unlike Arabic which tolerates elaboration, English tends to be straight and to the point. Thus, when translating the idiom ابن تسعة أشهر into English, translator could simply delete the idiom and replace it with what it stands for.

The Arabic idiom دب الشقاق بينه و بين أخيه meaning تشاجر is a verbose idiom and could be omitted and substituted by “fight” or “dispute” which is easy for the English audience to understand.

It is observed here that the translator has omitted the idioms and has changed them into non-idiomatic expressions. So the significance of the words in the source idioms is not transferred by the way the translator has translated them.

Another strategy which is proposed by Baker (1992) is giving a literal translation of the target idiom. Of course the literal version of the idiom should be acceptable by the target readers and it should be lexically modified. In the case of not finding a proper equivalent, giving a literal translation is not always an easy task to do. The more literal a text is translated, the more confusion it brings to the readers. According to Newmark (1988), literal translation is translating an idiom by giving a word-for-word translation of the source language idiom, which most of the time results in unnatural or wrong rendering of idioms.

Conclusion

Translation is a complicated process by itself, let alone the translation of idioms which are problematic and difficult to learn. Being problematic and difficult to learn is not merely attributed to the fact that idioms have non-literal meanings, though this is a huge problem by itself. Some other factors make idioms distinctive, and thus not an easy matter to tackle. Some idioms are characterized by their odd word grouping and/or their rigid and unjustifiable word order.

Two interrelated difficulties are detected on the part of the translator when dealing with idioms: his ability to recognize and interpret an idiom correctly on one hand, and his success in looking for the most suitable rendition of an idiom into the target language, on the other.

More often than not, idioms are culture-specific, a matter which needs further care and awareness on the part of the translator. In order to preserve such a criterion, the translator should work hard, not only to avoid literalisms – which he must avoid with almost all idioms – but also to endeavor to provide his readers, whenever this is possible, with idiomatic translations in which not only the intended meaning is presented, but also the cultural specificity flavour.
Translating Idiomatic Expressions from English into Arabic

About the Author:

Mostafa Oualif is a lecturer in the English Studies Department at the Faculty of Letters and Humanities, Hassan II University, Casablanca, Morocco. He is a holder of an MA in Theoretical Linguistics from the University of Wales in Bangor and a Graduate Certificate in Descriptive and Applied Linguistics from the University of Essex, England. His research interests focus on translation pedagogy, pragmatics, discourse analysis, and Universal Grammar and its relevance to second language acquisition.

References


“Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s works: A Vehicle for Creating Peace”

Chekra Allani
English Language and Literature
Faculty of Language Studies
Arab Open University, Kuwait

Abstract
In Naomi Shihab Nye’s works, the theme of nature as a creative force is recurrent, moving and poignant. It is often juxtaposed with the destructive forces of war and conflict. Nye’s romanticizing over nature gave it a glorified appeal and brought forth its nobility and magnanimity. Her subtle way of intermingling aspects of nature with daily individual experience touches the heart. In her poetry and prose, nature appears to be the connector and the comforter, and at times, it is the spiritual and the sublime. The aim of this paper is to delineate the multi-functions of nature as a vehicle for creating peace and for bridging the gap of misunderstanding and ignorance between East and West in this tempestuous period of human history.

Keywords: Arab-American literature, communication, eco-criticism, nature, peace, postmodernism, romanticism

Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s work: A Vehicle for Creating Peace

Introduction

Naomi Shihab Nye (1952- ) is an Arab-American poet, an anthologist and an educator born in St Louis to a Palestinian father and an American mother. Nye showed signs of poetic ingenuity from her tender years. In her poetry and prose, she embraces nature as a connector between not only the US and the Middle East, but also between diverse cultures: ‘Nye deals with nature as not just background but central subject’ (AlKhadra & Majdoubeh, 2014, 885). She is influenced and ‘infused’ by canonical Romantic American writers and particularly Dickinson: ‘It is like drinking water straight from Sitti’s spring’ (Nye, 1996, 141). Nye delineates nature in the different places she lived in: in Saint Louis, Jerusalem and San Antonio. In her narratives, ‘Nature adds a deeper dimension to experiences already shaped by political and cultural contestations’ (Bupujaj, 2015, 1). Nature is depicted in her works as the connector, the healer, and the sublume. It has a spiritual aura and an aesthetic value. At other times, we hear the environmentalist’s voice lamenting humans’ negative effect upon nature. Just like the Industrial Revolution’s effect upon the Romantics, the technological revolution’s impact is upon the postmodern ‘neo-romantic’: ‘Could it be changing weather conditions or cell phone beams? Obviously, the current atmosphere sizzles with more electronic signals than any world of the past’ (Nye, 2008, 2-3). Like Wordsworth, Nye can be an icon of eco-critical studies. The relationship of humans to nature and to their physical environment is crucial for serenity and sublimity. It is vital for connecting the disconnected, and including the excluded. The aim of the present study is to delineate these multi-functions of nature, as the connector, the healer and the transcendent, in Nye’s works and their role in promoting peace and understanding in a period when Arab-American relations have become awry after the 9/11 incidents.

Nye’s works have won many prestigious awards and have become part of school curricula within and outside the American continent. But in spite of the critics’ interest in Nye’s poetic ingenuity, no detailed systematic study has been attempted to delineate the multi-functions of nature in her works. AlKhadra & Majdoubeh, 2014 write about the schools of thought Nye belongs to, namely ‘neo-romanticism’ and postmodernism. Najmi, 2010 studies Nye’s ridicule of the military sublime through the aesthetic of smallness and the sanctity of natural phenomena in her poetry. Bujupaj, 2015 does an eco-critical comparative study of Lisa S. Majaj, Naomi S. Nye and Mohja Kahf’s works. Hitherto, the recurrent and significant use of nature in Nye’s works to further a specific agenda has not been fully explored.

Nature in Arab American Women writings

Arab American women’s literary works are the product of a bicultural heritage: the original homeland culture and their new home culture. The connection they have to the Middle East appears in Nye’s writings as a blessing and a doom. Similarly, Edward Said places in an advantageous and at times solitary position those who have seen the world through the different cultures they possess: “exile carries with it, I think, a touch of solitude and spirituality… It is not surprising that so many exiles seem to be novelists, chess players, political activists, and intellectuals” (Said, 2000, 144). The ‘mobility and skill’ which Said refers to entail the responsibility of representing this amalgamation of cultures with its joys and woes in the writings of the displaced. Harb states that the 9/11 events, with the bombing of the World Trade Center and the Pentagon, “marked a turning point in the lives of many
Americans” (Harb, 2012, 14). She adds that in this atmosphere “characterized by animosity and fear, Arab American writers insisted on making their voices heard and their perspectives represented” (Harb, 2012, 14). Arab American writings existed prior to the 9/11 incidents with icons like D. H. Melhem, Mohja Kahf, Lisa Suheir Majaj, Diana Abu Jaber, and Naomi Shihab Nye, but they promulgated more with the crucial need to prevent the entangling of every Arab American under one stereotype. In such an atmosphere of fear and hostility, Gómez believes that it is discriminating for the poet to keep attempting to “dissociate the word terrorist from its connection to her ancestral land” (Gómez, 2010, 110).

Endless troubles on the political arena are counter parted with warm family ties and interconnections Arab American writers tried to establish through the themes of nature, of family, and of food. Arab American writers express love and nostalgia for the home country and integration in the new homes. In either context, the theme of nature prevails to further their agendas. In her introduction to her poems of the Middle East, 19 Varieties of Gazelle, Nye says “When I finally met some other Arab American writers, we felt we had all been writing parts of a giant collective poem, using the same bouquet of treasured images (was there anyone among us who had never mentioned a fig?)” (Nye, 2002, 3).

Despite its strong presence in Arab American writings, nature has been a marginal topic in most critical interpretations of these literary writings, which explains the scarcity of the critical literature in this respect. Bujupaj explains:

"Perhaps because much Arab American writing engages with the flow of cultures across borders, a process which cultural anthropologist James Clifford famously termed 'the transit lounge of cultures', it may be difficult for critics to deal with the treatment of nature or even to notice it, for how can nature exist in a transit lounge?" (Bujupaj, 2015, 1).

The Arab American writers proved that nature can exist in this transit lounge of cultures. This is a romantic and a postmodern approach to nature. It is the new directions of ecocriticism: according to Marshall, “It seems that ecocriticism is not so much continuing along its path in the woods” (Marshall, 2005, 2). Urban nature prevails in many of the Arab American writers’ works. From Majaj’s Greek asphodel and olive tree, to Abu Jaber’s Syracause snow, to Nye’s multicultural images. Yet, from the micro level of urban nature to the macro level of rural or countryside nature, Arab American poets showed great concern over the environmental degradation.

Diana Melhem the Arab American poet paved the way for the future of Arab American women writers. Her work is deep into the American context which reflects her integration. She brings forth the beauty of the American landscape echoing the father of free verse Walt Whitman: "The Americans of all nations at any time upon the earth, have probably the fullest poetical nature. The United States themselves are essentially the greatest poem" (Whitman, 1855, 7). Melhem’s adaptability came after a long period of anxiety, homesickness and nostalgia, hence the relishing of olives, figs, lemons, grapes, ensuring a continuity of Arab
American writers of their cultural contact with their roots: "if poets can write effectively, let their poems be like cedar branches, bury discrimination and injustice in leaves and olive boughs" (Orfalea, 1999, 104). The western metaphor of the cedar and the eastern metaphor of the olive tree connote a shriveling of boundaries.

In Diana Abu Jaber’s works, the recurrent shift in terms of time and space has replenished her bouquet of ‘nature metaphors’ beyond the eastern culture or what Abu Jaber calls the ‘Language of Baklava’. Yucef believes that she shows a “deeply-rooted bond between the present and the past, the American and the Arab” (Yucef, 2010, 234). Abu Jaber is able to shift her setting into her new home (in Syracuse New York) with similar ingenuity. She uses the imagery of snow, where ‘snow’ and ‘ice’ connote both beauty and menace. In her novel, *Birds of Paradise*, she shifts her setting to Miami, Florida, where she interweaves nature’s storm with emotional storm and moves on at the end of her novel with a gentle sunrise shedding rays of hope. Miami’s sun and sand, skies and stars, show the ease with which the author can shift from the microclimate of her ancestral land to the macroclimate of her new homeland, in Syracuse and Miami.

Lisa Suheir Majaj on the other hand combines eastern metaphors of nature like olives and figs with the asphodels of her third home Greece. The strong presence and varied uses of nature in Majaj's poetry invite an ecocritical reading of her works. Nye and Majaj attempt to build bridges not only between their two identities, but also between the multicultural identities they are exposed to, hence the rich and varied metaphors of nature. In the same way the fig tree connected the father to his homeland in Nye’s poem, the olive tree in Majaj's poem "smoothed old scars" and "lulled the child to sleep" --the healing effect is obvious. However, the poet hears protests from her audience: "We have so many problems! / Our identities to defend, our culture under siege. / We can't waste time admiring trees!” (Majaj, 2009, 57). Yet it is Majaj’s belief in hope and light that emanates from her imagined landscape that has no geographical limitations, but the stars and the whole cosmos.

Throughout Arab American writings, the omnipresence of nature keeps shifting from a pause to smell roses to a call to preserve nature. Hence the vacillation between sun and snow and between olive trees of the East and red wood of the American West.

Despite the omnipresence of the theme of nature in Arab American writing, the critical terrain is too limited. Critics have recurrently delved into themes of multiculturalism and identity, leaving nature as a ‘peripheral topic.’ The treatment of nature by Arab American writers shows that they can shift settings be it in the western wilderness or in the eastern landscape. Their eye for beauty is omnipresent and they can use it to reconcile the past, the present and the unknown as in Abu Jaber’s works, to connect and communicate better as in Nye’s, and to heal the sorrows of the past as in Melhem’s. Whether they use the olive tree, the fig tree, the asphodel or the red woods, what matters most are the explicit and the implicit messages of connectedness, of hope and of universal peace.
Theoretical framework: Romantic and ecocritical reading of Nye’s works

Before proceeding with the analysis of the selected works, it is essential to put the current study within its theoretical framework. One might wonder how Romanticism, often considered as an out-of-date movement (Rothbard, 2007, 17), could be approached along with ecocriticism, a very recent analogue movement (Garrard, 2004, 16). It is actually in the primary sources, be it in the collections of Nye’s poetry, her novels, her short stories and her picture books that one cannot help but notice the strong presence of nature, a topic that comprehensively prevails in romantic writings and practically two centuries later in ecocritical literary theory. But Nye is not only a romantic writer, she is also a postmodern, and unlike modern fiction and modern criticism that unite over the rejection of romanticism, (Rothbard, 2007, 17) “Romanticism is still relevant in the age of Postmodernism… being an all-inclusive movement… inevitably open to Romantic influences” (AlKhadra & Majdoubeh, 2014, 886).

The seeds of romantic thought go back to the French philosophers Denise Diderot (1713-1784) and to Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778). Their works had a profound impact upon the development of romanticism in fiction in England and beyond the continent, in America. The Romantic Movement flourished for over a century from the publication of the *Lyrical Ballads* by Wordsworth, after which realism emerged, followed by naturalism, and subsequently modernism. The latter gave way to postmodernism, an all-inclusive movement that is still ‘en vogue’. Romantic writers are considered “lovers, even priests, of nature” (Bygrave, 2004, ix). It is no wonder that Nye could be a romantic and a postmodern concurrently because “postmodernism swerves away from and encompasses all previous movements” (AlKhadra & Majdoubeh, 2014, 886). Despite the fact that Nye does romanticize over the rural and the urban, she seems to lament the good old days, when the ecology was better preserved, and to worry about the present days: “If all honeybees disappear, human beings would have four years left on earth” (Nye, 2008, 8). Therefore, Nye’s works would relevantly be approached from an eco-critical perspective. In our ‘brave new world’, the romantic conception of nature took a new approach as eco-criticism emerged in the late 1970s raising ecological and environmental concerns (Hutchings, 175). These concerns are not novice; they have deeper roots that go back to the rise of the Industrial Revolution and to the Romantics’ apprehension about its repercussions over nature.

Ecocriticism is a fairly recent approach to literature, coined by William Rueckert in 1978. It is a redefined area of literary research that sheds light on the relationship between literature and the natural world. The movement hibernated for a decade between its creation in 1978 until 1989 when it got revived by Cheryl Glotfelty who commended its adoption in the study of nature writings (Black & Cokinos, 1994, 1). Cokinos defines it as “the critical and pedagogical broadening of literary studies to include texts that deal with the nonhuman world and our relationship to it” (Black & Cokinos, 1994,, 3). Thomas Dean added that “Ecocriticism is a response to the need for humanistic understanding of our relationships with the natural world in an age of environmental destruction. In large part, environmental crises are a result of humanity's disconnection from the natural world… a mentality of specialization that fails to recognize the interconnectedness of all things” (Black & Cokinos, 1994, 5). Glotfelty states that environmental writings enhance dualism that proclaim nature as a separate entity
from humanity, while ecocritical writings unite both (Glotfelty & Fromm xx). The connection of the humane and the natural world is a theme that permeates Nye’s works enhancing an ecocritical reading. Henceforth, the concepts of interconnectedness and ‘green’ peace are tackled under the umbrella of the romantic and ecocritical theories.

**Nature, the connector and the healer**

Nye uses nature in her poems as a means to further her agenda, an agenda that is explicit at the beginning of her poem *Jerusalem* where she states: “I’m not interested in / who suffered the most / I’m interested in / people getting over it” (Nye, 2002, 92). Intermittent revenge is only likely to prolong the conflicts and wars. Nye calls for peace not for calculation of casualties on either side. Within the narrative, a child writes his own poem and draws his own painting. The poem within the poem stresses the child poets’ plea for ‘getting over’ their woes: “A child’s poem says / ‘I don’t like wars, they end up in monuments’ / He’s painting a bird with wings / wide enough to cover two roofs at once” (Nye, 2002, 93). In order to give authenticity to the child’s voice, the speaker appears as a witness. Hence the shift from the first person to the third person narrative within the same stanza. What a ‘tableau vivant’ the child paints! A bird with wings wide enough to connect two roofs at once; the concept of nature as a connector is therefore clearly illustrated in the hyperbolic size of the bird’s wings stretching out to put together the severed roofs. The neighboring roofs have deeper connotation to the two different cultures Nye belongs to. Being a bicultural person, she knows the importance of connecting them together. In Nye’s works as in other Arab American writers’, we often encounter a duality in terms of space, “like a cherry with two pits at its heart” (Bujupaj, 2015, 21). The child in Nye’s *Jerusalem* does not understand conflicts and political agendas, like Wordsworth’s child in *Anecdote for Fathers*; his utterance comes truthful from the heart. Nye’s child was straightforward in his rejection and his hatred of wars. The poem ends with an assertion that it is never too late to sow the seeds of peace. “There is a place in this brain / where hate won’t grow. / I touch its riddle: wind, and seeds. / Something pokes us as we sleep. / It’s late but everything comes next” (Nye, 2002, 93). The metaphors of nature ‘wind’ and ‘seeds’ used in this stanza have an implicit connotation to our responsibility. We are responsible to sow the seeds of peace and the wind will disseminate and pollinate. To follow the positive and productive forces of nature is more fruitful than the destructive forces of hatred and revenge that keep poking our conscience and disturbing our ‘sleep’. The words ‘wind’ and ‘seeds’ are the riddle the poet finds the answer to. It is an implicit allusion to the individual and the collective duty of all to sow the seeds of peace in young adults’ minds so we may reap interconnectedness and amity. In her *Letter to Any Would Be Terrorists*, Nye says it is “peace, not violence, that fixes things. You could ask any one of the kids in the Seeds of Peace Organization and they would tell you that” (Gerhardt, 2014, 14).

The function of nature as a connector recurs in many of Nye’s works, poetry and prose. In her collection of poems, *Honeybee*, Nye shows nature as a connector in various insinuations. She states that “Bees are fabulous communicators,” they “can tell each other where the good flowers are. They can find their ways back to their own hives even if you try to block or trick them” (Nye, 2008, 1). Bees have the natural ability to communicate better than humans. In her poem *Bees Were Better*, Nye wonders why people are breaking up while bees are connecting: “I studied bees, who were able / to convey messages through dancing / and
could find their ways / home to their hives / even if someone put up a blockade of sheets / and boards and wire / Bees had radar in their wings and brains / that humans could barely understand” (Nye, 2008, 66). People ought to learn from bees the way to keep connected through dancing not through guns. Nature in Bees Were Better seems to be offering lessons to college students, to thinkers and researchers, to revert to nature and to be able to communicate like bees that never lose their paths despite humans’ attempts to relocate bees in wagons, seeking better pastures. The vanishing nature has engendered a negative impact upon the feelings of people and their conduct towards each other. Our relationship towards our environment has degenerated; likewise our connection towards each other has loosened. In the first part of the poem, the setting is urban, parking lots, artificial fountains and library. In all these settings, disconnection is so recurrent that it upsets the poet: “I could not sit at that table again” where two people are breaking. However, with the change of setting, from an urban to a rural setting, nature seems to be providing smooth communication between bees. Scientific research revealed that “Bees had radar in their wings and brains that humans could barely understand” (Nye, 2008, 66). In the last stanza, Nye shows her role as a poet and a researcher “I wrote a paper proclaiming / their brilliance and superiority / and revised it at a small café / featuring wooden hive-shaped honey dippers in silver honeyhops / on every table” (Nye, 2008, 66). Bees become a symbol of proper communication that humans ought to emulate. The café where the poet revised her paper has a reminder on every table ‘honeyhops’ and ‘honey dippers’ are omnipresent as an aide-mémoire to overlook our differences and to live in peace with each other. Nye seems to be ‘infused’ by Emilie Dickinson’s poem Nature where she depicts nature as “the Bumble bee / Nature is Heaven / Nature is Harmony / So impotent Our Wisdom is / To her Simplicity” (Ackley et al, 277) Like eco-critical theorists, Nye is seeking harmony with nature. She grieves over the disappearance of bees causing empty hives. Like the romantics who were concerned over the Industrial Revolution’s impact upon humans, Nye and the eco-critics worry over the ‘colony collapse disorder’ caused by the Technological Revolution.

Moving from honeybees to frogs, Nye seems to be quite selective of the symbols that are able to convey her messages of connection and adaptability. In the same manner the bees are a symbol of proper communication, her selection of the ‘frog’ In Frogs Did not Forget shows the ability to live in two worlds. Being amphibians, they can live in water and in land. In either setting, they have the ability to adapt themselves well. The play with words ‘frogs’ and ‘forget’ implies an inherent physiognomy that goes beyond the lexicon to convey human ability to adapt to different environments. This close connection of similar consonants goes parallel with their ability to connect in aridity and in humidity adjusting themselves well in both contexts. During ‘huge dry days’, they may hibernate, but ‘after the rain, they sing on six notes’. After the title Frogs did not Forget an enjambment takes us straight to the first couplet of the poem, after which the poet poses a question: “The Frogs Did not Forget / how to do what they do / through the huge dry days / where were they hiding? / One might lose a tune / abandon a tradition / fall into a crack but the frogs after the rain / were singing on six notes” (Nye, 2008, 32). The question posed by the speaker is actually a wonder more than a question. In this state of hibernation where the frogs hide somewhere during arid seasons, aren’t they likely to forget how to live in rainy seasons, the speaker wonders? The fact that they have not abandoned their habit and that they have not fall into oblivion stresses their dual amphibian
nature, a nature which leaves the speaker at the end of the poem in a state of delight after listening to the singing of the frogs: “pleasure poking its throaty resonance / back into my brain” (Nye, 2008, 32). The implicit message here shows the importance of adaptability: it is a matter of survival. Similarly, in her poem Honeybee, the message of communication brings inner peace, so is our ability to adapt ourselves in different cultural milieus. Being bi-cultural herself, it is imperative that the poet adapts well to her new home, while keeping connected with her ancestors’ home.

In her novel Habibi with her poetic prose, Nye moves on from inner peace to world peace. In Habibi, she depicts nature as a connector between Arabs and Jews. Grandma’s closeness to nature --that prevails as well in her picture book Sitti’s Secrets and in her collection of poetry 19 Varieties of Gazelle-- softens her to the point that she accepts the Jewish friend of her granddaughter Liyana in spite of others’ hostility. Grandma gives a story in which she likens Omer to a shepherd with comforting power: “The shepherd had a healing power… He could make the air feel calm again when it felt troubled… He could fix it… Your friend has her friend’s same kind of hair. He has his exact same shape of head. He has something in the way he turns his eyes to things” (Nye, 1996, a, 260). This seems to be a clear reference to the pastoral where, according to the Romantics, we ought to all live in peace and harmony with nature regardless of our ethnicity, religion or cultural background. A strong link to the notion of connectedness pervades Nye’s anthology Under The Same Sky where Nye consecrates one whole section to nature (Nye, 1996, b, 92-124). The title of the anthology stresses the concept of grand communication since we all share the same sky. However, this multicultural approach to nature necessitates further research with a comparative approach to explore the various and multiethnic selection of poetry the rich anthology encompasses.

The grandmother in Habibi seems to be teaching a lesson to include the other rather than alienate him/her. She is the voice of wisdom and understanding that Nye believes to be lacking nowadays on both sides. Liyanna’s grandma accepts the Jewish boyfriend of her Muslim granddaughter and gives him a restorative and curative supremacy, an act bearing an implicit message for western readers to accept their eastern analogues. Unlike Omer’s Israeli mother, who appears leery to approve of his relationship to Liyanna, the Palestinian grandma is trying to instill examples of peaceful connections by initiating the acceptance of the other. Nye states in an interview by Joy Castro: “if grandmas ran the world, I don’t think we’d have any wars” (Castro, 2002).

It is on top of the mountain as well where Omer and Liyana find comfort and peace: “They climbed the highest hill above the village to the abandoned stone house where her uncle used to live. He had been a recluse and almost never came down. Omer offered his hand to Liyana more than once…She felt a great peacefulness floating in the air” (Nye, 1996, b, 261-2). Connections are therefore better made when we are closer to earth. Words like ‘shepherd’, ‘mountain’, ‘hill’ and ‘spring’ have the ability to bring people together: “Rafik broke the spell, galloping down the road toward the spring where he and Omer scooped cold water straight into their palms. They splashed their own faces… We wish our family lived up here” (Nye, 1996, b, 256). This is a typical Romantic approach that shows the corruption of civilization and the urban as opposed to the sanctity of the rural and of the landscape. However, unlike the
Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s work: A Vehicle for Creating Peace

Allani

Romantic poets, Nye does not shun the urban, she romanticizes over it too. From springs, fountains, hills and mountains, she can move on to write with the same passion about restaurants, coffee shops, city parks and supermarkets, making her a postmodern par excellence: “Nye revives Romanticism and keeps it alive well into the twentieth and twenty-first centuries [but at the same time], she has turned the urban landscape in the modern world into what the natural was in Romanticism, a landscape which evokes uplifting, transforming mystical experiences” (Khidra & Majdoubeh, 2014, 886). Nye’s ability to shift between the urban and the rural with similar passion reflects her bicultural identity and her integration. As a second generation immigrant in the US, she integrates into the urban environment of St Louis and San Antonio, as well as in her father’s homeland. She claims this duality to have had a deep impact upon her writing. In an interview, Nye explains that these three places are each “deeply precious” to her and that she often finds them “weaving in and out of [her] writing. Each place has such distinctive neighborhoods and flavors” (Barenblat & Nye, 1999).

Nature, the spiritual and the sublime

The recurrent theme of nature in Nye’s collection of poems 19 varieties of gazelle draws the attention of the reader where nature appears at times the healer, and at times the mystical. In Nye’s Different Ways to Pray, as in Mohja Kahf’s works, the spiritual aura prevails in the poet’s attempts to fuse the mundane with the celestial world through the metaphors of ‘rock’ and ‘stones’ beneath, and the ‘sky’ and ‘moon’ above. The olive tree under which the shepherd prays and implores God to hear his laments represents the sacred, the auspicious and the serene. “The olives bobbed peacefully” (Nye, 2002, 1), connoting God’s response to the shepherd’s prayers by yielding plentiful crops of olives which connect people together around the dinner table “where fragrant buckets of vinegar and thyme” (Nye, 2002, 1) are served along with “flat bread and white cheese” (Nye, 2002, 1). Pain dissolves in these brief moments of happiness and in the simple treats the olive tree presents. This blessed tree has been mentioned seven times in the holy Quran. As in Surat An-Nur, it has been compared to the light of faith:

Allah is the light of heavens and the earth. The metaphor of his light is that of a niche in which is a lamp, the lamp inside the glass, the glass like a brilliant star, lit from a blessed tree, an olive, neither of the east nor of the west, its oil all but giving off light even if no fire touches it. Light upon light… (Qur’an, An-Nur, 24- Verse 35).

Likewise, in Different Ways to Pray, Nye explicitly links the olive tree to peace and to plenitude. In the relatively arid setting of the Middle East, the olive tree seems to be a rich source of nutrients from which oil is extracted, lamps are lit, and the fruit is pickled and served as a treat to boost the meager diet of the poor shepherds and the laity; hence the blissful connotation of the olive tree.

In My Father and the Fig Tree, the coordinating conjunction ‘and’ links the father to the fig tree, a connection which appears at all levels, the cultural, the religious and the spacious. The father’s obsession with the fruit and the tree is obvious from his indifference to cherries which do not grow in his homeland. However, his nostalgic wish for the cherries to turn into figs delineates his attempts to connect to his roots, to Palestine. Being the first...
generation immigrant, the father shows more attachment to his homeland than his daughter who is born in the US and has sporadic visits to her father’s homeland. She and other second generation poets are indeed able to connect, as is noticeable from their writings, but they are not able to do so with the same intensity as the previous generation. The father is born in Jerusalem and has childhood memories that link him strongly to his birthplace. In the same poem, the father weaves humorous folk tales of Joha, deliberately including figs and fig trees, an obsession that offers him a sweet sensation of a world he is craving to connect to. The spiritual connotation of the fig tree is prevalent in the father’s attempts to share his love of figs with his beloved ones. However, his daughter’s response is negative as her exposure to the fruit comes in its dried form. He finds difficulty integrating into his new home, and she finds it similarly difficult to feel the intensity of the emotions of nostalgia to her father’s home. To her reaction, the father reiterates: “That’s not what I’m talking about! He said / I’m talking about a fig straight from the earth / Gift of Allah! On a branch so heavy / It touches the ground” (Nye, 2002, 7). In Nye’s poems, the fig tree, like the olive tree, is a “Gift of Allah”. Indeed, the fig tree is stated in the holy Quran in Surat Al-Tin where in the successive four oaths the fig (Al Teen in Arabic) comes in the first lieu: “By the figs and the olive, and Tur of Sinin, and this city of security, we have indeed created man in the best of mold” (Qur’an, Al-Tin 25, Verse 1-4) Some commentators state that the value of Al Teen is in its extraordinary nutritive value, others believe in the special connotation of the tree that grows on the sides of the two holy mountains, lands where prophets appeared. Another interpretation of the fig tree is its existence in heaven when Adam and Eve, ashamed of their nakedness, started grabbing fig tree leaves to cover their intimate parts. The existence of the fig tree in heaven gives it a sacred aura in this respect. Hence the father’s interjection about the fig fruit “Gift of Allah!” The succession of three superlatives “largest, fattest, sweetest” (Nye, 2002, 7) that describe the fig stresses the deep connection between the father and the fig, an implicit connection to his land where fig trees are plentiful and where memories of his childhood rush vividly with a sensation so sweet that he needs to pause, to ‘stop and close his eyes’. The image of the fig in his mouth conjures itself and carries him to the origin of the tree, to the Jordan Valley, the origin of revelations, to his own roots. Wondering from one location to another in his new land, he carries along the sweet memory of the fig tree till the ‘dreamer’ plants a fig tree in the middle of Dallas, Texas. It remains however ambiguous whether he plants, creates or merely dreams about the presence of the fig tree. All that matters is that he feels himself no longer alienated. He finally integrates and his new home starts to feel like his old home, thereby blending both eastern and western cultures in a harmonious existence. Gómez sees the father’s planting of the fig tree in the US as an “admission that the world of his memories is lost forever” (Gómez, 2010, 112). However, the cheerful tone of the last stanza in the poem lends a more likely interpretation of connection of both cultures rather than a permanent loss of his homeland. This narrative poem comprises an implicit message to some western readers who stigmatize eastern cultures as inferior. Nye states that poetry lies within the tradition of storytelling: “I know we need to keep warm on earth/ and when your shawl is as thin as mine, you tell stories” (Nye, 1994, 26). The stories she weaves are at many instances told by her father who infuses them with eastern images.

In response to My Father and the Fig Tree, Edna Gorney validates the role of nature as a vehicle for peace in her poem To a Palestinian Sister-poet. Despite her initial assertion of the
self over fig trees, almonds, olives, grapevines, dates and pomegranates, she comes back in the last stanza to delineate the laden nature with man’s belligerent stance throughout history (Gorney, 2004, 27). In spite of all this pain and suffering, nature is still generous “And the land / drinks / all this pain / and the almond tree blossoms / and the sweet figs ripen / and fall to the ground” (Gorney, 2004, 21-7). Neither the Palestinian poet, nor her Jewish analogue can bear with these conflicts and wars. Like her Jewish sister-poet, Nye ‘claims feminine space in a politically defiant posture against traditionally masculine turfs of war and international politics’ (Najmi, 2010, 158).

In her poem “For Mohammed on the Mountains”, the mystique of the mountains avails in her uncle’s retreat “like a god / living close to the clouds” (Nye, 2002, 17). Nye prefers him to all her uncles and to her friends’ uncles. ‘What attracts her most to him is his romanticism: The fact that he abandons human society… and that he is alone’ (AlKhadra & Majdoubeh, 2014, 889) living like a hermit so close to nature, an experience reminiscent of Wordsworth who was educated by the forces of nature around him at the Lake District. Like Nye’s uncle Mohammed, who, in the poem, starts his “travel across the ocean” and up to the top of the mountain, Wordsworth started his boat through the Lake District, an experience that eventually defined the course of his life: ‘I dipped my oars into the silent lake / And, as I rose upon the stroke, my boat / Went heaving through the water like a swan’ (Owens, 2004, 162). This childhood episode was the source of his inspiration that towered in his Alps’ climbing journey. He traveled through hills and cliffs and ragged mountains and got trapped in the mountain, in the dark. The same fatal experience that killed Wordsworth’s father, turned out to be a creative force that kept Wordsworth alive and awe-stricken, and had a profound effect upon his imagination. Like Uncle Mohammed, the reclusive experience connected him to all the elements of nature: “A meditation rose on me that night / Upon the lonely mountain when the scene / Had passed away, and it appeared to me / The perfect image of a mighty mind / Of one that feeds upon infinity / That is exalted by an under-presence / The sense of God, or whatsoever is dim / Or vast in its own being” (Owens, 2004, 164). The power of the sublime seems to have taken possession of all his faculties and absorbed them in bewilderment. Shaw believes that “The concept of the sublime lends itself well to the idea of transcendence, in the poetics of romanticism” (Shaw, 2006, 3-4). This is the sublime in the romantic experience that Nye is captivated by. It asserts the link between the mundane and the celestial world in the mystical experiences of both Wordsworth and Nye’s uncle Mahmoud.

Conclusion
Throughout her works, Naomi Shihab Nye tries to spread awareness among her readers of the importance of communication between different cultures and between the mundane and the celestial worlds. In her poetic and prose narratives, she uses nature as a means for creating and sustaining peace and serenity, a theme which prevails not only in the selected works above, but also throughout many of her works. Through the concept of nature, she manages to further her agenda of establishing connections between Western and Eastern cultures and of revealing the relationship of humans to their physical environment: the landscape and the cityscape. Her various uses of the element of nature make her a Romantic, a Postmodern and at times an Eco-critic: She is a typical Romantic in the transcending, spiritual and deified contexts of nature in her works. However, she swerves from the Romantics in her infatuation with the urban along
with the rural. This equal merging of both spaces makes her a Postmodern. Yet, explicit malaise with the environmental crisis and its negative effect upon human relationships enhance the validity of an eco-critical reading of her writings through the new approach of the ecocritical theory ‘urbanature’. The recurrent juxtaposition of the American woods with the Palestinian landscape and the deliberate merging of the western and eastern metaphors of nature emphasize the poet’s plea for a peaceful co-existence. Nye finds in her imagined landscapes rays of hope of a better world with less animosity and more understanding. Within the three contexts of Romanticism, Postmodernism and Ecocriticism, interconnectedness is the fundamental theme that Nye tries to establish, interconnectedness between humans to emulate the productive forces of nature rather than the destructive forces of hatred and disconnection. Being an Arab American writer or what she calls herself ‘half and half’, Nye sows the ‘seeds of peace’ and creates a world in which ‘kisses are more important than gunshots’.

About the author:
Dr. Chekra Allani is an Assistant Professor of English Literature. She ran the department of language and literature at the Arab Open University Kuwait Branch. Her research interests include Children’s Literature with a global perspective and Trilingual Translation Studies. She currently chairs courses of French Language, Modern Drama and Children’s Literature.

References
Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s work: A Vehicle for Creating Peace


Nature in Naomi Shihab Nye’s work: A Vehicle for Creating Peace

Allani

The Translatability of Schemata in the Holy Quran: Seeing the Invisible

Adnan Abumahfouz
Salt College for Human Sciences, Al-Balqa Applied University
Salt, Jordan

Yasser Al-shboul
Salt College for Human Sciences, Al-Balqa Applied University
Salt, Jordan

Abstract
This paper investigates the correctness and accuracy of some translations of the meanings of the Holy Quran in echoing the schemata of some Quranic terms. It also examines the amount of translation loss resulting from this process. Moreover, the paper highlights some reasons which made translators of the meanings of the Holy Quran lose sight of part of the culture-bound, culture sensitive and language-bound schemata. Euphemism and synonymy, however, were addressed in so far as schemata are concerned. The paper also endeavors to suggest solutions, when possible, to make up for the amount of translation loss resulting from the formal or functional equivalence opted for by many translators of the meanings of the Holy Quran which led to the activation of slightly, and sometimes utterly, different schemata. However, the translation loss is inevitable in many cases. The findings of the present paper are expected to be useful information in the translation of the meanings of the Holy Quran studies and other related areas. Three prominent translations of the meanings of Holy Quran (Abdullah Ali, Pickthall, and Al-Hilali and Khan) were consulted and resorted to tackle the main premise of the study along with one commendable Qur’anic exegesis (Ibn Katheer).

Keywords: culture-bound, functional equivalence, schemata, The Holy Quran, translation loss

Introduction
The translation loss, which refers to any distortion or misrepresentation of meaning in the translation process, is one of the most harmful phenomena in translation. It refers to the amount of meaning sacrificed in the process of conveying the meaning from one language to another. Each time we translate a text we lose part of its meaning due to the mere fact that languages are structurally different and they differ in the way they conceptualize ideas in the form of lexis. However, the problem exacerbates when it comes to authoritative texts like the Holy Quran or the Bible, among others.

Transferring the meaning of words across languages has not always been an easy mission for translators; it can be strenuous in some cases and insurmountable in other ones. Juxtaposing the meaning of words in languages at the mental level of representation poses another challenge for translators. However, this is going to be the domain of this paper with the “inevitability” of translation loss in mind.

Literature Review
Many studies have defined the concept of schemata. The following paragraphs provide a brief overview of studies conducted on the concept of schemata in general and the translatability of schemata in the Holy Quran in particular.

Barlett (1932) is the first to use the term “schema” as "an active organization of past reactions or experiences" (p. 201). He believes that our memory of discourse is not based on straight reproductions, but is constructive. This constructive process uses information from the encountered discourse, together with knowledge from past experience related to the discourse at hand to build a mental representation. Another definition is given by Rumelhart (1980) who defines schema as “a data structure for representing the genetic concepts stored in memory” (p. 34). Moreover, Cook (1989) states that the mind, stimulated by key words or phrases in the text or by the context, activates a knowledge schema. Similarly, Shakir (1995) suggests that rendering into the target language a message conveyed via text equivalent in content and function to that conveyed in the source language seems to derive not only from linguistic knowledge, but also from schematic or encyclopedic knowledge, especially when the text is culturally based.

In more recent studies, the concept of schemata is also the interest of many researchers. For example, Ajideh (2003) puts forward that schemata can be defined as the organized background knowledge which helps us predict aspects in our interpretation of discourse. The author extends that a schema (plural schemata) is a hypothetical mental structure for representing generic concepts stored in memory. It’s a sort of framework, or plan, or script. Schemata are created through experience with people, objects, and events in the world. He also argues that when we encounter something repeatedly, such as a restaurant, we begin to generalize across our restaurant experiences to develop an abstracted, generic set of expectations about what we will encounter in a restaurant. This is useful, because if someone asks you to help him/her to open the door because his/her hand is broken, you don’t have to provide all of the details about using the key, turning the key to the left, and pulling the door handle down, etc., because your schema for opening the door experience can fill in these missing details (Ajideh, 2003).
Farghal (2010) argues that correct text comprehension is based on a successful matching and integration between the text’s schematic structure and the schemata available in the translator’s encyclopedic repertoire and therefore essential for the production of an adequate translation. However, the assumption that the Holy Quran cannot be translated across languages without losing the glamorous harmony inherent to verses and sacrificing the emotiveness of cultural and language-specific terms, among others, has been all-pervasive in the Islamic heritage, history and literature (Abu-Mahfouz, 2011).

In the present paper, the researchers highlight the translation loss resulting from losing sight of the culture-bound, culture sensitive and language-bound schemata. On the one hand, culture-free schemata can easily and precisely depict the message of the source language text and they can be literally translated with no distortion of the meaning. On the other hand, culture-bound schemata call for a more functionally-oriented approach where poly-systems play a central role. (Farghal, 2004). Moreover, language-bound schemata behave in almost the same way too. As we try to make up for the amount of translation loss resulting from the functional equivalence, which is the effect the message has on the target language and the source language readers, opted for by many translators of the meanings of the Holy Quran while dealing with those linguistic phenomena, it is important to underscore the fact that there is no one factor that the choice of one a particular equivalent rests on.

With this respect, Baker (1992) claims that the choice of a suitable equivalent will always depend on the way both the writer of the source text and the producer of the target text rather than the linguistic system (s) being handled by the translator. In doing so, the translator chooses to manipulate the linguistic systems in question. Misunderstanding schemata, the domain of psycholinguistics, is mostly the source of the problem of conveying the meaning of a particular linguistic entity. It remains to say that the translation loss can’t be avoided in all cases.

Discussion
This paper aims at investigating the correctness and accuracy of some translations of the meanings of the Holy Quran in echoing the schemata of some Quranic terms. The researchers of the present paper discuss the amount of translation loss among translators in lights of several cultural and linguistic bounds including the culture-bound, culture sensitive, and language-bound schemata. The following paragraphs are further discussions of these different bounds.

Free schemata
Generally speaking, free schemata are the hypothetical mental structures for representing generic concepts stored in memory which are, by and large, universal and therefore can be grasped directly in so far as the translation of particular schemata is concerned. Farghal (2004) states that those cognitive structures whose thematic elements can be worked out on the basis of universal principles stemming from general human experience. This kind of schemata is based on the universal representation that exists in almost every culture and which is, in turn, part of the human experience and does not make a translation problem or even a gap for translators in general and translators of the Holy Quran in particular. Consider the following example to illustrate the idea:
And they say: "What sort of an apostle is this, who eats food, and walks through the streets? Why has not an angel been sent down to him to give admonition with him?"
{Surah, 25: 7}  [Translation by Abdullah Ali]

And they say: "Why does this Messenger (Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم) eat food, and walk about in the markets (as we)? Why is not an angel sent down to him to be a warner with him?"
{Surah, 25: 7}  [Translation by al-Hilali and Khan]

And they say: What aileth this messenger (of Allah) that he eateth food and walketh in the markets? Why is not an angel sent down unto him, to be a warner with him?
{Surah, 25: 7}  [Translation by Pickthall]

 Obviously, the schema of “eating food” is transferred smoothly from the Source Language (SL) to the Target Language (TL) by all the translators because the schema itself is culture-free and universal in nature. In other words, a culture-free schema usually lends itself easily to direct translation. Examples of culture-free schemata are ubiquitous in the Holy Quran and all texts and they do not pose a translation problem to translators at all. In fact, there is no need to provide all of the details about eating because our schema for the eating experience can fill in these missing details.

**Bound-schemata**

Within bound-schemata, the researchers of the present paper discuss the amount of translation loss among translators in lights of culture-bound, culture-sensitive schemata, and euphemism and schemata. The following paragraphs are further discussions of these different bounds.

**Culture-bound schemata**

Palmer (1976) argues that Whorf came to a “new principle of relativity which holds that all observers are not led by the same physical evidence to the same picture of the universe, unless their linguistic backgrounds are similar or in some way can be calibrated” (p. 56). This can be attributed to the fact that when people have different linguistic backgrounds, they see the world differently. This, in turn, makes us have terms which have limitation and restriction in character to a certain culture.

Baker (1992) argues that the source-language word may express a concept which is totally unknown in the target culture. Strictly speaking, the hypothetical mental structures for representing the generic concepts stored in memory are available in the SL culture and completely or partially missing in the TL culture. These mental structures are dubbed culture-bound schemata. These kinds of schemata pose a serious problem for translators who usually opt
for functional or formal equivalence, or other translation strategies to deal with it. However, transliteration reduces the amount of damage on the side of the authoritative text when it is associated with a footnote; sometimes the translation loss seems inevitable notwithstanding. The following example illustrates the idea:

1. "الَّذِينَ يُؤْمِنُونَ بِالْغَيْبِ وَيُقِيمُونَ الصَّلاةَ وَمِمَّا رَزَقْنَاهُمْ يُنفِقُونَ." (الآية 3 من سورة البقرة)

Who believe in the Unseen, Are steadfast in **prayer**.
And spend out of what
We Have provided for them;
{Surah, 2: 3} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

Who believe in the Ghaib and perform
**as-Salat** (Iqamat-as-Salat), and spend out
of what We have provided for them
{Surah, 2: 3} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

Who believe in the Unseen, and establish **worship**, and
spend of that We have bestowed upon them;
{Surah, 2: 3} (Translated by Pickthall)

The term "الصَّلاةَ" (as-salaat), which literally means "prayer", is pervasive in the Holy Quran. The hypothetical mental structures representing "الصَّلاةَ" (as-salaat) in the Arabic language and Islamic culture differ from those existing in other cultures and languages. Unlike Christians, among others who “say” their prayers, Muslims not only say their prayers but also do (or establish) them. In other words, "الصلاة" (as-salaat) in Arabic is more "ritualistic" in nature, whereas in English it is mostly "verbal" and sometimes accompanied by a certain body movements and postures. The term "الصلاة" (as-salaat), however, is "the ritualistic prayer" and better to be transliterated as "As-salaat" as many translators do, some of them fail though. This, however, tells the reader that it is performed differently. The source of schematic uniqueness resides in the performance although the idea is roughly universal.

Abdullah Ali, al-Hilali and Khan, and Pickthall rendered the term "الصَّلاةَ" (as-salaat) as "prayer", "as-Salat" and "worship" respectively. The term “prayer” is not precise for the reason discussed in the previous paragraph. Al-Hilali and Khan transliterated it as "As-Salat" which means that they were aware of the fact that there is more to the term "الصلاة" (as-salaat) than just saying it. Pickthall uses the more general word or superordinate which is "worship" as an equivalent which is very far from communicating the same meaning and cognitive image inherent to the source language term. The difference between the translators is ascribed to the schema of the term "الصلاة" which is different from the schema of "prayer" in the TL and, in turn, blurs the meaning. Consider the following example to illustrate the idea further:

2. "خَذْ مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ صَدَقَةً تُطَهِّرُهُمْ وَتُزَكِّيهِم بِهَا وَصَلِّ عَلَيْهِمْ إِنَّ صَلاَتَكَ سَكَنٌ لَّهُمْ وَاللُّهُ سَمِيعٌ عَلِيمٌ." (الآية 103 من سورة التوبة)
Of their wealth take alms, that so thou mightiest purify and sanctify them; and pray on their behalf. Verily thy prayers are a source of security for them: And God is One Who heareth and knoweth. {Surah, 9: 103}  (Translated by Abdullah Ali)
Take Sadaqah (alms) from their wealth in order to purify them and sanctify them with it; and invoke Allah for them. Verily, your invocations are a source of security for them; and Allah is All-Hearer, All-Knower. {Surah, 9: 103}  (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)
Take alms of their wealth, wherewith thou mayst purify them and mayst make them grow, and pray for them. Lo! Thy prayer is an assuagement for them. Allah is Hearer, Knower. {Surah, 9: 103}  (Translated by Pickthall)

Originally, the term (صلاة) /salaat/ "prayer" means "invocation", and invocations are said rather than performed; the expression (صلاة) /salaat/ is polysemous in Arabic. Polysemy according to Palmer (1976) is the case that the same word may have a set of different meanings. In example (2) above, the three translators render the term (صلاة) /salaat/ into "prayers", "invocations", and "prayer" respectively. The term (صلاة) /salaat/ in example (1) above is different in meaning and schema from the one in example (2) but it is translated in almost the same way. In fact, “دعاء” /duaa/ in this context has a peculiar meaning which is "دعاء" /duaa/ (invocation). So, does the ritualistic prayer have the same meaning as invocation? No. The source of the mistranslation resides in the misunderstanding of the schemata.

Table 1: Common religion-specific terms with their English equivalent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic term</th>
<th>English equivalent</th>
<th>Commentary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Allah</td>
<td>God</td>
<td>English equivalents fall short of delivering the full meaning. Often, a strategy of Borrowing the SL term (loan word) + a short explanation is deployed. English equivalents are taken only as approximation to the general meaning of the terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Salat</td>
<td>Prayers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Zakat</td>
<td>Charity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Shahadah</td>
<td>Martyrdom</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Sawm</td>
<td>Fasting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Haj</td>
<td>Pilgrimage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Adhan</td>
<td>Call for Prayers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Haraam</td>
<td>Forbidden</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Halal</td>
<td>Permissible</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Ethm</td>
<td>Sin</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Jihad</td>
<td>Holy war</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Qiblah</td>
<td>Prayer direction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatwa</td>
<td>Verdict</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Du’aa</td>
<td>Invocation, supplication</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Fiqh</td>
<td>Jurisprudence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As shown in Table 1, Kashgary (2010) provides a list of common religion-specific terms with their English equivalent. Although most of these expressions make culture-specific ones, many other expressions are not mentioned notwithstanding. However, he argues that they represent a category of translation non-equivalence because they cannot be appropriately translated by providing their dictionary equivalents. Kashgary claims that the dictionary equivalents of these terms may be considered within the framework of Nida’s approximation in translation where equivalents are given only to approximate the meaning in general terms and not the details because the content of these terms is highly different from the content of their equivalents.

Kashgary (2010) puts forward that part of the difficulty in translating such terms lies in the fact that these words require an awareness of the Arabic culture with all its social values and traditions. In addition, these words represent concepts which do not exist in English. In other words, such terms are untranslatable because the schemata of the terms in the source language are culture-bound and therefore cognitively different from the ones in the target language. With this in mind, using a loan word or a loan word plus a short explanation was judged to be more precise and more accurate in rendering the full meaning of these terms. For example, the word [zakat], can be translated by using its one-word English equivalent “charity” or “alms”, as many translators did in translating Quran. However, these equivalents do not give the complete meaning of the Arabic word as it is used by Muslims. [zakat] can be more adequately translated by explaining and describing its conditions to approximate its full meaning through adding a qualifier “obligatory” or “ordained” to the English equivalent. So, the more accurate translation would be “obligatory or ordained charity” (Kashgary, 2010).

**Culture-sensitive schemata**

Farghal (2004) believes that culture-sensitive schemata differ from their culture-bound counterparts by the fact that they reflect susceptibility rather than uniqueness to the SL culture. Dates which are sweet fruits of various types of the palm tree are well-known fruits in many cultures and countries. However, in the Arabic and Islamic culture the image of dates is peculiarly sacred and therefore culturally sensitive. It is the first thing that almost every Muslim usually eats in Ramadan to break his/her strenuous fast. The prophet Mohammed (peace be upon him) and his companions depended on dates as their main diet, and many stories and authentic Hadeeths (what the prophet Muhammad said) narrated to us from the time of the Prophet (Peace be upon him) are about dates which makes this fruit peculiar to the Arab as a person and to Arabic and Islamic culture on a broader scale of thought. Consider the following examples from the Holy Quran:

1. "ذَلِكُمُ اللَّهُ رَبُّكُمْ لَهُ الْمُلْكُ وَالَّذِينَ تَدْعُونَ مِن دُونِهِ مَا يَمْلِكُونَ مِنْ قِطْمِيرٍ. (الآية 13 من سورة فاطر)"

Such is God your Lord: To him belongs all Dominion. And those whom ye invoke Besides Him have not

**The least of power.**

{Surah, 35: 13} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

Such is Allah your Lord; His is the kingdom.
And those, Whom you invoke or call upon instead of Him own not even a Qitmir (the thin membrane over the date-stone).

{Surah, 35: 13} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

Such is Allah, your Lord; His is the Sovereignty; and those unto whom ye pray instead of Him own not so much as the white spot on a date-stone.

{Surah, 35: 13} (Translated by Pickthall)

It seems that transliteration can be the best translation strategy resorted to to bridge the gap when formal or functional translation does not answer this purpose. The schema of (قطمير) “qitmir” which is a thin membrane over the date-stone is intended here because dates schemata are culturally sensitive for the Muslims in general and the Arabs in particular for the reasons discussed in the previous paragraph. In the previous example, unlike Ali who uses the term “the least of power” to convey the “meagerness” inherent to the term “قطمير” at the expense of the source language schema, al-Hilali and Khan were aware of the importance of the schema of the SL text. They transliterated it and introduced a definition of what “قطمير” is all about. However, Pickthall lost sight of the whole schema and changed it all together. He sacrificed the original cognitive structures of the SL text.

Have they a share In dominion or power? Behold, they give not a farthing To their fellow-men?

{Surah, 4: 53} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

Or have they a share in dominion? Then in that case they would not give mankind even a speck on the back of a date-stone.

{Surah, 4: 53} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

Or have they even a share in the Sovereignty? Then in that case, they would not give mankind even a speck on a date-stone.

{Surah, 4: 53} (Translated by Pickthall)

It can be seen that Ali opted for functional equivalent sacrificing the original cognitive structures in the SL text. He translated the term “نقير” (naqeer), which literally means the speck on the back of a date-stone, as a “farthing” which is a coin worth a quarter of a penny in old British money. This, however, might sound awkward or unfamiliar even to a native speaker of English and it needs further explanation as it does not make sense at all.

Like al-Hilali and Khan, Pickthall gave a description of the term in question. “نقير” (naqeer) is “a speck on a date-stone”, which is, to a large extent, a successful translation. However, the cognitive structures inherent to the term “نقير” (naqeer) is that of “a bird’s beak” or beakful, i.e., “as much food as a bird’s beak will hold or carry. “نقير” (naqeer) refers to the spot that remains when a bird hits something relatively soft. However, since there is not a well-
established word in English with this meaning and schema, a translation strategy as translation by description makes a good way to tackle this and such issues.

Another term related to dates mentioned in the Holy Quran is “فتيل” (fateel) (literally: cord or wick). The meaning of such an expression is “nothing”. If someone does not own even a cord on the date-stone, then he/she technically owns nothing. The Holy Quran uses a peculiar cognitive image to communicate this message; therefore, it should, if possible, be kept as it is. The following paragraphs show different translations of “فتيل” (fateel):

Hast thou not turned Thy thought to those Who claim sanctity? For themselves? Nay – but God Doth sanctify whom He pleaseth. But never will they Fail to receive justice In the least little thing.

{Surah, 4: 49} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

Have you not seen those (Jews and Christians) who claim sanctity for themselves?

Nay, but Allah sanctifies whom He wills, and they will not be dealt with injustice even equal to the extent of a scalish thread in the long slit of a date-stone.

{Surah, 4: 49} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

Hast thou not seen those who praise themselves for purity?

Nay, Allah purifieth whom He wills, and they will not be wronged even the hair upon a date-stone.

{Surah, 4: 49} (Translated by Pickthall)

Ali rendered “فتيل” (fateel) as “the least little thing” which conveys the overall meaning but sacrifices the schemata. al-Hilali and Khan always opt for a description of the term that has no direct equivalent in the TL which is a successful translation strategy to bridge many cases of translation non-equivalence at the word level. Pickthall used the expression “the hair upon a date-stone” which does not convey the meaning as “a scalish thread in the long slit of a date-stone”, used by al-Hilali and Khan, because “فتيل” (fateel) is in fact as thick as a tread not as thin as a hair. The cognitive structures of the SL expression are not conveyed perfectly.

In other cases the cultural sensitivity arises from the fact that the term is geographically restricted. This, in turn, makes it better to render the term in a way that reflects the connotative meaning related to the word in question. Most translators of the meanings of the Holy Quran used a more general word or the superordinate because the target language lacks a well-established word to communicate the same meaning in the source language at the expense of the SL schemata. Consider the following example:

"وَكَمْ مِن قُرْنِيَّةٍ أُهْلِكْنَاهَا فَجَاءَهَا بَأْسُنَا بَيَاتاً أَوْهُمْ (الآية 4 من سورة الأعراف)."
How many towns have We Destroyed (for their sins)? Our punishment took them on a sudden by night 
Or while they **slept For their afternoon rest**. 
{Surah, 7: 4} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)  
And a great number of towns (their population) 
We destroyed (for their crimes). 
Our torment came upon them (suddenly) by 
night or while **thy were taking their midday nap**. 
{Surah, 7: 4} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)  
How many a township have We destroyed! As a raid by 
night, or while **they slept at noon**. 
{Surah, 7: 4} (Translated by Pickthall)

The word “قَآئِلُونَ”, which means being in a state of rest or sleep taken after lunch, especially in hot countries, is rendered as "afternoon rest", "midday nap", and "slept at noon" respectively. The three expressions might describe a rest or short sleep taken in the afternoon but none of them tells the reader that this sleep is related to “hot countries” and is usually taken after lunch. In many hot countries as is the case in some Arab and African ones, it is difficult to work during the midday time, so people in those regions are used to be, and most of them still, in the habit of having a rest or nap in the midday time especially after lunch because the climate is very harsh and it is very strenuous to work during that period.

The high-level conceptual structure or framework that organizes our prior knowledge about “القيلولة” (qailuula), “having a short nap after lunch especially in hot countries”, help us interpret the meaning of this culturally sensitive expression. In English, however, the loanword “siesta”, originally a Spanish word from Latin “sexta”, communicates almost the same meaning as “قَآئِلُونَ”. But “siesta” is a midday or afternoon rest or nap, especially as taken in Spain and Latin America. In other words, the schemata are geographically restricted. A siesta is common in Spain because Spain is a warm country as compared to other European countries in the north of Europe. Thus, “siesta” would be too narrow and “nap” would be too general which means that the translation loss is sometimes inevitable in so far as schemata are concerned. This and many similar expressions are prevalent in the Holy Quran and they need careful handling from a translation point of view.

