

Subtitling on the Intersection of Theory and Practice: Pedagogical Research-Based Approach to Subtitled Training

Mohammad Ahmad Thawabteh

Department of English Language and Literature
Faculty of Arts
Al-Quds University, Jerusalem
Occupied Palestinian Territories

Abstract

The present article investigates our proposed approach for subtitler training namely a Pedagogical Research-Based (PRB), defined as a professionally-oriented approach utilised in Audiovisual Translation (AVT) translator training to theoretically and practically strengthen the subtitling skills of trainees. The data of the present study is derived from an Egyptian television hard-edged drama entitled *Firqit Naji Atallah* (lit. Naji Atallah Team), Episode 1 (2012), subtitled by a sample of twenty MA translation students, ten of whom enrolled in the second semester for the academic year 2013/2014 and the rest (also totalling ten) did the same, a year later, namely for the school year 2014/2015. The article clearly reveals that before PRB approach is introduced in actual translation classroom, translator trainees (i.e. experimental group) are faced with tremendously difficult problems linguistically, culturally and technically which may hinder communication, thought to be crucial to retain for the target audience. The PRB approach is then introduced whereby the other translator trainees are equipped with some theoretical insights apropos of subtitling norms, well-envisaged in two scholarly AVT works by Karamitroglou (1998) and Schwarz (2002). Being aware of the PRB approach, the translator trainees could therefore do the translation task with minimal linguistic, cultural and technical problems. The study concludes with some pedagogical implications that will hopefully help translator trainees do translation tasks with minimal communication breakdown and maximal communicative thrust drawing on PRB.

Keywords: audiovisual translation, PRB approach, subtitler training, subtitling

Cite as: Mohammad, M.A. (2017). Subtitling on the Intersection of Theory and Practice: Pedagogical Research-Based Approach to Subtitled Training. *Arab World English Journal for Translation & Literary Studies*, 1(1). DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no1.3>

Introduction

Translation has always been thought to be behind the underlying nature of interlingual and intercultural communication since time immemorial. It plays a vital role in helping to bridge the cultural gap among different cultures, with a varying degree. On procedural grounds, we should then be able to contemplate a well-thought-out training that corresponds to different professional orientations. At this juncture, it may help to point out that in the course of the following discussion, we shall focus on subtitling as a mode of Audiovisual Translation (AVT), a discipline which has been well-established in translation studies for the past few decades.

True, translation comprises interpreting, literary translation, Audiovisual Translation (AVT), and other forms of transfer. As for AVT, it requires general translation (both interlingual and intercultural) skills as well as the ability to handle polysemiotic channels and deal with several technical constraints. For the past few decades, translator training has profoundly and rapidly gained momentum and visibility in many educational institutions all over the world, and has indeed given the translation profession a new lease on life. Training for professional translators in such AVT the world over tends to take its point of departure from linguistic and technical dimensions, in which subtitling is so clearly tied to.

Linguistic approaches to translation at the expense of more specialized translator-training dealing with professionally-oriented translation have repeatedly come under strong criticism. It is perhaps true that an attempt to move beyond a linguistic-only approach to a pedagogy approach that aims to engage students with current advances in AVT would be of paramount importance. In this regard, Venuti (1998: 1) argues that translator training has been “impeded by the prevalence of linguistics-oriented approaches that offer a truncated view of the empirical data they collect.” In addition to these solely inescapable “approaches” to translator training, we believe a greater role should be accorded to other interdisciplinary ones, integrating translator trainees, teachers, research methods and insights gained from various branches of linguistics, perhaps something like the one we propose here—Pedagogical Research-Based (PRB) translator training approach.

For a start, we need to clear up PRB approach. It is self-training concept that attempts to develop subtitling skills in a meaningful and durable manner on the basis of a heuristic research method. To better conceptualize PRB, first we need to position it in the extant literature on AVT as can be shown in a number of studies, e.g. Gottlieb (1994); De Linde and Kay (1999); Díaz Cintas (2001); Orero (2004); Gambier (2009); to name but a few, all of which differ from the present article as its focus is mainly on pedagogy. We also need to make a distinction between the prevalent approach to arm students, say, PhD students with research skills and techniques to write a dissertation on a given topic (see for example Schäffner 2009), and pedagogical research which can be utilized by a translator trainee in developing theories he/she needs to know and translation skills (and subtitling ones in our case). Precisely true, pedagogical research is often a catch-all to theory and practice— it might inspire a translator trainee to do academic research as well. Tennent (2005: xxi) confirms: “Theoretical assumptions can only be arrived at through

research”, which, can make a contribution to the development of new pedagogical tools. The focus of the current study is typically on translator training that is dependent on integrating existing scholarly research on subtitling into actual training settings whereby the trainee accesses extensive subtitling literature and is systematically trained to feed his/her own knowledge. In fact, AVT literature includes extensive research, namely on subtitling; for the purpose of the present article, only two subtitling-related research articles will be taken into account as they are considered the basis for an AVT course, like the one offered at Al-Quds University. The articles, written by Karamitroglou (1998) and Schwarz (2002), are particularly informative in AVT. Arguably, these articles are necessarily reflective of the current practice in AVT and may very well be appropriate for students; the rationale for their inclusion is that they provide students with the tools that allow them to take a step forward from mere translation at linguistic level to more complicated technical constraints. True, there is not an international unifying standard for subtitling, but honing students’ skills towards one particular standard as the one proposed by Karamitroglou (1998) and Schwarz (2002) would be praised.