**Euphemism and schemata**

Euphemism is a substitution for a socially undesirable lexical item to avoid saying an unpleasant or socially offensive word. Euphemism is not only used to avoid prohibited words, but also annoying, unpleasant or religiously unacceptable ones. Obviously, the term "avoid" pops out each time we try to define the term "euphemism" and collocates with it. Generally speaking, euphemistic expressions, in some cases, were a source of losing sight of schemata in the Holy Quran. The following is an example of euphemistic expression:

1. "والقوم الذين من النساء اللاتي لا يزوجونهنّ نكاحاً فليزغن عليهنّ غزّة أن يصنعنّ نباتهنّ على متزوجات بزينة" (الآية 60 من سورة النور)
Such elderly women as are past the prospect of marriage, there is no blame on them
If they lay aside their (outer) garment, provided they make not a wanton display of their beauty
{Surah, 24: 60} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

And as for women past child-bearing
who do not expect wed-lock, it is no sin on
them if they discard their (outer) clothing in
such a way as not to show their adornment.
{Surah, 24: 60} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

As for women past child-bearing, who have no hope of
marriage, it is no sin for them if they discard their (outer)
clothing in such a way as not to show adornment.
{Surah, 24: 60} (Translated by Pickthall)

It can be noted that instead of keeping the schematically euphemistic dimension of the
expression "القواعدد مدن النسدة", some translators use a term which is as offensive as the word
“spinster” which is socially unacceptable in the Arabic and English languages and cultures. The
Quranic expression has a highly euphemistic schema and some translators give as an equivalent
expression with relatively dysphemistic schema. In other words, the schema of the source
language text is sacrificed.

In the Holy Quran, the schemata of those unmarried women are depicted as “sitting
women, and not wishing to marry (of their own choice)”. Those euphemistic cognitive structures
are spoiled and not conveyed. The problem here is that rendering the expression in such a way as
“sitting women, and not wishing to marry” does not, in any way, help the target language reader,
English readers in this context, understand the original message which is a case of euphemism.
The translator of the text is obliged to give explanation to make clear the message. In Arabic,
"القواعد من النساء" is understood for an average speaker to mean “spinster” in the form of
euphemism. The following example illustrates the idea further:

Who guard their modesty, Except with those joined To them in the marriage bond, Or (the
captives) whom
Their right hands possess. For (in their case) they are Free from blame,
{Surah, 23: 5-6} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

5. And those who guard their chastity (i.e.
private parts, from illegal sexual acts)
6. Except from their wives or (slaves)
that their right hands possess, for then,
they are free from blame;
{Surah, 23: 5-6}  
(Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)
And those who guard their modesty
Save form their wives or (slaves) that their right 
**hands possess**, for then they are not blameworthy,
{Surah, 23: 5-6}  
(Translated by Pickthall)

The expression "ما ملكت أيديهم" which literally means (what their right hands own) is used in the original text as a way of avoiding the ugly idea of (slavery). Ironically, all the translators above insist on using the terms that the original text tries to avoid because they are either obsessed with the functional equivalence or because they are unaware of the euphemistic dimension of this usage. They, maybe, are trying to be faithful to the source language the thing that makes them lose sight of the schemata of the word in question. This, however, causes irreversible damage to the coherence of the TLT. The following is Arberry’s (1980) translation of the same verses “And guard their private parts save from their wives and **what their right hands own**”.

Yet, it is true that a translation like "what their right hands own" might sound awkward to a native speaker of English, but using the expression "slaves" or "captives" sounds not only more awkward but also more dysphemistic and taxing on the side of the source language text which intends to euphemize a socially stigmatized cognitive image.

**Language-bound schemata**
Language-bound schemata represent formal linguistic features that coincide, per chance, with content schemata, thus interlocking form and content in aesthetic, subtle ways. Typical examples of language-bound schemata include wordplay and rhyme, which are features that rarely correspond between remote languages such as English and Arabic. Language-bound schemata, we believe, can derive from other semantic phenomena such as synonymy, polysemy (as suggested by Farghal himself), antonymy, etc.; all sense relations and semantically complex words (Farghal, 2004).

**Synonymy and schemata**
In the different translations of the meanings of the Holy Quran synonymy poses a source of mistranslation and translation loss in so far as schemata are concerned. Since there is no such thing as perfect or complete synonyms, synonyms have slightly different schemata. Therefore, the translation loss is inevitable in some cases. Sometimes the idea is totally or partially missing in the target language or mistakenly thought of to be the same as another concept. However, when the translator is aware of this difference in schemata, he/she usually bridges this gap by using a more general word a “superordinate”.

Al-Qinai (2011) suggests that the versatility of Quranic lexemes and styles are not captured in most of the English versions of the Quran. For example, the fine subtleties of Quranic synonymous nuances are best expressed in the words "سنة" /sana/ and "عام" /‘aam/
which are both rendered as ‘year’ despite the fact that "سنة" /sana/ is often associated with suffering, perseverance and agony while "عام" /aam/ is occasionally used in the context of benevolence and good deeds. He also argues that this lexical void in English results in under-translating the implications of the Arabic verse. For example, "سنة" /sana/ is used with a negative sense to imply a long life of misery and affliction that will not benefit those who cling to life. Such examples are many in the Holy Quran and the following is one of them:

"وَمَا أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ مِنْ خَيْلٍ وَلاَ رِكَابٍ وَلَكِنَّ اللَّهَ يُسَلِّطُ رُسُلَهُ عَلَى رَسُولِهِ مِنْهُمْ فَمَا أَوْجَفْتُمْ عَلَى أَفَاءٍ." (الآية 6 من سورة الحشر)

What Allah has **bestowed** on his apostle (and taken away) from them – for this **Ye made no expedition**

With either cavalry or camelry: But Allah gives power To his apostles over Any He pleases. and God

Has power over all things.

{Surah, 59: 6} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

And what Allah **gave as booty (Fai`)** to

His messenger (Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم) from them – for this **you made no expedition** with either cavalry or camelry.

But Allah gives power to His messengers over whomever He wills. And Allah is

Able to do all things.

{Surah, 59: 6} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

And that which Allah **gave as spoil** unto His messenger from them, ye urged not any horse or riding-camel for the sake thereof, but Allah giveth His messenger lordship over whom He will. Allah is Able to do all things.

{Surah, 59: 6} (Translated by Pickthall)

In the abovementioned example, the word (أفاء) /faa`a/ is rendered into "bestowed on", "gave as booty (fai`)", and "gave as spoil" by Abdullah Ali, al-Hilali and Khan and Pickthall respectively. In Arabic we distinguish between "الغنائم" /?anaa`m/ and "فئى" /fai`/ and "قهي" /fai`/ . The two terms are near synonyms, never perfect ones, if there are any. The first one "الغنائم" /?anaa`m/ refers to "spoils" taken in war, of course, after fight. The latter, however, is used to refer to things taken from the disbelievers without fighting. The fighting and force schemata are totally excluded. If one group of people goes to fight another and the other group flees leaving their precious and valuable things behind them, those things are called "قهي" /fai`/ which is derived from the verb "قهي" /faa`a/.

According to Ibn Katheer, (1998), "الفنى" /alfai`/ refers to what is taken from disbelievers without fighting or making expedition with either cavalry or camelry. However, "الغنائم"
/?anaa`m/ according to refers to what is taken from disbelievers with fighting or making expedition with either cavalry or camelry (Ibn Katheer, 1998). In other words, the cognitive structure of the first one is partially different from the second one. The mistranslation, in the case of Pickthall, and the translation loss, in the case of Abdullah Ali, is due to the fact that the translator is either unaware of the difference or because they think that they are complete synonyms. A footnote explaining this cognitive difference between "الغنائم" /?anaa`m/ and "الفيئ" /fai`/ helps though.

Abdullah Ali uses the term "bestowed on", not spoils, which gives the impression that the schema of the original term is different from "الغنائم" /?anaa`m/. Al-Hilali and Khan realize that there is more to the term than taking things in war as spoils, as suggested by Pickthall. Nevertheless, the term makes a culture-bound schema that defies formal equivalence. Using “gave as booty” accompanied by a transliteration, as suggested by al-Hilali and Khan, would be the best solution. Pickthall’s translation does not show any difference between "الغنائم" /?anaa`m/ and "الفيئ" /fai`/ which leads to good amount of translation loss.

**Complex schemata**

Baker (1992) suggests that a single word which consists of a single morpheme can sometimes express a more complex set of meanings than a whole sentence. She provides an example of such semantically complex word is “arruaÇão”, a Brazilian word which means “clearing the ground under coffee trees of rubbish and piling it in the middle of the row in order to aid in the recovery of beans dropped during harvesting” (p. 22). In other words, the schemata of the word conjure up many different images in the mind of the recipient. We can find many examples of semantically complex words which pose a serious challenge for the translators of the meanings of the Holy Quran. Look at the following example:

Those who eschew Evil, And fall not into It’s worship and turn To God (in repentance) For them is good news So announce the good news To my servants.

{Surah, 39: 17} (Translated by Abdullah Ali)

Those who avoid At-Taghut (false deities) by not worshipping them and turn to Allah (in repentance), for them are glad tidings; so announce the good news to My slaves-

{Surah, 39: 17} (Translated by al-Hilali and Khan)

And those who put away false gods lest they should worship them and turn to Allah in repentance, for them there are glad tidings. Therefore give good tidings (O Muhammad) To my bondmen

{Surah, 39: 17} (Translated by Pickthall)
The Arabic word taghut or taaghoot (ar. طاغوت, ṭāġūt, pl. ṭawāġīt) means to "cross the limits, overstep boundaries," or "to rebel." In Islamic theology, the word refers to idolatry or to the worship of anything except Allah. The Arabic taghut is variously interpreted to refer to idols, a specific tyrant, an oracle, or an opponent of the Prophet.

A semantically complex set of meanings are implied in the word "الطاغوت" (attaaaghuuut) than can be contained in a whole sentence or even a long list of things. According to almost all exegeses (interpretations of the Holy Quran), "الطاغوت" (attaaaghuuut) means everything that is worshipped apart from Allah. It could be “a cow”, “the sun”, “an idol”, “a human being”, “Buddha”, “the devil”, “an ant”, or anything imaginable. Ali rendered “taghut” as “evil” but evil restricts and narrows the schemata inherent to the source language word and therefore does not best convey the meaning.

As usual, al-Hilali and Khan transliterate culture and language bound expressions which are, to a large extent, successful because no other translation strategy serves the meaning in a better way. Pickthall translates it as “false deities” which also does not provide us with the full schemata of the original term. Apparently, such semantically complex terms, which are also schematically complex, do not lend themselves to straightforward translation and pose an insurmountable challenge for translators.

Conclusion
In conclusion, it is important to indicate that the translators of the Holy Quran and other authoritative texts cannot provide all the different senses possible of some words because they belong to: culture-bound, culture sensitive, language-bound, euphemism, synonym, and polysemy. However, the context itself allows for many possibilities. More to the point, the translation loss, in some cases, is due to the fact that translators mistranslate some expressions sacrificing the schemata inherent to them and in other cases the translation loss can not have been avoided as languages are different in the way they lexicalize things because, as suggested by Whorf in the introduction to this paper, all observers are not led by the same physical evidence to the same picture of the universe.

About the Authors:
Adnan Abumahfouz is a full-time lecturer of English in the department of English language and literature at Al-Balqa Applied University, Jordan, Salt. He studied English language and literature at the University of Jordan and translation at Yarmouk University. He proceeded to work as a teacher of English and a freelance translator. He is interested in translation studies.

Yasser Al-Shboul is an Assistant Professor in the English Language and Literature Department Al-Balqa Applied University, Salt, Jordan, and holds a Ph.D. of English Language Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities, National University of Malaysia. He is interested in topics related to Sociolinguistics, Sociopragmatics, and Language Acquisition.
The Translatability of Schemata in the Holy Quran

Abumahfouz & Al-shboul

References


A Pragma-stylistic Study of Hybrid Speech Acts in Selected Dramatic Texts

Riyadh Khalil Ibrahim
Department of English, College of Languages
University of Baghdad, Iraq (Corresponding Author)

Khamail Ali Waheeb
Wasit Directorate of Education, Iraq

Abstract
The study is intended to investigate the role of speech act theory (SAT) in understanding dramatic texts through using pragma-stylistic approach. It is also an attempt to examine the stylistic effects of using speech acts (SAs) and their implication in conveying the theme of the play and the intentions of the characters. Therefore, eight extracts are selected from Harold Pinter's Plays: A Night Out and The Birthday party, to be the data of analysis. The analysis reveals that the interaction between stylistics and pragmatics is a vital tool for analyzing dramatic texts in terms of (SAT). SAs are grouped into systematic combination depending on the purpose of the speaker or the playwright. Direct of fit is the most decisive aspect of the combination of some hybrid speech acts. The pragma-stylistics analysis of hybrid (SAs) also reveals the importance of these speech acts in conveying the intended message of the dramatist through the contextual details offered about the characters and events. These details can secure a proper interpretation of the socio-psychological relationships between the characters and the audience of the play.

Keywords: Hybrid speech acts, felicity conditions, pragma-stylistics

Introduction
Stylistics is a branch of linguistics. It is usually defined as the study of style. The concept of style is an old one. It goes back to the very beginning of classical Rhetorics and poetics. It is originally taken from the Latin word (stilus) to mean a short stick made of reed used for writing on boards made of wax (Hough, 1969, p.1).

Throughout its history, stylistics witnessed a great deal of development. This development is a result of the development of linguistic theories and the political changes in society which affect the life and the language of people. Today stylistics is a solid discipline interested in analyzing the language of different texts. Obviously contemporary stylistics is influenced by the late twentieth century development of linguistic studies in discourse analysis, pragmatics and sociolinguistics. Consequently, stylistics adopts a range of concepts and models from these fields. These concepts help stylistics to investigate the interpretive impact of linguistic peculiarities used within literature (Fabb, 2002, p.6).

Scholars like Radford (1997), Simpson (2004), Jeffries and McIntyre (2010) and others maintained that contemporary stylistics is a mature discipline not confined to the analysis of literary texts as it always was. Stylistics involves the analysis of non-literary texts such as scientific, political, legal texts, advertisement, etc.

The latest development of stylistics and its disciplinary nature has led to the emergence of sub-branches; linguistic stylistics, formal stylistics, feminist stylistics, functional stylistics, critical stylistics, pragmatic stylistics and cognitive stylistics (Wales, 2001, p.4). In effect, pragmatic-stylistics is a branch of stylistics which emerged in the 1960s but came to be a focal approach to text analysis during the 1980s and the beginning of the 1990s.

The research problem can be stated thus:
1-How can a pragma-stylistic approach to hybrid speech acts be beneficial in providing a mutual understanding among the playwright, the characters and the audience?
2- How far an eclectic model of analysis (pragmatics and stylistics) can be successful in studying dramatic texts?

To the best of the researchers ’knowledge, there exists rare studies that tackle hybrid speech acts in dramatic texts using a pragma-stylistic analysis, thus this can be an attempt to bridge a gap in the literature.

Research Objectives
The present study aims at:
1- Presenting a comprehensive survey of the available literature on the phenomenon of hybrid speech acts.
2- Applying a pragma-stylistic model of analysis on the dramatic texts to detect the type and the realization of hybrid speech acts used.
3-Giving some conclusions derived from the data analysis and suggesting some studies for future research.
Pragmatic stylistics

Huang (2012) defines Pragmatic stylistics or pragmatic stylistics by stating that it "refers to the application of the findings and methodologies of the theoretical pragmatics to the study of the concept of style in language" (p.19). Stylistics in its analysis to different texts gets use of formal aspects of language, however in analyzing narrative texts and in particular dramatic texts, stylistics makes use of pragmatic theories and strategies to arrive at a comprehensive analysis. Therefore, stylisticians frequently depend on pragmatics theories and discourse analysis in analyzing dramatic texts. Some stylisticians have focused on the dramatic structure of plays as Burton (1980), others have dealt with plays in terms of politeness and other pragmatic theories like Leech (1992), Short (1989) and Simpson (1989), Culpeper (1998, pp.3-4).

Drama is the literary genre that is mostly like real life situations. It largely consists of dialogues and stage directions. Thus, Stylisticians use those areas of linguistic analysis that best developed by linguists to describe face-to-face interaction and to infer meaning in context. Besides, the language of dramatic dialogues is similar to the everyday language of people. In effect, it is acceptable to employ pragmatics and discourse analysis theories and techniques such as SAT to arrive at a better understanding and interpretation of the text and the message which the playwright wants to convey to his audience.

Language as Action

The theory of SAs is one of the basic components of pragmatics for a long time. The concept (SAT) is first introduced by the British philosopher J.L. Austin (1911-1960) in his own lectures at Harvard University. It is initiated as a reaction to many earlier linguistic theories which disregarded language as action. It is based on the assumption that when people say something they do something. This theory has been modified and developed by the American philosopher Searle (1969) in his influential book entitled "Speech Act" (Verschueren, 1999, p.22).

Austin (1962, p.6) distinguishes between two types of utterances: performatives; acts that describe constant information, and constatives; propositions which can be stated positively or negatively; statements of facts which could be either right or wrong. In contrast to constatives, Austin remarks that performative are used not to describe something but to achieve something for instance, to promise is not to state something about the world rather it is to perform the act of promising.

Austin (1962, pp.14-5) proposes certain circumstances and conditions for the utterances to be felicitous calling them the felicity conditions, which demand that there must be an accepted conventional procedure having a certain conventional effect. The persons and circumstances for a certain SA must be appropriate for the invocation of the particular procedure invoked. The procedure must be executed by all participants both correctly and completely. Violation of any of these conditions the SA will be infelicitous. Accordingly, the utterance of the sentence:

I now pronounce you husband and wife.

would be rendered felicitous if it is uttered by a priest to a pair of man and woman in the church, as people all gather for celebrating the wedding ceremony. The whole action must be taken seriously by the participants (priest and the couple); otherwise, the SA of pronouncing would go unhappy (infelicitous). If an act fails to conform to the required conventions, it would be
described as *misfire*, and if it is carried out insincerely by the participants, it would be described as an abuse, (Saeed, 1997, p. 207).

Searle (1969, p. 57), on the other hand, tries to develop the felicity conditions of SAs by postulating the necessary and sufficient conditions for the performance of the SA of "promise" as a typology. He proposes four kinds of conditions which govern the happy performance of an illocutionary act. These conditions are; *Propositional Content Condition* which specifies restrictions on the content of the speaker's utterance expressed in the sentence.

*Preparatory Condition* that determines the real world prerequisites to each illocutionary act,

*Sincerity Condition* that represents the essential beliefs, feelings and intentions of the speaker, being appropriate to the type of illocutionary act in question,

*Essential Condition* that is the constitutive rule which governs the issuance of a certain illocutionary act. These conditions represent the syntactic and semantic rules required for building up an utterance.

Austin, on the other hand, proposes the theory of locutionary, illocutionary and perlocutionary acts. The three levels of action carried by language in parallel: *firstly*, there is the locutionary act which consists of the actual utterance produced by the speaker; *secondly*, there is the illocutionary act, which is the real intended meaning of the utterance; *finally*, there is the perlocutionary act which is the actual effect of the utterance, such as scaring, persuading, encouraging, etc. It is interesting to notice that the locutionary act is a feature of any kind of language, not only natural ones, and that it does not depend on the existence of any actor. In contrast, an illocutionary act needs the existence of an environment outside language and an actor that possesses intentions, in other words an entity that uses language for acting in the outside environment. Finally, a perlocutionary refers to the consequential effects of uttering something on the audience or listener.

To sum up, SA is a significant theory that attracts the attention to the functional side of language. It plays a prominent role in communication as the production and interpretation of utterances in different circumstances depending on the recognition of the acts.

**Speech Act Classification**

Several attempts have been made to classify illocutionary acts into a limited number of types. Austin (1962) distinguishes five different groups of performatives:

1. *Verdictives*, acts that provide findings or judgments, such as estimate, value, assess.
2. *Exercitives*, this class of verbs shows exercise of powers, rights or influences such as order, dedicate, dismiss,
3. *Commissives*, acts of commitment or promises of different kinds or the taking on of an obligation or states an intention such as promise, guarantee, plan, swear and bet.
4. *Behabitives*, SAs involve verbs indicate expressions of attitude and social behavior as congratulate.
5. *Expositives* involve verbs that refer to discussion and argument going by providing different kinds of clarification, such as: ask, assume, concede, and hypothesize.
Searle (1969) further develops a taxonomy. It is an attempt to systematize Austin's theory of SAs, so that he proposes:

1. **Representatives**, *this* class of SAs aims at "committing the speaker (in varying degrees) to something's being the case, to the truth of the expressed proposition.
2. **Directives**, the illocutionary point is to direct the hearer towards doing (or not doing) something.
3. **Commissives**, they are SAs in which the speaker is committed to some future course of action.
4. **Declarations**, this class of illocutions brings into existence the state described in the proposition.
5. **Expressives**, they are SAs that express "the psychological state specified in the sincerity condition about a state of affairs.

Many specialists regard Searle's classification as the most reliable and comprehensive one, however, the theory runs into problems. There are real examples where difficulties lie in determining a single point to the utterance. Such as in:

"I hereby reward you with a golden watch" (expressive + commissive)
"I hereby sell you my car for 400 €." (Commissive + directive hybrid)
"I bet that Black Beauty will win!"—“Ok.” (Hybrid of conditional commitments of hearer and speaker)
"I hereby invite you to our house tonight” (commissive + directive hybrid). (Eckardt, 2010, p.3)

On his article, Hancher (1979) made a comparison between different taxonomies of SAs; Austin (1969), Ohmann (1972), Fraser (1974) and Searle (1976). He compares all these five taxonomies with Searle's taxonomy as a reference standard. He considers Searle's taxonomy as more comprehensive and more economical than other classifications. For him, these taxonomies represent two kinds of illocutionary acts:

Illocutionary acts that combine Commissive with Directive illocutionary force, for example, offering, inviting, challenging.

Illocutionary acts that require two participants, for example, giving, selling, contracting.

He refers to the fact that Searle (1976) identifies in his taxonomy five basic kinds of SAs; Representatives, Directives, Commissives, Expressives and Declarations, in addition to an important sub-class of declarative that is representative-declarative SA. This sub-class is a hybrid speech act. Like any representatives, a representative-declarative involves a truth claim but it also carries the force of declaration. Hancher postulates the following examples; if an umpire rules that the ball was in, the ball is counted as in, even if it was out and was seen to be out by others. Hancher (1979, p.5) sustains his hypotheses by arguing that Ohmann's classification contains a special category which no one else made it that is the category of 'conditionals', it includes the making of contracts which Hancher considers as a prime use of language. Ohmann (1972) considers conditional SA a hybrid speech act that combines influencer (directive) and (commissive).
Conjunctive conditionals are likely to be bargains:
Stay for half an hour, and I'll make you a drink.
Disjunctive conditionals are likely to be threats:
Stop or I'll shoot. (Ohmann, 1972)

Hancher (1979, p. 6) refers to the fact that this combination of directive-commissive is not only found in compound sentences, but also in simple sentences as in invitations and offers as in the following examples:

-Would you like a drink?
-Have a drink.

Offering, bidding, inviting, volunteering and formal challenging are all hybrid SAs that combine directive with commissive illocutionary forces, direct the hearer's behavior and commit the speaker to a certain course of behavior. Accordingly, Hancher contends that speech acts have dual or composite function for which he proposes the notion of “hybrid speech acts”. These acts, he adds cannot be completed without other party’s cooperation vis-à-vis, hearer’s involvement which he labels “cooperative illocutionary act”. Hancher has criticized Searle’s classification of illocutionary acts (1976, p. 11) for neglecting this issue as Searle classifies “Offers” as commissives, because offers do not only require the speaker to honour his/her commitment to the hearer, but also call the speaker to persuade the hearer to accept the offer, hence offers represent a hybrid speech act that combine directive and commissive speech acts. Bach and Harnish (1979) likewise avoid an extensive discussion of hybrids, even though they officially use the term for some mixed cases. However, they sort out interactional SA (buy, sell, lend, borrow, bequest, etc.) as "conventional acts". Conventional acts are, as they say, generally uninteresting because they are interactions defined by social convention, not acts of communication.

Methodological Considerations

The pragmatic analysis of SAs is frequently carried out in linguistic studies. This is essentially accomplished by identifying the types of SAs and their felicity or appropriate conditions. The present study follows this pragmatic analysis. Another type of analysis is provided as well, which is the stylistic analysis of texts. It is intended to deduce the stylistic effects which resulted from using SAs in the selected extracts. The two levels of analysis (i.e.: pragma-stylistics) account for the meaning and interpretation of literary works. Consequently, the pragmatic level of this study involves the following techniques: identifying the type of SAs according to the classification provided by Searle (1969), and Hancher (1979), and analyzing the felicity conditions of their illocutionary acts. Searle's felicity conditions of the successful achievement of the acts are adopted with reference to the hybridity of the conditions of the acts.

The stylistic level of the study accounts for the stylistic aspects of using SAs in drama, their interpretation and effects on the works as a whole. This level of analysis follows Short's model of analyzing SA in dramatic texts. Short (1996, p. 198-204) explains in details examples of stylistic analysis of SAs in dramatic texts to arrive at their interpretation. He claims that the meaning of texts can be understood through the use of SAs. He maintains that the contextual
aspects of the text have a crucial role in analyzing the SAs of the literary text. He, thus focuses on:

1. Investigating the extracts to see if there are any typical kinds of SAs used by the different characters.
2. Examining each SA in turn, and deciding whether it is direct or indirect SAs.
3. Deducing from these information about the characters and their relationships and/or the thematic concern of the text.
4. Explaining the effects of this analysis on the understanding of the whole play and the characters.
5. Examining the perlocutionary effects of the SAs and deciding whether they succeed or fail. If they fail, what the consequences of the failure are?
6. Explaining the effects of this analysis on the understanding of the whole play and the characters.

Data Analysis
For the purpose of the study, eight texts culled from two plays written by Harold Pinter have been chosen; four texts from the Night out play and another four from the Birthday Party (Pinter, 1960; Osberose, 2012). The analysis follows Searle (1969), Hancher (1979), Eckardt (2010), and Short (1996).

A Summary of Night Out Play
Albert Stokes, a loner in his late twenties lives with his emotionally-suffocating mother. He works in an office. After being falsely accused of groping a female at an office party, he wanders the streets until he meets a girl, who invites him to her flat, where he responds to her overtures by angrily demeaning her. Then he returns home to his mother.

Extract No. 1
MOTHER: Albert, you’ll upset me in a minute, you go on like that.
ALBERT: I’m not going on about anything. (Act One, Scene 1)

The Pragmatic Level
a-Identifying the Type of HSA.
The above utterance has a hybrid SA. According to Hancher (1979), it is a conditional SA, hence it is a commissive -directive act.

- The locutionary act of the underlined utterance is uttering conditional sentences in a nervous way.
- The illocutionary act of the underlined utterance is a conditional threat.
- The perlocutionary act is to oblige the addressee to do the act to get the state of affairs.

b- The Felicity Conditions and their Establishment
1. The preparatory Condition: S believes H is able to do A.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: S believes H does not want A to be done.
3. The Sincerity Condition: S is willing to do A.
4. The **Essential Condition**: It counts as an attempt to get H to do A.

c- Establishing SA Conditions

1. **Preparatory Condition**: The mother wants her son to obey her orders as he always does. She believes that he could do that.

2. **Propositional Content Condition**: The mother threatens Albert to obey her order and go down the cellar. If he does not do what she says, he will distress her.

3. **Sincerity Condition**: The mother is willing that Albert obey her.

4. **Essential Condition**: Albert's mother threatens him in an attempt to get him do what she wants.

**The Stylistic Level**

It is a conditional SA. The sentence is extended to be 'you upset me if you don't obey the orders and go on talking that way'. The whole utterance is a conditional threatening. It is a direct SA as she directly commands him to stop talking ridiculously about his grandmother; otherwise she will get angry with him. There is a correspondence between the SAs pattern of the commissive-directive act (threatening) and the conditional compound sentence. On the other hand, one can say the utterance is felicitous in which the mother, as an obsessive character, has the authority over her son and therefore she can order him. The conditions are happily fulfilled. She knows that he will obey her, she is willing to obsess him, she intends sincerely to threaten him as she has used to do when he rejects doing something and the attempt to make him obey her is done. Furthermore, the perlocutionary act of the utterance has succeeded because Albert's response to his mother threatening is that he accepts to stop talking about his grandmother.

Harold Pinter clearly illustrates the dominant character of the mother. He demonstrates the social and power relation between the mother and her son in this play through using a hybrid SA. The playwright tries to show the nature of Albert's character. The implications of the hybrid SA help to understand these stylistic effects.

**Extract No. 2**

**MOTHER**: Your father would turn in his grave if he heard you raise your voice to me. You are all I've got.

**ALBERT**: I'm sorry…. I raised my voice. (Act One, P.4)

**The Pragmatic Level**

a- Identifying the Type of SA: According to Eckardt (2010) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is an expressive-assertive act.

- The locutionary act of the utterance is uttering two declarative sentences in an impressive way.
- The illocutionary act of the utterance is an apologizing act.
- The perlocutionary act is to get the addressee recognize the state of affairs.

b- Felicity Conditions and their Establishment

1. **The Preparatory Condition**: S assumes H is willing that A be done.
2. **The Propositional Content Condition**: a. Any proposition P
3. **The Sincerity Condition**: S wishes A to be done.
4. **The Essential Condition**: It counts as an attempt to make H recognize his wish for A to be done.
C-Establishing SA Conditions
1. The Preparatory Condition: Albert assumes his mother will be happy if he apologizes to her.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: Albert wants to show his mother that he feels sorry for upsetting her.
3. The Sincerity Condition: Albert wishes to apologize.
4. The Essential Condition: The utterance can be accounted as an attempt by Albert to let his mother recognize his regret.

The Stylistic Level
The utterance is a direct SA. It is a hybrid of expressive-assertive SAs. There is a clear correspondence between the SAs patterns and their grammatical structure. Apologizing is expressed in two declarative sentences in which Albert apologizes first and then expresses his regret. Moreover, one can regard this utterance as felicitous. Albert knows his mother well, so he assumes she wants him to apologize. He wants to reconcile his mother; therefore, he apologizes to her. The perlocutionary act succeeds to achieve its intentions as he expresses his regret.

The implication of using this hybrid act is to show the psychological state of Albert. His mother tries to oblige him to stay with her and not to go out. She asks him to bring the blub, asks him to have his dinner, asks her stay and play cards. When she finds that he doesn't listen to her, she tries to possess him emotionally.

Extract No. 3
GIDNEY: I'm talking to this man on behalf of the firm! Unless I get a satisfactory explanation I shall think seriously about recommending his dismissal.
(Act Two, P. 24)

The Pragmatic Level
a-Identifying the Type of SAs: According to Hancher(1979) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is a conditional thereat.
The locutionary act of the utterance is a conditional statement.
The illocutionary act of the utterance is commissive-directive acts.
The prelocutionary act of the utterance is to urge the addressee to do the action.
b-The Felicity Conditions and their Establishment
1. The preparatory Condition: S believes H able to do A.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: S believes H does not want A to be done.
3. The Sincerity Condition: S is willing to do A.
4. The Essential Condition: Accounts as an attempt to urge H to answer, and S is threatening H to do A.
C-Establishing SA Conditions
1. The preparatory Condition: The speaker, Gidney, requests Albert, the hearer, to give explanation to the accusation of insulting his mate, Eileen, on the party. He has the authority over Albert. So he threatens him to recommend his dismissal.
2. The propositional Content Condition: Gidney threatens Albert to let him speak.
3. The Sincerity Condition: Gidney is willing to do so.
4. The Essential Condition: The speaker directs Albert to answer and commits himself to recommend Albert's dismissal as a consequence.

The Stylistic Level

The utterance is said by Gidney who is one Albert's mates on the firm. He hates Albert and tries to get rid of him because he is jealous of him. Gidney tells Eileen to accuse Albert of touching her in the party leading to his dismissal. The utterance is a conditional SA in which the first part of it is a condition for the second part. Though it is not an explicit performative SA, it is a direct one. This utterance is infelicitous that the hearer does not answer his question and give the hearer an explanation.

The stylistic effect of using this hybrid SA by the playwright is intended to show the social relation between the two characters. The utterance also leads the audience to see the hard events which Albert passes through that night.

Extract No. 4

GIRLE: Quite possibly, I admit that with your continuity girls and secretaries, I don't see why you... had to approach me.... Have you been on the town tonight, then? With a continuity girl?
ALBERT: You 're a bet.... Worried about continuity girls, aren't you? (Act Three, p.32)

A- The Pragmatic Level
a-Identifying the Type of hybrid SA. According to Eckardt(2010) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is a commissive-assertive act.
- The locutionary act is uttering declarative sentences.
- The illocutionary act of the utterance is the SA of admitting and asserting.
- The perlocutionary act is to get the addressee to recognize the future course of action.

b- The Felicity Conditions and their Establishment.
1. The Preparatory Condition:
a- It is not obvious to both S and H that H knows (does not need to be reminded of, etc.) A.
b- S believes H is willing to do A.
2. The propositional Content Condition: a-Any proposition P. b- S predicts a future course of action.
3. The Sincerity Condition: a-S wants A to be done. b- S believes A should be done.
4. The Essential Conditions:
It counts as an undertaking to the effect that S represents an actual state of affairs.
c- Establishing SA Conditions:
1. Preparatory Condition:
The girl wants Albert to know that she believes there are many girls in his firm. She believes that Albert wants her to assert this fact.
2. Propositional Content Condition:
The girl expresses her opinion that Albert should have girlfriends. She predicts that he accompanies one of his girlfriends in the town tonight.
3. Sincerity Condition: She is willing to assert her opinion by committing herself to the consequences of her admitting.
4. Essential Condition:
It counts as an attempt by the girl to assert her opinion about the relation between Albert and his girlfriends.

The Stylistic Level
The hybrid SA in the above utterance is commissive-assertive SA. It is an indirect SA, the girl's intention is to assert her opinion about Albert and his girlfriends. She indirectly asks Albert "Why he is alone here at night. A man like him, in his age and in his position, must be with his girlfriend enjoying himself in town". He has many girls working with him, so why he approaches her?

The correspondence between the SAs patterns and the grammatical structure is obvious through the use of declarative and interrogative sentences to represent asserting and questioning SA. The utterance is infelicitous because not all the conditions are satisfied. She assumes that Albert is willing to talk about such subject. However, Albert is so bothered by his co-worker girls at that night. The perlocutionary act of the utterance fails. Albert does not assert her opinion or answer her question. Her talk leads him later on to the consequences of frightening her. This hybrid SA indicates the dimensions of the girl's character as well as Albert's character. She is talking too much just like his mother. Albert, on the other hand, has no social relations with girls. He is an awkward person.

A Summary of the Birthday Party
The Birthday Party is about Stanley Webber, an erstwhile piano player in his 30s, who lives in a rundown boarding house, run by Meg and Petey Boles, in an English seaside town, "probably on the south coast, not too far from London". Two sinister strangers, Goldberg and McCann, who arrive supposedly on his birthday and who appear to have come looking for him, turn Stanley's apparently innocuous birthday party organized by Meg into a nightmare.

Extract No. 5
STANLEY (abruptly): How would you like to go away with me?
LULU: Where?
STANLEY: Nowhere. Still, we could go.    (Act One, P.26)

The Pragmatic Level
a-Identifying the Type of SA
According to Hancher(1979) and Eckardt(2010) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is a commissive- directive act.
- The locutionary act of the above utterance is uttering interrogative sentence to express invitation.
- The ilocutionary act of the above utterance is an inviting act.
- The perlocutionary act of the above utterance is to get the addressee to a future course of action.

b- Felicity Conditions and their Establishment
1. The preparatory Condition: a- H may accept or refuse A.
   b- S assumes H is willing that A be done.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: a-S expresses the proposition of invitation in his utterance. b-S predicates a future act of S.

C- Establishing the SA Conditions
1. The preparatory Condition: Stanley invites Lulu to go with him. He expects she is willing to do that. She may refuse or accept.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: Stanley expresses invitation to Lulu. He expects her to accept.
3. The Sincerity Condition: Stanley wishes her to accept the invitation.
4. Essential Condition: He intends to make Lulu recognize his wish.

The Stylistic Level
The utterance is a direct SA. The correspondence between the SA patterns and their grammatical structure is salient through using the interrogative sentence for invitation. It is felicitous as he wishes Lulu to come with him. He assumes she likes to. Therefore, the conditions are fulfilled. The perlocutoioary act of it fails to achieve its effect when Lulu refuses his invitation.

Stanley is so desperate that morning because he has heard about the two gentlemen. Lulu, his friend, enters and sees his sad appearance. She chats with him and asks him to go out to change his mood. This has led him to think to invite her to go with him anywhere. The utterance counts as an invitation. It is a commissive-directive act. He commits himself to go with her and at the same time directs her to accept or refuse. The stylistic effect of using this utterance says something about the relation between the characters. It also displays the situation and the psychological state of Stanley. He just wants to get out of his conditions.

Extract No. 6
GOLDBERG: But today is different. How are you keeping Mrs. Poles?
MEG: Oh, very well, thank you. (Act One, P. 30)

The Pragmatic Level
a-Identifying the Type of SA.
According to Hancher (1979) the utterance is an expressive-assertive SA
-The locutionary act of the underlined utterance is declarative
-The illocutionary act of the underlined utterance is thanking.
-The perlocutionary act of the underlined utterance is to get the addressee to recognize the state of affairs.
b-Felicity Conditions and their Establishment
1. The Preparatory Condition: S assumes H is willing that A is to be done.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: a-Any proposition P.
b-S expresses the proposition of thanking.
3. The Sincerity Condition: S wishes A to be done.
4. The Essential Condition: It counts as an attempt to make H recognize the state of affairs.
C-Establishing SA Conditions:
1. The Preparatory Condition: Mrs. Poles believes that it is kind of Mr. Goldberg to praise her. Therefore, she thanks him.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: Meg expresses her gratitude to Mr. Goldberg.
3. The Sincerity Condition: She is willing to thank him.
4. The Essential Condition: She tries to make him recognize her gratitude.

The Stylistic Level
The SA is an expressive SA. The utterance is a direct SA. Further, it is felicitous; Mrs. Poles expresses her gratitude to Mr. Goldberg because he praises her. His words have been very nice. Therefore, she wants to thank him. She does not only express her gratitude. The correspondence between the SAs and the grammatical structure is characterized by the declarative sentences. The perlocutionary effect of this utterance succeeds as Mr. Goldberg recognizes her gratitude.

The playwright uses this SA to display the psychological state of the characters, Mrs. Poles and Mr. Goldberg. From the first time he meets her, he praises her. He uses very nice words to flatter her. This is the way he follows to get the information he wants.

Extract NO. 7
PETEY: Well, if he's no better by lunchtime I'll go and get hold of a doctor.
GOLDBERG (briskly): It's all taken care of, Mr. Boles. Don't worry yourself.
(Act Three, P. 73)

The Pragmatic Level
a- Identifying the Type of SA
According to Hancher (1979) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is a commissive-directive SA.
- The locutionary act of the underlined utterance is uttering declarative sentences.
- The illocutionary act of the underlined utterance is a conditional offer.
- The perlocutionary act of the underlined utterance is an attempt to recognize the state of affairs.

b- Felicity Conditions and their establishment
1. The preparatory Condition: a. S believes A should be done.
   b. S is willing to do A.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: S proposes to do A.
3. The Sincerity Condition: S wants A to be done.
4. The Essential Condition: It counts as an attempt to recognize the proposal.

C- Establishing SA Conditions
1. The preparatory Condition: The speaker is Mr. Boles. He thinks that Stanley should be seen by a doctor. He is willing to fetch a doctor for Stanley.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: Petey proposes to do that if Stanley doesn't get better till lunchtime.
3. The Sincerity Condition: Petey wants Stanley to be taken care of
4. The Essential Condition: He attempts to let a doctor see Stanley.

The Stylistic Level
The utterance contains a hybrid SA. It is a direct act. The correspondence between the SA patterns and their grammatical structure is salient through the use of declarative sentences. Further, the utterance is felicitious that all the conditions are satisfied. Mr. Poles tries to help
Stanley. He offers to bring a doctor for him if he does not get better soon. The perlocutionary act of the utterance fails since the offer has been politely refused.

Goldberg tells Petey that Stanley is so sick; he has got a nervous breakdown because of the birthday party. Petey proposes to fetch a doctor to see Stanley if he doesn't get better before lunchtime. The stylistic effect of using this conditional SA is to show the way Goldberg deals with the events. It also manages to show the psychological state of Petey.

Extract No. 8

GOLDBERG (violently): Up? I thought you weren't going to go up there again?
MCCANN: What do you Why not?
GOLDBERG: You said so.
MCCANN: I never said that.
GOLDBERG: NO?
MCCANN (from the floor, to the room at large): Who said that? I never said that! I'll go up now.

(Act Three, P. 77)

The Pragmatic Level

a-Identifying the Type of SA
According to Hancher (1979) the utterance has a hybrid SA. It is a commissive-directive act.
- The Locutionary Act of the underlined Act is uttering interrogative and declarative sentences in a challenging tone.
- The Illocutionary Act of the underlined utterance is Challenging SA.
- The Perlocutionary Act of the underlined utterance is to recognize the state of affairs
b-Felicity Conditions and their Establishment
1. Preparatory Condition: a. H has the ability to do A.
   b. H would not do A in the usual course of action.
2. The Propositional Content Conditions: S wants H to do A.
3. The Sincerity Condition: H is willing to do A.
4. The Essential Condition: It counts as an attempt to undertake A.
C-Establishing SA Conditions:
1. The Preparatory Condition: Mccann believes that he doesn't say that he wouldn't go up. He tries to make Goldberg believes he doesn't say that. Therefore, he challenges him.
2. The Propositional Content Condition: He wants to prove that he can do it.
3. The Sincerity Condition: Mccann wishes Goldberg to believe that he doesn't say these words. Therefore, he obliged to do it
4. The Essential Condition: It is an attempt to get Goldberg believes that he doesn't say these words.

The Stylistic Level

The utterance is a hybrid SA. It is a commissive-directive act. At the same time, the utterance is direct SA. It is felicitous because Mccann goes up and he says so to prove that he can do it. The perlocutionary act of the utterance succeeds because McCann goes up and brings Stanley. After the birthday night, Goldberg sympathizes Stanley after his bad condition. He gets
McCann to be nervous and says he would go up. McCann denies that and questions Goldberg to prove that.

The utterance is intended to illustrate the psychological state of Goldberg. Firstly, he seems to be a dominant character. He is confident of himself and his mission. Yet, here his state is changed, he doesn't want McCann to go up and bring Stanley.

Conclusions and Suggestions for Future Research

The study finds out that the interaction between stylistics and pragmatics is a vital tool for analyzing dramatic texts in terms of SAT. The application of SAs can support the analysis of dramatic texts and demonstrate the functions of their words and acts. It has been found that hybrid SAs are an essential category of SAs. They are grouped in systematic combinations depending on the purpose of the speaker or the playwright; they may demonstrate the state of action or affairs, then give a request and the like, direction of fit is the most decisive aspect of the combination of some hybrid SAs such as commissive-directive SAs; since the direction of fit for the two categories is to change the world to fit the words.

The stylistic analysis of SAs and hybrid SAs points out that the use of these acts is so important in conveying the intended message of the playwright in that they afford details about the characters and events. The implication of these SAs in dramatic texts provides the analyst with contextual details about the message which the playwright wants to convey to his audience. These details can secure a proper interpretation to these texts. As the case with other types of SAs, the application of hybrid speech acts can illustrate stylistic effects and purposes such as the psychological state of the characters, the dimensions of the character's personality and social and power relations among characters.

A number of future studies can be thus:
1- A similar study can be conducted, but this time on either fictional or narrative texts.
2- A pragmatic study of hybrid speech acts in media interviews deserves an investigation.

About the Authors:

Riyadh Khalil Ibrahim: is a professor of English language and linguistic. He is interested in the fields of pragmatics, stylistics, semantics, and literary theory. He has been teaching English for 25 years to undergraduate and post-graduate students.

Khamail Ali Waheeb: is an MA holder in English language and linguistics. She is currently working at Wasit Directorate of Education in Iraq.

References


Osberose, St. (2012). *Harold Pinter: A Night Out*.


Ecofeminism in Doris Lessing’s *Mara and Dann: An Adventure*

Najla R. Aldeeb
Language Center, Batterjee Medical College
Jeddah, Saudi Arabia

Abstract
Doris Lessing's *Mara and Dann: An Adventure* (1999) is a fantasy novel with focus on nature. Lessing portrays a world in which oppression by a male-dominated society is at the root of countless problems. It depicts the effects of global warming in the future emphasizing that the domination of women is the core of all crises in the environment. The novel implies that women are able to lead as most of the female characters in the novel play the role of the leader starting from Daima, the woman who protects Mara and Dann as children, to Orphne the woman who heals Dann from addiction. Applying Greta Claire Gaard’s (1993) principles of ecofeminism to literature classifies and justifies the cause of the movement (p. 20). This paper sheds light on Gaard’s four types of ecofeminism in Lessing’s *Rama and Dann: An Adventure*: liberal, culture, social and socialist by discussing the apocalypses, patriarchal legacy, pathetic fallacy and radical orthodoxies as features of ecofeminism.

Key words: apocalypses, ecofeminism, pathetic fallacy, patriarchal legacy, radical orthodoxies

Introduction
Doris Lessing's *Mara and Dann: An Adventure*, published in 1999, is a winner of the Nobel Prize for Literature. The novel is difficult to be classified into one category, which endows it with one of the characteristics of postmodernism. Gendusa (2014, p. 135) categorizes Lessing's *Mara and Dann* as an adventure not only because the word “adventure” is written in the title but also because the novel represents the heroine's quest. Wilson (2013) categorizes it as a “ustopic text, a combination of utopian and dystopian … [it] satirizes civilizations of past, present, and future while revealing multicultural greediness and blindness” (p. 3). Sperlinger (2017) states that Lessing's *Mara and Dann* is a didactic story teaching the reader about the connectedness between humans and nature (p. 300). It is perceivable from the novel that humans, males and females, are able to develop if they believe in the ecofeminist philosophy as the main solution for having a better world.

The impossibility to pin down a work into a single category and the combination of many techniques are two of the strongest hints of postmodernism. Setting the novel in the deteriorated Africa, "Ifrik", in the distant future reflects the author's prediction of the degradation of the future. Nevertheless, there is still hope in the future by making the hero and heroine able to reach their destination. The link between women's suffering and the worsening of the environment gives the novel an ecofeminist reading.

This paper discusses Mara and Dann’s apocalyptic world with its significant social and environmental problems. It also deliberates the patriarchal legacy which makes men superior to women and form women’s stereotype. The paper examines the link between women, men, birds, trees and other elements of nature in the novel and analyses the personification of birds and trees as a style of pathetic fallacy. Challenging the orthodoxies in the novel is another form of corruption; the novel gives an indirect message that violating the rules of nature can affect not only humans but also nature.

Ecofeminism Definition
The term *ecofeminism* was coined in 1974 by “the French writer Francoise d'Eaubonne, who called upon women to lead an ecological revolution to save the planet” (Merchant, 1992, p. 184). It is a combination of the prefix *eco-* and the noun *feminism*. According to Davis (1992), the prefix *eco-* represents ecology and is derived from the Greek word *oikos*, which means *family, family's property, or house*, in other words, the Earth (p. 290). Consequently, the term ecofeminism indicates a connection between household and the Earth. This connection is established by women, because they can preserve their houses and the planet Earth (Sandilands, 1999, p. 4).

Merchant (1992) describes ecofeminism as a natural theory that links women to nature and emphasizes the role of each creature including women. She discourages the dominance of men on women, and encourages serene concord and ecological understanding among all living things on Earth. Merchant states that there are four types of ecofeminism: liberal, cultural, social and socialist. Liberal ecofeminism facilitates positive changes in the government and state affairs. Cultural ecofeminism shifts the concept of women and nature in society and endeavors to correct the stereotypes of women and the nature. Social ecofeminism fosters equality for all living things on Earth including nature in order to establish harmony in the world. Finally,
socialist ecofeminism condemns Western philosophy and its capitalist activities; also, it calls for a revolution to save the environment.

Although some scholars consider ecofeminism as a theory, others classify it as a philosophical movement that calls for eliminating all forms of injustice, including injustice against women and the environment. Ortner (1974) compares women to nature arguing that both are raped by the male rule (pp. 67-87). In other words, women and nature are both oppressed by the patriarchal society. Thus, ecofeminism is a green movement which urges women to see their similarities with nature and to protect it for the coming generations.

**Ecofeminist Principles**
The principles of ecofeminism show that it is a green philosophy as it requests social changes. The first principle is the reformation of all systems in the society, so the movement raises awareness to promote these changes. Another principle is enhancing sympathy towards all creatures not only women. Ecofeminism calls for eliminating all forms of divisions like male/female or culture/nature. Also, the movement assumes that banning all forms of oppression and exploitation can be achieved if authority is distributed equally in the society (Gaard, 1993, p. 20).

**Ecofeminism in Lessing’s *Mara and Dann***
Mara and Dann live in the distant future, on Earth thousands of years from now. The novel fantasizes the Ice Age as a result of the ecological voracity of today's society, causing fatal drought to the Southern land of "Ifrik,". In the Author’s Note, Lessing writes: “*Mara and Dan* is a reworking of a very old tale …. It is set in the future, in Africa …. (it is) an attempt to imagine the consequences might be when the ice return” (pp. vii-viii). The whole place is afflicted by significant natural disasters: the center has nonstop drought and the northern part is permanently covered by a coat of ice. Mara and Dann are respectively seven and four when they become orphans, so they are brought to a place called The Rock Village and looked after by Daima, a female character. A few years later they begin their epic journey from the centre of Ifrik to its northern part where there is more water and consequently more food. Throughout their journey, Mara and Dann have to fight in order to survive; they encounter all kinds of primitive peoples who live in very poor conditions.

**Social Ecofeminism**
According to Gaard (1993), social ecofeminism is the result of feminist movements in various areas including politics and labor. It seeks to end oppression and to develop equality highlighting the idea that equality cannot be accomplished unless there is harmony in the world. Achieving this harmony requires the collaboration of males and females because the degradation of the environment affects women and then their children, which in turn affects men (pp. 9-12). The principles of social ecofeminism are demonstrated in Lessing’s *Mara and Dann* in its apocalyptic world with its serious future damage and destruction: “All around was this enormous, flat country covered with grass, a yellow dying grass …. Fish were dying in the water, which was hardly enough to cover them” (p. 10).

People in this world live in semi-tribal colonies and behave aggressively. They lose contact with all scientific knowledge and they lack any familiarity with culture or art. Some
cities were splendid, but now they are either destroyed or submerged by floods. The unfriendly nature makes it difficult for people to inhabit the center of Ifrik as there are giant spiders, water dragons, enormous lizards and huge beetles which can bisect and divide a child with their pincers. The novel depicts a frightening vision of the future of our planet. It raises awareness of nature in which everything is vital; thus, Lessing plays the role of an ecofeminist and calls for social change, which must be made by all members of the society.

The novel also illustrates the interconnectedness of women and nature. Corruption is rampant in all the societies encountered by Mara and Dann. In every stop the siblings face a natural disaster: drought, flood, or change in climate. The more the female characters are oppressed, the more aggressively nature responds. In the first journey, which is from the Rock village to Chelops, Mara disguises to be a boy, which emphasizes the idea of the patriarchal society and the oppression of women. She knows that achieving recognition and surviving necessitates changing her identity and wearing boys’ clothes:

she felt the knife blade sliding over the bones of her skull and saw the horrible lumps falling into the sand. She kept quiet still for fear of being cut …. Her head was as smooth and shiny as a bone or a nut. (p. 83).

Disguising as a boy is the only way to protect herself in a society dominated by men as women are marginalized. One of Gaard’s principles of social ecofeminism is that humans should serve nature and reserve the natural differences and ecological balance (Gaard, 1993, p. 20). In her novel, Lessing plays the role of a social reformer who preaches people saying indirectly that there is no possibility for women to be free and the ecological crisis to be solved in a society full of oppression.

**Socialist Ecofeminism**

Carlassare (2000) argues that socialist feminists are committed to reveal the causes of oppression and domination and they incorporate the Marxist feminism. Women receive less payment than men and serve as outlets to male frustration through violence and rape (pp. 89-106). Socialist feminism also scrutinizes the role of the family in the oppression of women. Lessing’s *Rama and Dann* illustrates women’s systematic oppression through highlighting the patriarchal legacy and emphasizing the role of women as incubators. This ideology is engraved in childhood by family members.

In Charad, Mara becomes a spy. She is kidnapped to be a "breeder". The theme of breeding reflects the submission of women. Women are considered incubators in all societies. Again Mara pretends to be a man and wears soldier clothes. The motif of disguising as a boy also shows neglecting women in the African society. Mara is discovered and taken to another house for females. The Mahondi mistress Ida always loses children in pregnancy. Mahondis set a rule that men can marry two women to have more children; nevertheless, the babies die of hunger. To have more children, they set another rule that men can marry three women. They do not care about women’s feelings. They ignore women's refusal. Mara gets married to Meryx, the son of the tribe’s chief. Mara escapes for survival because of poverty and infertility in Chelops. However, in Goidel she is arrested and dealt with as a breeder: “Well, you must go back to prison. If your husband does not claim you within a week, then you will go to the breeding
programme” (p. 224). She gives “the two women gaolers” (p. 225) two gold coins and asks them for abortion to hide her fertility; otherwise, she is exploited in a materialist world that deals with women as possessions.

When Dann becomes addicted to "the poppy", he gambles Mara away on a roll of the dice; this action demonstrates dealing with women as objects with no feeling or voice. Having no voice is one of the elements feminism deals with, and it is supported by ecofeminism or the oppression of the environment. Women and nature are injured concurrently by patriarchal dominance. Lessing portrays a world in which oppression by a male-dominated society is at the root of countless problems.

**Cultural ecofeminism**

Cultural ecofeminists believe that women are associated with the environment; hence, they are sensitive to nature. The link between women and nature is clear in Lessing’s use of pathetic fallacy, “a literary term for the attributing of human emotion and conduct to all aspects within nature. It is a kind of personification that is found in poetic writing when, for example, clouds seem sullen, when leaves dance, when dogs laugh, or when rocks seem indifferent” (Abrams & Harpham, 2012, p. 269). In pathetic fallacy, the writer ascribes the human feelings of his or her characters to inanimate objects or non-human phenomena surrounding them in the natural world.

In *Mara and Dann*, Lessing depicts the thirst that Mara feels as the thirst that all inanimate creatures around Mara feel. In describing the bird, the narrator says, "It was so thirsty: Mara could feel the dryness of its mouth in her own" (12). Mara sees the bird "so weak" because she is weak. As Mara is thinking of water, she imagines, "These thirsty trees must have been thinking of all that water rushing past, just over the ridge, but they could not get to it" (18). Throughout the novel, Mara attributes whatever she feels to either animals, birds, or plants in nature.

The cultural ecofeminism movement aims at changing the stereotypes of women and nature. (Carlassare, 2000, pp. 89-106). It seeks spiritual, personal, and material changes. For instance, it endeavors to end capitalism. Kira exemplifies oppressed women who seek social transformation. She is an orphan from an inferior branch. She has been taken into the kin as a child, but she has never felt part of the kin. This shows the hierarchy in society. When Mara meets Kira, the latter is one of the wives of the Mahondi chief, but she has escaped, leaving her baby to Ida. She feels marginalized and ignored not only by men, especially her husband, but also by the other women in the society. She gets married to a black man, which shows that she is plagued by being a woman and being poor; she is doubly marginalized. Kira falls in love with Dann, but she prefers her "nice little house, life and poppy" (p. 219). Her insistence on continuing with the black man reflects her need for a safe place to live in.

Another feature of cultural ecofeminism is the change of values and the revolution against the systems. Lessing challenges the orthodoxies; she contends the bond of sister and brother and the institution of marriage. Although the story shows the strong relationship between the sister and brother, Mara and Dann, some events show that Dann is hard and selfish especially when he eats all the food without leaving anything to his sister. When they go to Bilma, a large trading and powerful city, but not the main city of the North Lands, Daulis helps Mara by marrying her on paper and paying mother Dalide.

In Bamila, Mara discovers the new Dann, the real Dann, her enemy. Mara sees him coming along the street with Bergos and a new
man, a Mahondi. The three men sit down at a table well away from her, but she knows Dann has seen her and is pretending not to. He asks Mara to give him her money. He gambles away everything and loses his money. He gambles Mara, as if he were possessing her, and they leave Bilma to go to Kanaz, a cold place. In Tundra, she becomes sick and she dreams of Daima, Crethis, the Rock Village.

Mara and Dann find an isolated house where Felissa and Felix live. They tell Mara and Dann that they are the last princess and prince from the Royal family. They tell them that their real names were Princess Shahana and Prince Shahmand. They tell them that they have to marry to get children and rule Ifrik again. Mara considers them insane as it is against nature to have children from Dann. When she finds Dann tempted to do what Felix asks him, she asks him, "Dann, are you going to rape me?" She reminds him that he gambled her in Bilma. She tells him that he would not make her a prisoner but the other Dann would. This incident shows Dann's willingness to break the bond of sister and brother; again near the end of the story he goes back to this desire. He asks, "Mara, why can't we be together? We ought to be together … But now you've got Shabis" (403).

Another feature of cultural ecofeminism is the change in the relationship between the husband and wife; it is not respected or considered something sacred any more. This is revealed in the stories of betrayal that Larissa gives. The first one is about a woman called Mam Bova who hates her husband and tries to seduce a handsome youth who rejects her, so she takes poison and dies. The second story is about a beautiful, powerful woman called Ankrena who similarly hates her husband and leaves him for a handsome soldier and commits suicide by throwing herself under a machine, "running on a parallel rail, but this vehicle lacked freedom of movement and was soon superseded by ancient versions of the skimmer" (p. 166). The third story was about Mam Bedfly, who was a young female slave, who falls “in love with a sailor from across the sea” (p. 166). Since they do not comprehend the notions of sea, ocean, and ships, she feels abandoned, and kills herself. Lessing revolts against some behaviors through some love stories. The old myth about a girl called Jull and a boy called Rom, modelled on Shakespeare’s Romeo and Juliet, who are from different clans, shows that even the meaning of love has changed. Jull and Rom fall in love and kill themselves because the clan disapproves. Another story illustrates the corruption and the changes of norms. A young girl wants to marry a handsome young man instead of an old rich man chosen by her father, but instead of killing herself, she is imprisoned forever in a temple. The ecofeminist movement shows that the unexpected becomes the norm in a corrupted world. The last story is that of a famous singer called Toski who befriends a young man escaping from the police because he is intriguing against an unjust king. In exchange for the promise of freedom for the young hero, Toski sleeps with the Chief of Police, but he betrays her, and the famous singer kills herself. This story shows the unethical world that does not respect any relationships or systems. Challenging the orthodoxies in the novel is a double-edged weapon. It demonstrates the corruption of the society, and it implies the necessity to go back to the radical orthodoxies because all people who break the bonds in the novel are punished. This is an implication that these relationships are sacred and should not be challenged. It is a warning against violating the rules of nature.
Liberal ecofeminism

Tong (1989) defines liberal feminism as women’s ability to preserve their equivalence through their own activities and choices to correct the belief that women are, inherently, incapable physically and mentally (pp. 1-5). Merchant’s (1992) view of liberal ecofeminism is that nature is a partner and people should have sympathy with nature as well as with other individuals. Humans should not show discrimination and care about each other regardless of sex or class. She encourages mutual respect, and calls for changes in the government and state systems.

Lessing’s *Mara and Dann* discusses the corruption of the government and people who have power, and this is the main reason of Mara’s escape. Han, the old woman, who owns the boat they take from Majab, is the navigator. She is so tough and aggressive that Mara thinks she looks like an animal. She demands another fee from them all, and their hatred seemed to feed her. When refugees attack the boat, she throws them bread over which they fight. In Charad the soldiers attack the boat, and she is “knocked down and disappeared among scuffling, kicking and stamping feet” (p. 238). She is killed by the soldiers and her money bags are scattered. Mara dives forward and snatches one up and then returns to her place so fast. In the Tundra, Mara sees sun traps not working and says, "if Han were still alive, she could probably make them work again. She was the last person to know the secret" (p. 230). Han’s death reflects the elimination of the evil, which asserts the necessity of hope.

*Mara and Dann* can be read as a political novel; it has one of the elements of liberal ecofeminism as it comments on the sins and foibles of governments and systems. It depicts the negative impact of corrupt rulers: war, slavery, sexism, and racism. Mara’s affliction is because of a power struggle in her family. The struggle over who rules causes the separation between seven-year-old Mara and her younger brother Dann. Mara ferociously cares for her brother in a remote village of neo-Neanderthals. The corruption of rulers and systems result in the siblings’ hardships: Dann becomes addicted to "the poppy" and gambles Mara away on a roll of the dice; Mara works as a spy and is kidnapped to be a "breeder."

Conclusion

Ecofeminism is a movement that has many perspectives; it is an attempt to restore the pure, natural environment and fair way of living by raising awareness of the consequences of oppressing women and destroying the environment. Its main principle is that human beings are connected with all creatures in nature, so it promotes the significance of abolishing any harm against people or the environment. Ecofeminism links the oppression of women to the oppression of nature.

Adamson et. al. (1988) state that socialist ecofeminists suggest cooperation as a solution because it empowers humans to gain their rights. They agree with social ecofeminists that equality paves the way to achieve harmony in the world. However, cultural ecofeminists seek to change the stereotypes of women and nature by eliminating the patriarchal legacy (Carlassare, 2000, pp. 89-106). They agree with liberal ecofeminists that equality between men and women can be accomplished through political reform, if women lead and have a role in governments.

As a postmodern novel, Lessing’s *Mara and Dann* depicts the social, socialist, cultural, and liberal ecofeminism since it reveals social, political, and ecological complications. The novel
challenges the stable ideologies and systems such as the bond of sister and brother and the institution of marriage. It relates all human and nature conflicts to practicing oppression and challenging the rules of nature. The novel implies that women’s oppression, corrupt governments, and many other environmental problems can be solved if authority is distributed equally in all societies.

About the Autor
Najlaa Aldeeb is an English Language Lecturer and researcher. She works for Batterjee Medical College. She has twenty years of experience in teaching ESL. Ms. Najla has an MA in English Literature and an MSc in Translation Studies. She is a DELTA holder. Her research interests include college academic writing, Feminist literary criticism and translation studies. She has participated in national and international conferences. Her last paper was presented in 21st International Conference on Learning, New York, USA.

References
Literary Translation Teaching/Learning as a TRI-PHASE PROCESS:  
Case Study: Arabic-English and English-Arabic Translation of Novels

Mohammed MEDIOUNI  
English Section, King Fahd School of Translation,  
Abdelmaleek Essaadi University, Tangier, Morocco

Abstract
The aim of the present work is to demonstrate a tri-phase method for teaching literary translation. The first pre-translation phase consists in introducing the author, his/her works, style and the text to be translated. The second phase, the translation proper, is divided into three sub-phases: (a) the identification of problems (connotative meanings, figures of speech, idioms, uncommon collocations, culture-bound items, ...), (b) the treatment of these problems by opting for the adequate procedures which should be in tune with the overall translation strategy opted for, and (c) the translation of the whole text into the target language. The final third phase is of revision and assessment. The criteria to be taken into consideration are genre-related and the focus is on the stylistic match or mismatch between the source and target texts. The present process-oriented method of literary translation is illustrated through three in-class translations of three literary texts from Arabic into English and vice versa. The targeted students are enrolled in the Master of Translation Science and Linguistics during Fall-Semester 2017 at the Faculty of Humanities at the University Abdelmalek Essaadi. The study concluded that literary translation should be taught as a creative tri-phase process throughout which students are made fully aware of the significance and impact of the strategies they opt for in order to deal with the different literary translation problems and attain the perfect stylistic equivalence so aspired for by literary translators.

Keywords: literary translation, translation procedure, translation process, translation strategy, translation problems, translation teaching

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.7
1. Research Review

It is traditional to start a work, be it on literary translation or on any other subject, with the definition of terms. However, concerning our object of study; ‘literary translation’, such enterprise may be hazardous and not that easy. Even if we refer to the primary source of translation studies, Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies, we have to content ourselves with the circular definition, “literary translation is the translation of literary works” (Bush, 2001, p. 127). Such truism, if we borrow the word used by the author of the article, exhibits the intricate nature of the concept and the slippery genre of ‘literary translation’. In another article entitled ‘literary translation research’ in the same encyclopedia, Lambert (2001) underlines the different approaches to literary translation research and mentions for example the function or norm-oriented studies, such as Toury, (1980, 1995) and the descriptive studies like Even-Zohar (1978) or Bassnet (1993).

This latter, for example, explains at outset of her third chapter, 

In this third section I propose, therefore, to approach the question of the translation of literary works through a close analysis of examples, not so much to evaluate the products but rather to show how specific problems of translation can emerge from the individual translators’ selection of criteria” (Bassnet, 1980, p. 82).

The identification of translation problems is not the whole, but part of the translation process. A more comprehensive process-based approach to literary translation was shortly explained by Bush (2001). According to him, the translator of literary works first “confronts words set on the page in a certain context and with particular resonances” (Bush, 2001, p. 128) and second “creates new patterns in a different language based on personal readings, research and creativity.” (Bush, 2001, p. 129) Between these two moves, falls a phase during which “thousands of decisions, large and small” are made and a “creative activity” is embarked upon.

Preference for teaching translation as a process has been voiced by many translation theorists and instructors in many writings. Think Aloud Protocol (TAP) is a case in point, as students are required to verbalize their process of translation so as to identify its phases and disclose the problems they face and the solutions they opt for. According to Jaaskelainen, (2001), the aim of TAP is “to gain better understanding of the psychological and linguistic mechanisms involved in the activity of translating.”(p. 266) This TAP model was substituted with ‘Integrated Problem and Decision Report’ (IPDR) in the sequential model of Gile (1984, 2009). The model is bi-phase as it is based on the assumption that the translation process comprises two main phases: comprehension and reformulation. Each of the two comprises further moves or sub-phases, namely: (a) working out the meaning hypotheses, (b) checking for plausibility (in the first phase), (c) reverbalizing and (d) checking for editorial acceptability (in the second phase). Throughout the whole process, prominence is given to the linguistic or extra-linguistic knowledge acquired either before the translation process or on the spur of the moment (by ad hoc knowledge acquisition) and which enables the translator to make sense of the text and formulate the target text adequately. The pertinence of this model cannot be questioned especially in the first period of training. According to Gile (2009),

The desirability of optimization is one good reason for adopting a process-oriented approach in at least the first part of Translator training. The idea is that in the classroom, trainers should focus on the Translation process, not on the end product. More specifically,
rather than giving students texts to translate or speeches to interpret, commenting on the translations produced by saying what is ‘right’ and what is ‘wrong’, suggesting appropriate solutions and counting on the accumulation of such indications to guide trainees up the learning curve, in the process-oriented approach, trainers attempt to identify problems in the process followed by the students, raise their awareness of problems and suggest good Translation principles, methods, and procedures.

(Gile, 2009, p. 14)

It is worth mentioning that this process-oriented approach has been advocated and demonstrated in the field of translation teaching by many other scholars and researchers (See for example Delisle (1980), Bastin (2009), Davies & Scott-Tennent (2005), Hanelore Lee-Janhke (2005), Mediouni (2016) but not in the sub-field of literary translation.

To the belief and knowledge of Kuhiwczak, (2003, p. 112), there has been only one attempt to approach literary translation from the training perspective, and it has been made by Salmon-Kovasky from Bologna University. Her model is textually based in the sense that it classifies texts into three main types: (a) highly specified texts, (b) literary texts characterized with the use of high-degree conventional forms (1) and (c) literary texts (2) written in the language of literature (stylistically complex). As explained by Kuhiwczak (2003), this model focuses mainly on literary texts from the structural perspective and seeks to identify the salient stylistic features and the problems they may pose to the detriment of the process. Kuhiwczak (2003) says ‘it does not explain what happens when we translate.” What it tells instead is that “the difficulty to translate is related to the complexity of the text,’ (Kuhiwczak, 2003, p. 117). This leaves ample room for research on literary translation in the context of translation training. The present work seeks to provide an answer to the problem raised by Kuhiwczak (2003) at the end of his article: “what is exactly happening when we translate (literature)?’ More precisely it aims at demonstrating how a tri-phase process based approach can be adopted in literary translation teaching and learning.

2. Tri-phase Approach to Literary Translation Teaching: Introducing the method

The aim of the present work is to demonstrate a tri-phase method for teaching literary translation. The first pre-translation phase consists in introducing the author, his works, style and the text to be translated. An emphasis is put on the particularity of literary translation as a process which starts even before translation per se with the selection of the text to be translated. According to Venuti (2005), “strategies of translation involve the basic tasks of choosing the foreign text to be translated and developing a method to translate it.”(p. 240) The selection of the work to be translated implies a process of researching the author and his works before embarking upon the translation task. Any piece of literary work is intimately related to its author and anchored on its micro and macro socio-cultural contexts. This finds its explanation in the nature of literature as a piece of “writing which expresses and communicates thoughts, feelings and attitudes toward life,’ (Rees, 1973, p. 2). In other words literature (to use Hamlet’s phrase) ‘holds the mirror up to nature’ (cited in Rees, 1973, p. 2). It should be life enhancing’ or (as Mathew Arnold said of poetry) ‘a criticism of life” (Rees, 1973, p. 5). It follows then that without reading and re-reading about the author, his style, his work, his period and its intellectual trends, etc., the translation cannot be successful. There are even those who advocate a pre-translation intensive critical reading with the aim to achieve a kind of empathy with the author. It suffices to mention here the father of English poets, John Dryden (1631–1700) who confessed overtly and covertly in the preface of his
translation of Ovid’s epistles that before proceeding with the translation, he had read intensively and critically about the author who was of the same “genius” and whose works were within easy reach. He said:

Yet, not to speak too partially in his behalf, I will confess, that the Copiousness of his Wit was such, that he often writ too pointedly for his Subject, and made his persons speak more Eloquently than the violence of their Passion would admit; so that he is frequently witty out of season: leaving the imitation of Nature, and the cooler dictates of his Judgment, for the false applause of Fancy. Yet he seems to have found out this Imperfection in his riper age:

(John Dryden, 1631–1700)

In this pre-translation phase, students are requested to conduct research in order to know more about the author and his work(s). A power point presentation is given featuring the salient elements about the author and his works and discussed in group. More attention is granted to the literary work to be translated. Based on the contextualizing elements provided in the presentation, a translation strategy is opted for. A distinction is made between the translation strategies which concern the whole work and the translation procedures or techniques which are applied to the short segments of text. According to Newmark (1988), “While translation methods relate to whole texts, translation procedures are used for sentences and the smaller units of language.” (p. 81). Under the first category fall dichotomies like domestication / foreignization, semantic translation / communicative translation, formal equivalent / dynamic equivalence, free translation / literal translation. If the translator opts for instance for foreignizing a work, he will tend to resort to ‘literal translation’, ‘calque’ and ‘borrowing’. For an Arabic culture-bound word like ‘حمام’, the translator will borrow and transliterate it ‘hammam’ instead of providing its functional equivalent ‘the baths’. Irrespective of the taxonomy opted for, the student-translator should be aware of the pertinence and adequacy of the translation strategy and procedures to the text, its macro and micro contexts.

The second phase, the translation proper, is divided into three activities: (a) reading the work and identifying the potential translation problems (i.e., connotative meanings, metaphors, similes, hyperbole, idioms, uncommon collocations, culture-bound items, etc.), (b) treating these problems by opting for the adequate procedures which should be in tune with the overall translation strategy opted for, and (c) translating the whole text into the target language. The concept of translation as a problem identification and solving process has been intensively debated since some historical treatises and prefaces of translations. More recently, according to Davies and Tennent (2005, p. 163), a five-phase sequence approach can be adopted in translation teaching. It comprises:

1. General approach (the selection of specific macro and micro decisions)
2. Problem spotting
3. Brainstorming and choosing strategies
4. Brainstorming and choosing procedures
5. Choosing a final solution
Davies and Tennent (2005) define translation problem as “a (verbal or non verbal) segment that can be present either in a text segment (micro-level) or in the text as a whole (macro-level) and that compels the student-translators to make a conscious decision to apply a motivated translation strategy, procedure and solution from amongst a range of options” (p. 164). It is worth noting here that for pedagogical purposes the five stages can be reduced to three with the aim to highlight the necessity to discriminate between the pre and post translation phases. It is worth adding here that literary translation problems are more acute, compared with the type of problems tackled by the two above-mentioned authors. According to Burgess (1974, p. 7), “literature may be defined as words working hard; literature is the exploitation of words.” It follows then that the aesthetic exploitation of words is exhibited through the marked use of connotative words, figures of speech, idioms and other rhetorical devices, which are language specific. Their literal transfer from the source language to the target language is more often than not impossible. It suffices here to mention the procedures proposed by Newmark (1988, pp. 104-106) for the translation of metaphors.

The last production sub-phase normally goes smoothly without any difficulty, as the main problems have been identified and settled and the adequate translation procedures have been opted for. Now comes the time to focus on the reformulation process. Students are invited to translate the whole text in groups paying due regard to the solutions opted for. The text is constructed through interactive and dynamic student-student and student-instructor exchanges. A data show is used to project the final output.

The final third phase is of revision and assessment, which are two skills that translation students should necessarily develop. According to Lee-Johnke (2005), the evaluative judgment “should be stimulated during the whole process of formative evaluation.”(p. 364) In the present case, this skill is brought to the fore only at the last post-translation phase for two main pedagogical purposes. First, it is in this phase that the students revise the translation for correction and improvement. The criterion to be taken into consideration is the stylistic match or mismatch between the source and the target texts. This does not mean that the basic linguistic (lexical, grammatical and syntactic) correctness is overlooked. On the contrary as style embraces all these levels and goes beyond them to include what is aesthetic. According to Leech and Short (1984, p. 42), “Generally in looking at style in a text, one is not interested in choices in isolation, but rather at a pattern of choices: something that belongs to a text as whole.” In this respect, the literary translator should strive to render this said pattern, certainly not by following literally the author of the original step by step but rather by taking him as a model and imitating him. It is a translation idiom by idiom, metaphor by metaphor, parable by parable, and not word by word. Tyler (1747-1813) in his Essay on the principles of translation, said that the good translation should render “the style and manner of writing” of the original.”

Second, in this phase, the student translator, based on the end-product, tries to retrace his/her translation process with the aim to identify the translation difficulties encountered and the solutions opted for either on the micro or macro levels. This operation may result in the writing of a report in which the student lists the problems identified and his/her comments on the strategies and procedures adopted. This offers him/her the opportunity to be aware of their difficulties and flaws, and help them spot the translation problems and opt for the adequate solutions (strategies and procedures).
3. Illustration and discussion of the tri-phase method

In the present section, the researcher will demonstrate this tri-phase process-oriented method of literary translation teaching through three in-class translations of three literary texts; two from Arabic into English and one from English into Arabic. The first one is extracted from ‘أكابر’ (the Bourgeois) by Mickhael Nouaima, the second from ‘رجوع إلى الطفولة’ (Return to Childhood) by Leila Abu Zeid, and the third is taken from ‘Who moved my cheese?’, the bestseller of Spenser Johnson. The targeted students are enrolled in the Master of Translation Science at the Faculty of Humanities at the University Abdelmalek Essaadi during Fall-Semester 2017. The findings are formulated in the form of heuristics that can contribute in guiding, orienting or at least enlightening the teaching-learning process of literary translation.

3.1. Pre-translation Phase

In this pre-translation phase, students are required to engage in a brain-storming activity with the aim to bring to their short memory in use certain ideas about the author, his work(s) and style that can be very enlightening to the translation process. To trigger this process, the instructor gives a power point presentation featuring the salient and relevant elements of information. Apart from the mere bibliographic data about the life, education and works of the authors, he/she focuses on the factors that impact the text and its translation. For example, in the first text, the religious educational background of the author, Mikhael Nouaima, and his solidarity and empathy with the poor, powerless and oppressed people is of great importance. In the extract to be translated, the description of the characters, the tenant farmer Abu Rachid and his small family on the one hand and the landlord; the lawyer (ustad) and his small family on the other hand reflect the clash between two opposed social classes and the bias of the author for the tenant farmers. This clash is exhibited in the lexical choices which are mostly evocative and connotative as we will see below. As for Leila Abu Zeid, her feminist orientation is noticeable in the extract as she gives voice to women only, namely her mother, sister and the women in Hammam. She depicts an ordinary scene of Moroccan women and by the same token foregrounds the key role of women in the Moroccan family and society in the colonial and post-colonial periods. For the last text, the professional medical profile of the author and the didactic function of the text -a parable- are important as they cast the mould into which the author wrote the story and into which the translator should rewrite it. The imagery and symbolism of the source text are to be rendered or rather reinvented in the target text as we will see below. Based on these considerations, we opted for a foreignizing translation of the two first extracts so as to make the English reader feel the flavor of the foreign Arab culture –Lebanon and Morocco – and for a domesticating strategy for the third extract so as to render the same didactic message and produce the same effect. After introducing the authors and their works, comes the turn of the work at hand to be translated in the following phase.

3.2. Translation per-se

Before proceeding with translation, students are requested to read the text with the aim to work out its characters, setting, story as well as its salient stylistic features. For the names of characters, generally they are directly transferred into the target language without any modifications. This was the case of names of characters in the first and second texts:

Table 1. Characters in ‘أكابر’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Name</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>أبو رشيد</td>
<td>Rachid’s father – Abu Rachid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>أم رشيد</td>
<td>Rachid’s mother – Um Rachid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the second text, an autobiographic narrative, the narrator is one of the acting characters.

Table 2 Characters in "رجوع الى الطفولة"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ami</td>
<td>Mom (my mother)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>تسمح لي إلا أنني لم أكن أحب</td>
<td>allowed me, but I, I did not like,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>فاتحة</td>
<td>Fatiha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الطيابة يامنة</td>
<td>Yamna, Tiyaba (hammam attendant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>واحدة من النساء</td>
<td>One of the women (in Hammam)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The direct transfer of proper names does not operate when the translation is highly ‘adaptative’- or when the names used by the author are highly symbolic and their transliteration involves a loss that cannot be compensated for. None of the three cases fall under the first category, but it is worth mentioning that such strategy can be opted for. Delisle (1999, p. 114) for example mentions that in the comic strip *Tintin*, the names Dupont and Dupond become Thomson and Thompson in English, Hernandez y Fernandez in Spanish and Schulze un Schultze in German. In our case, under the second category falls the third text, as the names of the characters are highly symbolic and therefore, semantically rich Arabic names are proposed:

Table 3 Characters in "Who moved my cheese?"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sniff</td>
<td>شمام</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scurry</td>
<td>ركاض</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hem</td>
<td>تمتموم</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haw</td>
<td>لعثوم</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

‘Sniff’ is known for its ability to sniff to anticipate things, whereas ‘Scurry’ is known for its ability to run quickly ahead. ‘Hem’ and ‘Haw’ refer to the idiom ‘Hem and Haw’ and means ‘to take a long time to make a decision or before saying something’ (http://www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com. Accessed 18/04/2017). This semantic and semiotic richness of the English names is rendered in Arabic by semantically rich names. For the first two, the Arabic names ‘شمام وركاض’ are suggested. They are formed according to the morphological pattern of ‘ش’ (fa’alun) of their respective three-consonant base forms ‘شم’ (sniff) and ‘ركض’ (run). As for Hem and Haw, they are translated into ‘تمتموم’ and ‘لعثوم’ which are coined according to the morphological pattern ‘ل’ from their base forms ‘لم’ (to express oneself and indecision that exist in their corresponding source language items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sniff</td>
<td>شمام</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scurry</td>
<td>ركضاف</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hem</td>
<td>تمتموم</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haw</td>
<td>لعثوم</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As for the story and more precisely the chronology of events, each of the three texts teems with time indicators showing the chronological sequencing with some rare flash forwards or flashbacks.

Table 4 Chronology in ‘أكبر’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Description</th>
<th>English Description</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>في الغد</td>
<td>tomorrow</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By the end of summer</td>
<td>Flash forward (subjective anachrony)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في الشتاء الماضي</td>
<td>Last winter</td>
<td>Flashback (objective anachrony)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في الصباح</td>
<td>In the morning</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early in the morning</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>في الموسم الماضي</td>
<td>Last season</td>
<td>Flashback (subjective anachrony)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>اقتربت الساعة الثانية</td>
<td>Nearly two o’clock</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 Chronology in ‘رجع إلى الطفولة’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Description</th>
<th>English Description</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ليلة الثلاثاء</td>
<td>On Tuesday evening</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the morning</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The laundry day</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hammam day</td>
<td>chronology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>وفي اليوم التالي</td>
<td>On the following day</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>منذ الساعات الأولى</td>
<td>Since early hours</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On Thursday</td>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tomorrow Friday</td>
<td>Flash forward (subjective anachrony)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Concerning the setting, in the first two extracts, the authors depict very traditional scenes in which the story unfolds itself. In the case of the first extract, the setting is the countryside; the farmhouse or rather ‘الخيمة’ and the nearby area: the ‘threshing floor’ and public road. In the second extract, the characters act in the house (the narrator’s family home) and in the hammam, where they go to bathe. In both cases, the settings reflect some of the traditional aspects of life of Arab societies (pieces of furniture, rituals, customs, …) which pose some problems in translation as will be seen below. As for the third text, all the events of the story take place in a maze which is symbolic as it stands “for the environment where you look for what you want (the organization you work in, or the family or community you live in…” (Spencer, 1998, p. 2). In the three cases, the settings are kept without any modification, as it is generally done in literary translation. The setting can be modified only in extreme cases of adaptation as explained by Delisle (1999, p. 114). According to him, in case of adaptation, “the translator replaces a socio-cultural reality from the source language with a reality specific to the culture of the target language in order to accommodate the expectations of the target audience.” Even in our domesticating translation of the last segment we retained the same setting ‘כניסה’ (maze).
After working out these macro and micro-structural features of the text, we shift the focus to the language used by the authors. Here, students are asked to read the text a second time to scan it for potential translation difficulties; be it lexical, grammatical, syntactic, textual, interpersonal, … It is worth noting here, that the three extracts are characterized by the use of a simple straightforward prose, as the focus is not on the language and its aesthetic dimension but on the story (characters and events). They, however, teem with idiomatic expressions, informal and even colloquial words in conversations, culture-bound words, words used in their connotative meanings and some figures of speech like metaphors and similes.

Concerning the connotative meaning, in the first extract the word ‘أكابر’ (akabir) does not objectively refer to the ‘elites’ and ‘notables’, but rather pejoratively to the ‘bourgeois’; i.e., people who are socially highly ranked but not very humble or noble in their hearts and attitudes. The lawyer, (ustad) يعيش عيشة الكبار وزوجته كذلك من الكبار (leads the life of bourgeois in the capital city and his wife is likewise from a bourgeois family); ومن الأكيد أن الأستاذ لن يأتيهم وحده، بل سيصحب زوجته وابنته وخادمته وسائق سيارته (certainly he would not come alone; he would be accompanied with his wife, housemaid and chauffeur).

The use of idiomatic or fixed expressions is another problem that students have to deal with. Their use is a feature of informal or semi-formal registers very frequent in dialogues between characters and even in some narrative segments. What is worth adding here is that if an idiom is “a group of words whose meaning is different from the meanings of the individual words,” (www.oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com. Accessed 18/04/2017), its translation cannot be literal. It is, as mentioned above, a translation idiom by idiom; it is a translation equivalence technique in which “one and the same situation can be rendered by two texts using completely different stylistic and structural methods,” (Vinay and Darbelnet, 2002, p. 90).

Concerning the first texts, students extract the following list:

- انتقل إلى رحمة الله
- تشمل بال
- انتابت رشيد نوبة من البكاء والعويل وممزق الثياب والعصى والسعال
- والقصة في حلقه
- رحمة الله على والده
- رحمة الله على عظامه
- جن جنونه
- ترتيب هندامها
- تهدئة روع ابنها
- فالكتاب يقرأ على مرمى حجرة من الخيمة

As for the second text, the following list is established:

- يملا نفسي بالبرودة
- سلنا آمنا الله
- سقت لك وجه الله
Once the list of fixed or idiomatic expressions has been established, students are assigned the task to search their equivalents, and the main instruction is to avoid literality whenever possible. The solutions or procedures agreed upon and adopted reflect this orientation as can be seen below in the following tables:

### Table 6 *Idiomatic and fixed expressions inَ أكابرَ’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Expression</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>انتقل إلى رحمة الله</td>
<td>He passed away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>تشمل بالغلص في حلقة</td>
<td>It occupied their minds – it preoccupied them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>انتابت رشيد نوبة من البكاء والعويل وتمزيق الثياب والغصص والسعال</td>
<td>Rachid had a fit of weeping, wailing, clothes tearing, choking and coughing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>والغضب في حلقة</td>
<td>with a lump in his throat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>رحمة الله على والده</td>
<td>may God have mercy upon his father</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>رحمة الله على عظامه</td>
<td>may his soul rest in peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>جن جنونه</td>
<td>he went mad / went out of his mind / became crazy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ترتيب هندامها</td>
<td>she dressed very smartly / she wore her smartest clothes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>تهدئة روع ابنها</td>
<td>she calmed him down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>فالكتاب يقرأ من عنوانه</td>
<td>his book can be judged from its title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>على مرمى حجرا من الخيمة</td>
<td>at a stone throw</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 7 *Idiomatic and fixed expressions inَ رجوع إلى الطفولةَ’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Expression</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>يملأ نفسي بالبرودة</td>
<td>It chilled me to the bones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>سلمنا أمرنا الله</td>
<td>We resign ourselves to the wisdom of God</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>سقت لك وجه الله</td>
<td>For the love of God</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As for culture-bound items, the first two texts abound with culture-specific items as they both depict the ordinary social life of people from Lebanon in the first case and from Morocco in the second case. Culture-bound words represent one of the frequent problems faced in translation, especially in literary translation to the extent that some consider literary translation as the celebration of alterity. It “allows us to enter the minds of people from other times and places. It is a celebration of otherness, a truly multicultural event without all the balloons and noisemakers,” (Weshler, 1998, p. 6). These words which convey ‘culture specialities’ (Nida, 1964; p. 167), cannot be translated literally. More often than not they are either borrowed and transliterated or rendered by their functional equivalents or ‘cultural substitutions’ (Baker, 1991, p. 31). In this connection, students have to establish the list of culture-bound words and provide their transliterations or translations.

### Table 8 *Culture-bound words inَ أكابرَ’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Expression</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>القوارمة</td>
<td>Qawarma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الخبز المرقوق أو المرحرح</td>
<td>thin flatbread</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الطراحي</td>
<td>Tararih (mattresses- beds)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the first text, ‘الطرازيح’ and ‘القوارمة’ were borrowed and transliterated because they have no equivalents in English. For example, any effort to translate by cultural substitution would have altered the meaning intended by the narrator. ‘Eggs scrambled with cream cheese or spinach’ would have produced a case of anatopism; i.e., an item which is not in its correct context. The same applies to tararih, as the poor tenant farmers can neither scramble their eggs with spinach nor offer mattresses or armchairs for their guests to sit on.

The second text also features few instances of culture-specific words which refer to different objects (place, pieces of clothing and furniture) and for which either borrowing (transliteration) or cultural substitution is adopted. The choice of one rather than the other is always motivated by the prospected audience; the American audience in particular and the English reading audience in general, given that the author lives in Louisiana in USA and writes for the American audience.

Table 9 Culture-bound words in ‘رجوع إلى الطفولة’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>الحمام</td>
<td>Hammam, baths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>الطنبور</td>
<td>Tambour, water boiler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>صابون المنجل</td>
<td>Manjal soap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>أغطية المطارف</td>
<td>Upholstery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>السراويل والقمصان</td>
<td>Underwear shirts and trousers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As we can notice, the two possibilities; either transliteration or cultural substitution are possible for the two first items ‘الحمام’ and ‘الطنبور’, but not for the four remaining three, for which one option remains possible. The brand name of the traditional soap ‘المنجل’ is transferred directly, whereas ‘أغطية المطارف’ and ‘السراويل والقمصان’ are rendered by their functional equivalents, ‘upholstery’ and ‘underwear shirts and trousers’.

The third text does not manifest any culture-bound word, as it is a parable and its symbolism is universal and crosses all borders and cultural hurdles.

As for imagery and the use of figures of speech, the first text features some similes, metaphors and a hyperbole.

Table 10 Figures of speech in ‘رجوع إلى الطفولة’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>أخذ يبكي ويلطم ويتمرغ على الأرض كمن صرعه روح نجس</td>
<td>He burst into tears and started slapping his face, wallowing on the ground as if possessed by a devil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>كل دمعة من عين أبيني تساوي ما يملك</td>
<td>Every tear drop from his eyes is worth all his possessions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>إن ظفره عندي بالدنيا</td>
<td>His finger nail is all the world to me</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>فقد بخلت السماء بالعطر في أوانه وقادت به في غير أوانه</td>
<td>The rainfall was poor in winter and abundant in other seasons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In all these cases, the translation is oblique (indirect); it retains the same rhetorical devices and formulates them in an acceptable diction. In other words, it strikes a balance between faithfulness to the subjective meanings intended by the narrator or his characters through the
different rhetorical devices used on the one hand and the adequacy of the formulation in the view of the targeted audience on the other hand.

In the second extract, the first person narrator describes the condition of the house on the day on which she goes with her mother and sister to the *hammam (baths)*. Concerning the rooms, she says ‘تتعرى فيه الغرف’, which means that the rooms ‘are stripped bare’, a translation which retains the same vehicle; ‘nakedness’ and conveys the same ground, which is the absence of any piece of furniture. The English equivalent ‘stripped bare’ conveys perfectly the same metaphor and is acceptable as can be seen in the example: “A woman whose home was broken into and stripped bare by thieves while she was in hospital recovering from brain surgery spoke yesterday of her despair at losing almost everything she owned.” (The Telegraph, 15 December 2001).

Focus is also on conversations, because “The writing of conversation raises another problem for the novelist: how is he to make sure that his characters speak the sort of language they should speak in real life? A doctor must be made to talk like a doctor, a farmer like a farmer, and a woman of fashion like a woman of fashion. So the novelist like the dramatist needs to have ‘a good ear’. To catch and to imitate the speech habits and tone of voice of people in conversation is not an easy task.” (Rees, 1973, p. 115). The translator should have the same concerns and opt for the adequate strategies, as the quality of the output depends largely on the pertinence of these strategies. The translation of Moroccan dialect into standard formal English is not a good choice as can be seen in the following example:

(نثر الحمرا، الزبير بن بوشتي)

- **Err’aqassa**: Sidi El-hkim, are you here? I have been looking for you everywhere.
- **El-Hkim**: What do you want?
- **Err’aqassa**: Good people sent me to you and said you are El-baraka here. I beseech you, Sidi El-Hkim, to deliver me.
- **El-Hkim**: I am busy now. Talk to Meskin!
- **Err’aqassa**: For the sake of the inscribed tablet and the holy Koran you studies, Si Elfqihi, relieve me and implore Si El-Hkim for me
- **El-fqihi**: There shall be no harm, Chrifa. What do you want?

(Moustapha Hilal Soussi, *the Red Fire*)

Here, it is a matter of rendering a spoken language by another spoken language and maybe a sub-code by another sub-code in case of dialect variety. In this respect, Brisset (2002) says:

Here, the difficulty of translation does not arise from the lack of a specific translation language. It arises, rather, from the absence in the target language of a sub-code equivalent to the one used by the source text in its reproduction of the source language. How should
the cockney dialogue in *Pygmalion* be translated? What French-language dialect equivalent should be used to render the lunfardo of Buenos Aires in translations of Roberto Arlt’s novels? (p. 344)

These are the questions that should be raised by students when it comes to the translation of conversations in novels or plays. In the three extracts translated, figure long stretches of dialogues between the characters. The focus is on producing target language conversations that reflect at least features of ‘orality’, such as the use of interjections, gap fillers, swear words, vocatives, exclamations, contractions, etc., and the same register, especially the informal chatty style showing the close and intimate relationship between the protagonists.

Table 11 *Conversation in أكبَرُ*:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic Text</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>وَلَدِي! لَقَدْ نَامَ وَالْغَصَّةَ فِي حَلْقِهِ وَسَتَاعُوْدَهُ الْغَصَّةَ عِنْدَمَا يَسْتَقْفُقُ فِي الْصَّبَاحِ قَبْرِي أَنَا قَدْ ذَيَحَنَا دَجَاَجَةُ مِنَ الْثَّلَاثِ. فَهُوَ يَبْحَجُهُ جَمِيْعًا.</td>
<td>&quot;Oh dear! My son slept with a lump in his throat, and he’ll have it again when he’ll wake up in the morning and realize that we’ve slaughtered one of the three hens. He loves them all.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>فَقَالَ أَبُو رَشِيدُ:</td>
<td>Abu Rachid then replied:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| سِيِّكِي قَلِيلاً ثُمَّ يَنْسَاهَا. وَمَا الْعَمْلُ؟ أَيْتَيْنَا الأَسْتَاذُ لَأُولَى مَرَّةٍ وَلَا نَقْوِمُ بِوَجْهِهِ؟ | "He’ll cry for a while and eventually forget it. What can we do? Will Ustad come for the first time and we fail our duty towards him?"
| دَعَنَا مِنْهُ يَا رَجُلٌ. كَلْ دُمْعَةَ مِنْ عِينِ ابْنِي تُسَاوِي كَلْ مَا يَمْلُكَ! أَسْبِبْتُ أَنَا دَفْنَتُ ثَلَاثَةَ مِنْ إِخْوُتِهِ وَلَمْ يَبْقِ لَنَا سَوَاءً؟ وَأَن لَا أَمَّلُ فِيْما بَعْدَ بِغِيْرِهِ؟ إِنَّ عَظَمَُهُ عَنْدَيْنِي بَالْدِنْدِنَا. | “Forget it man! Each tear drop from my son’s eye is worth all what he owns. Have you forgotten that we buried three of his brothers and we’re left with him only, with no hope to have another child? His finger nail’s all the world to me.” |
| لا تَتَنَبِّئُ يَا أَمْرَةُ أَنَا شَرَكَاءُ. وَأَنَا مُدِينُونُ لِصَاحِبِ الأَرْضِ بِثَلَاثَةِ أَلْفِ قَرْشٍ. فَفِجَدَرْ بِنَا أَنْ نُحْسِنَ أَسْتَقْبَالُهُ وَضَيَاَقُهُ وَلَوْ كَنَا نَعْرِفُ أَنَّهُ سَيَكُونُ رَفِيقَ بَنَا كَوْالِدَهُ لِلْأَمَامِ, وَلَكِنْ نَجْهِلُ ذِخْيِهِ. | “Oh! Don’t forget that we’re partners and we owe the landlord three thousand Qirsh. So we’ve to receive and welcome him well. If at least we knew he would be kind to us as his father used to be, it would be easier. But we ignore his innermost feelings.” |
| رَحْمَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَيْ وَالْدِهِ. فَمَا كَانَ يَطَالِبُنَا حَتَّى بَالْفَائِدَةَ. | “Peace and blessings of Allah be upon his father. He didn’t even claim the interests.” |
| Ooh yeah! May his soul rest in peace. He was tender-hearted. But woman! Time passes so | Oh yeah! May his soul rest in peace. He was tender-hearted. But woman! Time passes so
fast, and over time men change. We don’t know if fortune will smile on us with his son. My heart tells me that it won’t.”

إي. رحمة الله على عظامه. لقد كان طيب القلب. ولكن الزمان يتغير بسرعة يا امرأة، ومع الزمان الرجال، فما ندري كيف يكون طالعنا مع الابن. قلبي يحدثني بأنه لن يكون طالع خير.

Table 12 Conversation in ‘رجع الى الطفولة’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ستأخذ معنا البرتقال، إيوا للا ونجلس في الغرفة العروس وسنأتي لانا الاماء البارد في الدلو الصغير، إيوا لالة وسأخرجك كالعروس. ويلي أمشي! لا أستطيع الله حس أبيك ولا حس اليوم الذي رأيتك فيه. شف للاك!</td>
<td>-“We’ll take oranges with us; yeah Ma’am. We’ll sit in the brides’ compartment, and you’ll bring us cold water in your small bucket. Yeah, yeah ma’am! When I’ll take you out you’ll look like a bride. Woe is me! Go ahead. May God never make me hear of your father and of the day I saw the family of your father. Look at your sister; how correctly she behaves!”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>المموت. فقالت: لا أصب حتى يمتلئ الحوض. من منكن لم تأت بالماء البارد؟</td>
<td>“Hey Yamna, fill our buckets, we are over exhausted.” She replied: “I won’t, unless the tank is full. Who hasn’t brought her cold water yet?” “Yes, yes, we’ve.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>لا أصب حتى يمتلئ الحوض. من منكن لم تأتي بالماء البارد؟</td>
<td>When the tub was full, Yamna said: “I don’t want any mess here. I’ll pour water for you all.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3. Post-translation phase

As mentioned above, students are required, in this phase, to revise and evaluate the end-product against the stylistic yardstick and to ponder upon their translation process.

Concerning revision and quality assessment, students have to analyze the translation from the stylistic perspective. It is worth mentioning that if we borrow the ‘dress metaphor’ of Leech (1969, p. 17), we can say that the predominant style in the three texts is the ‘middle style’ (respectable clothes for a night out) used in the narrator’s discourse and the ‘plain style’ (the working dress of language) used in the characters’ discourse. There is no attempt to elevate the language to the level of ‘grand style (ceremonial dress). In the three texts, the lexical and structural choices make the style swing between these second and third levels. This can be explained by the predominance of idioms and idiomatic expressions and the scarcity of figures of speech such as metaphors and similes.

Under the general label of ‘middle style’ used by the narrator, it is worth noting the difference between the narrative style used when events are related and the descriptive style used when settings or characters are described. In the three extracts, the narrative style is characterized by the use of short sentences and clauses featuring the predominance of dynamic processes, the
narrative past tense and the straightforward vocabulary, subjective in some instances and objective in others as can be seen in the following segment:

بقي أبو رشيد وأم رشيد حتى ساعة متأخرة من الليل يتناولان في أمر بالغ الأهمية فما يستقران على رأي. فقد جاءهما من الأستاذ أنه قادم في الغد ليقسم البيدر. وإذن فلا بد من إعداد الغداء التقليدي. فماذا يعانى له؟ لقد كان المرحوم والده رجلاً أميّاً مثلهم، بسيط اللباس والعادات والحديث. وكان كله جاء لقسمة البيدر في أواخر الصيف يأبى الجلوس إلا على التراب، تحت البلوطة التي بقرب البيدر، حيث كانت أم رشيد تأتي بالغداء على صينية من القش. والغداء مهما أسرفت أم رشيد في البذخ، ما كان يتجاوز بضع بيضات مقلية بالقاورمة مع كمية من اللبن المؤبر، وشيء من البصل والخيار، والكثير من الخبز المرقوق أو المرحرح، وقليل من العسل – إذا تيسر العسل.

In such case, the translation should normally render the same stylistic simplicity, in other words, it should seek to achieve the ‘stylistic equivalence’ as Ghazala (2002, p. 223) put it. According to him, stylistic equivalence is “the proper choice of the style of the TL text ‘i.e. Arabic) based on that of the SL text (i.e. in English), unless available in the TL.”

Based on the above-mentioned considerations, the following translation is provided:

Abu Rachid and Ummu Rachid stayed up late discussing an issue of utmost importance, but they did not reach any agreement. They heard from Ustad that he would come on the following day to divide the harvest. Therefore, they had to prepare the traditional lunch. So, what would they prepare for him?

His deceased father was illiterate like them. He was humble in his clothing, habits and speech. Each time he came to divide the harvest by the end of the summer, he refused to sit but on the ground under the oak tree near the threshing floor. The lunch, no matter how extravagant Ummu Rachid was, did not exceed some eggs scrambled with “qawarma”, some fermented milk, few onions and cucumbers, a lot of thin flatbread and some honey if affordable.

But the father passed away last winter and at his death, his vast estates passed to his son and along with the estates the tenant farmers, including Abu Rachid, who was the closest and the dearest one to ustad’s father.

For the third text, for which the domesticating translation strategy is opted for, further efforts are deployed to render a highly narrative style catering for the needs of the Arab readership. This can be easily seen in the following segment:

Table 13 Translation of the first segment of ‘Who moved my cheese?’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Text</th>
<th>Target Text (Domesticating Translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Who Moved My Cheese? The Story</td>
<td>لا جبن بعد اليوم – القصة</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONCE, long ago in a land far away, there lived four little characters who ran through a Maze looking for cheese to nourish them and make them happy.</td>
<td>كان يا مكان في قديم الزمان وسالف العصر والأوان، في بلاد بعيدة، أربعة مخلوقات قزمية تجري داخل متاهة بحثًا عن جبنة تقتات منها وتكون لها مصدر سعادة وأطمنان.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Two were mice, named "Sniff" and "Scurry" and two were Little people—beings who were as small as mice but who looked and acted a lot like people today. Their names were "Hem" and "Haw."

Due to their small size, it would be easy not to notice what the four of them were doing. But if you looked closely enough, you could discover the most amazing things!

The same goes for the descriptive style characterized by the intensive use of adjectives, adverbs and prepositional groups modifying either the nouns or verbs. Most of them are evocative and appeal to the five senses of the reader. The following extract from the second text is a case in point:

The segment above, the author describes meticulously the process of clothes’ washing (laundry). Such description can be done only by a person who witnesses all stages of the process and over a long period. The challenge resides not in the vocabulary, which is objective in some instances and attitudinal in others, but on the syntactic level. If in Arabic it is easy to combine an unlimited number of sentences with the conjunction ‘wa’ and a comma, in English it is not that easy. This entails the resort to recasting; i.e. syntactic arrangement as can be seen below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Arabic</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>وكان اثنان منهما فأرين يدعيان شمام وركاض، وأثنان قزمين يدعيان لعوم ومعين يبدينان في حجمهما الفنان، ولكن في مظهرهما وتصريفهما يماثلان الإنسان.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two were mice, named &quot;Sniff&quot; and &quot;Scurry&quot; and two were Little people—being who were as small as mice but who looked and acted like people today. Their names were &quot;Hem&quot; and &quot;Haw.&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Preparations for school began with the laundry and hammam (baths). On Tuesday evening, my mother did not leave a single piece of cloth in the house. She threw into the laundry-pile (bundle) the pillowcases, upholstery, the room curtain and even the kitchen rags and the floor rugs.

Early in the morning, she woke up and kindled fire in a large metal brazier in the outer courtyard. She filled the “Tanbur” (water boiler) with water and put it on the brazier. She emptied two wooden basins from the rest of the water she had kept in them overnight to close up their cracks and set them on two wooden boxes. She then brought the sizeable bundle of laundry and started sorting: head scarves, whites, coloreds, black clothes and the rags. She put them into separate piles. She poured some hot water and lye into the basin. She washed first the headscarves, rinsed them and went up on the roof to hang them and came back.
She soaked the whites and started scrubbing with manjal soap on the coned washing plank (washboard), producing rhythmic scrubbing sounds. After that, she removed the plank from the basin and started scrubbing energetically each piece of cloth with both hands. Now and then, she dipped it in the soapy water. Then she wrung it out and stacked it on the table. After that, she drenched the coloreds pile, filled the second basin with hot water, shook the wrung clothes and threw them in it. Then, she began rubbing them with soap, bending over the basin and her hands going back and forth pressing the laundry effortlessly. Then she wrung out all the cloth items and threw them in the “Tanbur”. She pushed the partly burned wood in the brazier with an unburned piece of wood. She stirred the items in the “Tanbur” and removed them with a stick.

After the revision and evaluation activities, comes the time to ponder on the whole process so as to identify the lessons, principles to be drawn therefrom. Students are assigned the following exercise which consists in completing the following grid with the adequate information as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Translation problem</th>
<th>Segment from the text illustrating this problem</th>
<th>Characterization of the problem</th>
<th>Solution opted for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Idiomatic or fixed expressions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture-bound words</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metaphors and similes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Conclusion
The relevance and pertinence of a process-oriented translation method has been advocated by many translation and interpreting scholars and experts for over more than three decades. In our present work, we have tried to demonstrate its adequacy for teaching literary translation. With its three phases, the pre-translation, translation and post-translation phases, it schematizes the cognitive process that the literary translator goes through. It also helps the literary translator shift his/her attention from the here-and-now to move backward or forward to identify problems or resolve them. More precisely, each of the three phases has a key role to play in the training of literary translation.

The pre-translation phase equips the literary translator with the necessary background information to embark upon the translation task. As mentioned above, this phase is necessary in literary translation more than in any other type of translation. For the translation of a marriage contract or a financial report for example, does the translator need to be knowledgeable about the author, his life or style? The answer is definitely no, which is not the case in literary translation. The literary work is a piece of art, the creation of an artist and as a matter of consequence, its intelligibility and its sense if not its senses remain accessible only for those who have an insight into the whole work and its author. In the examples above, we demonstrated how the religious
educational background of Michael Nouaima impacts the language used, how the feminism of Leila Abou Zeid is exhibited in the predominance of the feminine voice and the meticulous description of the household activities and how the didactic function of the parable ‘Who moved my Cheese?’ of Dr. Spenser Johnson informs and motivates the text and by the same token its translation. This preparatory phase then feeds into the second phase of translation per se.

The translation phase is broken down into three main sub-phases with the aim to disclose what exactly happens in the mental black box of the literary translator. It involves reading for identifying the translation problems, adopting the relevant translation strategy and procedures, and finally translating the whole text. The first move consists in reading the text for spotting out the salient literary translation problems; namely connotative words, metaphors, idioms, etc., which students have to handle on the spur of the moment. For this purpose, the instructor may guide them by providing the category of translation difficulty to deal with, such as an idiomatic or fixed expression and two or three possible translations from amongst which they have to select the most adequate one. Each of the choices made is explained and argued for or against. After identifying the translation problems and resolving them, students must work in group to provide the translation of the whole segment. This dynamic exchange amongst students and between the students and the instructor enlighten the students cognitive process and develop further their procedural knowledge; knowledge of problem solving techniques and translation procedures.

The post-translation phase is devoted to revision and reflection; two skills that any professional translator should acquire and develop. Any text translated, be it by a novice or professional translator, should be revised and assessed against specific criteria. In our case, given the particularity of the literary text, the focus is on the more comprehensive level of style, but not to the detriment of the basic linguistic level. Equivalence of style is checked at all scales of translation units and for the different potential styles to be used: ‘middle style’ by ‘middle style’, ‘plain style’ by ‘plain style’, ‘narrative style’ by ‘narrative style’, ‘descriptive style’ by ‘descriptive style’. Through this task, we seek to develop the capacity of literary translation students to assess a translated piece of literary work, which will certainly not elevate to the evaluative capacity and instinct of the literary critic, but at least ensure the improvement of the literary product. In this last phase, students are also required to reflect on the translation process by spotting the difficulties encountered and the solutions opted for. With this end in view, they are asked to complete a ‘reflection grid’ setting forth the categories of problems for which they have to provide the segments concerned, the solutions opted for and their comments. The didactic value of this exercise cannot be questioned as it helps check whether the objectives of the course of literary translation have been attained or not. It is a kind of self-evaluation which leads to more self confidence that students, in general, should acquire during their courses.

About the author
Mohammed Mediouni is Head of the English Section at King Fahd School of Translation (Tangier, Morocco). He holds a doctorate in English Linguistics from l’Université Paris-Sorbonne (Paris VI). His research interests include legal translation, terminology and translation studies. His recent publications include ‘Towards a functional approach to Arabic-English legal translation: The role of Comparable/Parallel texts, in Taibi, M. ed. (2016) New insights into Arabic translation and interpreting. Bristol/Buffalo/Toronto: Multilingual Matters, and ‘Can dictionaries (monolingual or bilingual) help translators overcome collocation pitfalls’ in Turjuman 22:1, Actes du colloque ‘Traduction et Lexicographie’ (April 2013).
5. References


An Attempt at Applying Vladimir Propp’s Morphology of the Folktale on Charles Dickens’s Great Expectations

Khalid LAHLOU
Department of English, Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences
Hassan II University, Ben M’Sik, Casablanca, Morocco

Abstract
The present paper is an attempt at approaching Charles Dickens’ Great Expectations from a morphological perspective based upon Vladimir Propp’s Morphology of the Folktale. The paper is divided into two parts. The first part is concerned with a brief view of the nature of formalism: its background and its process of analysis. The second part is devoted to putting into practice what has been dealt with in the first part. It will be mostly concerned with the question as to whether all the functions of dramatis personae as stated by Propp figure in the object of analysis, Great Expectations. Finally, the paper will draw the conclusion as to whether the aforementioned elements constitute an organic unity.

Keywords: dramatis personae, folktale, formalistic reading, morphological substructure

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.8
Introduction
A work of art is open to several interpretations. This feature undoubtedly gives justice to the view that a literary work is rich. It is so in the sense that it contains ideas, notions and themes that can be treated and appreciated differently. But if a literary work is an offspring of a genius, its richness, then, will take deeper dimensions. This is the case of Charles Dickens, one of the renowned Victorian novelists.

“That Dickens was a great genius and is permanently among the classics is certain, but the genius was that of a great entertainer, and he had …no profounder responsibility as a creative artist than this description suggests” Allen (1954. p.107 ). This passage makes it clear that Dickens’ creative power resides solely and particularly in his ability to bring into being novels that make the reader enjoy him/herself.

This fact of enjoyment is attributed to the folktale, given the evidence that folktales take place in an imaginary world consisting of supernatural forces, extraordinary events and of superhuman characters. This enriches the reader’s imagination and gives him an opportunity to escape the hard facts existing in the physical world. But the task at hands does not really necessitate a deeper probing in this matter. The question that is asked here is how Dickens’ books are approached.

In effect, Dickens’ novels have been stimuli to a good number of books and articles written especially to illuminate his literary production. Moreover, Dickens’ literary work was, and still is, fertile fields open to investigations and scholastic researches. In addition to sociological, psychological and biographical approaches, the formalistic one tries, in its turn, to find admittance into Dickens’ literary work. Many a critic, however, have considered Dickens’ work in the light of the novelist’s life and his autobiographical accounts, and his psychological growth. All of these approaches, therefore, have tried to make sufficient illuminations of Dickens’ work relying upon extra-literary materials, such as the writer’s environment, his psychological growth and his personal life.

The present paper is an attempt at approaching Charles Dickens’ Great Expectations from a morphological standpoint based upon Vladimir Propp’s Morphology of the Folktale. The paper is divided into two parts. The first part is concerned with a brief view of the nature of formalism: its background and its process of analysis. The main purpose of this part is to bring into focus the elements which would be dealt with throughout the attempt namely the dramatis personae and their functions together with the morphological substructure of tales.

The second part is devoted to putting into practice what has been dealt with in the first part. It would be mostly concerned with the question as to whether all the functions of dramatis personae as stated by Propp figure in the object of analysis, Great Expectations.

Finally, the paper would draw the conclusion as to whether the aforesaid elements constitute an organic unity. Also the conclusion would make it clear whether Propp’s theory succeeds in achieving a formalistic reading of Great Expectations.
I- A General View of the Framework of Propp's Morphology of the Folktale

Vladimir Propp's *Morphology of the Folktale* suggests a formalistic approach to literary texts. To better understand his theory, certain knowledge of the nature of formalism is required. In a simpler way, the formalistic theory deals primarily with the form of a literary work and leaves aside all the extra-literary materials, such as the writer’s life, environment, philosophy and so forth. The point of interest of the formalist critic, however, is to state simply “what is the literary work, what are its shape and effect and how these are achieved. All relevant answers to these questions are to come from the text itself” (Harper & Row 1979, p.159). In accordance with this, the stress is put on the intrinsic material of the work of art regardless of the possible weight that might influence that very work.

By means of illustration one may take, for instance, Virginia Woolf’s (1882-1941) masterpiece, *To the Lighthouse* (1927). In this novel, the writer provides us with pattern and formula through two analogous characters: Mrs. Ramsay who tries the best she can to give ‘pattern’ and ‘formula’ to people in life; and Lily Briscoe who attempts hard to give ‘form’ and ‘shape’ to her vision upon canvas in order to achieve a unified picture. In both cases, the object sought is ‘oneness’ through art. This, so it is observed, becomes a little parable of formalistic research and discovery. This is quite justified on the grounds that “the artist experiences an underlying or transcendent reality that he or she captures and transmits by recreating on canvas the vision of formal relations and harmonies, or significant form” (Harper & Row, 1979, p.161).

If we go back to the Greek Era, however, we notice that there was some implied conscience of formalism, given the evidence that question as to the proper end of fine art was discussed in its exclusive appropriateness to poetry. Conversely, in the late eighteenth century and early nineteenth century “the Romantic movement... intensified speculations about form in literature, especially in the generation of concepts of ‘organisms’ of a work of art and that of living organisms” (1979, p.174).