In PRB approach, it may be argued that a professionally-oriented pedagogical research can be viewed in terms of the fact that “the pedagogically most appropriate key concepts are those associated with experiencing, exploration and discovery” (Toury 1995, 256). Interestingly enough, the three concepts are appealed to very frequently in pedagogical research world, and in our attempt to relate, in an intricate way, research to translator training, we are inclined to think that the aforementioned concepts are presumably conducive to more appropriate translator training insofar as subtitling is concerned. ‘Experience’ is higher-level theoretical knowledge subtitling-wise, which one might have gained over a long period of time. It ensues that experience requires ‘exploration’ usually based on a rather immaculate conception of AVT (and subtitling in particular) and its assessment. This might inevitably lead trainees to make an incredible discovery in the final analysis. The three concepts identified above might conflate into a research-based training mould. Academic research bears out translator trainees’ skills, and is probably inevitable for performing translation skills as efficiently and effectively as possible. On the significance of research Dollerup (2004: 8) highlights:

It is reassuring for the readership to know that the article has been checked thoroughly, the referees and the editorial staff have contributed to the improvement of the contents of the journal, and the publisher, we hope, gains prestige if not money on the venture.

As consequence, the impact pedagogical research may have is not only related to the author, but also to anonymous referees and the editorial members. Pedagogical Research as to AVT is no exception. This impact on acquiring AVT-knowledge needed for training as is the case in subtitling is expected to be high.

In terms of translation theories underlying our research world, Pym (2005: 3-6) states that they are considered as “abstruse and useless; only professionals know the realities of translation;

trainees thus need the professional skills, not the academic theories.” Nevertheless, theoretically self-aware translation pedagogy is needed as Kiraly (1995: x) aptly remarks:

A translation pedagogy without a theoretical basis will be a blind pedagogy. It will fail to set reasonable objectives, will be unable to create and apply methods appropriate to the learning task, will be unable to measure and evaluate results, and will ultimately fail to create the effective translators our society demand (see also Cronin 2005, 250 and Pym (2005, 3-6).

It may be helpful to point out that research has deeper theoretical underpinnings, perhaps it is an intuitively satisfactory way to bring about a high-quality training as can be shown later.

Methodology

Having examined the translations of the two groups, we could spot a significant difference. The present article aims to shed the light on the status of translator training before and after adopting PRB approach. To do so, the study consists of two-group design¹. One experimental group (n=10) enrolled in the second semester of the school year 2013/2014, does not have familiarity with two articles while the other control group (n=20) enrolled on AVT for academic year 2014/2015 does. The data of the study comprises an Egyptian television drama entitled *Firqit Naji Atallah* (Naji Atallah Team) Episode 1, (2012), starring a famous Egyptian comic actor, Adel Imam.

The sample of the study consists of twenty MA translation students, ten of whom had already taken AVT course in the second semester for the academic year 2013/2014 at Al-Quds University and subtitled *Firqit Naji Atallah* (Naji Atallah Team), Episode 1, (2012) as a course requirement. Having already introduced to PRB approach in which the trainees had already read AVT-related scholarly researches, the trainees were then referred to as a fully fledged (FF) trainees or control group, and presumably had a level of specialized knowledge on AVT on the basis of adherence to subtitling conventions as can be illustrated in the discussion and analysis section below; yet exposing to a few articles is perhaps not suffice to claim that they are fully fledged. It was found that amongst the articles the trainees read for the course were Karamitroglou (1998) and Schwarz (2002). The remainder of a group (i.e. experimental group) were enrolled on the same course, specifically a year later for academic year 2014/2015, but were introduced to a rather variational approach which mainly aims to embrace the range of options in the light of insufficient background on AVT, and were asked to subtitle the episode the FF translators had already subtitled. At first glance, this deprivation perhaps raises an ethical concern, but it is quite authentic in subtitling world— Thawabteh and Muslam 2016 aptly remark that the subtitling of amateur aficionados for a movie is less natural than that of a trained student subtitler who has received an institutional training.