What we can deduce from here is that a work of art should be seen as a whole, each part should be related to each other and to the whole, hence “oneness”. But what is noticeable about the Greek and the Romantic Era is that there was a ‘lack’ of a systematic approach of formalistic theory. There were no schools, no journals and no manifestoes. The systematization and methodization come only with the development of new criticism. This modern school of criticism, that is, new criticism, stresses the importance of the form of a work of art.

For the Russian formalists, literature is not a matter of religion, psychology or sociology, but a particular construction of language. A work of art has got its own laws and mechanism which are to be studied separately. Vladimir Propp (1927), accordingly, is an adherent critic to the Russian school of formalism. The structural study of fiction might be said to begin with Propp’s work on the Russian fairy tales. Propp provided for fiction a sort of simplification of form which has such an impetus on structural thinking.

In his book, *Morphology of the Folktale*, Vladimir Propp presents the sum-total of his view as to how to approach fairy tales through a morphological study. Propp stresses the importance of the dramatis personae and their functions in the tale. He sees that although the names of the dramatis personae change from one tale to another, their functions remain the same.
For Propp, any study of the tale necessitates the study of its dramatis personae, together with their functions. Propp wants to emphasize the importance of certifying the extent to which these functions really represent intermittent constants of the tale. This leads us to the core of the matter: how many functions are known to the tale? Propp indicates that the number of the tales is quite surprising. He specifies that “however various they may be”, the characters of a tale “often perform the same actions” (p.102). Since this point gains much importance in Propp’s theory, we shall dwell at length on it.

Vladimir Propp distinguishes between the means of realizing the function and the function itself. For him, the means is ever-changing. It changes from one work to another. It is ‘variable’. The function, on the other hand, is constant. Let us explain this and consider Pip’s and Oliver’s whereabouts in *Great Expectations* and *Oliver Twist* respectively. Pip, at the end of the book, is changed to a ‘respectable gentleman’ who marries a charming lady. Hence happy ending. Oliver, on the other hand, does not wed any body but is a changed boy. He has turned from a homeless and disrespectful boy to a conventional ‘fellow’. Hence happy ending. Thus, as Propp has observed, identical acts have different meaning and vice versa. Although we are presented with two morphologically distinct components, the action remains the same. Hence, to borrow Propp’s words, “function is understood as an act of character from the point of view of its significance for the course of the action” (p.120).

The sequence of the dramatis personae is not neglected in Propp’s book. It strongly relies on coincidence and violation of the logical development of events, on the grounds that tales have their own logic. In this respect, two Russian formalists give their viewpoints concerning the sequence of fairy tales. Veselovskij (1936) maintains that the selection and order of tasks and encounters (examples of motifs) already presupposes certain freedom. Another Russian formalist, namely Sklouskij (1942) holds that it is quite impossible to understand why, in the act of adoption, the accidental sequence of motifs must be retained. In both views the two men agree, though in different terms, that the sequence of events get distorted in fairy tales. But this distortion, after all, is justified. We have already said that fairy tales possess laws of their own. A tale, Vladimir Propp observes, “…has its own entirely particular and specific laws” (p.127).

To be explicit, we may refer to the structure of *Great Expectations* as being a testimony to what has just been discussed. In *Great Expectations*, the violation of events is quite apparent: Pip, the orphan from the marches, comes into ‘expectations’ right away when he has been longing to be a ‘gentleman’. Also, Magwitch whom Pip finds in the churchyard is Pip’s benefactor. More, Estella, the haughty lady of jewels and charm, is the criminal Magwich’s daughter etc.

Propp also stresses the importance of another point. It is connected with the presence or absence of functions in tales. He holds that in no respect are all the narrative functions found in all tales. This by no means alters the development of events. But the absence of certain functions, Propp notices, does not change the order of the rest. Dickens, in most of his novels, structures his plots without actually losing the thread of narration. In this respect, Propp stands on firm grounds when he asserts that all fairy tales are of one type in regard to their structure.

Before he gives any details concerning the functions of the dramatis personae, Vladimir Propp indicates that “the study of the tale must be carried on strictly deductively; i.e. proceeding
An Attempt at Applying Vladimir Propp’s Morphology of the Folktale

from the material at hand to the consequences…but the presentation may have a reversed order” (p.192). His aim in so saying lies on an attempt to make the task easier for the reader to grasp the meaning for his theory. And as he gives more importance to the dramatis personae, Propp enumerates these functions. They are one and thirty in number. Since they are of paramount importance, it would be worthwhile stating the most important ones of them—leaving the others till the next part.

The first in number is one of the members of a family absents himself from home. Knowing that the case of absence might not be the same, Propp indicates that an excessive form of default is embodied in the death of parents. The second comes an interdiction which is addressed to the hero. This function sometimes figures in all tales and some other times does not. But it is important, all the same. Third comes the fact that interdiction is violated in order to heighten the mood of the tale. Four in number is the appearance of “the villain (who) makes an attempt at reconnaissance. Fifth the villain (who) deceives his victim to take possession of him or of his belongings”. The fourth and fifth functions introduce the villain to the tale. It is of paramount significance since the apparition of the villain sets out the mood of the tale and gives worth to the hero. Six in number comes the victim (who) submits to the deception and thereby unwittingly helps his enemy. Seven in importance is that the villain causes harm or injury to a member of a family (p.192). The injury can be psychological or physical, or in the case of Pip’s both psychological and physical. These functions, together with those which are not enumerated here, constitute the backbone and the morphological cornerstone of fairy tales. Propp, surprisingly enough, postpones the definition of the tale till the last chapter of the book. The delay can be justified in assuming that Vladimir Propp wants to start by giving the major components of the tale and afterwards defining the tale through a morphological point of view.

The tale (skazka), as defined by the formalist, “may be termed any development proceeding from ‘villainy’ or a ‘lack’ through intermediary functions to marriage or reward”. What is striking about this definition is that Propp’s description of the tale is by all means different from the conventional definition of the tale—the Oxford English Dictionary’s for example. Propp, nevertheless, proceeds to distinguish between tales with a single move and tales with more than one move. He warns the morphologists not to be misguided by what he terms ‘brief moves’. After this, Propp advances to give an example of the way a tale should be analyzed—a task we shall elaborately see in the second part of this paper.

The problem of classifying fairy tales gains a great importance from Propp. He goes so far as to trace the source of the tale. He sees that the construction of fairy tales is not dissimilar to that of legends, individual tales about animals, and isolated novellas. In this respect, Propp makes it clear that

A similar construction is displayed by a number of very archaic myths, some of which present this structure in an amazing pure form. Evidently this is the realm back to which the tale may be traced. On the other hand, the very same structure is exhibited, for example, by certain novels of chivalry. This is very likely a realm which itself may be traced back to the tale (p.198).
This passage, as a matter of fact, is quite revealing. It is significant in the sense that tales are not restricted to one kind of literary genres with regards to their structure. Elements of a fairy tale can be found in romantic novels, myth-books and the like. And it is no coincidence that such a well-known novelist as Charles Dickens should make use of fairy tales elements.

As to the source of the fairy tale, Propp wonders whether all tales, being not dissimilar in form and shape, take their rise and emanate from a single source. Propp is fully aware that the task is not that of a morphologist. But he ventures to find some answers to the question he has posed. For Propp, all tales pertain to one source. As far as Propp is concerned, ‘a single source’ does not necessarily mean that all tales come from Asia and spread from there to the other parts of the globe, taking different shapes and forms in the course of transition. If the case be so, the potential human creativity becomes abused. Tales, however, are the product of the human imaginative power. A power that enables the story teller to give birth to stories superbly made up.

Propp, however, likens the development of tales to “…every day life and religion…A way of life and religion die out, while their content turn into tales”. Let us take, in this respect, the American South which has witnessed a hard collapse, physically and spiritually. Its old-established traditions have turned into legend. In Faulkner’s novels, for instance, “the past takes on a sort of super-reality: its contours are hard and clear, unchangeable” Faulkner (1927). Even the ancestors come to be seen as mythical figures, endowed with extra-ordinary deeds. That is why we can say with Propp that although a way of life vanishes, its solid dimensions are set forth in tales.

Propp comes back to the patterns he draws for the tale. He once again asserts that “an absolute stability would seem to be unconfirmed by the fact that the sequence of functions is not always the same”. This assertion is of great significance. It is significant in the sense that it lets the morphologist free to approach tales that do not, of necessity, contain all the functions enumerated by Propp. This is quite helpful in approaching Dickens’ Great Expectations. As already stated, if a function does not figure in a tale, this does not mean that the structure of the tale gets affected. Propp notices here and elsewhere that “often it is possible…according to certain rudiments that this absence an amount to an omission”

Whether or not Propp’s theory can be relevant to Dickens’ novels, especially Great Expectations is what will appear in the course of this paper. And from which source Dickens has got these elements is not fully displayed. We have no clear-cut evidence that Dickens was influenced by The Arabian Nights. But what we are quite sure of is that the novelist, in a passage in Great Expectations, describes the downfall of Pip as that of a Sultan. Pip imparts to us the sudden decline he witnessed by saying:

“In the Easter story, the heavy slab that was to fall on the bed of state in the flush of conquest was slowly wrought out of the quarry, the tunnel for the rope to hold it in its place was slowly carried through the leagues of rock, the slab was slowly raised and fitted in the roof, the rope was rove to it and slowly taken through the miles of hollow to the great iron ring...So in my case; all the work, near and afar, that tended to the end, had been accomplished; and in instant the blow was struck, and the roof of my stronghold dropped upon me” (Great Expectations, Chapter 38)
The passage shows the extent to which Dickens was interested in Eastern stories. There is a reference to the fairy novels in which Dickens seemed to have been interested – *The Sultan of Minsar* and *Tales of the Genii* as examples. And it is no surprise that Dickens make use of elements of fairy tales in his novels, especially *Great Expectations*.

To sup up Vladimir Propp’s theory, we can say that the formalist has started with the question of categorizing and constructing, through a sort of organization, folktales. He tries to mark out the difference between ‘constant’ and ‘invariable’ morphological elements. He does this through his scrutiny of one hundred Russian fairy tales. Further, Propp has drawn four specific rules which have made the study of folk literature and fictions rely on a new basis. These rules are as follows:

a) Functions of characters serve as stable, constant elements in a tale independent of how and by whom they are fulfilled. They constitute the fundamental pattern of the tale.

b) The number of functions known to the fairy tale is limited.

c) The sequence of function is always identical.

d) All fairy tales are of one type in regard to their structure.

Thus far, we might as safely say that Propp’s theory of the folktale could find admittance into our subject matter. This is partly or wholly due to the fact that “Dickens was the great entertainer, the greatest entertainer, probably, in the history of fiction” Allen (1954). This view may be exaggerated; however, it contains some truth in it. What Allen wants to convey is that the aspect of amusement in Dickens’ novels is what makes the latter a well-known novelist. So with Vladimir Propp’s theory in mind, let us proceed to make apply it on our subject matter.

II- A morphological attempt at studying *Great Expectations* as a fairy tale based on Propp’s theory.

Having considered the major morphological elements that could be found in tales in general, the task that follows hard upon is to see whether all the functions enumerated by the Russian formalist, Propp, do figure in our object of analysis, *Great expectations*. Therefore, the first thing that we must start with is to break down the text-the novel- into major morphological components. This should be done through the grouping of the functions that are to be found in our subject matter.

It is stated by Propp that a tale normally always starts with what is called ‘initial situation’. This ‘initial situation’, however, provides a general atmosphere of the tale, especially with regards to its hero per se. In the very first page of *Great Expectations*, there is a somewhat innocent description of how the child, Pip, tries to know his real identity. Pip declares that “I never saw my father or my mother, and never saw any likeness of either of them; my first fancies regarding what they were like, were unreasonably derived from their tombstones” (*Great Expectations*, p.35)

From here it is made clear that the would-be hero is parentless. He is living with a sister who is married to a blacksmith. Poverty and orphanage are the atmosphere which Pip lives in. This situation is reinforced by the fact that the narrator gives us a global view of the place where the ‘future’ hero resides: “My first vivid and broad impression seems to me to have been gained on a
memorable raw afternoon towards evening. At such a time I found out for certain, that this bleak place was the church yard” (Great Expectations, p.35)

Thus, the initial position of the hero is made at full length. It is marked by hardship and misery. That is why Vladimir Propp asserts that “although this situation is not a function, it nevertheless is an important morphological element”. Propp has indicated that through this situation “the members of a family are enumerated or the future hero is simply introduced by mention of his name or indication of his status”. The first pages of our object of analysis make it plain that not only is the name of the hero mentioned but also his social rank is announced.

Although ‘the absention’ of which Propp speaks in his book does not literally find room in Great Expectations, the formalist gives another alternative which is kept within the scope of the first function. This alternative lies in the fact that “an intensified form of absention is represented by the death of the parents”. Therefore, the earlier pages of our novel make it clear that the hero-to-be is parentless and taken charge of by his sister. Here arises a question. What is the difference between ‘the initial situation’ and what Propp calls ‘absention’?

On the surface level, one might say that there is no difference between the two, since both of them revolve around one idea: the parentlessness of the hero. But, in truth, there is a clear but deep difference between these two morphological elements. ‘The initial situation’ is not a function but constitutes an important morphological ingredient in the tale. Moreover, through ‘the initial situation’ we come to know the number of people the family is composed of. ‘Absention’, on the other hand, is a function. And this is morphologically important.

Whereas ‘the initial situation’ tells us the number of people in a given family, the first function of the dramatis personae indicates that “one of the members of the (that) family absents himself from home” Propp (1927). Thus far, in Great Expectations this ‘absention’ amounts to the death of the hero’s parents. So instead of being cared for by a merciful father, Pip is surrounded by a mother-surrogate who “(has) a great reputation with herself and the neighbors because she (has) brought me up by hand” (Great Expectations, p.39)

It is noted in Propp’s theory that ‘interdiction’ follows immediately ‘absention’. For, according to Propp, “the tale generally mentions an ‘absention’ at first, and then an ‘interdiction’. But in some tales, the course of the event may be reversed to the point that “interdiction can … be made without being connected with ‘an absention’”. In the case of Great Expectations ‘interdiction’ comes next to ‘absention’. In this our novel respects the order suggested by Propp. Here an illumination must be made, though.

An interdiction is normally imposed on the hero of the tale by his parents. But when the parents are no more alive, the prohibition comes from the hero’s elders or seniors, either through warning or through ruthless pieces of advice. In fact, one of the ruthless patrons of Pip is Pumblechook. The name itself is suggestive. It is so in the sense that this man-Pumblechook-always makes Pip get shaken by the elder’s nonsensical claims of a patron. This ‘patron’, in effect, keeps on time and time again giving ‘sermons’ to Pip. On one occasion, Pip tells us that:

It became sheer monomania in my master’s daughter to care a button for me; and all I can say my grasping and procrastinating conduct on the fatal morning, is, that it was
An Attempt at Applying Vladimir Propp’s *Morphology of the Folktale*

Vladimir Propp suggests that ‘interdiction’ goes hand in hand with ‘violation’. Both functions constitute what Propp calls ‘a paired element’. In *Great Expectations*, however, violation takes some deeper significance. Pip’s violation of the interdiction is twofold: it comes from within and from without. Throughout the first stage of the novel, we have noticed that Pip is no longer satisfied with his status. His dissatisfaction is justified on the grounds that he has always been the center of his elder’s mockery. Propp tells us, in his book, that interdiction is motivated. This is morphologically significant in regards to the hero of our novel.

In this respect, Pip confesses the reality of his situation and says that ‘I am not at all happy as I am. I am disgusted with my calling and with my life’. And what further motivates and intensifies Pip’s sense of discontent is his exposure to *Satis House*, being a totally different world from his own. This dissatisfaction, nevertheless, leads Pip to be no longer grateful to those who brought him up by hand. Instead, he would fain like to repudiate his old associates and cronies. In this sense, Pip’s violation takes on yet another dimension. It becomes a violation of the sanctity of human relationship and warm fellowship.

At this stage, Propp notices that “…a new personage who can be termed the villain, enters the tale…the villain may be … a devil or… a witch” (p.192). Strangely enough, in *Great Expectations* we have both Orlick and Miss Havisham as devil and witch respectively. However, when we first take notice of his appearance, Orlick seems to be “a broad-shouldered loose-limbed swarthy fellow of great strength, never in a hurry, and always slouching…he would slouch out, as if he had no idea where he was going and no intention of ever coming back” (Great Expectations, p.140)

What is really striking about the description above is that Orlick is no better than a devilish figure given demon-like delineation: ‘great strength’, ‘Cain’, and ‘the wandering Jew’. This fiendish figure, however, causes physical harm to Pip. Anyone, while reading *Great Expectations*, can well remember the famous scene in which Pip is entrapped by Orlick, the villain of the tale. Here an important element crops out: ‘trickery’. Orlick has used some of his treachery and tricks to isolate Pip and kill Pip thereupon. To execute his devilish plan, Orlick has sent a letter to Pip, calling him to come in the indicated place as soon as possible. And when

“I(Pip) turned round to do so, and had taken up the candle in my hand, ...it was extinguished by some violent shock, and the next thing I comprehended, was, that I had been caught in a strong running noose, thrown over my head from behind” (Great Expectations, p.434)
So, here, Orlick, the villain, ‘attempts’ to deceive his victim (Pip) in order to take possession of him. This is morphologically important. And equally important is that the victim submits to the deception and thereby unwittingly helps his enemy. Had he known what awaited him, Pip would not have come in response to the letter he receives from Orlick. Pip, however, emerges from his ‘abduction’ seriously injured in his arms.

On the other hand, when we first take sight of Miss Havisham, she appears no better than a sorceress. Pip reports to us how he sees Miss Havisham, the witch

“I saw that (the) dress had been put upon the rounded figure of a...woman, and that the figure upon which it now hung loose, had shrunk to skin and bone. I had been taken to see some ghostly waxwork... (and) once I had been taken to one of our old march churches to see a skeleton...Now, waxwork and skeleton seemed to have dark eyes that moved and looked at me” (Great Expectations, p.87)

What is suggestive about the passage is that all the requirements of a dangerous witch are present in Miss Havisham. Not even so, but also her ‘dwelling’ is associated with darkness. Light is never admitted to her strange house. This gives it a sense of melancholy. It also gives Miss Havisham an atmospheric opportunity to brood revenge against male sex. In other words, Miss Havisham’s place of residence is not dissimilar, in its darkness and perverseness, to Fagin’s home. Dickens’ description of the Jew’s house, in Oliver Twist, does not contradict Fain’s evil character:

“The walls and ceiling of the room were perfectly black with age and dirt...In a frying-pan, which was on the fire, and which was secured to the mantelshelf by a string, some sausages were cooking, and standing over them, with a toasting fork in his hand, was a very old shrunken Jew, whose villainous-looking and repulsive face was obscured by a quantity of matted red hair” (Oliver Twist, p.27)

As it appears from the description of Fagin is that the points of similarity between him and Miss Havisham are strikingly abundant. Both are associated with darkness. Both dwell in dark places. In them both, outward darkness reflects their inward psychic enigma. And if Orlock causes physical injury to Pip, Miss Havisham effectuates spiritual harm to the hero. She has given rise to Pip’s spiritual injury when she lets him believe that she is his benefactress. The moment he receives his materialistic expectations, Pip links Miss Havisham with his fortune. Pip takes it as axiomatic that Miss Havisham will make him be “removed from his present sphere of life and be brought up as a ‘gentleman’.

More than that, Pip takes it for granted that “Miss Havisham (is) going to make my fortune on a grand scale” (Great Expectations, p.165).Furthermore, this ‘witch’ would encourage her ward, Estella, to make Pip believe that she (Estella) is designed for him, together with wealth and higher position. The dramatic irony lies in the fact that “upon the return of Magwitch (Pip’s real benefactor), Pip is forced to wake up and recognize that life is not, after all, a fairy tale. He learns that the source of his wealth comes from a run-away convict. This, in effect, causes Pip’s spiritual and psychological harm. We are to remember, by means of illustration, that injury caused to the hero is an important morphological element. And what of great significance is that Pip’s injury, in its physical and spiritual senses, is caused by the mischievous villains of the tale.
That a tale contains both villainy and lack at the same time is mainly due to the genius of its maker. Although the Russian formalist observes that at times ‘villainy’ is replaced either by ‘lack’ or ‘insufficiency’, *Great Expectations* combines the two important morphological components. Accordingly, in the first pages of the novel, we have noticed that the would-be hero is deprived of something—of many things, as a matter of fact. In the course of narration, we come to know that Pip is bereaved of complete human kindness. Here a clarification should be made.

Vladimir Propp notes that sometimes “the structure of the tale demands that the hero leave home at any cost. But in Pip’s case, it seems impossible for him to go to London to be trained as a ‘gentleman’, as he is poor. Propp, in this respect, points out that the story teller should employ what he calls ‘the connective incident’ to accomplish the removal of the hero from home. In accordance with this, we notice that although Pip is relatively poor, he is to go to London to be educated as a gentleman. So the journey from Pip’s village to London is quite significant. This form of ‘pilgrimage’ on the part of the hero signifies a search for a better life, given the evidence that Pip has grown dissatisfied with the life he leads in the marches as a blacksmith’s apprentice. More than that, Pip, before he leaves home, has been tormented by his patrons— a point back to which I will come.

Assuming that Miss Havisham is his benefactress, Pip gets infatuated with her ward, Estella. In the process, he becomes passive. He becomes passive as to the source of his real sponsor, and passive in his view of the lady with whom he has fallen in love. Pip goes so far as to “allow himself to be pushed along, never challenging that he must not look too closely into the source of his …fortune…He is passive in longing for Estella” Monyahan (1946). The latter embodies for him all he hankers after: gentility and higher social position.

If, on the surface level, the hero seems to be passive he is, in reality active. This seems paradoxical. In this sense, Vladimir Propp observes that the hero needs a ‘magical agent’. In *Great Expectations*, this ‘magical agent’ takes the shape of a devilish being: Orlick. At close scrutiny of the novel, there appears that almost all the characters who have effectuated the hero’s injury—both physical and psychological—get punished. And who by? Ironically, they have been castigated indirectly through Pip’s ‘punitive’ agent: Orlick. It is no surprise, then, that Pumblechook be attacked by a gang led by Orlick. It is also no fallacy that Orlick sets upon Mrs. Joe whom Pip fearfully dislikes. All this indicates that ‘passivity’ is but outwardly seen. In this respect, Propp observes that “If the agent received is a living creature, its help is put directly (or indirectly) to use on the command of the hero. With this the hero outwardly loses all significance; he himself does nothing” (p.50).

In the case of Miss of Miss Havisham’s, there is no Orlick. That is, when Miss Havisham gets burnt, the man who has effectuated Pip’s revenge has not been present. How can we account for this? Propp tells us that one of the morphological functions of the tale is that “the hero and the villain join in direct combat-struggle”. This happens when Pip goes to visit Miss Havisham after the marriage of Estella. He enters with the ‘witch’ in a struggle that begins verbally and then takes on a somewhat physical fight. Let us consider the following passage wherein Pip ‘tries’ to put out the fire off the ‘witch’:
In the passage above, Pip tells us that he wants to rescue Miss Havisham from fire. But how can it be that a person watching a lady burning into flames of fire, then jumping with courage to her rescue? Pip, however, in the process of sketching his rescue is determined to remark that ‘we were on the ground like desperate enemies’. Hence, the struggle with the villain is a morphologically significant element in the structure of the tale.

Perhaps the most significant of all functions is that which necessitates a difficult task to be done by the hero per se. Propp observes that that the hero should; and ought to, perform an undertaking. This morphological ingredient is present in Great Expectations. Upon the return of the hero’s real benefactor, Pip has been faced by a number of difficult tasks; the most important of all being the task related to the run-away convict, Magwitch. Here some illumination must be made. Pip’s real ‘donor’ is a transported convict. This means that the convict has no right to set foot on his home-country.

Driven by a desire to see ‘his brought up London gentleman’, Magwitch risks his life. Here an important morphological function intrudes. Pip, for whose sake the convict come back home, should and ought to save the man. This means that Pip, being a hero, has to make an effort to rescue the convict. The task, then, is of great danger. In effect, Pip resolves to help the ‘donor’. He decides to smuggle the convict through a boat. More than that, the fact that the convict’s security depends on the responsibility of Pip causes him to become morally disturbed to the point that he wonders “where I might go, what I might do, or when I might return…vex(ed) my mind…for it was wholly bet on Provis’s safety” (Great Expectations, pp.444-5). In the utterance quoted above, we notice the repetition of ‘might’; which indicates that the task at Pip’s hand is very perilous and imbued with doubt.

What is striking, at this very stage, is that in the process of getting the convict out of England, Pip is pursued. The pursuit of the hero, to be remembered, is a morphological function which is of great importance to the structure of the tale. And we have already noticed, the villain Orlick seems to dog Pip’s footprints, and keeps watching his moves. Because of that villainous figure, Magwitch’s safety is threatened.

At this point, the novel draws to its close. Pip, through the journey he has made from the village to the metropolis, has learnt a great deal. He has learnt that “the world is not a vast mammary gland from which he can draw rich nourishment with moral impunity” (Great Expectations, p.446). Here arises a question. Is it not compatible and suitable that Pip, the hero, having been exposed to various hardships and misery, get a reward?

As far as the morphological structure of the tale is concerned, the hero should by all means receive a reward. Pip does. His reward is intensified and solidified through his marriage to a lady
whose hand Pip “(takes)… and in all the broad expanse of tranquil light… I (see) no shadow of another parting from her” (Great Expectations, p.493). This ending or ‘closure’, however, is justified, because there has been ‘liquidation’ of misfortune: the villains of the tale get punished. Both Orlick and Miss Havisham vanish from the hero’s life by getting imprisoned and by being no longer alive. We are to be reminded, nonetheless, that the castigation of the two villains is a function which comes close to the novel’s closure.

What is quite noticeable about Great Expectations, however, is the very limited number of the morphological functions it contains. This does not by any means affect the structure of the work as a whole. On the contrary, the novel retains its structural unity. And as far as Vladimir Propp is concerned, all tales are of one type in regards to their structure. This means that although Great Expectations as a fairy tale presents only some morphological functions that are ranged from lack, villainy to Pip’s marriage, the organic unity of the tale is preserved.

Conclusion

In the course of our analysis, it appears clearer that Charles Dickens’s use of folktale elements in not due to chance. It is something really systematized and methodized. For although the Victorian fiction seems, on the surface level, to have cut itself from medieval literature, novelists still tended to use some primitive requirements of prose writing. This is quite apparent in the narrative forms that, though having known some considerable evolution, still retain the pristine narrative devices.

Dickens, being one of the famous early Victorian prose writers, took his literary material from different sources. The folk substance, however, seems to have been given justice by the writer? His use of folk material enables the novelist to bestow upon his characters some mythic and universal characteristics. In Great Expectations, however, Dickens’ handling of folk material and substance figures in a manner that is strikingly astonishing. It is striking in that the narrative techniques used in fairy tales and myth books are not dissimilar to the narrative devices used in our object of analysis.

This is why we have observed that Great Expectations makes use of such artifices as exaggeration and points of hyper coincidences. In this respect, we may refer to a greatest figure in the world of drama, William Shakespeare. This great poet and playwright had himself made use of fairy tale components in some of his comedies. Particularly in The Winter Tale and A Midsummer Night’s Dream, fairies are given considerable importance. But the question that concerns us most is the following: Has Propp’s formalistic theory of the folktale succeeded in achieving a formalistic reading of our subject-matter, Great Expectations?

No doubt, Vladimir Propp’s theory suggests a new way of approaching works of art. This theory, in fact, is a kind of intellectual revolutionary reaction against traditional approaches. For Propp, however, a work of art must be regarded as a work of art: no more, no less. In his book, Propp insists on the presence within literary works of every thing necessary for their analysis. In other words, Propp seems to emphasize the importance of structural tightness in works of art. Therefore, it is thanks to Propp’s theory that we have been able to break Great Expectations into its major morphological components.
In fine, the novel appears to possess an organic unity, and although the novel does not contain all the functions enumerated by Propp, it still preserves its sense of oneness. This notion of oneness is well-observed in our dissection of the novel. Great Expectations, however, begins by an ‘initial situation’ of the hero, moves to what Propp calls ‘intermediary’ functions, and ends in the hero’s marriage. More than that, we have seen that what Propp seems to insist on in his Morphology of the Folktale is depicted in Great Expectations.

We have noticed that Pip is warned to be ‘grateful’ to his elders, which is in a sense a kind of ‘interdiction’. And immediately after that, we have seen that this ‘interdiction’ is violated the moment Jaggers the lawyer announces Pip’s expectations. Hence Propp’s ‘paired-element’ is retained. We have also noticed that the hero of the tale, Pip, has unintentionally submitted to the deception of the ‘villains’. Orlick has tricked him thereby attempting to kill him. Miss Havisham, on the other hand, deceives Pip in letting him believe that she is his benefactress. Hence: the achievement of ‘villainy’ which is an important function stated by Propp. Further, the use of the ‘connective incident’ is quite apparent in our novel; otherwise, how can we explain Pip’s removal from the marches despite his relative poverty? More, we have been able to notice that Pip goes through what is called ‘initiation’, during which “the hero undergoes a series of excruciating ordeals in passing from ignorance and immaturity to social and spiritual adulthood”.

To be more accurate, we can say that the hero of our tale has gone through three different phases: ‘separation’, ‘transformation’ and ‘return’, in the course of which Pip has learned a great deal and is finally rewarded. His ‘reward’, in fact, amounts to his marriage to Estella. Hence: happy ending. We have already seen that the structure of Great Expectations proves to possess an organic unity. This unity makes the relationship between each of the parts and the whole moves to an understanding of the whole work.

This leads us to conclude that Dickens’ handling of folk material is what has made Vladimir Propp’s theory all-pervading in our object of analysis. It is also due to the fact that Dickens “was a fantasist, and he forces us to accept the world he creates by the sheer compelling power of the intensity of his imagination… it was an hallucinatory imagination” Allen (1927). Here W. Allen ascribes Dickens’ prolific creation to the novel’s creative power, and it is due to his imagination that Dickens, consciously or unconsciously, followed the narrative devices implemented in fairy-tales by his predecessors.

About the Author
Professor Khalid LAHLOU is a senior lecturer, Hassan II University, Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences at Ben Msik, Casablanca, Morocco. Graduated from Essex University, Colchester, UK, LAHLOU has been teaching a number of courses, among which we can cite: Introduction to Cultural Studies, Afro-American Studies, Readings in Culture, Study Skills, and Guided Reading etc. His areas of interest are English and American literatures and comparative cultures.

References
Forester, E.M (1927), *Aspect of the Novel*, King’s College, Cambridge
Leavis, F.R, and Q.D (1970), *Dickens the Novelist*, Singapore (S.E Asia) Pte ltd
Sklouskij, Viktor (1942), *O teorii prozy*, Moscow, Russia
Transadapting the Cultural Realia of Soviet Russia to an Arab Audience: The Case of the Film Утомленные Солнцем (Burnt by the Sun)

Katsiaryna Panasiuk
Translation and Interpreting Institute, College of Humanities and Social Sciences
Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha, Qatar

Rashid Yahiaoui
Translation and Interpreting Institute, College of Humanities and Social Sciences
Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha, Qatar

Abstract
Since the advent of the cinema, films started playing an important role in promoting knowledge about different countries and peoples. Taking the film Утомленные Солнцем (Burnt by the Sun) as a case study, the authors aim to describe translation strategies for transadapting cultural realia in their own Arabic dubbing script, and to look at them from the perspective of the translation norms that are operational in the Arab society. For the analysis of strategies of transadapting cultural realia into Arabic, the researchers use the taxonomy developed by Pedersen (Pedersen, 2005). They also employ the concept of norms by Toury (Toury, (1995/2012)) since these norms take into account cultural and social constraints of the community, which have an impact on the translator’s choices. The results of the study show that mostly source text-oriented strategies were used for transadapting the Soviet Russia cultural realia, with the exception of the realia belonging to the category of linguistic culture. It is true, however, that the norms operating in the Arab society and the constraints of the dubbing and subtitling modes can impact the translator’s choice to a large extent.

Key words: cultural realia, norms, Russian cinematography, Russian into Arabic dubbing, transadaptation

Cite as: Panasiuk, K., & Yahiaoui, R. (2017). Transadapting the Cultural Realia of Soviet Russia to an Arab Audience: The Case of the Film Утомленные Солнцем (Burnt by the Sun). Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 1(3).
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.9
Introduction
Throughout history, people have been using different media to obtain information. A turning point came with the creation of cinematography when films, in addition to fulfilling their aesthetic and entertainment functions, also started playing a leading role in disseminating knowledge and bridging gaps between cultures.

The Russian cinema of the early post-Soviet period is an indispensable part of world heritage. The movies of that time were influenced by the important historic events that took place on the threshold of the collapse of the Soviet Union. Interest in those events especially increased after Mikhail Gorbachev came to power in 1985 and continued perestroika. This innovative political course eventually led to the collapse of the USSR in 1991—an event which affected the countries of the Soviet bloc and reshaped the world map.

Naturally, the interest in the country was followed by an interest in its cinematography. Nowadays, due to the close cooperation between Russia and the Arab world in an array of spheres, Arab residents of the Gulf are coming to know more about Russian culture and history, which have influenced many aspects of life in the whole world. A brief survey conducted among 28 Master’s degree Arab students in Qatar suggests that, in general, Arabs of the Gulf have some knowledge about Russian and Soviet history; however, their knowledge remains limited. At the same time, they are eager to learn more from different sources, and consider movies to be a reasonable channel of information.

With all this in mind, the researchers have chosen to study the issue of transadapting culturally bound items, or cultural realia, of the Russian film Утомленные Солнцем ([Utomlennye Solntsem], Burnt by the Sun) (Mikhalkov, 1994) for the Arab audience in the Arabic language. By transadaptation the authors mean what Gambier, (2003) calls “a term which might allow us to go beyond the usual dichotomy (literal/free translation, translation/adaptation, etc.) and take target audiences into consideration more directly” (p. 178), and which includes different types of audiovisual activity, such as subtitling and dubbing.

The movie Утомленные Солнцем is an Oscar-winning film by Nikita Mikhalkov that was officially issued with closed English subtitles. The film elucidates and covertly criticizes life in the USSR at the peak of the Stalinist repressions in the 1930’s and speaks about Soviet cultural phenomena that have played an important role in modern Russia’s development up to the present day. Moreover, along with the international importance of the epoch depicted in the film, as well as the film’s aesthetic values, it also touches on the topics of freedom of speech and repressive regimes, progressive technologies, and state security—all of which are highly relevant to the world in general and the Arab world in particular.

As a common practice, movies screened for film festivals are subtitled into English and the language of the country. However, subtitles, although having many benefits for the viewers and film distributors, have their own disadvantages. These drawbacks are mostly associated with the fact that subtitles often prevent viewers from concentrating on the visual parts of the film. In the case of the film Утомленные Солнцем, it can be regarded as a substantial disadvantage, since the movie has received many international accolades, including praise for the visuals. Driven by the desire to transmit that visual beauty to the viewers, overall, dubbing was opted for while only subtitling songs and visual signs (posters) into Arabic.
For this research, transadaptation in Arabic for sections of the film that include instances of cultural realia was prepared, and the strategies opted for were analyzed through the prism of a specific theoretical model. The following sections will shed light on the scope of the concept of cultural realia and the applied theoretical model.

Cultural Realia and Their Rendering in Audiovisual Translation (AVT)

Taking into consideration the multiplicity of studies dealing with translating cultural elements, it is not surprising that different scholars use different terms and definitions while referring to the same phenomenon. For example, as Terestyenyi, (2011) posits, “it is not always clear which words and expressions should be considered culture-specific items, even in the literature of translation several names exist for these items: realia, culture-specific items and culturally bound items” (p. 13). Chaume, (2012) offers other terms, such as micro-signs, culturemes, extralinguistic references and culture entities. Scholars also have different understandings of culture, sometimes including in it the concept of ideology. Thus, according to Calzada Pérez, (2003) ideology is “the set of ideas, values and beliefs that govern a community by virtue of being regarded as the norm” (p. 5). On the other hand, she considers culture as “an integrated system of learned behavior patterns that are characteristic of the members of any given society” (p. 23). As Yahiaoui, (2014) rightly notices, “It is evident that the difference is barely tangible between the two definitions” (p. 13). However, despite this overlap, Yahiaoui, (2014) claims, “I do not use these two notions interchangeably, I use ideology to indicate religious, political and personal opinions, and culture to the acquired traditions, customs and way of life of a given society” (p. 14), thus separating the two concepts from each other.

On another note, issues commonly regarded as linguistic, also tend to be analyzed within the research on culture-bound elements. Thus, Leppihalme, (1997) admits that culture-bound elements “can be more problematic for the translator than the semantic or syntactic difficulties of the text” (p. 2–3). Although she says that “some researchers have focused on mainly extralinguistic phenomena, from natural (topography, flora and fauna, etc) to man-made (social institutions, buildings, trademarks, etc)” (Leppihalme, 1997, p.2-3), culture-bound elements are not limited to these notions only. Leppihalme, (1997) agrees that culture-bound translation problems can be seen as “intralinguistic and pragmatic (involving idioms, puns, wordplay or ways of, for instance, addressing a person, complimenting him or her, or apologizing)” (p. 3), which allows the researchers to broaden the scope of the phenomenon.

AVT in the Arab World

In the Arab world, studies of AVT were carried by several scholars. To the best of the writers’ knowledge, the earliest research dedicated to the Arabic subtitles was carried by Khuddro (2000). In his study, the author discusses the types of subtitles in general, the common mistakes in Arabic subtitling, and the issue of censorship. A broader spectrum of linguistic, ideological and cultural aspects, and technical constraints of Arabic subtitling was analyzed by Mazid (2006), Abd-El-Kareem (2010), and Thawabteh (2011). A detailed study of the problems of euphemisation and dysphemisation in subtitles was conducted by Al-Adwan (2015) and Thawabteh (2012) who based their researches on the American sitcom Friends and the Egyptian film Ramadan atop the Volcano respectively. One of the newest research papers on Arabic subtitling, specifically fansubbing, has been recently published by Eldalees, Al-Adwan and Yahiaoui (2017) who analyzed amateur Arabic subtitles of the American movie The Wolf of Wall Street.
When it comes to research in Arabic dubbing, an array of topics has been studied by different scholars. For example, Maluf (2003, 2005) explored the reasons of failure of some American TV products and success of Mexican soap operas dubbed into Educated Spoken Arabic. Zitawi (2003) and Di Giovanni (2016) carried out their researches of linguistic, cultural, social and political alterations in the Arabic dubbing of cartoons. The issue of ideological and cultural constraints in dubbing was raised by Yahiaoui (2014) who analyzed the American sitcom The Simpsons.

However, the analysis of AVT in the Arab world leaves many areas for further investigation. As Gamal, (2013) puts it, AVT “needs to be examined on a much broader level that examines not only polysemiotic nature of the audiovisual text but brings in the multidisciplinary impact of the overarching term ‘audiovisual translation’” (p. 372). It is also worth mentioning that, to the best of the authors’ knowledge, no analysis at all has been carried out in terms of Russian-Arabic AVT in general, not to mention cultural phenomena. Anecdotal evidence based on the transient references in various articles on the topic of dubbing and subtitling from Russian suggests that there might have been old Soviet movies in the 1950’s and 1960’s dubbed into Modern Standard Arabic, but no solid proof of this was uncovered. Meanwhile, studies on dubbing into Arabic were carried out by Maluf (2003, 2005), Gamal (2013) and Yahiaoui (2014), however, they were done within the English-Arabic language pair. Therefore, this research provides a good opportunity to start an academic conversation in the Arab and Russophone worlds about Russian-Arabic dubbing and to promote further studies in the area of dubbing in general.

Theoretical Framework

In order to clear any possible ambiguities and to facilitate the consistency of the terminology used in the paper, in the beginning, the authors clarified the scope of the key concepts. For the purpose of this study, and taking into account that ideology and culture are closely intertwined, the writers analyzed the ideological concepts of the film within cultural realia. Like Leppihalme, (1997), they also included in their analysis instances of cultural realia that are expressed linguistically, specifically idioms, word play, and the ways of addressing people. It is important to mention that in this paper, for the sake of consistency, the writers used the term cultural realia, which they see as synonymous to all the terms mentioned previously.

Cultural realia in the Arabic script were analyzed in light of Pedersen’s model (2005) due to its clear taxonomy, connection with the AVT mode and consideration of paratextual parameters that may influence the translator’s decisions. Taking into account the target audience, the Arab society, which, as Yahiaoui (2014) puts it, “as open and liberal as it may be, lives by religious, cultural, and in some countries, tribal values” (p. 138–39), Toury’s concept of norms is also used in the analysis of the transadaptation strategies. Toury (2012) sees norms as “the translation of general values or ideas shared by a community - as to what is right or wrong, adequate and inadequate – into performance instructions appropriate for and applicable to particular situations” (p. 63). This statement is particularly valid when it comes to the analysis of norms of films in the Arab society with its rejection or euphemisation of topics dealing with sex, religion, bodily functions, and its intolerance of insults and foul language (Al-Adwan, 2015; Yahiaoui, 2014).

As mentioned before, the researchers applied Pedersen’s (2005) model for describing the strategies to which they resorted in their translation of cultural realia for the Arab audience. The logical intertwining of Pedersen’s (Pedersen, 2005) model and the concept of norms by Toury
(1995, 2012) is underlined by Pedersen himself while discussing the notion of translation crisis points in translating extra-cultural references (ECR’s). According to Pedersen, (2005), translation crisis points mean “the turning points at which the translators have to make active decisions, and these points are thus indicative of overall strategy and to what norms the translator professes” (p.1).

Seven strategies were singled out—retention, specification, direct translation, generalization, substitution, official equivalent and omission—all of which were found in the analysis of the researchers’ data. According to Pedersen’s model, the first three strategies are considered to be source text (ST)-oriented. Retention is identified as “the most SL-oriented strategy” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 4) since it allows an ST element to enter the target text with or without being adjusted to the target language. Specification, is realized in two ways: either through explicitation which involves “expansion of the text, or spelling out anything that is implicit in the ST” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 4) or through addition which implies adding some latent information about the cultural realia. Direct translation, being on the borderline between ST- and target text (TT)-oriented strategies, does not cause any changes in the semantic load.

The next two strategies are considered to be more target language (TL)-oriented; generalization, means replacing an instance of cultural realia referring to something specific by something more general, hence hyponymy, while substitution, presumes replacing the source text realia either with a cultural realia operating in the target text (cultural substitution), or does not involve introducing cultural realia into the target text at all. In this scenario, the translator deals with paraphrase which can be realized in two forms: either through transferring the meaning and connotations of the source text cultural realia into the target text (paraphrase with sense transfer), or by complete removal or replacement of the cultural realia, regardless of the original sense (situational paraphrase).

The last two strategies in Pedersen’s (Pedersen, 2005) taxonomy, official equivalent and omission, lie beyond the ST-TT dichotomy. Official equivalent strategy leads to a fixed standard expression in the target language for the word or expression in the source language and is unlikely to create any translation crisis point. As for omission, it presumes replacing instances of cultural realia with nothing for an array of reasons, among which it being “the only viable option” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 9) or due to translators’ “laziness” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 9).

Figure 1 gives a pictorial view of Pedersen’s strategies, which according to him, are arranged from the most ST oriented (in yellow) to the most TT oriented (in blue).
Applying the abovementioned definitions of cultural realia, the authors extracted 230 instances from the corpus of the film. Taking into account the norms operating in the Arabic society, the target audience familiarity with the subject of the film, and the restrictions of subtitling and dubbing, the researchers transadapted the instances of cultural realia. In the end, conclusions were made about the patterns applied to translating cultural realia belonging to different semantic categories.

In order to look at certain paradigms applied to the translation of Soviet cultural realia, first, the writers divided them into semantic categories. For this purpose, they used the taxonomy suggested by the studies of Vlakhov and Florin, (1980) and Ku, (2006) as cited in Fernández Guerra, 2012, p. 3–4). In spite of the fact that these categories are rather tentative and occasionally overlapping, they illustrate the richness and variety of the analyzed material and are convenient for use in the discussion of the translation strategies. Therefore, after analysis of the corpus, the authors singled out four semantic categories which in total include 230 instances.

Translating Geography and Environment
This category encompasses environment, including ecology and place names, and is mainly borrowed from Ku’s (2006) (as cited in Fernández Guerra, 2012, p. 3–4). This is the least represented semantic category with 26 extracted instances. Some of the examples of geographic realia and their translation into Arabic are presented in table 1.
Table 1. Strategies for rendering geographic realia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
<th>Strategy for rendering into Arabic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Вы прослушали выступление генерального прокурора Союза ССР товарища Вышинского. [You have listened to the speech by the prosecutor general of the Union of the SSR comrade Vychinsky].</td>
<td>لقد استمعتم لخطاب النائب العام للاتحاد السوفياتي الرفيع (فيشينسكي). [You have listened to the speech of the prosecutor general of the Soviet Union comrade Vychinsky].</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. (Под Парижем играл в ресторанчике маленьким). Сейчас здесь, под Москвой. В Подольске. [I was playing near Paris in a small restaurant. Now, here, near Moscow. In Podolsk].</td>
<td>كنت أعزف في مطعم قرب باريس. الآن قرب موسكو، أخيراً. [I was playing at a restaurant close to Paris. Now near Moscow, since recently].</td>
<td>Substitution (situational paraphrase)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Почитай родителей. И люби свою советскую родину. [Respect your parents. And love your Soviet fatherland].</td>
<td>إحترمي والديك. وأحبي وطنك السوفيتي. [Respect your parents. And love your Soviet fatherland].</td>
<td>Direct translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Помогите. Загорянка или Загоренка, деревня? [Help. Where is Zagorianka or Zagorienka, village?]</td>
<td>آسف. ساعدني. أين قرية (زاغورینکا) أو (زْغورنکا)؟ [Help me. Where is the village of Zagorianka or Zagorienka?]</td>
<td>Retention</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, geographical realia in the movie included the names of the local villages (ex. Zagorianka, Petriaevo), cities (Moscow, Podolsk), areas (vicinities of Moscow) and the country (the USSR). According to the analysis, the most recurrent strategy used while translating geographical places was that of retention. Out of 26 instances, 21 geographical realia were translated into Arabic employing this strategy. Although, Pedersen, (2005) himself calls retention “not the most felicitous way of solving an ECR crisis point that involves a Monocultural ECR” (p. 4), he agrees that this strategy “displays most fidelity towards the ST” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 4). This adds to the credibility of the dubbing script of the movie which tells about the events unfolding in a foreign country with a background different from the target audience’s.

In many cases, geographical references are repeated, as in the case of the driver looking for the village Zagorienka or Zagorianka (example 4), which is mentioned in the movie eight times.
Although this village seems to be unknown even to the local residents, this reference is central on the macro level, since the driver’s search for that place links all the events into a single whole in the end and even causes his death, therefore it is required to be transferred to the audience. In spite of the fact, that the Arab audience, understandably, may hardly guess what the word Zagorianka refers to in general, the initial use of this name followed by the hyperonym village makes the task easier in the other seven cases. Therefore, after having explained the meaning of the cultural realia once in the co-text through addition of the more general term village, the authors did not have to perform the same task every time in order to disambiguate the meaning of the place name.

Another case is the translation of the city Podolsk in example 2. Since this city is mentioned in passing just once and does not play a significant role in the plot, initially, the researchers chose to remove it from the dubbing script so as not to overload the target audience with the extra information. However, after the character prounces the first part of the sentence Сейчас здесь, под Москвой. ([Now, here, near Moscow]), it is visible that he still continues moving his lips, saying something although the camera is not in a close-up. Therefore, this constraint of the dubbing, specifically, lips synchronization, made the authors of the paper search for words to fill in that time stretch where the actor notably utters words. In this case, the writers decided to remove the name of the city and replace it with something that fits the situation, irrespective of the sense of the original cultural realia, which in Pedersen’s (2005) taxonomy is called situational paraphrase.

Examples 1 and 3 are rendered through selecting an official equivalent and direct translation strategies respectively. Overall, out of 26 instances of geographical realia, 21 were translated into Arabic through retention, three through direct translation, one through official equivalent and one through substitution (situational paraphrase).

Translating Cultural Heritage

The second category, cultural heritage, also offered by Ku, covers “religious beliefs, historical events, characters, festivities, folklore, housing, objects, etc.” (cited in Fernández Guerra, 2012, p. 3–4). Overall, the researchers came across 73 instances belonging to this category. They cover a wide range of subcategories: historic personalia and cultural figures (14 instances), names of currencies (two), household objects and structures (16), holidays and historic events (20), folklore characters (nine), literary and musical pieces of arts (three), traditions (two), songs (five), and poems (two).

All the seven strategies were exploited to render the meaning of cultural realia belonging to the category into Arabic. Out of the 73 instances, 43 cases were rendered through direct translation, 11 cases through retention, nine through substitution (three through paraphrase with sense transfer, six through cultural substitution), five through specification (two additions and three explicitations), three cases through official equivalent, two cases of generalization, and one through omission. Also, in one case the authors had to refer to the combination of strategies, specifically specification (addition) and retention.

As it follows from the breakdown of the strategies for this category, the most popular strategy was that of direct translation. The instances rendered through direct translation were all the songs and poems, 19 instances of references to historic events and holidays (out of 20), 11 references to household objects and structures (out of 16), as well as a small number of cultural
realia from other categories. According to Pedersen (2005), while applying this strategy, “the semantic load of the ST ECR is unchanged” (2005, p. 5). In this case, the target audience is not guided in any particular way, but rather is left to make their own decisions about the unfolding of the events in the film.

Also, it is worth mentioning, that all the poems and songs in the movie were rendered through direct translation. These are the famous Russian song Вечерний Звон [Evening Bell] (written in 1827), the tango Утомленное Солнце [Wearied Sun] (1935), Песня о Встреченном [The Song about the Passer-by] (1931), the elegy Массне [Massne] performed by the renowned Feodor Chaliapin in 1907, a poem Жираф [Giraffe] (1907) by Nikolay Gumilyov and a Soviet children’s poem about Stalin by an unknown author. Moreover, the researchers decided to follow the established tradition in the Russian cinema, and subtitled the songs, leaving the audience a chance to listen to the authentic sound which added to the verisimilitude of the atmosphere of the mid 1930’s. Some examples of cultural realia rendered through direct translation are presented in table 2 below.

Table 2. Examples of applying direct translation strategy for rendering cultural heritage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Я совсем не понимаю. Зачем нужно ходить в эту грязную деревенскую баню? [I don’t understand why they have to go to that dirty steam bath].</td>
<td>أنا لا أفهم إطلاقاً! لماذا عليهم الذهاب إلى حمام البخار القذر؟ [I don’t understand at all why they have to go to that dirty steam bath].</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Утомленное солнце нежно с морем прощалось. [Wearied sun was gently saying goodbye to the sea, at this moment you confessed that you didn’t love me]. (song)</td>
<td>كانت الشمس الخلاَّبة تُوَدَّع البحر بلطف، وفي هذا الوقت اعترفتِ أنكِ لا تحملين لي أي حب. [Wearied sun was gently saying goodbye to the sea, at this moment you confessed that you didn’t carry love for me]. (song, subtitled)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 С днем сталинского дирижаблестроения! [Holiday of Stalin’s balloon builders] (poster)</td>
<td>عيد بناني مناطيد (ستالين) السعيد! [Holiday of Stalin’s balloon builders] (poster, subtitled)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is interesting to note that although overall, direct translation strategy prevailed in rendering cultural realia falling under the category of cultural heritage, it was not predominant within each of the subcategories, and in some subcategories was not used at all. For example, while rendering the 14 instances within the subcategory of historic personalia and cultural figures, the authors employed retention ten times, three times substitution and once a combined strategy of specification and retention (Рахманинов [Rachmaninoff] - ملحن راخمانينوف).
Rachmaninoff]) but there was no case of direct translation. Examples of different strategies used for transadapting the movie for the Arab audience are presented in table 3.

Table 3. Strategies for rendering cultural heritage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
<th>Strategy for rendering into Arabic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Знаю, знаю. И Суворов, и Кутузов, и Пушкин - все они мылись в бане. [I know, I know, Suvorov, Kutuzov and Pushkin used to wash in a steam bath].</td>
<td>أعرف، أعرف. (تونستي) و(دوستويفسكي) و(بوشكين) – كلهم اغتسلوا في حمام البخار.</td>
<td>Substitution (cultural)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Я-то причём здесь, Ольга Николаевна? Я что, Мичурин? [Why me, Olga Nikolaevna? Am I Michurin?]</td>
<td>وأنا يا (أولغا نيكولايفنا)، هل ترينني جبار؟</td>
<td>Substitution (paraphrase with sense transfer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Ты же знаешь, Боренька до Революции эти лекарства привозил. [You know that Borenka brought these medicines before the Revolution.]</td>
<td>أنت تعرفين جيدا أن (بوريس) أحضر هذه الأدوية قبل الثورة البلشفية.</td>
<td>Specification (explicitation)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen from table 3, in examples 1 and 2, the authors omitted most of the personal names mentioned in the original Russian script. Drawing upon the results from the survey, which suggested that the target audience may have the necessary knowledge to understand the realia of the USSR and Russia, although not the minute details, and following the idea to use the movie to inform Arab audiences about Russian culture, it was decided to keep the names of the Russian names in the dialogue. However, taking into account the fact that commanders Suvorov and Kutuzov (example 1) might be unfamiliar to the Arab viewers, being monocultural references, which are less “identifiable to the majority of the relevant TT audience” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 11), the researchers replaced them for the world-famous Russian writers Dostoevsky and Tolstoy, all of whom, in fact, also liked going to the steam bath.

In example 2, the authors of the paper decided to leave out the name of the person entirely, due to the fact that Michurin, although a very influential scientist in Soviet times, is not very familiar nowadays even to the ST audience, and opted for a situational paraphrase with sense transfer. Therefore, the researchers have chosen to substitute the name of the famous scientist by the quality that he was jokingly famous for – всемогущий [all-powerful] – جبار [jabbaar].
In example 3, the authors decided to explicate the cultural realia by bringing to the surface the details inherent to that revolution. Therefore, they added the word بلشفية [balshafiyya], meaning Bolshevist, to the word revolution to help the target audience establish reference to the event.

In all the above mentioned cases, the constraints of the dubbing and subtitling modes did not play a significant role. The Arabic subtitles for songs and posters were rather short in symbols, so there were not any spatial constraints, and also there was enough time for the subtitle to stay onscreen. As for dubbing constraints, they were not essential, since the characters were mostly speaking not in close up or with their backs to the camera. Therefore, the dubbing constraints mostly concerned cutting the number of repetitions in utterances.

**Translating Social and Political Realia**

The third category, suggested by Vlakhov and Florin (1980), deals with a wide range of social and political realia. The researchers include into it all social culture phenomena (conventions, beliefs, social organizations) offered by Ku (quoted in Fernández Guerra, 2012), as well as add administrative-territorial units, government bodies, social movements, ranks, forms of addressing, institutions, layers of the society, and military realia. This was the most represented category with 103 instances extracted from the corpus. Within this category the writers singled out 12 instances referring to the layers of society (пролетарии [proletarians], труженики села [workers of the village]), 20 referring to ranks (комдив [division commander]), 39 forms of address (товарищ [comrade]), 16 references to governmental bodies (НКВД [NKVD]), and ten to social movements (марксизм-ленинизм [Marxism - Leninism, Белое движение [White movement]). In addition to the large amount of phenomena the category covers, the movie dealt with a topic loaded with political and social issues, hence the high amount of instances belonging to this category.

The prevailing strategy for rendering social and political realia was direct translation. For example, all the 39 instances referring to the forms of address, as well as all the 12 instances denoting the layers of society were transferred through the direct translation strategy. The authors also resorted to the same strategy while translating 18 out of 20 cases denoting ranks, and six out of ten cases denoting social movements. Table 4 provides examples of the instances denoting social and political realia rendered through direct translation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 О, пионеры! Мохова, не плачь. Пионеры не плачут. [Oh, pioneers! Don’t cry, Mokhova. Pioneers don’t cry.]</td>
<td>أه! الروّاد! لا تبكي يا (موخوفا)! الروّاد لا يبكون! [Oh, pioneers! Don’t cry, Mohova. Pioneers don’t cry.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Пролетарии всех стран, соединяйтесь! (poster)</td>
<td>يا عمال العالم انتحدوا! [Proletarians of the world, unite!]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. *Examples of applying direct translation strategy for rendering social and political realia*
In the first two examples, the words пионеры [pioneers], пролетарии [proletarians] were rendered through direct translation strategy (روّاد [ruwwaad], عمّال [ʻummaal]). These Arabic words are frequently used in the Arabic language and are completely understood by the target audience irrespective of their educational background. Although the authoritative Russian-Arabic dictionary by Borisov (1997) in the first place provides such equivalents as - [biyooneer] - (pioneer) and - [brooleetari] - (proletarian) (i.e. retention strategy is employed), these words, provided by the dictionary, albeit an authoritative one, according to the information received in the survey and the opinion of the Arabic native speakers, are not clear to the Arab audience.

It is interesting to note that instances belonging to the category of governmental bodies were in half of the cases rendered through such strategies as substitution or specification, or even through a combination of both with other strategies, predominantly retention and direct translation. This was done in order to explicate the meaning of these organizations, some of which are mostly known in the source text in the form of abbreviations, to the target audience who, naturally, know neither the abbreviation itself, nor the work of the organization. Table 5 gives examples of two of the most important organizations appearing in the movie.

Table 5. Strategies for rendering government institutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 - А председатель у вас зачем?  
- Председатель на дирижабле.  
- На дирижабле!  
- Да, там НКВД приехало. Вот он ахает, охает!  
[Why do you need the president?]  
He is in the balloon.  
-In the balloon!  
-Yes, the NKVD came, and he is groaning and moaning.] | - ولماذا يصنع الرئيس عنكم؟  
- الرئيس على المنطاد.  
- عنا لمنطاد!  
- نعم. وصل رجال الداخلية إلى هناك وهو يتنهد ويتأفف.  
[Why do you need the president?]  
He is in the balloon.  
-In the balloon!  
-Yes, the people from the Interior came, and he is groaning and moaning.] | Specification (explicitation) + direct translation |
| 2 - Что же ты в своей сказочке-то не рассказал...  
لماذا لم تذكر في قصتك آلله منذ سنة 1923 تم تجنيده في الشرطة السرية... | - لم أذكر في قصتك آلله منذ سنة 1923 تم تجنيده في الشرطة السرية... | Substitution (paraphrase with sense transfer) |
In both cases the characters were speaking with their backs to the camera or very far away from it. Although, the lip synchronization was not the major issue in these cases, the kinetic synchronization and isochrony, or contemporaneity, did not allow the researchers to expand more on the meaning of the abbreviations, therefore they briefly incorporated into their transadaptation the scope of work of those organizations. Moreover, next time when the NKVD was mentioned in the movie, the characters’ lips were in a close-up, and the dialogues was running very fast, which made the writers reduce رجال الداخلية [people from the Interior] to just الداخلية [Interior] in order to overcome the abovementioned constraints.

Translating Linguistic Culture

The fourth category deals with linguistic culture, which includes fixed expressions, idioms, insults, etc (Ku, 2006; Vlakhov&Florin, 1980). Although the category counts a relatively small number of instances, it included puns, curses, abbreviations which required creative skills. This was the only category, where overall direct translation was not the dominating strategy. Out of 28 cases, only five were rendered through direct translation, while 21 through substitution (18 through paraphrase with sense transfer, and two through cultural substitution) and two cases of omission.

According to Delabastita, (1996) puns, or wordplays, are a “textual phenomenon” contrasting “linguistic structures with different meanings on the basis of their formal similarity” (Delabastita, 1996, p. 128). These puns can include many categories, depending on the degree and nature of similarity (Delabastita, 1996). In the film, the researchers found five cases of puns, all of which were rendered through the substitution strategy (paraphrase with sense transfer). Among them, two cases of playing with abbreviations, and three cases of puns based on the consonance of the words inflexions, although overall the expression stood meaningless. Below in table 6 are examples of puns found in the corpus.

Table 6. Examples of applying substitution strategy (paraphrase with sense transfer) for rendering puns

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Что 1923 года...</td>
<td>[Why didn’t you tell in your fairy tale that since 1923 you were recruited by the secret police…]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Завербован ОГПУ...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Why didn’t you tell in your fairy tale that since 1923 you were recruited by the Joint State Political Directorate …]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Молодой человек, простите, пожалуйста, скажите, это ХЛАМ?</td>
<td>أنت يا شاب، قل لي من فضلك؟ هل هذه قمامة؟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Хлам, хлам, ещё какой хлам.</td>
<td>سوق، سوق، أي قمامة؟</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Какой ещё хлам?</td>
<td>القرية، نعم، قرية الموسيقيين والأدباء والممثلين التاريخيين. وختصارها (قمامة) يا صديقي.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As can be seen from example 1 in table 6, the successful transference of puns depended on the apt choice of the words that could make a meaningful abbreviation in the Arabic language. This was a hard task taking into account the fact that Arabic usually does not rely on abbreviations, and that the pun in the target language for that specific instance must also sound funny. According to Díaz-Cintas, “humour… tests translators’ skills forcing them to activate imaginative solutions in order to find equivalence between the humorous intent of the SL and the humorous effect in the target language” (cited in Veiga, 2009, p. 175). In example 1, the humourous effect of the abbreviation was preserved, while in example 2, among possible options the researchers chose the one which has the same communicative intention, although at the expense of the humourous connotation.

In the next example, presented in table 7, and translated through the strategy of cultural substitution, the writers had to reproduce the meaning of the idiom in the target language, since it is central on the micro level, “and carries the local discourse forward… or is a trigger of a joke” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 12). As the Oxford English Dictionary defines it, an idiom is a “group of words established by usage as having a meaning not deducible from those of the individual words” (Oxford English Dictionary, 2017). Therefore, the meaning of the idiom cannot be understood from the mere components of it, but requires analyzing the unit as a whole.

Table 7. Examples of applying cultural substitution strategy for rendering idioms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. - Приказ, милая моя, надо выполнять. Ох, я им арбуз вставлю! … Между прочим, арбуз и мне могут вставить. И очень правильно сделают.</td>
<td>لا بد من الالتزام بالأوامر يا عزيزتي. آه. سأريهم النجوم في عز الظهر. بالمناسبة، وهم بإمكانهم فعل هذا أيضاً. ولديهم الحق. ليس هناك أصلاً نحوم إلاّ في الليل.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is clear from the example that the reference to the watermelon was replaced by the reference to the stars during the daylight which is a common idiom in the Arabic language and transfers all the connotations of the original Russian idiom.

Other cultural realia found in the text dealt with swearing and insults. Although almost all of the Russian insults and swear words were rendered into Arabic, still many of them were marked by vulgarity, offences of relatives and reference to bodily excreta which cannot be tolerated in the Arab society. Such references are regarded as very offensive to the Arab society, where dirty language and disrespect of women are considered to be sins and cannot be even transmitted through movies (see Al-Adwan, 2015; Yahiaoui, 2014). In such cases, the authors either used the strategy of substitution (paraphrase with sense transfer) rendering the insult in a more neutral way, or in some cases omitted it at all. As mentioned earlier, in order to take into account the restrictions of the Arab society as being conservative, the authors referred to the concept of norms, which from a sociological point of view, tell us about acceptable or unacceptable behavior, including permissible translation choices. This was the only case when the norms of the Arab society influenced the researchers’ decision-making process to a considerable degree. Therefore, in such cases they opted for transferring the meaning of insults and characters’ swearing through more ‘decent’ language, hence the prevalence of the substitution strategy based on paraphrase with sense transfer. Table 8 gives us a few examples of strategies for rendering foul language.

Table 8. Strategies for rendering foul language

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The original Russian</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1   Ты меня не узнал, твою мать?</td>
<td>ألا تعرف من أكون؟</td>
<td>Omission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Haven’t you recognized me, you motherfucker?]</td>
<td>[Do you know who I am?]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2   Что ты, машин не боишься, а коня бздишь?</td>
<td>ماذا! لا تخاف من المركبات وتخاف من الحصان؟</td>
<td>Substitution (paraphrase with sense transfer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[What, you are not scared of the cars but you farting from the horse?]</td>
<td>[What! You are not scared of the cars but you are scared of the horse?]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As we see, the researchers removed the offensive reference to the interlocutor’s mother in the first example and replaced the vulgar word with a less offensive one in the second example, trying to take into consideration the cultural norms of the Arab society.

Conclusions
Therefore, in this paper, the authors analyzed the transadaptation strategies of rendering Soviet Russia cultural realia for the Arab audience taking into account the constraints of the audiovisual translation modes (dubbing and subtitling) and the norms operating in the Arab society, i.e. their intolerance of insults and rude language. In order to carry out this research, the writers utilized the classification by Pedersen (2005) and the concept of norms by Toury (1995/2012), as well as carried out a pre-translation survey among Arab students in order to find out what they know about Soviet Russia.

Driven by the desire to preserve the foreign nature of the movie and inform the target audience about the history and culture of Soviet Russia, the writers transadapted the film with the prevalence of SL-oriented strategies. The categories of social and political realia, cultural heritage, and geographical realia were all rendered to the Arab viewer mostly through direct translation and, to a lesser degree, retention, thus allowing the audience to feel the film’s foreign nature. The only category where the authors mostly employed TL-oriented strategies was the category of linguistic culture, specifically foul language. The reason for this is the norms operating in the Arab society where insults of families, references to sexual intercourse and effluvia are considered offensive to the viewers.

The results of the study are valuable in a way that this research has set foundation for analysis of Russian-Arabic transadaptation. It will hopefully stimulate further studies in the area of Russian-Arabic dubbing and subtitling in an array of topics.

About the Authors:
Katsiaryna Panasiuk holds MA in Audiovisual Translation from Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Qatar. She has previously obtained a Master in Philology and a Bachelor degree in Linguistics and Translation from Minsk State Linguistic University, Belarus.

Dr. Rashid Yahiaoui is currently an assistant professor and the coordinator of the MA programs in Audiovisual Translation and Translation Studies at Hamad bin Khalifa University. He has a Ph.D. in Translation Studies from London Metropolitan University, UK, and a Master in Translation and Interpreting from the University of Salford, UK.

References


The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth: A Stylistic Study

Nawar Hussein Rdhaiwi Al-Marsumi
English Department, College of Languages,
Baghdad University, Baghdad, Iraq

Abstract
A tautology is to say the same thing twice where part of the sentence is redundant. The words are used and then expanded further in a way as if it has never been spoken before. It is the repetition or duplication of words; however, it has been argued that every repetition is not a tautology. Poets use this part of speech in their work for many years. Owing to its principal use in poems, it deserves an investigatory research work. This study aims at analyzing ‘tautologies’ in William Wordsworth’s poem “The Thorn” from the viewpoint of stylistic analysis. This analysis can show the significance of the use of tautological words to conclude whether tautologies produce redundancy or make a poem beautiful. Leech (1969) is the model adopted in analyzing the selected poem where the concept of “Foregrounding” is introduced as being considered an important field of stylistic analysis. The analysis is quantitative where a statistical analysis is conducted. It is hypothesized that tautology is redundancy, whereas the findings reveal it as an expression of the depth of the human feelings. Wordsworth has successfully used tautology to achieve the themes included in his poem. This paper is hoped to help researchers know the position and effectiveness of tautology in literary texts, specifically, in poems.

Keywords: Duplication, foregrounding, redundancy, repetition, stylistic analysis, tautology

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.10
Literature Review

Style in fiction is a landmark study by Leech and Short (1981) in which they attempt to take into account the process, suggesting the relative transparency or opacity of the literary concept phenomenon in an metafunction approach. Leech and Short (1981) also try to address the fact that the literary or the poetic texts have several levels of linguistic style transparency. According to them the dualism of language has several means of passing in the same substance. On the other hand, the monism believes that using different words to convey the same message is a mistake and that any modification of language or the form of poetic brings a change in the content (Leech, 1969).

The authors propose that the dualists believe that every text can easily be paraphrased. According to Leech and Short (1981), the likeliness of paraphrasing is not challenged in the daily use language. However, in literature, the practice of paraphrasing becomes involved. To resolve this conflict, they argue about the analysis of the literary language in regards to its function or the metafunctions along with the poetic function of foregrounding.

The theories and concepts in the above-mentioned paragraphs do not only present the outline that is to follow but at the same time, they shed light on the reason behind the occurrence of the various phenomenon. Accordingly, it is necessary to provide grounds for the presence of these matters and at the same time, assist in looking for methods and ways for issues to be done effectively.

To analyze the complex phenomena of a language, analysts usually take into account the different elements that compose separately: the study of sounds (phonetics), the study of the lexicon (morphology) and the study of phrases and periods (syntax). In the use of real language, however, the linguistic behaviour does not occur in the form of sounds, words, phrases and clauses, but rather of a weave organic, characterized in that the elements that compose it are structured in a particular way. This intertwining of such elements is called linguistic analysis.

Lyricists and poets have been using an array of literary devices in their written pieces for many centuries. These devices may include metaphors, imagery, symbols, etc. Similarly, poets also use tautologies in writing down their masterpieces. This is indicated in one of the essential figures of speech in English literature. Therefore, it is significant to know the use of this part of the language.

Tautology is the repetition and is the redundant use of words that convey the same idea again and again in different words. It is either used to deliver the same message or to emphasize over an idea that has been presented just before (Pomorska, 1987). This repetition of words was common in the poems written by poets of 18th and 19th centuries. Establishing formal theories for the evaluation and hypothesizing of the regular repetition of words in the text can investigate the issue of tautology. It is noted that most of the tautologies in poems are overwhelmed by the uncertainty of the descriptive categories along with the related concepts, resulting in the methodological errors.

Tautology is also said to be expressions that elaborate something that has been already illustrated in the phrase before (Gibbs, 1994). According to Leech (1969), tautologies tell us nothing about the world and the language. The establishment of the more formal theories for
evaluation and hypothesizing of the use of redundancy in poems might present a right solution of tautologies (Ward & Hirschberg, 1991). However, these theories are still in the infant stage and are also weigh down by the complications of related concepts with the descriptive categories along with the critical differences between the two that is completely ignored and result in a methodological error.

Although, it sounds that tautology is only the repetition of words, arising from the reiteration of the same words; it is different from the replication or the redundancy arranged from the paraphrastic use of different words having the same meanings (Waldoff, 2001). Owing to these facts, tautology raises the bar of poems, and it is much more necessary than it appears at a glance. It is also linked to the operation of meaning in language. When different words are used to deliver the same meaning, it is suggested that meanings of those phrases or lyrics exceed the expressive powers of those words (Keach, 2004). Meanings of poetic words cannot be completely worn out by only the repetition, but it continues beyond them. Looking at this way, tautology seems to happen when language runs up against its figurative restrictions. However, it is interesting to note that tautology does not only identify the limitations of language but also marks the very potential of transcending those limitations.

There are many reasons which make the repetition and tautology become the beauties for the poems. The most important reason is the interest that the mind of the reader attached to the words he/she reads. Words are no longer words or only symbols of passion they become attractive and active things that are also the part of the passion. This is a crucial point. The ambivalence of the poet in the poem as well as his note towards the repetition and tautology can be noticed. Initially, these are seen as the externalities of its form, language as different from the content of the poem (Sarker, 2003). However, the implicit licensing of a supposed style substance over the notwithstanding form affirms that there are various reasons why tautology and repetition are frequently used in Wordsworth poem. Tautology is not only a mindless repetition of words, but it is an expression of the depth of the human feelings (Russell, 2005).

Moore (2001) states that tautology is a faulty repetition of phrases, such as: 'me, myself and I.' Current definitions do not clarify repeated words or ideas and they leave it unclear. Three dictionary definitions may illustrate this confusion: the Concise Oxford Dictionary (2011) states: "the unnecessary repetition within a statement of the same thing in different words (P.1477)". The Merriam-Webster's Dictionary of Synonyms (1984) states: "Needless or useless repetition of the same an idea in different words (P.857)". And the Oxford Dictionary of English (2010) defines Tautology as: "the saying of the same thing twice over in different words; generally considered to be a fault of style (P.1822)". Moore (2001) adds that the following terms are related to tautology, showing that repetition comes in different forms:

1. **Antanaclasis**: The repetition of the same words in a different, if not a contrary signification, such as: that's that! or who's who.
2. **Paronomasia**: A play upon words in which the same word is used in different senses or words similar in sound are set in opposition so as to give antithetical force: Thou art Peter [rock], and upon this rock, I shall build my.(Moore, 2001)
3. **Pleonasm**: The Merriam-Webster's Dictionary of Synonyms (1984) states that pleonasm is best defined as "the use of syntactically unnecessary words as in "the man he said" (P.857)".
Functions of Tautological Constructions

Intended Vagueness:
Tautologies can be used to achieve ambiguity. Political demagoguery falls into this category. States (1989: 51-66) explains that tautology, strategically, would be a way of saying something without actually saying much. This strategy has a dominant element of populism: one cannot tautologize to an elite audience:

(1) “I am that I am ……”
(2) “I am the God who IS…..”

Acceptance/resignation
Tautologies can be used to communicate the need to accept or resign oneself to something. In English, every type of tautology can be used with this function, as shown in:

(3) But war is war. It isn’t pretty.
(4) An early day is an early day.
(5) …either I’ll find it or I won’t, …

Denial of Difference within Category
This type is used to deny the importance of differences between members of a category. It can sometimes be used to communicate that, for the present purposes, all members of a class are the same. (Bulhof & Gimbel, 2001). Examples are found in equatives, conditionals, and disjunctions, as shown in:

(6) A win is a win … Even if it’s a weird one.
(7) If it’s slow, it’s slow.
(8) You do it or you don’t.

Inadequacies of Language
Cherry (1978) states that this type arises out of "the inadequacies of language itself. This latter requires expanding phrases and sentences until we are content that we have 'conveyed our meaning.' Jespersen (1917), similarly, explains the use of the unnecessary double negation, stating that: "The insignificance of these elements makes it desirable to multiply them so as to prevent their being overlooked (P.72)"

(9) "We don't never let him get off the place."
(10) "It wasn't none of my cars; I tell you!".

Obligation
Such tautologies can be used to communicate that one must fulfill one's obligations. Examples can only be found in equatives. (Wierzbicka, 1987):

(11) A deal’s a deal.
(12) A bet’s a bet.
(13) The law’s the law.

Derision
Tautology can be used with neither strengthening nor weakening, but rather rests on the ridicule inherent in it. The following is a quotation from Shakespeare (2002):

(14) "Polonius: What do you read, my lord? / Hamlet: Words, words, words (P.74)"

Poetic Device

Several types of tautology may appear with technical aspects of repetition can be used: imitation, ornamentation, and figures of speech. These are used in everyday language and as a poetic device. This example is taken from Eliot (2003):

(15) "This is the way the world ends/ This is the way the world ends/ This is the way the world ends/ Not with a bang but a whimper (P.108)"

Linguistic and Poetic Language

In the protocols of modern linguistics, the poetic language is a particular use of language designed to obtain evidence through communication and enhancement tools signifiers of the form (phonetic, syntactic, etc.) of words and speech. Jakobson (1960) writes that "the emphasis on the message for himself, is the poetic function of language (P 1-21)".

The poetic language as it stands has its rules of operation. Jakobson (Ibid) notices that when carrying out a phrase, you choose words that are similar between different ones. He clarifies that when talking about 'car' we can use (automobile, car, and machine), and when saying that it is set in motion, we can use (does not work, do not start, do not go, do not turn on, etc...). This theory is not only vital to analyze the language of poems in general but is also important when it comes to analyses of the use of tautologies in poems. It is because that linguistics in poems stresses upon the use of different words conveying same meanings.

Deviation from the norm, however, the prevalence or importance of the requirements of similarity between words in the succession of the same traits are characteristic of poetic language, that the literary language uses and enhances particularly. It is understood, however, that the properties of poetic language are more visible and operating in poetry and drama in verse, and more in lyric poetry than in the epic narrative, theater and more tragic than in the comic.

Stylistic Analysis

The term "anthropological linguistics" is, at best, redundant. If, as now allowed linguists, language is a specifically human phenomenon and linguistics studies precisely this phenomenon, meaningless adjectives that designate the term that way (Mitchell, 2013). Discussion on the new creation of new linguistic ideologies began in the third millennium with a tautology serves as a reminder that many statements about the language are simple and they need to go back to redo clarity.

Short (1996) defines Stylistics as "an approach to the analysis of (literary) texts using linguistic description (P.1)". It has its root in the formalistic school of literary criticism emerged in Russia early in the twentieth century. Sarker (2003) states that "the very existence of the word 'style' shows that something can be said about the words which does not refer directly to the content (P.258)". Verdonk (2002) defines stylistics as “the analysis of distinctive expression in language and the description of its purpose and effect (P.4)”. Bradford (1997) says that stylistics is “an elusive and slippery topic every contribution to the vast multifaceted discipline of literary
studies will involve an engagement with style (P.1)”. However, with its objectivity, insights from linguistics and useful terminology, stylistics makes our interpretation valid and enhances our enjoyment of literature.

The stylistic analysis of a text can highlight the means implemented by a writer in a generic framework determined to share a specific worldview. It is generally based on the study of the style, for example, the study of vocabulary, figures of speech, syntax, etc. while balancing the form and substance (= meaning). The basis of stylistic analysis of a text is the belief that every literary text conveys a subjective vision, that is to say a non-neutral view. Thornborrow and Wareing (1998) limit some key aspects of stylistics as:

• Linguistics (the study of language) is to approach literary texts
• The discussion of texts according to objective criteria rather than according purely to subjective and impressionistic values
• Emphasis on the aesthetic properties of language (for example, the way rhyme can give pleasure)

Model for Analysis
The model adopted in analyzing the selected poem is drawn heavily on Leech (1969). Leech and Short (1981) distinguish four levels that describe the style of language. These levels are: semantics, syntax, phonology and graphology. While the semantic level is the level of meaning, syntax and phonology constitute what is often referred to as the “double articulation” of linguistic form: phonology being the “sound pattern” of the language (phonemes, stresses, rhythm and intonation), and syntax being, roughly speaking, “the abstract grammatical and lexical form of language”. A fourth level is added by Leech and Short (1981) to suit the written medium of literature; it is the level of graphology.

Leech (1969) introduces the concept of “Foregrounding” considering it as an important field of stylistic analysis. Foregrounding as the major characteristic of stylistics is particularly useful in analyzing poetry. Two main types of foregrounding can be distinguished: Parallelism and Deviation. Whereas parallelism is unexpected regularity, deviation can be seen as unexpected irregularity. In fact, foregrounding is the core of stylistics and can be defined as a form of textual patterning which is motivated for literary aesthetic purpose. It is realized by linguistic deviation and linguistic parallelism (Simpson: 2007).

Leech (1969) says that there are different kinds of deviation found in poetry:
1. Lexical Deviation, when words deviate from their actual and standard form in order to have a deeper value in meaning and in aesthetics.
2. Semantic Deviation, when a word can have differences in meaning.
3. Phonological Deviation, this is the deviation in sound.
4. Morphological Deviation, this is the deviation in how a word is formed.
5. Grammatical Deviation, when poets disregard the rules of sentence. They sometimes put no period between sentences; make no space between words, also use the tenses incorrectly etc.
6. The Use of Dialect, when poems are written by those who want to express their emotions using features of socially or regionally defined dialects.
7. The Use of Register (a professional dialect).
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth

Al-Marsumi

8. Historical Deviation when poets use archaic words to enhance the aesthetical value of the poem.
9. Graphological Deviation, when poets disregard the rules of writing.

Not all the above-mentioned deviations can be found in every poem. Poems may have one or more (Leech, 1969). Hence, some of these deviations will be the model in analyzing tautologies used in the selected poem. These may include (grammatical, morphological, graphological, and phonological) deviations.

The framework of Leech’s (1969) model can be within the following steps:

1. Giving background about the poet and the poem.
2. Understanding the poem under analyzing.
3. Initiating a linguistic stylistic analysis within the levels of:
   a. Lexis, by drawing a complete table to show the number and rate for each part of speech (content words) in the poem and to highlight the significance of their frequency in the poem. This also includes stating a lexical grouping for each lexical category to interoperate the relation of a particular repeated word with a series of conceptual groups in the poem.
   b. Grammar, to concentrate on sentence types, types of clauses and phrases and tenses used in the poem and their influence on the context.
4. Investigating foregrounding within its primary components; deviation and parallelism.

Wordsworth’s Poetic Style
William Wordsworth (1770-1850), son of John and Ann Cookson Wordsworth, was born in Cockermouth, Cumberland. He is one of the greatest poets in England and known as the poet of nature. His poems took on greater significance in English literature. His deep love for the “beauteous forms” of the natural world was established early. He had a belief that poetic style should be as simple and sincere as the language of everyday life and that the more the poet draws on elemental feelings and primal simplicities the better for his art. He advocated the use of simple language in poetry. Patra and Prasad (2006) state that Wordsworth continues to argue that poetry should be written in a language really used by humble and rustic men. He set himself to the task of freeing poetry from all its “conceits” and its “inane phraseology”. He made certain very effective and striking experiments in the use of simple language.

Wordsworth was the first poet who fully recognised and deliberately practised the beauties of extreme simplicity; and this achievement constitutes his most obvious claim to fame. His use of the nobly-plain style has something unique and unmatchable.

William Wordsworth is also a poet who used tautology in his poems very frequently. Wordsworth’s “The Thorn” (1798) is an example of such poem, in which tautologies have been used, without making it monotonous and dull (Side, 2006). “The Thorn” is said to be the piece which has used tautology at its best. In order to analyze the use of tautology in this poem, it is important to briefly know the context of the poem.

The Thorn Analysis
Supposedly born out of William Wordsworth's observation of a thorny, gnarled tree one stormy day in March 1798, "The Thorn" was first published in September that year as a contribution to
his and Samuel Taylor Coleridge's landmark poetry collection Lyrical Ballads. The lyrical ballad is a collaboration of two great poets namely William Wordsworth and Samuel Taylor Coleridge. It was first published in 1798 and considered to start the Romantic Movement era in English literature.

"The Thorn" is one of several poems by Wordsworth through which he suggests the supernatural. It also explores subjects such as the human psyche, the fallen woman of the late 18th century, and especially the reliability of narrator and reader's role in interpretation. On the surface, "The Thorn" speaks of a woman, Martha Ray, who, after giving "with a maiden's true good-will/Her company to Stephen Hill" (X, 106–108), discovers on what was to be their wedding day that Stephen is betrothed to another. Finding herself with a child, mad with anguish, she retreats to a mountaintop, where she spends most of her days. However, though supposedly pregnant, no child is ever seen. It is unknown if the child is stillborn or murdered by Martha's own hand. The consequence of the pregnancy, though, appears to be Martha's final descent into insanity, and 20 years later she can still be heard wailing, "Oh misery! oh misery! / Oh woe is me! Oh misery!" (VI: 65–66, VII: 76–77, XVIII: 194 and 200, XXII: 244–245).

Wordsworth may be suggesting to us that the beauteous heap is an infant’s grave because in several parts of the poem (ex. V: 49–52 and VI: 60–61), he describes the hill "like" an infant’s grave. Going to the spot when the woman is there described as a "dare" in the poem, this could be because she is sad and always weeping or she may be crazy, or because she in depression. A common question might come to mind when reading this poem; why does the woman go to the top of this mountain and weep? Well the author answers this with the best to his abilities by saying what he knows previously about this woman's life. This poem leaves us with a lot of unanswered questions, or answers that could be true, but the poem never really justifies if its suggestions are actually correct. Throughout the poem, we hear a lot of different opinions, and views on the woman. Questions that come to one’s mind are: what does the thorn symbolize and how does it relate to this obviously sad woman?

While the subjects presented here—which include infanticide, a "fallen" woman, and insanity—are enticing to the modern reader, an even greater complexity can be found within the narrator's role. Here we find a man, a newcomer to the area 20 years after the jilting of Martha Ray, who attempts to tell us the story. However, it becomes increasingly clear that neither the narrator nor the rest of the townsfolk really knows what had happened to Martha Ray and her child—if, in fact, there even was a child in the first place.

"The Thorn" is a narrative poem containing elements such as a plot, characters, conflict and setting. It is a long poem that consists of (22) stanzas; each is made of (11) lines. It is also necessary to note that the poem was written in ballad form. The ballads are slow and that is why this poem also had to move slowly and naturally. Tautology, in this aspect, worked in the favour of the poem. Although, the duplication of words may make the written piece, it also helps poets stress upon the emotions and imagery they want to develop in the poem.

The poem itself is entitled "The Thorn" and it starts with the description of "this aged Thorn" that "stands erect" on the highest top of a mountain. Furthermore, the thorn symbolizes Martha's pain and misery as well as her dead child.
The main theme of “The Thorn” is “Death” which overwhelms the whole atmosphere of the poem represented by the death of love, humanity, nature and hope. Other themes can also be found:

- **Nature:** this reflects the gloom and agony of the characters. The depressed mother and the dead baby become part of the gloomy, thorny landscape.

- **Seclusion and isolation:** next to the thorn, there is a little muddy pond and a mossy hill, "A beauteous heap" which is supposed to be the place where Martha's child was buried, as she used to go there and lament its death. The thorn is as isolated as Martha herself. She decided to lead a life of loneliness on the mountain.

- **Melancholy:** Martha was depressed, crazy and she was pregnant. Her cries of pain "'Oh misery! oh misery! / Oh woe is me! oh misery!' ” are repeated throughout the poem. The "aged thorn" becomes Martha's only companion on the top of the mountain where she painfully cries.

- **The supernatural power:** there are also supernatural elements in the poem, like the stirring hill, the moss which is spotted with the infant's blood and the pond which mirrors the baby's face.

- **Loss of innocence:** as represented by the lost childhood. The scarlet colour is associated with adultery and murder. It refers to the loss of innocence or virginity and to adultery or lust. The woman's scarlet coat indicates that she is a sinner. She has to endure pain and torture that might finally purge her of her sins. She might be not only adulterous but also a murderer who killed her own baby in a moment of despair.

### Stylistic Analysis of the Poem

**Lexical Level**

This category examines the tautological ‘content word’: nouns, verbs, adjectives and adverbs in the poem under study. Content words belong to ‘open class’ where new words can be added to the class as the need arises. The other class is known as ‘closed class’ including: prepositions, pronouns, particles, determiners, conjunctions, demonstratives and interjections. They are made up of finite sets of words which are never expanded. Leech (1982) specifies three tests to define English open classes. These tests are to define: Function, form and meaning. Appendix A shows the distribution of the tautological content words with the numbers of their occurrence in the poem.

Appendix A shows that the total number of the tautological content words in the poem under investigation is 120. Nouns occupy the highest frequency of occurrence (50, 45.833%). The majority of the nouns used insure the fact mentioned above that Wordsworth is ‘a poet of nature’. His deep love for the “beauteous forms” of the natural world is tautologically represented in this poem through repeating nouns reflecting nature like: the thorn (16, 29.090%), mountain (11, 20%), hill (9, 16.363%), pond (9, 16.363%), wind (7, 12.727%), rain (6, 10.909%), star (4, 7.272%) and ground (4, 7.272%). Some other nouns reflecting nature with less frequency are: leaves, stone, storm, winter, vale, water, air, colours, sky, etc. All tautological nouns are concrete (49, 98%) and only ‘misery’ (1, 2%) is abstract. This reveals the high interest the poet has towards using natural characters.

In Appendix A, adjectives are tautologically shown with frequency of (32, 26.666%). Tautology is obvious in adjectives describing ‘nature’ like: beauteous (3, 9.677%) in (VI: 37 beauteous heap), (V: 51 beauteous dyes) and (VI: 57 beauteous hill). He also describes ‘air’ as
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth

Al-Marsumi

‘frosty’ (2, 6.451%) and ‘keen (2, 6.451%) in (VII: 74 and VIII: 85). The highest frequency of occurrence is for the adjective ‘little’ (7, 22.580 %) describing images of nature like: pond in (III: 30 and XIX: 204) and breezes in (XVIII: 196). Wordsworth not only uses tautological adjectives for nature, but also premodifies the names and objects reflecting other themes found in the poem: death, misery, seclusion, melancholy, etc. A high tautological occurrence is for ‘poor’ (6, 19.354%) describing the ‘thorn’ in (II: 17 and 22), the woman in (VIII: 81 and XI: 118) and the child/infant in (XIV: 147 and XX: 213). Since the ‘Thorn’ symbolizes an ‘imaginary infant’ which proposes that the mosses are trying to “bury” the tree, as they are re-enacting the burial of the baby that may lie under the close by “hill of moss”, Wordsworth tautologically uses different and alternative adjectives reflecting these images in: old (4, 12.903 %), aged (3, 9.677%), overgrown (3, 9.677%), grey (3, 9.677%). A similar use of tautologies is in: scarlet (3, 9.677 %), red (2, 6.45%) and, alternatively, he also uses ‘vermilion’ to personify the ‘woman’s misery’, ‘infant’s death’ and, consequently, the ‘tragic destiny’.

Verbs are used tautologically with frequency of occurrence (24, 20%). Dynamic verbs have a frequency rate (18, 75%), while stative verbs (6, 25%). The highest rate of the dynamic verbs is due to the narration nature of the selected poem. The story implies a simple scheme of movement. Though tautological dynamic verbs are higher than stative ones, the highest rates of frequency are for the tautological verbs that are stative, for example: was (18, 75%), see (8, 33.333%), look (7, 29.166%), know (5, 20.833%), were (4, 16.666%), be (3, 12.5%) and wish (3, 12.5%). This might be related to Wordsworth’s deep interest in describing nature and subjects, and it can also be a justification for using ‘present’ tenses in parts of the poem depicting images and scenes the poet embodies to his readers; whereas ‘past’ tenses are used to narrate the story.

Within the expected level, few tautological adverbs come with the number and frequency rate (9, 7.5%). Appendix A shows that all the adverbs used are those expressing place and time of the events taken place in the poem.

At the lexical level, appendix A points out many examples of conceptual groups that are tautologically used: thorn, stone, leaves, pond, colours, stars, mountain, hill, bright, etc. are examples relating to ‘nature and life’. Tautological words relating to ‘despair and death’ are like: misery, woe, wretched, overgrown, poor, scarlet, grave, burry, cry, etc. Other tautologies are those words relating to ‘place’: there, around, beyond and through; and those relating to ‘time’: years, time, day and night. There are some examples of tautological words relating to ‘body’: head, brain,

Grammatical Level

This level reveals types of sentences (clauses and phrases) tautologically used in the selected poem as illustrated in Appendix B. This is to focus on what Wordsworth is doing with the tautology of the poem and how he functions the grammatical devices to achieve the intended themes.

Russell (2005) states that it is not necessary that such repetition happens in the chorus, tautology is something that can be found out even in the middle of the stanzas.
As shown in appendix B, (16) tautological sentences are used. Most of them (13, 81.25%) are of a declarative assertive type. This indicates that what Wordsworth tries to assert is true. The highest frequency of occurrence is that for the exclamative tautology of “Oh misery! oh misery!” (10, 62.5%) and “Oh woe is me! oh misery!” (3, 18.75%). In fact, there are cases where repetition is more like the refrain and occupies the larger space in the stanzas. The poet insists on depicting images like: adultery, murder and misery which are juxtaposed to each other, so that feelings of frustration, bewilderment and suffering are produced and then focused on.

Reviewing the poem, it is evident that most of the tautological sentences used are parts of ‘compound’ ones, as in (I, 6): "It stands erect, and like a stone ...”; others are identified as parts of ‘complex’ sentences as in (II, 20):

“So close, you’d say that they are bent
With plain and manifest intent
To drag it to the ground;
And all have joined in one endeavour
To bury this poor Thorn for ever.”

Furthermore, it is the specific form of Wordsworth’s problemization that tautology is strengthened by every step taken to eliminate it, that raises assumptions regarding the repetition to be a condition of chances for modification as a master trope. Owing to this fact, William Wordsworth uses different words or phrases with the same meanings (i.e. redundancy) to make the way for even more virtual tautology. Appendix C shows such tautologies:

In sentences (17), the tautological verses reflect redundantly the truth that the ‘thorn’ tree, as an object in the landscape, becomes a representation of the essential mystery. Martha, as always, sits beside this ‘thorn’ that stands erect on the highest top of a mountain (as in 19), where she spends much of her time journeying to and sitting by the thorn at its mountain-top site, recalling her infant with a sense of agony, regret and suffering. This scene is more deeply depicted through the tautological verses used (in 21) that emphasize the hearing of Martha’s desperate cries: "Oh misery! Oh misery! / Oh woe is me! Oh misery".

In sentences (18), Wordsworth redundantly emphasizes another fact that no one knows for sure how the prevailing crime is achieved since all what is said are rumors. The hopeless mother may unconsciously kill her baby (in 22) or hang it or drown it in the pond. Such redundant verses are related to another dispute (in 20) where people do not know if her child was born dead or alive, or whether miscarriage or abortion occurred. Nevertheless, the poet (in 23) affirms a fact that the baby’s face can be seen plainly, looking at you whenever you look on it. In fact, Wordsworth has successfully used tautology to convey the intended themes of his poem.

Tense

Appendix B shows that all tautological sentences have ‘simple finite’ verb phrases. The only ‘simple non- finite’ is the following:
- To drag it to the ground; (II, 20 and XXII, 238)

As mentioned earlier, the whole poem is written in ‘present’ tense to convey the beautiful imaginary ideas through selected natural objects that electrify the imagination of the poet.
Wordsworth shifts the tense into ‘past’ when narrating the tale, though no many dramatic actions transpire during the occasion. In this sense, the poem conforms to Wordsworth’s idea of poetry as passion in that the poem, as a dramatic exchange between two characters, enacts a kind of “history or science of feelings” linguistically.

**Fore grounding**

Fore grounding is the violation of the scheme used to surprise or impress readers. It can be realized by ‘deviation’ and ‘parallelism’. Investigating the selected poem thoroughly, only grammatical, morphological and graphological deviation of the tautological sentences listed in appendixes A and B can be analyzed linguistically:

**Grammatical Deviation**

Many of such deviations are used in the selected poem; some are used tautologically in the sentences in appendix A and B. The poet sometimes transfers verbs in subject positions when sentences are not interrogatives or even in the bottom of the stanzas which may indicate that he focuses on actions rather than subjects:

- With lichens is it overgrown. (I: 10)
- And why sits she beside the Thorn (VIII: 82)
- “More know I not, I wish I did, (VIX: 145)
- For many a time and oft were heard
  - Cries coming from the mountain head: (XV: 160-161)

Wordsworth also deviates when placing adverbial and prepositional phrases:

- And to herself she cries, (VI:64)
- For the true reason no one knows: (IX:91)
- This wretched Woman thither goes; (VII:68)
- She to the mountain-top would go, (XII:125)
  - Furthermore, two examples have elliptical subjects:
    - As like as like can be: (V:53)
    - And there sits in a scarlet cloak, (XVI:169)

**Morphological Deviation**

The poet uses deviated forms like: ’twas (XIV:151), oft (XV:160), o’ergrown (II:12), babe (XIX:210, XXI:232), whene’er (XX:221) and ‘tis (XX:221). Deviant morphology is used as an element of the poetic technique. Wordsworth's art can be enhanced if his readers could understand the machinery behind using such deviation.

**Graphological Deviation**

Graphological forms, like: spelling, italicization, capitalization and hyphenation are expressive when they are a writer’s choice. Discarding the rules of writing as to form creative language, Wordsworth deviates from the norms in most parts of the poem to attract the attention of his readers. In appendix A and (2), many of the tautological sentences end with commas which may reflect the sense of wandering, though, they are placed in the bottom in these verses:

- And there she sits, until the moon (XVIII:194)
- She shudders, and you hear her cry, (XVIII:199)
The semi-colons at the end of some verses are used to indicate end stopped lines and may stress that the decision is being made strictly, as in the following examples:

- To drag it to the ground; (II:20)
- I cannot tell; (IX:90)
- wind that blows; (VII:70)
- No mortal ever knew; (XIV:148)
- No earthly tongue could ever tell; (XIV:150)

In other examples, the colon is used to make a very pointed pause between two thoughts:

- As like as like can be: (V:53)
- For the true reason, no one knows: (IX:91)
- Cries coming from the mountain head: (XV:161)

The poet deviates when using the hyphen in the bottom of some examples to reflect a short pause and to express that the thought will be completed:

- “There is a Thorn—it looks so old, (I:1)
- Nay—if a child to her was born (XIV:149)

Though capitalization at the beginning of verses is a characteristic of poetic style, Wordsworth capitalizes certain words used in the tautological sentences, like: Babe (XIX:210, XXI:232) and Woman (VI:63, VII:68, VIII:81, X:102 and XVII:188) to express that they are the central issues in the poem.

**Conclusion**

William Wordsworth has used tautology in his poem “The Thorn”, not to fill out the space but to strengthen the feeling of the words. The implicit licensing of a supposed language substance over the notwithstanding form affirms that there are various reasons why tautology and repetition are used frequently in Wordsworth poem. Tautology is not only a mindless repetition of words but it is an expression of the depth of the human feelings.

Different stages of the arguments regarding the use of tautology in “The Thorn” may form a dialectal pattern. Firstly, tautology is illustrated as a certainty linked with the operation of meaning in language of the poem. Secondly, it is also seen as the externality and finally, it is re-assimilated into the concluding thesis as an important aspect of the particular content to which it was thought be an external. In fact, the poem is not that of making a decision but it is the art of indecision.

Depending on the stylistic analysis based on Leech’s model (1969), the results show the following:

- At the lexical level, content words (120) are tautologically investigated to show higher frequency of occurrence of nouns (50, 45.833%) than verbs (24, 20%), adjectives (32, 26.666%) or adverbs (9, 7.5%). As a poet of nature, Wordsworth has deep interest in describing natural subjects and that is why concrete nouns occur with a higher frequency (49, 98%) than abstract nouns (1, 2%). On the other hand, Tautology is used to describe conceptual groups relating to ‘nature and life’, ‘despair and death’, ‘place’, ‘time’ and ‘body’.
At the grammatical level, tautology is analyzed in sentences (16 clauses and phrases) where there is repetition of the same words. The highest frequency of occurrence is that of the declarative type (13, 81.25%) and only two sentences (3, 18.75%) are exclamative. Most of these sentences are formed as parts of compound ones. On the other hand, the analysis reveals another type of tautology, i.e. ‘redundancy’ where different words or phrases are used to express the same meanings. Wordsworth has successfully used tautology to achieve the themes includes in his poem: nature, melancholy, seclusion and isolation, supernatural power and loss of innocence. Tenses of the tautological sentences are almost present as they are used to describe the different views of the natural landscapes but the poet shifts towards using the past tense when narrating the events in the poem.

Deviation as a type of foregrounding is analyzed grammatically, morphologically and graphologically. As an attempt to attract his readers and emphasize some thoughts, Wordsworth deliberately deviates from the rules of grammar when placing verbs in subject positions, using elliptical subjects and misplacing adverbial and prepositional phrases. He also uses his poetic technique in the deviation of particular forms of words. Furthermore, he discards some rules of punctuation, using or misusing commas, colons, semi-colons, capitalization and hyphenation as to make his style more creative and expressive.

About the Author:
Nawar Hussein Rdhaiwi Al-Marsumi MA holder and a university instructor at Baghdad University-College of Languages, the English Department. Her specific specialization is linguistics and contrastive Studies. She has published papers in contrastive studies, pragmatics and stylistics.

References
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth

Al-Marsumi


Appendix A: Frequencies of Occurrence of the Tautological Content Words in “The Thorn” Poem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Noun</th>
<th>No. of Occurrence %</th>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>No. of Occurrence %</th>
<th>Adjective</th>
<th>No. of Occurrence %</th>
<th>Adverb</th>
<th>No. of Occurrence %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thorn</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>look</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>old</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>through</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29.09</td>
<td></td>
<td>29.16</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>say</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>high</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>beyond</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td></td>
<td>29.16</td>
<td>15.625</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22.222</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth

Al-Marsumi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>9.090</th>
<th>Be</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>12.5</th>
<th>grey</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>9.375</th>
<th>there</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>144.444</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leaves</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>stand</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>sad</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td>where</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stone</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>was</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>erect</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td>wherefo</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>44.444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lichens</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>bury</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>aged</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td>when</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33.333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.272</td>
<td>see</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>33.33</td>
<td>wretched</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td>again</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mountain</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>seek</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>overgrown</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td>around</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storm</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>were</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.66</td>
<td>heavy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td>beneath</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rain</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.90</td>
<td>Sit</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.83</td>
<td>frosty</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winter</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>speak</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>little</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21.875</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vale</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>Cry</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>close</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yards</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td>Go</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37.5</td>
<td>fresh</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Path</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>know</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.83</td>
<td>lovely</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pond</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16.36</td>
<td>blow</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>beauteous</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>tell</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20.83</td>
<td>fair</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td>wish</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>green</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heap</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td>view</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>scarlet</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hill</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16.36</td>
<td>sworn</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>bright</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>colours</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>Do</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>red</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eye</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td>Climb</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>blue</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dye</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>came</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>clear</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9.375</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloak</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>saw</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>keen</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Star</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.272</td>
<td>stir</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.333</td>
<td>poor</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>18.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earth</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td>true</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infant</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14.54</td>
<td>plain</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grave</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.272</td>
<td>kindled</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Size</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.636</td>
<td>last</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12.72</td>
<td>born</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>woman</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9.090</td>
<td>jutting</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misery</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>41.81</td>
<td>full</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15.625</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14.54</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Night</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.454</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wind</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12.72</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B: Frequencies of Occurrence of the Tautological Sentences in “The Thorn” Poem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Clauses and Phrases</th>
<th>Types</th>
<th>No. of Occurrence</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>It looks so old</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>It stands erect,</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>(it is/is it) overgrown</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>To drag it to the ground</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>like an infant’s grave in size</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>And to herself she cries</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Oh misery! oh misery!</td>
<td>Exclamative</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>62.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Oh, woe is me! oh misery!’</td>
<td>Exclamative</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>When the blue daylight’s in the skies</td>
<td>Interrogative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>And when the whirlwinds on the hill</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Or frosty air is keen and still</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Beneath that hill of moss so fair</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>As like as like can be</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>I cannot tell</td>
<td>Declarative</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total No. of tautological content words: 120

No. Ratio No. Ratio No. Ratio
55 45.833% 24 20% 32 26.666% 9 7.5%
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth

Al-Marsumi

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Redundant Sentences</th>
<th>No. of Stanza</th>
<th>No. of Line</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>- And there, beside the Thorn, she sits</td>
<td>VII</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- And why sits she beside the Thorn,</td>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The Thorn which I described to you,</td>
<td>XVI</td>
<td>169-170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>And there sits in a scarlet cloak,</td>
<td>XVIII</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>- For the true reason, no one knows:</td>
<td>IX</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- “More know I not, I wish I did,</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No mortal ever knew;</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- No earthly tongue could ever tell;</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>- This wretched Review of ached Woman thither goes;</td>
<td>VII</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Thus, to the dreary mountain-top</td>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>80-81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Does this poor Woman go?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“But wherefore to the mountain-top</td>
<td>XII</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Can this unhappy Woman go,</td>
<td>XXII</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>- Held that the unborn infant wrought</td>
<td>XIII</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Nay—if a child to her was born</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- And if ’twas born alive or dead,</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>- For many a time and oft were heard</td>
<td>XV</td>
<td>160-161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cries coming from the mountain head:</td>
<td>XVIII</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I turned about and heard her cry,</td>
<td>XVIII</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>She shudders, and you hear her cry,</td>
<td>XXII</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>She hanged her baby on the tree;</td>
<td>XIX</td>
<td>206-207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some say she drowned it in the pond,</td>
<td>XX</td>
<td>214-215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>But kill a new-born infant thus,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I do not think she could!</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>A baby and a baby’s face,</td>
<td>XX</td>
<td>219-220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>And that it looks at you;</td>
<td>XX</td>
<td>212-222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Whene’er you look on it, ’tis plain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The baby looks at you again.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix D: The Thorn (1798) BY WILLIAM WORDSWORTH

I

“There is a Thorn—it looks so old,
In truth, you’d find it hard to say

Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies
eISSN: 2550-1542 | www.awej-tls.org
How it could ever have been young,
It looks so old and grey.
Not higher than a two years' child
It stands erect, this aged Thorn;
No leaves it has, no prickly points;
It is a mass of knotted joints,
A wretched thing forlorn.
It stands erect, and like a stone
With lichens is it overgrown.

II
“Like rock or stone, it is o’ergrown,
With lichens to the very top,
And hung with heavy tufts of moss,
A melancholy crop:
Up from the earth these mosses creep,
And this poor Thorn they clasp it round
So close, you’d say that they are bent
With plain and manifest intent
To drag it to the ground;
And all have joined in one endeavour
To bury this poor Thorn forever.

III
“High on a mountain’s highest ridge,
Where oft the stormy winter gale
Cuts like a scythe, while through the clouds
It sweeps from vale to vale;
Not five yards from the mountain path,
This Thorn you on your left espy;
And to the left, three yards beyond,
You see a little muddy pond
Of water—never dry,
Though but of compass small, and bare
To thirsty suns and parching air.

IV
“And, close beside this aged Thorn,
There is a fresh and lovely sight,
A beauteous heap, a hill of moss,
Just half a foot in height.
All lovely colours there you see,
All colours that were ever seen;
And mossy network too is there,
As if by hand of lady fair
The work had woven been;
And cups, the darlings of the eye,
So deep is their vermilion dye.

V
“Ah me! what lovely tints are there
Of olive green and scarlet bright,
In spikes, in branches, and in stars,
Green, red, and pearly white!
This heap of earth o’ergrown with moss,
Which close beside the Thorn you see,
So fresh in all its beauteous dyes,
Is like an infant’s grave in size,
As like as like can be:
But never, never anywhere,
An infant’s grave was half so fair.

VI
“Now would you see this aged Thorn,
This pond, and beauteous hill of moss,
You must take care and choose your time
The mountain when to cross.
For oft there sits between the heap,
So, like an infant’s grave in size,
And that same pond of which I spoke,
A Woman in a scarlet cloak,
And to herself she cries,
‘Oh misery! oh misery!
Oh, woe is me! oh misery!’

VII
“At all times of the day and night
This wretched Woman thither goes;
And she is known to every star,
And every wind that blows;
And there, beside the Thorn, she sits
When the blue daylight’s in the skies,
And when the whirlwind’s on the hill,
Or frosty air is keen and still,
And to herself she cries,
‘Oh misery! oh misery!
Oh woe is me! oh misery!’ ”

VIII
“Now wherefore, thus, by day and night,
In rain, in tempest, and in snow,
Thus to the dreary mountain-top
Does this poor Woman go?
And why sits she beside the Thorn
When the blue daylight’s in the sky
Or when the whirlwind’s on the hill,
Or frosty air is keen and still,
And wherefore does she cry?—
O wherefore? wherefore? tell me why
Does she repeat that doleful cry?”

IX
“I cannot tell; I wish I could;
For the true reason no one knows:
But would you gladly view the spot,
The spot to which she goes;
The hillock like an infant’s grave,
The pond—and Thorn, so old and grey:
Pass by her door—’tis seldom shut—
And if you see her in her hut—
Then to the spot away!
I never heard of such as dare
Approach the spot when she is there.”

X
“But wherefore to the mountain-top
Can this unhappy Woman go,
Whatever star is in the skies,
Whatever wind may blow?”
“Full twenty years are past and gone
Since she (her name is Martha Ray)
Gave with a maiden’s true good-will
Her company to Stephen Hill;
And she was blithe and gay,
While friends and kindred all approved
Of him whom tenderly she loved.

XI
“And they had fixed the wedding day,
The morning that must wed them both;
But Stephen to another Maid
Had sworn another oath;
And, with this other Maid, to church
Unthinking Stephen went—
Poor Martha! on that woeful day
A pang of pitiless dismay
Into her soul was sent;
A fire was kindled in her breast,
Which might not burn itself to rest.

XII
“They say, full six months after this,
While yet the summer leaves were green,
She to the mountain-top would go,
And there was often seen.
What could she seek?—or wish to hide?
Her state to any eye was plain;
She was with child, and she was mad;
Yet often was she sober sad
From her exceeding pain.
O guilty Father—would that death
Had saved him from that breach of faith!

XIII
“Sad case for such a brain to hold
Communion with a stirring child!
Sad case, as you may think, for one
Who had a brain so wild!
Last Christmas-eve we talked of this,
And grey-haired Wilfred of the glen
Held that the unborn infant wrought
About its mother’s heart, and brought
Her senses back again:
And, when at last her time drew near,
Her looks were calm, her senses clear.

XIV
“More know I not, I wish I did,
And it should all be told to you:
For what became of this poor child
No mortal ever knew;
Nay—if a child to her was born
No earthly tongue could ever tell;
And if ’twas born alive or dead,
Far less could this with proof be said;
But some remember well,
That Martha Ray about this time
Would up the mountain often climb.
XV
“And all that winter, when at night
The wind blew from the mountain-peak,
’Twas worth your while, though in the dark,
The churchyard path to seek:
For many a time and oft were heard
Cries coming from the mountain head:
Some plainly living voices were;
And others, I’ve heard many swear,
Were voices of the dead:
I cannot think, whate’er they say,
They had to do with Martha Ray.

XVI
“But that she goes to this old Thorn,
The Thorn which I described to you,
And there sits in a scarlet cloak,
I will be sworn is true.
For one day with my telescope,
To view the ocean wide and bright,
When to this country first I came,
Ere I had heard of Martha’s name,
I climbed the mountain’s height:
A storm came on, and I could see
No object higher than my knee.

XVII
“ ’Twas mist and rain, and storm and rain:
No screen, no fence could I discover;
And then the wind! in sooth, it was
A wind full ten times over.
I looked around, I thought I saw
A jutting crag,—and off I ran,
Head-foremost, through the driving rain,
The shelter of the crag to gain;
And, as I am a man,
Instead of jutting crag, I found
A Woman seated on the ground.

XVIII
“I did not speak—I saw her face;
Her face!—it was enough for me;
I turned about and heard her cry,
‘Oh misery! oh misery!’
And there she sits, until the moon
Through half the clear blue sky will go;
And when the little breezes make
The waters of the pond to shake,
As all the country know,
She shudders, and you hear her cry,
‘Oh misery! oh misery!’ ”

XIX
“But what’s the Thorn? and what the pond?
And what the hill of moss to her?
And what the creeping breeze that comes
The little pond to stir?”
“I cannot tell; but some will say
She hanged her baby on the tree;
The Use of Tautology in “The Thorn” by William Wordsworth
Al-Marsumi

Some say she drowned it in the pond,
Which is a little step beyond:
But all and each agree,
The little Babe was buried there,
Beneath that hill of moss so fair.

XX
“I’ve heard, the moss is spotted red
With drops of that poor infant’s blood;
But kill a new-born infant thus,
I do not think she could!
Some say, if to the pond you go,
And fix on it a steady view,
The shadow of a babe you trace,
A baby and a baby’s face,
And that it looks at you;
Whene’er you look on it, ’tis plain
The baby looks at you again.

XXI
“And some had sworn an oath that she
Should be to public justice brought;
And for the little infant’s bones
With spades they would have sought.
But instantly the hill of moss
Before their eyes began to stir!
And, for full fifty yards around,
The grass—it shook upon the ground!
Yet all do still aver
The little Babe lies buried there,
Beneath that hill of moss so fair.

XXII
“I cannot tell how this may be,
But plain it is the Thorn is bound
With heavy tufts of moss that strive
To drag it to the ground;
And this I know, full many a time,
When she was on the mountain high,
By day, and in the silent night,
When all the stars shone clear and bright,
That I have heard her cry,
‘Oh misery! oh misery!’
Oh woe is me! oh misery!’’”
The Usefulness of Translation in Foreign Language Teaching: Teachers’ Attitudes and Perceptions

Dalila Benelhadj Djelloul
Department of English, Faculty of Letters and Arts
University of Mostaganem, Algeria

Bel Abbes Neddar
Department of English, Faculty of Letters and Arts
University of Mostaganem, Algeria

Abstract
Translation has long been viewed as an ineffective pedagogical tool due to its unjustifiable association to old methods of teaching, particularly the Grammar-Translation Method (GTM) and its practices. The overuse and the misuse of translation in the heydays of these methods paved the way to the monolingual assumption that English should be taught without the inclusion of translation activities in the classroom. However, in the last few decades, there has been ongoing research re-evaluating the use of translation in the EFL context. Drawing upon several studies conducted in this respect, researchers discussed the main objections raised against the use of translation and set the benefits of this teaching tool in facilitating the students’ language learning process. On the basis of the findings of these studies, the present article aims at exploring teachers’ attitudes towards the use and usefulness of translation in English classes in the Algerian EFL context. Due to the huge gap between the literature on the importance of translation and its practice on the ground, this article attempts to confirm the validity of this pedagogical tool and suggest some guidelines as to how and when to integrate translation activities within the teaching of English as a foreign language. The data were collected through a questionnaire addressed to secondary school teachers working in different cities in Algeria. Though it has never been practised in a principled and purposeful way, translation, has gained a wide recognition from secondary school teachers who reported that this pedagogical tool played a considerable role in facilitating foreign language learning and improving language skills. The findings confirmed the effectiveness of translation in explaining new vocabulary, developing students’ cognitive skills and extending students’ background knowledge as well as their linguistic competence.