By and large, both groups (i.e. experimental and control) were supposed to have sufficient training as they had already enrolled on courses considered to be prerequisites for the AVT course: Advanced Linguistics for Translators, Translation History and Theory, Translation

Practice etc. Since this experimental group was not introduced to PRB approach before, it was referred to as novice and non-fully fledged (NFF) translators. Therefore, there is a good reason to consider familiarity versus unfamiliarity with scholarly AVT-related research (again, restricted to the two said articles) as a yardstick against which to judge performance of the task in question.

Significance of the study

Developing research skills in translator training has received considerable attention (Schäffner 2009, Pym 2011, among others), but, to our best knowledge, scant attention has been paid to use research as a pedagogical tool in translator training, particularly subtitling-wise. In the Arab World, research on AVT has been vigorously pursued by a number of scholars with a kind of conscientiously and enthusiastically research on linguistic and technical aspects: Athamneh and Zitawi (1999); Khuddro (2000); Zitawi (2003 and 2008); Bahaa-Eddin (2006); Gamal (2007, 2008 and (2009); Jawad Thanoon (2008); Thawabteh (2010, 2011a, 2011b, 2011c, 2011d, 2012, 2013, 2014); Al-Adwan (2015); Alharthi (2015); Ben Slamia (2015); and Thawabteh and Muslim (2016). Nevertheless, most, if not all of research, is done with blithe disregard for salient training on employing pedagogical research with a view to honing trainees' skills to subtitle.

Translation and Subtitling Strategies

There is no consensus among translation theorists on a clear-cut definition of 'strategy' (Davies 2005: 74). For the sake of the present article, we opt for a practical definition offered by Scott-Tennent, *et al.* (2000: 108): "the steps, selected from a consciously known range of potential procedures, taken to solve a translation problem which has been consciously detected and resulting in a consciously applied solution." Translation strategies constitute the 'bread-and-butter' of any translation mode, e.g. literary translation, interpreting, AVT, among others. To better appreciate translation strategies in relation to subtitling, let us first take a closer look at subtitling as a mode of AVT. Gottlieb (2004: 219-220) defines subtitling as:

diasemiotic translation in polysemiotic media (including films, TV, video and DVD), in the form of one or more lines of written text presented on the screen in sync with the original dialog [...] The term 'polysemiotic' refers to the presence of two or more parallel channels of discourse constituting the text in question. In a film, up to four semiotic channels are in operation simultaneously: non-verbal picture, written pictorial elements, dialog, and music [and] effects.

It is then of paramount importance to note that the skills involved in negotiating meaning across languages in subtitling are quite different from those required in translation (Luyken *et al.* 1991; Baker 1998; Karamitroglou 1998; De Linde & Kay 1999; Díaz Cintas 2001; Schwarz 2002; Orero, 2004; Gambier 2009; Georgakopoulou 2009; Kruger 2008, among many others). Kruger (2008, 82) says:

The difference between the skills required for subtitling and those required for translation, editing or interpreting, lies in the very technical aspects of subtitling. Subtitling requires all the skills that other modes require in terms of text analysis, subject expertise, language,

awareness of context, quality control and so forth, but it also requires that the subtitler to be able to apply these skills within very rigid constraints of time and space, while adhering to specific conventions of quantity and form. Mastering and applying these skills take a long time.

Drawing on the differences pointed out above and the fact that skills are closely associated with spatial and temporal constraints, particular strategies, mainly based on technical competence on the part of the translator, are suggested by AVT theorists and practitioners. Technical competence, according to Skuggevik (2009: 198), refers to “the ability to deal with the sheer practical demands of the job as it appears to most working subtitlers: use of software, line breaks, positioning on the screen, time and space restrictions, use of italics, etc.” All these competencies draw on the fact that “the amount of dialog has to be reduced to meet the technical conditions of the medium and the reading capacities of non-native language users” (Linde and Kay 1999: 1-2). A corollary of this, Gottlieb (1994) proposes a number of well-established norm-bound subtitling strategies: expansion; paraphrase; transfer; imitation; transcription; dislocation; condensation; decimation; deletion; resignation, with much focus on reducing strategies, namely, condensation, decimation, and deletion.

Analysis and Discussion

The theoretical framework established so far requires that we examine in depth some translations by both groups (i.e. experimental and control) in order to corroborate and diversify our argument. Let us examine a few illustrative examples of these translations to scrutinize decision-making process by FF trainees (who clearly feed their knowledge into subtitling) and novice NFF (with no knowledge of subtitling norms at all, normally gained from research in the field). Consider Text 1 below:

(1)

Original: - *ilḥamdillah bis-salāma Gamal bayh.* - *shukran*
 [Thank God you're well Mr. Jamal. Thanks.]
 (Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle² - Welcome Mr. Jamal
 -Thanks

(20/9 characters³)

Subtitle⁴ Thank God we have you here. Thank you very much
 (47 characters)

In this film sequence, a new Media Advisor has just arrived at the Egyptian Embassy in Tel Aviv. Upon entering the embassy, an officer welcomes him. It seems possible to argue that the translation by one of the FF trainees tilts towards standardization of subtitling practices proposed by Karamitroglou (1998, Text positioning); for instance, the FF trainee is no doubt aware that dialog turns should be “initiated by dashes and presented simultaneously on a two-line subtitle” (ibid.), and also that “[d]ashes are used before the first character of each of the lines of a two-line subtitle (with a space character inserted each time) (ibid., Dashes and hyphens). Another

technical-related problem for which FF trainee sufficiently respect is the number of characters allowed per line. Karamitroglou (1998, Number of characters) states that an “attempting to fit over 40 per subtitle line, reduces the legibility of the subtitles because the font size is also inevitably reduced.” Clearly, FF trainee is able to meet the special requirement of number of characters per line in this example as is the case in all subsequent examples. However, incompetent performance is a fairly obvious point in the subtitle offered by NFF, though it sounds natural in English.

In addition, the stretch of language displayed in Text 1 above, viz. *ilḥamdillāh bis-salāma* (lit. ‘Thank God you had a safe journey’) has its own pragmatic force to perform— actually more than one illocutionary act, i.e. ‘a pragmatically multipurpose expression’ (Farghal 1995; see also Austin 1962). One act is to offer a fantastic welcome to someone who has just arrived at a place. “In judging the quality of subtitles, one must examine the degree to which the subtitled version *as a whole* manages to convey the semantic gestalt of the original” (Gottlieb 1994, 106; emphasis in original). Nevertheless, prioritizing pragmatic adequacy over linguistic accuracy is significant as can be shown in the translation by FF trainee who actually translates pragmatically rather than semantically, thus abiding herself/himself by most significantly preferred strategies in subtitling, namely, ‘condensation, decimation, and deletion’. Semantic translation is not only ungainly and/or verbose as can be shown by NFF, but it also allows for more characters (47), too much to be displayed on screen. To more appreciate it, take Text 2 below:

Text 2

Original: *Muḥsin Bassyunī min maktab sa ‘ādat il-wazīr*
 [Mohsin Basoni from Mr. Minister’s Office.]
 (Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle I’m Mohsin Basoni⁵ the Amb’s Office Manager
 (18/27 characters)

Subtitle I am Mohsin Basoni, Office Manager of Egyptian
 ambassador to Israel. (69 characters)

In quest for a condensed subtitle, FF trainee seems to be fastidious about the use of abbreviations, normally subsumed within subtitling norms as can be explicated by Karamitroglou (1998, Acronyms, apostrophes, numerals and symbols): “to use apostrophes for abbreviations of auxiliaries like “I’d” which “can save precious character space by abbreviating meaning signs” (ibid.), or in the words of Thawabteh (2011, 37):

A space in need is a friend indeed [...] Every single space is highly needed for other communicative purposes, that is, when the subtitle is appropriately and adequately positioned on the screen, the possibility of nonverbal communication becomes high.

The use of contracted ‘I’m’, and ‘Amb’s’ would adequately achieve the desired effect, i.e. the sense of abbreviation as a subtitling norm, but the question of whether or not ‘Amb’s’ is a standardized abbreviation. It is not, but if it can be “immediately recognisable and comprehensible”, it might ideally be unproblematic as is the case in Text 2 above whereby the

sequence is akin to its wider polysemiotic context. Initially, the camera pans the Egyptian Embassy in before a close-up of a sign that reads ‘Egyptian Embassy’ is made.

Conversely, the subtitle by NFF sounds natural in English on grounds of apparent language competence on the part of the translator trainee. An attenuated form of translation nevertheless prevails in terms of technical dimension— superfluous number of characters, etc. For more elaboration, take Text 3 below:

Text 3

Original: *ana lula 'ā'id 'alā id-dmaghhum kunna 'abaḍna* [If I'm
not a nag about it, we may be paid
kuli shahrīn
every two months.]

(Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle If I don't follow up, |we may be paid every 2 months
(22/30 characters)

Subtitle If I haven't nagged them, we may sniff at that we could be paid
every two months.

(81 characters)

There has been a firestorm of protest against the dilatory of getting their pay packets by the employees in the Embassy protest as they could barely scrape by on their salaries. Naji says that due to a stifling bureaucracy of the bank, the salaries are not to be paid on time, but will be paid as soon as possible. Naji is a nag about salaries. FF trainee seems to be aware of the most salient lexical items to be opted for in terms of the number of characters and meaning. Schwarz (2002, Idiosyncratic speech) points out “[p]eople can speak with authority or in a hesitant and shy manner. They use a specific repertoire which is expressed phonologically and syntactically as well as lexically.” By way of illustration, instead of using ‘investigate’ which is synonymous to ‘follow up’, the FF trainee goes on to decide on ‘follow up’. A decomposition of word meaning is employed. FF trainee seems to have paid scrupulous attention to register, i.e. “appropriateness to a particular context of situation” (Brown and Yule 1983: 195) “in terms of a number of parameters which constrain the communicative transaction. These include field (or subject matter), tenor (or level of formality), and mode (or the distinction between spoken and written)” (Hatim and Mason 1998: 17). The ‘level of formality’ in the SL slangy dialog of *'ā'id 'alā id-dmaghhum* (lit. ‘sitting on their heads’) perhaps requires ‘follow up’ rather than ‘investigate’. Employing circumlocution deters communicative breakdowns in an exchange, but it turns out to be problematic in subtitling in view of spatial and temporal constraints which, in turn, require

decimating of Source Language (SL) dialog to allow easy accessibility of the message more effectively.