Key words: EFL, Grammar-Translation Method (GTM), pedagogical translation, teachers’ attitudes and perceptions, translation

Cite as: Benelhadj Djelloul, D., & Neddar, B. A. (2017). The Usefulness of Translation in Foreign Language Teaching: Teachers’ Attitudes and Perceptions. Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies, 1(3).
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.11
Introduction:
Translation practice has always been present and dates back to the birth of languages where it was the only method used to facilitate the process of communication. Whether as a vocational activity or as part of the field of language teaching and learning, translation has been the subject of heated debate and controversies. The objections raised against the use of translation in foreign language classrooms are associated with the shortcomings of GTM, the dominant methodology in the field of language teaching until the 20th century. Subsequent research in the field of translation and foreign language teaching has been conducted to explore the benefits of this tool in fostering foreign language learning. However, despite researchers’ increasing interest in the reconsideration of the usefulness of translation in the foreign language classroom, there is still little literature on how and when to use this pedagogical aid in foreign language regular courses. The present paper aims at discussing the arguments for and against translation use in the EFL context and investigating secondary school teachers’ perceptions towards it, and suggesting some useful guidelines that teachers should consider to achieve their expected learning outcomes.

Theorizing about the Use of Translation in EFL Classroom
Most of the researchers’ arguments against the use of translation in language teaching are, in fact, associated with the classical method of GTM as previously indicated. This teaching methodology came into existence at the end of the nineteenth century and was mainly used to teach classical languages such as Latin and Greek and was employed later to teach modern languages. It was popular in Europe and China until the late twentieth century (Adamson, 2004, in Hall & Cook, 2013). GTM gave much importance to grammar rules that have been taught through translation into the learners’ own language at the expense of communication skills and fluency. Furthermore, the proponents of this method considered translation as a testing tool to assess the comprehension of the grammatical aspects introduced in the classroom. Decontextualized sentences that had to be translated were meant to illustrate grammar rules rather than to improve learners’ communicative skills in the foreign language.

The advocates of the audiovisual and communicative methods believed that the use of translation was counter-productive in acquiring a new language as it could be more harmful than beneficial in the classroom. Today, a number of researchers such as Carreres (2006) and Malmkjaer (2010) report negative attitudes towards the integration of translation in ELT because they view it as an unrealistic exercise that should be prohibited from language curricula in both secondary schools and private language schools. Translation, according to them, is not a beneficial tool in foreign language learning because it instilled in the learners’ minds that there was a one-to-one relationship between the native and the target language.

Whether convincing or not, these arguments have been seriously espoused for a long time by teachers and practitioners in the field of education. Malmkjaer (1998) asserts that the question whether or not these arguments are valid is conditioned by when and how translation is being practised in the classroom. Besides, some current approaches that favour a monolingual approach in foreign language teaching have considered a number of factors in disfavour of the use of translation such as the multiplicity of mother tongues in some foreign language classes, the native teacher’s non-mastery of the student’s mother tongue, and the monolingual course books published and marketed all over the world. Moreover, there has been a shift from focusing on
the aim of enhancing the learners’ abilities to appreciate literature in its original language as well as to translate written texts to the aim of developing learners’ communicative competence in monolingual contexts and speaking in a native-like manner.

Bowen, D & M. (1987) argue that translation was viewed negatively in the 1970’s because foreign language teaching focused on exposing the learners only to the foreign language to improve their linguistic as well as their communicative competences. Moreover, some researchers think that translation is a time-consuming activity that lacks the appropriate materials to be practised. In this respect, Duff claims that “translation was traditionally accused of being uncommunicative, boring, pointless, difficult and irrelevant” (Duff, 1989, p. 3).

Because of language interference, translation can produce a compound bilingual (an individual who learns two languages in the same environment, thus acquiring one notion with two verbal expressions) rather than a coordinate bilingual (a learner who acquires two languages in different contexts, such as home and school, in which words of the two languages form part of different independent systems). This can cause or contribute to developing lasting habits. It does not only make learners think that there is a one-to-one correspondence of meaning between native and foreign language, but it draws their attention to the formal aspects of language rather than their communicative functions.

According to Stibbard (1994), the use of the native language, which is the translation from the foreign language into one’s own language in the classroom, reduces the amount of exposure to English or the use of it. In the same vein, Atkinson (1987) proposes a rate of 95% English to 5% mother tongue for teachers to take into consideration in the foreign language classroom as a judicious and appropriate use of languages.

Translation has been strongly criticised for not making a balance in the development of the four skills because it is concerned with reading and writing only and does not count for listening and speaking skills. According to Cunningham (2000), the lack of positive literature on the use of translation in the language classroom and the negative reputation it receives from the experts in the field of language teaching has undoubtedly deprived teachers of utilizing it or making research on it, though many learners report positive attitudes towards it as they feel self-confident when moderately using their own-language to understand the foreign language course.

At the beginning of the twentieth century, Maximilian Delphinus Berlitz had criticized translation as a learning-teaching tool. He rather favoured “the direct association of thought with the foreign speech and sound in addition to the constant exclusive use of the foreign language” (Kerr, 2014, p. 2). Berlitz rejected translation for three major reasons. First, He thought that own-language use in English language teaching is a time-consuming activity that leaves no time for using the target language. Then, studying with translation, he stated, would never enable learners get used to the “spirit of a foreign language and the learner has a tendency to base all he says upon what he would in his mother tongue” (Berlitz, 1916, p. 3-4 in Kerr, 2014, p.4). He also noted that “knowledge of a foreign tongue, acquired by means of translation, is necessarily defective and incomplete; for there is by no means for every word of one language, the exact equivalent in the other” (Berlitz, 1916, p. 4 in Kerr, 2014, p. 3).
Despite all the strong criticism against the use of translation in language teaching, there has been a shift in the views of scholars who believe that translation is a valuable pedagogical resource in EFL classroom after being considered, for a long time, as an inadequate tool that hinders the acquisition of a new language. Until the late 1970’s, students were provided with texts that are incomplete to be translated. Students were not also aware of the kind of texts they were exposed to or why they were asked to translate. In this respect, translation was seen as a testing tool for checking learners’ understanding as well as for improving their translation competence later. Due to the way the Grammar-Translation Method made use of translation, this method was proved, to a certain degree, inadequate. The emergence, in the mid-nineteenth century, of the “new brave world” where technology and commerce were the two main governing forces strengthened the need for a language to communicate and mediate between the different cultures and social groups and paved the way for a new view of translation to emerge.

Starting from the late 1970’s, translation has widely begun to be viewed as a complex process that involves a variety of cognitive skills and abilities. Consequently, translation has come to regain ground after a long rejection and marginalization by researchers, educationalists and practitioners in the field of foreign language teaching. As a matter of fact, the skills that make up the translation process are linguistically and methodologically related to language teaching. As a consequence, translation has never been independent of the four language skills; listening, speaking, reading and writing. Along the same lines, Vienne (1998) supports the functionalists’ point of view about the effectiveness of parameters such as anticipation, resource exploitation, cooperation, and revision involved in the contextual analysis of texts and their exploitation by learners when he asserts that:

they provide life-like focus for meaningful spoken and written language production and reception, requiring students to use both their languages for particular, easily identifiable purposes, both transactionally (to obtain and provide information) and interactively (to get along with others involved in the activity”) (Vienne, 1998, p. 116, as cited in Malmkjaer et al, 1998) (see Brown & Yule, 1983, Ch1)

In the same vein, he adds that even first language activities could be useful if they involve aspects related to the foreign language or culture. Translation, Vienne believes, cannot be harmful if it is well planned and purposefully applied in EFL classroom. Though many EFL teachers disagree with Vienne thinking that interference between languages deprives students of developing the linguistic competence; it similarly raises their awareness of the different linguistic systems they are exposed to as well as helps them control both, especially if the learning environment is a bilingual classroom.

Gatenby (1967), one of the proponents of the Direct Method, states that our aim must be “to get our pupils (…) to the stage where they can use English without having to think” (p.70, in Kerr, 2014, p. 4). Gatenby means that learners should learn “how to dissociate the two languages”. Due to this belief, own language use had been rejected in the EFL classroom for a long time. Separating the two languages seems impossible because of the structure of the human brain. Spivey and Hirsch (2003) in Kerr (2014) have conducted a study on word associations.
Based on scientific evidence, they claim that the human brain can process knowledge of two or more languages in parallel. They attest that the brain is not divided into regions where each region is responsible for the storage of one language only.

Atkinson (1987) points out that translation is one of the most preferred learning strategies for most learners in most places. Additionally, studies in cognitive linguistics and neuroscience prove the effectiveness of learners own language in the foreign language classroom. Widdowson (2003 in Kerr, 2014) is one of the scholars who noted that the rejection of translation was not based on scientific research or pedagogical principles. Interestingly, Vygotsky (1986) believes that learning a new language involves the use of one’s own-language as a mediator between the world of objects and the new language. Neuroscience confirms that the initial acquisition of new words in a foreign language depends on the association of these words with corresponding own-language items in the learner’s memory (Sousa, 2011, p. 247 in Kerr, 2014).

The use of translation from and into one’s first language in the EFL classroom leads to what is known as “negative transfer”. This process, the cross linguistic influence that plays a considerable role in learning a target language, may occur at the lexical level, sentential, and discourse level. According to Odlin (2003), transfer is “the influence resulting from similarities and differences between the target language and any other language that has been previously acquired” (p.13). In this case, the teacher should know how to deal with this negative language transfer wisely by comparing the two languages explicitly with his students. This process is very effective for studying grammatical structures as well as for detecting the students’ common errors. Thus, a good piece of writing in a foreign language can be achieved if those errors are adequately dealt with in the language classroom.

Research confirms that grammatical aspects differ from one language to another, which makes some of them difficult to easily understand. In this respect, translation is a beneficial tool that helps EFL learners be aware of this diversity. Therefore, they can achieve better results as well as develop an awareness of the similarities and differences between their mother tongue and the foreign language. In fact, the process of contrasting particular features of the foreign language and the students’ native language can help them foster their cognitive skills and enable them to better improve the foreign language learning.

Though Halliday (2007) strongly disagrees with the fact that some tasks require translating decontextualized, isolated stretches of language and memorizing word lists in one language along with their word–for-word equivalents in another, he points out that “one can make positive use of the students’ mother tongue; and in such cases to neglect it may be to throw away one of the tools best adapted to the task in hand” (Halliday, 2007, p. 161).

Widdowson (2003) highlights the importance of the learners’ own language in improving bilingual skills when he states that learners “cannot be immunized against the influence of their own language, (…..). There is bound to be contact and (…..) language learning is indeed of its nature, in the same degree, a compound bilingual experience” (p. 151). In addition, Edstrom (2006) notes that current debates shift their focus from the simple use of translation in the EFL classroom to a more serious discussion about the fact that the teacher has a kind of moral
The obligation to make use of the learners’ own language appropriately and judiciously. The teacher does it in order to create an effective learning environment based on a good relationship between the teacher and his students. Widdowson points out that learning is a compound bilingual experience as he believes in the interrelation of both languages in the learners’ mind. Similarly, Harris and Sherwood (1978), who note that the two languages are compounded and learners are unable to avoid the first language interference in the foreign language classroom, also consider code-switching while learning as natural translation. Furthermore, if the role of L1 use is to be assessed, it should be noted that it plays a functional role in facilitating access to explanations, thus enabling contrasts between languages, and most importantly, it raises the students’ awareness of cultural diversity and linguistic knowledge.

Nation (1997, in Kerr, 2014, p. 122) reports that translation from and into the target language is beneficial for vocabulary acquisition in the sense that bilingual word lists may undoubtedly help learners learn new words and phrases, especially in the early stages of learning vocabulary. Interestingly, translation is the only teaching tool that deals with some aspects of vocabulary such as “false friends”. Moreover, there are some grammatical aspects that cannot be easily taught without referring back to translation, i.e., grammatical structures that are influenced by interference between the learners’ own language and the foreign language.

Petrocchi (2006) believes in the usefulness of translation in developing language systems such as grammar, syntax and lexis in both the source language and the target language. According to Shiyab and Abdullattef (2001), grammar is the basis of learning any language. A word –for–word back translation enables students to be aware of the relationship between the two languages though they have different structures. Based on three steps, analysis, transfer and reconstructing, translation helps students not only discover and learn new vocabulary but also new styles that enable them to be active participants in the learning process when they are exposed to purposefully designed translation activities. Moreover, several researchers consider translation as a cultural mediation in the sense that learners will be familiarized with the linguistic elements that are connected to their cultures by comparing the native and the target culture. Barhoudarov (1983) introduces another argument in favour of the use of translation. He claims that translation into the learners’ native language is after all one of the effective means that develop skills of understanding and perception of both foreign speech and writing.

A study conducted at Poznan University, Poland, confirmed that students who were taught and practiced translation techniques at the English department achieved better results in developing both speaking and writing skills than students who have not been trained in them. According to Newmark (1991), translation is “an exercise in accuracy, economy and elegance in manipulating a variety of L2 registers in a first degree” (p. 62). In fact, translation enables learners to overcome the linguistic barriers in which their own-language confines them. More importantly, it can develop communicative and intercultural communicative competence through engaging learners in interactions between different social and ethnic groups that have different cultures, even skills, and as such, negotiation and expression of meaning and interpretations can be improved.
Other scholars such as Carreres (2006) and Fernandez-Guerra (2014), consider translation as a real-life activity that prepares students for real-life situations and encourages them to take risks in communication and learn through their own mistakes. Vienne (1998, as cited in Malmkjaer et al, 1998) also argues that translation activities will raise awareness not only of the native language and the foreign language, but also of the two cultures. Learning new vocabulary through translation helps the learner use figurative language correctly and develops the skill to interpret and produce good pieces of writing. Duff (1989) is one of the proponents of translation as a useful pedagogical tool that helps teachers and practitioners in the field of foreign language teaching to understand better the influence of one language on another and overcome errors of habits. It should be noted that when a teacher translates a word or an expression from English to the native language during the foreign language class, students will understand quickly and will be active participants, even the low-level students, and contribute positively in achieving the learning objectives expected by the teacher.

Translation may be beneficial for language learners in their professional life as many language specialists and pedagogues may “enter professions in which a basic understanding of the processes involved in professional translation may be involved” (Malmkjaer, 1998, p. 9). Malmkjaer (1998) seriously encourages teachers to vary their teaching methods and activities with the integration of translation. For malmkjaer, “translation might profitably be used as one among several methods of actually teaching language, rather than as a mere preparation for an examination” (p. 9).

Titford (1983) supports Atkinson’s point of view by stating that back translation as well as word-for-word translation help students activate their previous knowledge to find the appropriate substitutes when they translate by themselves. He further notes that translation can be very useful for advanced learners if it is purposefully, adequately and wisely implemented in foreign language classes. Titford views translation as a problem-solving activity, a cognitive activity, and a bridge that enables learners to relate form to function in their own language to form and function in the foreign language. Similarly, Stibbard (1994) explains the crucial importance of translation as a pedagogical aid by pointing to the fact that “translation is a natural, useful and essentially communicative activity” (p.9). He believes that translation is practised by all learners of language whether they are trained at it or not, formally or informally, in speaking or in writing.

Despite the varying attitudes towards translation across history, due particularly to the emergence of several EFL teaching methods that banned the use of translation in the EFL environment, there are still numerous voices that believe in the effectiveness of translation as a didactic tool as long as it is used purposefully and judiciously. Despite the fact that arguments against the use of translation may carry some sensible resonance for a number of scholars, teachers, and language practitioners, no convincing reason could be found to consider translation harmful to foreign language learning if it is interactive, communicative in nature, and properly applied.
Participants
The participants in the study were sixty-five secondary school teachers working in different high schools in a number of Algerian provinces. These teachers were asked to fill out a questionnaire which aimed at exploring the secondary schools teachers’ perceptions towards the use of translation in the EFL classroom in order to improve their students’ writing skills and develop their level of English proficiency through time. These teachers adapted the Competency-based approach, taught the same syllabus and were exposed to approximately the same teachers’ training.

Data Collection
The data used in this study were based on responses to the questionnaire addressed to secondary school teachers on their perceptions and attitudes towards the use of translation as a pedagogical aid in the EFL classroom in order to enhance third year foreign language students’ writing performance. In addition to the information about the teachers’ backgrounds (gender, position, teaching experience and location), teachers were asked to indicate whether translation was beneficial in developing the students’ writing by ticking the appropriate box on a provided checklist. It consists of seven closed items ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree. All the questionnaire sheets were filled out and returned.

Data Analysis
Teacher’s General Profile
As far as secondary school teachers’ general profile is concerned, the questionnaire showed that 60% of them were females and 40% were males. About 17% of the respondents were part-time secondary school teachers and 83% of them were full-time secondary school practicing teachers whose teaching experience ranged from 3 to 29 years. The author of this paper has not taken into account the teachers’ place of work as they have all been working under the CBA approach in different secondary schools across Algeria.

1. Respondents’ Perceptions on the Usefulness of Translation in the EFL Classroom

As figure 1 indicates, the results of the teachers’ attitudes towards the usefulness of translation as a teaching aid in EFL show that 16.92% of them strongly agreed that translation was a beneficial teaching tool. The majority of the informants (63.07%) have agreed that translation is useful in teaching English as a foreign language. 12.30% have chosen the option “undecided” to

![Figure 1. Participants’ responses to item 1.](image-url)
express their lack of opinion on the subject. The last 7.60% have expressed their disagreement about the usefulness of translation activities in the EFL context.

2. Teachers’ Responses to the Role of Translation in Explaining and Teaching the New Vocabulary Related to the Teaching Unit

As to the second item, the vast majority of the questionnaire respondents reported positive attitudes towards using translation in teaching the new vocabulary related to the unit they were teaching, with 20% of them strongly agreeing with this view and 63.07% agreeing. In contrast, some participants did not believe that translation was adequate for teaching or explaining vocabulary in that 10.76% of them disagreed with this idea and 3.07% strongly disagreed. About 3.07% of respondents did not have an opinion about this particular issue.

3. Teacher’s’ responses to the role of translation in developing students’ cognitive skills

In this regard, the results show that more than half of them thought that translation was beneficial as far as this kind of skill were concerned (with 12.30% who strongly agreed and 46.15% who agreed with this view). 23.07% of the participants subscribed to the view that translation could not help students develop their cognitive skills. In fact, 3.07% of them
expressed strong disagreement with this view. About 15.38% were undecided about this statement.

4. Teachers’ Responses to the Role of Translation Activities in Helping Students Plan, Reflect, Review and Edit their Written Work

Figure 4. Participants’ responses to item 4

According to the teachers’ responses about whether or not translation activities give the learners the opportunity to plan, reflect, discuss, review and edit their written works, 43.07% of the informants agreed and 20% of them strongly endorsed this idea. Furthermore, 13.84% answered negatively and about 6.15% strongly disagreed with the view. Some of them (16.92%) did not have an opinion about this statement.

5. Teachers’ Responses to the Role of Translation in Extending Students’ Background Knowledge and Enriching their Linguistic Competence

Figure 5. Participants’ responses to item 5

The results about the role of translation in extending students’ background knowledge and enriching their linguistic competence show that 18.46% of the respondents strongly agreed with this view while 36.92% of them have chosen to agree only. On the other hand, about 26.15% of
them disagreed and only 4.61% strongly expressed disagreement with this idea. However, 13.84% of the respondents were undecided about the subject.

6. Teachers’ Responses to the Usefulness of Translation in Transposing Students’ Ideas from L1 into English during the Writing Process

The findings show that 15.38% strongly agreed with the view that purports that students translated their thought using their first language when writing in English, a process that helps them transfer these ideas into the foreign language when producing a piece of writing. 43.07% agreed with this idea. However, 18.46% of the informants disagreed with this view whereas others (10.76%) expressed their strong disagreement about it. 12.30% of them were undecided as far as the statement is concerned.

7. Teachers’ Responses to the Usefulness of Translation in Helping Students Learn Comparatively Resulting in the Avoidance of Negative L1 Transfer Errors

The results indicate that 53.84% of the participants reported their agreement with the idea that if translation were used purposefully and judiciously, students would learn comparatively. Thus, common mistakes caused by negative first language transfer could be avoided. 13.84% of the respondents strongly believed in the usefulness of translation in avoiding interference errors. In addition, 15.83% were undecided as far as the importance of translation in this respect is
The Usefulness of Translation in Foreign Language

Benelhadj Djelloul & Neddar

Discussion of the Findings

The findings show that the vast majority of secondary school teachers were quite positive about the usefulness of translation as a teaching aid in English classes, which indicates their awareness of the importance of varying new activities to facilitate the learning of English as well as to create a learning environment in which the foreign language can be effectively and appropriately taught.

The majority of participating teachers reported the effectiveness of translation in explaining new vocabulary related to the unit they were teaching, as stated by Carreres (2006, in Fernandez-Guerra, 2014, p. 157), which helped the students produce a rich piece of writing. Writing tasks introduced to third year students were all related to the different sequences of the teaching unit that revolved around one particular theme. Interestingly, the vocabulary taught in the different units covered during the school year would be tested in the Baccalaureate exam (Algeria’s national exam that grants students admission to university undergraduate studies) in the form of two suggested writing topics. Consequently, any vocabulary section should be well covered and it would be part of the teachers’ responsibility to explain and to ensure that students understand the new vocabulary introduced to them.

Unsurprisingly, there are clear variations in the teachers’ attitudes towards the relevance of translation in developing students’ cognitive skills such as analyzing, critical thinking, interpreting, understanding, sequencing and problem-solving skills. More than half of the respondents agreed that translation helped students develop their cognitive skills in the sense that it was a mental process that required an in-depth study of the source text. This study, based on interpreting, reflecting and contrasting the source text with the target text, involved high skills of analyzing and critical thinking that enable learners to choose an accurate translation from the wide range of possibilities existing in the target language. The teachers’ possible explanation is consistent with the findings of many researchers (Duff, 1989; Stibbard, 1994; Leonardi, 2010; Hall & Cook, 2013; Fernandez-Guerra, 2014). Additionally, more than 60% of the participants subscribed to the view that translation from and into students’ own-language helped them plan, reflect, review and edit their written works using the different previously mentioned cognitive skills (as cited in Fernandez-Guerra, 2014).

More than half of the respondents subscribed to the view that thinking in the first language was a natural process that all students went through when writing regardless of their level of proficiency and whether the teacher allowed this practice or rejected it (Duff, 1989; Hall & Cook, 2013, Kerr, 2014). Considered as the most preferred language learning strategy (Atkinson, 1987), translation helped students transpose ideas based on their previous background knowledge from their own-language into English while writing. In other words, translation enabled students to direct their thinking about English during classroom tasks such as writing (Hall & Cook, 2013). Besides, the translation process can enrich students’ schemata as well as their linguistic competence in both their native language and the target language.
While some teachers disagreed with the idea that translation allowed students to learn comparatively and that negative L1 transfer errors could be avoided, most believed that learners would “automatically” compare both languages as stated by Kavaliauskienė and Kaminskienė (2007, in Fernandez-Guerra, 2014, p. 157). Thus, students’ language awareness, including the similarities and the differences between the source and the target language, would be raised (Widdowson, 2003) and many negative transfer errors could be avoided. These teachers seemed to support Kerr’s (2014) view on learning comparatively when he asserts that the most effective way to deal with negative transfer errors is to directly compare the source and the target language. The teachers who were against this idea supported a monolingual approach to teaching English as they believed that the use of two languages in the classroom would lead to negative transfer which, in turn, would cause a lot of writing errors.

Suggested Guidelines on How to Integrate Translation in the EFL Classroom

In the light of the findings obtained from the analysis of the questionnaire, some guidelines are suggested on how to integrate translation activities in English classes so as to overcome secondary school students’ weaknesses and, thus, improve their writing performance.

1. Teachers should make a careful selection of texts of different types and registers that are related to the themes under study.

2. The selected material should be interesting, clear and suits the students’ level of English proficiency.

3. The suggested material should cover the different aspects of language which help develop students’ writing performance.

4. The teacher should consider several factors before practising translation activities mainly students’ level of proficiency, the class size and the time devoted to such activities (Leonardi, 2010).

5. Teachers should encourage and plan for pair and team work which enable students engage in discussions by exchanging and comparing ideas with their classmates.

6. Teachers should participate in training programmes and workshops about the reassessment and current debates surrounding translation use in the EFL context.

7. Translation can be a very effective pedagogical tool in the EFL classroom if a course including basic knowledge of translation techniques and models as well as its importance in language teaching forms part of the future teachers’ academic syllabus.

Conclusion

Clearly, as it ensues from the majority of secondary school teachers’ reports, translation played a considerable role in improving foreign language learning and language skills in general, and the writing skill in particular. Their responses to the different statements suggested in the questionnaire indicate, to a large measure, the importance of translation in raising students’ awareness of the different aspects of the foreign language that helps foster the improvement of their language writing skill.
The Usefulness of Translation in Foreign Language

Benelhadj Djelloul & Neddar

About the Authors

Dalila Benelhadj Djelloul is a PhD candidate and an English high school teacher. She received a B.A. degree in English Language, Literature and Anglo-Saxon Civilization and a Master’s in Applied Linguistics from the University of Mostaganem, Algeria. She has been teaching English since 2012.

Dr. Bel Abbes Neddar is an associate professor in Applied Linguistics at the University of Mostaganem (Algeria). He postgraduated from the Institute of Education (University of London). His major interests are in Pragmatics and Discourse Analysis, Language pedagogy, Education and Systemic Functional linguistics, issues on which he published world-wide. Dr. Neddar is the editor-in-chief of ENGLISH LINGUA JOURNAL.

References:


Barhoudarov, L.S. (1983). The Role of Translation as a Means of Developing Oral and Written Speech Habits in the Senior Years of Instructional a Language Teaching College. In Translation in Foreign Language Teaching. Paris: Round Table FIT-UNESCO.


Manchester, UK. St. Jerome Publishing


The Role of Culture in Dubbing TV Advertisements into Arabic: The Case of Chocolate Commercials

Ameena Haroun Abdulla Al-Haroon
Audiovisual Translation Graduate Student, College of Humanities and Social Sciences
Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha, Qatar

Rashid Yahiaoui
Assistant Professor, College of Humanities and Social Sciences
Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Doha, Qatar

Abstract
This study aims to explore the transcreation of television advertisements that were dubbed from English into vernacular and modern standard Arabic, and to propose translation as an integral part of marketing a product internationally. The study attempts to achieve these aims by looking at the pragmatic concept of presupposition in translation studies, guided by micro-translation strategies of cultural themes. The study employs Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs (1943) and Hofstede’s Cultural Dimensions (1984) to analyze the translation of three cultural themes: methods of persuasion, stereotypes, and humor. Further themes, per each cultural themes are explored: persuasion through foreignization, persuasion through localization of norms and preferences, persuasion through adapting types of register, portraying the Arab culture as storytellers, verbalizing stereotypes through linguistic clichés and idioms, hyperbole in humor, and modification of irony in humor. The study concludes that micro-translation strategies: (1) in terms of cultural themes, are not exclusive to either a Modern Standard Arabic (MSA) or a vernacular Arabic dialect; and (2) are used concurrently across cultural sub-themes.

Keywords: Advertisement translation, cultural translation, dubbing, localization, transcreation, Arabic dialects, Modern Standard Arabic

DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.12
Introduction
In international marketing, the tangible features of an edible product, such as packaging, labelling, and ingredients are often the primary concern of how this product could be adapted to a target market. Advertising through various media platforms, such as television, radio, the Internet, and print material plays a key role in promoting these features. However, Valdés (2013) documents that “few research attempts have been made to approach marketing and communication studies within translation studies” (p. 311). In the Arab World, audiovisual product advertisement is rarely studied as an overlap of visual and verbal components that make up its audiovisual nature. Hence, this study attempts to bridge the gap between these two components by proposing translation as an integral part to adapting audiovisual product promotion to an Arab audience. The study specifically looks at how certain cultural themes are dubbed into Arabic in advertisements, and attempts to answer two questions: (1) how can the presupposition theory govern the dubbing of television advertisements? and (2) why should commercial texts be translated by specialized translators?

Certain terminologies will need to be defined for this study. First, localization will be used in the usual sense of marketing, not in the sense that is common in translation studies referring to the regional adaptation of computer software (Esselink, 2000, 4). Second, the terms transcreation and transadaptation will be used interchangeably since the study utilizes topics from two fields: audiovisual translation and advertising. Ray and Kelly (2010) state that transcreation is “commonly applied to marketing and advertising content that must resonate in local markets in order to deliver the same impact as the original” (p. 2). Transadaptation, on the other hand, is used to describe cultural adaptation in the field of audiovisual translation (Gambier, 2004, 5 as cited in Munday 2012, 271). Third, “source text” and “target text” will be abbreviated as “ST” and “TT”, respectively, throughout this paper. Fourth and last, the terms “Western Culture” and “the West” will be used to refer only to countries whose geographic location is in the western hemisphere, and whose major populations speak English. Hence, those countries are Canada,¹ the United States of America and the United Kingdom. These three countries have very similar measures of cultural dimensions, illustrated in Figure 1.

Figure 1: Hofstede's Cultural Dimensions, United States in comparison with Canada and United Kingdom.

Source: Geert Hofstede (2017)
Valdés (2011) argues that “it is essential to consider audiovisual advertising as a social phenomenon” (p. 94). Moreover, Sidiropoulou (2008) states that “advertisements provide insights into both artistic and socio-cultural aspects of language” (p. 338). Therefore, in terms of international marketing, advertising can get tricky because it often taps into cultural topics that are not easily replicated or rendered into other cultures. This challenge becomes even more complex in dubbed advertisements due to textual/linguistic, aural, and visual modes (and hence adaptations) that are present in dubbed advertisements.

It is imperative to note the main challenge in conducting this study was the minimal number of EN-AR dubbed, chocolate-promoting advertisements available online, which made the process in attempting to collect a wider set for the study very constrained.

Research Background

In marketing, advertising is an acoustic, visual, or audiovisual method of promoting a product or a service to the public. Stanton (1984) defines advertising as a “form of marketing communication that employs an openly sponsored, non-personal message [...]” (p. 465). Advertising has different formats; print, such as magazines, newspapers, and wall posters, and non-print; such as television, radio, electronic billboards, and websites. In the Arab World, current advertising practices show that dubbing is a popular audiovisual mode when communicating a foreign advertisement to an Arab audience (Hammond 2005, 267).

Chaume (2012) defines dubbing as “an audiovisual translation mode or practice that consists of replacing the original track of a film’s source language dialogues with another track on which translated dialogues have been recorded in the target language. The remaining track are left untouched (the soundtrack – including both music and special effects – and the images)” (p. 181).

Many scholars such as De Mooij (2004), Valdés Rodríguez (2008), Torresi (2010) and Cui and Zhao (2014) agree that translators of advertisement should be professionals and specialized in the field of advertising.

Unlike in translation studies, the term “localization” in marketing is defined as a practice that adjusts the “product's functional properties and characteristics to accommodate the language, cultural, political and legal differences of a foreign market or country” (Haveman & Vochteloo 2016, p. 81).

Challenges in Advertisement Translation

Persuading the viewer to buy or to consider buying a product is the ultimate goal of any advertisement. However, methods of persuasion also differ across cultures. This difference, as explained by Sidiropoulou (2008), is majorly influenced by the cultural elements that are defined in Hofstede’s Cultural Dimensions, as we shall see.

Stereotypes in advertising are sometimes important as they make the message that promotes a product more persuasive because cultural beliefs are associated with stereotypes and social expectations (Fasoli, Mazzurega, & Sulpizio, 2016, p. 3). For example, Valdés and Fuentes-Luque (2008) state that a car commercial promoted by a German engineer speaking in the ad denotes reliability, which is “stereotypically associated with German people and products” (p. 139).
Humor in audiovisual translation is another often challenging dimension. The challenge stems from the “duplicity of channels” (Sanderson, 2009, p. 125) that is portrayed in “technical (acoustic and visual synchronization), linguistic and cultural constraints” (Veiga, 2009, p. 2).

Pronoun use across cultures could also be challenging in advertisement translation, as the target text of the addressee may be presented in a collectivistic or an individualistic context. For example, De Mooij (2004, p. 188) argues that in some languages, the subject pronouns “I”, “we”, and “you” may be dropped from the translation due to the target cultures’ preference(s) and as a result of their low individualism.

In dubbing advertisements, inaccessibility to the visual elements of the advertisement that needs to be culturally adapted is one of the biggest constraints, represented in writing the script for the dubbed advertisement. Valdés (2007) accounts that “some translators have mentioned that when they are commissioned to translate a television commercial, they are rarely given the video, just the storyboard, making it extremely difficult of see the global cohesive effect of the text” (p. 282). However, further exploration of the challenges in dubbing and transadapting advertisements would be beyond the scope of this study.

Theoretical Framework

A recent work by Cui and Zhao (2014) explores the cultural translation of advertisements through the pragmatic concept of presuppositions. El-Gamal (2001) defines presuppositions as “shared assumptions that form the background of the asserted meaning” (p. 37). Based on this understanding, this study’s analysis employs theories borrowed from psychology and social psychology: Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs (1943) and Geert Hofstede’s Cultural Dimensions (1984), respectively. The first theory is illustrated in Figure 2:

![Figure 2: Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs.](Image)

Recreated from Collin et al. (2012, p. 139).
Maslow’s theory (1943) is important for the present study because it identifies different human needs that advertisers and translators of advertisements may highlight in an advertisement. Hence, they may choose them as a guide to approach and relate to their target audience.

On the other hand, Hofstede (1984) stipulates that human interaction across cultures differ due to different cultural “dimensions”: individualism versus collectivism, power distance, uncertainty avoidance, masculinity versus femininity (Hofstede 1984), and long-term versus short-term orientation (Hofstede and Bond 1988). The most significant dimensions for this research, guided by the corpus selection, are the collectivistic versus the individualistic characteristics of culture, and culture’s measure of uncertainty avoidance. Figure 3 illustrates Hofstede’s dimensions (1984) through comparing cultural measures of the Arab World against those of the United States.

![Figure 3: Cultural dimension measures of the Arab World and the United States.](source)

Hofstede’s theory is significant to this research because it identifies social elements that largely influence and shape global and cross-cultural message communication.

The study employs two sets of micro-translation strategies.² The first set was proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet (1995):

1. Borrowing;
2. Transposition;
3. Modulation;
4. Equivalence;
5. Adaptation;
6. Amplification
7. Explicitation; and
8. Generalisation.
The second set was proposed by Schjoldager, Gottlieb, and Klitgård (2008), who define it as a “taxonomy” that was influenced by Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) and Delabastita’s (1993) translation strategies. The taxonomy is presented in Figure 4:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct Transfer</th>
<th>Transfers something unchanged.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>Transfers the structure or makes a very close translation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct Translation</td>
<td>Translates in a word-for-word procedure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oblique Translation</td>
<td>Translates in a sense-for-sense procedure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explicitation</td>
<td>Makes implicit information explicit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>Translates rather freely.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condensation</td>
<td>Translates in a shorter way, which may involve implication (making explicit information implicit).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adaptation</td>
<td>Recreates the effect, entirely or partially.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addition</td>
<td>Adds a unit of meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substitution</td>
<td>Changes the meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deletion</td>
<td>Leaves out a unit of meaning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permutation</td>
<td>Translates in a different place.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 4: A taxonomy of microstrategies.*


**Research Methodology**

The advertisements we chose to analyze were obtained from YouTube, and were then re-uploaded to avoid potential content removal by the original publisher. The product category we chose to analyze is chocolate because chocolate advertisements are widely dubbed on Arabic television and, to the best of our knowledge, they had not been thoroughly explored in research.

Two variables govern the corpus used in this study. The first variable is the language variant used to dub the commercial: vernacular or Modern Standard Arabic (MSA). The vernacular versions of the target ads have further variables: Egyptian dialect and Khaleeji dialect. However, the effect of dialect variation on the dubbing of the ads would not be explored in the analysis because each ad has been produced in the given dialect only. The second variable is the degree of transcreation of each commercial. For this variable, we define *mirror ads* as only those whose visual elements have not been changed because only verbal elements generally vary in a dubbed product. On the other hand, we define *semi-mirror ads* as target ads whose visual elements have been reproduced through employing new actors, or have been slightly modified through the rearrangement of certain clips.
Analysis

Based on the analysis of the source and target (i.e. parallel) texts, three mutual cultural themes were identified and studied: methods of persuasion, stereotypes and humor. Further themes were introduced as “sub-themes” from specific common examples found in the parallel texts.

Methods of Persuasion

In advertising, methods of persuasion are “largely culture-specific” (Torresi, 2011, p. 9). Hornikx, Meurs, and Boer (2010) add that “ads with culturally adapted value appeals are more persuasive and better liked than ads with culturally non-adapted value appeals” (p. 171-2).

1. Persuasion through Foreignization

Consumers in developing countries tend to associate foreign products with better quality (Stoebe, 2013, 58). In two of the eight TTs, this was achieved by employing words that either associated superior product quality with the foreignness of the product, or regions in which these products were made. In Table 1, words corresponding to “quality”, “expertise” and “refinery” were added in TT1.

Table 1 Persuasion through Foreignization, Example 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST1</th>
<th>TT1</th>
<th>TT1 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>And in Christmas, the</td>
<td>قصة الشغف الحقيقي للجودة</td>
<td>The story of real passion for quality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>magic is even stronger.</td>
<td>…</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Because the ambassador</td>
<td>الخبرة العريقة…</td>
<td>The deep-rooted expertise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>knows how to captivate</td>
<td>…</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>his guests.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mmmm… Ferrero Rocher.</td>
<td>والإبداعات الراقية.</td>
<td>And the refined creations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In TT5, the geographic region (Europe) in which the chocolate was manufactured was identified. Afoakwa (2011) states that “many leading suppliers of premium chocolate are headquartered either in the United States or in Europe, the latter of which boasts of a long-standing chocolate manufacturing heritage” (p. 7). Perception-wise, Bilkey and Nes (1982) stress that the “country of origin has a considerable influence on the quality perceptions of a product” (p. 89). Schjoldager, Gottlieb, and Klitgård (2008, p. 92) put forward that in translation, a strategy where implicit information is made explicit is known as explicitation.

The sampling method of the corpus was *stratification* where “the population is divided into mutually exclusive groups (such as gender or age); then random samples are drawn from each group” (Lamb, Hair, & McDaniel, 2015, p.171).
Table 2  Persuasion through Foreignization, Example 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST5</th>
<th>TT5</th>
<th>TT5 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The pleasure to choose from a unique collection of finest chocolate.</td>
<td>متعة الاختيار من تشكيلة فريدةً من أخر أنواع الشوكولاتة الأوروبية.</td>
<td>The pleasure of selecting from a unique variety of the finest kinds of European chocolate.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Explicating Europe as the origin of the chocolate in TT5 aims to highlight the foreignness of the brand to the viewer, which could further imply the high quality associated with European chocolate.

2. Persuasion through Localization of Norms and Preferences

Guerra (2012, 7) stipulates that “the basic goal of the translator when trying to ‘adapt’ the translation is to have a similar effect on the TL readers, ‘domesticating’, in a way, the cultural terms.” Venuti (2008, 15) defines the term domestication as “an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to target-language cultural values [that brings] the author back home.” In TT1, the product was promoted for the occasion of Christmas, the central Christian commemoration of the birth of Jesus Christ, whereas the corresponding TT promoted it for Eid Al-Adha, a Muslim occasion that commemorates the sacrifice Prophet Abraham made and celebrates Muslims’ pilgrimage “the Hajj” in Mecca. Thus, contextualizing the product through adaptation as a translation strategy was imperative for persuasion, on the presupposition that an occasion relative to the Arab consumer was required to appeal to them.

Target culture’s habits also influence the translation of advertisements. Valdés (2000) argues that such adaptation is “influenced by the target culture norms: while the image follows the globalization principle, the linguistic message [is] adapted according to the target” (p. 276). To demonstrate this claim, two lines from commercial no. 8 are analyzed in Table 3. In the ST, the first line described the production process of the left Twix bar. The following line then described that of the right Twix bar. The TT8 versions of these lines, however, described the production process of the right Twix bar first and then that of the left Twix bar.

Table 3  Persuasion through Localization of Norms and Preferences, Example 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST8</th>
<th>TT8</th>
<th>Screenshot³</th>
<th>TT8 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Left Twix flowed caramel on cookie.</td>
<td>بين الالي خصل ان الالي عاليمين خط كاراميل عاليسكوت.</td>
<td>But what happened was that the right one put caramel on biscuit.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In this example, the translator was aware of a norm in the target culture: the habitual preference of right over left. Vinay and Darbelnet (1995, 37) define such translation strategy as an *optional (or free) modulation*, which seeks to provide “a solution which rests upon a habitual train of thought.” But the translator of these two lines might have also been skeptical of the viewer’s both cognitive and aesthetic needs (Figure 2) for recognizing visual and verbal symmetry, which made the translation not optimum because the screen shows a Twix bar situated on the left side when the TT narrator described it as a ‘right’ Twix bar. Thus, there is a noticeable semantic disconnection between the visual and the verbal texts. Valdés and Fuentes-Luque (2008, 136) state that “when textual cohesion fails, the intended meaning (message) is miscommunicated.”

Another example within this sub-cultural theme is in ST8, where the two main characters were identified as “founders”, while in TT8 they were defined as “brothers” (أخين). In this case, the term “founders” might appeal to the individualism of the characters rather than to a direct familial relationship between them. Kulwicki (2016, 209) states that “the family unit continues to be the most sacred unit in Arab society.” Moreover, White (2011, 394) argues that relations in the Arab world “begin within the immediate family and reach out to extended families, clans, and tribes”. Thus, the notable collectivistic characteristic in the Arab culture could explain why the term “brothers” was chosen as the target term over other terms that could denote social relationships between the two main characters. From an audiovisual perspective, the adaptation was successful because the image (Figure 5) shows a clear resemblance between the characters in terms of outfit and facial features.

![Figure 5: Twix, "Ideologies"](image)

3. Persuasion through Adapting Types of Register

Vinay and Darbelnet’s (1995) *transposition* is a translation strategy that concerns changing a sentence’s register and degree of generality in the TT. These two aspects – for any sentence – are majorly influenced by the cultural background of a language. To demonstrate this claim, let us look at a line in the first commercial:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5</th>
<th>while Right Twix cascaded caramel on cookie.</th>
<th>وبالصدفة، اللي عالش مال بُرسَوْ حَطَّ كاراميل عالبسكوت.</th>
<th>And coincidentally, the one of the left also put caramel on biscuit.</th>
<th><img src="image" alt="Image" /></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

| 5 | while Right Twix cascaded caramel on cookie. | وبالصدفة، اللي عالش مال بُرسَوْ حَطَّ كاراميل عالبسكوت. | And coincidentally, the one of the left also put caramel on biscuit. | ![Image](image) |
Table 4: Persuasion through Adapting Types of Register, Example 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST1</th>
<th>TT1</th>
<th>TT1 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Ferrero Rocher… Share your Golden Christmas.</td>
<td>(فيريرو روشير … في عيد الأضحى … عطاء من القلب في قالب من ذهب)</td>
<td>Ferrero Rocher in Eid Al-Adha… Giving from the heart in a golden platter.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The lines in ST1 and TT1 have different sentence fields of addressing the viewer. The ST makes the desired action from the viewer toward the advertisement explicit by asking them to “share” the chocolate. This direct communication approach coincides with the Western culture’s high individualism and generally low uncertainty avoidance scores on Hofstede’s cultural dimensions (Hofstede 1984), as Figure 1 shows. Witte and Morrison (1995) as cited in Robinson (2004) state that “Euro-Americans’ verbal messages are explicit and less concerned with context. Members of Asian cultures are more likely to be offended by direct and explicit messages and prefer indirect and implicit messages” (p. 117). The same line in TT1, on the other hand, only implies the desired action from the viewer, putting it in the implicit, metaphorical form of “giving”.

Another type of register change is the illocutionary change, defined by Chesterman (2016) as “a change of speech act” where “the translation introduces a rhetorical question, to produce a more dialogic text” (p. 107). In the context of advertisement translation, persuasion is key, and thus phrases that elicit natural ways of conversation in the dialogue text should be thoroughly considered. Gregory and Carroll (1978) argue that audiovisual texts are “written to be spoken as if not written” (p. 42). In TT7, the register of the twelfth line has been changed in translation from an exclamatory statement into a rhetorical question that carries the same meaning loaded in the ST:

Table 5: Persuasion through Adapting Types of Register, Example 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST7</th>
<th>TT7</th>
<th>TT7 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>I wanna reshuffle!</td>
<td>مانوز ع تاني؟</td>
<td>How about we deal again?!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Shakour (2014) claims that “the rhetorical question is one of the most important aspects of argumentative rhetoric. It is an indirect speech act that seeks to express an emphatic assertion, with no expectation of a reply in most cases” (p. 408). The argumentative situation might have been suitable for the translator to make this illocutionary change — from a statement in the source text to a rhetorical question in the target text. Chiad and Sabah (2015, p. 114) allege that rhetorical questions in Arabic are more rhetoric than those in English, such that they could be more implicit in Arabic than in English. In this example, this claim holds such that the source text has one layer of presupposition: the player was not impressed with the hand he was dealt. In the target text, there are two layers of presupposition: the player also was not...
impressed with his share of dealt cards, and assumes (through his rhetorical question) that the cards would be dealt again.

**Stereotypes**
The “classical view of stereotypes”, as Pickering (2001) puts it, is “the idea that social stereotypes exaggerate and homogenise traits held to be characteristic of particular categories and serve as blanket generalisations for all individuals assigned to such categories” (p. 10). Moreover, cultural stereotypes have “culturally salient entities” (Blum, 2004, p. 252-3), and they are a vital asset for short promotional genres such as advertisements” (Torresi, 2010, p. 161).

1. Portraying the Arab Culture as Storytellers
Becatelli and Swindells (1998) as quoted in De Mooij (2004) argue that “[...] where a different language is spoken, there is likely to be a different set of symbolic references, including myths, history, humour and the arts. Any advertisement that does not tap into such references is likely to be a blander proposition than one that does” (2004, p. 180-81). TT1 makes an interesting case of cultural adaptation along those lines:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST1</th>
<th>TT1 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>[female]: There’s always something magic about the ambassador’s reception…</td>
<td>[male]: The gold… tells us the tale of Rocher.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Because the ambassador knows how to captivate his guests.</td>
<td>The deep-rooted expertise,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The object in the ST was the “ambassador's reception”, which was described as “magical” and “captivating.” In the Western pop culture, which includes advertising, magic and happiness are correlated. Hockley and Fadina (2015) observe that contemporary media in the Western society has contributed to imbuing the mind of the consumer that “a throwaway commercial object […] with an apparently magical quality […] will enchant our lives and supernaturally turn the mundane realities of life into deeply satisfying states of happiness” (p. 2-3). In ST1, words such as “magic” and “captivation” emphasize *happiness* in the Western culture. On the other hand, TT1 objectifies “the gold of Rocher” and appeals to anecdotal or narrative words such as (حكاية) “story” and (عريقة) “deep-rooted” to indicate storytelling and association to history. On orality and Arabic storytelling, Herzog (2012) comments that “[...] oral performance and transmission play an important role alongside literacy in Arab-Islamic culture” (p. 627).

This narrative theme in cultural adaptation has also been found in commercial no. 5. While the source text associated falling in love with the state of happiness, the target text has associated it with fairytales and storytelling.
Schjoldager, Gottlieb, and Klitgård (2008) identify this translation strategy as *substitution*, where the meaning was transcreated in the target text:

**Table 7: Storytelling and History, Example 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST5</th>
<th>TT5 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>[sung, male]: I’m so happy, I’m so glad that I’ve got you.</td>
<td>[sung in Lebanese dialect, male]: You being with me is the most beautiful story.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Verbalizing Stereotypes through Linguistic Clichés and Idioms**

Touy (2012) suggests that “translations be regarded as facts of the culture that would host them” (p. 18). In the same vein, Baider (2013) argues that “knowing cultural stereotypes and using linguistic clichés are important, since such processes trigger recognition and acceptance within the target culture” (p. 1170).

ST3 frequently uses the phrase *here’s to*, which is “an expression used as a toast to someone or something to wish someone or something well” (Spears, 2005, p. 301). In the commercial, the phrase is used to imply the celebratory and well-wishing feelings associated with eating Kit Kat when taking a break. In the TT, however, an equivalent for the term in Arabic has been used: (حبتين) literally meaning “two-pieces”. Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) define this translation strategy as *equivalence* (p. 38-9). The phrase (حبتين) describes the shape of the V sign gesture. In the West, the gesture rose to prominence during World War II, when then British Prime Minister Winston Churchill flashed a “‘V for Victory’ [...] in a speech to his compatriots” (Cosgrove, 2014). Zelinsky (2011b) notes that the gesture seems to have transcended from the West to the Middle East during Iraq’s “first general election since the U.S.-led invasion and the removal of Saddam Hussein.” In relation to the TT of commercial no. 3, the word (حبتين) could explain the activity of coming of age, which might be along the recent political trends in the Middle East. Zelinsky (2011a) elaborates that “the V has become a calling card of the wave for reform in the Arab (and Persian) world.” Although there were no V gestures in the visual text to match the verbal choice of “حبتين”, the music playing in the background of the ad enhances the celebratory and victorious feelings radiated through the target word.

**Humor**

1. **Hyperbole in Humor**

Patnoe (2010) defines hyperbole as “a figurative device using self-conscious exaggeration to emphasize feelings and intensify rhetorical effects” (p. 334). In the translation of humor, it is used to amplify a mild humorous presence without substituting the joke. However, we do not associate hyperbole here with Vinay and Darbelnet’s (1995) translation strategy of “amplification” (p. 339): the addition of more words in the target text to exaggerate a meaning in the source text.

The first example is found in the sixth line of commercial no. 8. Here, the ST reads “bathed”, while the TT version reads (غرق) “make drown”, an exaggerated form of the word in an attempt to create
a humorous effect to the Arab audience. The strategy was also heavily used in commercial no. 3, as indicated in the underlined parts in Table 8:

Table 8: Hyperbole in Humor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line in ST</th>
<th>ST3</th>
<th>TT3</th>
<th>TT3 (back-translation)</th>
<th>Line in TT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The “give me a break from ad breaks” breaker.</td>
<td>واللي انفعت مرارته من كثر الإعلانات.</td>
<td>And to he whose gallbladder has exploded because of the many ads.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>The selfie taker.</td>
<td>حبيين للي يومه سيلفي ورى سيلفي.</td>
<td>Two-pieces to he whose day is selfie after another.</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>“I’ll always be a kid”,</td>
<td>واللي قليه شباب مشعل.</td>
<td>And he whose heart is flaming youth.</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>To the old-school breaker.</td>
<td>وللي ما تغير بريكه من أيام رمسيس.</td>
<td>And to he whose break has not changed since the days of Ramesses.</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Modification of Irony in Humor

In general, an irony aims to “stress the absurdity present in the contradiction between substance and form” (“Ironies” on Dictionary.com Unabridged, 2017). In translation, Mateo (1995) presents thirteen strategies for translating irony in humorous texts. One method is explicitation: “[when an] ironic innuendo [in the ST] becomes more restricted and explicit in TT” (p. 176). Hence, explicitation would be necessary to maintain the function of the ST (humor), despite the loss of the rhetorical tool (irony) in the TT. We first look at commercial no. 8 to see irony explicitation in the TT:

Table 9: Modification of Irony in Humor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST8</th>
<th>TT8</th>
<th>TT8 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Both bars as different as the vastly distinct men who invented them.</td>
<td>في الآخر، الصوابعين طلعوا زي بعض بالظبط، بين كل آخ لسه مقتنع إن تويكس بريكيه أحلى.</td>
<td>In the end, both [Twix] fingers looked exactly the same, but each brother is convinced that his own Twix is better.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The verbal text of the ST briefed that the resulting Twix bars are nonidentical while the visual text showed that the bars are indeed identical. This non-parallelism has created a humorous effect in the source text. In the TT, however, irony was not employed, but rather made explicit by explaining the situation: the resulting Twix bars were identical, but seemed non-identical to their creators (i.e. the brothers).

The second line of commercial no. 7 demonstrates another case in which irony was made explicit in the TT to elicit a humorous effect and thus, enhance the comedic aspect in the commercial:

Table 10: Modification of Irony in Humor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Line</th>
<th>ST7</th>
<th>TT7</th>
<th>TT7 (back-translation)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>[the Joker]: How about the Joker plays with you?</td>
<td>[ال الجوكر]: إيه رأيكو الجوكر هو اللي هَيِلعَب بيكو؟</td>
<td>[the Joker]: What would you think if the Joker plays [using] you?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Yus (2013, p. 80) notes that jokes in absurd scenarios are strengthened with when characters are personified. In the ST, the Joker card is personified as a participant in the card game. However, it is important to note that the phrasing in the line could carry two meanings, such that the Joker proposes: (1) his interest in being a participant in the card game, or (2) being the only participant in the card game, and uses the other participants as play cards (i.e. personification).

Regardless of the intended meaning in the ST, the verbal text aims to promote an ironic situation. In contrast, the TT’s approach toward maintaining the ironic rhetoric function was by utilizing one of the possibly intended meanings and thus making the meaning explicit through translation. Fortunately, the choice made in the TT was still consistent with the ST’s meaning because the relationship between the visual and the verbal elements of both texts were maintained. This is depicted through the source and target scenes where the card game players seem unimpressed following the Joker’s rhetoric (and ironic) question, as we can see in Figures 6 and 7..

Figure 6: Modification of Irony in Humor, Example 1°
Figure 7: Modification of Irony in Humor, Example 2⁶

Concluding Remarks

This study explored presupposition in the translation of three cultural themes — methods of persuasion, stereotypes, and humor — in television advertisements that were dubbed from English into Arabic. Each theme had further sub-themes with their almost consistent micro-translation strategies, which were proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) and Schjoldager, Gottlieb, and Klitgård (2008). The analysis in this study has shown that micro-translation strategies are not exclusive to either language variant (Modern Standard Arabic or vernacular), and that the strategies could occur concurrently across the cultural sub-themes identified in the study.

Based on the results of the analysis, it might be safe to state that presuppositions influence the creation and perception of dubbed television advertisements. Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs (1943) — the first tool governing presupposition — shows how the translator’s authority prevails as he is expected know of the target culture’s needs from the advertisement, and thus create the dubbing text according to those needs.

Hofstede’s Cultural Typology (1984) — the second tool governing presupposition — demonstrates how the social psychology of the target audience also guides the translator’s target text, essentially through individualism versus collectivism and uncertainty avoidance measures.

Cultural rather than linguistic approaches to dubbing advertisements seem to prevail in the Arab World as they allow for more flexibility for the translator. However, the potential risk of deviating from the message intended might not only introduce the issue of unfaithfulness in translation, but also a potential negative reputation about the commercial and the company adopting the promoted product.

Future studies on audiovisual advertisement translation could further explore current corporate practices in cultural advertisement translation, and whether their marketing departments predetermine these practices as a method of standardizing their international marketing approaches.

Endnotes:
¹ A 2011 census showed that 56.9% of Canada's population identifies English as its mother tongue language (Statistics Canada 2016).
² On the other hand, macro-translation strategies, as indicated by Schjoldager, Gottlieb, and Klitgård (2008) generally concern “source-text oriented” versus “target-text oriented” translation strategies.
The Role of Culture in Dubbing TV Advertisements into Arabic

Ameena Al-Haroon & Yahiaoui

References


The Visibility of the Translator: A Case Study of the Palestinian Translator

Mohammed El-Haj Ahmed
English Department, Islamic University of Gaza.
Palestine

Ghadeer Jamal Shabana
Islamic University of Gaza, Palestine

Abstract
This study aims at investigating the impact of ideology on rendering highly sensitive news items with special examination of the visibility of the Palestinian translator. It shows how ideology controls speech and how the translator should use certain jargons in his translation as a weapon of resistance to refute the superiority implied in the occupier's discourse. The study also investigates whether Palestinian translators would counter ‘interpellation’ as a strategy of resistance through translation. For this purpose, 30 participants of translation students at the English Language department at IUG were tested. The test consisted of 10 sentences incorporating 12 highly sensitive terms. Another data collection method was a questionnaire administered to 11 male MA translation students. The questionnaire included 13 statements that tackle the issues of visibility, ideology, and neutrality in translation. The participants showed a highly emotive and ideological tendency in translating such terms. The researchers then ended up with some recommendations for researchers, translators, and syllabus designers.

Keywords: discourse, ideology, interpellation, jargon, visibility

I. Introduction

There has been a great effort to investigate the impact of ideology on translating. This intricate issue has been the main concern of translation scholars for many years. Translation is believed to be a process practiced by translators to convey certain ideas that are sometimes subject to their culture, beliefs, institution’s agenda, and religion, etc. It is a means of cross-cultural communication, and, for this reason, translators can ideologically manipulate the source text to influence their readers. This act of manipulation reflects the translators’ attitude towards the subject they are translating. For this sake, the translator tends to use certain strategies such as deleting information, changing the meaning of certain terms, foregrounding, postponing, and passive construction, among many others.