Text 4

Original: *ana 'awiz a 'rfak 'ala il-mustshār il-i 'lamī*
 [I want to introduce you to the Media Advisor
Gamal Abed En-Nasir
 [Mr. Gamal Abed In-Nasser]

(Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle Ok this is the Media Advisor (28 characters)
 Mr. Gamal Abdinaser (late Egyptian president name)
 (20/30 characters)

Subtitle This is the Media Advisor (26 characters)
 His Excellency Gamal, Gamal Abed In-Nasser
 (45 characters)

The ambassador introduces the new Media Advisor to Naji who has just entered the office. The advisor's name is Gamal Abdinaser or more aptly Gamal Abdel Nasser, named after late Egyptian president, Gamal Abdel Nasser. When his name is uttered, Naji's eyebrows went up simply because the former Egyptian president was renowned for being fiercely patriotic, with a long history of animosity against Israel. With such strong socio-political connotations, FF trainee opts for a more explanatory note in the brackets bearing in mind that "the sub-title is only part of the overall input of a film and there is no possibility of back-tracking, this separation [caused by brackets] should be kept to a minimum (Schwarz (2002, Conjunction and the remainder of the sentence).

In Text 5 below, Naji looks for a flat for the Media Advisor with less expensive accommodation as much as possible nearby. The lexical availability relies so much on most short lexical items, taking into account to have a semantically self-contained subtitle.

Text 5

Original: *Naji bayh, himitak ma 'āna 'awizān* [Mr. Naji!
 Could you please *Gamal bayh yuskun janb is-safāra*
 help us find a flat for Mr. Gamal near the embassy]

(Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle Help us find him a flat near the embassy.
 (24/17 characters)

Subtitle Could you please give us a hand with finding an
 apartment for him?
 (61 characters)

Borne in mind that "the reduction of text can even be found on the level of single letters [...]. In general, letters are proportional, in other words the letters differ in width. For example, 'i', 'l' or 't' are particularly narrow, while 'm' and 'w' are much wider" (Schwarz 2002, Fonts and figures), FF trainee seems to be aware of certain lexical items are shorter than their counterparts

as is the case with American and British English. It ensues that the choice for a four-letter British English ‘flat’ seems to be more appropriate than that for a nine-letter American English ‘apartment’ (see also Thawabteh 2011b: 218-19 and Thawabteh 2013). On the other hand, NFF opt for a long and structurally and lexically complex sentence, comprising an idiom, i.e. ‘give us a hand’, a padding expression i.e. ‘Could you please’ (see also Karamitroglou 1998) and long lexical item, i.e., ‘apartment’. “An **idiom** is a group of words which have a different meaning when used together from the one they would have if you took the meaning of each word separately” (*Collins Cobuild Advanced Learner’s English Dictionary* 2003; emphasis in original). Idioms can be long which, when translated into TL equivalents, are likely to give rise not only to complex structure, but also to a superfluity of characters. The fact that an idiom consists of ‘a group of words’ can bring about ill-segmentation. Being the case so “[a] decision as to which pieces of information to omit or to include should depend on the relative contribution of these pieces of information to the comprehension and appreciation of the target film as a whole” (Karamitroglou (1998, Omitting linguistic items of the original). Karamitroglou further argues that the “subtitler should not attempt to transfer everything, even when this is spatio-temporally feasible”, for instance, padding expressions, considered to be “most frequently empty of semantic load and their presence is mostly functional, padding-in speech in order to maintain the desired speech flow” (ibid.).

In Text 6 below, the picture of Golda Meir, former Israeli Prime Minister is hung up in the wall of an Israeli broker’s office named Roni. Unfamiliar with the picture, viewers needed to be provided with maximal ease of communication. One way in which this is done is by means of providing a subtitle which could have paid dividends, that the non-verbal visual sign productively interacts with the verbal visual sign, making up maximal communicative thrust intended for actual targeted audience, and that the broker is patriotic as he hangs the picture in the office.

Text 6

Original:	No dialog: Picture of Golda Meir (Naji Atallah Team)
Subtitle	Golda Meir, Former Israeli Prime Minister. (41 characters)
Subtitle	No subtitle

“In a film, up to four semiotic channels are in operation simultaneously: non-verbal picture, written pictorial elements, dialog, and music and effects” (Gottlieb 2004, 227). The non-verbal visual channel (e.g. the composition of the image) is deemed significant as Orero (2004, 86) argues: “the content of the non-verbal channels has to be taken into account” (see also Schwarz 2002). FF trainee seems to have taken the non-verbal sign in her stride. She seeks to capture maximal communicative import by transferring non-verbal visual sign into verbal visual sign, i.e.

the subtitle *per se*. Her decision might be considered valid. NFF, however, did not pay any attention to the non-verbal sign, leaving the TL audience to forge its own interpretation.

Text 7

Original: *khamisa fil miyyah, barḍu da khaṣm* [A five per cent discount! Is this a discount indeed?

inta bitqta' minlahmak ya raqil

This makes my flesh creep!]

(Naji Atallah Team)

Subtitle That's too little. |You're so tight
(19/17 characters)

Subtitle Oh! Come on! You offer a five per cent discount! An insatiable greed for money indeed.

(61 characters)

Unable to satisfy the broker's avarice, Naji negotiates a discount in earnest. However, the broker claims that 'slap-bang in the middle' of Tel Aviv, the rents are always high. In the end, he is parsimonious, that he only offers a five per cent discount which does not satisfy Naji. FF trainee opts for rendering the SL idiom, i.e., *bitqta' min laḥmak* (lit. 'as if you cut off your flesh') into an equivalent idiom (with fewer words)— 'You're so tight' in lieu of 'tight-fisted', 'Scrooge', 'skinflint' for instance, which all clearly count more. On the other hand, NFF do not pay much attention to subtitling norms, giving rise to a subtitle that is long-winded.

Another point worthy of research is segmentation at the highest nodes. Karamitroglou (1998, Segmentation at the highest nodes) speaks of the justification beyond segmentation:

When we segment a sentence, we force the brain to pause its linguistic processing for a while, until the eyes trace the next piece of linguistic information. In cases where segmentation is inevitable, therefore, we should try to force this pause on the brain at a point where the semantic load has already managed to convey a satisfactorily complete piece of information (see also Georgakopolou 2009, 24).

In Text 7 above, FF trainee successfully does segmentation at the highest node i.e. 'That's too little' which may in practice facilitate comprehension and increase reading speed whereas the subtitle offered by NFF may not, owing to a lack in segmentation.

Text 8 below bears witness to the use of a third language within the SL dialog, that is, Hebrew. Gimbert (2005, 148) points out that a third language refers to any language that exists in the source text, but is not the main language of it.

Text 8

Original: (In Hebrew) אָדוֹן בֹּאֲרֵי מֵה שְׁלוֹמֶךָ
[Good morning]
(Naji Atallah Team)

Egyptian comic, Ismail Yasin. He sang the song, with distinctive phonetic features often utilized by an Israeli in pronouncing voiceless velar fricative *kh* instead of voiceless pharyngeal fricative *h*. Contrary to obvious NFF ignorance of subtitling norms, FF trainee opts for a more or less technically accurate subtitle to deal with the song— using italics, apparently talking cue from Karamitroglou (1998, Quotation marks embracing text in italics):

Quotation marks embracing text in italics should be used to indicate a public broadcast, i.e. spoken text coming from an off-screen source and addressed to a number of people (e.g. through a TV, a radio, or a loudspeaker). They should also be used when transferring song lyrics.

Concluding Remarks

We should take cognisance of the pivotal role of PRB approach as to translator training to subtitle. The study provides some evidence that would point in the direction of significance of pedagogical research in such a training. We are particularly inclined to conclude that painstaking pedagogical research (1) seems to be a powerful tool at translator trainee's disposal, the integration of which in training can probably be of great benefit to translator trainees; (2) can throw light on all the theoretical implications of the two articles in question more tangibly and explicitly. The FF trainees fit in a mould of subtitlers because pedagogical research seems to have provided them with a theoretical framework which is an indicator of what the translators are doing and why; (3) can methodologically serve better as a prerequisite for developing training skills for subtitlers; (4) can also help developing researchers skills; (5) can enhance the role of educators as facilitators for learning process; (6) can not only help translation trainees, but it can also help on-the-job training and continuing training as well. 'Goofing up', or committing grave mistakes in subtitling, subtitlers working for state-run televisions, satellite channels, etc. almost in all countries can make benefit from self-taught pedagogical research; (7) can help translation trainees make their decision-making strategies; (8) can be useful with the three concepts proposed by Toury 1995 in which experience, exploration and discovery have been great assets as shown in the translations of FF; (9) it ensues, therefore, that translator trainees need to be more aware of this tool; and (10) the efficiency of the subtitles offered by FF translators, with an access to paper-based research has the merit of relaying the appropriate linguistic and technical dimensions, and is a far cry from that of those who are not familiar with subtitling norms as reflected in the two research papers— the subtitles deviate significantly from dominant linguistic and technical norms.