Ideology in translation has recently been a very important issue for scholars from different fields of study for its significance which is introduced explicitly or implicitly to guide the readership towards certain goals in the minds of translators. News is rich with controversial issues which are conveyed differently due to the differences in cultural backgrounds and religious and political affiliations. Translators of news items may come across news contradicting their beliefs. Intensive efforts to illustrate and study the role of ideology in translation have been exerted by researchers. In fact, scholars have recently tried to investigate the concept of ideology in translation and to study its influence as a means that may help change how the readers conceptualize the world.

II. Research Question

The study aims at investigating the following questions:

1. To what extent is the Palestinian translators’ ideology visible in news translation?
2. What strategies do Palestinian translation students use in translating highly sensitive terms in news articles?

III. Literature Review

A) Visibility vs. Invisibility

The notion of visibility and invisibility of the translator has been discussed by the scholars of translation studies from many different perspectives. For instance, invisible translators are defined by Liu (2013:5) as those who “never or seldom have the opportunity to communicate with their clients or end-users”. On the other hand, he defines visible translators as those who can “communicate with both their clients and end-users”.

Venuti (2004) suggests a possible explanation of the invisibility of the translator. According to him, this invisibility might occur because the hard working the translator does in translating a text does not appear to the public. This would certainly justify why the translator is marginalized in the society. The notion that translators are supposed to apply a “fluent style that supports an illusion of original authorship (the author’s face, not the translator’s, would appear on the metaphorical coin” as stated by Bilodeau (2012: 4). He also adds that book covers and reviews tend to ignore translators, who are of less significance in the publishing business.

Translation studies has studied the role of the translator through investigating different methods of translation. Throughout the very long history of studies trying to figure out the ideal
method of translation, two approaches of translation studies emerged: the linguistic-oriented studies of translation and the cultural-oriented descriptive approach. According to Zhang (2012), over the past decades, the linguistic-oriented studies of translation have deteriorated while the cultural-oriented descriptive approach has got considerable momentum. This shift has emerged out of the general tendency towards sense for sense method of translation. Zhang (2012) explains that the descriptive approach has been originated in “comparative literature and Russian Formalism”. The idea of literary poly-system shows that “different literatures and genres, including translated and non-translated works, compete for dominance” (Zhang, 2012, p. 754).

In maintaining the message of the text as well as the cultural aspects, translators tend to use communicative approaches of translation. One of these approaches is using dynamic (functional) equivalence and the principle of equivalent effect suggested by Nida in 1964. In this regard, using formal equivalence may result in a target text (TT) which is literally identical to the original one while using dynamic equivalence may result in a more communicative translation. Completely following formal equivalence would lead sometimes to incomprehensibility. This might go back to the differences between languages in the various linguistic characteristics. Ali (2007) gives an example of Arabic and English. Arabic does not contain plenty of cohesive devices while English does. In this case, the translator has to maintain some kind of restructuring to convey the message behind the source text (ST) cohesively. This also applies to the lexical level where sometimes there is no equivalent word in the target language (TL) for every word in the source language (SL).

B) Translation as Rewriting or Manipulation

André Lefevere (1992) tended to look at translation as being an act of "rewriting" moving away from the notion of poly-system. Lefevere (1992) dismisses the kinds of linguistic theories of translation, which "have moved from word to text as a unit, but not beyond without considering the text in its cultural environment" (Lefevere, 1992, p. 87). Instead, he focuses on the interaction between translation and culture discarding the differences in languages. The gist of Lefevere’s translation theory is focusing on the manipulation or rewriting. According to Lefevere (1992), “any work is not translated in vacuum, which is certainly manipulated or rewritten in a certain form for a certain reason” (Lefevere, 1992, p. 14).

When asked about the difference between writing and translating, Willard Trask (as cited in Honig, 1985), answered by saying that writing is completely different from translating. When asked whether to write is the same as whether to translate, Trask replied:

No, I wouldn’t say so, because I once tried to write a novel. When you’re writing a novel […] you’re obviously writing about people or places, something or other, but what you are essentially doing is expressing yourself. Whereas when you translate you’re not expressing yourself. You’re performing a technical stunt. […] I realized that the translator and the actor had to have the same kind of talent. […] So in addition to the technical stunt, there is a psychological workout, which translation involves: something like
The Visibility of the Translator: A Case Study of the Palestinian Ahmed & Shabana

being on stage. It does something entirely different from what I think of as creative poetry writing. (As cited in Honig, 1985:13)

From Trask’s point of view, translators should not play the role of authors although their job includes a sense of “authorial presence” as a result of the “transparent discourse”.

Two general perspectives on translation exist. On the one hand, translation may be seen as a fake version of the original text. It gives only a fake representation of the ST which is the only authentic product of the author’s beliefs and thoughts. On the other hand, it may be “required to efface its second-order status with transparent discourse, producing the illusion of authorial presence whereby the translated text can be taken as the original” as defined by Venuti (2004:7) who asserts the fact that the first definition of translation results in the translator’s full identification of the author which leads to a complete absence of self-representation of the translator.

C) Ideology and Translation

Media producers play a fundamental role in news coverage. Writers not only report events, but also manipulate news discourse to serve the interests of their news agencies and consequently shaping the readers’ understanding of facts. The expansion of news reporting via the internet also was of great significance as indicated by Thompson and White (2008). Egorova and Parfitt (2002) state that almost every news agency has its own agenda. Thus, the discourse used in media tends to serve certain purposes which are determined by the political environment. Politics affects the way media uses to cover certain events especially during critical periods of conflict. Therefore, media has become a key political weapon that can manipulate events reporting, like the case of "Israel", to influence the public opinion.

According to Luostarinen (2002), people tend to be persuaded by media which in turn manipulates language and events since it has the power of giving a different meaning whether it promotes peace or war. In the meantime, electronic and visual media help journalists influence the public and direct the international concentration towards hatred and violence against a certain group as stated by Luostarinen (2002) cited in Baidoun (2014). Brook (2012) sees translation as a hidden factor for international news to be successful as a marketable commodity. News is a commodity that is traded between a wide range of producers and receivers. Translation is a common practice when it comes to international news. In this sphere, news translation- since it is loaded with connotations, hidden ideologies and perspectives - involves more than any other kind of translation. It is not merely “a process of replacing words and expressions in one language by their corresponding words and expressions in another language” (Schäffner and Bassnett 2010, 10 cited in Brook, 2012).

Accordingly, translation is always shaped by a certain force, power and so on, and the choice of the works to be translated and goals of the translation activity are also set by certain forces. Therefore, translation takes the forms of rewriting, since it is performed under certain constraints and for certain purposes. Shuping (2013) states that translation can take the form of rewriting since it is done under many different constrains for many different purposes, the thing that makes it more than just rendering of words and meanings into the target language. For
Shuping (2013), there is always a certain force or power that determines the type of work to be translated, the goals behind the translation and the methods to be used.

Karoubi (2005) states that ideology has been influencing translation since the beginning of the history of translation itself. According to Fawcett (1998), "throughout the centuries, individuals and institutions applied their particular beliefs to the production of certain effect in translation". He claims that "an ideological approach to translation can be found in some of the earliest examples of translation known to us" (Fawcett, 1998: 106-107).

For Hatim and Mason (2005), ideology involves "the tacit assumptions, beliefs, and value systems which are shared collectively by social group". Hatim and Mason (2005) define 'mediation' as "the extent to which translators intervene in transfer process, feeding their own knowledge and beliefs into processing the text" as cited in Hatim and Munday (2004:102-103). Accordingly, it can be inferred that ideology and translation are intertwined.

D) Ideology and the Role of the Translator

Bassnett (2002) defines the translator as being a “liberator” who is the one who liberates the readers from the boundaries of the ST and the ST author. The translator actually bridges the way between the ST and the readership. Thus, translators should be considered creative writers. According to Bassnett (ibid), the method followed in translating a text, whether word for word or sense for sense, determines the space allowed to the translator. In other words, the translator can be more visible whenever sense for sense method is followed. The text also is the translator’s liberator.

Thus, it can be concluded that the translator’s personality should be concealed and does not appear plainly in TTs. The successful translator according to Venuti (2004) is the translator who can be an illusionist who can insert his personality within the deep sense of the text, but also suppress himself from appearing so vividly and accordingly to be considered as a new authoring or a non-authentic text. In comparison, the American translator Norman Shapiro tries to reach a line in between as quoted in Kratz (1986) by explaining that sees himself in asociation with the author while translating where his personality is involved but he also tries as much as possible to stay faithful to the author and the ST.

In modern actual translation practice, translators tend to pay attention not only to their own understanding but also to the cultural context of the ST rather than the linguistic code of the text. According to Ali (2007), most translators try to put the “ideological implication” in consideration. They should even “negotiate” the thoughts of the author. However, “the invisibility of the translator becomes relative, especially if the text is of a high sensitive nature” (Ali, 2007:24).

To Translate or to Subvert? Translating Politically Sensitive Texts in the Palestinian Context is a study done by three researchers from Al Najah University. Daraghmeh, Herzallah, and Karim (2010) investigate translation in politically sensitive contexts. The researchers explore the staged translation of an English political source text into an Arabic TT. In their study, the researchers adopt the cultural turn approaches which regard translation as not merely rendering
of words and sentences, but also a translation of ideology. In other words, translators should also negotiate the underlying ideologies implied in the ST. The researchers give words like “terrorists” and “IDF” that can be translated as “freedom fighters” and “occupation forces” by a Palestinian translator.

According to Daraghmeh et.al. (2010), the visibility of the translator becomes apparent from the expression of political and ideological beliefs which might conflict with the beliefs of the author of the ST. After studying some emotive expressions in the Jerusalem Post news report and their translations, the researchers conclude that formal equivalence and faithfulness are not effective in the translation of sensitive texts as in the Palestinian context. The translator negotiates the context, particularly the relation between the two different cultures and the agents of power involved. Accordingly, “faithfulness becomes an irrelevant issue and the reality and truth of the ST are questioned and often subverted in translation” (Daraghmeh, et al, 2010: 16).

E) Ideology and Translation Strategies in Previous Studies

Managing and monitoring, ideology and emotiveness, texts sensitivity, and audience preferences are areas that concerned researchers. Al-Shamali (1992) studied the strategy of managing in translating news reports whether syntactic or semantic managing. Farghal (1993:2) distinguishes between two types of managing that are used in news translation which are intrinsic, that is related to the inherent differences between ST and TL, and extrinsic, which refers to the practice of intervention in the source text to achieve the translator’s goal. Van Dijk (1985a) differentiates between explicit ideology which is expressed verbally, and implicit ideology that is implied by the writers’ linguistic choices.

Translators’ historical and cultural ideologies can also interfere with the translation of political news. Hence, translators “shape readers’ understanding of, and attitude to, political events through the translators’ interpretation of events surfacing in target texts” (Banhegyi, 2014: 147). Fairclough (1989) also asserts this view by explaining that power affects the discourse since the media controllers can adapt the linguistic and lexical features of the texts to serve their goals.

The notion of equivalence and dynamic equivalence in particular seems to be different in Niranjana’s Sitting Translation (1992) where she uses the term ‘interpellation’ to refer to the “subjection of a given people by the discourse of the colonizers, depicting an inferior view of that people”. She disapproves using the earlier assumptions of translation where it was supposed to be only about rendering words while the meaning is fixed. Niranjana (1992) called for “a strategy of discarding the power of the colonizer's language. In other words, she called for resistance through re-translation.” (Niranjana, 1992: 66).

In fact, this term is applicable in translating Israeli media discourse. As claimed by (Ali, 2007) Israeli reporters use the language of the superior colonialists who view Palestinians as inferior using a wide range of negative images. They easily control their discourse in order to view Palestinians as terrorists and therefore control the international point of view. Journalistic sentences such as "Twelve Palestinians, including 11 armed members of terrorist organizations, were killed in IDF operations in Gaza" clarify this more. Using the term ‘terrorist organizations’
for Palestinians and the beautified term ‘IDF’ of Israelis is a good example of this case where Israeli media controllers’ objectives are visible in the discourse. They aim at positioning the Palestinians in the terrorists’ position and Israelis in self-defenders’ position.

Another example of the visibility of the media controllers’ identity is the discourse used in Haretz news when reporting about the Gaza war. Frequently, they used “Lexical items such as ‘terrorist, weapon smugglers, gunmen, Qassam launchers etc.’” (Ali, 2007) which reflect a bad image of the occupied Palestinians. By using this discourse, they justify their existence in Palestine. Based on this point, this study aims at figuring out whether Palestinian translators may adopt the ‘interpellation’ strategy or stay invisible and objective in translation.

Stetting (1989), as cited in Brook (2012), used to liken translation to the work of editors calling it trans-editing. He sees translation as “that part of the news production process which involves translating into another language those parts of the original message that are considered newsworthy in the receiving cultural environment” (quoted in Brook, 2012). Deletion, addition, substitution and reorganization are four processes involved in the translation process.

According to Stetting (1989), deletion is the omission of individual lexical items or deletion of clauses, sentences or even complete paragraphs. In other words, any information which is considered unnecessary is eliminated. Deletion may meet the cultural needs or stylistic expectations of the target readership, but there is a danger that important information can also be deleted as cited in Brook (2012). Stetting (1989) also deems addition necessary when the target readership changes. It may be necessary to add background information that is important for the readers in the new context in order to clarify some cultural aspects necessary for a complete understanding. Substitution relates to a variety of different procedures: figures and quantities may be rounded up or down, or expressed differently. Summaries rather than more extensive detailed accounts of sub-events may be given in certain contexts. Reorganization involves restructuring the text through changing the stylistic features of the text to meet those of the target audience. In other words, specific details are sometimes strengthened or weakened through foregrounding or back-grounding. The items foregrounded are usually those that are important to the producer of the news as explained by Stetting (1989) cited in Brook (2012).

The successful translator in general is the one who can smoothly use both formal and dynamic equivalence when rendering both the words and the sense of the ST.

In the Palestinian translator's case, to be a successful translator refers to being visible in smoothly getting involved in the message of the ST by including their beliefs, ideologies and expectations. Accordingly, a Palestinian translator would translate a news story of Palestinians killed in Gaza war using the lexis, narrative, argument, and style that reflect his own ideology as in: "The twelve Palestinians killed this weekend bring the total number of Palestinians killed in a stepped-up IDF offensive that began on Thursday to 20. Of these, at least, three were civilians.” (Ali, 2007). The word that refers to the occupied here is ‘Palestinians’ not ‘terrorists’, and they are killed by the ‘IDF offensive’ not as a self-defense done by IDF although some of them are referred to as being ‘civilians’ or ‘armed members’.

Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies
eISSN: 2550-1542 | www.awej-tls.org
A similar and perhaps clearer difference is evident in this original text mentioned in Ali (2007) followed by its Arabic translation: "Over the past week, there has been an increase in the number of rockets fired at Sderot and other Negev towns, and Defense Minister Amir Peretz yesterday ordered the IDF to step-up its anti-rocket activity."

"وخلال الأسبوع الماضي كان هناك ازدياد في إطلاق الصواريخ على سديروت و أمر وزير الدفاع عبرم بيرتس قوات الاحتلال أن تزيد نشاطها ضد الصواريخ"

In this example, the translator refused to render the defensive sense that ‘IDF’ implies and prefers to use "الاحتلال" instead. In translating fake news claimed by IDF and Israeli media, the Palestinian translator would use lexical items like the word "يدعي" to represent the fact that it is untrue. A good example is this TT translated by a Palestinian translator:

"وفي رفح على الحدود المصرية قامت قوات الاحتلال الإسرائيلية بتفجير بيت تدعي بأنهم يخفون أسلحة في نقق تحته"

Anderson (1976) state that "titles affect the meaning of what follows, delimit the interpretation of what follows and divide the text into smaller headings and paragraphs" (Anderson,1976: 372). News headings would appear in Israeli media as in the following example: "IDF kills terrorist with Qassam launcher in Gaza." On the other hand, a Palestinian translator would render it as follows:

"استشهاد مقاوم فلسطيني وهو يطلق الصواريخ باتجاه قوات الاحتلال"

The word ‘terrorist’ was rendered as "مقاوم", and the word ‘kills’ was rendered by the quasi-passive (a verbal noun) "استشهاد". Such translations convey a message that may have impact on the international awareness of the true case of the Palestinians’ self-defense against the aggressive occupiers.

According to Daraghmeh, et al (2010), managing and emotive lexis are two of the most important strategies used by media reporters to express their attitudes as well as those of the target readers. Their paper also investigates the strategies adopted by Palestinian translators while translating an Israeli news report. A comparison is then made by the researchers between the Israeli original report and the Arabic translated version.

In their analysis of the target texts, the researchers focused on the terms that are considered sensitive or challenging for the Palestinian translators. While rendering the text, the translators intervened adopting dynamic equivalence to meet the needs and ideologies of Arab target readership. While two thirds of the translators rendered the text neutrally, one third didn’t. The translators used substitution for items considered unacceptable such as translating the expression ‘Gaza terrorists’ in "One of the rockets launched by Gaza terrorists landed near Kibbutz YadMordecahi” as ‘مقاتلون من غزة’ or ‘مقاتلون من غزة’. Substitution occurred also in replacing the term "الحكومة الفلسطينية" with "الحكومة حماس”. By doing so, the translators add “pro-unity” political meanings. (Daraghmeh et.al., 2010:16)

Transformation is another strategy used by the translators to make the TT suitable for the target readers. The researchers mention an example where the translators rendered the
statement of "Frustrated by cover provided to troops conducting searches in the centre of Beit Hanoun, the terrorists resorted to sending a woman" into:

هذا وأفادت تقارير عبرية بأن الهجمات التي يقوم بها مقاومون فلسطينيون قد أحبطت بسبب التغطية الجوية التي تزودها قوات الاحتلال الإسرائيلية للجنود الصهاينة المتمركزين في بيت حانون لذلك لاحق المقاومة إلى إرسال امرأة

Translators also tend to use cliché evaluative expressions like 'ادعت' , 'حسب رأي كاتب المقال' , 'دعت' , and 'على حد زعمهم'. To show respect to the ideology their target readers have, other translators preferred to use transformation in: "ورغم التغطية والدعم الذين تحصل عليهما قوات الاحتلال التي تقوم بعمليات "دهم وتفتيش واسعة النطاق في مركز بيت حانون فقد تمكنت الفتاة من الوصول إلى قوة خاصة من جنود الاحتلال" (Daraghmeh et.al., 2010:18)

According to the researchers, all of the translated versions show maximal mediation. The translators intervened in the message “not only by feeding their feelings, but also by diverting the content of the original” (Daraghmeh, et al, 2010: 26). When a proposition, like 'sending a woman' in the previous example, is used by the reporter to imply sarcasm, inferiority, shamelessness, and cowardliness, the translators tended to delete the content which shows that the Palestinians were disabled. Instead, they reversed the message representing the Israeli soldiers as incapable to prevent the girl from blowing herself up near them even though they were covered heavily.

The translated versions also show that the translators used the strategy of addition when rendering the news report under study. In their translation of 'The IDF and the government officials cried foul at what they called the shameless use of civilians as human shields, but the Hamas government praised the women as heroes and encouraged further female contributions to the resistance', the translators added a new statement:

ورغم ما قام به جنود الاحتلال من عمليات قتل ودهم للبيوت، صاح مسئولون إسرائيليون بما أسموه الاستخدام المخزي للفلسطينيين كدروع بشرية ونددوا بما نعتوه إشادة الحكومة الفلسطينية بالنساء ووصفهن بالبطلات وتشجيعهن على المساهمة الإضافية في المقاومة

The added sentence of "ورغم ما قام به جنود الاحتلال من عمليات قتل ودهم للبيوت" shows two things: First, it shows that the translator does not agree with the Israeli perspective in describing the woman's act. Second, it shows that the translator expresses his feelings and attitudes regarding the situation in Gaza.

IV. Methodology

Despite the fact that there have been many studies that tried to trace the influence of ideology on the translation process theoretically, there are not enough empirical studies that measure that influence especially with regard to the Israeli Palestinian conflict. In this sense, this study aims to fill in such empirical gap by designing a data collection instrument to investigate the extent to which ideology of the Palestinian translator is visible in the translation product. The researchers used a mixed research of both qualitative and quantitative designs. A translation test was given to 15 MA students of Translation and Applied linguistics at the English language department at The Islamic University of Gaza. The researchers contacted with the course lecturer to take permission for doing the test. The students signed a consent form first then did the test individually.
The test consisted of 9 questions containing ideologically loaded expressions to be tested. The researchers conducted the analysis upon these nine sentences which contain 14 sensitive expressions. The sentences of the test cover the recent clashes in Jerusalem during the period from October, 2015 till now. Texts were chosen from major Israeli news websites which are Haaretz, the Jerusalem Post, and the Times of Israel. The articles were reported throughout the period from November 25 to December 27, 2015. The researchers collected the articles from electronic websites using keywords as: Gaza, fire, Hamas, terrorist, stabbing, attack and borders, etc. then ended up with four sentences from Haaretz, four sentences from The Jerusalem Post, and two sentences from The Times of Israel. The researchers then used both quantitative and qualitative methods in analysing participants’ translations identifying the translation strategies used.

Another data collection method was a questionnaire that was administered to 11 male MA translation students. The questionnaire consisted of 13 statements that tackle different issues related to the study. The students responded through stating whether they agree, disagree, or are not sure about the statements given. The researchers then analysed the questionnaire results. The validity of the test and the questionnaire was checked through presenting the test to different professors of translation at the MA program at IUG who approved both the form and the content. The reliability of data collection methods was checked through the repetition of the same sensitive items within different sentences in the translation test as well as the repetition of the same underlying notion within different statements through the use of paraphrasing and having a relevant response for each repeated item without any contradiction.

V. Results
V.I. Test: 
In this section, the researchers present the test results and then analyze them interpretatively.

V.I.I. Test Results
The results showed that the participants rendered each sensitive item differently using different techniques, as shown clearly in table 1:

Table 1: Results of The Translation Alternatives of The Test Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Alternative 1</th>
<th>Alternative 2</th>
<th>Alternative 3</th>
<th>Alternative 4</th>
<th>Alternative 5</th>
<th>Alternative 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Palestinian attacker</td>
<td>مهاجم</td>
<td>معتدي</td>
<td>مقاتل</td>
<td>فدائي</td>
<td>مجاهد</td>
<td>فسطيني</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shot dead</td>
<td>قتل</td>
<td>لقي مصرعه</td>
<td>استشهاد</td>
<td>استشهد</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Security</td>
<td>قوات الأمن</td>
<td>قوات الاحتلال</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>forces</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4 IDF</strong></td>
<td>قوات الدفاع</td>
<td>جيش الدفاع الإسرائيلي</td>
<td>قوات الاحتلال الصهيوني</td>
<td>الاحتلال الإسرائيلي</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5 West Bank</strong></td>
<td>الضفة الغربية المحتلة</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6 Death</strong></td>
<td>مقتل</td>
<td>وفاة</td>
<td>مصرع</td>
<td>موت</td>
<td>استشهاد</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7 Israeli jets</strong></td>
<td>الطيران الإسرائيلي</td>
<td>الطائرات الحربية الإسرائيلية</td>
<td>طائرات الاحتلال</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8 IDF soldier</strong></td>
<td>جندي من قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلي</td>
<td>جندي اسرائيلي</td>
<td>ضابط في جيش الاحتلال</td>
<td>صهيوني</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9 Hamas military targets</strong></td>
<td>هدفين عسكريين لحماس</td>
<td>موقعين تابعين لحماس</td>
<td>موقعين عسكريين</td>
<td>هدافي لحركة المقاومة الاسلامية حماس</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>10 Palestinian Terrorist</strong></td>
<td>ارهابي</td>
<td>ملثم</td>
<td>ثوار</td>
<td>مقاوم</td>
<td>فدائي</td>
<td>فلسطيني</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>11 Killed</strong></td>
<td>قتل</td>
<td>مات</td>
<td>استشهاد</td>
<td>وفاة</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>12 Palestinian Assailants</strong></td>
<td>المهاجم الفلسطيني المعندي الفلسطيني</td>
<td>القتلى الفلسطيني</td>
<td>القتلى الفلسطيني</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VI. Discussion of Results

The participants rendered the sensitive terms differently using different translation strategies. The results were interpreted as the following:

1. “Palestinian attacker”:

The participants who responded to the test were fifteen MA students. Three participants rendered it as “معتدي” while one participant only used “مقاتل”. All these renderings are neutral translations as the translator preferred to be invisible using the direct formal equivalence. Translators’ ideology didn’t seem to have any impact on their translation. Four participants translated “Palestinian attacker” using the direct formal equivalence “مهاجم” which is the neutral denotative meaning of the word “attacker” while some other translators preferred not to take the expression “Palestinian attacker” as it is. Instead, they negotiated the meaning injecting the TT with their ideologies. Three participants rendered it as “فداء” while one participant used “مطاف” and "مطاف". In these translations, the participants used a strategy of dynamic equivalence replacing the denotative meaning with a more functional one reflecting and fitting their own ideologies. Figure (1) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Graph showing the translation of "Palestinian attacker"]

2. “Shot dead”:

Four participants translated “shot dead” using the direct formal equivalence “قتل” which is the denotative meaning of the word “shot dead”. Three participants rendered it as “أردي قتيلا” while two participants used “لقي مصرعه”. All these renderings are neutral translations as the translators preferred to be invisible using the direct formal equivalence. Translators’ ideology didn’t have a great impact on their translation. Other translators however negotiated the meaning injecting the TT with their ideologies. Based on the concept that being shot dead by occupation forces is an honored death that Palestinians call...
“martyrdom”, two participants rendered it as “استشهد “، and four participants used “استشهاد “. In these translations, the participants used a strategy of dynamic equivalence replacing the denotative meaning with a more functional one that reflects and fits their own ideologies. The expression “shot dead” was replaced by the emotive term “استشهد / استشهاد” which means ending your life fighting for a noble cause. Such terms are more ideologically acceptable in the Palestinian narrative discourse. In other words, the translators distanced themselves from the original in order to produce expressions acceptable to the target audience. Figure (2) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 2: “shot dead” Participants’ translations.](image1)

3. “security forces”:

Ten participants translated “security forces” using the direct formal equivalence “قوات الأمن” which is the denotative meaning of the word “security forces”. Other translators preferred not to take the expression “security forces” as it is. Instead, they negotiated the meaning injecting the TT with their ideologies. Based on the concept that Israel is the occupying oppressor of the Palestinian people, five translators preferred to use “قوات الاحتلال”. In this translation, the participants used a strategy of dynamic equivalence replacing the denotative meaning with a more functional one that reflects and fits their own ideologies. The expression “security forces” was replaced by the emotive term “قوات الإحتلال” which means that the translator refuses to recognize the so-called Israel as a state and prefers to describe it as an illegitimate occupation entity. Such term is more ideologically acceptable in the Palestinian target culture. Figure (3) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 3: “security forces” Participants’ translations](image2)
4. “IDF”

The term “IDF” stands for Israeli Defense Forces. The euphemistic linguistic term 'IDF' is used to represent the Israelis as self-defenders, so all the actions they take are justified. Five participants rendered the term “IDF” as “جيش الدفاع الإسرائيلي” and three others rendered it as “قوات الدفاع”. Both translations do not show any impact of ideology on the translation product. The meaning was translated literally following formal equivalence.

Other participants preferred to use more emotive expressions for naming the army of the oppressor. They insisted on explaining to the target readers that “IDF” is a criminal agency which oppresses Palestinians and kills them. Five participants used the “الاحتلال الإسرائيلي” to render “IDF”, while two translators preferred to use “قوات الاحتلال الصهيوني”. Translators here used the strategy of substitution which involves replacing a term in the ST with an equivalent TL term. The word 'Zionist' or 'Zionism' arouses negative connotations in the TL. Therefore, the participants preferred to substitute the word “defense” with “occupation” or “Zionist” which are more emotive terms. Figure (4) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 4: “IDF” Participants’ translations](image)

5. “The West Bank”

Eleven participants rendered the expression “West Bank” literally while four others used the strategy of addition rendering it as “الضفة الغربية المحتلة”. Such renderings show clearly how ideology can play a pivotal role in representing the true case of the situation in Palestine where the term “occupied territories” is frequently used when referring to the Palestinian cities and villages. Figure (5) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 5: “The West Bank” Participants’ translations](image)
6. “Death”:
   The word ‘death’ in “Trial Over Death of Palestinian Teen: Prosecutor Seeks to Poke Holes in Minor's Testimony” refers to the criminal murder of the Palestinian innocent teenager, Mohammed Abu Khdeir. The teenager was burned to death by three murderous settlers. The boy suffered a lot and was tortured till his spirit left this unfair world. All the torture that Mohammed had to suffer from was summarized in the word “death”- a euphemistic expression that conceals much of the truth.

   Seven translators refused to keep the murder euphemized. Instead, they preferred to substitute the word “death” with “murder” to show to the world that the teenager didn’t die alone- he was murdered. Therefore, they used the emotive term “مقتل”, and two other used “استشهاد” which also asserts the fact that it was an honorable death. Other translators rendered the term “death” neutrally without interfering with the text. For example, two participants used the term “مصرع”, two used “وفاة” and two used “موت” which are ideologically unacceptable expressions by the target readers although they reflect the denotative meaning of the word “death”. Figure (6) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

   ![Figure 6: “Death” Participants’ translations](image)

7. “Israeli jets”:
   Not recognizing the Israeli state, four translators followed the strategy of substitution to replace the term “Israeli” with “occupation”. Therefore, they rendered the term “Israeli jets” as “طائرات الاحتلال” using dynamic equivalent. Ideology was visible in such translation since this is what best fits the target readers. Other translators rendered it literally following the formal equivalence technique using “الطائرات الحربية الإسرائيلية” which can be considered a neutral and objective translation. Figure (7) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

   ![Figure 7: “Israeli jets” Participants’ translations](image)
8. “IDF soldier”

The euphemistic representation of the Israeli soldiers as being “Israeli defense soldiers” was translated differently by the participants. Seven students translated “IDF soldier” as جندي من قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلي rendering the term denotatively while concealing their ideology. Being neutral, two participants rendered it as جندي اسرائيلي, while the rest of participants did not use the denotative meaning of the term. Instead, they insisted on making sure they interfere with the text. Hence, four participants rendered it as جندي من قوات الاحتلال, one participant rendered it as ضابط في جيش الاحتلال, and another one rendered it as جندي صهيوني. In these three translations, the participants chose to de-euphemize (dysphemism is a noun) the representation of the Israelis to uncover the true reality of the occupation. Figure (8) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 8: “IDF soldier” Participants’ translations](image)

9. “Hamas military targets”

The word “military” usually carries a negative connotation. Thus, it is deemed to be a sensitive term for translators. In some cases, it is used to mean “terrorist” and accordingly translated into موقع للإرهاب. The participants preferred to render the denotative meaning of the expression to be translated as هدفين عسكريين لحماس by five participants, and as موقعين عسكريين لحماس by five others. On the other hand, five other participants used the deletion strategy to render it as موقعين تابعين لحماس by two participants, and as أهداف لحركة المقاومة الاسلامية حماس by three others. The use of حركة المقاومة الاسلامية حماس shows a visible ideology of these three translators. They not only deleted the term “military” from their translation, but also used addition to indicate that it is not just a military or violent movement and that it is a resistance movement, instead. Figure (9) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 9: “Hamas military targets” Participants’ translations](image)
10. “Palestinian terrorist”

The use of the word “terrorist” is a dysphemistic representation of the Palestinians showing them aggressive, violent terrorists who commit crimes against the Israeli ‘civilians’. Participants rendered this term differently. Six translators rendered it as "إرهابي" focusing on the denotative meaning of the word. Three other translators chose to conceal their ideology, but they also refused to agree on the representation of Palestinians as being “terrorists”. Hence, they chose to use the deletion strategy rendering it as “شاب فلسطيني”. By doing so, the participants guarantee being neutral. The rests of the translators chose to interfere with the text making their ideology visible to their audience. Accordingly, the item was rendered as “مناضل” by one participant, “ثوار” by another, “مقاوم” by two participants, and as “فداء فلسطيني” by two other participants. The participants negotiate the meaning of “terrorist” to make it opt for the Palestinian audience through all these positive expressions. Figure (10) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 10: “Palestinian terrorist” Participants’ translations](image)

11. “killed”

Israeli media usually use the passive form to conceal the doer of atrocities. It is also the same way of concealing the killer of Palestinians. The literal denotative meaning of the word “killed” is “قتل”. So, translators have the word “قتل” as their first option. By rendering it like this, the translator keeps the action itself as ugly and horrible as it is. Hence, six participants rendered it as “قتل”. Other four translators were very neutral and tried to keep the reality of the action concealed, covering also the doer by the use of “مات” and “وفاة”. On the other hand, five participants chose to interfere with the text to make it opt for the Palestinian target reader using “استشهد”. By doing so, the same meaning of the word ‘killed’ is retained in addition to representing what happened as being a noble death for the sake of the country. Figure (11) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 11: “killed” Participants’ translations](image)
12. “assailant”

The word “assailant” is a dysphemistic representation of the Palestinians used by Israeli media. Six participants rendered it as “المعتدي الفلسطيني” conveying the denotative meaning of the word “assailant”. Three translators rendered it into a more positive expression: “المهاجم الفلسطيني” while two rendered it as “الفدائي الفلسطيني” making their ideology visible for their audience. Four translators preferred to use deletion as a strategy for dealing with such a sensitive term. Hence, they deleted the word “assailant” and translated only the word “Palestinian”, rendering it as “الفلسطيني”. Figure (12) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 12: “assailant” Participants’ translations](image)

13. “shot and killed”

The killing of Palestinians can be rendered either positively or negatively. Thus, participants’ translations varied. Five participants rendered it as “قتل” and two more participants rendered it as “إطلاق النار وقتل” uncovering the reality that they were killed not just died. Other two participants rendered it neutrally as “وفاة” covering the reality of the action of killing. It was also rendered negatively by using “لقي مصرعه”. Only four participants chose to interfere to represent the death of the Palestinian as a noble death using the word “استشهد”, instead. Figure (13) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 13: “shot and killed” participants’ translations](image)

14. “terror tunnels”

Referring to the tunnels that Palestinians build and use for multi-functions, the Israeli media uses the term “terror” claiming that they are used for terrorist activities such as smuggling weapons and money for the Palestinian fighters. The participants rendered it differently. Some participants chose to render them objectively without interfering with the text. Accordingly, two participants rendered it as “الأنفاق الإرهابية” while two others rendered it as “الأنفاق الإرهابية” and three more translated it as “الأنفاق المقاومة” using formal equivalence. Three participants however used dynamic equivalence rendering it as “الأنفاق المقاومة” bringing in a highly ideologically loaded
expression. Most of the participants chose not to render the word ‘terror’. They retained the positive meaning of the word ‘tunnels’ deleting the negative claim that the Israeli media suggest. Thus, seven participants rendered it as “الأنفاق” using the deletion strategy. Figure (14) shows the translation alternatives for this item statistically:

![Figure 14: “Terror tunnels” participants’ translations](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Participants’ Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Translation is a mirror that reflects the political, economic, and religious background of the translator.</td>
<td>11 Agree, - Disagree, - Not Sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Translation is never innocent in terms of its effect on the source text.</td>
<td>7 Agree, 3 Disagree, 1 Not Sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Translators interfere with the texts to insert their ideologies.</td>
<td>11 Agree, - Disagree, - Not Sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Political Translation is the most difficult field to work in.</td>
<td>4 Agree, 4 Disagree, 3 Not Sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dealing with highly sensitive political texts is very difficult for me.</td>
<td>5 Agree, 3 Disagree, 3 Not Sure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>If I were translating a sentence that includes highly sensitive expressions, I would interfere with the text to show my own ideology.</td>
<td>8 Agree, 2 Disagree, 1 Not Sure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V.II. Questionnaire

In this section, the researchers present the questionnaire results and then analyze them interpretatively.

V.II.1 Questionnaire Results

Participants to the questionnaire responded differently to the statements which tackle key issues in translation, ideology, and visibility of the translator, etc.

Table 2. Questionnaire Results
As a Palestinian translator, I believe in using translation as a means of resistance. I will follow the agenda of the agency I am working for even if it contradicts with my ideology. Using literal translation is the safest strategy when translating highly sensitive texts. To translate “IDF” into Arabic, I use "قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلية“ not "جيش الاحتلال الصهيوني". To translate “suicide bombing, I use "عملية استشهادية” not "عملية انتحارية”

V.II.II Analysis of Questionnaire Results

1. “Translation is a mirror that reflects the political, economic, and religious background of the translator.”
   The results of the questionnaire show that all the participants agree that translation is a mirror that reflects the political, economic, and religious background of the translator. It is one of the very general yet basic notions translation is based on. Thus, the consensus of the participants that it does reflect the translators’ background and consequently their ideologies and beliefs indicates that, while translating, they do feel their translations reflect who they are. This basic issue also relates to the relationship between language and identity. Our translation is who we are, in other words.

2. “Translation is never innocent in terms of its effect on the source text”
   Participants’ responses to this statement differed. Seven participants agreed that translation is never innocent since, while rendering the source texts, translators intervene with it whether at the lexical level or at the ideological level. Other three participants disagreed with the statement. This might go back to lack of experience in the translation field or to the generality in the statement itself because some translators think that some types of texts need to be translated literally with no need for translators’ interference with the text. Finally, one translator only was not sure about his stance from the statement. This response might be attributed to lack of translation experience.

3. “Translators interfere with the texts to insert their ideologies”
   All the participants agreed that translators interfere with the texts to insert their ideologies. The participants’ responses to this statement approve the reliability of the participants’ responses to the first statement since the two statements are two sides for the same coin. In other words, it is agreed that translators inject the texts with their ideologies; consequently, the target texts reflect their ideologies, beliefs, as well as their social, cultural, and economic backgrounds.
4. “Political Translation is the most difficult field to work in”

Based on the differences in the participants’ experience in translation field, their responses to the degree of difficulty in political translation varied considerably. Four participants agreed that political translation is the most difficult field to work in, four others disagreed, while three more stated that they are not sure. This difference might be attributed to the fact that political texts are loaded with sensitive items making them difficult to translate. Participants with translation experience think it is not a difficult field since they are equipped with the required strategies used in rendering such sensitive items. Being unable to decide is something that might go back to lack of experience in translating such texts.

5. “Dealing with highly sensitive political texts is very difficult for me”

Getting closer to the specific topic of the study, the fifth statement investigates the participants’ experience in dealing with highly sensitive texts. As the participants’ responses to the degree of difficulty of political translation for them differed, so did their responses to the difficulty of sensitive terms which is one of the key features of political translation. Again, the participants’ responses to this statement prove the reliability of the questionnaire results in general and the responses to the fourth statement in particular. Five participants agreed that it is difficult to render sensitive terms, three participants disagreed, while three others stated that they are not sure or don’t have the sufficient experience to decide.

6. “If I were translating a sentence that includes highly sensitive expressions, I would interfere with the text to show my own ideology”

Coming to investigating the practical translation strategies that the participants may follow while rendering sensitive political texts, the sixth statement checks whether participants will interfere with the text to reflect their ideologies or not. Eight participants agreed that they will interfere. This might refer back to the fact that Palestinian translators find it necessary to reflect their ideologies in the texts they translate especially news items. Since most sensitive international news articles are related to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, it is very difficult yet necessary to use different managing strategies to render the text ideologically. Two other translators disagreed with this statement and this might go back to their preference for neutrality and faithfulness to the ST i.e. invisibility of the translator over the visibility of the translator.

7. “As a Palestinian translator, I believe in using translation as a means of resistance”

As Palestinian would-be translators, the participants all agreed that they believe in using translation to defend their cause. In fact, there are many stances where the Palestinian translators find themselves at a critical juncture having to deal with ideologically loaded source texts. In this case, the participants of the study preferred to interfere with the text to resist the ideologies embedded in the STs which might be contradicting with their ideologies or negatively representing the Palestinians or even euphemizing the existence of ‘Israel’.

8. “I will follow the agenda of the agency I am working for even if it contradicts with my ideology”

News agencies often manipulate the news through many discursive strategies. Such news is usually ideologically-loaded. Each agency commissions a certain method to be followed by those
translators who work on this news. Consequently, the translators need to follow what they commissioned with the agency to do even if it contradicts their own ideologies i.e. the skopos theory to translation. Two participants only agreed with doing this while seven others disagreed on writing something that contradicts with their ideologies. Two other participants were not sure about what should be done. The variety in their responses can be blamed on lack of experience in political translation. The respondents may have worked as freelance translators, but not with agencies such as BBC, CNN, Reuters, etc. which impose certain restrictions upon the discursive elements to be used.

9. “Using literal translation is the safest strategy when translating highly sensitive texts”

The issue of using sense for sense translation or literal translation has been an intricate issue that attracted translation scholars over years. In certain types of texts, literal translation might be helpful, especially if the text’s message is direct and clear. However, in political translation, where texts are usually highly sensitive and ideologically loaded, it would be helpless to use literal translation. This is what most of the participants agreed upon. Seven participants disagreed that literal translation is the safest strategy to follow when rendering highly sensitive texts. Three participants only preferred to play it safe and use literal translation. This might go back to lack of knowledge about the translation strategies that could be followed to overcome such intricate problems. Finally, only one participant couldn’t decide about the statement.

10. “To translate “IDF” into Arabic, I use ‘قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلية’ not ‘جيش الاحتلال الصهيوني’”

“IDF” is a term that stands for Israeli Defense Forces which is commonly used in international news covering the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. It is considered one of the highly sensitive terms when it comes to translation. Translating it literally with no ideological interference from the part of the translator, the translator has to use ‘قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلية’. On the other hand, a Palestinian translator, for example, might think that such a choice would contradict with the target readers (Palestinians’) ideology. Accordingly, nine participants chose to disagree with the statement. In other words, the majority of the participants refuse to use ‘قوات الدفاع’ to render ‘IDF’. This, in fact, implies that they do not approve contradicting with their ideologies and preferring to intervene with the text to be a means of counter interpellation-the discourse of the superior or the powerful to the powerless. One participant only chose to be more neutral or faithful to the ST and agreed to use such a translation. Finally, one participant only couldn’t decide which translation to follow probably due to lack of experience.

11. To translate “suicide bombing, I use ‘عملية استشهادية’ not ‘عملية انتحارية’”

The last statement also investigated the choice that the participants would make if they were asked to translate some highly sensitive expressions. ‘Suicide bombing’ is one of those sensitive expressions. The Israeli or pro-Israeli news agencies use such an expression to represent Palestinians as victimizers and violent aggressors. The translator has two options: either to stick to this misleading version of the news or insert his own ideology. Again, ten participants chose to be visible in their translations and chose to use ‘عملية استشهادية’ instead of ‘عملية انتحارية’ to render ‘suicide bombing’ representing the Palestinian’s death for their country as a noble death. Only one participant preferred to be more neutral and faithful to the target text and disagreed with the statement.
VII. Discussion of Findings

The test results showed that the participants, who are just MA students in translation at the English department at IUG, adopted various translation strategies considered to be highly emotive and ideological. This might have happened because the participants were not inclined to follow a certain strategy or agenda while translating. The strategies used by the participants included deletion, addition, and sometimes formal equivalence (roughly word for word translation). In addition, it was obvious that the participants used literal translation but they injected the target text with some words reflecting their culture and ideology. Furthermore, the study showed that some participants preferred to be neutral in translating controversial news items. Others’ translations were closely related to their emotional, cultural, and political backgrounds. This leads the researchers to indicate that the Palestinian translator tends to be visible in his/her translations due to the sensitive nature of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict which demands using some controversial expressions that might not appeal to the parties.

The questionnaire results indicated that the respondents also showed highly emotive and ideological responses that reflected their preference for adaptation and dynamic equivalence over literal translation. In general, most of them agreed that political translation is one of the most difficult fields to work at. They also agreed that translating highly sensitive expressions is one of the most intricate problems that might face the translator. Particularly speaking, the respondents to the questionnaire, being Palestinian would-be translators, stated that they would not take what is written in the ST for granted and would negotiate the meaning to produce a version that might be appropriate and accepted by the Palestinian target readers in case they are translating into Arabic, and a version that might help defend their cause in case of translating into English. They believe that ideology plays in rendering political texts. To conclude, it is commonly agreed among the respondents that translation can be used as a weapon against the occupation’s discourse-interpellation.

VIII. Conclusion

This study addressed a topic in translation that is of great importance for translators and translation scholars in general and Palestinian translators and interpreters in particular. Nowadays media is playing a major role in controlling individuals' ideologies and points of view; translators who hold the job of translating news items find it a meticulous task specially when news contains items and terms that may be contradictory with local culture and political attitudes, beliefs, and perspectives of both the readership and translators. For this reason, translators choose to manage the news articles that are considered to be controversially sensitive through using a wide range of techniques such as deletion, addition, and dynamic equivalence which are embedded in their translation. Therefore, the making of the ideology of the ST becomes invisible whereas the ideology of translators and target readers becomes visible. Issues of objectivity and subjectivity are controlled by political and ideological agendas of translators who are involved in translating such sensitive texts.

IX. Recommendations

Based on the study results, the researchers suggest the following recommendations which might be helpful for other researchers.
Translators should avoid using literal translation especially when dealing with such sensitive items. Translators should also be aware of the translation strategies that might help them make their translations go along with the ideology and culture of the readership.

University syllabus designers (translation courses designers in particular) should be aware of the significance of such an issue and hold the responsibility of injecting the curriculum of the translation courses with important issues like the visibility of the translator, with particular reference to the Arab –Israeli conflict.

Students should enrich their knowledge about the terms and phrases used in media through extensive readings and analysis so that they avoid any mistranslations that could be offensive to target readers’ cultures as well as to students’ own attitudes and perspectives.

Institutions involved in translator training should focus on the relation between ideology and translation during the courses they offer in order to make this topic more understandable among translation students.

About the Authors:
Dr. Mohammed El Haj Ahmed is an assistant professor of English language and translation at the Islamic University of Gaza. He obtained his BA in English language and literature at the Islamic University of Gaza, Palestine in 1988, his MA in Applied Linguistics at the University of Khartoum in 1995, and his Ph.D. in Translation Studies at the University of Salford, UK, in 2009. Since 1997 Dr. El Haj Ahmed has been a staff member at the English Department Teaching Linguistics and Translation at the BA and MA levels. He has published several papers on Translation and Interpreting. He has also supervised many graduation projects at the MA and Professional Diploma in Translation. Currently he is working as head of the English Department.

Ms. Ghadeer Shabana is an MA student of Translation at the Islamic University of Gaza. She obtained a BA in English language and literature at the Islamic University of Gaza, Palestine in 2011. She is currently working on her MA thesis and is expected to finish her study in the coming few months. Since 2012 Ms. Shabana has been working as an English language Teacher at Gaza UNRWA schools.

References


Appendix (A): Test consent form

Dear participants,

We, the researchers, are doing a research on The Visibility of the Translator: A case Study of the Palestinian Translator. You are kindly requested to take part in attempting the attached test. We would like to thank you in advance for your participation in the test. The test includes 10 sentences that encompass various terms and phrases which are deemed controversial. The sentences were selected from major news agencies and newspapers. Participation in this study is voluntary. You have the right not to participate at all or to leave the study at any time. If you decide to participate, you will be asked to translate some texts. We think this will take you 20 minutes. All the results of this test will be used for research purposes only and may not be used for any other purposes.

Best Regards,
Dr Mohammed ElHajahmed
Ghadeer Shabana

Appendix (B): The Test

1. The Israel Defence Forces (IDF) and Palestinian Islamist group Hamas have opened a new front in the propaganda war, via Twitter.
2. Israel says it will not give in to international pressure to halt plans for 3,000 new settler homes
3. Odai Darawish, 21, was shot dead by Israeli troops while trying to cross the barrier separating Israel from the West Bank, his family said.
4. Fifteen Palestinians have been killed in Israeli operations.
5. According to Israel's ministry of foreign affairs, the last bomb attack in Tel Aviv was in April 2006, when a suicide bombing on a restaurant killed 11.
6. Israeli security forces have shot dead a Palestinian man in the West Bank.
7. Israel's three-week-long invasion of the Gaza Strip, launched in 2008 with the declared aim of curbing rocket launches, drew international criticism over a heavy Palestinian casualty toll.
8. "Today we relayed a clear message to the Hamas organization and other terrorist organizations," Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu said.
9. Multiple terror attacks in Jerusalem and Central Israel leave 3 dead
10. Two assailants killed in three different Jerusalem stabbing attacks

Appendix (C): Questionnaire consent form

Dear participants,

We, the researchers, are doing a research on The Visibility of the Translator: A case Study of the Palestinian Translator. You are kindly requested to take part in attempting the attached questionnaire. We would like to thank you in advance for your participation in the questionnaire. The questionnaire includes 13 statements that encompass various issues on topic. The sentences reflect the participants’ perspective on the issues discussed. Participation in this study is voluntary. You have the right not to participate at all or to leave the study at any time. If you decide to participate, you will be asked to respond to some statements. We think this will take you 20 minutes. All the results of this questionnaire will be used for research purposes only and may not be used for any other purposes.
Best Regards,
Dr Mohammed ElHajahmed
Ghadeer Shabana

Appendix (D): The Questionnaire
1. Demographic Information:

   A) Personal Information:

   Name: __________________________________________________ (will be kept confidential)

   Gender: male - female

   Age: ___________________________

   Occupation: _______________________________

   B) Experience in translation field:

   Duration: ___________ year(s)

   Agency: _________________________________

   Any comment: _____________________________________________________________________________________________

2. Please state whether you agree, disagree, or are not sure about the following statements:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Participants’ Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Translation is a mirror that reflects the political, economic, and religious background of the translator.</td>
<td>Agree: 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Translation is never innocent in terms of its effect on the source text.</td>
<td>Agree: 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Translators interfere with the texts to insert their ideologies.</td>
<td>Agree: 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Political Translation is the most difficult field to work in.</td>
<td>Agree: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dealing with highly sensitive political texts is very difficult for me.</td>
<td>Agree: 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>If I were translating a sentence that includes highly sensitive expressions, I would interfere with the text to show my own ideology.</td>
<td>Agree: 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>As a Palestinian translator, I believe in using translation as a means of resistance.</td>
<td>Agree: 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>I will follow the agenda of the agency I am working for even if it contradicts with my ideology.</td>
<td>Agree: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Using literal translation is the safest strategy when translating highly sensitive texts.</td>
<td>Agree: 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>To translate “IDF” into Arabic, I use “قوات الدفاع الإسرائيلية” and not “جيش الاحتلال الصهيوني”.</td>
<td>Agree: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>To translate “suicide bombing, I use “عملية استشهادية” and not “عملية انتحارية” in Arabic.</td>
<td>Agree: 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Poetry as a means of revolt against the tribe: The experience of poet Suhaym as a model

Abdul Khaliq Esa
Dean of the Faculty of Humanities
An-Najah National University, Nablus, Palestine

Oqab Jabali
Director of Language Center
An-Najah National University, Nablus, Palestine

Kamel Yaseen
Ministry of Education and Higher Education
Ramallah, Palestine

Abstract
This study traces and identifies the psychological crisis of the veteran, old hand poet, Suhaym, the slave of Bani Al-Hashaas as exposed through his poems. This personality disorder results basically from the poet's inability to socialize and merge into his local society which denies him both his masculinity and recognition as a poet. The study also deals with the repercussions of the poet's psychosis which reduces him to sadism, narcissism, and perversion. As a result, the poet is resolved to get revenge on the tribe through tarnishing the chastity of its women and depicting sexual savagery towards them in his poems. The study results find that these poems are nothing but mere delusions and Suhaym has to pay the price eventually by being burned to death.

Key words: flirting-poetry, perversion, psychosis, revolt, Suhaym, tribe.

Introduction
Freedom is the most crucial element and the greatest thing in one's life because without it s/he can never feel satisfied nor can have supreme value before himself/herself and the world around him/her once it is lost. Consequently, the true proponents of humanity and human dignity, including the first Muslim Khalif, Spartacus, and Abraham Lincoln, have fought slavery in all its manifestations and forms since the early stages of human existence.

Slavery dates back to the old ages; it is deep-rooted in history and inherent in almost all nations whether in the age of their progress or even the age of decline. It is remarkable that this phenomenon is not the result of moral or social savagery in any nation; it is a tangible and clear-cut proof of nation prosperity and development over ages which, later on, contributed to the creation of the system of strata in the civil state and placed the human values at the lowest level of the social hierarchy. Moreover, slavery has contributed much to modern civilizations since the very beginnings of history.

It has always been present in the teachings and practices of heavenly religions. Judaism, for instance, states that only non-Jews can be drawn to slavery; a Hebrew could not become a slave unless by order of the court or by giving himself voluntarily into bondage. Other slaves were always brought from outside the Jewish nation (Al-Termanini, 1979).

Christianity is different in the way it looks at people and the issue of slavery that is not compatible with Christian ideas of justice and charity. Some people argue against all forms of servitude and slavery; for them, all human beings are equal. While others, i.e. Augustine and Thomas Aquinas, argue for slavery which is subject to certain limitations and restrictions. They believe that God has destined some people to be slaves and be ruled. Lewis (1992) argues that:

Both the Old and New Testaments recognize and accept the institution of slavery…The Jews are frequently reminded, in both Bible and Talmud, that they too were slaves in Egypt and should therefore treat their slaves decently….there is neither Jew nor Greek, there is neither bond nor free, there is neither male nor female; for ye are all one in Christ Jesus (p. 17).

Islam acknowledges slavery and accepts it implicitly, yet it does not express any kind of prejudice; it also expresses no discrimination based on ethnicity, color, wealth or any other factor to the extent that the Holy Quran "does not even reveal any awareness of such prejudice" (Lewis, 1992, p.22). However, Islam could not abolish the slavery system which was rampant during the Pre-Islam era. Lewis (1992) states that:

The abolition of slavery itself would hardly have been possible. From a Muslim point of view, to forbid what God permits, is almost as great an offense as to permit what God forbids- and slavery was authorized and regulated by the holy law. More specifically, it formed part of the central core of social usage (p. 78).

Islam has started to gradually offer moral and ethical remedies in order to limit the phenomenon and, regulate the practice of it. Al-Termanini (1979) argues that among the remedies provided by Islam is the possibility of liberating necks (slaves) by offering an expiatory sacrifice.
to repent sins and show sorrow for bad behaviors. Furthermore, Muslim "showed compassion for the wretched of the earth, and protested against injustice." (Clarence-Smith, 2006).

Alwan (2004) maintains that the reason why Islam has not been able to abolish slavery is pure political. Islam has emerged while the phenomenon is completely recognized by all religions and civilizations. On the other hand, there have been social practices and tendencies which made it impossible for Islam to uproot slavery from the society. From a pure Islamic perspective, slavery helps cleans the society from adultery and pornography which were linked to servants, slaves, and bond men.

The elite, in all societies, used to own slaves who were constantly subjected to castration and emasculation fearing for their women. Such practices have had negative consequences on the lives of these slaves, the way they think, and their reactions to the society as a whole including the formation of specific psychological structures, for these slaves, which, by their turn, are manifested in their behaviors as well as their speeches. Melamed (2010, p. 123) argues that the Holy Quran and Arabic literature "were to a large extent indifferent to racial differences and judgmental distinctions on the basis of skin color."

This research aims to study a veteran poet, Suhaym, who was a slave himself and analyze the way he employs the language to react to the society that has rejected him and denied his masculinity. The researchers have collected a corpus of verses that cover the most significant phases of the poet's life focusing on those related to rejection and sexual attitudes towards the elite's or the masters' women. For him, poetry exposes a corrupt society which denies the essence of life for slaves. The study aims also to prove how rebellious poets (e.g. Suhaym) perform significant tasks in disclosing many secrets related to their life.

**Theoretical background**

It is taken for granted that language is a means of communication; people normally communicate feeling, attitudes, like and dislike and many other senses. Poetry has always been a means of expressing deepest emotions, passions and feelings; it tends to articulate the innermost experience of humans. Maguire (2012) postulates that poetry is "about capturing impressions and expressing feelings. The goal of poetry is not to describe the world." Poetry is not meant to tell facts and describe things; it is employed to "use language in a creative and imaginative way to express thoughts, feelings, and impressions." (para.1).