It is also concluded the fact that the two groups are sufficiently different based on the result of having read two articles is true other things being equal. It is perhaps safe to determine whether the "familiar" group is employing the strategies in subtitling the episode as a result of reading the articles or because of larger professional norms is simple as most of these strategies are a reflection on the articles. The room for professional norms is still valid, however.

To sum, “[i]t would be enough to train students to learn and adapt. Then let them live” (Pym, 2004, Section 2). Most importantly, they also need to employ pedagogical research in the face of meanderings of their life as translator trainees, trainers, freelancers, professionals.

6. Endnotes

1. Many thanks go out for MA translation students at Al-Quds University who go to great pains to serve as subjects for the current article, as without their help, the article would not have seen the light of day.
2. First subtitle displayed in the examples is the translation of FF.
3. Number of characters of first line and second line separated by slash.
4. Second subtitle displayed in the examples is the translation of NFF.
5. An oblique line “|” (‘pipe’) represents a new subtitle line.

About the Author:

Dr. Mohammad Ahmad Thawabteh was Department Chair, and is currently Associate Professor of Translation at the Department of English and Literature, Al-Quds University, Jerusalem. His main research interests and publications are in Audiovisual Translation/subtitling, including problems of subtitling from Arabic into English and vice versa. His research also focuses on Translation Technology, Discourse Analysis, Semiotics, Translation and Conflict and Translator Training.

7. References

- Al-Adwan, Amer. (2015). “Towards a Model of Euphemisation in Arabic Subtitling.” *Arab World English Journal* 4: 6-21.
- Alharthi, Adel. (2015). “Strategies of Subtitling Satire: A Case Study of the American Sitcom Seinfeld, with Particular Reference to English and Arabic.” *Arab World English Journal* 4: 22- 41.
- Athamneh, Nasser and Zitawi, Jihan. (1999). “English-Arabic Translation of Dubbed Children’s Animated Pictures.” *Babel* 45: 107-126.
- Austin, J.L. (1962). *How to Do Things with Words*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Bahaa-Eddin, Mazid. (2006). “Arabic Subtitles on English Movies: Some Linguistic, Ideological and Pedagogic Issues.” *IJAES* 7: 81-100.
- Baker, Mona. (1998). *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies*. London: Routledge.
- Ben Slamia, Fatima. (2015). “Pragmatic and Semantic Errors of Illocutionary Force Subtitling.” *Arab World English Journal* 4: 42-52.
- Brown, Gillian and Yule, George. (1983). *Discourse Analysis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Collins Cobuild Advanced Learner’s English Dictionary* (2003). HarperCollins Publisher.
- Cronin, Michael. (2005). “Deschooling Translation: Beginning of Century Reflections on Teaching Translation and Interpreting.” In *Training for the New Millennium: Pedagogies for Translation and Interpreting*, edited by Martha, Tennent, 249-267. John Benjamins Publishing Company.

- Díaz Cintas, Jorge. (2001). Teaching Subtitling at University. In *Conference Proceedings. (Training Translators and Interpreters in the New Millennium*, edited by S. Cunico, 29-44. University of Portsmouth.
- De Linde, Zoé and Kay, Neil. (1999). *Semiotics of Subtitling*. Manchester: St. Jerome.
- Dollerup, Cay. (2004). "Journals, the Internet, and Quality in Research." *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology 12*: 3-10.
- Farghal, Mohammad. (1995). "The Pragmatics of 'inshallah in Jordanian Arabic." *Multilingua 14*: 253-270.
- Gamal, Mohammed. (2007). "Issues in Arabic subtitling." In *Translation and Meaning, Part 7*, edited by Barbara Lewandowska-Tomaszczyk and Marcel Thelen, 487-496. Maastricht: Zuyd University.
- Gamal, Mohammed. (2008). "Egypt's Audiovisual Translation Scene." *Arab Media and Society 5*: 1-15.
- Gamal, Mohammed. (2009). "Adding Text to Image: Challenges of Subtitling Non-Verbal Communication." *Journal of Multicultural Research, 1*. accessed 20 August 2015. <http://academicpress.us/journals/4695/download/v1n1-1.pdf>.
- Gambier, Yves. (2009). "Challenges in Research on Audiovisual Translation" In *Translation Research Projects 2*, edited by Anthony Pym and Alexander, Perekrestenko, 24-33. Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group.
- Georgakopoulou, Panayota. (2009). "Subtitling for the DVD Industry." In *Audiovisual Translation: Language Transfer on Screen*, edited by Jorge Díaz Cintas and Anderman, Gunilla, 21-36. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gimbert, MC. (2005). "The Third Language: A Recurrent Textual Restriction that Translators Come across in Audiovisual Translation." *Cadernos de Tradução 2*: 147-160.
- Gottlieb, Henrich. (1994). "Subtitling: Diagonal Translation." *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology 2*: 101-121.
- Gottlieb, Henrich. (2004). "Subtitles and International Anglification." *Nordic Journal of English Studies 3*: 219-230.
- Jawad Thanoon, Akram. (2008). "Retos y soluciones de la subtitulación en árabe" [Challenges and solutions in Arabic subtitling]. *América Latina e investigación traductológica 1/2*: 316-342.
- Karamitroglou, Fotios. (1998). "A Proposed Set of Subtitling Standards for Europe." *Translation Journal 2.2*. accessed 25 July 2015. <http://accurapid.com/journal/04stndrd.htm>.
- Khuddro, Ahmad. (2000). "Subtitling in Arabic." *Turjuman 9*: 31-37.
- Kruger, JL. (2008). "Subtitling Training as Part of a General Training Programme in the Language Professions." In *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation*, edited by Jorge, Díaz Cintas, 71-87. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Luyken, Herbst, Thomas, Langham-Brown, Jo, Reid, Helen and Spinhof, Hermann. (1991). *Overcoming Language Barriers in Television: Dubbing and Subtitling for the European Audience*. Manchester: European Institute for the Media.
- Orero, Pedro. (2004). *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Pym, Anthony. (2005). "Training Translators— Ten Recurrent Naiveties." *Translating Today 2*: 3-6.