The main task of a poet is to rebuild, via words, an image of the universe as a place for mutual relationships between its constituents and components. These relationships might be real or imaginary. As Abu Athera (1995) puts it, poetry is a mirror which exactly portrays and reflects what is happening in a given place; it also portrays clearly the real status of a given tribe, society or, to a larger extent, a nation. The main focus of poets like these is the social life in the society or the tribe. In most cases, they tend to criticize habits and customs mainly those which discriminate between the various spectrums of the society; it also touches upon very sensitive relations that hold between the various groups of the society including bondage, slavery, marriage, dress and, above all, the relationships between men and women.
Lewis (1992) maintains that Arabic poetry includes instances of distinction between Arabs and the other based on normal feelings which exist in people such as identity, but there are no clear instances that discriminate between people based on racial sentiments. "We do not, however, find any clear indication that this (awareness of difference) was felt in racial terms or went beyond the normal felling of distinctness which all human groups have about themselves in relation to others" (Lewis, 1992, p 22).

Arabic poetry has always been used to document other instances of distinction among the Arabian society itself. There is evidence for the growth of hatred against and prejudice to certain sectors of the society including, the rich, women, and, most importantly, slaves. The majority of slaves are black of mixed Arab and African origins; for most of non-Arab slaves their skin color is an affliction and used to cause them a lot of troubles and "suffering from insults and discrimination, as showing resentment at this, and yet in some way as accepting the inferior status resulting from their African ancestry" (Lewis, 1992, p 28).

Arabic poetry tackles many themes and black poets, including Antara Bin Shadad, Suhaym, and many others, have constantly stressed blackness and slavery in their poems in an attempt to define their identity as a significant sector of the society. Such poets were excluded and away from the spotlight as they used to live for people rather than with people (Badawi, 1973). This has resulted in feeling a sense disconnection or, put simply, outcast. They tend to feel as if they are split into two worlds: their own black community, on the one hand, and country natives or citizen, on the other. Consequently, some of them tend to imitate and, sometimes, plagiarize notable pure Arab poets such as Omar Bin Abi Rabea’a, Abu Tammam, Al-Mutanabbi, Al-Buhtori, etc. (Badawi, 1973). The poet under scrutiny followed Omar Bin Abi Rabea’a.

Suhaym (سُحَيْم), the slave of Banu al-Hashas (بنو الحسحاس)

Suhaym, who died in 660, was born and lived a slave. His full name is Suhaym bin Hind bin Sufyan bin Khuzaymah. His name is a diminutive noun of (asham: أسَمَح) which means "black" and his real name is (Habba: حَبًة). He was black; he used to be alone, without friends or company (Al-Safadi, 2000). He was nicknamed as Abu Abdullah. Literary critics and historians depicted him as "the slave of Banu al-Hashas" because he was owned by this family. His owner, Abdullah Bin Abi Rabea’a, once decided to give him, as a present, to the third Muslim caliph, Othamn Bin Affan. Yet, the caliph rejected him knowing that he was a slave poet. Othamn refused to have the slave "remarking that he did not need a slave who treated his owners as did Suhaym: "When he is sated he directs love-verses at their women, and when he is hungry he directs satires at them”" (Lewis, 1985, p. 94). After his rejection by the caliph, Suhaym is captured by a small clan called Bau al-Hashas which is part of a larger tribe called Asad.

In fact, Suhaym has been described differently; sometimes he is an Ethiopian who is brought from Africa; other times he is depicted as a Nubian and was stained with a mark on his face to distinguish him. Suhaym starts to serve his owners living miserably among them. He gradually begins to say verses most of which is plagiarized. Once he is discovered, the whole clan start to humiliate him and look at him with contempt and resentment. Al-Asfahani (1968)
and Nicholson (1941) state that Suhaym's sufferings begin when he is sent by the clan to find out something. He returns saying:

أنْعَتُ غيْثاً حَسَناً نَباتُـــهُ                        كالحبشيّ حولَهُ بناتُـــهُ

I see nice rain and nice grass
As if it is a Habashi surrounded by his daughters

The clan men all agree that Suhaym is a good poet; consequently, he embarks on saying verse about different topics. Later, the whole clan start to undermine his potentials as a man and underestimate his merits as a poet. As a result, he begins to feel inferior because Arabs are famous for admiring many elements in their culture including poets, male born babies, and mares/horses which are considered as points of strength for any tribe. When he feels rejected, he says:

أشْعَـارُ عَبْدِ بَني الحسْحاسِ قُمْنَ لَهُ
عِندَ الفَخار مقام الأصل والورق
إنْ كنتُ عَبْداً فنفْسي حُرّاً كَرَمـاً
أو أسودَ اللونِ إنّي أبيضُ الخُلُق

My verses serve me on the day of boasting
in place of birth and silver coin;
though I am a slave, my soul is nobly free;
though I am black of color, my nature is white

This kind of inferiority has pushed Suhaym to react and compensate for suffering such a negative feeling following two different approaches. Sometimes he tries to alleviate himself to the high standards of the tribe; in other situations, Suhaym is recorded flirting the women of the tribe using obscene and vulgar words. The women of the tribe also reject him for many reasons including his complexion, color, servitude, and above all, his gut to flirt them. The final result is really devastating for the poet; he ends burned to death in public by his owners. As Al-Asfahani (1968) puts it, his owners have dug a trench, filled it with burning wood, and eventually cast him into the ablaze.

Suhaym has never gained good reputation during his life; however, he has collected fame after death. The slight details of his life reveal how much suffering, agony, torture, and mental as well as psychological anxiety he has passed through and expressed in his poems. These poems reveal the repercussions of the poet's psychosis which reduced him to sadism, narcissism, and sexual perversion, let alone, sexual abuse.

The most striking feature in Suhaym's story is his reaction towards his burning by his owners. It is said that when a person is at the prim of death, s/he shows some remarks of anxiety, fear, or repentance and tries to deny all the charges directed to him/her. However, Suhaym shows no sign of this; on the contrary, he asks them to tie him securely so that he does not escape. This is a sign of acceptance because he has already retaliated for himself through tarnishing the chastity of the tribe's women and depicting sexual savagery towards these women in his poems. He says:

لا شُدّوا وَثاقَ العَبْدِ
يُفلِتْكُمُ إنَّ الحياةَ مِنَ المماتِ قَريـبُ
فَقَلَّدْ تَحَـرِّرٌ من جَبينِ فتاتِكُم

Handcuff the slave securely so that he does not escape;
Indeed, life is so close to death.
Your maid's forehead has poured
too much sweat and perfume in my bed.

These lines tell about Suhaym's courage in defying the tribe and ridiculing them. He announces his rebellion in these words saying that I am no longer afraid of you; I have already tarnished your women's chastity and spoiled your reputation. I do not fear death and my life is eventually coming to its end.

This kind of sexual defying or, put simply, sexual delirium or hallucination has changed into an act of revenge and a matter of compensation. It has also changed Suhaym, the feeble, humble black slave, into an enemy who looks at himself as a strong opponent or rival to the whole tribe in an attempt to regain what he has lost, i.e. humanity, dignity, and natural instincts which he has been deprived of again and again. In sum, his vengeance, i.e. pornographic, poetic deliriums, is equal to the punishment he has previously received, i.e. castration, from his owners.

**Suhaym's signs of shortage**

The biological and existential tasks of a human being on this earth are determined, to a large extent, by the community with which he lives; he is civil by nature, and any confusion over his relationship with the society will create a great dilemma for him to reach a real and clear meaning of life. The German psychologist Alfred Adler has emphasized that the meaning of life is determined by three compelling conditions: finding a job that enables him to live under restrictions/constraints, cooperating with the rest of the group, and understanding the relationship between men and women. Adler (1931) states:

> The first question pertains to the social side of life: the relationship between you and me. The second question is the relationship of the individual to work: how can I be useful: how can I contribute to the well-being of all? The third question is the question of love. To be interested in a person of the other sex who is physically attractive, to have more interest in that person than in oneself, to strive to make life easier and more pleasant for the other is inseparably connected with progeny (para. 21).

It is worth noting that any failure to represent these conditions will necessarily lead to misunderstanding the meaning of life and will negatively affect the peaceful coexistence with members of society. Suhaym belongs to a class that prevents him from defining his function as an active member of a specific human group; he is also depicted as a slave and that his slavery does not allow him to integrate with the tribe. This, in turn, will create a psychological disorder that pertains to the meaning of life and may have dire consequences and serious repercussions.

**Finding a job that helps to live under restrictions**

The tasks of slaves are closely related to the tribe that enslaves them; their personalities dissolve and correspond to or identify with the personalities of their masters. As a result, the slave becomes a machine that is not allowed to think, and perhaps the person starts to be characterized with his role to the extent that he accepts his role and does not dare to think or do anything beyond serving. The question of functionality, career, or feasibility hurts Suhaym who is a poet and a slave at the same time; he gets recognized by the tribe as a slave only but not a
Poetry as a means of revolt against the tribe

Esa, Jabali, & Yaseen

I miss the women though I left for a night
How would the case be after a month?
I have never feared my master to sell me
For anything even when he has nothing in hand.
I am your brother, money defender, and ally
Who has dwelt among you for long.

In these verses, the tone of sadness, entreaty and supplication rises inside Suhaym; he pleads his masters and the tribe to keep him among them by stressing the fact that he is their brother, money defender, ally, etc.

**Cooperation with tribe members**

The relative verification of the first condition, i.e. finding a suitable job, has never been adequate to qualify Suhaym to achieve the second condition, i.e. cooperating with the tribe and integrating with them due to his social status and social role as a slave. He mingles with the society members just as a slave, nothing more. He is mere a slave like all other slaves except for being a poet which has never been recognized by the tribe, though.

Here, the Suhaym starts to feel the huge gap between him and the free poets who are extremely ahead of him. As a reaction, Suhaym used to arbitrarily inculcate himself into the tribe and lead a role of a free poet who is entitled to commemorate the exploits as well as the advantages of the tribe and describe or portray the courage and guts of its knights in wars. He says:

**Sons of Asad go together and fight**

Ma'd when their skins mix with evil.
I see Asad (the tribe), thanks to God,
Getting better and stronger, and God gives it more.
We brought the horses from the side of the gardener
Until they joined by Al-Rasha'a its soldiers.

In another poem, Suhaym tries to mingle with the tribe during fighting and wars. He stresses a false tone of ego while he is getting involved with the tribe and showing solidarity for the defense of it. He is also entrusted to commemorate its exploits and political relations with other tribes. This false sense of ego manifests a form of compensation for the group sense which is ignored by everyone in the tribe:
And horses step forward carrying armed soldiers
Walking likes ibexes towards caves.
They become thin due to swift running;
They arise dust haze in front of me.
I walked boiling past them while they were
Chewing the rein out of thirst.

In the midst of this turmoil, Suhaym makes use of his strength as a warrior and appreciates or glorifies his poetic potentials by saying:
My verses serve me on the day of boasting
In place of birth and sliver coin;
Though I am a slave, my soul is nobly free;
Though I am black of color, my nature is white.

Suhaym goes further in boasting and glorifying his manners and his blackness. He tends to introduce the black slave who hides lonely in the darkness of slavery and blackness in a different way. He constantly draws attention to his high morals to which none of his tribe members pays attention:

Blackness does not degrade a whole man
Nor a young man of discernment and breeding
If blackness has fallen to me as my lot
So has the whiteness of my character.

The attempt to assimilate, integrate, and adapt to the tribe members has failed, and Suhaym remains, in the eyes of the tribe members, the black slave who copies poetry, not the black, fighter, slave knight. At this point, Suhaym loses control of himself and he becomes unable to restrain his psychic shocks that start to appear and lead him and his tribe, as well, to abyss.

Understanding the relationship between men and women
The third significant condition necessary to understand the meaning of life, according to Adler taxonomy, is the necessity to understand the type of relationships that hold between men and women. This is the last straw that broke the back of the camel. It has contributed, in one way or another, to the elimination of Suhaim who could not understand the relationship between men and women, or rather was unable to establish a normal relationship with women because of his social status within the tribe. Here paradoxes and confusion which is, in fact, similar to delirium, emerge inside Suhaym. The reason is to fully verify the oppression of blackness and slavery that are the towering wall, and the great obstacles that prevent him from reaching the woman who occupies his mentality and is manifested so much in his poetry. These two same elements, i.e.
servitude and blackness, have previously prevented him from establishing a foothold among the people of the tribe; consequently, he, now, loses both worlds: the world of man and the world of women; he says:

Yet it does not diminish me that my mother was a slave woman
Who tended the udders of female camels.

In such a situation, malice and hatred accumulate inside the poet and the gap between him and the tribe gets larger and larger to pave the way towards revenge; therefore, Suhaym says:

They gathered around me in threes, fours
And ones until they make a whole eight.
They approached me from the far side of the country promising
Breasts that were never seen except by me.
They promised a patient agitated by them
Indeed, some of them caused my sickness.

Here Suhaym's narcissism unfolds when he depicts the women of the tribe thronging only around him and seeking his company but not anybody else's. His sexual perversion is also manifested in the emergence of his unbridled desire to bring together eight women at the same time.

Based on the three basic preconditions of understanding the meaning of life, Suhaym is said to fail in his endeavors in comprehending the exact meaning of life. He has experienced a rebellious rift and lived a kind of estrangement. He constantly tries to break down and overcome the various obstacles he has been facing while he is trying to integrate with tribe. Still, he has also been erecting some others unconsciously inside him; these internal barriers have contributed to the intensification of internal conflict with the self as well as the external one with the tribe.

Unknowingly, Suhaym resorts to compensate for every single precondition in his own way; however, he eventually fails but relatively. At this point, Suhaym reaches the stage of counter-compensation which is a form of revenge against his tribe: men or women.

**Dreams as compensating tools**

There is no doubt that dreams constitute a refuge for the individual to escape from his/her reality. Brett and Adler (2014) maintain that dreams can be seen as a direct way toward
your true thoughts, emotions and actions. In dreams, one clearly sees aggressive impulses and desires. Dreams are also a way of compensation for the shortcomings in one's life. Undoubtedly, the feelings of lack of power and inferiority of the individual in his real life lead, in one way or another, to compensation, whether it positive or negative, not to restore balance between the conflicting aspects of his/her experience but to tip the scale to one's advantage in order to deal with and succeed in his/her life. Therefore, it is easy to see clearly that the realization of desire is often reflected in wild dreams (Freud, 1913).

Ibn al-Jawzi (1998) argues that Suhaym fell in love with Omayrah, the daughter of his owner named Abu Ma'bad. Once, the father was preparing to go for fighting and before he left he decided to bid farewell to his beloved daughter saying:

"Bid farewell to Umayrah when you prepare to go fighting"

but he could not continue; he asked Suhaym, who got agitated, for help and started a long flirting poem that included wild pictures of sexual perversion. The first line of the poem reads:

Bid farewell to Umayrah when you prepare to go fighting.
Sufficient are Islam and old age for people to abstain.

As a reaction to this wild flirting poem, the owners decided to sell Suhaym; Jandal, the son of Abu Ma'bad, took him to the city and sold him.

It is worth mentioning that in this poem, Suhaym resorts to illusions and daydreaming in an attempt to compensate for lack of power and the sense of inferiority inherent in his relation with the tribe so that he frees himself from the oppression he is suffering (Freud, 1913).

If we acknowledge the story of Ibn al-Jawzi and accept that the adventures included in the poem are pure deliriums and illusions invented by Suhyam, we can assert that his love affair with Umayrah represents the first oppressed topic inside his mind. Therefore, he proceeds to digress in the psychological discharge of negative feelings mainly blackness and servitude, on the one hand, and of portraying women coming up to him from all over the country, on the other hand.

The poem consists of ninety-one lines; it starts with typical flirting verses that are acceptable and forgivable to the lay reader due to the fact that most of these verses are recurrent and used by other poets. What is unforgivable in this poem is the pure pornographic scenes that portray Suhaym together with women:

We stayed together leaning to a tree
And a curved rope of sand moving here and there.
She pillows me in a hand and holds me tight by a wrest
While her legs are circulating me.
The wind of the north brought us cold breeze
No dress did we have save her dress and my garment.
My garment remained sound because of hers
For a whole year until it is worn out.
I swear by God I have seen her
And her twenty fingers behind me.
I kiss her from the two sides and shield
By her myself from the cold wind.

Suhaym does not mean to express a blatant sexual scene; this scene is purely imagined and does not portray a typical sexual process. The poet shows a strange surreal scene where he fears the cold north wind and protects himself against it uniting with Umayrah; it is more than sexual connection. In pursuit of autism, he has realized the problematic nature of his relationship as a human being to a woman. Unintentionally, he tries to reveal the state of neurosis resulting from the castration, because the denial of proper sexual satisfaction can lead to the formation of neurosis that, in its turn, results in psychosis; consequently, the person tends to improper satisfaction of his desires (Hitschmann, 1913). And it comes to show his desire to transfer his sympathy to eight women at one time.

**Counter compensation**

Suhaym's failure in compensating for the sense of inferiority and bridging the gap between him and the tribe forces him to systematically seek revenge. He says:

إِن تقتلونِي فَقد أَسْخَنْتُ أَعْيَنَكُمْ
وَقَدْ أَتَبَيْحَتْ حَرَامًا مَا تَظْنُونَا
وَقَدْ ضَمَّتْ إِلَى الأَحْشَاءِ جَارِيَةً
عَذْبٌ مُقَبَّلٌ مَّا تَصوَّنْنَا

If you kill me, I cause you to cry
A I committed something haram that you do not imagine.
I have grabbed to my body a maid
Who has tasty lips to kiss.
When they prepare him to be killed, he does not show fear nor does he feel sorry. On the contrary he goes on saying:

شَدّوا وَثَاقَ العبـِّدِ لا يَفْلِتُكُمْ
إِنَّ الْحَيَاتَ مِنَ الْمَمْتِ قَرِيبٌ
فرَقَّ عَلَى جَنْبِ الفَراشِ وَطِيْبٌ
فَلَقد تَحْدَرُ مِنْ جَبِينِ فَتَائِكْ

Handcuff the slave securely so that he does not escape;
life is so close to death.
Your maid's forehead has poured
too much sweat and perfume in my bed.

Here, life equals death for Suhaym who declares war against the tribe blatantly. The previous lines of verse do not portray a sexual scene, they rather express an act of revenge or a retaliation of the society. He is extremely sadist as he uses the maid to protect himself against the cold. When he unites with her, he tries to be very hard sexually leaving her almost motionless out of
exhaustion. In fact, this is a sign of perversion which occurs very often in his verse. He also seems notorious when he forces the women to tear their dresses and become completely naked:

كأنَّ الصبىـراتِ يومَ لقيْننا
ظباءٌ حَنَـتْ أعناقها في المكانس
وهُنَّ بنـاتُ القومِ إن يشعُروا بنا
فُكَم قد شقّقْنا من رداءٍ مُنيّــــرٍ
دواليْكَ حتى كلنا غيرُ لابـــــسِ

The women of Sobayriyat when they meet us
Are like deer hiding their necks in the caves.
When their folk notice us,
One of them turns to be ingenious.
How often we tore woven dresses
And veils worn by virgins not old maids.
Once a veil is torn, another veil
Is torn too until we become completely naked.

According to Cashdan (1972), these verses show how abnormal Suhaym is when he tends to display his genital organs to the public as well as those of the women he accompanies. This abnormality is called exhibitionism.

The weapon that Suhyam uses against the tribe, i.e. flirting the women, to make up for his inferiority turns against him and results in dire consequences against him. He starts to suffer chronic psychosis just like sociopaths who have counter, hostile tendencies towards the society. Hence, Suhaym can be regarded as a sociopath who has a variety of legal and social irregularities. The common denominator among all sociopaths is the sense of indifference (Cashdan, 1972).

Conclusion

The general view of the slaves at the beginning of the human history is, somewhat, unclear because the shift made by Islam is, in fact, shocking to those who were used to the existence of slaves who are supposed to serve do everything for their masters and who are always viewed as a commodity whose value is determined depending on various factors.

At the same time, this view has always been a major obstacle to the integration of slaves in the new reality although it has worked blandly in some environments and failed in others. Thus, Suhaym, and many others like him, has failed to achieve social success, understand their job in life, and reach a real and clear meaning of it. This has contributed to the emergence of severe inferiority and deficiency complexes. As a result, he tries to compensate for all his losses following extreme, bizarre techniques.

The study aims to establish a link between all these aspects with the psychological state of the poet. Therefore, Suhaym is seen, sometimes, proud of his blackness which conceals a white character with white morals and ethics. In other instances, Suhaym describes the love of women to him and their appeal to him whether individually and in groups to the extent that he does present, in his poetry, scenes of sexual perversion and irregularities including the combination of eight women at the same time to play with
Among the other tools of compensation used by the poet is daydreaming in which he builds a world of illusion in order to achieve everything he aspires to. He also has established few relationships. However, when he has failed to integrate in the tribe, find a position worthy of a poet and knight, and understand the relationship between men and women, he resorts to counter-compensation or retaliation, by insulting the honor of the tribe. Eventually, Suhaym turns to a sociopath suffering psychosis before the tribe unanimously decide to burn him to death.

Note: The original article is written in Arabic: the translation is rendered by Oqab Jabali, the second author.

Authors' Profiles

Dr Abdul Khaliq Esa is currently the dean of Faculty of Humanities, An-Najah National University in Nablus, Palestine. He holds a PhD degree in Language philosophy from the University of Jordan in Amman; he teaches Abbasid Literature. His research affiliation includes Ancient Arabic Literature, Modern Literature, and Philology.

Dr Oqab Jabali is the director of the Language Center and instructor of English in the Department of English at An-Najah National University, Nablus, Palestine. Besides teaching translation and linguistic courses, he is a freelance translator and he teaches English for specific purpose in the language center. He holds a PhD in Cultural Studies and Political Sciences from the Jagiellonian University in Krakow, Poland. His major publications include women studies and translation and linguistic studies.

Kamel Yaseen is a graduate student at An-Najah National University. Currently, he works for the Ministry of Education in Palestine teaching Arabic at school level. He is interested in Arabic literature and rhetorics.

References


Adaptation in Translation: Howells’s Short Story “Christmas Every Day”

Mohsine Khazrouni
Department of English and Translation
Abdelmalek Essaadi University
Tetouan, Morocco

Abstract
The present study aims to highlight the importance of adaptation in translation. To convey the message, translators need to take into account not only the text, but also extra linguistic factors such as the target audience. The present paper claims that adaptation is an unavoidable translation strategy when dealing with texts that are heavy with religious and cultural themes. The translation task becomes even more challenging when dealing with children’s literature as the audience is children whose comprehension, experience and world knowledge is limited. The study uses the Arabic translation of the short story “Christmas Every Day” by William Dean Howells (1837-1920) as a case study. The short story will be translated and the pragmatic problems involved will be discussed. The focus will be on the issue of adaptation, i.e., the source text should be adapted to the target language audience’s social and cultural environment.

Keywords Adaptation, Arabic audience, children's literature, translation, equivalence

Introduction
Translation is generally defined as the process of transferring an idea, a concept, or a thought from one language to another. However, translators are faced with many obstacles when they attempt to convey an idea to the target language. Words denoting cultural specific items pose problems for translators. Baker (1992) states that source language word may express a concept which is totally unknown in the target culture. The concept could be abstract or concrete; it may be related to a religious belief, social custom, or even to a type of food. Such concepts are usually referred to as “culture specific”. As an example, she mentions the concept ‘airing cupboard’ in English, which is unknown to speakers of most languages. Thus, it is difficult to translate (p. 21).

According to House, (2015) “Translation is the replacement of a text in the source language by a semantically and pragmatically equivalent text in the target language” (p. 72). To produce the intended effect on the target language audience, translators’ task is not only to transfer meaning from one language to another, they need to go beyond the text so that the function of the source language text should be similar to that of the target language text. (House, 2015)

Different text types require different translation strategies. Literal translation, for example, is a typical of legal texts where the content of the text is the most important. In literary works, on the other hand, adaptation (naturalization or domestication according to Chesterman &Wagner (2002) is one of the strategies that can be used. This idea is echoed by House’s distinction between overt translation and covert translation. An overt translation is required whenever the source text is linked to the source language and its culture. A covert translation is closely linked to the target language. It enjoys the status of an original source text in the target language. In covert translation, functional equivalence is essential because it involves subtle cultural presuppositions which necessitate the application of a “cultural filter”.

Adaptation in Translation
Several authors have investigated the issue of adaptation in translation. Baker, (1992) talks about pragmatic equivalence which deals with the way utterances are used in communicative situations and the way we interpret them in context. According to her, “Pragmatics is the study of language in use. It is the study of meaning, not as generated by the linguistic system but as conveyed and manipulated by participants in a communicative situation” (p. 217).

Adaptation can be defined as the changes translators need to make in the source text so that it suits the target readers’ needs and situation. Raw (2012) explains the importance of adaptation as follows:

Whether it is consciously carried out by a translator or not, successful adaptation allows (or even forces) the target readers to discover the text in a way that suits its aim, ensures the optimal reception experience, or simply promotes understanding of a specific
message. (p. 26)

Similarly, Vinay & Darbelne (1995) stress the importance of adaptation when they state that ‘if a translator systematically refuses to adapt, it will eventually lead to a weakening of a target text’ (p. 41). According to them, adaptation is one of the seven translation procedures that should be used whenever the source text situation does not exist in the culture of the target text. In this case, translators need to recreate a new situation which can be considered more appropriate to the target audience.

Bastin (2014) emphasizes too the the importance of adaptation when he says that “without any doubts that adaptation is the most efficient communicational strategy.” (p. 76) He explains that adaptation is an efficient strategy that can be used to solve cultural dissimilarities. For him, what makes adaptation different from translation is the fact that translation is text based because it focuses on meaning, while adaptation is context based because it recreates the purpose. He talks about advertising texts which necessitates that translators and adapters go beyond the content of text and consider the function of the text which needs to be preserved. The function of advertising text is to sell products. Therefore, the success of the translation is assessed based on the impact of the translation on the target culture readers, rather than achieving equivalence or faithfulness.

Domestication and foreignization are two opposing translation strategies suggested by Venuti. Domestication is the case when the translator decides to minimize the foreignness of the source text to make it more appropriate to the target language readers’ culture, while foreignization means retaining foreignness of the original text. Venuti, (1995) explains that foreignization refers to a method or strategy of translation which retains some of the the original ‘foreign’ text. Domestication, on the other hand, assimilates a text to the target cultural and linguistic values.

Baker and Saldanha (2009, p.4) suggest the following types of adaptation: summarizing, paraphrase, omission: the elimination of part of the text, exoticism: the substitution of stretches of slang, dialect, nonsense words, etc. in the original text by rough equivalents in the target language, situational or cultural adequacy: the recreation of a context that is more familiar or culturally appropriate from the target reader’s perspective than the one used in the original, creation: a more global replacement of the original text with a text that preserves only the essential message/ideas/functions of the original . Baker and Saldanha (2009) consider the following most common factors which cause translators to resort to adaptations:
• ‘cross-code breakdown’ (where there are no lexical or any other kinds of equivalents in the target language);
• ‘situational or cultural inadequacy’ (where the contexts in the source text does not exist or cannot be applied to the target text);
• ‘genre switching’ (change from one discourse type to another (e.g. from adult to children’s literature)
Baker and Saldanha (2009, p.5) insist that adaptation can be carried out under certain conditions. First, the adapter must evaluate to what extent the source text presents new or shared information for the target audience. Second, the adapter must find an appropriate match in the target language. The third condition is related to the meaning and purpose(s) of the source and target texts.


It is worth noting that the dividing line between translation and adaptation is not always clear. While some scholars consider adaptation as an essential part of the translation, others have severely criticized adaptation, considering it a bad phenomenon as it is a kind of distortion or unfaithfulness to the original. Among the proponents of adaptation are Gambier and Gottlieb (2001) who contend that it is unrealistic to ask a translator to create an easily comprehensible text without using any cultural, pragmatic or any other kind of adaptation.

Oittinen (2000) states that the concept of adaptation is like the concept of equivalence. Both are “ill-defined” and “self-evident”. He points out that one of the reasons why some scholars have negative views about adaptation has to with the way they see translation. If they see translation as producing the sameness, then, they must make a clear distinction between translation and adaptation. But if they consider translation as rewriting, then they will find it hard to distinguish one from the other. For Oittinen, translation and adaptation have many things in common though adaptation is very often seen as a version, an abridgement, or a shortened edition which is less valuable than the original. One of the reasons why we need to use adaptation, according to Oittinen, is when we write for children as the readers will “understand better”. Oittinen includes adaptation in “the concept of translation”, and believes that “All translators, if they want to be successful, need to adapt their texts according to the presumptive readers” (P.78)

Baker and Saldanha (2009) note that the study of adaptation urges the theorists to go beyond the linguistic factors and highlights the role of translators as mediators, creative and communicators. They add that relevance, rather than accuracy becomes the key word, and this necessitates the careful analysis of three important concepts in translation theory: meaning, purpose (or function, or skopos) and intention.

**The source text as children’s literature**

The short story is about a little girl who asks her father to tell her a story. She wants a story about Christmas. He tells her a story of a little girl who asks the Christmas Fairy for
Christmas every day. When her wish came true, she learned that her greed had brought many negative economic and social impacts.

Oittinen, (2000) defines children’s literature as “literature produced and intended for children or as literature read by children”. (p.61) The case study of the present paper is a text which is written for children. Therefore, the translator of these kinds of texts has to consider not only the meaning, but also the situation and the purpose of the text. To use Oittinen’s words, “Situation and purpose are an intrinsic part of all translation” (p.3). The theme of the source text is Christmas which is deeply rooted in the Western culture. The challenge we face here is that the text is loaded with Christmas terms that are unknown to many children in the Arab world. The translator has to create a new situation which preserves the function of the text (teaching children certain values or morals. Puurtinen (1995) claims that genres such as children’s literature require the re-creation of the message according to the sociolinguistic needs of a different readership.

Children’s literature has a strong influence on children’s development and their perception of the world. This led many Muslim scholars to consider Western children’s literature a threat to our culture as it transmits cultural values, morals and religious convictions which are not compatible with Islamic and Arab culture. For example, Mdallel (2003) asserts that every nation has the right to choose the texts to be translated for its kids, and it can censor any literature that contains values that are not accepted by the target audience as censorship is considered as a means to preserve one’s own cultural identity and avoid being just a copy of the other.

The Principle of equivalent effect: (Nida’s formal and dynamic equivalence)

Nida (1964) differentiates between formal and dynamic equivalence. Formal equivalence “focuses attention on the message itself, in both form and content. In such a translation, one is concerned with such correspondences as poetry to poetry, sentence to sentence, and concept to concept” (p.159). Formal equivalence necessitates that the message in the receptor language should match as closely as possible the different elements in the source language. This means that “the message in the receptor culture is constantly compared with the message in the source culture to determine the standards of accuracy and correctness” (p.159).

Dynamic equivalence is a receptor-oriented approach which is based on what Nida calls ‘the principle of equivalent effect’, where the ‘relationship between the receptor and the message should be substantially the same as that which existed between the original receptors and the message’. The message has to be adapted to suit the receptors’ linguistic and cultural needs and expectations. Adjustments of grammar, lexicon and of cultural references is essential in order to achieve naturalness. (p.159).

Newmark’s (semantic and communicative translation)

Newmark (1988) departs from Nida’s receptor-oriented line. He feels that the success of equivalent effect is ‘illusory’ and that the conflict of loyalties and the gap between emphasis on source and target language will always remain as the overriding problem in translation theory.
and practice. He suggests that we can narrow that gap by replacing the old terms with those of ‘semantic’ and ‘communicative’ translation (Newmark, 1981, p.38, as cited in Munday 2016).

According to Newmark, (1988) communicative translation attempts to produce on its readers an effect as close as possible to that obtained on the readers of the source language. Semantic translation attempts to render, as closely as the semantic and syntactic structures of the target language allow, the exact contextual meaning of the original. (p.14).

Newmark distances himself from the full principle of equivalent effect, since that effect “is inoperant if the text is out of target language space and time” (p.15). An example would be a modern British English translation of Homer. No modern translator, irrespective of the target language, can possibly hope or expect to produce the same effect on the reader of the written target language as the oral source language had on its audience in ancient Greece. Newmark also raises further questions concerning the readers to whom Nida directs his dynamic equivalence, asking if they are “to be handed everything on a plate”, with everything explained for them (Munday, 2016).

### Data Analysis and Discussion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original text</th>
<th>Arabic translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Well, once there was a little pig—</td>
<td>• كان هناك أرنب صغير.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• I should like to know what's the difference between a little pig and a little girl that wanted it Christmas every day!&quot;</td>
<td>• أود أن أعرف الفرق بين أرنب صغير وبنت صغيرة أرادت أن يكون عيد الأضحى كل يوم!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Muslims believe that pig is impure, unhealthy, and harmful for humans. Muslims abstain from pork because the holy Quran prohibits its consumption. The verse in Surah Al-Baqara says: “He has only forbidden to you dead animals, blood, the flesh of swine, and that which has been dedicated to other than Allah. But whoever is forced [by necessity], neither desiring [it] nor transgressing [its limit], there is no sin upon him. Indeed, Allah is Forgiving and Merciful.” [2:173] (https://quran.com/2/173)

Therefore, replacing a pig with a rabbit would be more acceptable and appropriate to the target audience.
Although Christmas is celebrated in many Islamic countries, I find it more appropriate to replace it with another celebration in the Arab and Islamic world. I have decided to create another situation “Eid Al Adha” for two reasons. First, children do not have enough knowledge of Christmas, and many terms related to Christmas are unfamiliar to them. Second, there are many similarities between rituals of Christmas celebration in the Western culture and Eid Al Adha in Islamic culture. Both are very important occasions in both cultures when kids are happy as they buy new clothes and receive gifts.

Conclusion
The present paper has discussed the importance of adaption when translating texts that contain values and cultural references. Rendering the same content can result in a foreign and incomprehensible translation especially if the text is written for children. In every translation, there are losses and sacrifices. In some cases, translators need to sacrifice the original text for the sake of producing an intelligible and appropriate text for the target readers. Adaptation is the strategy used to translate the “Christmas Every Day” short story. The translation appears as an abridged version of the source story because the researcher believes that translation is a creation. Though many scholars continue to regard adaptation as a negative phenomenon, adaptation is a necessary strategy that needs be used whenever there is a cultural mismatch. We need to create a new situation that is acceptable and comprehensible to the target readers especially when translating children’s literature.

Arabic translation
عيد الأضحى كل يوم
دخلت فتاة صغيرة إلى غرفة مطالعة والدها كما كانت عادة كل صباح سبت قبل تناول وجبة الإفطار و سألت أباها أن يروي لها حكاية. حاول الأب أن يتملص من رواية الحكاية لأنه كان مشغولاً ذلك الصباح، لكن البنت أصرت ولم تدعه، وهكذا بدأ في سرد حكايتها قائلاً: "في يوم من الأيام كان هناك أرنب صغير . 
وضعت يدها على فمه و منعته من متابعة الكلام و قالت إنها سمعت حكايات الأرانب الصغيرة إلى أن ملت منها. "إذن أي نوع من الحكايات تودين ان أروي لك؟"
"حكاية حول عيد الأضحى"

رد الأب قائلا: "بدو لي أن عدد الحكايات حول عيد الأضحى التي رويتها لك يساوي تلك التي رويتها لك حول الأرانب الصغيرة.".

ليس هناك فرق، لكن حدث عيد الأضحى أكثر أهمية

بجهد كبير توقف الأب عن ما كان يكتبه وقال "حسنا إن، سأروي لك حكاية حول تلك الفتاة الصغيرة التي أرادت أن تكون مناسبة عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. هل تحين سماعهم؟".

ردت البنت "أحبها جدا" وجلست منتظرة سماع الحكاية.

حسنا إن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.

قضت عيد أضحى رائع طوال اليوم، أكلت الكثير من الحلوى حتى انها لم تأكل أي شيء في وجبة الفطور. ذهبت البنت لزيارة أسرتها وأصحابها، ثم جاءت الى المنزل وتناولت وجبة العشاء، كما تناولت حلوى العيد. بعد ذلك خرجت ثم عادت ومدهشت كانت البنت:

"حسنا إذن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.

قضت عيد أضحى رائع طوال اليوم، أكلت الكثير من الحلوى حتى انها لم تأكل أي شيء في وجبة الفطور. ذهبت البنت لزيارة أسرتها وأصحابها، ثم جاءت الى المنزل وتناولت وجبة العشاء، كما تناولت حلوى العيد. بعد ذلك خرجت ثم عادت ومدهشت كانت البنت:

"حسنا إذن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.

قضت عيد أضحى رائع طوال اليوم، أكلت الكثير من الحلوى حتى انها لم تأكل أي شيء في وجبة الفطور. ذهبت البنت لزيارة أسرتها وأصحابها، ثم جاءت الى المنزل وتناولت وجبة العشاء، كما تناولت حلوى العيد. بعد ذلك خرجت ثم عادت ومدهشت كانت البنت:

"حسنا إذن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.

قضت عيد أضحى رائع طوال اليوم، أكلت الكثير من الحلوى حتى انها لم تأكل أي شيء في وجبة الفطور. ذهبت البنت لزيارة أسرتها وأصحابها، ثم جاءت الى المنزل وتناولت وجبة العشاء، كما تناولت حلوى العيد. بعد ذلك خرجت ثم عادت ومدهشت كانت البنت:

"حسنا إذن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.

قضت عيد أضحى رائع طوال اليوم، أكلت الكثير من الحلوى حتى انها لم تأكل أي شيء في وجبة الفطور. ذهبت البنت لزيارة أسرتها وأصحابها، ثم جاءت الى المنزل وتناولت وجبة العشاء، كما تناولت حلوى العيد. بعد ذلك خرجت ثم عادت ومدهشت كانت البنت:

"حسنا إذن، في يوم من الأيام كانت هناك بنت صغيرة أحببت عيد الأضحى كثيرا لدرجة أنها تمنت لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم طيلة السنة. فجأة، ظهر جني وأكد لها ان بإمكانه ان يحقق لها أي أمنيت أرادت. قالت البنت إنها تمنى لو كان عيد الأضحى كل يوم. حقق لها الجني حلمها وباان عيد الأضحى سوف يكون كل يوم طيلة السنة.

كانت البنت متحمسة جدا قبل هذا لأنها كانت تستعد للاحتفال بعيد الأضحى العادي الذي يأتي كل مرة في السنة والذي كان موعده في اليوم التالي، فقد عزمت أن تحتفظ بهذا السر لنفسها وأن تفاجئ به الجميع حالما يصير الأمر حقيقة.
في اليوم التالي، تكرر نفس الشيء، لكن الجميع أصبح غضبانا، ومع نهاية أسبوع واحد، بدأ كثير من الناس يفقدون أعصابهم.

بدأت ال.fullName_1 الصغيرة تحس بالخوف و هي تحتفظ بالسر لنفسها. كانت تود أن تفشي السر لأمها لكنها لم تجرا على ذلك. كما أنها استحبنت أن تقالب ال nike_2 أي يوقف الاعياد لأن هذا سيدعو نوعا من نكران الشمال، واعتقدت أنه يجب عليها أن تواصل على هذا السنة كلا رغبتها لم تعرف كيف. واستمرت الأحداث، مر عيد الفقر و مرت ذكرى الأعياد الوطنية، لكن الآلية كلها كانت متشابهة، كلها عيد الأضحى.

وبعد فترة، بدأ كميات الفحم والبطاطس تنفد من الأسواق وأصبح ثم الأضحية غالبا جدا.

أصبح الناس قراء جدا نتيجة شرائهم للهدايا و أضحيات العيد، ولم يستطيعوا شراء أي ملابس جديدة، واكتفوا بارتداء الملابس الممزقة. أصحوا قراء جدا إلى درجة أنه كان على الجميع الهرب إلى ملاجئ الفقراء كان دون تكلفة.

كلهم أصبحوا أغنياء وتعاملوا بغرور. لقد كسبوا مخزيا.

مل الناس من كل نفس الحلوى ومن نفس الأطباق وامتلاك الأزمة و الأحياء بالنفايات المرتبطة بالعيد التي أدت إلى تلوث البيئة و انتشار الزكام الكرة لأن السلطات لم تستطع التخلص من تلك الكميات الكبيرة من النفايات، وأصبحت العديد من الناس بأمراض السمنة لأنهم أفرطوا في تناول اللحم.

وبعد أن استمر هذا الحال لمدة ثلاث أو أربع أسابيع تدريجيا، كانت البنت كما جاء، إلى العري في الصباح رأى ثلاثة أعياد جديدة، وذلك بالطريقة المتعارفة في كل مكان، كانت تجلس وتهيج بالبكاء. في غضون ستة أشهر أصبحت منبهة تماما، إذ لم تعد تستطيع حتى البكاء، فقط تجلس في غرفة العائدين وتدبر عينيها وتحسس. وعندما كانت تستطيع أن تجلس على الندى حينما وجدتها، كانت تكسر النظر إليها كانت غاضبة وكانت ترنيها هناك، وعندما حولت النظر إليها، كانت تكسر النظر إليها.

وفي ذلك الوقت، لم تعد الناس يحتفظون باللحوم بتلك اللغة المعهودة، ولكنهم أصبحوا يرموها من السياج أو من مكان آخر، كان رجال الشرطة يأتون ويأمرونهم بأن لا يفعلوا ذلك وإلا سوف يعتقلونهم.

لم يعد بمقدور الناس إصدار صوت.

"لماذا لم يستطعوا ذلك؟"

"لا، لأنهم فقدوا أصولهم لكلمة ما قالوا" عيد مبارك سعيد.

"أنا أنصحك أن ترى بعض كل هذه الأعياد. عانت البنت الصغيرة كثيرا إلى درجة أنها أصبحت تحتفظ عن الموضوع وهي نائمة. لم يعد加深 يحب عيناها و تحتفظها الناس لأن هذا لم يكن له طاعة. وفي اليوم التالي، بدأت البنت تنادي النقلي كي يأتي ويوقف الأعياد. لكن هذا لم ينجح. نامت البنت تلك الليلة، وحين استيقظ، بدأت تقول: "قلت البنت "وجدت كل ذلك كان حليما".

رد الأب "لا، كان واقع إلى حد ما "

"ماذا اكتشفه أن؟"

"لا، يمكن أن يكون موعد الصراف".

"اختلفت البنت بريقها وقالت: "سوف لن تقوم من مكان إذا تركت الحكاية هكذا!"
"كيف تريدين الحكاية أن تنتهي؟"

"أن يكون عيد الميلاد مرة واحدة في السنة.

قال الأب "حسنًا، وواصل:

حسنًا، عمت الفرحة كل أنحاء البلاد، وامتدت حتى إلى الدولة المجاورة. التقى الناس بعضهم بعضاً في كل مكان وعبروا عن فرحتهم، طلبت الأشياء التي تمتلكها المدينة وجمعوا كل تفاصيل الأصوات، وتخليصوا منها برغمهم من النهر. وهذا جعل الأسماك مريضة جداً. كانت كل المناطق عبارة عن نار تحرق فيها الأطفال هداياهم. لقد كانوا فعلاً يستمتعون بوقتهم.

عبرت البنت الصغيرة عن شكرها للجني لأنه أوقف أعياد الميلاد. وكانت تأمل أن يكون عيد الميلاد مرة كل ألف سنة، وبعد ذلك قالت كل مرة سنة، ثم عشر سنوات، وفي النهاية طلبت أن يكون مرة كل سنة. فقال الجني أن هذا الأخير هو الطريق الأمثل الذي أسعد الناس منذ أن بدؤوا يحتفلون بأعياد الأضحى. واتفقا على هذا. ردت البنت: "ثم تسوية الأمر بينا" وعادت مسرعة وهي تقفز في طريقها إلى المنزل. كانت فرحة جداً.

سال الأب "كيف وجدت الحكاية؟"

ردت البنت: "رانع، لكنها لم تحب كون القصة انتهت، لكن أمها جاءت وسألت الأب:

"هل ستأتي لتناول وجبة الفطور؟" ماذا كنت تحكي للبنت؟"

"كنت أحكي لها حكاية أخلاقية"

---

The English Original Text

Christmas Every Day  By William Dean Howells.

William Dean Howells (March 1, 1837 – May 11, 1920) is an American author. "Christmas Every Day" is one of his best-known short stories. "Christmas Every Day" is a short story about a young girl who wished that Christmas would come every day.

The story

The little girl came into her papa's study, as she always did Saturday morning before breakfast, and asked for a story. He tried to beg off that morning, for he was very busy, but she would not let him. So he began:

"Well, once there was a little pig--"

She put her hand over his mouth and stopped him at the word. She said she had heard little pig-stories till she was perfectly sick of them.

"Well, what kind of story shall I tell, then?"

"About Christmas. It's getting to be the season. It's past Thanksgiving already."

"It seems to me," her papa argued, "that I've told as often about Christmas as I have about little pigs."

"No difference! Christmas is more interesting."

"Well!" Her papa roused himself from his writing by a great effort. "Well, then, I'll tell you about the little girl that wanted it Christmas every day in the year. How would you like that?"
"First-rate!" said the little girl; and she nestled into comfortable shape in his lap, ready for listening.
"Very well, then, this little pig--Oh, what are you pounding me for?"
"Because you said little pig instead of little girl."
"I should like to know what's the difference between a little pig and a little girl that wanted it Christmas every day!"
"Papa," said the little girl, warningly, "if you don't go on, I'll give it to you!" And at this her papa darted off like lightning, and began to tell the story as fast as he could.
Well, once there was a little girl who liked Christmas so much that she wanted it to be Christmas every day in the year; and as soon as Thanksgiving was over she began to send postal-cards to the old Christmas Fairy to ask if she mightn't have it. But the old fairy never answered any of the postals; and after a while the little girl found out that the Fairy was pretty particular, and wouldn't notice anything but letters--not even correspondence cards in envelopes; but real letters on sheets of paper, and sealed outside with a monogram--or your initial, anyway. So, then, she began to send her letters; and in about three weeks--or just the day before Christmas, it was--she got a letter from the Fairy, saying she might have it Christmas every day for a year, and then they would see about having it longer.
The little girl was a good deal excited already, preparing for the old-fashioned, once-a-year Christmas that was coming the next day, and perhaps the Fairy's promise didn't make such an impression on her as it would have made at some other time. She just resolved to keep it to herself, and surprise everybody with it as it kept coming true; and then it slipped out of her mind altogether.
She had a splendid Christmas. She went to bed early, so as to let Santa Claus have a chance at the stockings, and in the morning she was up the first of anybody and went and felt them, and found hers all lumpy with packages of candy, and oranges and grapes, and pocket-books and rubber balls, and all kinds of small presents, and her big brother's with nothing but the tongs in them, and her young lady sister's with a new silk umbrella, and her papa's and mamma's with potatoes and pieces of coal wrapped up in tissue-paper, just as they always had every Christmas.
Then she waited around till the rest of the family were up, and she was the first to burst into the library, when the doors were opened, and look at the large presents laid out on the library-table--books, and portfolios, and boxes of stationery, and breastpins, and dolls, and little stoves, and dozens of handkerchiefs, and ink-stands, and skates, and snow-shovels, and photograph-frames, and little easels, and boxes of water-colors, and Turkish paste, and nougat, and candied cherries, and dolls' houses, and water proofs--and the big Christmas-tree, lighted and standing in a waste-basket in the middle.
She had a splendid Christmas all day. She ate so much candy that she did not want any breakfast; and the whole forenoon the presents kept pouring in that the expressman had not had time to deliver the night before; and she went round giving the presents she had got for other people, and came home and ate turkey and cranberry for dinner, and plum-pudding and nuts and raisins and oranges and more candy, and then went out and coasted, and came in with a stomach-ache, crying; and her papa said he would see if his house was turned into that sort of fool's paradise another year; and they had a light supper, and pretty early everybody went to bed cross.
Here the little girl pounded her papa in the back, again.
"Well, what now? Did I say pigs?"
"You made them act like pigs."
“Well, didn't they?”
"No matter; you oughtn't to put it into a story."
"Very well, then, I'll take it all out."
Her father went on:
The little girl slept very heavily, and she slept very late, but she was wakened at last by the other children dancing round her bed with their stockings full of presents in their hands.
"What is it?” said the little girl, and she rubbed her eyes and tried to rise up in bed.
"Christmas! Christmas! Christmas!” they all shouted, and waved their stockings.
"Nonsense! It was Christmas yesterday.”
Her brothers and sisters just laughed. "We don't know about that. It's Christmas to-day, anyway.
You come into the library and see."
Then all at once it flashed on the little girl that the Fairy was keeping her promise, and her year of Christmases was beginning. She was dreadfully sleepy, but she sprang up like a lark--a lark that had overeaten itself and gone to bed cross--and darted into the library. There it was again!
Books, and portfolios, and boxes of stationery, and breastpins--
"You needn't go over it all, papa; I guess I can remember just what was there," said the little girl.
Well, and there was the Christmas-tree blazing away, and the family picking out their presents, but looking pretty sleepy, and her father perfectly puzzled, and her mother ready to cry. "I'm sure I don't see how I'm to dispose of all these things," said her mother, and her father said it seemed to him they had had something just like it the day before, but he supposed he must have dreamed it. This struck the little girl as the best kind of a joke; and so she ate so much candy she didn't want any breakfast, and went round carrying presents, and had turkey and cranberry for dinner, and then went out and coasted, and came in with a--
"Papa!"
"Well, what now?"
"What did you promise, you forgetful thing?"
"Oh! oh yes!"
Well, the next day, it was just the same thing over again, but everybody getting crosser; and at the end of a week's time so many people had lost their tempers that you could pick up lost tempers anywhere; they perfectly strewed the ground. Even when people tried to recover their tempers they usually got somebody else's, and it made the most dreadful mix.
The little girl began to get frightened, keeping the secret all to herself; she wanted to tell her mother, but she didn't dare to; and she was ashamed to ask the Fairy to take back her gift, it seemed ungrateful and ill-bred, and she thought she would try to stand it, but she hardly knew how she could, for a whole year. So it went on and on, and it was Christmas on St. Valentine's Day and Washington's Birthday, just the same as any day, and it didn't skip even the First of April, though everything was counterfeit that day, and that was some little relief.
After a while coal and potatoes began to be awfully scarce, so many had been wrapped up in tissue-paper to fool papas and mammas with. Turkeys got to be about a thousand dollars apiece--
"Papa!"
"Well, what?"
"You're beginning to fib."
"Well, two thousand, then."
And they got to passing off almost anything for turkeys--half-grown humming-birds, and even rocs out of the Arabian Nights--the real turkeys were so scarce. And cranberries--well, they
asked a diamond apiece for cranberries. All the woods and orchards were cut down for Christmas-trees, and where the woods and orchards used to be it looked just like a stubble-field, with the stumps. After a while they had to make Christmas-trees out of rags, and stuff them with bran, like old-fashioned dolls; but there were plenty of rags, because people got so poor, buying presents for one another, that they couldn't get any new clothes, and they just wore their old ones to tatters. They got so poor that everybody had to go to the poor-house, except the confectioners, and the fancy-store keepers, and the picture-book sellers, and the expressmen; and they all got so rich and proud that they would hardly wait upon a person when he came to buy. It was perfectly shameful!

Well, after it had gone on about three or four months, the little girl, whenever she came into the room in the morning and saw those great ugly, lumpy stockings dangling at the fire-place, and the disgusting presents around everywhere, used to just sit down and burst out crying. In six months, she was perfectly exhausted; she couldn't even cry anymore; she just lay on the lounge and rolled her eyes and panted. About the beginning of October, she took to sitting down on dolls wherever she found them--French dolls, or any kind--she hated the sight of them so; and by Thanksgiving she was crazy, and just slammed her presents across the room.

By that time people didn't carry presents around nicely any more. They flung them over the fence, or through the window, or anything; and, instead of running their tongues out and taking great pains to write "For dear Papa," or "Mamma," or "Brother," or "Sister," or "Susie," or "Sammie," or "Billie," or "Bobbie," or "Jimmie," or "Jennie," or whoever it was, and troubling to get the spelling right, and then signing their names, and "Xmas, 18--," they used to write in the gift-books, "Take it, you horrid old thing!" and then go and bang it against the front door. Nearly everybody had built barns to hold their presents, but pretty soon the barns overflowed, and then they used to let them lie out in the rain, or anywhere. Sometimes the police used to come and tell them to shovel their presents off the sidewalk, or they would arrest them.

"I thought you said everybody had gone to the poor-house," interrupted the little girl.
"They did go, at first," said her papa; "but after a while the poor-houses got so full that they had to send the people back to their own houses. They tried to cry, when they got back, but they couldn't make the least sound."

"Why couldn't they?"
"Because they had lost their voices, saying 'Merry Christmas' so much. Did I tell you how it was on the Fourth of July?"

"No; how was it?" And the little girl nestled closer, in expectation of something uncommon.

Well, the night before, the boys stayed up to celebrate, as they always do, and fell asleep before twelve o'clock, as usual, expecting to be wakened by the bells and cannon. But it was nearly eight o'clock before the first boy in the United States woke up, and then he found out what the trouble was. As soon as he could get his clothes on he ran out of the house and smashed a big cannon-torpedo down on the pavement; but it didn't make any more noise than a damp wad of paper; and after he tried about twenty or thirty more, he began to pick them up and look at them. Every single torpedo was a big raisin! Then he just streaked it up-stairs, and examined his fire-crackers and toy-pistol and two-dollar collection of fireworks, and found that they were nothing but sugar and candy painted up to look like fireworks! Before ten o'clock every boy in the United States found out that his Fourth of July things had turned into Christmas things; and then they just sat down and cried--they were so mad. There are about twenty million boys in the United States, and so you can imagine what a noise they made. Some men got together before night.
with a little powder that hadn't turned into purple sugar yet, and they said they would fire off one cannon, anyway. But the cannon burst into a thousand pieces, for it was nothing but rock-candy, and some of the men nearly got killed. The Fourth of July orations all turned into Christmas carols, and when anybody tried to read the Declaration, instead of saying, "When in the course of human events it becomes necessary," he was sure to sing, "God rest you, merry gentlemen." It was perfectly awful.
The little girl drew a deep sigh of satisfaction.
"And how was it at Thanksgiving?"
Her papa hesitated. "Well, I'm almost afraid to tell you. I'm afraid you'll think it's wicked."
"Well, tell, anyway," said the little girl.
Well, before it came Thanksgiving it had leaked out who had caused all these Christmases. The little girl had suffered so much that she had talked about it in her sleep; and after that hardly anybody would play with her. People just perfectly despised her, because if it had not been for her greediness it wouldn't have happened; and now, when it came Thanksgiving, and she wanted them to go to church, and have squash-pie and turkey, and show their gratitude, they said that all the turkeys had been eaten up for her old Christmas dinners, and if she would stop the Christmases, they would see about the gratitude. Wasn't it dreadful? And the very next day the little girl began to send letters to the Christmas Fairy, and then telegrams, to stop it. But it didn't do any good; and then she got to calling at the Fairy's house, but the girl that came to the door always said, "Not at home," or "Engaged," or "At dinner," or something like that; and so it went on till it came to the old once-a-year Christmas Eve. The little girl fell asleep, and when she woke up in the morning--
"She found it was all nothing but a dream," suggested the little girl.
"No, indeed!" said her papa. "It was all every bit true!"
"Well, what did she find out, then?"
"Why, that it wasn't Christmas at last, and wasn't ever going to be, any more. Now it's time for breakfast."
The little girl held her papa fast around the neck.
"You sha'n't go if you're going to leave it so!"
"How do you want it left?"
"Christmas once a year."
"All right," said her papa; and he went on again.
Well, there was the greatest rejoicing all over the country, and it extended clear up into Canada. The people met together everywhere, and kissed and cried for joy. The city carts went around and gathered up all the candy and raisins and nuts, and dumped them into the river; and it made the fish perfectly sick; and the whole United States, as far out as Alaska, was one blaze of bonfires, where the children were burning up their gift-books and presents of all kinds. They had the greatest time!
The little girl went to thank the old Fairy because she had stopped its being Christmas, and she said she hoped she would keep her promise and see that Christmas never, never came again. Then the Fairy frowned, and asked her if she was sure she knew what she meant; and the little girl asked her, Why not? and the old Fairy said that now she was behaving just as greedily as ever, and she'd better look out. This made the little girl think it all over carefully again, and she said she would be willing to have it Christmas about once in a thousand years; and then she said a hundred, and then she said ten, and at last she got down to one. Then the Fairy said that was the
Adaptation in Translation: Howells’s Short Story “Christmas Every Day”  Khazrouni

good old way that had pleased people ever since Christmas began, and she was agreed. Then the little girl said, "What're your shoes made of?" And the Fairy said, "Leather." And the little girl said, "Bargain's done forever," and skipped off, and hippity-hopped the whole way home, she was so glad.

"How will that do?" asked the papa.

"First-rate!" said the little girl; but she hated to have the story stop, and was rather sober. However, her mamma put her head in at the door, and asked her papa:

"Are you never coming to breakfast? What have you been telling that child?"

"Oh, just a moral tale."
The little girl caught him around the neck again.

"We know! Don't you tell what, papa! Don't you tell what!"

About the Author:
Mohsine Khazrouni: Department of English and Translation, Abdelmalek Essaadi University, Tetouan, Morocco.

References