- Pym, Anthony. (2011). "Translation Research Terms: A Tentative Glossary for Moments of Perplexity and Dispute." In *Translation research projects 3*, edited by in Anthony, Pym, 75-99. Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group.
- Schäffner, Christina. (2009). "Research Training: How Specific Does it Need to Be?" In *Translation Research projects 2*, edited by Anthony Pym and Alexander, Perekrestenko, 17-23. Tarragona: Intercultural Studies Group.
- Schwarz, Barbara. (2020). "Translation in A Confined Space— Film Sub-titling with Special Reference to Dennis Potter's "lipstick on your collar" Part 1." *Translation Journal 6*. accessed 12 July 2015. <http://accurapid.com/journal/22subtitles.htm>.
- Scott-Tennent, C., Davies, Maria, and Torras, Fernanda Rodríguez. (2000). "Translation Strategies and Translation Solutions: Design of a Teaching Prototype and Empirical Study of its Results." In *Investigating Translation*, edited by Allison Beeby Lonsdale, Allison Beeby, Doris Ensinger, 108-116. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: Benjamins.
- Skuggevik, Erik. (2009). "Teaching Screen Translation: The Role of Pragmatics in Subtitling." In *Audiovisual Translation: Language Transfer on Screen*, edited by Jorge Díaz Cintas and Anderman, Gunilla, 197-213. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2010). "The Translatability of Interjections: A Case Study of Arabic-English Subtitling." *Meta 55*: 499-515. (DOI: 10.7202/045067ar).
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2011a). "Linguistic, Cultural and Technical Problems in English-Arabic Subtitling." *Skase Journal of Translation and Interpretation 5*: 24-44.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2011b). "Lexical Problems in Arabic-English Subtitling," *Communication and Culture Online 2*:207-220
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2011c). "The Translatability of Gestures: A Case Study of Arabic-English Subtitling". *International Journal of Translation 23*: 147–159.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2011d). "The Translation of Prosody and all that Aggro: A Case Study of Arabic-English Subtitling." *T21N: Translation in Transition 2*: 1–18.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2012). "The Translatability of Euphemism and Dysphemism in Arabic-English Subtitling." *Lexis, E-Journal in English Lexicology 7*:145–156.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2013). "Analysis of Technical 'Foul-ups': With Particular Reference to Arabic-English Subtitling", *Studies of Science and Culture 9*: 77-90.
- Thawabteh, Mohammad. (2014). "Translation and Crime: The Case of Subtitling English thrillers into Arabic." *Studies about Languages 24*: 11-17. (DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.5755/j01.sal.0.24.6255>).
- Thawabteh, Mohammad and Muslam, Sulafa. (2016). "Addressing Coherence in Subtitling English Comedy Shows into Arabic by Amateur Aficionados," *Journal of Cultural Communication, 7*, 109-126. (DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18485/kkonline.2016.7.7.8>).
- Tennent, Martha. (2005). "Introduction" In *Training for the New Millennium: Pedagogies for translation and Interpreting*, edited by Martha, Tennent, M. xv-xxv. John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Venuti, Lawrence (1998). *The Scandals of Translation*. London: Routledge.
- Zitawi, Jehan. (2003). "English-Arabic Dubbed Children's Cartoons: Strategies of Translating Idioms." *Across Languages and Cultures 4*: 237-251.
- Zitawi, Jehan. (2008). "Contextualising Disney Comics within the Arab Culture." *Meta 53*:139-153.